## Huited Bates $\mathfrak{C u m u t}$ of Apprals

for the

## Sarnid Ciraut

PATRICK CARIOU,
Plaintiff-Appellee,

- v. -

RICHARD PRINCE,
Defendant-Appellant, GAGOSIAN GALLERY, INC., LAWRENCE GAGOSIAN, Defendants-Appellants.

## ON APPEAL FROM THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

 FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK
## JOINT APPENDIX <br> Volume 6 of 9 (Pages A-1350 to A-1619)

Hollis Anne Gonerka Bart
Chaya Weinberg-Brodt
Dara G. Hammerman
Azmina N. JASANI
Withers Bergman LLP
Attorneys for Defendants-Appellants Gagosian
Gallery, Inc. and Lawrence Gagosian
430 Park Avenue, $10^{\text {th }}$ Floor
New York, New York 10022
(212) 848-9800

Daniel J. Brooks
Eric A. Boden
Schnader Harrison Segal \& Lewis LLP
Attorneys for Plaintiff-Appellee
140 Broadway, Suite 3100
New York, New York 10005
(212) 973-8000

Jonathan D. Schiller
George F. Carpinello
Joshua I. Schiller
Boies, Schiller \& Flexner LLP
Attorneys for Defendant-Appellant Richard Prince
575 Lexington Avenue, $7^{\text {th }}$ Floor
New York, New York 10022
(212) 446-2300

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page
Docket Entries. ..... A-1
Amended Complaint, dated January 14, 2009 ..... A-16
Answer to Amended Complaint of Defendant
Richard Prince, dated March 3, 2009 ..... A-32
Answer to Amended Complaint of Defendants Gagosian Gallery, Inc. and Lawrence Gagosian, dated March 3, 2009 ..... A-41
Plaintiff's Initial Disclosure, dated April 30, 2009 ..... A-53
Scheduling Order, dated June 19, 2009 ..... A-58
Memo Endorsed Letter, dated January 27, 2010 ..... A-60
Order of the Honorable Deborah A. Batts, dated March 19, 2010 ..... A-61
Memo Endorsed Letter, dated April 21, 2010 ..... A-62
Memo Endorsed Letter, dated May 3, 2010 ..... A-63
Notice of Motion by Plaintiff for Summary
Judgment, dated May 14, 2010 ..... A-64
Plaintiff's Statement Pursuant to Local Rule 56.1, dated May 14, 2010 ..... A-66
Declaration of Daniel J. Brooks, for Plaintiff, inMay 7, 2010A-75
Exhibit A to Brooks Declaration -
Amended Complaint, dated January 14, 2009
(Reproduced herein at pp. A-16-A-31)

## ii

## Page

Exhibit B to Brooks Declaration -
Answer to Amended Complaint of Defendant
Richard Prince, dated March 3, 2009
(Reproduced herein at pp. A-32-A-40)
Exhibit C to Brooks Declaration -
Answer to Amended Complaint of Defendants
Gagosian Gallery, Inc. and Lawrence Gagosian, dated March 3, 2009
(Reproduced herein at pp. A-41-A-52)
Exhibit D to Brooks Declaration -
Excerpts from Deposition Transcript of Patrick
Cariou, dated January 12, 2010 A-84

Exhibit E to Brooks Declaration -
Excerpts from Videotaped Deposition Transcript of Richard Prince, dated October 6, 2009A-117

Exhibit F to Brooks Declaration -
Excerpts from Videotaped Deposition Transcript of Lawrence Gagosian, dated October 8, 2009..... A-167

Exhibit G to Brooks Declaration -
Excerpts from Deposition Transcript of Gagosian Gallery, Inc. by Louise Neri, dated
December 17, 2009
A-185
Exhibit H to Brooks Declaration -
Excerpts from Deposition Transcript of Gagosian
Gallery, Inc. by Alison McDonald, dated
December 17, 2009
A-189
Exhibit I to Brooks Declaration -
Excerpts from Deposition Transcript of John
Olson, dated November 16, 2009

## iii

## Page

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { Exhibit J to Brooks Declaration - } \\
& \text { Excerpts from Deposition Transcript of } \\
& \text { Christiane Celle, dated January 26, } 2009 \text {.............. A-203 }
\end{aligned}
$$

Exhibit K to Brooks Declaration -Certificate of Copyright Registration for Bookentitled Yes RastaA-227
Exhibit L to Brooks Declaration -
Cover of Yes Rasta ..... A-229
Exhibit L-1 to Brooks Declaration -
Cover of Yes Rasta ..... A-230
Exhibit L-2 to Brooks Declaration -
Colophon Page of Yes Rasta ..... A-231
Exhibit M to Brooks Declaration -
Cover of the Catalogue published by Gagosian Gallery ..... A-232
Exhibit M-1 to Brooks Declaration - Front, Back and Spine of the Canal Zone Catalogue ..... A-233
Exhibit M-2 to Brooks Declaration -
Title Page of the Canal Zone Catalogue ..... A-236
Exhibit M-3 to Brooks Declaration - List of Works depicted in the Canal Zone Catalogue ..... A-237
Exhibit M-4 to Brooks Declaration - Colophon Page of Canal Zone Catalogue ..... A-240
Exhibit N to Brooks Declaration -22 Paintings depicted in the Canal Zone
CatalogueA-241

## Page

Exhibit O to Brooks Declaration -
Seven additional Prince Paintings depicted in Canal Zone Catalogue ..... A-263
Exhibit P to Brooks Declaration - Stipulation between Plaintiff and Gagosian Defendants, dated January 26, 2010 ..... A-270
Exhibit Q to Brooks Declaration -
Pages from Prince’s Website, including Comments entitled "Practicing Without A License" ..... A-279
Exhibit R to Brooks Declaration -
Interview of Prince in Artforum, March 2003 ..... A-281
Exhibit S to Brooks Declaration - June 3, 2008 E-mail ..... A-284
Exhibit T to Brooks Declaration - Interview of Prince in Interview Magazine ..... A-285
Exhibit U to Brooks Declaration - Comparison Document ..... A-298
Exhibit V to Brooks Declaration - Prince Painting entitled "Canal Zone 2007" ..... A-325
Exhibit V-1 to Brooks Declaration - Canal Zone 2007 ..... A-326
Exhibit W to Brooks Declaration - The Art Newspaper ..... A-327
Exhibit X to Brooks Declaration - Exhibit 32 to Prince Deposition. ..... A-329
Exhibit Y to Brooks Declaration -Printout from Gagosian Gallery WebsiteA-331

## Page

Exhibit Z to Brooks Declaration - Inserts to Canal Zone Catalogue. ..... A-349
Exhibit AA to Brooks Declaration - Blown-up Details from Prince Paintings ..... A-352
Exhibit BB to Brooks Declaration - Landscape ..... A-354
Exhibit CC to Brooks Declaration -
Photographs ..... A-355
Exhibit DD to Brooks Declaration -
"Pitch" from Movie written by Prince ..... A-357
Exhibit EE to Brooks Declaration -
E-mail from Louise Neri to Betsy Biscone, dated October 7, 2008 ..... A-359
Exhibit FF to Brooks Declaration -
Printout from Gagosian Gallery Website ..... A-361
Exhibit GG to Brooks Declaration - Newspaper Advertisements ..... A-364
Exhibit HH to Brooks Declaration -
E-mails from Alison McDonald to Darlina Goldak, dated October 2, 2008 ..... A-369
Exhibit II to Brooks Declaration -
E-mail from Darlina Goldak to Nicole Heck, dated September 25, 2008 ..... A-370
Exhibit JJ to Brooks Declaration - Announcement Card ..... A-371
Exhibit KK to Brooks Declaration -E-mails from Andie Trainer to Jessica Arisohn,dated December 5, 2008A-373
Page
Exhibit LL to Brooks Declaration - Invitation to opening Dinner for the Canal Zone Exhibition ..... A-377
Exhibit MM to Brooks Declaration -E-mails from Tom Duncan to Anita Foden, datedSeptember 6, 2008A-378
Exhibit NN to Brooks Declaration -
E-mails from Karen Ho to Vanessa Riding and Rysia Murphy, dated October 28, 2008 ..... A-380
Exhibit OO to Brooks Declaration -
E-mail from Meredith Dunn to Sam Orlofsky and Others at the Gagosian Gallery, dated October 23, 2008 ..... A-386
Exhibit PP to Brooks Declaration -
E-mail from Vanessa Riding to Barbara Wilhelm Dwek, dated October 23, 2008 ..... A-387
Exhibit QQ to Brooks Declaration -
Invitation List ..... A-388
Exhibit RR to Brooks Declaration -Cariou's Cease and Desist Letter, datedDecember 11, 2008A-395
Exhibit SS to Brooks Declaration -E-mails from Patrick Cariou to Christiane Celle,dated August 28, 2008, with Certified TranslationA-397
Declaration of Eric Doeringer, for Plaintiff, in
Support of Motion for Summary Judgment, datedMay 6, 2010A-400
Exhibit A to Doeringer Declaration -
Letter from Peter J. Toren to Eric Doeringer,dated November 10, 2005A-403

## vii

## Page

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { Exhibit B to Doeringer Declaration - } \\
& \text { Letter from Eric Doeringer to Peter J. Toren, } \\
& \text { undated................................................................ A-405 }
\end{aligned}
$$

Exhibit C to Doeringer Declaration -Letter from Peter J. Toren to Eric Doeringer,dated November 28, 2005A-406
Memorandum of Law in Support of Plaintiff's Motion for Summary Judgment, dated May 14, 2010 ..... A-408
Notice of Motion by Defendants for Summary
Judgment, dated May 14, 2010 ..... A-438
Affidavit of Hollis Gonerka Bart, for Defendants Gagosian Gallery, Inc. and Lawrence Gagosian, in Support of Motion for Summary Judgment, sworn to May 14, 2010 ..... A-440
Exhibit A to Bart Affidavit -
The Tate Collection's Glossary defining the Term Appropriation Art. ..... A-446
Exhibit B to Bart Affidavit -
The Tate Collection’s Glossary defining the Term Collage ..... A-447
Exhibit C to Bart Affidavit -
The Tate Collection's Glossary Information on Marcel Duchamp’s Fountain ..... A-448
Exhibit D to Bart Affidavit -
MOMA, Collection's Information on Andy
Warhol's Gold Marilyn Monroe. ..... A-449
Exhibit E to Bart Affidavit -
Amended Complaint, dated January 14, 2009
(Reproduced herein at pp. A-16-A31)

## viii

Page
Exhibit F to Bart Affidavit -Guggenheim Press Release entitled "RichardPrince: Spiritual America Opens at theGuggenheim Museum September 28".A-453
Exhibit G to Bart Affidavit -
Excerpts from Deposition Transcript of RichardPrince, dated October 6, 2009A-460
Exhibit H to Bart Affidavit -
Artnet's listing for Richard Prince Work availablefor saleA-502
Exhibit I to Bart Affidavit -
Article from artcritical.com entitled "Eighteen
Experts Talk with Brian Appel on the $\$ 1,248,000$Richard Prince Photograph that Has Set a NewWorld Auction Record for Photography"A-507
Exhibit J to Bart Affidavit -
Article from ArtDaily entitled "Sotheby's July
2008 Contemporary Art Evening Sale Triumphs" ..... A-514
Exhibit K to Bart Affidavit -
Excerpt from Trust \& Estates, August 2008 Tableof ContentsA-519
Exhibit L to Bart Affidavit -Excerpts from Deposition Transcript of LawrenceGagosian, dated October 8, 2009A-520
Exhibit M to Bart Affidavit -Richard Prince Book Canal Zone also referred toas "The Catalogue" [See Exhibit 1 to the JointAppendix - Hard Copy of Canal Zone Book]....... A-528
Page
Exhibit N to Bart Affidavit -Stipulation between Plaintiff and GagosianDefendants, dated January 26, 2010(Reproduced herein at pp. A-270-A-278)
Exhibit O to Bart Affidavit -
The Gagosian Gallery General Ledger for the Period from October 1, 2008 to June 30, 2009 ..... A-529
Exhibit P to Bart Affidavit -
Advertisements for the Canal Zone Exhibition. ..... A-530
Exhibit Q to Bart Affidavit -Guest List for the November 8, 2008 Dinner heldat the Gramercy Park Hotel for Richard Prince.A-539
Exhibit R to Bart Affidavit -Excerpts from Deposition Transcript of AnthonyPetrillose, dated October 23, 2009A-547
Exhibit S to Bart Affidavit -Stipulation and Order of Dismissal betweenPlaintiff and Rizzoli International Publications,Inc., entered February 5, 2010A-549Exhibit T to Bart Affidavit -Stipulation between Gagosian and powerHouseCultural Entertainment, Inc., datedFebruary 1, 2010A-551
Exhibit U to Bart Affidavit -Excerpts from Deposition Transcript of PatrickCariou, dated January 12, 2010A-555Exhibit V to Bart Affidavit -Plaintiff's Answers and Objections to DefendantsGagosian Gallery, Inc. and Lawrence Gagosian’sInterrogatories, dated October 5, 2009A-606

## Page

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { Exhibit W to Bart Affidavit - } \\
& \text { powerHouse's Press Release announcing the } \\
& \text { publication Yes Rasta, and categorizing the Book } \\
& \text { as "Photography/Reggae Culture"....................... A-621 }
\end{aligned}
$$

Exhibit X to Bart Affidavit -
Printout of Plaintiff's Website ..... A-622
Exhibit Y to Bart Affidavit -Excerpts from Deposition Transcript ofChristiane Celle, dated January 26, 2010A-715
Exhibit Z to Bart Affidavit -
Letter from Daniel Brooks to the Honorable
Deborah A. Batts, dated February 8, 2010 ..... A-735
Exhibit AA to Bart Affidavit -
Inside Jacket Cover of Yes Rasta ..... A-738
Exhibit BB to Bart Affidavit -
Definition of Appropriation Art from ArtLex ..... A-740
Exhibit CC to Bart Affidavit -Composite Exhibit containing Copies of Imagesof RastafariansA-742
Exhibit DD to Bart Affidavit -Certificate of Copyright Registration for Bookentitled Yes Rasta(Reproduced herein at pp. A-227-A-228)
Exhibit EE to Bart Affidavit -
Photocopy of Patrick Carious’ Book entitled
Yes Rasta [See Exhibit 2 to the Joint Appendix -Hard Copy of Yes Rasta Book]A-743
Affidavit of Richard Prince, Defendant, in Supportof Motion for Summary Judgment, sworn toMay 13, 2010A-744
Page
Exhibit A to Prince Affidavit - Composite Exhibit ..... A-772
Memorandum of Law in Support of Defendants’ Joint Motion for Summary Judgment, dated May 14, 2010 ..... A-812
Rule 56.1 Statement of Uncontested Material Facts
in Support of Defendants' Joint Motion for
Summary Judgment, dated May 14, 2010 ..... A-842
Declaration of Daniel J. Brooks, for Plaintiff, in Opposition to Defendants’ Motion for Summary Judgment, dated June 11, 2010 ..... A-886
Exhibit A to Brooks Declaration -
Excerpts from Deposition Transcript of RichardPrince, dated October 6, 2009A-888
Exhibit B to Brooks Declaration -
Excerpts from Deposition Transcript of Lawrence Gagosian, dated October 8, 2009 ..... A-893
Exhibit C to Brooks Declaration -
Excerpts from Deposition Transcript ofChristiane Celle, dated January 26, 2010A-896
Exhibit D to Brooks Declaration -
Photograph entitled V-J Day in Time Square ..... A-901
Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Defendants’
Motion for Summary Judgment, dated June 14, 2010 ..... A-902
Supplemental Affidavit of Richard Prince,Defendant, in Further Support of Defendants’Motion for Summary Judgment and inOpposition to Plaintiff's Motion for SummaryJudgment, sworn to June 11, 2010A-933

## xii

Page
Exhibit A to Prince Supplemental Affidavit - Composite Exhibit ..... A-936
Counter-Statement Pursuant to Local Civil Rule 56.1 of Undisputed Material Facts in Opposition to Defendants’ Motion for Summary Judgment, dated June 14, 2010 ..... A-937
Defendants Rule 56.1 State of Uncontested Material
Fact in Response to Plaintiff's Statement
Pursuant to Local Rule 56.1, filed June 14, 2010 .. ..... A-970
Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Plaintiff's
Motion for Summary Judgment, dated June 14, 2010 ..... A-984
Affidavit of Hollis Gonerka Bart, for Defendants Gagosian Gallery, Inc. and Lawrence Gagosian, in Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion for Summary Judgment, sworn to June 14, 2010 ..... A-1014
Exhibit A to Bart Affidavit -
Pages from Website of "Ganja Fields and Marijuana Tours" and "Negril Ganja Tour" ..... A-1017
Exhibit B to Bart Affidavit -
Web Pages detailing the Amount of Time Cy
Twombly and Pablo Picasso dedicated to variousWorks of Art.A-1030
Exhibit C to Bart Affidavit - Complaint, dated December 30, 2008 ..... A-1034
Exhibit D to Bart Affidavit -
Excerpts from Deposition Transcript of RichardPrince, dated October 6, 2010A-1049

## xiii

Page
Exhibit E to Bart Affidavit -
Excerpts from Deposition Transcript of Lawrence Gagosian ..... A-1059
Exhibit F to Bart Affidavit -
Excerpts from Deposition Transcript ofChristiane Celle, dated January 26, 2010A-1075
Exhibit G to Bart Affidavit -Excerpts from Deposition Transcript of PatrickCariou, dated January 12, 2010A-1082
Exhibit H to Bart Affidavit -
Excerpts from Deposition Transcript of LouiseNeri, dated December 17, 2009A-1085
Exhibit I to Bart Affidavit -
Excerpts from Deposition Transcript of AllisonMcDonald, dated December 17, 2009A-1091
Response to Defendants’ Counter-Statement ofUncontested Material Facts Pursuant to LocalRule 56.1, dated June 24, 2010A-1102
Reply Memorandum of Law in Support ofPlaintiff's Motion for Summary Judgment, datedJune 24, 2010A-1107
Reply Declaration of Daniel J. Brooks, for Plaintiff, in Further Support of Motion for Summary Judgment, dated June 24, 2010 ..... A-1121
Exhibit A to Brooks Reply Declaration -Excerpts from Deposition Transcript of RichardPrince, dated October 6, 2009A-1123
Exhibit B to Brooks Reply Declaration -
Excerpts from Deposition Transcript of Lawrence
Gagosian, dated October 8, 2009 ..... A-1129
Page
Exhibit C to Brooks Reply Declaration -New York Times Article entitled "If the Copy Isan ArtWork, Then What's the Original?"...............A-1131
Exhibit D to Brooks Reply Declaration - Interview of Richard Prince by Brian Appel ..... A-1133
Defendants’ Joint Memorandum of Law in Reply to Plaintiff's Opposition to Defendants' Joint Motion for Summary Judgment, dated June 24, 2010 ..... A-1139
Reply Affidavit of Hollis Gonerka Bart, for
Defendants Gagosian Gallery, Inc. and LawrenceGagosian, in Further Support of Defendants’Motion for Summary Judgment, sworn toJune 24, 2010A-1154
Exhibit A to Bart Reply Affidavit -
Excerpts from Deposition Transcript of JohnOlson, dated November 16, 2009A-1156
Exhibit B to Bart Reply Affidavit - Chart ..... A-1171
Exhibit C to Bart Reply Affidavit -
Deposition Transcript of Richard Prince, datedOctober 6, 2009A-1173
Letter from Steven M. Hayes to the HonorableDeborah A. Batts, dated June 24, 2010 withAmendment to Defendants' Rule 56.1 Statementof Uncontested Material Facts in Response toPlaintiff's Statement Pursuant to Local Rule 56.1. A-1271
Memo Endorsed Letter, dated July 1, 2010 ..... A-1273
Deposition Transcript of Lawrence Gagosian, dated October 8, 2009 ..... A-1274
Page
Deposition Transcript of Anthony Petrillose, dated October 23, 2009 ..... A-1319
Deposition Transcript of Nancyscans Corp. by John Olson, dated November 16, 2009 ..... A-1350
Deposition Transcript of Alison McDonald, dated December 17, 2009 ..... A-1461
Deposition Transcript of Louise Neri, dated December 17, 2009 ..... A-1486
Deposition Transcript of Patrick Cariou, dated January 12, 2010 ..... A-1503
Deposition Transcript of Christiane Celle, dated January 26, 2010 ..... A-1578
Prince Deposition Exhibits 1-43 ..... A-1620
Cariou Deposition Exhibits 1-18 ..... A-1842
Neri Deposition Exhibits 106-109 ..... A-1988
Gagosian Deposition Exhibits 44-62 ..... A-1995
Olson Deposition Exhibits 92-102 ..... A-2067
Celle Deposition Exhibits 1-3 ..... A-2136
Petrillose Deposition Exhibits 63-91 ..... A-2145
McDonald Deposition Exhibits 103-105 ..... A-2235
Notice of Joint Appeal, dated March 25, 2011 ..... A-2260
Stipulation of Counsel, dated April 11, 2011 ..... A-2262

PATRICK CARIOU,

> Plaintiff,

- against -

RICHARD PRTNCE, GAGOSIAN GALLERY, INC.
LAWRENCE GAGOSIAN and RIZZOIIT INTERNATIONAL PUBLICATIONS, INC.,

Defendants.

DEPOSITION UPON ORAL EXAMINATION OF
Non-Party Witness, NANCYSCANS CORP. by JOHN OLSON, Chief Executive Officer, held pursuant to Notice of Examination on the 16th day of November 2009 at 2:05 P. M. at the offices of SONYA DEL PERAL, ESQ., 22 Park Row, Chatham, New York 12037 before CHARIES E. M. JOHNSON, a Court Reporter and Notary Public in the State of New York.

Valley Reporting Service, Inc. 115 Green Street
Kingston, New York 12401
(845) 331-4020

APPEARANCES:

SCHNADER, HARRISON, SEGAL and LENIS, ESQS.,
140 Broadway, Suite 3100, New York, New York 10005 appearing on behalf of the PLATNTIFF (ERIC A. BODEN, ESQ., of Counsel).

WITHERS and BERGMAN, ESQS., 430 Park Avenue, 10th Floor, New York, New York 10022 appearing on behalf of the DEFENDANT, GAGOSIAN GALLERY, INC. and LAWRENCE GAGOSIAN (HOLUIS GONERKA BART, ESQ., of Counsel).

HANLY, CONROY, BIERSTEIN, SHERIDAN, FISHER and HAYES, ESQS., 112 Madison Avenue, New York, New York 10016 appearing on behalf of the DEFENDANT, RICHARD PRINCE (SIEVEN M. HAYES, ESQ., of Counsel).

SONYA DEI PERAL, ESQ., 22 Park Row, Chatham, New York 12037 appearing on behalf of NANCYSCANS, CORP. and the WITNESS, JOHN OLSON.

$$
S \quad T \quad I \quad P \quad U \quad L \quad A \quad T \quad I \quad O \quad N \quad S
$$

IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREFE, by and between the attorneys for the respective parties hereto, that:

All rights, including the right to object to any question, except as to the form thereof, or to strike any testimony at this examination, is hereby reserved; and that, in addition, the failure to object to any question or to move to strike any testimony at this examination shall not be a bar or a waiver to make such motion at, and is reserved to, the trial of this action.

This deposition may be sworn to by the Witness being examined before a Notary Public other than the Notary public before whom this examination was begun, but the failure to do so or the failure to return the original of this deposition to counsel shall not be deemed a waiver of any rights, and shall not be controlled thereby.

The filing of the original of this deposition is hereby waived.

IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREFED, that a copy of this examination shall be furnished to the attorney of the Witness being examined without cost or charge.

PATRICK CARIOU AGAINST RICHARC PRINCE, EI AL
JOHN OLSON:
having been first duly sworn by the Notary Public, was examined and testified as follows:

EXAMINATION BY MR. BODEN:
Q. Good morning. My name is Eric Boden. I represent the Plaintiff in this action, Patrick Cariou, and the law firm that I work for is Schnader, Harrison, Segal and Lewis.

We represent Mr. Cariou in this action against three Defendants; one of whom is not here today, Rizzoli International Publications.

The other Defendants are Mr. Hayes. Mr.
Hayes is representing Richard Prince. And Miss Bart is here representing Gagosian Gallery and Lawrence Gagosian in this action.

Now, have you ever been deposed before?
A. No.
Q. Have you ever been a party to a lawsuit?
A. No.
Q. You have never given sworn testimony before?
A. No.
Q. All right. Without divulging any conversations and the

JOHN OLSON
subject of any conversations that you have had with your attorney or any of the attorneys working for this office, can you tell me what you did to prepare for today's deposition.
A. I met with Counsel briefly. I reviewed the subpoena, and I provided the information, as I understand it, that pertains to the subpoena.
Q. By information, you supplied documents from your company, NancyScans, that you provided to your attorney; yes?
A. Yes.

MR. BODEN: I would like to introduce the subpoena, which you're referring to, for identification purposes. So, we will mark this as an exhibit. Plaintiff's Exhibit 92.
(A subpoena was marked Plaintiff's Exhibit No. 92 for identification this date.)

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. I would like you to look at this subpoena. Please, take your time, and look through it.
A. (The Witness complied.).
Q. Do you recognize that as the subpoena which you were

## JOHN OLSON

served with pursuant to your testifying here today?
A. Yes.
Q. All right. And you understand that today pursuant to this subpoena -- which was addressed to NancyScans, Inc. incorrectly -- it was supposed to be to NancyScans Corp. -- that you are testifying on behalf of NancyScans and not for yourself individually?
A. Yes.
Q. I would like you to turn, please, to the second to the last page of the subpoena to which an exhibit was attached.
A. (The Witness complied.).
Q. Do you understand that these elements and these listed items on the exhibit, which were referenced on the first page of the subpoena, as these are the topics which you're here today to testify about on behalf of NancyScans?
A. Yes.
Q. Did you look through these two lists -- the items in these two lists -- in order to develop and give to your attorney -- well, not develop -- but in order to look for documents in NancyScans' possession and to give them

JOHN OLSON
to your attorney?
A. Yes.
Q. What is your address, Mr. Olson?
A. 124 Hudson Avenue, Chatham 12037.
Q. And that's your personal address or NancyScans' address?
A. NancyScans.
Q. All right. And I know you said earlier off the record that -- and let's get it on the record -- your position is --
A. I'm CEO.
Q. -- Chief Executive Officer.
A. Yes.
Q. Is NancyScans a public or private corporation?
A. Privately held.
Q. Are there any other officers of the company?
A. Yes.
Q. How many others?
A. Four. Excuse me. How many would you --
Q. Other officers.
A. I misunderstood that question.
Q. Other officers.

JOHN OLSON
A. One other officer.
Q. And what position does that person hold?
A. President.
Q. That is not you?
A. Not me.
Q. Who is President?
A. Nancy Olson.
Q. How long have you been the Chief Executive Officer of NancyScans?
A. About 15 years.
Q. How old is NancyScans? Was when was it incorporated?
A. 1994.
Q. Has NancyScans worked on projects for Richard Prince on more than one occasion in the past?
A. Yes.
Q. Do you know how many occasions you have worked for Mr. Prince?
A. No.
Q. When was the last time in your role as CEO of NancyScans you spoke to Mr. Prince?

And the reason I say in your role as CEO, if you had person conversations with Mr. Prince, I'm not

Valley Reporting Service, Inc. (845) 331-4020

JOHN OLSON
interested in that.
A. 2009 .
Q. Are you currently working on any project with Mr. Prince?
A. No.
Q. Now, the majority of my questions today -- and I hope it won't be a very long day -- are going to relate to one distinct project for which NancyScans worked on for Mr. Prince.

And in order to streamline this process, I would like to define for you -- and you don't have to adopt my definition of the term, but whenever I use the term I want you to understand that I'm speaking about the same project that you are thinking about.

So, that term that I'm going to define would be the Canal Zone project. That be will be NancyScans' work for Mr. Prince in the development or in the creation of paintings that included among other things images of Rastafarian men.

Do you understand that?
A. Yes.

MS. BART: Objection, form.

## JOHN OLSON

MR. HAYES: Not to continue to make
objections, I also take objection to the form.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. You can answer.
A. Yes.
Q. I want to show you what was previously marked as Exhibit 42 in another deposition related to this action, and this is a catalog entitled Canal Zone.

This is actually not the exact exhibit. The exact exhibit was a copy of this book, but I brought the actual book.

I want you to look at that. Tell me if you have ever seen the Canal Zone book before. And you can look through it, if that will help you answer the question.
A. I have seen the book.
Q. When did you see the book? When was the last time or the first time you saw the book?
A. December 2008.
Q. Are you aware that Gagosian Gallery is the publisher of that catalog?

MS. BART: Objection, form.

