

NOTE: This disposition is nonprecedential.

**United States Court of Appeals
for the Federal Circuit**

CHART TRADING DEVELOPMENT, LLC,
Appellant

v.

**INTERACTIVE BROKERS LLC, NINJATRADER
GROUP, LLC, NINJATRADER, LLC,
TRADESTATION GROUP, INC., TRADESTATION
SECURITIES, INC., TRADESTATION
TECHNOLOGIES, INC.,**
Appellees

2018-1102, 2018-1104

Appeals from the United States Patent and Trade-
mark Office, Patent Trial and Appeal Board in Nos.
CBM2016-00038, CBM2016-00039.

JUDGMENT

JAMES R. BARNEY, Finnegan, Henderson, Farabow,
Garrett & Dunner, LLP, Washington, DC, argued for
appellant. Also represented by JUSTIN LOFFREDO,
TIMOTHY P. McANULTY.

DANIELLE J. HEALEY, Fish & Richardson, PC, Hou-

ston, TX, argued for all appellees. Appellees TradeStation Group, Inc., TradeStation Securities, Inc., TradeStation Technologies, Inc. also represented by BAILEY KATHLEEN HARRIS; MARIA ELENA STITELER, Minneapolis, MN; ADAM J. KESSEL, Boston, MA; JOHN C. PHILLIPS, San Diego, CA.

MICHAEL T. ROSATO, Wilson, Sonsini, Goodrich & Rosati, PC, Seattle, WA, for appellee Interactive Brokers LLC. Also represented by MATTHEW A. ARGENTI, Palo Alto, CA.

BENJAMIN LIEB, Talus Law Group LLC, Denver, CO, for appellees NinjaTrader Group, LLC, NinjaTrader, LLC.

THIS CAUSE having been heard and considered, it is

ORDERED and ADJUDGED:

PER CURIAM (NEWMAN, PLAGER, and MOORE, *Circuit Judges*).

AFFIRMED. See Fed. Cir. R. 36.

ENTERED BY ORDER OF THE COURT

December 17, 2018
Date

/s/ Peter R. Marksteiner
Peter R. Marksteiner
Clerk of Court