NOTE: This disposition is nonprecedential.

# United States Court of Appeals for the Federal Circuit

CROSSROADS SYSTEMS, INC., Appellant

v.

ORACLE CORPORATION, NETAPP INC., Appellees

2016-1930, 2016-1931

Appeals from the United States Patent and Trademark Office, Patent Trial and Appeal Board in No. IPR2014-01207, IPR2014-01209.

Decided: June 6, 2017

ROBERT P. COURTNEY, Fish & Richardson P.C., Minneapolis, MN, argued for appellant. Also represented by JOHN A. DRAGSETH, CONRAD GOSEN; RUSSELL T. WONG, Blank Rome LLP, Houston, TX.

JARED BOBROW, Weil, Gotshal & Manges LLP, Redwood Shores, CA, argued for appellees. Also represented by AMANDA BRANCH, DEREK C. WALTER.

## Before REYNA, LINN, and CHEN, Circuit Judges.

### REYNA, Circuit Judge.

Crossroads Systems, Inc. ("Crossroads") appeals from the Patent Trial and Appeal Board's ("PTAB") inter partes review ("IPR") decisions finding claims 1, 2, 4, 5, 10, 11, 13, and 14–39 of U.S. Patent No. 7,051,147 ("147 patent") unpatentable as obvious.

Our decision today in *Crossroads Systems, Inc. v. Cisco Systems, Inc. et al.*, Nos. 2016-2017, -2026, and -2027, addresses largely the same arguments and finds the same claims of the '147 patent to be unpatentable. For the reasons articulated in that decision, here too we *affirm*.

These two appeals further argue that the PTAB erred in finding certain claims obvious over a combination of U.S. Patent No, 6,219,771 ("Kikuchi") and other references. This is an independent ground of obviousness. Because we have already found these claims obvious based on other references, we need not reach these arguments.

### AFFIRMED

#### COSTS

Each party to bear its own costs.