JOHN OLSON
THE WITNESS: No.
MR. BODEN: I'm sorry?
THE WITNESS: No.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. Are you aware that there was an exhibition of paintings created by Richard Prince in November and December of 2008, which displayed Canal Zone paintings?
A. Yes.
Q. Are you aware whether any of those paintings displayed during that exhibition are also displayed in this catalog?
A. No.
Q. When NancyScans was retained to work on the Canal Zone project with Mr. Prince, were you the first person at NancyScans who spoke with Mr. Prince?
A. I don't know.
Q. On previous projects that you worked with Mr. Prince on -- that NancyScans worked with Mr. Prince on -- were you the point of contact with Mr. Prince on the projects?
A. On occasion.
Q. Who else would speak regularly with Mr. Prince about

JOHN OLSON
these previous projects?
MS. BART: Objection to form.
THE WITNESS: Nancy Olson.
BY MR. BODEN: (Contimed.)
Q. And Nancy Olson is President of NancyScans?
A. Yes.
Q. And Nancy Olson is your wife?
A. Yes.
Q. Can you tell me what instructions Mr. Prince gave to NancyScans pursuant to the Canal Zone project? I know it's sort of a general question. But what were you retained to do for Mr. Prince in the Canal Zone project?
A. We would scan and print materials that he sent us.
Q. All the material that you received from Mr. Prince, did it come in hard copy form on this specific Canal zone project?
A. I don't -- I don't remember.
Q. Would you have receive any electronic material from Mr. Prince?
A. No.
Q. You never received any images that were saved onto a PDF

## JOHN OLSON

file or a TIF file or a JPEG file or any of those?
A. No.
Q. It was always hard copies that you received?
A. I think so.
Q. How would you receive those hard copies?
A. How would they be transported to us?
Q. Yes.
A. They would either come by overnight carrier or we would pick them up.
Q. Where would you pick them up from?
A. At his studio.
Q. Would Mr. Prince ever deliver items to you at NancyScans' office?
A. No.
Q. When you went to his studio to pick up items, did you receive them directly from Mr. Prince?
A. I don't remember.
Q. Did you ever go to his studio to pick up items for this specific project, if you recall?
A. I don't remember.
Q. And when you refer to his studio, are you referring to his studio in Rennselaerville, New York?

JOHN OLSON
A. Yes.
Q. You have personally been to that studio?
A. Yes.
Q. And you do not recall whether any of your previous -strike that.

In any of your previous visits to that studio to pick up material for NancyScans, did you ever meet directly with Mr. Prince?
A. No.
Q. Do you recall the names of anyone that you did meet on those previous visits to the Rennselaerville studio?
A. No.
Q. All right. Now, I want to show you what was previously marked as Exhibit 41 in this action. I would like you to feel free to look in the interior of that publication.
A. (The Witness complied.).
Q. And do you see that Exhibit 41 is a book entitled Yes Rasta Photography by Patrick Cariou?
A. Yes.
Q. Have you ever seen that book before?
A. No.

JOHN OLSON
Q. Have you ever -- strike that.

As you're looking through that book, do you recognize any of the pages within the book? Have you ever seen any of those?

MS. BART: Objection, form.
THE WITNESS: You know, I looked at this briefly. I don't recognize anything.

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. In connection with NancyScans' work on the Canal Zone project, did Mr. Prince ever send to NancyScans or release to NancyScans, whether officers or other employees, pages from a book, whatever book that might be, with photographs on it?

MS. BART: Objection, form.
Q. If you recall.

MS. BART: Objection, form.
THE WIINESS: I wouldn't know where the photographs came from.

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. Did you ever receive -- when you received hard copy material in connection with the Canal zone project, were they photographs?

Valley Reporting Service, Inc. (845) 331-4020

JOHN OLSON
A. Yes.
Q. Do you recall if -- strike that.

Do you recall what paper the photographs were on?
A. Matte paper.
Q. Do you recall whether any of the paragraphs on matte paper that you received had torn edges? Were they usually -- strike that.

Do you recall whether any of the photographs on matte paper that you received had torn edges?
A. No.
Q. Earlier you testified your general instructions were to scan, I believe, photographs for Mr. Prince in connection with the Canal Zone project.

MS. BART: Objection to form as to mischaracterizing his testimony.
Q. You can answer.
A. We scanned and printed photographs.
Q. Who gave you instructions from Richard Prince -- from Richard Prince or any -- strike that.

Whose instructions were you following to scan and print photographs?

JOHN OLSON
A. I don't remember.
Q. Were you the person from Nancyscans who received instructions to work on the Canal Zone project?
A. To the best I recall, I don't remember receiving the Canal zone project piece-by-piece, as you're describing it.
Q. Let me ask you this: How many employees are there of NancyScans --
A. Eight.
Q. -- who worked on the Canal Zone project?
A. There were eight employee.
Q. All of eight of those employees worked on the Canal Zone project to your understanding?
A. No.
Q. How many worked on the Canal zone project?
A. Two, possibly three.
Q. And were you one of these two or three?
A. Yes.
Q. Was your wife, Nancy Olson --
A. Yes.
Q. -- the third who would have been --
A. It would have been Mack Bruebaker.

## JOHN OLSON

Q. Does Mr. Bruebaker have an official title at NancyScans?
A. Digital Manager.
Q. You earlier testified that you worked previous to the Canal Zone project with Mr. Prince, you being NancyScans; correct?

MS. BART: Objection.
MR. HAYES: Objection to the form. THE WITNESS: Yes.

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. In these other projects in which NancyScans worked for Mr. Prince, was the job of NancyScans similar to the Canal Zone project, to scan and print photographs? MS. BART: Objection to form. THE WITNESS: Yes.

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. Were you or anyone else at NancyScans, if you know, ever requested to tear pages out of a book in connection with the Canal Zone project?
A. No.
Q. Now, the hard copy items that you earlier testified to receiving in connection with the Canal zone project,

JOHN OLSON
were you ever told to source any of those photographs on matte paper?
A. No.
Q. Did you or anyone else at NancyScans ask what the source of those photographs was?
A. No.
Q. As you sit here today, do you know what the source of those photographs were?

MS. PERAL: Objection. It calls for speculation.

MS. BART: Objection. MR. HAYES: Objection. THE WITNESS: No.

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. Did Mr. Prince or anyone else at Mr. Prince's or on of behalf of Mr. Prince ever tell you any of the materials he or she was sending you in connection with the Canal Zone project were copyrighted photographs?

MS. BART: Objection, form.
MR. HAYES: Objection, form.
THE WITNESS: NO.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)

JOHN OLSON
Q. Mr. Olson, are you familiar with ink jet or ink jetted?
A. Yes.
Q. What is ink jet or ink jetted? What does that term mean?
A. It's a technology.
Q. Can you describe what that technology involves?
A. It's ink being placed on a substrate to reproduce the data that resides in a digital file.
Q. Did you employ ink jet technology in connection with the Canal Zone project?
A. Yes.
Q. Can you explain how one, in layman's terms, if it's possible, performs ink jetting on, for example, a photograph that you receive.

MR. HAYES: Objection to the form.
MS. BART: Objection to the form.
MS. PERAL: Objection to the form.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. Do you understand the question?
A. Can you rephrase?
Q. Sure I will. By way of a hypothetical -- it might be easiest -- if NancyScans received a hard copy

JOHN OLSON
photograph, and the instructions from the photographer are to print or rather copy and print, this photograph, is it possible to employ ink jet technology in order to achieve that instruction?
A. Yes.
Q. And how would one do that?
A. If you receive a digital file, you feed that digital file to an ink jet printer, and the technology transforms that digital information onto a substrate with a head that squirts ink in different colors or gradations of gray onto paper or canvas.
Q. All right. Now, if you were to receive an original -and the same hypothetical -- if you were to receive an original document -- but it was a hard copy, in order to achieve what you have just described, you would have to create some electronic form of that hard copy; is that correct?
A. Yes.
Q. And how would you do that?
A. I would scan it.
Q. Is that process that you just described in general terms what you did for Mr. Prince in connection with the Canal

JOHN OLSON
Zone project?
A. Yes.
Q. He would send you hard copies, and NancyScans would scan them, and then employing an ink jet process would print them?

MR. HAYES: Objection to the form.
MS. BART: Join.
THE WITNESS: Yes.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. Now, we're going to get to the documents here that were produced, that you photocopied, in response to the subpoena.

But I want to ask whether you're familiar with, as you sit here today, some of the documents that were sent to you by hard copy from Mr. Prince.

Specifically, do you recall seeing images of Rastafarian men?

MS. BART: Objection to the form.
MR. HAYES: Objection to form.
MS. PERAL: Objection to the form.
THE WITNESS: I recall Rastafarians.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)

Valley Reporting Service, Inc. (845) 331-4020

JOHN OLSON
Q. Do you also recall receiving in the documents from Mr. Prince in comection with the Canal Zone project images of -- several images of -- guitars?
A. Yes.

MS. BART: Objection, form.
Q. Do you also recall receiving in the documents received from Mr. Prince or someone working on behalf of Mr. Prince images of landscapes, tropical landscapes?

MS. BART: Objection to the form.
MS. PERAL: Objection to the form.
THE WITNESS: No.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued --
Q. Do you recall receiving images of nude women?
A. Yes.
Q. When you received those images of Rastafarian men and nude women and guitars, were they usually received by or from separate -- strike that.

Did you see these different images separately or were they received in collage form together?

MS. BART: Objection.
MS. PERAL: Objection as to form.
THE WIINESS: I received them in collage form.

JOHN OLSON
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. You testified that you recall you received -- that you recall receiving -- Rastafarian men; correct?

THE COURT REPORTER: Rastafarian men?
MS. BART: Objection.
MR. BODEN: I will make the question
clearer.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. Images of Rastafarian men in connection with the Canal Zone project.

MS. BART: Objection to the form and also to the side bar communication about the question. It was clear.

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. And you also testified that you recall specifically receiving hard copy images of guitars in connection with the Canal Zone project.
A. Yes.

MS. BART: Objection to the form.
Q. And you also testified that you recall receiving in connection with the Canal Zone project images of nude women; correct?

## JOHN OLSON

A. Yes.
Q. Now, those three separate images, would you have received hard copy documents of each of those separately or on occasion were those three images or any combination of those three images together portrayed on one document?

MS. BART: Objection to the form.
MR. HAYES: Objection to the form.
THE WITNESS: I received them in both forms.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. You would have received them separately, and you would have received them --
A. Collaged.
Q. -- in some combination?
A. Yes.
Q. And the term collaged you understand to mean different images on one document --
A. Yes.
Q. -- correct?
A. Yes.
Q. Were you on occasion at NancyScans instructed by Mr. Prince to combine any of those three images we just

> JOHN OLSON
spoke about together on one image?
MR. HAYES: Objection to the form.
MS. BART: Join.
THE WITNESS: NO.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.
Q. Were you ever asked to superimpose one image on top of another image?
A. No.
Q. Were you ever requested to combine landscape images with any of the images that you testified to about?

MS. BART: Objection to the form.
THE WITNESS: NO.
Q. Do you know whether anyone at NancyScans was ever asked in connection with the Canal Zone project to combine images in one format?
A. I don't remember. I don't know. I don't know of anyone --

MS. BART: Objection, form.
THE WITNESS: -- who was asked at NancyScans to combine images.

BY MR. BODEN: (Contimed.)
Q. Now, how would you know what size to -- strike that.

## JOHN OLSON

Were you also asked to enlarge some of these images to specific size dimensions --
A. Yes.

MS. BART: Objection to the form.
Q. -- in connection with the Canal Zone project?
A. Yes.
Q. How would you know what size to enlarge images to?
A. By following the instructions that we received.
Q. You don't remember what the instructions, the exact instructions, were?
A. Yes.
Q. Do you know whether it was a verbal instruction or whether it was a written instruction?
A. Any instructions we received were either verbal or on occasion written on an envelope we would receive work in.
Q. Do you know who the author of the written instructions on the envelope is?
A. No, I don't.
Q. Do you know who gave verbal instructions?
A. No, I don't.
Q. Did you ever receive verbal instructions, if you can

## JOHN OLSON

recall?
MS. BART: Objection, form and asked and answered.

THE WITNESS: Previous projects I know we received verbal instructions. With regard to this project, I don't remember specifically how they came to us.

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. And when you reference previous projects, are you referring to projects that involved Mr. Prince?
A. Yes.
Q. In these previous projects where you received -- where you recall receiving -- verbal instructions, were those verbal instructions given to you by Mr. Prince?
A. On indication.
Q. Was that in person or by telephone?
A. In person.
Q. Do you recall what the details were or what any of the details on previous projects of the verbal instructions were?
A. No.
Q. Do you know what the artistic term losenge --

|  |  |
| :--- | :--- |
|  |  |
| A.O- |  |
|  |  |

MR. HAYES: Objection to the form.
MS. BART: Objection.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. In connection with the Canal Zone project, did you receive any images -- any documents bearing images -with Rastafarian men whose eyes were obscured by circles or any sort of symbol?
A. Yes.
Q. Did you or anyone else at NancyScans ever put circles or any sort of images over the eyes of the documents that you received from Mr. Prince in connection with the Canal Zone project?
A. No.
Q. Did you or anyone else at NancyScans ever put any marks on any documents bearing images that you received in connection with the Canal Zone project?
A. No.
Q. Are you familiar with artistic practice of skewing?
A. No.
Q. Do you ever recall dealing with any of Mr. Prince's

JOHN OLSON
assistants in connection with the Canal Zone project? By dealing with, I mean speaking to or receiving documents from.
A. No.
Q. Are you familiar with someone by the name of Betsy Biscone?
A. Yes.
Q. Have you ever dealt with Miss Biscone in any respect with regard to any project?
A. Yes.
Q. Do you recall specifically working with Miss Biscone cone on the Canal Zone project?
A. No.
Q. On previous projects, what kinds of interaction did you have with Miss Biscone?

MS. BART: Objection.
MS. PERAL: Objection as to form.
THE WITNESS: She would let me know that something would be coming to us via Fed-Ex. She would tell me that there was a project to pick up.

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. That was --

Valley Reporting Service, Inc. (845) 331-4020

JOHN OLSON
A. That was sent.
Q. How about Eric Brown, do you recall ever working with an Eric Brown --
A. Yes.
Q. -- on the Canal Zone project?
A. No.
Q. On previous projects, do you recall working with Mr. Brown?
A. Yes.
Q. What was the extent of your professional relationship with Mr. Brown with respect to projects between NancyScans and Mr. Prince?

MS. BART: Objection, form.
THE WITNESS: He would advise me that a project was coming via Fed-Ex; that something needed to be picked up.

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. Neither Miss Biscone or Mr. Brown on any of these projects previous to the Canal Zone project ever gave you instructions on what to do with the documents that you are about to be receiving; is that correct?
A. You're talking about verbal instructions, written

## A-1381

JOHN OLSON
instructions?
Q. Well, did they mention from your description that instructions were going to be with -- that they would be provided with the actual documents, which were sent by Fed-Ex; is that correct?
A. When we received written documents it would be a sentence or two written on the envelope that we would receive.
Q. So, there was never any verbal instructions given to you --
A. Not that I remember.
Q. -- from Mr. Brown or Miss Biscone?
A. Not that I remember.
Q. I should have -- I should have gone over some preliminary items when I started here. It has gone fairly well between us. So, I didn't think I needed to.

But one of the things -- one of the conditions -- of having a deposition interaction is that the Stenographer has to write everything down that we are saying, and it's difficult for him when we are speaking over one another.

JOHN OLSON
So, just try to -- so, just try to let me give my entire sentence.
A. Sure.
Q. And if there an objection -- and I will do the same for you with your answer.
A. Sure.
Q. And if at any time you want to take a break --
A. Sure.
Q. -- a bathroom break, we will certainly accomodate you.
A. Sure.
Q. Do you know whether Miss Biscone or Mr. Brown on any of the previous projects to the Canal Zone project took any of the photographs that were provided to NancyScans?
A. I don't know.
Q. Do you know whether any of them took any of the photographs that were provided to NancyScans in connection with the Canal zone project?
A. I don't know.
Q. Once NancyScans completed their work on any of the projects in which it worked with Mr. Prince -- once NancyScans completed the work for which it was retained to perform -- and I think you earlier described that

## A-1383

JOHN OLSON
work as copying and scarning and printing -- who would return the finished work product to Mr. Prince?
A. I would.

MS. BART: Objection to form.
Q. And how would you do that?
A. In person.
Q. You would deliver it?
A. In person. I would deliver it to the studio.
Q. But not necessarily to Mr. Prince?
A. No.
Q. On some occasions to Miss Biscone?
A. There would be occasions on which I would deliver them and access the studio on my own, open the door on my own, when no one was there.
Q. You would just leave it --
A. Yes.
Q. -- there?
A. Yes.
Q. But on other occasions, would you leave it with either Miss Biscone or Mr. Brown --
A. Yes.
Q. -- or both?

JOHN OLSON
A. Yes.
Q. Did you ever leave it with Mr. Prince that you can recall?
A. Not that I recall.
Q. When you dropped off materials with an individual, whether it be Miss Biscone or Mr. Brown, would you go over the complete work product with them?

Would they give it some sort of quality
assurance to make sure that it was completed as instructed?
A. No.
Q. You would just leave it and then leave the Remselaerville studio?
A. Yes.
Q. Have you ever been to Mr. Prince's studio in Long Island?
A. No.
Q. Do you recall NancyScans ever receiving back from Mr. Prince or someone working on behalf of Mr. Prince any work that NancyScans had completed that required follow-up work?
A. No.

JOHN OLSON
Q. You don't recall it ever happening or you know it never did happen?
A. It never did happen.
Q. Are you familiar with an entity by the name of Gagosian Gallery?
A. I have heard of them --
Q. Had you ever heard of Gagosian Gallery?
A. -- in regards to this lawsuit.
Q. I'm not sure. I know I referenced earlier a Canal Zone exhibition at Gagosian Gallery.

I don't know if I asked you if you were aware that there was an exhibition at Gagosian Gallery in a location in Chelsea, Manhattan in November and December of 2008 .

Are you aware of that exhibition?
A. Yes.
Q. Are you aware that the work displayed -- that some of the work displayed -- you worked on in connection with the Canal Zone project?

MS. BART: Objection, form.
MR. HAYES: Objection, form.
THE WITNESS: I never thought of it, and I --

JOHN OLSON
in light of this lawsuit, I believe I'm aware of it. BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. Did you ever in connection with the Canal zone project have any communications with anyone who worked for Gagosian Gallery?
A. No.
Q. Did you ever receive any correspondence at all from Gagosian Gallery in connection with the Canal Zone project?
A. No.
Q. Did you ever send them any materials -- to the Gagosian Gallery -- in connection with the Canal Zone project?
A. No.
Q. Do you recall what the payment arrangement was with Mr. Prince for work done by NancyScans on the Canal Zone project?

MS. BART: Objection, form. By who? Work done by NancyScans?

MR. BODEN: Can you read the question back, please.
(The Court Reporter read the pending pertinent question.)

## A-1387

JOHN OLSON
THE WITNESS: I don't understand the question.

BY MR. BODEN: (Contimued.)
Q. How did Mr. Prince -- strike that.

What was the payment arrangement between
NancyScans and Mr. Prince for work done buy NancyScans on the Canal Zone project?
A. We would bill our standard rate --
Q. I'm sorry?
A. -- based on the work that we were asked to do.
Q. Was it périodic billing? Did you bill one time for all of the work completed in connection with the Canal Zone project?
A. We billed -- we -- we billed as we completed -- we billed as we completed a project.
Q. So, periodically?
A. We billed periodically.
Q. When you say "you billed at your standard rate", is that an hourly standard rate; is that what you are referring to?
A. It would be either per piece. It was based on a service that we completed.

## JOHN OLSON

Q. As you sit here today, do you know how much Richard Prince was billed for all of the work completed in connection with the Canal zone project?
A. I have no idea. Sorry. I have no idea.
Q. Are you able to estimate with a degree of reasonable certainty?
A. No.

MS. BART: Objection, form.
THE WITNESS: No.
Q. Do you know whether Mr. Prince has paid NancyScans all of the amount owed on the Canal Zone project to date?
A. Yes.

MR. BODEN: I would like to mark for identification purposes Exhibit 93.
(A five-page NancyScans document was marked
Plaintiff's Exhibit No. 93 for identification this date.)

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. Now, Exhibit 93 is a compilation of five pages, and I'll just represent that I am producing these or marking these for identification during this deposition based on how they were produced to my office from your attorney.

## JOHN OLSON

So, that will explain why they are in this order.
Since these documents were not produced during discovery -- since you're not a party to this action -- this document as well as others wasn't produced in the course of discovery -- usually, we Bates stamp documents, and we will have an alphanumeric code on them -- it's easier to reference -- obviously, there is no Bates stamp on these or on the others that I will introduce.

So, I have to identify them for the record by referencing certain writing on the document.

So, Exhibit 93. I want to ask you some questions about the first page, and the first page of the exhibit in the upper right-hand margin says invoice, and it's dated 2/21/2008, and it's Invoice Number 0802210056.

Do you see that, Mr. Olson?
A. I do.
Q. Now, incidentally, the picture on the left margin of a woman's head, is that Nancy in NancyScans?
A. It is.
Q. Now, who drafts invoices for NancyScans?

## JOHN OLSON

A. By draft, you mean who prepared this invoice?
Q. Yes.
A. When a job comes in a work order is prepared, and at the end of the job that work order is converted to an invoice. So, the work order I would probably prepare, and then when a job is completed the comptroller would convert it to an invoice.
Q. Do you specifically recall preparing this invoice?
A. No.
Q. I would like to direct your attention to the description portion of this invoice, and the very last line item reads JO to deliver to Rennselaerville. Do you see that?
A. Yes.
Q. Do you know who JO is?
A. JO is my initials.
Q. I know you testified that you don't recall whether you were the one who prepared that invoice.

But by looking at the description of the work invoiced on this document, do you recall this work being done by NancyScans?
A. I don't recall it, no.

## JOHN OLSON

Q. Do you know what you delivered to Rennselaerville?
A. I would have a better idea if I looked through the invoice.
Q. Please, take your time.
A. Okay.
Q. Do you recall what you delivered to Mr. Prince?
A. I don't recall what I delivered. I see what's attached to the invoice.
Q. Are you referring to the last page of Exhibit 93?
A. Yes.
Q. These are 12 separate TIF files; is that correct?
A. There are icons on this page that appear to be TIF files.
Q. Are these TIF files related to the thumbnails? Would that be it?
A. Yes.
Q. Earlier you testified that in connection with the Canal Zone project you never received electronic files from Prince or anyone on behalf of Mr. Prince; is that correct?
A. Yes.
Q. So, these thumbnails on the last page of Exhibit 93

JOHN OLSON
would be scans that NancyScans had scamed of documents that were sent to them by Mr. Prince?
A. Yes.
Q. So, this would be in essence the second part of NancyScans' job in comection with Mr. Prince's Canal Zone project; specifically, that the first step would be to scan the documents, and after that you would print them?
A. That's correct.
Q. So then, do you recall whether these 12 separate images were after being scanned, printed and sent to Mr . Prince?
A. I don't recall.
Q. If you would just go back to the second page of Exhibit 93, in the upper right corner it's written work order, and the work order number is 0801190001 . Do you see that?
A. I do.
Q. And in the description of this work order -- three lines down -- in the left margin -- it reads as follows:

Stretch, devote system time to each file to

JOHN OLSON
match look and feel of print.
Do you see that?
A. I do.
Q. First, what does stretch mean in this context?
A. You're talking about down here, what's redacted?
Q. Yes.
A. Stretch would mean that we would put it on a canvas, but in this case it means we were not to do that.
Q. That's why it's crossed out?
A. I believe so.
Q. And underneath the line that reads devote system time to each file to match the look and feel of print --
A. Right.
Q. -- do you have an understanding what that means?
A. Yes.
Q. And what does that mean?
A. In the scanning process, you do a scan. You capture an original. What comes out is often different than the original, and you make adjustments, so you match the original.
Q. Why would what comes out after scanning, as you term it, be different than the original?

## JOHN OLSON

A. Because the scanning process doesn't exactly match the original.
Q. Can you tell me typically what some of the elements of the original are not embodied in the scan, whether it's color or shading or contrast.
A. All of the above.
Q. All right. And what will NancyScans do to remedy that problem?

MS. BART: Objection, form.
THE WITNESS: There are different skills and different controls in the software that you utilize to bring back the copy to match the original.

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. So, this process is a trial and error process in a sense; would you say that's fair to say?

MS. BART: Objection to the form.
MR. HAYES: Objection to the form.
THE WITNESS: A skilled operator would know what adjustments to make.

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. Is it ever the case that on the first scan that it is good enough or close enough to the original that it

Valley Reporting Service, Inc. (845) 331-4020

JOHN OLSON
doesn't need to be rescanned?
A. Almost never. It's not rescanned. It's adjusted.
Q. But it has to be scanned again?
A. No.
Q. It doesn't?
A. No.
Q. Okay. And I fully admit I don't understand the technical knowledge behind this. Maybe you can describe how you can make a scan approximate an original better without rescanning it.
A. You modify the aspect of the capture with controls you have to match the original more closely. It could be density. It could be contrast. It could be color.
Q. I think I am understanding this. Before you print out the scan, you have an image on the computer screen of the scan, and you manipulate that image with computer software before you print it; is that correct?
A. Yes.
Q. So, in every case, after undergoing whatever manipulation is required in order to approximate the original as close as possible, and then thereafter, you print out the scan, and you look at the scan, and you

## JOHN OLSON

say it still doesn't like good enough, and so, we are going to do the process over; does that ever occur? MS. BART: Objection, form.

THE WITNESS: Occasionally.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. Do you recall whether you were given any instructions in connection with the Canal Zone project from either Mr. Prince or anyone working on behalf of Mr. Prince that scans that you were hired to make had to approximate the original?

MS. BART: Objection.
MS. PERAL: Objection.
THE WITNESS: I don't recall those
instructions.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. Do you ever recall anyone at Mr. -- strike that.

Do you recall Mr. Prince or anyone working on Mr. Prince's behalf on the Canal Zone project telling you something to the effect that the printout, the scan, has to look as close to the original as possible? MS. BART: Objection. MS. PERAL: Objection.

JOHN OLSON
THE WITNESS: No.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. A few lines beneath there is some handwriting. It says test one canvas.
A. Yes.
Q. First of all, whose handwriting is this?
A. It looks like mine.
Q. What does that mean, test one canvas?
A. I don't remember.
Q. And generally, why would you be adding handwriting to a work order?
A. To bring something to the attention of the next person who is handling the job that wasn't added at the time that the order was created.
Q. The next person who would look at this work order and perform the work that is therein listed?
A. Yes, yes.
Q. Is there a general policy at NancyScans for an order of employees that work on a work order?
A. Yes.
Q. Who typically follows you on a work order?
A. In the scanning process, Nancy Olson follows me, and in

JOHN OLSON
the print process, Mack Bruebaker follows an order.
Q. So, as I understand it then -- because you earlier testified that yourself, Mr. Bruebaker and your wife, Miss Olson, you were the only three that worked on Richard Prince's Canal Zone project; correct --
A. I believe so.
Q. -- you would be the first line of fire for this project on both the work order and the invoice?

MS. BART: Objection to form.
MS. PERAL: Objection.
MR. BODEN: I will rephrase the question.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. You were the first employee who would work on a work onder?
A. Yes.
Q. And you were the first employee to work on an invoice?
A. No.
Q. The invoice -- the work -- you would create a work order, and once the job was complete the comptroller would convert that work order to an invoice?
Q. Who is the comptroller?
A. Jim Smith.

JOHN OLSON
Q. If you would turn to the second to last page of Exhibit 93. I believe it's Page Four.
A. (The Witness complied.).
Q. I already asked you about stretch and the redacting from Page Two.

You see in this Page Four, which is entitled Work Order Number 0801190001, and dated January 19th, 2008, stretch is not redacted; correct?
A. That's correct.
Q. And the intention there on this work order is then to convey to someone working on this, this project, whether it be you and Miss Olson, that this image is to be transferred onto canvas?
A. Yes. But I don't think that's correct.
Q. What's not correct?
A. Well, I don't -- looking at this invoice, we did not charge for anything stretched. So, I don't know why it's there. But if this work order was -- were correct, stretch would indicate that we should stretch it.
Q. Underneath stretch it's written devote system time to each file to match look and feel of print.

Do you have an understanding what that means

JOHN OLSON
and was that is supposed to convey to someone looking at the work order?

MS. BART: Objection to form and asked and answered.

MR. HAYES: Join.
THE WITNESS: Yes.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. It's similar to what you described previously where this is the same sentence that appeared on Page Two of this Exhibit 93?
A. Yes.

MR. BODEN: I'm going to mark for identification purposes Exhibit 94.
(A five-page NancyScans document was marked Plaintiff's Exhibit No. 94 for identification this date.) (A recess was taken.) MR. BODEN: Okay. Back on the record. BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. Mr. Olson, Exhibit 94 is marked invoice. The date is May 2nd, 2008. It's Invoice Number 0801090002.

Do you see that?

[^0]JOHN OLSON
A. I do.
Q. This is also a compilation of documents as produced to me by your attorney, a compilation of pages, and on the first page in the description section the first item listed is job colon Rasta.

