

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA  
Alexandria Division**

---

<b>TRIANTAFYLLOS TAFAS,</b>	:	
	:	
	:	
<b>Plaintiff,</b>	:	
	:	
<b>v.</b>	:	<b>1:07cv846 (JCC/TRJ)</b>
	:	
<b>JON W. DUDAS, et al.,</b>	:	
	:	
<b>Defendants.</b>	:	

---

**CONSOLIDATED WITH**

---

<b>SMITHKLINE BEECHAM</b>	:	
<b>CORPORATION,</b>	:	
<b>d/b/a GLAXOSMITHKLINE, et al.,</b>	:	
	:	
<b>Plaintiffs,</b>	:	
	:	
<b>v.</b>	:	<b>1:07cv1008 (JCC/TRJ)</b>
	:	
<b>JON W. DUDAS, et al.,</b>	:	
	:	
<b>Defendants.</b>	:	

---

**THE GLAXOSMITHKLINE PLAINTIFFS’  
RESPONSE TO PLAINTIFF TAFAS’  
RULE 72(a) OBJECTIONS**

Plaintiff in the lead case (No. 1:07cv846), Triantafyllos Tafas (“Tafas”), has filed objections (Docket # 98) to the Magistrate Judge’s rulings (*Order*, Docket # 93, corrected and amended Docket # 102). Plaintiffs in the consolidated case (No. 1:07cv1008), collectively referred in this case to as “GSK,” take no position on Tafas’ objections to the Magistrate Judge’s rulings.

Date: December 12, 2007

Respectfully submitted,

/s/

---

Craig C. Reilly VSB # 20942  
RICHARDS MCGETTIGAN REILLY  
& WEST, P.C.  
1725 Duke Street, Suite 600  
Alexandria, Virginia 22314  
Tel: (703) 549-5353  
Email: craig.reilly@rmrwlaw.com  
Fax: (703) 683-2941  
*Counsel for Plaintiffs*

*Of Counsel for Plaintiffs:*

John M. Desmarais  
Peter J. Armenio  
KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP  
Citigroup Center  
153 East 53rd Street  
New York, New York 10022  
Tel: (212) 446-4800

F. Christopher Mizzo  
Jeffrey Bossert Clark  
D. Sean Trainor VSB # 43260  
KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP  
655 15th Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
Tel: (202) 879-5000

**ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFFS**  
**SmithKline Beecham Corporation d/b/a**  
**GlaxoSmithKline, SmithKline Beecham plc,**  
**and Glaxo Group Limited d/b/a**  
**GlaxoSmithKline**

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a true copy of the foregoing pleading was filed electronically this 12th day of December 2007 using the CM/ECF system, which will send notification by electronic means to the following counsel of record:

CHUCK ROSENBERG  
UNITED STATES ATTORNEY  
Lauren A. Wetzler  
R. Joseph Sher  
Andrew Price  
Assistant United States Attorneys  
Justin W. Williams United States Attorney's Building  
2100 Jamieson Avenue  
Alexandria, Virginia 22314  
Lauren.Wetzler@usdoj.gov  
*Counsel for All Defendants*

Joseph D. Wilson, Esq.  
KELLY DRYE & WARREN LLP  
3050 K Street, NW, Suite 400  
Washington, DC 20007-5108  
[jwilson@kelleydrye.com](mailto:jwilson@kelleydrye.com)  
*Counsel for Plaintiff Triantafyllos Tafas (# 1:07cv846)*

Rebecca Malkin Carr  
PILLSBURY WINTHROP SHAW PITTMAN LLP  
2300 N St NW  
Washington, DC 20037  
[rebecca.carr@pillsburylaw.com](mailto:rebecca.carr@pillsburylaw.com)

*and*

Scott J. Pivnick  
PILLSBURY WINTHROP SHAW PITTMAN LLP  
1650 Tysons Boulevard  
McLean, Virginia 22102-4856  
[Scott.pivnick@pillsburylaw.com](mailto:Scott.pivnick@pillsburylaw.com)  
*Counsel for Amicus Elan Pharmaceuticals, Inc.*

James Murphy Dowd  
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE & DORR LLP  
1455 Pennsylvania Ave NW  
Washington, DC 20004  
[james.dowd@wilmerhale.com](mailto:james.dowd@wilmerhale.com)  
*Counsel for Amicus Pharmaceutical Research and Manufacturers of America*

Dawn-Marie Bey  
KIRKPATRICK STOCKTON LLP  
700 13th Street, N.W.  
Suite 800  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
[dbey@kslaw.com](mailto:dbey@kslaw.com)  
*Counsel for Amici Hexas, LLC, The Roskamp Institute, and  
Tikvah Therapeutics, Inc.*

Randall Karl Miller  
ARNOLD & PORTER LLP  
1600 Tysons Blvd  
Suite 900  
McLean, VA 22102  
[randall\\_miller@aporter.com](mailto:randall_miller@aporter.com)  
*Counsel for Amicus Biotechnology Industry Organization  
and  
Counsel for Amicus Monsanto Company*

Thomas J. O'Brien  
MORGAN LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP  
1111 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington D.C. 20004  
(202) 739-5186 (phone)  
(202) 739-3001 (fax)  
[to'brien@morganlewis.com](mailto:to'brien@morganlewis.com)  
*Counsel for Amicus American Intellectual Property  
Law Association*

Charles Gorenstein  
BIRCH, STEWART, KOLASCH AND BIRCH, LLP  
8110 Gatehouse Road  
Suite 100 East  
Falls Church, Virginia 22042  
[cg@bskb.com](mailto:cg@bskb.com)  
*Counsel for Amicus Intellectual Property Institute  
William Mitchell College of Law*

/s/  
Craig C. Reilly VSB # 20942  
RICHARDS MCGETTIGAN REILLY & WEST, P.C.  
1725 Duke Street, Suite 600  
Alexandria, Virginia 22314  
TEL: (703) 549-5353  
EMAIL: [craig.reilly@rmrwlaw.com](mailto:craig.reilly@rmrwlaw.com)  
fax: (703) 683-2941  
*Counsel for GSK plaintiffs (# 1:07cv1008)*