

1 MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP  
 Melissa D. Hill (*Pro Hac Vice*)  
 2 101 Park Avenue  
 New York, NY 10178-0060  
 3 Tel.: (212) 309-6000  
 Fax: (212) 309-6001  
 4 Email: melissa.hill@morganlewis.com

5 FISHER & PHILLIPS, LLP  
 Scott M. Mahoney  
 6 Nevada Bar. No. 1099  
 300 S Fourth Street, Suite 1500  
 7 Las Vegas, NV 89101  
 Tel.: (702) 252-3131  
 8 Fax: (702) 252-7411  
 Email: smahoney@fisherphillips.com

9 *Attorneys for Defendants Delta Air Lines,*  
 10 *Inc. and the Administrative Committee of*  
 11 *Delta Air Lines, Inc.*

12 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
 13 **DISTRICT OF NEVADA**

14  
 15 MARSHA R. DUVANEY, on behalf of herself  
 and all others similarly situated,

16  
 17 Plaintiff,

18 vs.

19 DELTA AIR LINES, INC., THE  
 ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE OF DELTA  
 20 AIR LINES, INC., GREG TAHVONEN,  
 MINDY DAVISON, JANET BRUNK, AND  
 21 JOHN/JANE DOES 1-5,

22 Defendants.

**Case No. 2:21-cv-02186-RFB-EJY**

**STIPULATION FOR**  
**PROTECTIVE ORDER**

23  
 24  
 25  
 26  
 27  
 28

1 IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED by the parties' counsel of record that the  
2 Court may enter the following Protective Order:

3 **1 Definitions.** As used in this Protective Order:

- 4 (a) "attorney" means an attorney who has appeared in this action;
- 5 (b) "confidential document" means a document, information (regardless of how it is  
6 generated, stored or maintained), or tangible thing that qualifies for protection  
7 under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c) that has been designated as  
8 confidential under this Protective Order;
- 9 (c) to "destroy" electronically stored information ("ESI") means to delete from all  
10 databases, applications, and file systems so that the information is not accessible  
11 without the use of specialized tools or techniques typically used by a forensic  
12 expert;
- 13 (d) "document" means document, information, or materials disclosed or produced in  
14 discovery, including at a deposition;
- 15 (e) "notice" or "notify" means written notice;
- 16 (f) "party" means a party to this action;
- 17 (g) "non-party" means any natural person, partnership, corporation, association,  
18 covered entity (as defined by 45 C.F.R. § 160.103), or other legal entity not named  
19 as a party to this action; and
- 20 (h) "protected document" means a document protected by a privilege or the work-  
21 product doctrine.

22 **2 Designating a Document or Deposition as Confidential.**

- 23 (a) A party or non-party disclosing or producing a document may designate it as  
24 confidential if the party or non-party reasonably believes in good faith that it  
25 include personal information, trade secrets, or sensitive strategic, technical,  
26 marketing, financial information, or other information that qualifies for protection  
27 under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c) and that the disclosing or designating  
28 party reasonably fears would, if publicly disclosed, cause competitive injury (to

1 the disclosing party or third parties). No party or non-party producing documents  
2 subject to this Protective Order will designate a document as confidential unless a  
3 particularized, specific assessment was made as to each document. Information  
4 that is available to the public shall not be designated confidential.

5 (b) A party or non-party may designate a document as confidential by conspicuously  
6 marking each page with the word “confidential” or otherwise identifying that  
7 document as confidential on a slip sheet or as part of a file name if marking each  
8 page is not possible due to its electronic format.

9 (c) Deposition testimony shall be treated as confidential following that deposition and  
10 for thirty days after notice by the court reporter of the completion of the transcript  
11 so that, during that period, a party may designate that testimony as confidential:

12 (1) on the record at the deposition; or

13 (2) after the deposition, by providing written notice of the page and line  
14 numbers being designated as confidential to all counsel of record.

15 At the end of that thirty day period or after the parties have indicated any  
16 confidentiality designations through written notice to all counsel of record  
17 (whichever occurs sooner), the remainder of that deposition testimony will become  
18 non-confidential.

19 (d) If a witness is expected to testify as to confidential or proprietary information, a  
20 party or non-party may request that the witness’s deposition be taken in the  
21 presence of only those persons entitled to receive confidential documents.