Do you see that?
A. Yes, I do.
Q. What does that refer to?
A. How we titled the job.
Q. Now, in regards to the Canal Zone project, were more than one job involved -- jobs involved -- in the Canal Zone project?
A. Yes.
Q. And this represents just one of the jobs in the Canal Zone project; correct?
A. Yes.
Q. All right. Now, beneath job -- well, strike that. Who comes up with names for specific jobs?
A. There is -- I don't know who comes up with names, but if something isn't named, then we cannot reference what the subject matter is.
Q. Okay. If you would turn to the final page of Exhibit

## JOHN OLSON

94, which is entitled Epson 2007, Richard Prince, Ratas.
A. (The Witness complied.).
Q. Do you see that?
A. I do.
Q. Does -- on the first page, line item, job, Ratas, does that refer to this image on the last page, if you recall?
A. Yes, it does.
Q. Do you recall working on this specific job?
A. I remember this job.
Q. All right. And this image on the last page, where did that come from?
A. I believe this is a compilation of 26 scans that we had done.
Q. Now, earlier you testified that all materials in connection with the Canal Zone project that you received from Mr. Prince were on hard copy form; correct?
A. Yes.
Q. So, you received a hard copy of this image on the last page of Exhibit 94 and scanned it; is that correct?
A. I believe this is 26 separate images we received.

## JOHN OLSON

Q. When you say "26 separate images", what do you mean?
A. 26 separate photographs.
Q. So, you received 26 photographs. And how did they -strike that.

Did you or someone at NancyScans put them in the order that's represented by the image in the last page of Exhibit 94?
A. To facilitate the print process, we put them in this order.
Q. Were you given any instructions what order to put the 26 pictures into?
A. No.
Q. After putting them -- these 26 separate photographs -in order and printing them, you then returned this print scan to Mr. Prince or someone at Mr. Prince's studio?
A. No.
Q. What did you do with it after you printed it?

MS. BART: Objection, form.
THE WITNESS: These images were gained onto a sheet and trimmed apart and then returned.

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)

## A-1404

## JOHN OLSON

Q. You are going to have to define some of those terms.
A. Okay.
Q. What do mean when you say "gained"?
A. We scanned 26 photographs.
Q. Straight photographs?
A. Yes.
Q. Okay.
A. We printed 26 photographs, but to facilitate the print process we put one next to the other, one next to the other one. So, instead of printing multiple -- multiple copies, we print one copy. Then they would be torn apart.
Q. Do you mean trimmed apart?
A. Cut apart. Ganged and trimmed.
Q. And this image on the last page of Exhibit 94, is this what you have to trim apart?
A. Yes.
Q. And how would you do that?
A. With a trimmer, with a cutter.
Q. Scissors?
A. A machine designed to make a long -- a long singular cut.

## JOHN OLSON

Q. What was -- with respect to the job Rastas, what were your instructions? What were you supposed to do -- you being NancyScans -- with these 26 images?

MS. BART: Objection to the form.
MR. HAYES: I join.
THE WITNESS: Scan them, and we were to print multiple copies of each.

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. Then why did they have to be, as you described, ganged together?
A. We did that for our own efficiency.
Q. I think maybe we are going to have to -- I think you're attempting to -- maybe I'm just not understanding, but I think we might have to bring it up in component parts.

Let's begin with the original instruction, which was to create 26 images; correct?

MS. BART: Objection.
MR. HAYES: Objection.
THE WITNESS: To scan 26 photographs.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. Okay. And enlarge them?
A. I -- my assumption is that they would be -- that we

## JOHN OLSON

would print them at the same size, 100 percent of their size.

MS. BART: Objection. Move to strike the Witness' response as speculative.

MR. HAYES: I join.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. The 26 images that you received, do you recall what paper they were on, what type of paper they were on?
A. Matte paper.
Q. Matte paper. And when you scanned and printed them in the same size you just testified to, what paper did you print them onto, what type of paper?
A. They were printed to a paper, not a canvas.
Q. What -- was it different matte paper that they came on?
A. I'm sure there was some difference.
Q. Do you have any idea of what difference that would be? I don't want you to guess.
A. I don't know.
Q. Back to the final page of Exhibit 94, these 26 images together in collage format, as being represented by this thumbnail on the final page of Exhibit 94, did you deliver to Mr. Prince something in collage format --

JOHN OLSON
A. No.

MS. BART: Objection.
Q. -- that resembled what is being reflected in this picture?

MS. BART: Objection, form.
MR. HAYES: Join.
THE WITNESS: No.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. And again, can you explain why on the final page all of these separate 26 photographs are reflected in a thumbnail of a collage?

MS. BART: Objection.
MS. PERAL: Objection.
MR. HAYES: Join.
THE WITNESS: For our own internal
efficiencies in the printing process, we print them one next to the other and then trimmed them apart.

We have to print that -- we have to print a very large sheet. We need to print them not in collage form, but as individuals.

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. But what appears on the final page is a thumbnail of a

JOHN OLSON
collage form?
MS. BART: Objection to the form and asked and answered.

MR. HAYES: Join.
THE WITNESS: It's a thumbnail version of a ganged sheet, and again it's only -- in this particular case, it's only for our own efficiencies.

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. Can you describe the difference between a ganged sheet and a collage, if there is a distinction between the two.

MS. BART: Objection.
MS. PERAL: Objection.
MR. HAYES: Objection.
THE WITNESS: A ganged sheet is something printers do to be -- what's known as page efficient or sheet efficient. You do it that way so you use less paper.

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. If you would go back to the first page of Exhibit 94.
A. (The Witness complied.)
Q. Under line item, job, Rasta, it reads scan 100 RGB dash

## JOHN OLSON

cleaned. What is RGB? What does that stand for?
A. Red, green and blue.
Q. And do you have an understanding of what is meant by the word cleaned on this invoice?
A. We offer two types of scans; one in which following the scan process we quote clean the file, and the one where we don't clean the file.

The scanning process captures artifacts in the scans. To accurately capture the original, you need to remove the artifacts that have been captured.

Some clients will do it themselves, and others will have us do it. In this case, we cleaned the files so none of the artifacts would remain.
Q. When you say "some clients will have you do it", does a client look at the scan and tell you that some artifacts need to be removed; is that the manner in which it works?

MS. BART: Objection.
MS. PERAL: Objection as to form.
MR. HAYES: Join.
THE WITNESS: It's requested ahead of time.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)

Valley Reporting Service, Inc. (845) 331-4020

## JOHN OLSON

Q. Do you know if in connection with the Canal Zone project Mr. Prince or anyone working on Mr. Prince's behalf requested that artifacts be cleaned?
A. It's the type of scan we have always delivered to Mr. Prince, and how we originally established that I don't recall.
Q. You don't recall any instructions ever coming from --
A. I do not.
Q. -- from anyone to that effect?
A. I don't. I do not.
Q. For most of the projects that you are working on at NancyScans, in addition to clients like Mr. Prince, for all of your clients, do you generally employ this cleaning practice to remove artifacts?

MS. BART: Objection, form. MR. HAYES: Join. THE WITNESS: 90 percent of our customers have us clean the files.

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. If you can, turn to the fourth page I believe of Exhibit 94.
A. (The Witness complied.).

## A-1411

## JOHN OLSON

Q. And in the right-hand margin, the work order is dated January 19th, 2008. It's Work Order Number 0801190002. In the second line under description it reads maximize file integrity to match originals.

Do you see that?
A. I do.
Q. I assume the intent to maximize it was --
A. Yes.
Q. -- or do you have an understanding what that term, maximize file integrity --
A. Yes.
Q. -- to match originals --
A. Yes.
Q. -- means?
A. Do the best job we are capable of.
Q. Is that an instruction that came from the customer?
A. No. It's something we know we need to do.
Q. What is file integrity?
A. It means deliver the best file we are capable of delivering. File -- file integrity -- maximize file integrity is the best file we can deliver.
Q. Are there some projects that NancyScans works on where

JOHN OLSON
the intent is not to maximize file integrity to match originals?

MS. BART: Objection to the form.
MR. HAYES: Join.
THE WITNESS: No.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. So, the inducement is to maximize -- always maximize -file integrity to match originals on a scan, on a prescribed job; is that correct?

MS. BART: Objection to the form.
THE WITNESS: We have some customers who have a strong skill set in working their own files, and we have others who don't work their own files.

In this case, we know we need to deliver the best file we are capable of, as the customers isn't going to do any additional work.

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. Do you know whether Mr. Prince or anyone working on his behalf did any additional work?
A. I don't.

MS. BART: Objection, form.
MR. BODEN: I'm sorry?

## A-1413

JOHN OLSON
THE WITNESS: I don't know.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. Do you have any knowledge as to the computer expertise or the scanning ability of anyone, either Mr. Prince or -- strike that.

Do you have any knowledge as to the computer expertise or the scanning ability, the scanning and printing ability of either Mr. Prince or anyone who worked on his behalf?
A. No.

MS. BART: Objection to form.
MR. BODEN: I'm going to mark as Exhibit 95 for identification purposes another compilation of documents provided to our office by your attorney. (A compilation of NancyScans documents was marked Plaintiff's Exhibit No. 95 for identification this date.)

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. I ask you to look over this document.
A. (The Witness complied.). (Indicating.).
Q. The first page of Exhibit 95 in the right upper margin says Invoice 0806070003. Do you see that?

JOHN OLSON
A. I do.
Q. The first line item of this read lavender guitar. Do you see that?
A. Yes, I do.
Q. Is that the job name for this specific job?
A. Yes.
Q. Do you recall working on any of the parts of this specific job?
A. No.
Q. Do you know who came with up the description of lavender guitar for this job?
A. I don't.
Q. If you turn to the last page of Exhibit 95, you will see six thumbnails of guitars, and appears to be in TIF format. Do you see that.
A. I do.
Q. Do you recall working on any of these images in connection with the Canal Zone project?
A. No.
Q. So, don't know in what format these guitars were received by NancyScans from Mr. Prince?
A. They were hard copies, and they were cut apart.

JOHN OLSON
Q. And scanned?
A. Yes.
Q. Do you know whether they were eventually printed?

MS. BART: Objection, form.
MR. HAYES: Join.
THE WITNESS: They were printed.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. And were they delivered to Mr. Prince or someone working for Mr. Prince?
A. Yes.

MR. BODEN: I would like to mark as Exhibit 96 another compilation of documents produced by your attorney to our office.
(A compilation of NancyScans documents was marked Plaintiff's Exhibit No. 96 for identification this date.)

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. Mr. Olson, have you had an opportunity to look through Exhibit 96?
A. Yes.
Q. The first page of Exhibit 96 in the upper margin reads Invoice Number 0805310008. Do you see that?

## A-1416

JOHN OLSON
A. Yes.
Q. And in the description, the first line item reads girls and Rastas. Is that again the name that was given to this job?
A. Yes.
Q. Do you recall who gave this job that name?
A. No.
Q. Do you recall working on the girls and Rastas job portion of the Canal zone project?
A. No.
Q. Three lines down in the description on the first page it reads system time dash imaging integrity.
A. Yes.
Q. What does system time mean?
A. It means devote the time to adjust the files to match the originals.
Q. But is there any time indicated there?
A. Yes.
Q. How much time is indicated?
A. Eight point two five hours.
Q. And what does imaging integrity mean in that context?
A. It's explaining what system time -- what we were

## JOHN OLSON

asked -- excuse me. It describes what we did during that time.
Q. And what did you do curring that time?
A. We made sure that the files matched the originals.
Q. Did this job involve a scanning of originals and then a printing of the scan? MS. BART: Objection, form. MR. HAYES: Objection, form. THE WITNESS: Yes.

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. Turn to the second page of Exhibit 96.
A. (The Witness complied.).
Q. In the upper right margin, it's listed Work Order Number 0805310008. Do you see that?
A. Yes.
Q. On the third line item, under the description block, it reads print canvas to ID indicated. Do you see that?
A. Yes.
Q. What does LD stand for?
A. Long dimension.
Q. Was this image that's being referenced here intended to be scanned onto a canvas and enlarged onto a canvas?

## A-1418

JOHN OLSON
MS. BART: Objection to form.
MR. HAYES: Join.
MS. PERAL: Objection.
THE WITNESS: There is the scanning process and the printing process. Following the scanning process, this work order indicates that we are to print these onto canvas.

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. And enlarge it from the original document that you scanned?
A. Well, it doesn't indicate that here, but the subsequent page gives the image and the size of which we are to print.
Q. Does that indicate to you that it was to be printed on a larger size than the original?
A. Yes.
Q. All right. Now, going back to the second page, it says print canvas to ID indicated. It's written you can gang files side-by-side to be page efficient.

Does that -- strike that.
Your earlier description of a ganged file and images in onder for the efficiency of NancyScans, is

## A-1419

JOHN OLSON
that what is being implied here?
MS. BART: Objection.
MS. PERAL: Objection as to form.
THE WITNESS: Yes.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. When it says "RP will be cutting canvas apart" -- do you see that --
A. I do.
Q. -- what does that mean?
A. I believe it means that he will be collaging.
Q. Who is he?
A. Richard Prince.
Q. RP stands for Richard Prince?
A. Yes.
Q. Did you prepare this work order, if you recall?
A. I believe I did.
Q. How did you know that Richard Prince was going to be, as you describe, collaging this work?

MS. BART: Objection to the form.
MR. HAYES: Objection to form.
THE WITNESS: It was communicated to me somehow.

JOHN OLSON
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. Do you recall how?
A. No, I don't.
Q. When it says "RP will be cutting canvas apart", is that referring to canvas on which NancyScans was scanning the image?
A. Okay. If there is a --
Q. Sorry. Printing the image.
A. Yes.

MS. BART: Can I hear the question back, please.

MR. BODEN: I'll withdraw that question.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. When it's written RP will be cutting canvas apart, is it your understanding that refers to canvas on which the scanned image was to be printed by NancyScans?

MS. BART: Objection to the form.
MR. HAYES: Join.
THE WITNESS: Yes.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. Can you turn to the third to last page of this Exhibit 96. So, that's Page One, Two -- Page Five of the

## A-1421

JOHN OLSON
exhibit.
A. (The Witness complied.).

MR. BODEN: On Page Five, just to identify it for the record, is written Epson 2007, prints, underscore, 32 images, canvas, Rastas, one EA.
Q. Do you see that?
A. I do.
Q. And you see nine thumbnails here that appear to be TIF format; is that correct?
A. Yes.
Q. Do you recall in your work on the Canal Zone project ever seeing any of these images?
A. Yes.
Q. And in what format did you see them?
A. They were collages.
Q. And you scanned them?
A. Yes.
Q. Now, on the second line of thumbnails, the first two from the left, the first one is number it appears 62 times 33, Rastas, long gotee dot TIF. Do you see that one?
A. Yes, I do.

## A-1422

## JOHN OLSON

Q. Do you see that the thumbnail appears to be legs drawn onto a photograph?
A. I do.
Q. The image that you scanned, did it appear like that with legs drawn onto a photograph?
A. Yes.
Q. Did anyone from NancyScans manipulate the photograph in any manner to add those legs?
A. No.

MS. BART: Objection.
MS. PERAL: Objection as to form.
MR. HAYES: Objection.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. The thumbnail to the right that is captioned 60 times 34 Rasta 15 dot hands TIF -- and do you see that --
A. Yes.
Q. -- that appears to have images of arms and legs drawn onto a photograph. Do you see that?
A. Yes.

MR. HAYES: Objection to the form.
MS. BART: Join.
Q. And the image does appear as the scan appears?

JOHN OLSON
A. Yes.
Q. And neither yourself nor anyone else from NancyScans manipulated that image in any way --

MS. PERAL: Objection.
MS. BART: Objection. MR. HAYES: Join.
Q. -- is that correct?
A. We did not manipulate that.

MR. BODEN: I'm going mark as Exhibit 97 for identification purposes another compilation of documents produced by your attorney to my office.
(A compilation of NancyScans documents was marked Plaintiff's Exhibit No. 97 for identification this date.)

BY MR. BODEN: (Contimed.)
Q. Mr. Olson, why don't you take a moment to look at that document.
A. (The Witness complied.). (Indicating.)
Q. Have you had a moment to look through it?
A. Yes.
Q. Exhibit 97, the first page in the upper right margin, it's listed Invoice Number 0805290024. Do you see

JOHN OLSON
that?
A. Yes.
Q. In the first line of the description, it reads cut outs. Is that the job name for this job?
A. Yes.
Q. Did you name it?
A. Yes.
Q. Do you have a specific recollection of working on the cut outs job in connection with the Canal zone project?
A. No.
Q. If you would turn to the third page of the four-page document, please, where it's listed Work Order Number 0805290012.
A. (The Witness complied.).
Q. Do you see that?
A. Yes.
Q. And in the third to last line under the description box, it reads maximize file integrity of 33 files, reduce dot pattern. Do you see that?
A. I do.
Q. What kind of work is being performed by that description, if you know?

## A-1425

JOHN OLSON
A. Trying to make the files as best they can to match the originals as close as they can be matched.
Q. What does reduce dot pattern mean?
A. It may mean to soften the scan, soften the focus slightly.
Q. In order to make the scan appear more like the original?
A. Yes.
Q. All right. Now, there is handwriting on this page. Do you see that?
A. Yes.
Q. Is that your handwriting?
A. No.
Q. Do you know whose handwriting that is?
A. I don't.
Q. Do you know what laser light means?
A. No.
Q. Did you see above Nancy a question mark?
A. Yes.
Q. Do you know what that means?
A. I know what Nancy is, but I don't understand what the question mark indicates.

## JOHN OLSON

Q. Do you have any familiarity with the term laser light?
A. All of our -- much of our technology is laser driven. RGB are three different lasers.
Q. Would this for scanning technology?
A. To -- for scans or printing. It depends on what technology it was printed to.
Q. But you don't know in this context what laser light is referring to?
A. No.

MR. BODEN: I want to mark for identification purposes Exhibit 98, which is a compilation of pages produced to my office by your attorney.
(A compilation of NancyScans documents was marked Plaintiff's Exhibit No. 98 for identification this date.)

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. Now, on the first page of Exhibit 98, in the upper right margin, it's written Invoice Number 0806030001. Do you see that?
A. I do.
Q. And in the description column, the first line item reads Rastas. Do you see that?

## A-1427

78

## JOHN OLSON

A. I do.
Q. Does that reference the specific job name for this work?
A. It does.
Q. Did you name this specific job?
A. I don't know if I personally named, it but I believe NancyScans gave it that name.
Q. Having looked through Exhibit 98, do you recall working on this specific job in connection with the Canal zone project?
A. No.
Q. Looking at description of the invoice and the accompanying work order for Exhibit 98, can you decipher what the instructions were for this job for the Rastas job?
A. We were to do four scans. We were to make them match the original photographs as close as our scamning technology allowed. We were to do four prints.
Q. If you would turn to the last page of Exhibit 98.
A. (The Witness complied.).

MR. BODEN: To identify this page for the record, it reads Epson 2007, prints, 32 images, canvas,

JOHN OLSON
all capitalized, under 64, one EA. What does that mean, one EA? Is that one each?
A. Yes.
Q. What does that reference, one each?
A. I think it means we print one each of those four files.
Q. And the four files are represented by the last page of Exhibit 98, by these four thumbnails?
A. Yes.
Q. And these are the scanned images, that last page?
A. Yes.
Q. What did you do after you scanned these images?
A. We -- after the scanning process is complete, you scan -- you devote the time necessary to make the raw scan look like the original.
Q. Right.
A. Then we print them.
Q. You printed these individual four images separate?
A. Yes.
Q. Then you delivered these print images to Mr. Prince or someone working for Mr. Prince?
A. Yes.
Q. Did you ever work with those four images again after

## A-1429

JOHN OLSON
that?
A. I don't remember those.

MR. BODEN: I'm going to mark as Exhibit 99 another complication of documents, of pages, produced by your attorney to our office.
(A compilation of NancyScans documents was marked Plaintiff's Exhibit No. 99 for identification this date.)

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. Mr. Olson, have you had an opportunity to look at Exhibit 99?
A. Yes.
Q. Exhibit 99, in the upper margin reads Invoice Number 0809030027. Do you see that?
A. Yes.
Q. Under the description colum, the first line item reads guitar nudes.
A. Yes.
Q. And that was the job name given to this specific job for the Canal Zone project?
A. Yes.
Q. Do you have any recollection of working on the guitar

## JOHN OLSON

nudes job?
A. I don't have a specific recollection of working on it.
Q. Okay. Under system time, on Page One of this document, you earlier testified as to what that means, and here it says system time, size and enhance file.
A. (Indicating.).
Q. What does size and enhance file mean in this context?
A. It's another way of saying what I previously said about maximizing file integrity.
Q. And that was not an instruction given to you from a client; is that correct?
A. No.
Q. The second page of this document appears to be a portion or maybe an entirety of a separate sheet. Do you see that?
A. I do.
Q. And in the first column there are eight titles. Do you know what these titles represent?
A. I assume they are file names or just descriptions of files that we worked on here.
Q. Who comes up with those names; do you know?
A. We do. NancyScans does.

## JOHN OLSON

Q. And that's just an internal way of identifying work that you're doing?
A. Someone looks at the image and gives it, you know, a name based on what's in the image.
Q. Is that to facilitate work on a project; it's easier to reference something when it has a name?
A. A name than a number.
Q. Did you come up with the names, these specific names?
A. I don't think so.
Q. Do you have any knowledge as to who at NancyScans did?
A. Nancy Olson may have.
Q. About midway through or towards the end of this spreadsheet there is a column, canvas. Do you see that?
A. Yes.
Q. What do those numbers indicate underneath canvas? They seem to be associated with each of those titles.
A. It's -- I don't know -- conceivable that could be a cost.
Q. What about canvas sub, do you have an understanding what that term denotes?
A. If I may, I don't know what this means. It looks

JOHN OLSON
like -- give me a moment, please.
Q. Take your time.

MS. PERAL: If you don't know, that's your answer.

THE WITNESS: I don't know.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. All right. Now, how about the last column? It reads DVD. Do you have an understanding what that acronym means?

MR. HAYES: Objection to the form. It's not the last column.

MR. BODEN: Well, I'm not -- I want to make sure the record is clear. I don't know if it's offset. Mr. Hayes could be correct. Maybe it is not the last column. But one of those last two column headings is DVD.

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. Do you see that?
A. I do.
Q. What is your understanding of what the acronym DVD stands for?
A. A DVD is a form of disk technology.

## JOHN OLSON

Q. Is it your understanding that is an acronym for digital video disk?
A. I never knew that.
Q. Okay. Well, why would DVD be on this spreadsheet? If you know, why would there be a column entitled DVD?

MS. BART: Objection to form.
MR. HAYES: Objection to form.
THE WITNESS: I'm not sure.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. In your -- in connection with the work NancyScans did for Mr. Prince on the Canal Zone project, would NancyScans put some images on a DVD format and produce that to Mr. Prince?
A. I don't know.
Q. Do you have DVD technology at NancyScans?
A. We do.
Q. And do you provide some of your customers with DVD stored images?
A. Yes.

MS. BART: Objection to form.
Q. I'm sorry. I'm not quite done with that one. If you would turn to the third page of document.

## JOHN OLSON

A. (The Witness complied.).
Q. It appears to reference the same eight titles that are referenced on the previous spreadsheet.

This is an handwritten page. It's entitled print dash guitar nudes.

That's the same guitar nudes and job name given to this job?
A. Yes.
Q. Do you know whose handwriting that is?
A. Nancy Olson.
Q. If you turn to the next page, which is another handwritten page, it appears to be a photocopy of the previous page with an additional note.
A. (The Witness complied.).
Q. Do you see that?
A. Yes.
Q. Is that a second set of handwriting on this, on this page, if you can tell?
A. Yes.
Q. Do you recognize the second set of handwriting on this page?
A. No, I don't.

## JOHN OLSON

Q. Do you know what is meant in the left-hand column when it's written done? What does done mean?

MR. HAYES: Objection to the form.
THE WITNESS: I believe it's confirming that the canvas has been complete.

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. If you turn to the last page of Exhibit 99, it appears to be 11 thumbnail images here; is that correct?
A. Yes.
Q. And these were images that NancyScans scanned?
A. Yes.
Q. And in connection with the guitar nudes job, NancyScans printed those scanned images?
A. Yes.
Q. Do you recall ever seeing any of these images before looking at them here?
A. Yes.
Q. And the first three at the top of the last page of Exhibit 99, do you see these three thumbnails?
A. Yes.
Q. Is that the same image or is that the same scan rather?

## JOHN OLSON

MS. BART: Objection to form.
THE WITNESS: Yes.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. And the scan which appears to reflect a man holding a guitar, do you see that?
A. Yes.
Q. Is that a hard copy image that you received from Mr. Prince or someone working for Mr. Prince, which was a man holding a guitar?
A. Yes.

MR. BODEN: I would like to mark for identification purposes Exhibit 100.
(A compilation of NancyScans documents was marked Plaintiff's Exhibit No. 100 for identification this date.)

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. Mr. Olson, have you had an opportunity to look over Exhibit 100?
A. Yes.
Q. Exhibit 100 is similar to the previous exhibits. It represents documents or a compilation of pages produced by your attorney to my office.

JOHN OLSON
And the first page of Exhibit 100 reads Invoice Number 0810070012. Do you see that?
A. Yes.
Q. And under the description -- we have gone over this now a few times -- the first line item is a general reference to the job name, and it says various canvas jobs. Is that the job name for this specific job?
A. Yes.
Q. Having looked through the exhibit, do you have any recollection of having worked on the various canvas jobs portion of the Canal Zone project?
A. Yes.
Q. Okay. Now, the third page of Exhibit 100, in the upper right-hand margin, it reads Work Order Number 81007012. That's dated October 14th, 2008. Do you see that?
A. Yes.
Q. And in the third line down in the description column, it reads match proof previously produced. Do you see that?
A. Yes.
Q. What does that mean in that context, match proof previously produced?

## A-1438

## JOHN OLSON

A. I'm not sure.
Q. Match proof previously produced is written under the next seven items on that page.

Do you have any understanding of what it means for any of the subsequent listings?
A. No.
Q. Is that a term that you have seen and used before on work orders for NancyScans?
A. No.
Q. If you turn to the next page.
A. (The Witness complied.).
Q. I believe that's Page Four of Exhibit 100. It appears to be a continuation. It bears the same work onder number and date as the previous page.

And on the second listing under description, do you see a handwritten a notation at the top --
A. Yes.
Q. -- green foliage?
A. Yes.
Q. Do you know whose handwriting that is?
A. I'm not sure.
Q. Having looked at Exhibit 100, and recalling working on

## JOHN OLSON

the various canvas jobs, do you have any idea of what green foliage was referencing?
A. No.
Q. If you would turn to one more page, again the fifth page of Exhibit 100.
A. (The Witness complied.).
Q. It also appears to be a work order. It's Work Order Number 810070122, and it has a date of October 14th, 2008. Do you see that?
A. Yes.
Q. Okay. And in the first line under description, print to light jet, matte, 40 inch 1 times fall.
A. Yes.
Q. What does that mean?
A. Light jet is the technology. Matte is the surface. 40 inch $L D$ is a 40 inch long dimension by fall, and by fall means if you print one dimension to 40 inches, whatever the second dimension becomes is acceptable.
Q. To see this work order, those line items of this work order is instructions of how to print out a scan and the dimensions to print out a scan; is that correct?
A. The instruction was the device to print on and what

## JOHN OLSON

size.
Q. As you sit here today, do you recall whether you were the person for -- where you were the employee of NancyScans who prepared this specific work order?
A. I don't remember.

MR. BODEN: All right. I want to mark for identification purposes Exhibit 101.
(A compilation of NancyScans documents was marked Plaintiff's Exhibit No. 101 for identification this date.)

BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. Take a moment to look over this exhibit, Mr. Olson.
A. (The Witness complied.).
Q. Exhibit 101 on the first page reads Invoice Number 0811110010. It's dated November 11th, 2008. Do you see that?
A. Yes.
Q. The first two lines items under the description column read oversized canvas nude slash Rastas slash plant. Do you see that?
A. Yes.
Q. That was the job name for this invoice?

JOHN OLSON
A. Internally, we referenced it as a job that contained nude and Rastas and plants.
Q. Oversized canvas, where that's written, that's not part of the job name?
A. It is not.
Q. What does that mean, oversized canvas, on this specific invoice?
A. I'm not sure.
Q. Do you have any recollection of working on the nude Rastas plant job in connection with the Canal zone project?
A. Yes.
Q. What did NancyScans do for this specific job?
A. We scanned, and we printed.
Q. If you tum to the third page of the document.
A. (The Witness complied.).
Q. It appears to be five thumbnails of images. Do you see that?
A. Yes.
Q. Is this what you scanned and printed in connection with the nude Rastas and plant job?
A. Yes.

JOHN OLSON
Q. If you look at the first image on the top left portion of the page, was that image -- strike that.

The scan that appears on Document 100, is that the same as -- strike that.

The scan, the thumbnail scan, at the top left portion of Page Three of Exhibit 100 --

MS. PERAL: 101.
Q. -- 101 -- sorry -- was the hard copy -- the hard copy photograph -- that you received from Mr. Prince in respect to those four separate images on one document?

MR. HAYES: Objection to form.
MS. BART: Join.
THE WITNESS: I don't remember.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. You don't remember?
A. No.
Q. Do you recall seeing hard copy documents for any of the thumbnails on this page?
A. Yes.
Q. Which one?
A. One title. Sixty-nine point nine underscore inch underscore Prince canvas three $V$ two.

## A-1443

JOHN OLSON
Q. Do you recall seeing that?
A. Yes.
Q. What form was the hard copy image in that you scanned?
A. Collage.
Q. So, all of the images that appear on this thumbnail in hard copy collage you scanned?

MR. HAYES: Objection to the form.
THE WITNESS: I don't understand.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. This image is the thumbnail that you scanned, sixty-nine point nine inch Prince canvas?
A. Right. I recall that image.
Q. And when you say "you recall that image", you recall the hard copy document --
A. Yes.
Q. -- photograph you got from Mr. Prince?
A. Yes.
Q. Is that hard copy -- I think you -- you described it as a collage.
A. Yes.
Q. That hard copy collage, did it have the two women that appear in the thumbnail?

## JOHN OLSON

A. Yes.
Q. It had a landscape image in the background?
A. Yes.
Q. Every portion that's reflected in this thumbnail would be in that hard copy collage?
A. As I recall.

MR. BODEN: I think I'm done. Let me take a second to look over these documents that you just gave to me.
(A compilation of NancyScans documents was marked Plaintiff's Exhibit No. 102 for
identification this date.)
MR. BODEN: So, Exhibit 102 was produced to me by your attorney today before the deposition, and it's a two-page exhibit.

MS. BART: Let me -- I just want to see it just quickly.

MR. BODEN: Sure. I'm going to going to ask one question.

MS. BART: Okay. Thank you.
MR. BODEN: Just to identify this exhibit on the record, in the right margin of the first page of it

## SOHN OLSON

is written Invoice Number 0811110011.
BY MR. BODEN: (Continued.)
Q. Do you see that?
A. Yes.
Q. I want to ask a question about the second page of the exhibit, which is a work order that's dated about two to three weeks before the invoice. On the first page of the exhibit, it's Work Order Number 81007022. Do you see that?
A. Yes.
Q. The work order is dated October 22nd, 2008, and the invoice, the first page, is dated November 11th, 2008. Do you see that?
A. Yes.
Q. At the very end of the description column, it reads Nancy, please, scan, print, that needs scanning comma size existing scans to same size and gang two up on eight point eight times 11 page for printing. Do you see that?
A. I do.
Q. This appears to be an instruction to Nancy Olson, your wife, and for the work to be completed in connection

JOHN OLSON
with this work order; is that correct?
A. Yes.
Q. Who gave that instruction, if you know?
A. I give that instruction.
Q. And as you sit here today, do you recall giving Nancy that instruction on this, this work order?
A. I don't recall it. I see it.
Q. How do you know that you gave her that instruction?
A. I recall it, because I believe I'm the one who the wrote order.
Q. Now, a little higher up in the description, it reads new Rasta one then parenthesis has slight tone closed parenthesis.
A. Yes.
Q. After parenthesis it has slight tone close parenthesis. You see that?
A. I do.
Q. And the same is written sequentially for new Rasta two, new Rasta three and new Rasta four; correct?
A. Yes.
Q. What does that parenthetical mean?
A. What?

## A-1447

JOHN OLSON
Q. What does that mean? What does that term mean on the work order, has slight tone?
A. That the original has a subtle tone.
Q. Is that instructions to everyone reading the work order and performed work pursuant to that work order to match the tone?
A. Yes.
Q. And do you know why there are no thumbnail images attached to this work order?
A. No.

MR. BODEN: I don't have any further questions.
(The examination of JOHN OLSON in the above-entitled matter was concluded at 4:10 P. M.)

I, JOHN OLSON, have read the foregoing record of my testimony taken at the time and place noted in the heading hereof, and I do hereby acknowledge it to be a true and correct transcript of same.

JOHN OLSON

Sworn to before me this
$\qquad$ day of $\qquad$ , 2009
$\qquad$
$\qquad$

STATE OF NEW YORK ) ss:
COUNTY OF GREENE )

I, CHARLES E. M. JOHNSON, a Court Reporter and Notary Public in the State of New York, certify that the foregoing is a true and correct transcript to the best of my ability of the testimony taken by me on the 16th day of November 2009 at Chatham, New York.


DATED:
23 NovemBer
2009

Valley Reporting Service, Inc. (845) 331-4020

No. 92 A compilation of NancyScans documents. 5

No. 93 A compilation of NancyScans documents. 39

No. 94 A compilation of NancyScans documents. 51
No. 95 A compilation of NancyScans documents. 64

No. 96 A compilation of NancyScans documents. 66
No. 97 A compilation of NancyScans documents. 74

No. 98 A compilation of NancyScans documents. 77

No. 99 A compilation of NancyScans documents. 80

No. 100 A compilation of NancyScans documents. 87

No. 101 A compilation of NancyScans documents. 91

No. 102 A compilation of NancyScans documents. 95






| 89:23 | Matte [4]-16:6, 57:10, | 19:15, 19:21, 19:23, | 61:16, 63:4, 63:11, | 92:14, 95:11, 101:6, |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Looking [1] - 78:13 | 57:11, 90:16 | 20:16, 20:19, $22: 7$ | 63:22, 64:12, 66:5, | 101:7, 101: |
| looking [ 5 - 15:3, | matte [5] - 16:7 | 22:10, 22:20, 22:23, | 68:8, 69:2, 69:4, | 101:10, 101:1 |
| 41:20, 50:17, 51:2, | 16:11, 19:3, 57:15, | 23:13, 24:2, 24 | 70:3, 70:4, 70:2 | 101:13, 101:1 |
| 86:17 | :1 | 24:9, 24:15, 25: | 71:11, 71:18, 73:11, | 101:16, 101:18 |
| looks [3] - 48:8, 82:4, | matter [z]-52:22 | 25:11, 26:3, $26:$ | 73:12, 73:22, 74:5, | 101:19, 101:21 |
| 82:23 | 9 | 26:22, 28:9 | 74:6 | NancyScans' [6] - |
| losenge [1]-28:23 | maximize [8] - 62: | 29:6, 30:22, 31:18 | $84: 21,87: 2,93: 8$ | 6:23, 7:6, 9:17, |
| LOSENGE [1] - 29:2 | $62: 8,62: 11,62: 21,$ | 36:22, 37:3, 37:20, | $93: 13,95: 17,95: 21$ | $13: 14,15: 10,43: 6$ |
| M | $\mathrm{ma}$ | 45:21, |  | nec |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { machine }[1]-55: 22 \\ & \text { Mack }[2]-17: 23,49: 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { mean [25] - 20:5, } \\ & 25: 17,30: 3,41: 2, \\ & 44: 5,44: 8,44: 17, \end{aligned}$ | 49:12, 49:13, 51:6, | N | :17 |
|  |  | $\begin{aligned} & 51: 20,54: 23,56: 6, \\ & 56: 9,56: 19,56: 21 \end{aligned}$ |  | needed [2] - 31:16 |
| Madison[1]-2:13 <br> majority [1] - 9:7 <br> $\operatorname{man}[2]-87: 5,87: 10$ <br> Manager [1] - 18:4 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 44:5, 44:8, 44:17, } \\ & \text { 48:9, 54:2, 55:4, } \\ & \text { 55:14, 67:15, 67:22, } \\ & 70: 10,76: 4,76: 5, \end{aligned}$ |  | 36:5, 65:6, 67: | 32:1 |
|  |  | 58:9, 58:15, 58:2: | $7,75: 5,75:$ | never [9] - 4:21, 12:23, |
|  | 2, 81:8, 86:3 | 59:5, 59:9, 59:15, | $\text { 78:3, 78:6, } 78:$ | $32: 10,36: 2,36: 4$ |
| Manhattan [1]-36:14 manipulate [3] - | 22, 90:15, 92:7 | 59:20, 60:21, 60:23, | 0:20, 82:5, 82: | 36:23, 42:19, 46:3, |
| $46: 17,73: 8,74:$ | means | $\begin{aligned} & 61 \\ & 63 \end{aligned}$ | 88:8, 91:23, 92: | 84:4 |
| manipulated [1] - 74:4 | means $44: 15,50: 23,62: 15$, | 64:3, 64:13, 64:19 | named [2] - 52:21 78.7 | 100:1 |
| manipulation [1] - $46: 21$ | $20,67: 16,70: 11$ | 66:6, 66:8, 66:12, | 78:7 names [7] | new [4] - 97:12, 97:19, |
| manner [2] - 60:17 | $5,82: 23,83: 10,$ | $69: 3,69: 9,70: 6$ | 52:19, 52:20, 81:20, | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 97:20 } \\ & \text { New [13] - 1:17, 1:19, } \end{aligned}$ |
| 73 | 5, 90:18 | 70:21, 71:2, 71:1 | 81:22, 82:9 | $1: 23,2: 4,2: 8,2: 13,$ |
| 40:20, 43:21, | meant [2] - 60:4, 86:2 | $72: 4,73: 13,73: 14$ | $12: 6,12: 8,17: 2$ | 2:18, 13:23, 100:8, |
| 64:22, 66:22, 68:14, | men []] - 9:20, 22:18 | 73:21, 74:7, 74:10, | :21, 48:23, 76:19, |  |
| 74:22, 77:19, 80:14, | $23: 16,24: 4,24: 5$ | 74:16, 77:11, 77:17, | 76:22, 82:12, 85:11, | 55:10, 58:18, 85:12, |
| 88:15, 95:23 | $24: 10,29:$ | $78: 22,80: 4,80: 10$ | 96:17, 96:22, 97:6 | 89:4, 89:11 |
| mark [12]-5:15, 39:14, 51:13, | mention [1] - 32:3 | 83:7, 83:11, 83:13, | 1:14, 2:18 | $\text { nine }[5]-72: 9,93: 22,$ |
| 66:12, 74:10, 76:19, | met [1] - | $86: 4,86: 7,87: 4$ | NancyScans | 94:11, 94:12 |
| 76:23, 77:11, 80:4, | mi | 87:12, 87:17, 91:7, | $5: 10,6: 5,6: 6,6: 7 \text {, }$ | Non-Party [1] - 1:1 |
| 87:12, $91: 7$ | 20:22, 5 | 91:12, 93:12, 93:15, 94:8, 94:10, 95:8, | 6:18, 7:8, 7:15, 8:10, 8:12, 8:14, 8:20, 9:9, | none [1] - 60:14 |
| 10:7, 14:15, 39:16, | mine [1] - | $95: 14,95: 19,95: 22,$ | 11:14, 11:16, 11:19, | Notary [5] - 1:18, 3:11, |
| 51:15, 51:21, $64: 17$, |  | 96:3, 98:12 | 6, 12:11, 14:8, |  |
| 66:16, 74:14, 77:15, |  | MS [89] - 9:23, 10:23, | 11, 15:12, 17:3, | [1] |
| 80:8, 87:15, 91:10, |  | 12:3, 15:6, 15:15 | 18:3, 18:7 | 5: |
| :12 | 13, 33:12, 34:12, | 15:17, 16:16, 18:8, | 12, 18:13, 18:18, |  |
| marking [1] - 39:2 | 34:21, 35:7, 49:5, | 18:15, 19:10, 19:12, | 19:5, 20:23, 22:4, |  |
| marks [1] - 29:17 | 50:13 | 19:20, 20:17, 20:18, | 25:22, 26:14, 26:20, |  |
| Match [1]-89:3 | misunderstood [1] - | 22:8, 22:19, 22:21, | 12, | $96: 13,100: 11$ |
| $\mathrm{ma}$ |  | 1, 23:2 | $33: 22,35: 19,35: 21,$ | nude [7] - 23:14, |
| $45: 13,46: 13,$ | modify [1] - 46 | 24:12, 24:20, 25: | 37:19, | 23:17, 24:22, 91:20, |
| $62: 5,62: 13,63: 2$ |  | 26:4, 26:12, 26:19, | 11, 39:16, 40:21, | 92:3, 92:10, 92:22 |
| 63:9, 67:16, 76:2, |  | 28:3, 29:5, | 41:22, 43 | nudes [5] - 80:1 |
| 78:17, 88:19, 88:22, |  | 8, 31:14 | 45:8, 48:19, 51:15, | 12, 85:6, 85:7 |
| 98:6 | m | 34:5, 36:21, 37:18 | 54:6, 56:4, 61:13 |  |
| matched [2]-68:5, | m | 39:9, 45:10, 45:17 | , 65 | Number [16] - 40:16 |
| 70:3 | move [1]-3:8 | 47:4, 47:12, 47:13, |  |  |
| material [4]-12:16, | $\operatorname{MR}[133]-4: 5,5: 13,$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 47:22, 47:23, 49:10, } \\ & \text { 49:11, 51:4, 54:20, } \end{aligned}$ | 71:17, 73:8, 74:3, $74: 13,77: 14,78: 8$ | $75: 13,77: 19,80: 14,$ |
| 12:20, 14:8, 15:22 | $5: 19,10: 2,10: 4$ | 49:11، 51:4, 54:20, <br> 56:5, 56:18, 57:4 | 74:13, 77:14, 78:8, 80:7, 81:23, 82:11, | 88:3, 88:15, 90:9, |
| materials [5]-12:15, 19:17, 35:6, 37:12 | 11:3, 11:5, 12:5, | 56:5, 56:18, 57:4, 58:3, 58:6, 58:13, | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 80:7, 81:23, 82:11, } \\ & \text { 84:11, 84:13, 84:16, } \end{aligned}$ | $\text { 91:15, 96:2, } 96: 9$ |
| 19:17, 35:6, 37:12, 53:17 | 15:9, 15:20, 18:9, | 58:14, 59:3, 59:13, | 86:11, 86:13, 87:14, | number [4]-43:17, |
|  | 18:11, 18:17, 19:13, | 59:14, 60:19, 60:20, | $89: 9,91: 5,91: 9 \text {, }$ | 72:20, 82:8, 89:15 |



|  |  |  | ```97:13, 97:19, 97:20 Rastafarian []] - 9:20, 22:18, 23:16, 24:4, 24:5, 24:10, \(29: 9\) Rastafarians [1] - 22:22 Rastas [11]-56:2, 67:4, 67:9, 72:6, 72:21, 77:23, 78:15, 91:20, 92:3, 92:11, 92:22 Ratas [2] - 53:3, 53:7 rate [3] - 38:9, 38:19, 38:20 rather [2] - 21:3, 86:23 raw [1]-79:14 read [5-37:20, 37:22, 65:3, 91:20, 99:7 reading [1] - 98:5 reads [22] -41:13, 43:21, 44:12, 59:23, 62:4, 66:22, 67:3, 67:13, 68:18, 75:4, 75:19, 77:22, 78:23, 80:14, 80:17, 83:8, 88:2, 88:15, 88:19, 91:15, 96:16, \(97: 12\) reason [1] - 8:22 reasonable [1] - 39:6 recalling [1] - 89:23 receive [13] - 12:20, 13:6, 13:17, 15:21, 20:15, 21:8, 21:13, 21:14, 27:16, 27:23, 29:8, 32:9, 37:8 received [34] - 12:16, 12:23, 13:4, 15:21, 16:8, 16:11, 17:3, 20:23, 23:7, 23:16, 23:17, 23:20, 23:23, 24:3, 25:4, 25:10, 25:12, 25:13, 27:9, 27:15, 28:6, 28:13, 29:14, 29:18, 32:7, 42:19, 53:18, 53:21, 53:23, 54:4, 57:8, 65:22, 87:8, 93:10 receiving [12] - 17:5, 18:23, 23:2, 23:7, 23:14, 24:4, 24:17, 24:21, 28:14, 30:3, 31:22, \(35: 19\) recess [1]-51:18 recognize [4]-5:23, 15:4, 15:8, 85:21 recollection [5] - 75:9, 80:23, 81:3, 88:11, 92:10 record [9] - 7:9, 7:10,``` |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |


| $4: 10,39: 21,81: 19$ | $56: 20,59: 23,60: 7$ | Segal [1] - 4:8 | slightly [1] - 76:6 | streamline [1] - 9:11 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| represented [3] - 54:7, | 60:16, 61:5, 63:9, | SEGAL [1] - 2:3 | Smith [1] - 49:23 | Street [1] - 1:22 |
|  | $\begin{aligned} & 68 \\ & 76 \end{aligned}$ | send [3]-15:11, 22:4, | soften [2] - 76: | Stretch [2]-43:23, |
| 4:14, 4:15 | 86:22, 87:5, 90:21, | sending [1] - 19:18 | 46:18 | stretch ${ }^{[6]}$ - 44:5, |
| represents [2]-52:15, | $90: 22,93: 4,93: 6,$ | sense [1] - 45:16 | someone [10]-23:8, | 50:5, 50:9, 50:20, |
| 87:22 |  | sent [0]-12:15, 22:16, | 30:6, 35:20, 50:1 | 50:21 |
| reproduce requested | $\begin{gathered} \text { scanned [22] - 16:19, } \\ \text { 43:2, 43:12, 46:4, } \end{gathered}$ | $: 2,32: 5,43: 3$ | 51:2, 54:6, 54:16, | stretched $[1]$ - 50:18 |
| 26:10, | $53: 22,55: 5,57: 11$ | se | Someone | strike [18] - 3:7, 3 |
| required [2] - 35:21, | 23, 69:11 | 33:3, 51:1 | SONYA [2]-1:17, | 6:9, 16:21, 23:18, |
| :2 | 73:5, | separate [12]-23:18, | 2:1 | :23, 38:5, 47:17, |
| rescanned [2] - 46:2, | 11, | 25:3, 42:12, 43:11, | sorry [5] - 11:3, 38:10, | 52:18, 54:5, 57: |
|  | 86:14, 92:15, 92:21, | 53:23, 54:2, 54:3, | 63:23, 84:22, 93:9 | 64:6, 69:21, 93:3, |
| rescanning [1] - 46:1 | 94:4, 94:7, 94:11 | 54:14, 58:11, 79:18, | Sorry [2] - 39:5, 71:9 | 93:5 |
| resembled [1] - 58:4 | scan | 81:15, $93: 11$ | sort [4] - 12:12, 29:10, | strong [1] - 63:13 |
| reserved [2] - 3:7, 3:9 |  | separately [3]-23:19, | 29:13, 35 | studio [13]-13:12 |
| resides [1] - 20:9 | 48:23, 60:9, 64:5 <br> $64: 8,68 \cdot 6,69 \cdot 5$ | 25:4, 25:12 | source [3-19:2 | 13:16, 13:19, 13:22, |
| respect [4]-30:9, |  | sequentially [1] | 19:5, 19:8 | :23, 14:3, 14:7, |
| $31: 12,56: 2,93: 11$ respective [1]-3:4 | $78: 18,79: 13,96: 17$ | 7:19 | SOUTHERN [1] - 1:1 | 14:12, 34:9, 34:14 |
| response [2]-22:12, | scans [8] - 43:2 | served [1] - 6:2 <br> service [1] - 38:2 | speaking [3]-9:14, | 35:14, 35:16, 54:17 |
| 57:5 | 47:10, 53:15, 60:6, | Service [1]-1:20 | $\mathbf{s p}$ | subject [2] - 5: |
| retained [3]-11:14, | 60:10, 77:6, 78:17, | set[3]-63:13, 85:18, | $13: 20,27: 3,52: 19$ | 52:22 |
| 12:13, |  | 85:21 | 1, 65:6, 65:9 | subpoena [10] - 5:6 |
| return [2] - $3: 12,34: 3$ | SCHNADER | seven [1] - 89:4 | 9, 78:3, 78:6 | 5:8, 5:14, 5:17, 5:20, |
| returne |  | several [1]-23:4 | 80:20, 81: | 5:23, 6:5, 6:11, 6:16, |
|  | Scissors [1] - 55:2 | shading [1] - 45: | 9, 88:8, 91:5, | 22:13 |
| reviewed [1] | sc | shall [4]-3:8, 3:13 | 92:7, 92:14 | subsequent [2] |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { RGB }[3]-59: 23,60: 2, \\ & 77: 4 \end{aligned}$ | second [15]-6:10, 43:5, 43:15, 50:2, | $\begin{gathered} \text { 3:13, } 3: 17 \\ \text { sheet }[7]-54: 22 \end{gathered}$ | Specifically [1] - 22:17 | $\begin{gathered} 69: 12,89: 6 \\ \text { substrate [2] - 20:8 } \end{gathered}$ |
| $\text { RICHARD }_{[2]}-1: 8 \text {, }$ $2: 14$ | $\begin{aligned} & 62: 4,68: 12,69: 18 \\ & 72: 19,81: 14,85: 18, \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 58: 20,59: 7,59: 10 \\ & 59: 16,59: 18,81: 15 \end{aligned}$ | specifically ${ }^{[5]}$ - $24: 16,28: 7,30: 1$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { 21:10 } \\ \text { subtle[1] } \end{gathered}$ |
| Richard [11] - 4:14, | 85:21, 89:16, 90:19, | SHERIDAN [1] - 2:12 | 41:9, 43:7 | Suite [1]-2:4 |
| $\begin{aligned} & 8: 14,11: 7,16: 20, \\ & 16: 21,39: 2,49: 6, \end{aligned}$ | section [1] - 52:5 | show [2] - 10:7, 14:14 <br> side [3] - 24:13, 69:20 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { speculation [1] } \\ & 19: 11 \end{aligned}$ | superimpose [1] - 26:7 |
| $\begin{aligned} & 53: 2,70: 13,70: 14 \\ & 70: 18 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { see }[58]-10: 18,14: 19, \\ 23: 19,40: 18,41: 13, \end{gathered}$ | side-by-side [1] | speculative [1] - 57:5 | supplied [1] - 5:9 |
| right-hand [3]-40:15, | $42: 8,43: 17,44: 3$ | 69:20 similar | spreadsheet [3] 82:14, 84:5, 85: | $\begin{aligned} & \text { supposed }[3]-6: 6, \\ & 51: 2,56: 3 \end{aligned}$ |
| 62:2, 88:15 | 50:7, 51:23, 52:7 | 51:9, 87:2 | squirts [1] - 21:1 | surface [1] - 90:16 |
| rights [2] - 3:6, 3:13 | 53:5, 62:6, 64:23, | singular [1] - 55:2 | ss [2]-99:1, 100; | Sworn [1]-99:20 |
| RIZZOLI [1] - 1:9 | 65:4, 65:14, 65:16, $66 \cdot 23,68: 15,68: 18$ | sit [5] - 19:8, 22:1 | stamp [2] - 40:7, 40:9 | sworn [3]-3:11, 4:3, |
| Rizzoli [1] - 4:11 | $70: 8,72: 7,72: 5$ | 39:2, 91:3, 9 | stand [2]-60:2, 68:20 | 4:21 |
| role [2] - 8:20, 8:22 Row 2$]-1: 17$ 2:17 | $72: 15,72: 21,7$ | six [1] -65:15 | standard [3] - 38:9, | symbol [1]-29:10 |
| ROW [2]-1:17, 2:17 RP $[4]-70: 7$ 70:14 | 73:16, 73:19, 74:23, | Sixty [1] - 93:22 | 38:19, 38:20 | system [8] - 43:23, |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { RP }[4]-70: 7,70: 14, \\ & 71: 5,71: 15 \end{aligned}$ | $75: 16,75: 20,76: 11,$ | $\text { sixty }[1]-94: 11$ <br> Sixty-nine [1] - | $\begin{aligned} & \text { stands [2] - 70:14 } \\ & 83: 22 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 44:12, 50:21, 67:13, } \\ & \text { 67:15, 67:23, 81:4, } \end{aligned}$ |
|  | 14, | sixty-nine [1] - | started [1] - 32:1 | 81:6 |
|  | 83:19, 85:16, 86:20, <br> $87.6,88 \cdot 3,88 \cdot 16$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { size }[13]-26: 23,27: 3, \\ 27: 8,57: 2,57: 3, \end{gathered}$ | STATE [3]-1:1,99 100:1 | T |
| saved [1] - 12:23 <br> saw [1]-10:19 | $0,$ | $: 6,81: 8,91: 2$ | Stenographer [1] |  |
| Scan [1]-56 | 92:18, 95:17, 96:4, | 96:18 |  |  |
| $\operatorname{scan}[37]-12: 15,$ | 96:10, 96:14, 96:20, | skewing [1]-29:21 | step [1] - 43:7 |  |
| 16:14, 16:22, 18:14, | 97:8, 97:17 | sk | -2: | $: 6,20: 7,20: 1$ |
| 21:21, 22:4, 43:8, | seeing [1- -22:17 | skilled [1] - 45:19 |  | 1:4, 21:9, 77:3 |
| 44:18, 45:5, 45:22, | 72:13, 86:16, 93:18, | skills [1] - 45:11 | TEED [2] - 3:4 | :5, 77:7, 78:19, |
| 46:10, 46:16, 46:17, | 94:2 | slight [3]-97:13 |  | 83:23, 84:16, 90:16 |
| 46:23, 47:20, 54:16, | seem [1] - 82:18 | slight [3]-97:13, 97:16, 98:3 | stored [1] - 84:19 <br> Straight [1] - 55:6 |  |


|  |  |  |  | Zone [6] - 9:17, 10:9, 10:14, 11:8, 11:14, 12:11, 12:13, 12:17, 15:10, 15:22, 16:15, 17:4, 17:6, 17:11, 17:13, 17:16, 18:6, 18:14, 18:20, 18:23, 19:19, 20:11, 22:2, 23:3, 24:11, 24:18, 24:22, 26:15, 27:6, 29:7, 29:15, 29:19, 30:2, 30:13, 31:6, 31:20, 33:13, 33:18, 36:10, 36:20, 37:4, 37:9, 37:13, 37:16, 38:8, 38:13, 39:4, 39:12, 42:19, 43:7, 47:8, 47:19, 49:6, 52:11, 52:13, 52:16, 53:18, 61:2, 65:19, 67:10, 72:12, 75:10, 78:10, 80:21, 84:12, 88:12, 92:11 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |


|  | McDonald <br> UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT <br> SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK <br> PATRICK CARIOU, $\begin{aligned} \text { vs. Plaintiff, } & \text { Index No.: } \\ \text { RICHARD PRINCE, GAGOSIAN } & \end{aligned}$ <br> GALLERY, INC., LAWRENCE <br> GAGOSIAN, and RIZZOLI <br> INTERNATIONAL PUBLICATIONS, INC., <br> Defendants. <br> DEPOSITION OF ALISON MCDONALD New York, New York Thursday, December 17, 2009 <br> Reported by: <br> Bryan Nilsen, RPR <br> JOB NO. 305996-A | 1 <br> 2 <br> 3 <br> 4 <br> 5 <br> 6 <br> 7 <br> 7 <br> 8 <br> 9 <br> 10 <br> 11 <br> 12 <br> 13 <br> 14 <br> 15 <br> 16 <br> 17 <br> 18 <br> 18 <br> 19 <br> 20 <br> 21 <br> 22 <br> 23 <br> 24 <br> 25 | McDonald A P P E A R A N C E S: SCHNADER HARRISON SEGAL \& LEWIS LLP Attorneys for Plaintiff 140 Broadway, Suite 3100 New York, New York 10005-1101 BY: DANIEL J. BROOKS, ESQ. PHONE: (212)973-8000 EMAIL: dbrooks@schnader.com WITHERS BERGMAN LLP Attorneys for Defendants Gagosian Gallery, Inc., and Lawrence Gagosian 430 Park Avenue, 10th Floor New York, New York 10022-3505 BY: HOLLIS GONERKA BART, ESQ. PHONE: (212)848-9800 EMAIL: hollis.bart@withers.us.com |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 2 |  | 4 |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 |  | 2 | APPEARANCES (Cont'd.) |
| 3 |  | 3 |  |
| 4 |  | 4 | HANLY CONROY BIERSTEIN SHERIDAN FISHER \& HAYES LLP |
| 5 |  | 5 | Attorneys for Defendant Richard Prince |
| 6 | December 17, 2009 | 6 | 112 Madison Avenue |
| 7 | 1:00 p.m. | 7 | New York, New York 10016-7416 |
| 8 |  | 8 | BY: STEVEN M. HAYES, ESQ. |
| 9 |  | 9 | PHONE: (212)784-6400 |
| 10 | Deposition of ALISON MCDONALD, | 10 | EMAIL: shayes@hanlyconroy.com |
| 11 | held at the offices of Withers Bergman, | 11 |  |
| 12 | LLP, 430 Park Avenue, New York, New York, | 12 | WEISMANN CELLER SPETT \& MODLIN P.C. |
| 13 | pursuant to Notice, before Bryan Nilsen, | 13 | Attorneys for Defendant Rizzoli International |
| 14 | RPR, a Notary Public of the State of | 14 | Publications, Inc. |
| 15 | New York. | 15 | 445 Park Avenue, No. 1500 |
| 16 |  | 16 | New York, New York 10022 |
| 17 |  | 17 | BY: JOHN B. SHERMAN, ESQ. |
| 18 |  | 18 | PHONE: (212)371-5400 |
| 19 |  | 19 | EMAIL: jsherman@wcsm445.com |
| 20 |  | 20 |  |
| 21 |  | 21 |  |
| 22 |  | 22 |  |
| 23 |  | 23 |  |
| 24 |  | 24 |  |
| 25 |  | 25 |  |