22 (e) The parties agree that documents produced in this action should be subject to the  
23 protections provided under Federal Rule Evidence 502(d) and that the provisions  
24 of Federal Rule of Evidence 502(b)(2) are inapplicable to the production of  
25 information, documents, or materials under this Protective Order. Neither the  
26 attorney-client privilege nor the work product protection will be deemed waived  
27 by disclosure connected with this litigation or any other federal or state action of  
28 any claim of privilege or work product protection that the designating party would

1 otherwise be entitled to assert with respect to the protected documents,  
2 information, or materials and their subject matter.

3 (f) The parties acknowledge there may be protected documents that are produced  
4 based on the determination by the producing party that the protected documents  
5 are subject to the fiduciary exception to the attorney-client privilege under ERISA.  
6 The parties agree that such a production of protected documents does not  
7 constitute a waiver or forfeiture—in this or any other action—of any claim of  
8 privilege or work-product protection that the producing party would otherwise be  
9 entitled to assert with respect to the protected documents and their subject matter.  
10 The disclosure by a producing party of privileged or protected documents in this  
11 litigation as part of a production shall not itself constitute a waiver for any  
12 purpose.

13 (g) Nothing in this Protective Order overrides any ethical responsibilities of any  
14 attorney to refrain from examining or disclosing materials that the attorney knows  
15 or reasonably should know to be privileged and to inform the producing party that  
16 such materials have been produced. Nothing contained herein is intended to or  
17 shall serve to limit a party's right to conduct a review of documents, ESI or  
18 information (including metadata) for relevance, responsiveness, and/or segregation  
19 of privileged and/or protected information before production. Further nothing  
20 contained herein is intended to reduce the time frame provided to the disclosing  
21 party to complete their review should they choose to do so. Nothing contained  
22 herein is intended to limit a party's proportionality and burden arguments  
23 specifically related to the costs to conduct a review of documents, ESI or  
24 information (including metadata) for relevance, responsiveness, and/or segregation  
25 of privileged and/or protected information before production.

26 (h) This Protective Order shall not be deemed or construed as a waiver of any right to  
27 object to the furnishing of information in response to any discovery request. Nor  
28 shall this Protective Order be deemed or construed as a waiver of the attorney-

1 client, work product, or any other privilege, or of the rights of any party, person, or  
2 entity to oppose the production of any documents or information on any  
3 permissible grounds. Further, this Protective Order does not limit, restrict, or  
4 otherwise affect the ability of any party to seek the production of documents,  
5 testimony, or information from any source.

6 (i) Neither this Protective Order nor a party's designation of particular confidential  
7 documents affects or establishes the admissibility or waiver of any right to object  
8 to the admissibility at trial of any confidential documents covered by this  
9 Protective Order.

10 (j) This Order applies only to pre-trial proceedings and does not apply to use at trial  
11 of confidential documents. If the parties have not reached agreement as to  
12 confidentiality of a listed trial exhibit, the party that designated the confidential  
13 document may file a motion for protective order with regard to the confidentiality  
14 of the document at trial within ten (10) days after service of the other party's list of  
15 trial exhibits in their pre-trial submissions. To the extent any confidential  
16 document is proposed for use at trial, but was not listed as a trial exhibit prior to  
17 trial, the parties shall attempt to resolve any issues regarding such confidentiality  
18 by agreement (which, if the agreement provides the document will be treated as  
19 confidential at trial, shall be approved by the court) or, if no agreement can be  
20 reached, by asking the court to address the issue prior to the introduction of the  
21 document as evidence.

22 **3 Who May Receive a Confidential Document.**

23 (a) A confidential document may be used only in this action.

24 (b) No person receiving a confidential document may reveal it except to:

25 (1) the court and its staff;

26 (2) an attorney or an attorney's partner, associate, or staff;

27 (3) a person shown on the face of the confidential document (or the email to  
28 which the document was attached, if any) to have authored or received it;

- 1 (4) a court reporter or videographer retained in connection with this action;
- 2 (5) a party;
- 3 (6) witnesses in the course of deposition or trial testimony where counsel has a
- 4 reasonable and good faith belief that examination with respect to the
- 5 document is appropriate in conducting discovery or for trial purposes in
- 6 this case, and any person who is being prepared to testify where counsel
- 7 has a reasonable and good faith belief that such person will be a witness in
- 8 this case and that an examination with respect to the document is necessary
- 9 in connection with such testimony;
- 10 (7) data recovery vendors, graphic consultants, or outside copy services;
- 11 (8) other persons by written agreement of all the Parties or as authorized by the
- 12 Court; and
- 13 (9) any person who:<sup>1</sup>
- 14 (A) is retained to assist a party or attorney with this action; and
- 15 (B) signs a declaration that contains the person's name, address,
- 16 employer, and title, and that is in substantially this form:

17 I have read, and agree to be bound by, the protective order

18 in the case captioned *DuVaney v. Delta*, No. 2:21-cv-02186-RFB-

19 EJY, in the United States District Court for the District of Nevada.

20 As soon as my work in connection with that action has ended, but

21 not later than 30 days after the termination of that action (including

22 any appeals), I will return or destroy any confidential document that

23 I received, any copy of or excerpt from a confidential document,

24 and any notes or other document that contains information from a

25 confidential document.

26 I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true

27 and correct.

- 28 (c) If a confidential document is revealed to someone not entitled to receive it, the
- parties must make reasonable efforts to retrieve it.
- (d) If a confidential document makes specific reference to the conduct or statement of
- a specific person, counsel may discuss such conduct or statement with such

---

<sup>1</sup> All such acknowledgments shall be retained by counsel and shall be subject to in camera review by the Court if good cause for review is demonstrated by opposing counsel.

1 person, provided that no portion of the confidential document other than that  
2 which specifically refers to such person's conduct or statement is revealed.

3 (e) If any party in possession of a confidential document is served with a subpoena,  
4 request for production of documents, or other similar legal process in another  
5 proceeding seeking production of a confidential document, the receiving party  
6 shall give written notice, by electronic mail, to the undersigned counsel for the  
7 party that produced the information designated as confidential within five (5)  
8 business days of receipt of the subpoena. To the extent permitted by applicable  
9 law, the receiving party shall not produce any of the producing party's information  
10 designated as confidential for a period of at least ten (10) business days after  
11 providing the required notice to the producing party. If, within ten (10) business  
12 days of receiving such notice, the producing party provides written notice to the  
13 receiving party that it opposes production of its information designated as  
14 confidential, the receiving party shall not thereafter produce such information  
15 except pursuant to a court order (or other order that subjects the party to penalties  
16 for noncompliance) requiring compliance with the subpoena, request for  
17 production, or other legal process. The producing party shall be solely responsible  
18 for asserting any objection to the requested production. The receiving party shall  
19 provide a copy of this Protective Order to the third-party requesting production of  
20 information designated as confidential. This Protective Order does not require the  
21 receiving party or anyone else covered by this Protective Order to challenge or  
22 appeal any such order requiring production of information designated as  
23 confidential covered by this Protective Order, or to subject itself to any penalties  
24 for noncompliance with any such order, or to seek any relief from a court.

25 **4 Serving This Protective Order on a Non-Party.** A party serving a subpoena on a non-  
26 party must simultaneously serve a copy of this Protective Order.

27 **5 Correcting an Error in Designation.** A party or non-party who discloses or produces a  
28 confidential document not designated as confidential may, within thirty (30) days after

1 discovering the error, provide notice of the error and identify the information by bates  
2 label or, where not bates labeled, by document title and page number(s) or page and line  
3 number(s), and produce a copy of the document designated as confidential.

4 **6 Use of a Confidential Document in Court.**

5 (a) Filing. A party intending to file a confidential document with the court or  
6 intending to file with the court any document or papers containing or making  
7 reference to the content of a confidential document shall file that document under  
8 seal in accordance with LR IA 10-5 until the Court orders otherwise or denies  
9 permission to file under seal.

10 (b) Presentation at a hearing or trial. A party intending to present another party's or a  
11 non-party's confidential document at a hearing or trial must promptly notify the  
12 other party or the non-party so that the other party or the non-party may seek relief  
13 from the court.

14 **7 Changing a Confidential Document's Designation.**

15 (a) Document disclosed or produced by a party. A confidential document disclosed or  
16 produced by a party remains confidential unless the party who designated the  
17 document as confidential revokes that designation (which it may do at any time) or  
18 the court orders otherwise.

19 (b) Document produced by a non-party. A confidential document produced by a non-  
20 party remains confidential unless the non-party agrees to change its designation or  
21 the court orders otherwise after providing an opportunity for the non-party to be  
22 heard.

23 (c) Changing a designation by court order. A party who cannot obtain agreement to  
24 change a designation may move the court for an order changing the designation. If  
25 the motion affects a document produced by a non-party then, with respect to the  
26 motion, that non-party is entitled to the same notice and opportunity to be heard as  
27 a party. The party or non-party who designated a document as confidential must  
28 show that the designation satisfies Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(c).