|  | 5 |  | 7 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 |  | 2 | background, please? |
| 3 |  | 3 | A. I went to college at Rutgers, Mason |
| 4 | IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, <br> by and among the attorneys for the respective parties herein, that filing and sealing be and the same are hereby waived. | 4 | Gross. |
| 5 |  | 5 | Q. I'm sorry? |
| 6 |  | 6 | A. Mason Gross, which is the art school |
| 7 |  | 7 | at Rutgers. |
| 8 |  | 8 | Q. Do you have a degree? |
| 9 | IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED that all objections, except as to the form of the question, shall be reserved to the time of the trial. | 9 | A. Ido. |
| 10 |  | 10 | Q. In fine arts? |
| 11 |  | 11 | A. Yes. |
| 12 |  | 12 | Q. And have you studied art history? |
| 13 |  | 13 | A. A bit, yes. |
| 14 | IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED that the within deposition may be sworn to and signed before any officer authorized to administer an oath, with the same force and effect as if signed and sworn to before the Court. | 14 | Q. By whom are you employed? |
| 15 |  | 15 | A. Gagosian Gallery. |
| 16 |  | 16 | Q. When did you first begin working for |
| 17 |  | 17 | Gagosian Gallery? |
| 18 |  | 18 | A. April of 2002. |
| 19 |  | 19 | Q. Had you been employed before that? |
| 20 |  | 20 | A. Yes. |
| 21 |  | 21 | Q. Doing what? |
| 22 |  | 22 | A. I was working for photographers as a |
| 23 |  | 23 | studio assistant. |
| 24 |  | 24 | Q. In? |
| 25 |  | 25 | A. In New York. |
|  | 6 |  | 8 |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | ALISON MCDONALD, called as a witness, having been duly sworn by a Notary Public, was examined and testified as follows: <br> THE COURT REPORTER: Please state your name and address for the record. <br> THE WITNESS: Alison McDonald, 582 Vanderbilt Avenue, Apartment 4, Brooklyn, New York 11238. | 2 | Q. What was his name or her name? |
| 3 |  | 3 | A. Andrea Robbins and Max Becher. |
| 4 |  | 4 | Q. And before that? |
| 5 |  | 5 | A. Before that, I was in college. |
| 6 |  | 6 | Q. When did you graduate from college? |
| 7 |  | 7 | A. 2001. |
| 8 |  | 8 | Q. In 2008 where were you employed at |
| 9 |  | 9 | Gagosian, in other words, at which location? |
| 10 |  | 10 | A. 980 Madison Avenue. |
| 11 | EXAMINATION BY | 11 | Q. And you began at Gagosian did you |
| 12 | MR. BROOKS: | 12 | say in April of 2002? |
| 13 | Q. Ms. McDonald, I represent the | 13 | A. Yes. |
| 14 | plaintiff in this lawsuit. | 14 | Q. And have you been employed at |
| 15 | I'm going to ask you some questions | 15 | 980 Madison for that entire period of time? |
| 16 | primarily about an exhibition that the Gagosian | 16 | A. Yes. |
| 17 | Gallery held for some paintings by Richard | 17 | Q. In 2008 did you have a title? |
| 18 | Prince, the Canal Zone exhibition, and a catalog | 18 | A. I do not have a formal title at the |
| 19 | I think it's called, that was made of some of | 19 | gallery. |
| 20 | the paintings in that exhibition. And I may ask | 20 | Q. And last year you didn't have a |
| 21 | you some other questions, but that's going to be | 21 | formal title either? |
| 22 | primarily what I'm going to ask you about. | 22 | A. No. |
| 23 | If you don't understand my question, | 23 | Q. In 2008, which is what the focus of |
| 24 | just tell me and l'll rephrase it. | 24 | my questions are going to be about, was there |
| 25 | Can you tell us your educational | 25 | someone that you reported to, did you have a |


|  | 9 |  | 11 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | boss? | 2 | A. Yes. |
| 3 | A. Yes. | 3 | Q. Were those taken by somebody named |
| 4 | Q. And who was that? | 4 | Rob McKeever, if you know? |
| 5 | A. Melissa Lazarov and Larry Gagosian. | 5 | MS. BART: Objection to form. |
| 6 | Q. Do you know if Melissa Lazarov had a | 6 | Q. You can answer. |
| 7 | title last year at Gagosian Gallery? | 7 | A. Yes. |
| 8 | A. No, I don't think there are formal | 8 | Q. Do you know Rob McKeever? |
| 9 | titles. | 9 | A. Yes. |
| 10 | Q. Was she also at 980 Madison? | 10 | Q. And he's a photographer employed by |
| 11 | A. Yes. | 11 | Gagosian Gallery? |
| 12 | Q. Did you work on the Canal Zone | 12 | A. Yes. |
| 13 | exhibition in 2008? | 13 | Q. Freelance or he's an employee, if |
| 14 | A. I worked on the publication. | 14 | you know? |
| 15 | Q. Of the catalog? | 15 | A. He's an employee. |
| 16 | A. Yes. | 16 | Q. If you look towards the back of that |
| 17 | Q. I just want to make sure I'm using | 17 | book you'll find a page which has your name on |
| 18 | the right terminology. I'm going to show you a | 18 | it and gives you credit as the managing editor. |
| 19 | book, which I think has been marked previously | 19 | Have you found that? |
| 20 | as Exhibit 42, Plaintiff's 42. | 20 | A. Yes. |
| 21 | Is that the publication you're | 21 | Q. And for the record, we had Bates |
| 22 | referring to? | 22 | stamped a copy of this book, so just for the |
| 23 | A. Yes. | 23 | record that would be Bates stamp C00213. And I |
| 24 | Q. So you worked on that book? | 24 | think the book has some Bates stamps but not all |
| 25 | A. Yes. | 25 | of them. |
|  | 10 |  | 12 |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | Q. In what capacity? | 2 | So this indicates that Melissa |
| 3 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 3 | Lazarov was the editor of this book? |
| 4 | Q. Okay, what were you doing with | 4 | A. Yes. |
| 5 | respect to the book? | 5 | Q. And did she supervise you in any way |
| 6 | A. I'm just not sure -- could you be | 6 | in connection with the publication of this book? |
| 7 | more specific? | 7 | A. Yes. |
| 8 | Q. Well, were you the managing editor | 8 | Q. Did you ever go to the Canal Zone |
| 9 | of the publication of the book? | 9 | exhibition, I think it was between November 8th |
| 10 | A. Yes. | 10 | and December 20th, 2008? |
| 11 | Q. What did that entail doing? | 11 | A. Yes. |
| 12 | A. I managed the production with the | 12 | Q. And can you tell us how frequently |
| 13 | printer, paper selection, binding, delivery. | 13 | you went? Approximately. No one's going to |
| 14 | I work to make sure there are no | 14 | hold you to it. |
| 15 | copy editing mistakes with regards to the text | 15 | A. Twice. |
| 16 | and captioning and -- of that material. | 16 | Q. Did you go there before the |
| 17 | I work to make sure the paintings | 17 | exhibition opened? |
| 18 | reproduce as beautifully as possible. | 18 | A. I don't remember. |
| 19 | Q. I'm sorry, I didn't hear the end of | 19 | Q. Did you discuss the exhibition with |
| 20 | that? | 20 | Melissa Lazarov? |
| 21 | A. As beautifully as possible, as | 21 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 22 | accurately as possible. | 22 | Q. You can answer. |
| 23 | Q. Okay. Does the book contain | 23 | A. Yes. |
| 24 | photographs of some of the paintings that were | 24 | Q. Did you discuss the exhibition with |
| 25 | exhibited at the Canal Zone show? | 25 | Richard Prince? |


|  | 13 |  | 15 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 2 | role was, if any -- well, what your role was? |
| 3 | A. No. | 3 | A. Proofreading. |
| 4 | Q. Did you discuss the book, the | 4 | Q. Did you make any editorial |
| 5 | catalog with Richard Prince? | 5 | suggestions or comments or suggest changes? |
| 6 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 6 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 7 | A. No. | 7 | Q. You can answer. |
| 8 | Q. Did you discuss the exhibition with | 8 | A. Because it was a fictional text we |
| 9 | Mr. Gagosian? | 9 | didn't make any changes. It's possible that we |
| 10 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 10 | made a recommendation or two for spelling |
| 11 | A. No. | 11 | mistakes. |
| 12 | Q. How about the catalog? | 12 | Q. Recommendation to who? |
| 13 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 13 | A. James Frey. |
| 14 | A. The finished catalog? | 14 | Q. Did you talk to him personally? |
| 15 | Q. No, as it was being prepared? | 15 | A. No. |
| 16 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 16 | Q. Did you have e-mail correspondence |
| 17 | Q. You can answer. | 17 | with him? |
| 18 | A. Yes. | 18 | A. Not that I recall. |
| 19 | Q. Yes? What did you discuss with him? | 19 | Q. If you go to the back of the book |
| 20 | A. How we would represent the paintings | 20 | again where your name was listed, page 213, it |
| 21 | within the publication. | 21 | lists some Gagosian Gallery coordinators, do you |
| 22 | Q. Did you have conversations with | 22 | see that? |
| 23 | Betsy Biscone about the book? | 23 | A. Yes. |
| $\begin{aligned} & 24 \\ & 25 \end{aligned}$ | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 24 | Q. Are those people who assisted you in |
|  |  |  |  |
|  | 14 |  | 16 |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | Q. And who is Betsy Biscone? | 2 | A. Yes. |
| 3 | A. She works at Richard Prince's | 3 | Q. And do you know if any of them |
| 4 | studio. | 4 | assisted in putting on the exhibition of the |
| 5 | Q. What did you discuss with her, if | 5 | Canal Zone show? |
| 6 | you remember? | 6 | A. Yes. |
| 7 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 7 | Q. Do you know which ones? |
| 8 | A. I believe we discussed the studio | 8 | A. For the exhibition? |
| 9 | photography, the photographs in the inserts of | 9 | Q. Yes. |
| 10 | the book. | 10 | A. Justin. |
| 11 | Q. The inserts? | 11 | Q. Justin Adian? |
| 12 | We'll get to this later, but is it | 12 | A. Yes. |
| 13 | correct there are three inserts in this book? | 13 | Andisheh Avini. |
| 14 | A. Yes. | 14 | Q. I'm sorry? |
| 15 | Q. The first one is -- would you call | 15 | A. Andisheh Avini. |
| 16 | it an essay by Richard Frey? | 16 | Q. Yes, okay. |
| 17 | A. James Frey. | 17 | A. Thomas Duncan, Anita Foden, Richie |
| 18 | Q. I'm sorry, James Frey? | 18 | Lasansky, Yayoi Sakurai, and Allison Smith. |
| 19 | A. A fictional text by James Frey. | 19 | Q. Did any of those people assist you |
| 20 | Q. And does it have a title? | 20 | with the preparation of the book? |
| 21 | A. Ding Dong the Witch is Dead. | 21 | A. Yes. |
| 22 | Q. Did you have any role at all in | 22 | Q. Which ones? |
| 23 | reviewing the fictional text by James Frey? | 23 | A. Darlina Goldak, Nicole Heck, |
| 24 | A. Yes. | 24 | Kim Higby. |
| 25 | Q. Can you tell us in general what your | 25 | Q. Kim? |


|  | 17 |  | 19 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | A. Higby. | 2 | has been marked as Exhibit 61, consists of a |
| 3 | Q. And were you supervising them? | 3 | number of different e-mails. |
| 4 | A. Yes. | 4 | If you could look at the first page |
| 5 | (Discussion off the record.) | 5 | of Exhibit 61, and just for the record, that's |
| 6 | BY MR. BROOKS: | 6 | Bates stamped GGP000800. |
| 7 | Q. On that same page, C213, it says | 7 | It looks like you received an e-mail |
| 8 | distributed by Rizzoli International | 8 | from somebody named Ivor Williams at the bottom |
| 9 | Publications, do you see that? | 9 | of that page? |
| 10 | A. Yes. | 10 | A. Yes. |
| 11 | Q. Are you aware of any role Rizzoli | 11 | Q. Do you remember what essay that |
| 12 | played in the publication or distribution of the | 12 | pertained to? |
| 13 | book that's in front of you, the Canal Zone | 13 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 14 | book? | 14 | A. The James Frey text. |
| 15 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 15 | Q. And what was the role of Graphic |
| 16 | MR. SHERMAN: Objection, form. | 16 | Thought Facility or Mr. Ivor Williams in |
| 17 | Q. You can answer. | 17 | connection with the Canal Zone book? |
| 18 | A. Role in producing the book? | 18 | A. He was the designer. |
| 19 | Q. Yes. | 19 | Q. Can you be a little more specific, |
| 20 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 20 | what part of the book was he designing? |
| 21 | Q. You can answer. | 21 | A. He designed the entire book. |
| 22 | MR. SHERMAN: Same. | 22 | Q. And they were located in London, |
| 23 | A. They gave us an ISBN number and | 23 | Graphic Thought Facility? |
| 24 | registered it with the Library of Congress. | 24 | A. Yes. |
| 25 | And we discussed the, you know, potential of | 25 | Q. In response to this e-mail from |
|  | 18 |  | 20 |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | distributing the title in book stores through | 2 | Mr. Williams it appears that you wrote, "Great, |
| 3 | Rizzoli. | 3 | Everything looks good to send Transcontinental, |
| 4 | Q. You say we. Who is we? | 4 | Can I have the spine to show Rizzoli?" |
| 5 | A. Anthony Petrillose and I. | 5 | Did you send that e-mail? |
| 6 | Q. And he was an employee or a | 6 | A. Yes. |
| 7 | representative of Rizzoli? | 7 | Q. What is Transcontinental? |
| 8 | A. Yes. | 8 | A. They were the printer. |
| 9 | Q. You said ISBN? | 9 | Q. Where were they located? |
| 10 | A. Yes. | 10 | A. Montreal. |
| 11 | Q. Do you know what a best edition is | 11 | Q. And what is the spine? |
| 12 | in the publishing business? | 12 | I can show you the book again. |
| 13 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 13 | A. It's the spine of the book. |
| 14 | A. A best? | 14 | MS. BART: Well, may the record |
| 15 | Q. Best, B-E-S-T, edition? | 15 | reflect that the witness is pointing to |
| 16 | A. No. | 16 | that portion that's about an inch thick, |
| 17 | Q. Do me a favor, give me back that | 17 | it says Canal Zone, Richard Prince, and it |
| 18 | book, and I'll give it back to you again later | 18 | has an R on it. |
| 19 | I'm sure. Thank you. | 19 | Q. And that's between the front cover |
| 20 | I'm going to show you a document | 20 | and the back cover, right? |
| 21 | which has previously been marked as Exhibit 61 | 21 | A. Yes. |
| 22 | in one of the depositions in this case. So I'm | 22 | Q. And if you turn to the fourth page |
| 23 | not going to mark it again. | 23 | of Exhibit 61, Bates stamp GGP001517, can you |
| 24 | And I have copies for everyone. | 24 | tell us what that is? |
| 25 | Ms. McDonald, this document, which | 25 | A. A printout of the spine of the book. |


| 21 |  |  | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| McDonald |  | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | Q. Why did you want to show the spine | 2 | When you said we you were talking |
| 3 | to Rizzoli? | 3 | about Gagosian Gallery, is that right? |
| 4 | A. It has their logo on it, so I wanted | 4 | A. Yes. |
| 5 | to show them how their logo would appear on the | 5 | Q. How did you reach that calculation, |
| 6 | spine of the book. | 6 | if you know? |
| 7 | Q. And did you? | 7 | A. Based on a percentage in a contract |
| 8 | A. Yes. | 8 | we were discussing at the time. |
| 9 | Q. And what, if anything, did -- was it | 9 | Q. A contract with whom? |
| 10 | Mr. Petrillose? | 10 | A. Rizzoli. |
| 11 | MR. SHERMAN: Petrillose. | 11 | Q. Do you know if that book, the Canal |
| 12 | MR. BROOKS: Petrillose. | 12 | Zone book catalog, was being offered for sale |
| 13 | Let's call him Anthony. | 13 | during the Canal Zone exhibition between |
| 14 | BY MR. BROOKS: | 14 | November 8th and December 20th, 2008? |
| 15 | Q. Was he the person you were talking | 15 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 16 | to at Rizzoli? | 16 | Q. You can answer. |
| 17 | A. Yes. | 17 | A. I don't know. |
| 18 | Q. And when you showed him the spine, | 18 | Q. Do you know if any copies were sold |
| 19 | what, if anything, did he say? | 19 | at the gallery? |
| 20 | A. He approved it. | 20 | A. Yes. |
| 21 | Q. Can you turn to the second page of | 21 | Q. How do you know that? |
| 22 | Exhibit 61, so you're on the fourth I think now. | 22 | A. I think there were a hundred copies |
| 23 | This is GGP001040. | 23 | sold. |
| 24 | Is this an e-mail, a copy of an | 24 | Q. But what's your basis for saying |
| 25 | e-mail that you sent on October 10th, 2008, to | 25 | that? |
|  | 22 |  | 24 |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | Melissa Lazarov? | 2 | MS. BART: He doesn't want you to |
| 3 | A. Yes. | 3 | guess. |
| 4 | Q. There's a calculation after the | 4 | Q. I'm not doubting you. |
| 5 | first paragraph, it says 3,000 total equals | 5 | What makes you think that? |
| 6 | \$115,000, parenthesis, \$38 per book, closed | 6 | A. I don't know. I think -- I just |
| 7 | parenthesis, what does that refer to? | 7 | think it. I don't know. |
| 8 | A. The printing price. | 8 | Q. Somebody told you? |
| 9 | Q. That's what you would be paying to | 9 | A. No. |
| 10 | Transcontinental? | 10 | Q. Why do you think a hundred were |
| 11 | A. Yes. | 11 | sold? |
| 12 | Q. And do you know if you ordered 3,000 | 12 | A. I was guessing really. |
| 13 | books in fact? | 13 | Q. Well, how do you know? |
| 14 | A. Yes. | 14 | Do you know whether any were sold? |
| 15 | Q. And were 1,000 of those books for | 15 | A. No. |
| 16 | Rizzoli? | 16 | Q. Do you know where the unsold copies |
| 17 | A. Yes. | 17 | of the Canal Zone book are now? |
| 18 | Q. And the gallery was going to get the | 18 | A. In storage. I don't know. |
| 19 | other 2,000 copies of the book? | 19 | Q. Do you know if there are any unsold |
| 20 | A. Yes. | 20 | copies of the Canal Zone book? |
| 21 | Q. How did you calculate that Gagosian | 21 | A. I don't know. |
| 22 | Gallery -- well, you said we should be able to | 22 | Q. Who would know how many were sold, |
| 23 | make about 30 to $\$ 40,000$ back from the Rizzoli | 23 | if any? |
| 24 | copies that sell in addition to any gallery | 24 | MS. BART: I believe, Mr. Brooks, |
| 25 | sales of the books. | 25 | that we're doing a stipulation to that |


|  | 25 |  | 27 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | effect, so rather than take this witness's | 2 | MS. BART: I think the witness wants |
| 3 | time, you know, since Gagosian is going to | 3 | to correct the record. |
| 4 | give you a stipulation, that should be | 4 | Your question as posed was somewhat |
| 5 | sufficient. | 5 | vague in that you said did you play any |
| 6 | MR. BROOKS: Okay. For present | 6 | role in the inviting of people, and I |
| 7 | purposes l'll move on. | 7 | think she answered no. |
| 8 | MS. BART: Thank you. | 8 | But I think so that the record |
| 9 | BY MR. BROOKS: | 9 | stands corrected I think she was going to |
| 10 | Q. You said you were at the exhibition | 10 | correct her answer. |
| 11 | I think you said twice? | 11 | A. We printed the invitation. |
| 12 | A. Yes. | 12 | Q. Right. Okay. |
| 13 | Q. Did you notice whether these books | 13 | When you say we, I mean I think |
| 14 | were on display and being offered for sale when | 14 | I asked you if you personally played a role? |
| 15 | you were there? | 15 | A. I printed the card that was sent out |
| 16 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 16 | for the invitation. |
| 17 | Q. You can answer. | 17 | Q. Printed it on what? |
| 18 | A. I don't remember. | 18 | A. Paper with ink. |
| 19 | Q. Was there a desk when you walked | 19 | Q. But did you do it in your office on |
| 20 | into the gallery? | 20 | a copying machine? |
| 21 | A. Yes. | 21 | A. No. |
| 22 | Q. Was there somebody sitting there? | 22 | Q. How did you print the invitations? |
| 23 | A. Yes. | 23 | A. We put the text in an InDesign |
| 24 | Q. And you didn't notice whether there | 24 | document and sent that document to a printer. |
| 25 | were any books there on the desk or a sign that | 25 | MR. BROOKS: Let's mark as |
|  | 26 |  | 28 |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | said \$80 for a copy of that book? | 2 | Plaintiff's Exhibit 103 a card stamped |
| 3 | A. No. | 3 | GGP001696A. |
| 4 | Q. When the exhibition commenced on | 4 | (Plaintiff's Exhibit 103, invitation |
| 5 | Saturday, November 8th, was there a dinner that | 5 | GGP001696A, was marked for identification, |
| 6 | night at the Gramercy Park Hotel? | 6 | as of this date.) |
| 7 | A. There was a dinner. Idon't | 7 | Q. Ms. McDonald, you've been handed a |
| 8 | remember if it was at the Gramercy Park Hotel. | 8 | document that's been marked as Plaintiff's |
| 9 | Q. Did you go? | 9 | Exhibit 103. Is that the invitation you were |
| 10 | A. No. | 10 | just testifying about a few minutes ago? |
| 11 | Q. Do you know how many people went? | 11 | A. Yes. |
| 12 | A. No. | 12 | Q. There seems to be a blank line there |
| 13 | Q. Do you know what the purpose of the | 13 | to put in somebody's name, is that right? |
| 14 | dinner was, if any? | 14 | A. Yes. |
| 15 | A. To celebrate the opening of an | 15 | Q. Were these invitations mailed out? |
| 16 | exhibition. | 16 | A. I don't know. I imagine, yeah. |
| 17 | Q. Did you have anything to do with | 17 | MS. BART: No, he doesn't want you |
| 18 | planning the dinner? | 18 | to guess or imagine. |
| 19 | A. We printed a card for the dinner but | 19 | A. I don't know. |
| 20 | not for planning the dinner. | 20 | Q. Do you know if there was an |
| 21 | Q. Did you play any role at all in | 21 | invitation list? |
| 22 | inviting people to come to the dinner? | 22 | A. I don't know. |
| 23 | A. No. | 23 | Q. Okay, I guess I'll hold on to these. |
| 24 | MS. BART: One moment, please. | 24 | In addition to that invitation that |
| 25 | (Discussion off the record.) | 25 | we just looked at, Exhibit 103, was there an |


|  | 29 |  | 31 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | announcement of the exhibition with a photograph | 2 | give us maybe the page number of the |
| 3 | on it, do you know? | 3 | actual catalog. |
| 4 | A. Yes. | 4 | MR. BROOKS: It's in the second |
| 5 | MR. BROOKS: Let's mark as | 5 | insert I think. It's C00148. I think |
| 6 | Plaintiff's Exhibit 104 a document that's | 6 | there's a Post-it there with that number. |
| 7 | been produced and Bates stamped GGP00139A | 7 | MS. BART: We're there. |
| 8 | and 140A front and back. | 8 | MR. BROOKS: That is the number, |
| 9 | (Plaintiff's Exhibit 104, GGP00139A | 9 | okay. |
| 10 | and 140 A , was marked for identification, | 10 | BY MR. BROOKS: |
| 11 | as of this date.) | 11 | Q. So you said something about a |
| 12 | Q. You've been handed Plaintiff's | 12 | picture in a studio, is this what you're |
| 13 | Exhibit 104. Do you know what it is? | 13 | referring to, the C148? |
| 14 | A. Yes. | 14 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 15 | Q. Can you tell us? | 15 | A. This is a different picture. |
| 16 | A. An announcement card for the | 16 | Q. This is a different picture than the |
| 17 | exhibition. | 17 | announcement card? |
| 18 | Q. Do you know if these announcement | 18 | A. Yes. |
| 19 | cards were mailed out? | 19 | Q. How do you know that? |
| 20 | A. Yes. | 20 | A. It's a different angle. |
| 21 | Q. Do you know to whom they were mailed | 21 | Q. Okay. But if you look at the |
| 22 | out, I don't mean the names of all the people, | 22 | announcement card there's a painting that |
| 23 | but what types of people, if you know? | 23 | appears to be propped up on two cans of paint, |
| 24 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 24 | right? |
| 25 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 25 | A. Yes. |
|  | 30 |  | 32 |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | MR. SHERMAN: Objection, form. | 2 | Q. And if you look at C148 the same |
| 3 | Q. You can answer. | 3 | seems to be true, there's a picture propped up |
| 4 | A. Yes. | 4 | on two cans of paint, right? |
| 5 | Q. Can you tell me? | 5 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 6 | A. We have a mailing list of about | 6 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
| 7 | 7,500 people. | 7 | Q. You can answer. |
| 8 | Q. So these announcement cards were | 8 | A. There is a painting on two cans of |
| 9 | mailed to people on that list? | 9 | paint. |
| 10 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 10 | Q. So you're saying that the photo is |
| 11 | Q. You can answer. | 11 | from a different angle, but is it correct that |
| 12 | A. Yes. | 12 | the image in Exhibit 104 in the announcement is |
| 13 | Q. Do you notice on the front of the | 13 | maybe a different photo of the same painting |
| 14 | announcement card an image of a man, do you see | 14 | that's propped on the two cans in C148? |
| 15 | him? | 15 | A. Yes. |
| 16 | A. I see a painting in a studio, yeah. | 16 | Q. But it's from a different angle? |
| 17 | The painting has a man in it, yes. | 17 | A. Yes. |
| 18 | Q. I couldn't hear what you said. | 18 | Q. Okay. And do you know if the |
| 19 | MR. BROOKS: Read it back. | 19 | painting that's shown on C148 in the insert in |
| 20 | (Record read.) | 20 | the book, do you know if that painting was |
| 21 | BY MR. BROOKS: | 21 | actually exhibited at the Canal Zone exhibition? |
| 22 | Q. Why don't you look in that book, the | 22 | A. I don't know. |
| 23 | Canal Zone book, and It think if you look at | 23 | Q. Could you look at the very first |
| 24 | page C00148 perhaps you will find something. | 24 | painting in the book, you have to go back to the |
| 25 | MS. BART: You're going to have to | 25 | beginning. |


| 33 |  |  | 35 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | (Witness looks at exhibit.) | 2 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
| 3 | Q. No, no, not on the cover. | 3 | A. No. |
| 4 | Number 1, it's called Graduation. | 4 | Q. It's correct that there's nothing |
| 5 | It's on page C95. | 5 | obscuring his face, right? |
| 6 | MS. BART: C96? | 6 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 7 | Q. Well, 95 says Graduation, right? | 7 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
| 8 | Correct? | 8 | A. Correct. |
| 9 | A. Yes. | 9 | Q. And do you know if that's the same |
| 10 | MS. BART: There's no number on | 10 | Rastafarian that's in the announcement and in |
| 11 | these. | 11 | page 148? |
| 12 | Q. Doesn't it say 1, Graduation? | 12 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 13 | A. Graduation, yes. | 13 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
| 14 | MS. BART: But there's no Bates | 14 | A. It looks the same. |
| 15 | number on it. | 15 | Q. And you don't know where -- |
| 16 | Q. Right. That's C95. | 16 | MS. BART: He doesn't want you |
| 17 | Now, the next page is a painting | 17 | to guess. |
| 18 | called Graduation, correct? | 18 | MR. BROOKS: She answered -- |
| 19 | A. Yes. | 19 | MO MS. BART: I'm going to object to |
| 20 | Q. Now, absent the paint cans, is that | 20 | the witness's answer as speculative and |
| 21 | painting Graduation the same image that's | 21 | move to strike. |
| 22 | depicted on the announcement? | 22 | MR. BROOKS: Well, you can't move, |
| 23 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 23 | she's your witness. |
| 24 | Q. You can answer. | 24 | MS. BART: I certainly can. |
| 25 | A. Yes. | 25 | MO MR. HAYES: I also move to strike. |
|  | 34 |  | 36 |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | Q. Do you know this man in the | 2 | Same grounds. |
| 3 | painting, in Graduation and on the announcement, | 3 | BY MR. BROOKS: |
| 4 | do you know where this image was obtained? | 4 | Q. On page C151, I'm talking about the |
| 5 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 5 | Rastafarian in between the women, do you know |
| 6 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 6 | where that image came from? |
| 7 | A. No. | 7 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 8 | Q. In the second insert there's a page | 8 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
| 9 | stamped C00151, did you find that? | 9 | A. No. |
| 10 | A. Yes. | 10 | Q. Could you look at page C168-- |
| 11 | Q. And there are a number of images. | 11 | actually, look at the page before, and that's a |
| 12 | There's a woman with it looks like blond hair, | 12 | painting called Tales of Brave Ulysses, is it |
| 13 | there's two images of her, right? | 13 | not? |
| 14 | A. In a painting, yes. | 14 | MS. BART: It's blank on ours. |
| 15 | Q. And in between them is a | 15 | Q. Well, the page before 168 says |
| 16 | Rastafarian, do you see him? | 16 | number 16, Tales of Brave Ulysses, correct? |
| 17 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 17 | A. Yes. |
| 18 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 18 | Q. And then on page 168 is a copy of a |
| 19 | Q. You can answer. | 19 | painting called Tales of Brave Ulysses, correct? |
| 20 | A. In the painting, yes. | 20 | A. Yes. |
| 21 | Q. And unlike the announcement and | 21 | Q. And was this picture or this |
| 22 | unlike Graduation, in that picture there's | 22 | painting part of the show? |
| 23 | nothing obscuring the face of the man in the | 23 | A. I don't know. |
| 24 | painting, right? | 24 | Q. Do you see there are four images of |
| 25 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 25 | the same Rastafarian that we've been looking at |


| 37 |  |  | 39 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | who is in the announcement, correct? | 2 | A. No. |
| 3 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 3 | Q. Do you have an understanding of |
| 4 | Q. You can answer. | 4 | where the studio was located? |
| 5 | A. Yes. | 5 | A. No. |
| 6 | Q. Let me show you a document that's | 6 | Q. Do you see a photo of the same |
| 7 | been marked as Plaintiff's Exhibit 32. | 7 | Rastafarian we've been looking at who is in the |
| 8 | Do you know what that is? | 8 | announcement and in Graduation? |
| 9 | A. Yes. | 9 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 10 | Q. Can you tell us? | 10 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
| 11 | A. It's the exhibition list. | 11 | Q. You can answer. |
| 12 | Q. Have you seen it before? | 12 | A. I see a figure in a painting, yeah. |
| 13 | A. No. | 13 | Q. It appears to be the same man? |
| 14 | Q. Do you see on the second page in | 14 | A. Yes. |
| 15 | gallery 2 it says number 3, Tales of Brave | 15 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 16 | Ulysses, do you see that? | 16 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
| 17 | A. Yes. | 17 | Q. What's the answer? |
| 18 | Q. If you go back to the page before, | 18 | A. Appears to be, yes. |
| 19 | the first page of Exhibit 32, that page, | 19 | MS. BART: Are you asking her to |
| 20 | GGP004298, do you recognize that schematic of | 20 | speculate? |
| 21 | the gallery on 24th Street? | 21 | MR. BROOKS: No, I'm asking her to |
| 22 | A. Yes. | 22 | do what anyone can do by looking at |
| 23 | Q. This was where the show was held, | 23 | things, what anyone can do. |
| 24 | correct? | 24 | MS. BART: I'll object to the form. |
| 25 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 25 | MR. BROOKS: Fine. |
|  | 38 |  | 40 |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | Q. You can answer. | 2 | BY MR. BROOKS: |
| 3 | A. Yes. | 3 | Q. The painting we were looking at |
| 4 | Q. And was the configuration of the | 4 | before, Tales of Brave Ulysses, which is on 168 |
| 5 | paintings on display as indicated in Exhibit 32? | 5 | I think, do you happen to know if that painting |
| 6 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 6 | was ever sold? |
| 7 | A. I don't know. | 7 | A. I don't know. |
| 8 | Q. You don't remember or you don't | 8 | Q. You weren't involved with that? |
| 9 | know? | 9 | A. No. |
| 10 | A. I don't remember. | 10 | Q. I'm sorry, I'm going to ask you, |
| 11 | MR. HAYES: Off the record. | 11 | I meant to ask you before, go back to page 184 |
| 12 | (Discussion off the record.) | 12 | and the third insert that we were just looking |
| 13 | BY MR. BROOKS: | 13 | at. |
| 14 | Q. In the Canal Zone catalog can you | 14 | Now, you said there's an image of |
| 15 | look at the page that's been stamped C00184, | 15 | a man there. What do you see surrounding the |
| 16 | please. It's also -- it's in the third insert | 16 | image of the man? |
| 17 | I believe. | 17 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 18 | Have you found that page? | 18 | Q. You can answer. |
| 19 | A. Yes. | 19 | A. Objects in the artist's studio, |
| 20 | Q. Do you know what this depicts? | 20 | canvases. |
| 21 | A. The artist's studio. | 21 | Q. No, I'm sorry. I mean on that |
| 22 | Q. When you say the artist you mean | 22 | canvas, do you notice landscaping? |
| 23 | Mr. Prince? | 23 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 24 | A. Richard Prince. | 24 | Q. You can answer. |
| 25 | Q. Were you ever in his studio? | 25 | A. There's foliage, yeah. |


|  | 41 |  | 43 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | Q. Foliage, okay, fine. | 2 | advertisements were placed? |
| 3 | If you look at that canvas on C184 | 3 | A. The Art Newspaper, Financial Times, |
| 4 | with the Rastafarian and the foliage -- and | 4 | and New York Times. |
| 5 | maybe keep your hand there in case you want to | 5 | Q. How about W? |
| 6 | go back to it -- and now look at C124. | 6 | A. The magazine? Yes, W. |
| 7 | MS. BART: I'm sorry, C124? | 7 | Q. How about Art Forum, Art in America, |
| 8 | MR. BROOKS: Right. | 8 | and Art and Auction? |
| 9 | BY MR. BROOKS: | 9 | MS. BART: Objection. |
| 10 | Q. Do you know if the painting in C124 | 10 | A. Yes. |
| 11 | is based on the canvas we looked at in C184? | 11 | Q. All three? |
| 12 | MR. HAYES: Objection to form. | 12 | A. There were more than -- did you |
| 13 | MS. BART: Join. | 13 | say W? |
| 14 | Q. You can answer. | 14 | Q. I just said -- no, after W I said |
| 15 | A. I don't know. | 15 | Art Forum? |
| 16 | Q. Do you know where the -- you call | 16 | A. Yes. |
| 17 | this foliage, if you look at 124? | 17 | Q. Were there ads there? |
| 18 | A. $\mathrm{Mm}-\mathrm{hmm}$. | 18 | A. One ad, yes. |
| 19 | Q. The plants that are around the image | 19 | Q. And Art in America, was there an ad |
| 20 | of the man, do you know where those images of | 20 | for the Canal Zone exhibition there? |
| 21 | foliage came from? | 21 | A. Yes. |
| 22 | A. No. | 22 | Q. And how about Art and Auction? |
| 23 | Q. Can I have the announcement back? | 23 | A. Yes. |
| 24 | Thanks. | 24 | Q. One ad in each of them? |
| 25 | MS. BART: Are you done with this | 25 | A. Yes. |
|  | 42 |  | 44 |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | one? | 2 | Q. In the New York Times were there two |
| 3 | MR. BROOKS: I'm done with that | 3 | ads? |
| 4 | page, yes, but she should keep the book. | 4 | A. I don't remember. |
| 5 | BY MR. BROOKS: | 5 | Q. Was there an ad just for the Canal |
| 6 | Q. Did you ever ask anyone where the | 6 | Zone exhibition in the New York Times? |
| 7 | images of the Rastafarians that are in many of | 7 | A. I remember it was on a list of other |
| 8 | these Canal Zone paintings came from? | 8 | exhibitions the gallery was having in the |
| 9 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 9 | New York Times ad. |
| 10 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 10 | Q. Right. One other, right, a painter |
| 11 | Q. You can answer. | 11 | with a Japanese name? |
| 12 | A. No. | 12 | A. I think it was Hiroshi Sugimoto. |
| 13 | Q. Did you ever hear anyone explaining | 13 | Q. To your knowledge did Mr. Gagosian |
| 14 | where they came from? | 14 | review the ads before they were placed in the |
| 15 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 15 | newspapers? |
| 16 | A. No. | 16 | A. Yes. |
| 17 | Q. Have you ever seen this book, it's | 17 | Q. That's a yes? |
| 18 | called Yes Rasta? | 18 | A. Yes. |
| 19 | A. No. | 19 | Q. Do you know if Mr. Prince reviewed |
| 20 | Q. Okay, you can give it back to me. | 20 | the ads? |
| 21 | Thank you. | 21 | A. I don't know for sure, no. |
| 22 | Were there newspaper advertisements | 22 | Q. I'm going to hand you a series of |
| 23 | for the Canal Zone exhibition? | 23 | e-mails that have been collectively marked as |
| 24 | A. Yes. | 24 | Plaintiff's Exhibit 45 previously. |
| 25 | Q. Do you remember where the | 25 | The first page of Exhibit 45 |


|  | 45 |  | 47 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | GGP001991 talks about an announcement card and | 2 | Look at the second page of |
| 3 | adverts, and something -- it says Larry reviewed | 3 | Exhibit 45, please. Do you see it says but LG |
| 4 | the options and wants to run the attached ad, | 4 | wants to make sure the ad is large and very |
| 5 | parenthesis, AF Prince placeholder, closed | 5 | clear because it has two shows on it, do you see |
| 6 | parenthesis, in Art Forum, et cetera. | 6 | that? |
| 7 | Do you know what the Prince | 7 | A. Yes. |
| 8 | placeholder, it's all in capital letters, do you | 8 | Q. And then below that there's an |
| 9 | know what that is? | 9 | e-mail from Nicole Heck October 17th saying |
| 10 | A. She's referring to the file name | 10 | run the attached again in NYT on Friday, |
| 11 | that's attached. | 11 | October 24th, and then below that it says Prince |
| 12 | Q. And is that an image that ran in the | 12 | and Sugimoto both open the week after that, does |
| 13 | advertisements? | 13 | he want to run one ad announcing both on Friday, |
| 14 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 14 | November 7th. |
| 15 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 15 | Do you recall whether an ad was |
| 16 | A. That was attached to the e-mail. | 16 | taken in the New York Times for both of those |
| 17 | I'd have to check. | 17 | shows, Prince and Sugimoto? |
| 18 | Q. Do you know if the image in the | 18 | A. Yes. |
| 19 | advertisements was an image of the same | 19 | Q. And you don't think there were |
| 20 | Rastafarian who is in the announcement card | 20 | any images, just printed words in that ad in |
| 21 | Exhibit 104? | 21 | The Times? |
| 22 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 22 | MS. BART: Objection, form, and |
| 23 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 23 | asked and answered. |
| 24 | And l'd like to, since this doesn't | 24 | Q. You can answer. |
| 25 | have this witness's name on it, l'd ask | 25 | A. Yes. |
|  | 46 |  | 48 |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | her to see if she's ever seen this before, | 2 | Q. Could you look at page GGP002282, |
| 3 | the exhibit. | 3 | which is part of that same Exhibit 45. |
| 4 | MR. BROOKS: I understand. | 4 | This is about the advertisement in |
| 5 | BY MR. BROOKS: | 5 | W Magazine? |
| 6 | Q. Do you know? | 6 | A. Yes. |
| 7 | A. The same painting was used in the | 7 | Q. And there you say an image was used, |
| 8 | ad. | 8 | a photo of the same Rastafarian that was in the |
| 9 | Q. I know. I'm asking you? | 9 | announcement card? |
| 10 | A. Yes. | 10 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 11 | Q. It was? Okay. | 11 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
| 12 | A. In the magazine ads. | 12 | Q. You can answer. |
| 13 | Q. What about the newspaper ads? | 13 | A. It's a different painting in the |
| 14 | A. No. | 14 | W ad. |
| 15 | Q. What was used in the newspaper ads? | 15 | Q. But the same Rastafarian, right? |
| 16 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 16 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 17 | A. Text only. | 17 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
| 18 | Q. No picture? | 18 | A. I don't remember. |
| 19 | A. No paintings. | 19 | Q. Okay. Did Larry Gagosian and |
| 20 | Q. So which were the magazine ad or | 20 | Richard Prince approve the ad in W Magazine? |
| 21 | ads? | 21 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
| 22 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 22 | MS. BART: Join. |
| 23 | I don't understand. What do you | 23 | A. Larry approved. I did not have any |
| 24 | mean? | 24 | interaction with Richard Prince for approval. |
| 25 | Q. Okay, we'll come back to it. | 25 | Q. Now, on the next page, which is |


|  | 49 |  | 51 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | GGP002418, it says I told Nicole Larry likes the | 2 | to hear the question back. I'm not sure |
| 3 | Prince ad with just, all capital letters, the | 3 | there was one. |
| 4 | Rasta man, not the one in the studio. For the | 4 | MR. BROOKS: There was. |
| 5 | announcements he likes the Rasta man poster on | 5 | Can you read the question back, |
| 6 | two paint cans with no books in the picture. | 6 | please. |
| 7 | Do you remember seeing a copy of | 7 | (Record read.) |
| 8 | this e-mail? | 8 | MS. BART: Object to form. |
| 9 | A. No. | 9 | Q. You can answer. |
| 10 | Q. Is it correct though that the | 10 | A. I don't remember. I don't remember. |
| 11 | announcement had the picture in the studio on | 11 | Q. Does it look like what was used in |
| 12 | the paint can without books? | 12 | the ads -- |
| 13 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 13 | MS. BART: Objection. |
| 14 | Q. And I'm showing you Exhibit 104? | 14 | Q. -- as you've been describing it? |
| 15 | A. Yes. | 15 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 16 | Q. And the advertisement just had a | 16 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
| 17 | Rastafarian, not the one in the studio, is that | 17 | MS. BART: The witness isn't here to |
| 18 | right? | 18 | speculate. |
| 19 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 19 | Q. You can answer. |
| 20 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 20 | A. It's the same type. I don't know -- |
| 21 | A. It had that same painting in the ad, | 21 | I don't remember this. |
| 22 | yes. | 22 | RQ MR. BROOKS: Okay. If the witness |
| 23 | Q. Which ad? | 23 | doesn't know l'm going to request that |
| 24 | A. Which ad? | 24 | Gagosian tell us whether Exhibit 52 is the |
| 25 | Q. Yes. | 25 | image that was used in newspaper and |
|  | 50 |  | 52 |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | A. The Art Forum, Art in America, Art | 2 | magazine ads. |
| 3 | and Auction. | 3 | She's testified to a number of ads, |
| 4 | Q. They had a painting, a picture of | 4 | some of which had images she said from |
| 5 | the same painting? | 5 | the same painting, and I want to know if |
| 6 | A. Yes. | 6 | Exhibit 52 is the image that was used |
| 7 | Q. But the New York Times didn't? | 7 | in the ads in Art Forum, Art in America, |
| 8 | MS. BART: Objection, form, and | 8 | Art and Auction, the Art Newspaper, and W. |
| 9 | asked and answered. | 9 | MS. BART: We'll take it under |
| 10 | Q. Is that what you're saying? | 10 | advisement. |
| 11 | MS. BART: Third time. | 11 | But just so that I understand I know |
| 12 | A. No image was in the New York Times. | 12 | what you're asking me, are you talking |
| 13 | Q. What about the Financial Times? | 13 | about the entirety that includes the title |
| 14 | A. No. | 14 | that says Richard Prince at the top, or |
| 15 | Q. I'm going to show you a document | 15 | are you talking about the cutout in the |
| 16 | which has previously been marked as Exhibit 52. | 16 | middle, in other words, are you talking |
| 17 | Is that the image that was used in | 17 | about the entirety? |
| 18 | some of the ads anyway? | 18 | I don't know what you're asking. |
| 19 | MS. BART: Can we just have one of | 19 | MR. BROOKS: Well, this is how it |
| 20 | the extras that you have there, please? | 20 | was produced to me by you. |
| 21 | I think John needs one, right? | 21 | MS. BART: That's irrelevant. |
| 22 | MR. BROOKS: You do? | 22 | You're asking us for a stipulation, |
| 23 | MR. SHERMAN: Yes. | 23 | Mr. Brooks, and I'm asking you, are you |
| 24 | A. Idon't -- | 24 | saying just the thing in the middle or are |
| 25 | MS. BART: Just one minute. I want | 25 | you talking about the entirety -- |


| 53 |  | 55 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | MR. BROOKS: The entirety. But if | 2 | MS. BART: I'll instruct the witness |
| 3 | the ad didn't say Richard Prince and only | 3 | not to speculate. |
| 4 | had the image, then you can tell me that. | 4 | MR. BROOKS: She already answered |
| 5 | 1 just want to find out. | 5 | yes. |
| 6 | MS. BART: We'll take it under | 6 | You're saying it's speculating when |
| 7 | advisement. | 7 | I ask her if there are paint cans there? |
| 8 | MR. BROOKS: Well, I'm certainly | 8 | MS. BART: Well, what I'm saying to |
| 9 | entitled to know what images were used in | 9 | you is that -- |
| 10 | the newspaper and magazine ads. | 10 | MR. BROOKS: Well, never mind. She |
| 11 | If this witness can't -- I mean I | 11 | answered. |
| 12 | think it's clear from her testimony that | 12 | MS. BART: Richard Prince is the |
| 13 | this is exactly what was used since there | 13 | best person to ask these questions of, not |
| 14 | are no paint cans, it's not in the studio, | 14 | a witness who didn't create these works of |
| 15 | it's the same painting. If it's not -- | 15 | art. |
| 16 | MS. BART: Well, you don't know | 16 | MR. BROOKS: Okay. |
| 17 | because it's cut off at the bottom, so -- | 17 | BY MR. BROOKS: |
| 18 | MR. BROOKS: Well, that's how it was | 18 | Q. With respect to these announcement |
| 19 | produced to me by you. So that's the best | 19 | cards, do you know if at the end of the show, |
| 20 | I can do, I'm sorry. | 20 | the exhibition, you had leftover cards, |
| 21 | MS. BART: No, this is how it was | 21 | announcement cards? |
| 22 | originally made. We didn't cut anything | 22 | A. Yes. |
| 23 | off, Mr. Brooks. | 23 | Q. I'm going to show you what's been |
| 24 | MR. BROOKS: Well, okay. | 24 | previously marked as Plaintiff's Exhibit 53, and |
| 25 | MS. BART: We'll take your request | 25 | actually the last two pages were previously |
|  | 54 |  | 56 |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | under advisement. | 2 | marked as 53A, so it's two exhibits. |
| 3 | BY MR. BROOKS: | 3 | Could you look at the -- |
| 4 | Q. Can you take a look at the Canal | 4 | MS. BART: Just give her a second to |
| 5 | Zone book again, please, and look at page | 5 | look at it. |
| 6 | C00122. | 6 | (Witness looks at exhibit.) |
| 7 | (Witness looks at exhibit.) | 7 | Q. Okay. Look at the second page, |
| 8 | Q. C122 is a painting called | 8 | GG002763. Did you receive a copy of the e-mail |
| 9 | Meditation, correct? | 9 | on the top from Jessica Arisohn? |
| 10 | A. Yes. | 10 | A. Yes. |
| 11 | Q. It's painting number 6 in the book? | 11 | Q. And who is Jessica Arisohn? |
| 12 | A. Yes. | 12 | A. A gallery assistant. |
| 13 | Q. Is that painting the same image as | 13 | Q. At the Gagosian Gallery? |
| 14 | in Exhibit 52 in the document that l've been | 14 | A. Yes. |
| 15 | asking whether or not that's a newspaper ad -- | 15 | Q. And who is Andie Trainer who wrote |
| 16 | a magazine ad? | 16 | the e-mail beneath the first one in the chain? |
| 17 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 17 | A. A gallery receptionist. |
| 18 | Q. You can answer. | 18 | Q. Do you know Ryan from Rare Posters? |
| 19 | A. Yes, same painting. | 19 | A. Know him? No. |
| 20 | Q. And it has no paint cans, right, | 20 | Q. Do you know who he is? |
| 21 | it's not from the studio, correct? | 21 | A. Sure, yeah. |
| 22 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 22 | Q. Who is he? |
| 23 | Q. You can answer. | 23 | A. He's someone who buys posters in |
| 24 | A. Yes. | 24 | bulk from us occasionally. |
| 25 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 25 | Q. Do you see she said in the e-mail |

Alison McDonald
December 17, 2009

|  | 57 |  | 59 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | but somehow it doesn't seem right for him to be | 2 | him, do you know? |
| 3 | selling, capital letters, our invitations, do | 3 | A. I don't know. |
| 4 | you see that? | 4 | Q. And in these e-mails there's a |
| 5 | A. Yes. | 5 | reference to invitations, right? |
| 6 | Q. Did you get involved in the question | 6 | Was that a reference to Exhibit 103, |
| 7 | of whether invitations should be given to Ryan? | 7 | which is the invitation you had printed, or to |
| 8 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 8 | 104, which is the announcement, what we've been |
| 9 | A. He normally sells posters. | 9 | calling the announcement card? |
| 10 | Q. Right. Okay. | 10 | A. The announcement card. |
| 11 | Let's look at the next page. | 11 | Q. 104? |
| 12 | Jessica Arisohn, now she's given his | 12 | A. Yes. |
| 13 | name, Ryan Dowler wants Prince Canal Zone, do | 13 | Q. That's what Ryan wanted, correct? |
| 14 | you see that, it's the second e-mail? | 14 | A. Yes. |
| 15 | A. Yes. | 15 | Q. To make posters? |
| 16 | Q. Andie says we have three extra boxes | 16 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 17 | left, and that was addressed -- that e-mail was | 17 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
| 18 | addressed to you as well, correct? | 18 | A. No, he wasn't making posters. |
| 19 | A. Yes. | 19 | Q. What was he doing? |
| 20 | Q. And then Nicole Heck wrote to | 20 | A. Selling the cards I think. |
| 21 | you and Jessica Arisohn and Darlina Goldak, | 21 | Q. Selling the cards? I see. |
| 22 | Shouldn't we get a percentage of the sale if he | 22 | It's just that on the first page -- |
| 23 | is selling something we paid to produce, do you | 23 | okay, I hear what you're saying. |
| 24 | see that? | 24 | On the first page of Exhibit 53 it |
| 25 | A. Yes. | 25 | says Ryan from Rare Posters -- okay, so you're |
|  | 58 |  | 60 |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | Q. Did you agree with that? | 2 | saying, your understanding was he wanted to sell |
| 3 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 3 | the actual announcement cards, not make them |
| 4 | Q. You can answer. | 4 | into posters, is that right? |
| 5 | A. Ithought we should be reimbursed | 5 | A. Yes. |
| 6 | for what we paid to make them. | 6 | Q. Okay. If I asked this before, I |
| 7 | Q. Reimbursed by Ryan's company? | 7 | apologize, but were these announcement cards |
| 8 | A. Yeah, instead of recycling. | 8 | sold to Ryan? |
| 9 | Q. Instead of? | 9 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 10 | A. Recycling the extra invitations. | 10 | Q. If you know? |
| 11 | Q. And if you look at the next page | 11 | MS. BART: And asked and answered. |
| 12 | 2766, GG -- actually, let's stick with the GGP, | 12 | A. I don't know. |
| 13 | GGP003063, you wrote an e-mail saying we should | 13 | Q. Okay. Did I ask you that before? |
| 14 | sell them to him, correct? | 14 | MS. BART: Yes. |
| 15 | A. Yes. | 15 | Q. And what did you say before? |
| 16 | Q. And what was your reasoning for | 16 | A. I don't know. |
| 17 | that? | 17 | Q. Okay. All right. It wasn't a trick |
| 18 | A. They would have been recycled or | 18 | question. I don't remember it. |
| 19 | discarded otherwise. | 19 | MS. BART: You never know with |
| 20 | Q. Why not just give them to him? | 20 | Mr. Brooks. |
| 21 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 21 | Q. So you don't know if they were |
| 22 | Q. You can answer. | 22 | sold -- |
| 23 | A. I just thought we should get | 23 | A. No. |
| 24 | reimbursed for what we had spent to make them. | 24 | Q. -- to him? Okay. |
| 25 | Q. And did you sell these materials to | 25 | MS. BART: Objection. |


|  | 61 |  | 63 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | Q. Do you know Glenn O'Brien? | 2 | A. Yes. |
| 3 | A. Barely, yes. | 3 | Q. Rasta works. |
| 4 | Q. Who is he? | 4 | And she says, Please include James |
| 5 | A. He worked with Andy Warhol. | 5 | Brown Disco Ball, Meditation, and a few others |
| 6 | I believe he was involved in Interview Magazine. | 6 | to choose -- it should be choose from, do you |
| 7 | I don't know him very well. | 7 | see that? |
| 8 | MR. BROOKS: Did you get that, | 8 | A. Yes. |
| 9 | Interview, Interview Magazine? | 9 | Q. And then Melissa Lazarov e-mailed |
| 10 | (Discussion off the record.) | 10 | you and said, I need to send some JPEGs to |
| 11 | BY MR. BROOKS: | 11 | Glenn, please attach for me? |
| 12 | Q. I'm going to hand you a document | 12 | A. Yes. |
| 13 | that's previously been marked as Plaintiff's | 13 | Q. Do you remember this? |
| 14 | Exhibit 29. | 14 | A. Yes. |
| 15 | If you look at the first page of | 15 | Q. And do you remember sending JPEGs to |
| 16 | Exhibit 29, GGP001421, there appears to be at | 16 | Mr. McDonald? |
| 17 | the bottom an e-mail from Glenn O'Brien to Betsy | 17 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 18 | Biscone at the Prince studio asking for some | 18 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
| 19 | images for the interview, do you see that? | 19 | Q. You can answer. |
| 20 | A. Yes. | 20 | A. Sending them to? |
| 21 | Q. Correct? | 21 | Q. Interview Magazine. |
| 22 | A. Yes. | 22 | What did I say? |
| 23 | Q. And did you become aware that | 23 | MR. HAYES: Mr. McDonald. |
| 24 | Mr. O'Brien wanted some images for Interview | 24 | Q. You're Ms. McDonald. |
| 25 | Magazine? | 25 | Mr. O'Brien, l'm sorry. |
|  | 62 |  | 64 |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | MR. HAYES: Objection to form. | 2 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 3 | A. Yes. | 3 | A. Can you repeat the question? |
| 4 | Q. Do you see his e-mail address there | 4 | Q. Yes. Look at the next page. Do you |
| 5 | Glenn O'Brien, it's gobrien@brantpub.com, do you | 5 | see some JPEGs were being sent? |
| 6 | see that? | 6 | A. To Tony Manzella. |
| 7 | A. Yes. | 7 | Q. Who is Tony? He's at Echelon? |
| 8 | Q. Do you know if that's Interview | 8 | A. Yes. |
| 9 | Magazine? | 9 | Q. What's Echelon? |
| 10 | A. I don't know. They own several | 10 | A. They do reproduction work. |
| 11 | magazines. | 11 | Q. And it says, Hi, Tony -- this is |
| 12 | Q. Do you know who Peter Brant is? | 12 | from Darlina Goldak, she worked for you, right? |
| 13 | A. Yes. | 13 | A. Yes. |
| 14 | Q. And he's Brant Publications? | 14 | Q. And you were copied on this e-mail? |
| 15 | A. Yes. | 15 | A. Yes. |
| 16 | Q. And you don't know if he owns | 16 | Q. And it says, Attached are eight |
| 17 | Interview Magazine or not? | 17 | Richard Prince works, please upload |
| 18 | A. He does own Interview Magazine. | 18 | high-resolution files for each work to the |
| 19 | Q. The next e-mail is from Betsy | 19 | Echelon -- dot, dot, dot -- provide me with |
| 20 | Biscone -- she works for Prince, right, or | 20 | download instructions. |
| 21 | worked for Prince then? | 21 | Was this being done so that these |
| 22 | A. Yes. | 22 | JPEGs could be sent to Interview Magazine? |
| 23 | Q. To Melissa Lazarov asking for a | 23 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 24 | small selection of high-res -- does that mean | 24 | Q. You can answer. |
| 25 | high resolution? | 25 | A. I don't know. |