1 **8 Handling a Confidential Document after Termination of Litigation.**

- 2 (a) Within 60 days after the termination of this action (including any appeals), each  
3 party must:
- 4 (1) return or destroy all confidential documents that it did not produce in the  
5 action; and
- 6 (2) notify the disclosing or producing party or non-party that it has returned or  
7 destroyed all confidential documents within the 60-day period.
- 8 (b) Notwithstanding paragraph 8(a), each attorney may retain a copy of any  
9 confidential document submitted to the court or any correspondence involving the  
10 parties that quotes or describes a confidential document.
- 11 (c) Where the parties agree to destroy information designated as confidential, the  
12 destroying party shall provide all parties with a written certification of counsel  
13 confirming the destruction of all information designated as confidential.

14 **9 Inadvertent Disclosure or Production to a Party of a Protected Document.**

- 15 (a) Notice.
- 16 (1) A party or non-party who discovers that it has inadvertently disclosed or  
17 produced a protected document must promptly notify the receiving party  
18 and describe the basis of the claim of privilege or protection. If the party  
19 or non-party provides such notice and description, the privilege or  
20 protection is not waived.
- 21 (2) A party who discovers that it may have received an inadvertently disclosed  
22 or produced protected document must promptly notify the disclosing or  
23 producing party or non-party.
- 24 (b) Handling of protected documents. A party who is notified or discovers that it may  
25 have received a protected document must comply with Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(b)(5)(B).

26 **10 Security Precautions and Data Breaches.**

- 27 (a) Each party must make reasonable efforts to protect the confidentiality of any  
28 confidential document disclosed or produced to that party.

1 (b) A party who learns of a breach of confidentiality must promptly notify the  
2 disclosing or producing party or non-party of the scope and nature of that breach  
3 and make reasonable efforts to remedy the breach.

4 **11 Modifications.**

5 (a) If a party determines this Protective Order does not sufficiently protect  
6 confidential documents produce or disclosed, or that this order should otherwise be  
7 modified, it may seek to modify this order with the agreement of all of the parties  
8 and approval of the court. If such agreement cannot be obtained, any party may  
9 seek modification of this Protective Order by motion of the court.

10 (b) The Court retains the right to allow, sua sponte or upon motion, disclosure of any  
11 subject covered by this Protective Order or to modify this Protective Order at any  
12 time in the interests of justice.

13 **12 Survival of Obligations.** The obligations imposed by this Protective Order survive the  
14 termination of this action.

15 **STIPULATED TO:**

16 Dated: February 28, 2024

17 /s/ Christopher Barrett  
18 Robert A. Izard (pro hac vice)  
19 Christopher Barrett (pro hac vice)  
20 **IZARD, KINDALL & RAABE LLP**  
21 29 South Main Street  
22 Suite 305  
23 West Hartford, CT 06107  
24 860-493-6292  
25 Fax: 860-493-6290  
26 dneedham@ikrlaw.com  
27 rizard@ikrlaw.com  
28 cbarrett@ikrlaw.com

**MOTLEY RICE LLC**  
Douglas P. Needham (pro hac vice)  
One Corporate Center  
20 Church Street, 17th Floor  
Hartford, CT 06103  
Telephone: 860-218-2720  
dneedham@motleyrice.com

/s/ Melissa D. Hill  
Melissa D. Hill, Esq. (Pro Hac Vice)  
**MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP**  
101 Park Avenue  
New York, NY 10178-0060  
melissa.hill@morganlewis.com

Scott M. Mahoney, Esq.  
Nevada Bar. No. 1099  
**FISHER & PHILLIPS LLP**  
300 South Fourth Street #1500  
Las Vegas, Nevada 89101  
smahoney@fisherphillips.com

*Attorneys for Defendants*

1 **KEMP JONES, LLP**  
Don Springmeyer, Esq.  
2 Nevada Bar No. 1021  
d.springmeyer@kempjones.com  
3 Michael Gayan, Esq.  
Nevada Bar No. 11135  
4 m.gayan@kempjones.com  
3800 Howard Hughes Pkwy., 17th Floor  
5 Las Vegas, Nevada 89169  
(P) (702) 385-6000  
6 (F) (702) 385-6001

7 *Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

8 IT IS SO ORDERED:

9  
10   
11 DAYNA J. ZOUCHAK  
UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE

12 DATED: February 28, 2024  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28