|  | 65 |  | 67 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | Q. Do you know if images were sent to | 2 | MS. BART: Objection. |
| 3 | Mr. O'Brien at Interview Magazine of some of the | 3 | Q. You can answer. |
| 4 | Prince paintings? | 4 | A. Yes. |
| 5 | A. I don't know. | 5 | Q. Now, to the right of James Brown |
| 6 | Q. I'm going to place in front of you | 6 | Disco Ball in Exhibit 28 is another painting, if |
| 7 | a document that's been previously marked as | 7 | you look at page C-- it's another image -- if |
| 8 | Plaintiff's Exhibit 28. | 8 | you look at page C168 in the Canal Zone book. |
| 9 | Do you know whose photo that is at | 9 | MS. BART: There's no question. |
| 10 | the very top of the first page? | 10 | Q. What painting is that a part of? |
| 11 | A. It's a photograph of Richard Prince. | 11 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
| 12 | Q. And do you see five paintings, five | 12 | MS. BART: Objection to form. |
| 13 | images beneath his photograph? | 13 | Q. You can answer. |
| 14 | A. Yes. | 14 | A. It appears to be Tales of Brave |
| 15 | Q. Let me ask you to go back to the | 15 | Ulysses. A detail of it. |
| 16 | book again, the Canal Zone book. | 16 | Q. I'm sorry, I didn't hear the end of |
| 17 | And beneath Mr. Prince's image and | 17 | it? |
| 18 | to the -- when you're looking at it -- on the | 18 | A. A detail of it. |
| 19 | left side is a painting, a grouping of figures, | 19 | Q. Okay. And then on the left, on the |
| 20 | do you see that? | 20 | bottom row, there's a painting, part of a |
| 21 | A. Yes. | 21 | painting, if you look at C144 in the Canal Zone |
| 22 | Q. And do you know what painting that | 22 | book, can you tell us -- |
| 23 | is? | 23 | MS. BART: Just one second, please. |
| 24 | MS. BART: I'm going to -- | 24 | Q. Can you tell us which painting that |
| 25 | MR. BROOKS: If she doesn't know, | 25 | is a detail of? |
|  | 66 |  | 68 |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | then we'll -- | 2 | MS. BART: Objection to form. |
| 3 | MS. BART: I'm just going to object | 3 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
| 4 | to this. You haven't even asked if she's | 4 | Q. You can answer. |
| 5 | ever seen this document before. | 5 | A. It appears to be a detail of |
| 6 | MR. BROOKS: Right. | 6 | Ding Dong the Witch is Dead. |
| 7 | BY MR. BROOKS: | 7 | Q. Which has the same title as |
| 8 | Q. Why don't you, just to save time, go | 8 | Mr. Frey's essay or fictional narrative or |
| 9 | to page C136 in the book. | 9 | whatever you call it? |
| 10 | Okay. So the first image beneath | 10 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 11 | Mr. Prince to the left, is that James Brown | 11 | Q. Correct? |
| 12 | Disco Ball or a part of it? | 12 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
| 13 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 13 | A. Yes. |
| 14 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 14 | Q. Do you know why? |
| 15 | Q. You can answer. | 15 | A. I do not know why. |
| 16 | A. It appears to be part of that | 16 | Q. In the bottom row in the middle |
| 17 | painting. | 17 | there's another one if you look at C202, does |
| 18 | Q. And do you recall in the e-mail that | 18 | the image in the middle of the bottom row appear |
| 19 | was one of the ones that was requested, do you | 19 | to be from Cheese and Crackers? |
| 20 | remember, Exhibit 29? | 20 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 21 | A. Yes. | 21 | MR. HAYES: Form. |
| 22 | Q. On the first page James Brown Disco | 22 | A. Yes, it appears to be a detail from |
| 23 | Ball, you see that was requested? | 23 | Cheese and Crackers. |
| 24 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 24 | Q. And finally, if you look at C126 in |
| 25 | Q. Do you see that? | 25 | the Canal Zone book, does the image on the right |


| 69 |  | 71 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | in the bottom row of Exhibit 28 appear to be a | 2 | see that? |
| 3 | detail from the Ocean Club painting? | 3 | A. Yes. |
| 4 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 4 | Q. And there's some attachments. And |
| 5 | MR. HAYES: Objection to form. | 5 | some of this has been redacted, but I see it |
| 6 | Q. You can answer. | 6 | says Prince 2008.0049, .0058, .0056, .0053, |
| 7 | A. Yes, it appears to be. | 7 | .0060, and .0059, do you see where I'm reading |
| 8 | Q. And that's that same Rastafarian | 8 | from? |
| 9 | whose picture is in the announcement card, | 9 | A. Yes. |
| 10 | correct? | 10 | Q. Do you know what those numbers refer |
| 11 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 11 | to? |
| 12 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 12 | A. Database numbers. |
| 13 | A. I can't see it in this picture, on | 13 | Q. Of? |
| 14 | the interview copy. | 14 | A. The Gagosian Gallery inventory. |
| 15 | Q. But how about on page C 126 ? | 15 | Q. And if you know that number is it |
| 16 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 16 | possible to figure out which paintings were |
| 17 | Q. The Ocean Club painting? | 17 | being sent as JPEGs? |
| 18 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 18 | A. Yes. |
| 19 | Q. You can answer. | 19 | Q. I'm going to show you a document |
| 20 | A. It appears to be. | 20 | that's previously been marked as Exhibit 46. |
| 21 | Q. Now, Exhibit 28 is a copy of | 21 | Ms. McDonald, do you know what |
| 22 | Mr. O'Brien's interview of Mr. Prince. Have you | 22 | Exhibit 46 is a copy of? |
| 23 | ever seen it before? | 23 | A. A checklist of Richard Prince |
| 24 | A. No. | 24 | paintings. |
| 25 | Q. Did you read it at the time? | 25 | Q. This indicates a date at the top, |
|  | 70 |  | 72 |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 2 | October 15th, 2008, do you see that? |
| 3 | A. No. | 3 | A. Yes. |
| 4 | Q. Do you know how Interview Magazine | 4 | Q. And that's before the show, the |
| 5 | got the five images that are on the first page | 5 | exhibition of Canal Zone opened on November 8th? |
| 6 | of Exhibit 28? | 6 | A. Yes. |
| 7 | A. I don't know. | 7 | Q. Do you have Exhibit 29 in front of |
| 8 | Q. Doesn't it seem most likely, based | 8 | you, the second page, where the JPEGs have |
| 9 | on what we looked at in Exhibit 29, that as | 9 | numbers? |
| 10 | requested it was sent by Gagosian Gallery to | 10 | Let's take the first one, Prince |
| 11 | Interview Magazine? | 11 | 2008.0058. By looking at Exhibit 46 can you |
| 12 | MR. HAYES: Objection. | 12 | tell us which painting that is? |
| 13 | MS. BART: Based on her prior answer | 13 | A. Ding Dong the Witch is Dead. |
| 14 | I'm going to instruct the witness not to | 14 | Q. The next one . 0056 , can you tell by |
| 15 | speculate. | 15 | looking at Exhibit 46 which painting that is? |
| 16 | MR. BROOKS: It's not privileged. | 16 | A. Graduation. |
| 17 | MS. BART: I'm instructing her not | 17 | Q. The next one .0053, can you tell by |
| 18 | to speculate. We're not going to have her | 18 | looking at Exhibit 46 which painting that is? |
| 19 | answer that question which totally calls | 19 | A. Cheese and Crackers. |
| 20 | for speculation, no. | 20 | Q. And I skipped 0049 inadvertently up |
| 21 | RL MR. BROOKS: Mark that, okay? | 21 | at the top there, which painting is that, |
| 22 | BY MR. BROOKS: | 22 | 2008.0049? |
| 23 | Q. Look back at Exhibit 29, please. | 23 | A. Back to the Garden. |
| 24 | On the second page there's an e-mail | 24 | Q. And .0060, can you tell what |
| 25 | from Darlina Goldak, and you were copied, do you | 25 | painting that is? |


| 73 |  |  | 75 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | A. Untitled. | 2 | going to be stipulating this just so |
| 3 | Q. And .0059? | 3 | that we would avoid wasting time in |
| 4 | A. The Ocean Club. | 4 | depositions, she didn't prepare this |
| 5 | Q. Staying with Exhibit 46, that's the | 5 | document -- |
| 6 | list of the paintings, there are images in the | 6 | MR. BROOKS: Well, we don't know |
| 7 | right-hand column, do you know what those are? | 7 | that. Excuse me, she didn't say that. |
| 8 | A. I can't tell from this printout. | 8 | Don't put words in her mouth. I didn't |
| 9 | Q. Let's just take the first painting, | 9 | ask her if she prepared it. |
| 10 | Specially Round Midnight, do you see that in | 10 | MS. BART: At the beginning you did. |
| 11 | Exhibit 46? | 11 | MR. BROOKS: No, I didn't. I did |
| 12 | A. On the list? Yes. | 12 | not. |
| 13 | Q. Yes. | 13 | MS. BART: And also about an hour |
| 14 | A. Yes. | 14 | ago you asked her if she participated in |
| 15 | Q. And then it says collage, inkjet and | 15 | the sales and she didn't know. |
| 16 | acrylic on canvas, do you know what that means? | 16 | MR. BROOKS: That's a different |
| 17 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 17 | question. |
| 18 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 18 | BY MR. BROOKS: |
| 19 | Q. You can answer. | 19 | Q. Let me ask you about this document. |
| 20 | A. It's the media. | 20 | Did you prepare this document? |
| 21 | Q. Do you know what inkjet refers to in | 21 | A. No. |
| 22 | connection with these particular paintings? | 22 | Q. Do you know who did? |
| 23 | A. It's a process for printing. | 23 | A. No. |
| 24 | Q. For scanning? | 24 | Q. Do you know what the purpose of it |
| 25 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 25 | is? |
|  | 74 |  | 76 |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | Q. You can answer. | 2 | A. To organize the information clearly. |
| 3 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 3 | Q. Is this something that you see in |
| 4 | A. No, not scanning. Printing. | 4 | the normal course of business at Gagosian |
| 5 | Q. Printing. | 5 | Gallery, this type of format? |
| 6 | And at the right it says Specially | 6 | A. No, it's always different. |
| 7 | Round Midnight sold. Do you know what that -- | 7 | Q. Okay. Have you seen documents like |
| 8 | under the column status, do you have any | 8 | this at Gagosian Gallery when there's a show? |
| 9 | knowledge of what that indicates? | 9 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 10 | A. It indicates that the painting sold. | 10 | Q. You can answer. |
| 11 | Q. Before the exhibition opened? | 11 | A. Yes. |
| 12 | A. It indicates that based on the date | 12 | Q. Do you know who prepares documents |
| 13 | at the top of the list. | 13 | in this format, and I'm talking about |
| 14 | MS. BART: But you don't know? | 14 | Exhibit 46, at Gagosian? |
| 15 | A. But I don't know. | 15 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 16 | Q. October 15th, 2008? | 16 | A. It's always different. |
| 17 | MS. BART: She doesn't know. | 17 | Q. It's always a different person? |
| 18 | A. I don't know. | 18 | A. Yes. |
| 19 | Q. Well, you see it says October 15, | 19 | Q. Is it someone in accounting? |
| 20 | 2008, right? | 20 | A. Not usually. |
| 21 | MS. BART: I believe we're going to | 21 | Q. Who would prepare this type of form |
| 22 | be giving you -- we've already given | 22 | within Gagosian? |
| 23 | you -- | 23 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 24 | MR. BROOKS: Well -- | 24 | Q. You can answer. |
| 25 | MS. BART: Hold on a second. We're | 25 | A. A gallery assistant. |


| 77 |  | 79 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | Q. Do you know who the gallery | 2 | a hat, yeah. |
| 3 | assistant was at the 24th Street gallery for | 3 | Q. Do you know where Mr. Prince got |
| 4 | this show? | 4 | that image? |
| 5 | A. No. | 5 | A. No. |
| 6 | Q. Do you know who came up with the | 6 | Q. I'm going to place in front of you a |
| 7 | names for the various paintings in the Canal | 7 | document which has been previously been marked |
| 8 | Zone exhibition? | 8 | as Plaintiff's Exhibit 54. |
| 9 | A. I don't know. | 9 | MR. BROOKS: Off the record. |
| 10 | Q. Let me ask you to look at the first | 10 | (Discussion off the record.) |
| 11 | insert in the book, which is the James Frey -- | 11 | BY MR. BROOKS: |
| 12 | I'm sorry, what did you call it, a fictional -- | 12 | Q. Exhibit 54 is a copy of an e-mail |
| 13 | A. Text. | 13 | that you sent? |
| 14 | Q. Text? Okay. | 14 | A. Yes. |
| 15 | If I asked this, I apologize in | 15 | Q. Who is Vanessa Riding? |
| 16 | advance, but did you review the text? I think | 16 | A. Larry Gagosian's assistant. |
| 17 | you said you did, right? | 17 | Q. And you say Melissa asked me to send |
| 18 | A. Yes. | 18 | this text on to Larry to read, do you know what |
| 19 | Q. And you did? | 19 | text that is? |
| 20 | A. Yes. | 20 | A. The James Frey fictional text. |
| 21 | MS. BART: For typos is what she | 21 | Q. And who is Melissa again, is that |
| 22 | said. | 22 | Melissa Lazarov? |
| 23 | A. For proofreading. | 23 | A. Melissa Lazarov. |
| 24 | Q. Do you know whose idea it was to | 24 | Q. And do you know if Mr. Gagosian had |
| 25 | have inserts in the Canal Zone catalog including | 25 | had comments or suggestions with respect to the |
|  | 78 |  | 80 |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | the James Frey fictional text? | 2 | James Frey text? |
| 3 | A. The designers. | 3 | A. No, I never got a response. |
| 4 | Q. And who was that again? | 4 | Q. You never got a -- |
| 5 | A. Graphic Thought Facility. | 5 | A. -- response. |
| 6 | Q. Ivor Williams? | 6 | (Discussion off the record.) |
| 7 | A. Yeah. | 7 | BY MR. BROOKS: |
| 8 | Q. Is that right? | 8 | Q. I'm going to show the witness |
| 9 | A. Yeah. | 9 | what's been marked previously as Plaintiff's |
| 10 | Q. I'm sorry, what is the name of the | 10 | Exhibit 55. |
| 11 | company again was what? | 11 | Now, Darlina Goldak and Nicole Heck, |
| 12 | A. Graphic Thought Facility. | 12 | I think you said before, were both people that |
| 13 | Q. And they were in London or Toronto? | 13 | worked for you in connection with the book? |
| 14 | A. London. | 14 | A. Yes. |
| 15 | Q. London, okay. Thank you. | 15 | Q. Do you see at the bottom it says |
| 16 | In the second insert, Ms. McDonald, | 16 | they want a more-interesting, non-traditional |
| 17 | if you could look at the page which is stamped | 17 | way to present the text in the book, Alison |
| 18 | C00155, do you know what is being depicted | 18 | explained this to Ivor yesterday, do you see |
| 19 | there? | 19 | that? |
| 20 | A. The artist's studio. | 20 | A. Yes. |
| 21 | Q. And by the artist you mean | 21 | Q. Do you recall explaining something |
| 22 | Mr. Prince? | 22 | about a non-traditional way to present the text |
| 23 | A. Richard Prince. | 23 | to Ivor Williams? |
| 24 | Q. You see a picture of a man in a hat? | 24 | A. Yes. |
| 25 | A. I see a painting that has a man with | 25 | MS. BART: Objection to form. |


|  | 81 |  | 83 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | Q. What did you explain to him? | 2 | It's in the middle of the first |
| 3 | A. That we wanted to do something | 3 | page? |
| 4 | different from the normal presentation of text | 4 | A. Yes. |
| 5 | in our other catalogs that we made previously. | 5 | Q. Please find attached the pitch which |
| 6 | Q. Did you discuss having an insert, | 6 | was displayed on the wall at the Eden Rock Hotel |
| 7 | you know, a smaller-size page with the text? | 7 | in St. Barths for last December 2007 Eden Rock |
| 8 | A. That came later. | 8 | show. Do you know anything about the pitch? |
| 9 | Q. Did you discuss having the cartoons | 9 | A. No. |
| 10 | added in with the text? | 10 | Q. You don't know what it is? |
| 11 | A. Can I read this document first? | 11 | A. No. |
| 12 | Q. Yes, by all means. | 12 | Q. Did you know there was a show at the |
| 13 | (Witness looks at exhibit.) | 13 | Eden Rock Hotel in St. Barths in December 2007? |
| 14 | A. Okay, sorry. | 14 | A. No. |
| 15 | Q. So what is your recollection of what | 15 | Q. Can I have that back? |
| 16 | you discussed with him? | 16 | A. Yes. |
| 17 | MS. BART: About what? | 17 | Q. Thank you. |
| 18 | Q. Having a more-interesting, | 18 | I'm going to show you a document |
| 19 | non-traditional way to present the text? | 19 | that's previously been marked as Exhibit 31. |
| 20 | A. We just discussed that as a | 20 | Do you know what that is? |
| 21 | fictional text and not an art historical text, | 21 | A. Press release for the exhibition. |
| 22 | it should be a different presentation from how | 22 | Q. Do you know who wrote it? |
| 23 | we tend to do it in our catalogs. | 23 | A. I don't know who wrote this, no. |
| 24 | Q. You discussed having a different | 24 | Q. Did you write it? |
| 25 | font? | 25 | A. No. |
|  | 82 |  | 84 |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | A. No. | 2 | Q. Is this first page taken from the |
| 3 | Q. Did you leave it up to him to make | 3 | Gagosian Gallery website, if you know? |
| 4 | it non-traditional? | 4 | A. Yes. |
| 5 | A. Yes. | 5 | Q. And it shows the first page of a |
| 6 | Q. Okay, good. | 6 | press release, is that right, about the show? |
| 7 | Further up, a few lines up above | 7 | A. Yes. |
| 8 | that it says, Please include essay or text by | 8 | Q. And the second page is a |
| 9 | James Frey in the title page. And then it says | 9 | continuation of the press release? |
| 10 | they want the book to come up if you Google | 10 | A. No. I don't know. |
| 11 | James Frey, do you see that? | 11 | MS. BART: The second page. |
| 12 | A. Yes. | 12 | A. Oh, the second page, yes. |
| 13 | Q. Do you know what the reason was that | 13 | Q. It is, okay. |
| 14 | that was desired? | 14 | All right. Just so the record is |
| 15 | A. I don't know. | 15 | clear, you're saying the first two pages of |
| 16 | Q. Did you discuss that with anyone? | 16 | Exhibit 31 are the press release taken from the |
| 17 | A. No. | 17 | Gagosian Gallery website, is that right? |
| 18 | Q. I'm going to hand you what's been | 18 | A. Yes. |
| 19 | marked as Exhibit 23 at a previous deposition. | 19 | Q. Now, look at the first page of |
| 20 | There's a reference in here to -- | 20 | Exhibit 31, please. |
| 21 | MS. BART: Just a minute, please. | 21 | Do you see where it says -- |
| 22 | Let her take a look at it. | 22 | MR. HAYES: Do you have a copy of |
| 23 | Q. There's a reference in there to | 23 | that? |
| 24 | something called the pitch, with an initial | 24 | MR. BROOKS: Yes, I do. |
| 25 | caps, capital T, capital P, do you see that? | 25 | MR. HAYES: Thanks. |


|  | 85 |  | 87 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | BY MR. BROOKS: | 2 | then if you clicked view work? |
| 3 | Q. On the first page of Exhibit 31, do | 3 | A. Yes. |
| 4 | you see where it says Richard Prince on the left | 4 | Q. And then the subsequent pages, just |
| 5 | at the top, and if you go down from there it | 5 | go through them slowly one by one, but what do |
| 6 | says press release? | 6 | they depict, if you know? |
| 7 | A. Yes. | 7 | A. Installation shots of the paintings |
| 8 | Q. If you clicked on press release | 8 | installed in the Chelsea 24th Street gallery. |
| 9 | would you see this press release we just looked | 9 | Q. As they were during the exhibition? |
| 10 | at, the first two pages of Exhibit 31? | 10 | A. I don't know when these photographs |
| 11 | A. Today? | 11 | were taken. |
| 12 | Q. Back then? | 12 | Q. But does that look like what the |
| 13 | MR. LARKIN: Objection, form. | 13 | exhibition looked like? |
| 14 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 14 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 15 | A. Yes. | 15 | A. Yes. |
| 16 | Q. Is that a yes? | 16 | Q. Do you see on the very last page |
| 17 | A. Yes. | 17 | there's an automobile, right, C00558? |
| 18 | Q. Now, beneath that it says view work, | 18 | A. Yes. |
| 19 | do you see that? | 19 | Q. Which appears to have some painting |
| 20 | A. Yes. | 20 | on it. Was that part of the Canal Zone |
| 21 | Q. If you clicked on that in November | 21 | exhibition? |
| 22 | or December 2008 do you know what would come up? | 22 | A. Yes. |
| 23 | A. Paintings from the exhibition. | 23 | Q. Could I have that back, please? |
| 24 | Q. Have you ever seen them? | 24 | Thank you. |
| 25 | A. Or installation photographs. | 25 | Now, were you looking at Exhibit 31 |
|  | 86 |  | 88 |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | Q. Have you ever seen them? | 2 | before or did I take it back? |
| 3 | A. Seen the paintings from the | 3 | MS. BART: You took it back. |
| 4 | exhibition? | 4 | Q. I did. Then I'm going to have to |
| 5 | Q. By clicking on view work? | 5 | give it to you again. |
| 6 | A. No. | 6 | Exhibit 31 I'm handing you. If |
| 7 | MR. BROOKS: Let's mark as | 7 | you look on the right of the printout from the |
| 8 | Plaintiff's Exhibit 105 a series of | 8 | website do you see it says Richard Prince, and |
| 9 | documents Bates stamped C00541 through | 9 | then it says artist info, do you see that? |
| 10 | 558. | 10 | A. Yes. |
| 11 | (Plaintiff's Exhibit 105, documents | 11 | Q. And then beneath that it says view? |
| 12 | C00541 through 558, was marked for | 12 | A. Yes. |
| 13 | identification, as of this date.) | 13 | Q. And do you know what would come up |
| 14 | Q. So we've placed in front of you | 14 | at that time if you clicked view? |
| 15 | Exhibit 105, and you'll notice the first two | 15 | A. No. |
| 16 | pages are the same as the first two pages of | 16 | Q. Just take a look at the last page |
| 17 | Exhibit 31, except the picture is in color, | 17 | of Exhibit 31, do you see that, there's some |
| 18 | right? | 18 | information about Richard Prince? |
| 19 | A. Yes. | 19 | A. Yes. |
| 20 | Q. Now, do you see the third page | 20 | Q. Do you know if that came from the |
| 21 | C00543 it has a number of it looks like | 21 | Gagosian Gallery website? |
| 22 | thumbnails you can click on on the left, do you | 22 | A. Yes. |
| 23 | see that? | 23 | Q. And look back -- I know it's a |
| 24 | A. Yes. | 24 | little bit hard to see, but if you look back at |
| 25 | Q. And is that what you would get back | 25 | the first page there's a little image there |


|  | 89 |  | 91 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | where it says artist info, can you make it out? | 2 | Q. Were you aware that Mr. Prince had a |
| 3 | A. No. | 3 | retrospective at the Guggenheim Museum in late |
| 4 | Q. All right. Having looked at the | 4 | 2007? |
| 5 | last page of Exhibit 31, do you know if that | 5 | A. Yes. |
| 6 | material about Richard Prince is the artist info | 6 | Q. Did you go to it? |
| 7 | that's referred to on the first page of | 7 | A. No. |
| 8 | Exhibit 31? | 8 | Q. Did Gagosian represent Mr. Prince at |
| 9 | A. I don't know. | 9 | that time? |
| 10 | Q. Okay. Were you familiar with | 10 | A. I don't know. |
| 11 | Mr. Prince's cowboy paintings or cowboy photos | 11 | Q. Did you know in 2008 that Mr. Prince |
| 12 | or whatever they are? | 12 | had a practice of appropriating images created |
| 13 | A. A bit. | 13 | by others and including those images in his |
| 14 | Q. Do you know where he got them from? | 14 | work? |
| 15 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 15 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 16 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 16 | MR. HAYES: Form. |
| 17 | A. No. | 17 | Q. You can answer. |
| 18 | Q. How about his nurse paintings, were | 18 | A. Can you say it again? |
| 19 | you familiar with those? | 19 | Q. He'll read it again. |
| 20 | A. The paintings? | 20 | (Record read.) |
| 21 | Q. Yes. | 21 | A. I knew he was an appropriation |
| 22 | A. Yes. | 22 | artist, yes. |
| 23 | Q. And do you know where those images | 23 | Q. Well, how do you define an |
| 24 | came from? | 24 | appropriation artist? |
| 25 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 25 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
|  | 90 |  | 92 |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 2 | A. An artist who uses materials that |
| 3 | A. No. | 3 | influence him and reinvents them to make |
| 4 | Q. The cover of pulp fiction novels? | 4 | something new. |
| 5 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 5 | Q. He uses materials that influence |
| 6 | MS. BART: Join. | 6 | him, materials created by others, right? |
| 7 | A. Sometimes, It think, yes. | 7 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 8 | Q. Were you familiar with his painting | 8 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
| 9 | Spiritual America? | 9 | A. Other painters, other magazines. |
| 10 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 10 | Q. Other photographers? |
| 11 | A. Is that a painting? | 11 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 12 | Q. It's a rephotograph of a picture of | 12 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
| 13 | Brooke Shields when she was ten years old? | 13 | Q. You can answer. |
| 14 | A. I think it's a photograph, yes. | 14 | A. Could be, yeah. |
| 15 | Q. And were you aware that Mr. Prince | 15 | Q. Did you personally do anything to |
| 16 | rephotographed that photograph that some other | 16 | find out whether any of the images in these |
| 17 | photographer had taken? | 17 | Canal Zone paintings were taken from copyrighted |
| 18 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 18 | material? |
| 19 | MR. HAYES: Form. | 19 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 20 | Q. You can answer. | 20 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
| 21 | A. That photograph I'm familiar with | 21 | Q. You can answer. |
| 22 | recently. | 22 | A. No. |
| 23 | Q. Do you know how long Gagosian | 23 | Q. Do you know if anyone at Gagosian |
| 24 | Gallery has represented Mr. Prince? | 24 | Gallery did that? |
| 25 | A. I don't know. | 25 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |


|  | 93 |  | 95 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | Q. You can answer. | 2 | CERTIFICATE |
| 3 | A. I don't know. | 3 |  |
| 4 | Q. Did you ever try to find out -- I | 4 | STATE OF NEW YORK ) |
| 5 | know you didn't ask him you said already, but | 5 | )ss: |
| 6 | did you ever try to find out where the images in | 6 | COUNTY OF NEW YORK) |
| 7 | these Canal Zone paintings, specifically the | 7 |  |
| 8 | Rastafarian images, came from? | 8 |  |
| 9 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 10 | within and for the State of New York, do |
| 10 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 11 | That ALISON MCDONALD, the witness |
| 11 | Q. You can answer. | 12 |  |
| 12 | A. No. | 12 | whose deposition is hereinbefore set <br> forth, was duly sworn by me and that such |
| 13 | Q. To your knowledge did anyone at | 14 | deposition is a true record of the |
| 14 | Gagosian Gallery make an attempt to find out | 15 | testimony given by such witness. |
| 15 | where the Rastafarian images came from? | 16 | I further certify that I am not |
| 16 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 17 | related to any of the parties to this |
| 17 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 18 | action by blood or marriage and that I am |
| 18 | Q. You can answer. | 19 | in no way interested in the outcome of |
| 19 | A. I don't know. | 20 | this matter. |
| 20 | MR. BROOKS: Let's take five minutes | 21 | IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto |
| 21 | and I might be finished. I want to look | 22 | set my hand this ___ day of ___ , 2009. |
| 22 | at my notes. | 23 |  |
| 23 | MS. BART: Okay. | 24 |  |
| 24 | (Recess taken: 3:40 p.m.) |  | BRYAN NILSEN, RPR |
| 25 | (Proceedings resumed: 3:48 p.m.) | 25 |  |
|  | 94 |  | 96 |
| 1 | McDonald | 1 | McDonald |
| 2 | MR. BROOKS: I have no further | 2 | --------------- IN D E X ------------ |
| 3 | questions. And happy birthday. | 3 | WITNESS EXAMINATION BY PAGE |
| 4 | MS. BART: Thank you for | 4 | ALISON MCDONALD MR. BROOKS............... 6 |
| 5 | acknowledging that. | 5 |  |
| 6 | MR. HAYES: I have no questions. | 6 |  |
| 7 | MR. SHERMAN: I don't either. | 7 | ------------- INFORMATION REQUESTS ---------- |
| 8 | (Time noted: 3:48 p.m.) | 8 | RULINGS: page 70, line 21 |
| 9 |  | 9 |  |
| 10 |  | 10 | REQUESTS: PAGE |
| 11 | ALISON MCDONALD | 11 | Whether Exhibit 52 is image used in |
| 12 |  | 12 | newspaper and magazine ads............... 51 |
| 13 | Subscribed and sworn to | 13 |  |
| 14 | before me this ___ day | 14 | MOTIONS: PAGE |
| 15 | of _ , 2009. | 15 | Motion to strike........................ 35 |
| 16 |  | 16 | Motion to strike........................ 35 |
| 17 |  | 17 |  |
| 18 |  | 18 |  |
| 19 |  | 19 | ------------------- EXHIBITS ----------------- |
| 20 |  | 20 | PLAINTIFF'S FORID. |
| 21 |  | 21 | 103 Invitation GGP001696A................. 28 |
| 22 |  | 22 | 104 GGP00139A and 140A................... 29 |
| 23 |  | 23 | 105 Documents C00541 through 558........... 86 |
| 24 |  | 24 |  |
| 25 |  | 25 | ** EXHIBITS RETAINED BY COUNSEL ** |

## A-1485

Alison McDonald
December 17, 2009


|  | ```None UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK PATRICK CARIOU, vs. Plaintiff, Index No.: RICHARD PRINCE, GAGOSIAN GA.LLERY, INC., LAWRENCE GAGOSIAN, and RIZZOLI INTERNATIONAL PUBLICATIONS, INC., --------------------------------- \\ DEPOSITION OF LOUISE NERI New York, New York Thursday, December 17, 2009 \\ Reported by: \\ Bryan Nilsen, RPR \\ JOB NO. 305996-B ``` | 1 <br> 2 <br> 3 <br> 4 <br> 5 <br> 6 <br> 7 <br> 7 <br> 8 <br> 9 <br> 10 <br> 11 <br> 12 <br> 13 <br> 13 <br> 14 <br> 15 <br> 16 <br> 16 <br> 17 <br> 18 <br> 19 | ```3 Neri APPEARANCES: SCHNADER HARRISON SEGAL \& LEWIS LLP Attorneys for Plaintiff 140 Broadway, Suite 3100 New York, New York 10005-1101 BY: DANIEL J. BROOKS, ESQ. PHONE: (212)973-8000 EMAIL: dbrooks@schnader.com WITHERS BERGMAN LLP Attorneys for Defendants Gagosian Gallery, Inc., and Lawrence Gagosian 430 Park Avenue, 10th Floor New York, New York 10022-3505 BY: HOLLIS GONERKA BART, ESQ. PHONE: (212)848-9800 EMAIL: hollis.bart@withers.us.com``` |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 2 |  | 4 |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Neri |
| 2 |  | 2 | APPEARANCES (Cont'd.) |
| 3 |  | 3 |  |
| 4 |  | 4 | HANLY CONROY BIERSTEIN SHERIDAN FISHER \& HAYES LLP |
| 5 |  | 5 | Attorneys for Defendant Richard Prince |
| 6 | December 17, 2009 | 6 | 112 Madison Avenue |
| 7 | 3:57 p.m. | 7 | New York, New York 10016-7416 |
| 8 |  | 8 | BY: STEVEN M. HAYES, ESQ. |
| 9 |  | 9 | PHONE: (212)784-6400 |
| 10 | Deposition of LOUISE NERI, held | 10 | EMAIL: shayes@hanlyconroy.com |
| 11 | at the offices of Withers Bergman, LLP, | 11 |  |
| 12 | 430 Park Avenue, New York, New York, | 12 | WEISMANN CELLER SPETT \& MODLIN P.C. |
| 13 | pursuant to Notice, before Bryan Nilsen, | 13 | Attomeys for Defendant Rizzoli Intemational |
| 14 | RPR, a Notary Public of the State of | 14 | Publications, Inc. |
| 15 | New York. | 15 | 445 Park Avenue, No. 1500 |
| 16 |  | 16 | New York, New York 10022 |
| 17 |  | 17 | BY: JOHN B. SHERMAN, ESQ. |
| 18 |  | 18 | PHONE: (212)371-5400 |
| 19 |  | 19 | EMAIL: jsherman@wcsm445.com |
| 20 |  | 20 |  |
| 21 |  | 21 |  |
| 22 |  | 22 |  |
| 23 |  | 23 |  |
| 24 |  | 24 |  |
| 25 |  | 25 |  |


|  | 5 |  | 7 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Neri |
| 2 |  | 2 | A. Far too long ago. |
| 3 |  | 3 | Q. Okay, never mind. |
| 4 | IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, | 4 | How long have you been working for |
| 5 | by and among the attorneys for the | 5 | Gagosian Gallery? |
| 6 | respective parties herein, that filing and | 6 | A. This is my fourth year. |
| 7 | sealing be and the same are hereby waived. | 7 | Q. What is your title there? |
| 8 |  | 8 | A. Director. |
| 9 | IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED | 9 | Q. Of? |
| 10 | that all objections, except as to the form | 10 | A. I'm a director. |
| 11 | of the question, shall be reserved to the | 11 | Q. A director? |
| 12 | time of the trial. | 12 | A. One of several directors. |
| 13 |  | 13 | Q. What does that mean? |
| 14 | IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED | 14 | A. I'm an artistic director. I work |
| 15 | that the within deposition may be sworn to | 15 | on exhibitions, publications, texts, artist |
| 16 | and signed before any officer authorized | 16 | acquisition, gallery representation, research |
| 17 | to administer an oath, with the same force | 17 | for the gallery of new and existing artists. |
| 18 | and effect as if signed and sworn to | 18 | Q. At which location do you work? |
| 19 | before the Court. | 19 | A. My office is at 555 West |
| 20 |  | 20 | 24th Street, Chelsea. |
| 21 |  | 21 | Q. So in the gallery where the Canal |
| 22 |  | 22 | Zone show took place? |
| 23 |  | 23 | A. Exactly. |
| 24 |  | 24 | Q. How long have you been working in |
| 25 |  | 25 | that gallery? |
|  | 6 |  | 8 |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Neri |
| 2 | LOUISE NERI, called as a witness, | 2 | A. I have been there since I joined |
| 3 | having been duly sworn by a Notary Public, | 3 | Gagosian in February 2006. |
| 4 | was examined and testified as follows: | 4 | Q. To whom do you report? |
| 5 | THE COURT REPORTER: Please state | 5 | A. To Larry. |
| 6 | your name and address for the record. | 6 | Q. Directly? |
| 7 | THE WITNESS: Louise N. Neri, | 7 | A. And Melissa Lazarov, yes. |
| 8 | 1 University Place, New York, New York | 8 | Q. Okay. I'm going to show you what's |
| 9 | 10003. | 9 | been marked as Plaintiff's Exhibit 23 at another |
| 10 | EXAMINATION BY | 10 | deposition. |
| 11 | MR. BROOKS: | 11 | MR. BROOKS: Off the record. |
| 12 | Q. Good afternoon, Ms. Neri. I'm going | 12 | (Discussion off the record.) |
| 13 | to ask you a few questions. And as I said, I | 13 | BY MR. BROOKS: |
| 14 | represent the plaintiff in this lawsuit. | 14 | Q. These are a couple of e-mails. |
| 15 | If you don't understand my question, | 15 | Do you recall receiving these two e-mails? |
| 16 | just tell me and I will rephrase it. | 16 | A. Yes. I have one e-mail. |
| 17 | A. Sure. | 17 | Q. One, and then one you sent, right? |
| 18 | Q. What is your education? | 18 | A. Yes, and a response to say that I |
| 19 | A. I have an art history background, a | 19 | received the material. |
| 20 | BA in art history. | 20 | MS. BART: Dan, I don't mean to |
| 21 | Q. Where did you earn that? | 21 | interrupt your examination, but we asked |
| 22 | A. University of Melbourne. | 22 | this witness to make sure that she had |
| 23 | Q. In Australia? | 23 | pulled any responsive documents because |
| 24 | A. In Australia. | 24 | when we looked at this one -- this we're |
| 25 | Q. And when did you get that? | 125 | just going to produce to everybody now, |


|  | 9 |  | 11 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Neri |
| 2 | it's the exact same thing, the only thing | 2 | Q. Did you in or about October 2008 |
| 3 | that it has is the attachment. | 3 | read the pitch, it's with a capital T and a |
| 4 | MR. BROOKS: It has what? | 4 | capital P? |
| 5 | MS. BART: It has the attachment. | 5 | A. Yes, I did. |
| 6 | MR. BROOKS: What attachment? | 6 | Q. And did you read it before you |
| 7 | THE WITNESS: That's mentioned in | 7 | talked to Mr. Prince about his idea? |
| 8 | her e-mail. | 8 | A. Yes. |
| 9 | MR. BROOKS: Oh, the pitch, right? | 9 | Q. And I see at the top you wrote back |
| 10 | MS. BART: Yeah. | 10 | to Betsy Biscone, you wrote, Dear Betsy, I |
| 11 | MR. BROOKS: Okay. All right. | 11 | definitely want to talk to Richard but let me |
| 12 | MS. BART: Unfortunately the icons | 12 | get started. Richard being Richard Prince? |
| 13 | don't print out when she prints it from | 13 | A. Mm-hmm, exactly. |
| 14 | her computer, but we asked her to bring | 14 | Q. When you said let me get started, |
| 15 | that in. | 15 | what is it that you wanted to get started on? |
| 16 | MR. BROOKS: Right, I see, okay. | 16 | A. I wanted to get started writing the |
| 17 | Off the record. | 17 | press release for the exhibition. |
| 18 | (Discussion off the record.) | 18 | Q. Did your reading of the pitch, which |
| 19 | MR. BROOKS: Let's mark this as 106. | 19 | is the exhibit part of Exhibit 106, did that |
| 20 | (Plaintiff's Exhibit 106, e-mail | 20 | enter into at least your initial draft of the |
| 21 | with pitch attachment, was marked for | 21 | press release? |
| 22 | identification, as of this date.) | 22 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 23 | BY MR. BROOKS: | 23 | Q. Let me rephrase it. |
| $24$ | Q. Ms. Neri, your counsel has handed us | 24 | You read the pitch before you |
| $25$ | a document Bates stamped GGP004336 through 39. | 25 | started preparing the press release? |
|  | 10 |  | 12 |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Neri |
| 2 | If you take a look at what was | 2 | A. Yes, I did. |
| 3 | marked as Exhibit 23 there's an e-mail to you | 3 | Q. Did what you read in the pitch |
| 4 | that says, it begins, Dear Louise, I hope this | 4 | inform what you wrote in the press release at |
| 5 | finds you well, per Richard's request please | 5 | all? |
| 6 | find attached the pitch, and then it goes on. | 6 | A. Yes. |
| 7 | But nothing was attached to | 7 | Q. What else, if anything, helped you |
| 8 | Exhibit 23. Now, we have Exhibit 106, and I'm | 8 | write the press release, and I'm just talking |
| 9 | going to ask you is that the same e-mail but | 9 | about the first go through? |
| 10 | with the attachment, the pitch, the pitch | 10 | A. My knowledge of Richard's work. |
| 11 | attachment that's missing from Exhibit 23? | 11 | I'm a working art historian and critic. I have |
| 12 | A. Yes, it is. | 12 | worked with him before, and so some general |
| 13 | Q. Okay, fine. Keep that in front of | 13 | knowledge on Prince's work. |
| 14 | you in case you need it. | 14 | Q. You had worked with Mr. Prince |
| 15 | But now, so getting back to 23, you | 15 | before? |
| 16 | got this e-mail, the one on the bottom, from | 16 | A. Yes. |
| 17 | Betsy Biscone? | 17 | Q. In connection with what? |
| 18 | A. Mm-hmm. | 18 | A. I used to edit a magazine called |
| 19 | Q. And she worked for Richard Prince? | 19 | Parkett Magazine, which I did for eleven years, |
| 20 | A. Yes. | 20 | and I prepared an issue of the magazine with |
| 21 | Q. In his studio? | 21 | him. |
| 22 | A. Yes. | 22 | Q. Called? |
| 23 | Q. And as she says, she attached the | 23 | A. Parkett, P-A-R-K-E-T-T. |
| 24 | pitch, which is now part of Exhibit 106? | 24 | Q. And what did that have to do with |
| 25 | A. Yes. | 25 | Mr. Prince? |



|  | 17 |  | 19 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Neri |
| 2 | many you saw? | 2 | like a website copy. |
| 3 | A. I can't recall. A few. Probably | 3 | Q. Whose website? |
| 4 | five. | 4 | A. Our website, Gagosian Gallery |
| 5 | Q. Some of those images had pictures of | 5 | website. |
| 6 | Rastafarians, correct? | 6 | Q. Do the first two pages of Exhibit 31 |
| 7 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 7 | appear to be your press release as taken off the |
| 8 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 8 | website? |
| 9 | Q. You can answer. | 9 | A. Yes. |
| 10 | You can answer. | 10 | Q. Now, let me ask you this. On the |
| 11 | A. Yes, they did. Or I would say men | 11 | first page do you see where it says artist info |
| 12 | with dreadlocks. I don't know if they were | 12 | and it says view on the right? |
| 13 | strictly Rastafarians. | 13 | A. Yes. |
| 14 | Q. Okay, so let's call them men with | 14 | Q. Are you familiar with the Gagosian |
| 15 | dreadlocks. | 15 | Gallery website? |
| 16 | Did you ever attempt to ascertain | 16 | A. Yes. |
| 17 | where those images came from, the ones with the | 17 | Q. If you were to click on that where |
| 18 | men with dreadlocks? | 18 | it says view artist info, view, what would you |
| 19 | A. No. | 19 | get? |
| 20 | Q. Did you ever ask him? | 20 | A. It depends. You would either get a |
| 21 | A. No. | 21 | view of available works, or in the case of an |
| 22 | Q. Having worked with Mr. Prince before | 22 | exhibition you would have a view of the |
| 23 | and knowing him, you knew he was known as an | 23 | exhibition. In certain cases we shoot videos |
| 24 | appropriation artist, correct? | 24 | of the show. |
| 25 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 25 | Q. In this case please look at the |
|  | 18 |  | 20 |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Neri |
| 2 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 2 | third page of Exhibit 31. There appears to be |
| 3 | Q. You can answer. | 3 | some biographical information about Mr. Prince, |
| 4 | A. Yes. | 4 | correct? |
| 5 | Q. You knew he had a practice of | 5 | A. Yes. |
| 6 | appropriating images created by others and | 6 | Q. Do you know if that's the artist |
| 7 | including them in his work, right? | 7 | info that's being referred to on the first page |
| 8 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 8 | of Exhibit 31? |
| 9 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 9 | A. I don't understand your question, |
| 10 | Q. You can answer. | 10 | I'm sorry. |
| 11 | A. Yes. | 11 | Q. You don't understand my question? |
| 12 | Q. Do you know if anyone at Gagosian | 12 | A. No. |
| 13 | Gallery attempted in this case to make sure that | 13 | Q. Do you know if you clicked on -- |
| 14 | the images appropriated in the Canal Zone | 14 | A. Oh, sorry, I see it. |
| 15 | paintings were not copyright protected? | 15 | Could you repeat the question? |
| 16 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 16 | Q. Does the third page of Exhibit 31 |
| 17 | MR. HAYES: Form. | 17 | appear to be the artist info referred to on the |
| 18 | Q. You can answer. | 18 | first page? |
| 19 | A. I don't know. | 19 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 20 | Q. Let's talk about the press release | 20 | A. It appears to be. I can't tell you |
| 21 | then. I'm going to hand you what's been marked | 21 | for sure. |
| 22 | as Exhibit 31. | 22 | Q. Did you write the third page of |
| 23 | Here's Exhibit 31. Do you know what | 23 | Exhibit 31? |
| 24 | Exhibit 31 is or what it is a copy of? | 24 | A. Yes. |
| 25 | A. It looks like a copy -- it looks | 25 | Q. You personally? |


|  | 21 |  | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Neri |
| 2 | A. Yes. | 2 | press release, right? |
| 3 | Q. You did? | 3 | MS. BART: Except that the date, the |
| 4 | A. Yes. | 4 | printout date is 12/14/2009 and this one |
| 5 | Q. Did you write it in connection with | 5 | says 12/8/2008. |
| 6 | the Canal Zone exhibition? | 6 | Q. All right. It's the same press |
| 7 | A. No. | 7 | release, right? |
| 8 | Q. Do you know when you wrote it? | 8 | MS. BART: Take a look. |
| 9 | A. Within the year. I write a lot of | 9 | A. Yes, it's the same press release. |
| 10 | material for the gallery on artists as we | 10 | Q. And if you look at the third page of |
| 11 | require information for many different reasons | 11 | Exhibit 105 what does that appear to be? |
| 12 | and we often reuse the information. | 12 | A. Installation shots of an exhibition. |
| 13 | Q. Do you think you wrote the | 13 | Q. Of the Canal Zone exhibition? |
| 14 | description of Mr. Prince, the third page of | 14 | A. They're too small for me to really |
| 15 | Exhibit 31, before the press release, which is | 15 | see there, but -- |
| 16 | the first two pages of Exhibit 31? | 16 | Q. Why don't you look at the subsequent |
| 17 | A. Yes. | 17 | pages which are bigger copies of those images? |
| 18 | MS. BART: Objection to form. | 18 | MS. BART: And, again, just for |
| 19 | Q. The answer is what? | 19 | the record, these pages are dated |
| 20 | A. Yes. | 20 | December 14th, 2009. |
| 21 | Q. Now, one other question before we | 21 | MR. BROOKS: Right. We just printed |
| 22 | get to the text. | 22 | it out from Google. |
| 23 | On the left it says press release, | 23 | MS. BART: But this witness has |
| 24 | is that a reference to this press release, the | 24 | testified she doesn't know what it looked |
| 25 | first two pages? | 25 | like in 2008. |
|  | 22 |  | 24 |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Neri |
| 2 | A. Yes. | 2 | MR. BROOKS: Well, she hasn't looked |
| 3 | Q. And then underneath that it says | 3 | at it yet. |
| 4 | view work, do you know what you would have | 4 | BY MR. BROOKS: |
| 5 | gotten in late 2008 if you clicked view work? | 5 | Q. So look through those and tell us |
| 6 | MS. BART: Objection, form, and | 6 | what those are shots of. |
| 7 | asked and answered. | 7 | A. The car that was exhibited in |
| 8 | MR. BROOKS: Not of this witness. | 8 | gallery 108. |
| 9 | MS. BART: Mm-hmm. | 9 | Q. In the Canal Zone exhibition? |
| 10 | MR. BROOKS: No, I asked her what | 10 | A. Yes. |
| 11 | would happen if you clicked on artist | 11 | Q. What else? |
| 12 | info. | 12 | A. It's basically an exhibition |
| 13 | MS. BART: No. | 13 | walkthrough. |
| 14 | MR. BROOKS: Yes, I did. | 14 | Q. Of the Canal Zone exhibition? |
| 15 | BY MR. BROOKS: | 15 | A. Yes. |
| 16 | Q. What would happen if you clicked on | 16 | Q. Thank you. |
| 17 | view work? | 17 | Can I have that back, please? |
| 18 | A. You might see images from the | 18 | MS. BART: Sure. |
| 19 | exhibition or you might see general work. | 19 | Q. On Exhibit 31 there's an image at |
| 20 | I can't be sure. | 20 | the very top, it looks like somebody sitting on |
| 21 | Q. Let me show you -- | 21 | a donkey, do you see that, among other things? |
| 22 | A. Depending on when it was done. | 22 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 23 | Q. Let me show you what was marked as | 23 | You can't see that from this |
| 24 | Exhibit 105 previously. | 24 | photocopied image. |
| 25 | The first two pages are the same | 125 | MR. BROOKS: You need better glasses |


| 25 |  | 27 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Neri |
| 2 | then. | 2 | is being shown in Exhibit 105? |
| 3 | MS. BART: You can't see that. I | 3 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 4 | have glasses on. | 4 | Q. You can answer. |
| 5 | MR. BROOKS: Well, let's see if she | 5 | A. Yes. It's the same image. |
| 6 | can see it. It doesn't matter if you can | 6 | Q. And what is the name of that |
| 7 | see it. | 7 | painting? |
| 8 | BY MR. BROOKS: | 8 | A. In the book it says Back to the |
| 9 | Q. Do you see the image? | 9 | Garden. |
| 10 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 10 | Q. Let me show you another book. It's |
| 11 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 11 | called Yes Rasta. It's photos by Patrick Cariou |
| 12 | A. I would not be able to tell what it | 12 | who is the plaintiff in this case. |
| 13 | was from this photocopy. | 13 | Have you ever seen that book? |
| 14 | Q. Do you see the image? | 14 | A. No. |
| 15 | A. Not really, no. | 15 | Q. I've opened the book, the Patrick |
| 16 | Q. Is it better in 105, Exhibit 105? | 16 | Cariou book to a page which is not numbered, but |
| 17 | A. Yes. | 17 | I will make an exhibit of this double page. |
| 18 | Q. You see a man sitting on a donkey? | 18 | Does that appear to be the same |
| 19 | A. Yes. | 19 | image? |
| 20 | Q. I won't swear it's a donkey -- | 20 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 21 | A. Or the back of a donkey. | 21 | Q. Of the man on the donkey? |
| 22 | Q. Some kind of -- | 22 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 23 | A. A mule maybe. | 23 | Q. You can answer. |
| 24 | Q. Who knows. | 24 | MS. BART: If she can. |
| 25 | Take a look at the Canal Zone | 25 | A. Yes. |
|  | 26 |  | 28 |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Neri |
| 2 | catalog which is in front of you, please. | 2 | Q. Excuse me? |
| 3 | Have you ever seen that book before? | 3 | A. Yes. |
| 4 | A. Yes. | 4 | Q. Do you know how that image from |
| 5 | Q. Was it being exhibited and offered | 5 | Mr. Cariou's book ended up in the Back to the |
| 6 | for sale during the exhibition between | 6 | Garden painting? |
| 7 | November 8th and December 20th, 2008 -- | 7 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 8 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 8 | Q. You can answer. |
| 9 | Q. -- at the gallery? | 9 | A. I don't. |
| 10 | A. It was exhibited at the front desk | 10 | Q. Do you know if it was scanned on or |
| 11 | of the gallery during the exhibition, for how | 11 | squeegeed on? |
| 12 | long I cannot be sure. | 12 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 13 | Q. And it was on sale? | 13 | A. I'm not sure I understand the |
| 14 | A. At the beginning. | 14 | question. |
| 15 | Q. It was on sale? | 15 | Q. Well, you used those words in your |
| 16 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 16 | press release, right? |
| 17 | Q. You can answer. | 17 | A. Yes, but I used them in a very |
| 18 | A. Our catalogs usually are. | 18 | precise context. |
| 19 | Q. Do you know if copies of it were | 19 | Q. Okay, so we'll get to the press |
| 20 | sold? | 20 | release in a moment. |
| 21 | A. I don't know. | 21 | MR. BROOKS: Let's mark as |
| 22 | Q. Could you turn to page -- you'll see | 22 | Exhibit 107, just so everybody will know |
| 23 | there are some Post-its with numbers. Turn to | 23 | what I was talking about, a photocopy of |
| 24 | page C000116, please. | 24 | the page. |
| 25 | Is that the painting, part of which | 25 | (Plaintiff's Exhibit 107, two |


|  | 29 |  | 31 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Neri |
| 2 | pages from Yes Rasta, was marked for | 2 | MS. BART: You said I assume these |
| 3 | ideritification, as of this date.) | 3 | are your words, you read them, and then |
| 4 | Q. Just for the record Ms, Neri, what's | 4 | you asked her do you see them. |
| 5 | been put in front of you is 107. It appears to | 5 | MR. BROOKS: Well, now I'm going to |
| 6 | be a copy of two pages in the Patrick Cariou | 6 | ask her if they're her words. |
| 7 | book we've just been talking about, correct? | 7 | MS. BART: Okay. |
| 8 | A. Yes. | 8 | BY MR. BROOKS: |
| 9 | Q. May I have that, please? | 9 | Q. Are those your words? |
| 10 | Thank you. | 10 | A. I wrote them, yes. |
| 11 | Okay. So now back to Exhibit 31, if | 11 | Q. What were you referring to when you |
| 12 | you don't mind. | 12 | said Naughty Nurse pulp fiction? |
| 13 | First, there's a quote in italics, | 13 | A. Richard made a series of collages, |
| 14 | the story was basically about a guy who lands in | 14 | works on paper and paintings after a book series |
| 15 | St. Barths, gets off the plane, is immediately | 15 | called the Naughty Nurse series. |
| 16 | told that there's been a nuclear holocaust in | 16 | Q. And did he appropriate the covers? |
| 17 | the rest of the world and he looks at his family | 17 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 18 | and says, quote, we can't go back, unquote. | 18 | Q. You can answer. |
| 19 | And that's attributed there to | 19 | A. He actually used the covers. |
| 20 | Richard Prince, correct? | 20 | Q. Oh, the actual covers? |
| 21 | A. Yes. | 21 | A. In some cases, yes. |
| 22 | Q. And is that something you took out | 22 | Q. In what way did he use them? |
| 23 | of what we've been calling the pitch? | 23 | A. As collages, paint collages. |
| 24 | A. I can't recall. | 24 | Q. Did he enlarge them or just use them |
| 25 | Q. Do you recall where you got that | 25 | directly onto the canvas, if you know? |
|  | 30 |  | 32 |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Neri |
| 2 | language from? | 2 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 3 | A. From Richard Prince. Whether it was | 3 | Q. You can answer. |
| 4 | from his pitch or whether it was from him, it | 4 | A. They were collages, works on paper, |
| 5 | was a quote that was verified by him. | 5 | so there was no canvas involved. And then there |
| 6 | Q. And did he discuss this idea of a | 6 | are a series of large canvases where the images |
| 7 | family getting off a plane and finding out | 7 | that are inspired by the original images, |
| 8 | there's been a nuclear war, did he discuss that | 8 | they're not the book covers, they're not the |
| 9 | with you? | 9 | book covers per se. |
| 10 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 10 | Q. Further down you said, you refer to |
| 11 | Q. You can answer. | 11 | Rastafarians with massive dreadlocks, do you see |
| 12 | A. It was the pitch that he had | 12 | that? |
| 13 | written. | 13 | A. Yes. |
| 14 | Q. So the answer is you did not discuss | 14 | Q. Now, before I asked you if there are |
| 15 | that with him? | 15 | Rastafarians in the paintings and you said you |
| 16 | A. I did not discuss it further, no. | 16 | didn't know, you just said they were just men |
| 17 | Q. In the third paragraph these are | 17 | with dreadlocks. How did you know these were |
| 18 | your words I assume, following his burlesque | 18 | Rastafarians when you wrote the press release? |
| 19 | dialogues with the art of De Kooning, Picasso, | 19 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 20 | and Naughty Nurse pulp fiction, Prince has | 20 | Q. You can answer. |
| 21 | turned to his own biographical roots for | 21 | A. In the additional notes to the |
| 22 | inspiration, do you see that? | 22 | pitch, which we've all seen, he referred to a |
| 23 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 23 | group of Rastas. |
| 24 | A. Yes. | 24 | Q. So we have to go back to Exhibit 23 |
| 25 | MR. BROOKS: What's the objection? | 125 | then briefly. Do you have it there? |


|  | 33 |  | 35 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Neri |
| 2 | I'm looking at the additional | 2 | Q. Do you know if they're supposed to |
| 3 | Eden Rock slash pitch material, right? | 3 | be well-known literary and artistic lesbians |
| 4 | A. Mm-hmm. | 4 | from the early 20th century? |
| 5 | Q. And where does it say these are | 5 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 6 | Rastafarians? | 6 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
| 7 | A. Number 1, Rastas and Reggae. | 7 | Q. You can answer. |
| 8 | Q. And anywhere else besides that? | 8 | A. I know all their names. Djuna |
| 9 | A. No. | 9 | Barnes I certainly know is a famous writer, and |
| 10 | Q. Look at number 3 about the Amazons, | 10 | a couple of the others. Whether they're famous |
| 11 | do you see that? | 11 | lesbians, I don't know. |
| 12 | A. Yes. | 12 | Q. If you look at that painting about |
| 13 | Q. Do you know what the Guanahani Hotel | 13 | the four women taking over the Guanahani on page |
| 14 | is? | 14 | C00164, do you see a tropical landscape |
| 15 | A. It's a hotel in St. Barths. | 15 | background against which the four women are |
| 16 | Q. Do you know if one of the paintings | 16 | superimposed? |
| 17 | in this Canal Zone exhibition purports to show | 17 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 18 | four women taking over the Guanahani Hotel in | 18 | A. I can see vegetation. |
| 19 | St. Barths? | 19 | Q. Do you know where that vegetation |
| 20 | A. There's a painting with the title | 20 | came from? |
| 21 | Guanahani in it, whether they are taking over | 21 | A. No. |
| 22 | the hotel I couldn't tell you. I think it's a | 22 | Q. I'm going to show you another two |
| 23 | figure of speech. | 23 | pages from the plaintiff's photo book. |
| 24 | Q. Take a look at the Canal Zone book. | 24 | You've never seen this book before, |
| 25 | You were looking at it before. | $\underline{25}$ | correct? |
|  | 34 |  | 36 |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Neri |
| 2 | By the way, for the record, I should | 2 | A. No. |
| 3 | have said it before, a copy has been marked as | 3 | Q. Have you ever heard of Mr. Cariou |
| 4 | Plaintiff's Exhibit 42. So please take a look | 4 | before? |
| 5 | at the Canal Zone book again. | 5 | A. No. |
| 6 | And if you could look at page | 6 | Q. Do those two pages appear to be the |
| 7 | C00164, is that the painting you were discussing | 7 | vegetation background in the painting which is |
| 8 | before about something about the Guanahani Hotel | 8 | reproduced on page C00164, the Guanahani |
| 9 | and four women? | 9 | painting? |
| 10 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 10 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 11 | Q. You can answer. | 11 | Q. You can answer. |
| 12 | A. It says Guanahani, it doesn't say | 12 | A. It could be. I don't know. |
| 13 | hotel. | 13 | Q. Do you see the -- |
| 14 | Q. Does it say they're taking it over? | 14 | MS. BART: Just don't guess. |
| 15 | A. It says take over the Guanahani. | 15 | Q. Do you notice the paim leaf in the |
| 16 | Q. And who are those four women | 16 | upper right-hand corner of the Cariou book? |
| 17 | supposed to be, do you know? | 17 | It might be under that pink Post-it |
| 18 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 18 | there, do you see that? |
| 19 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 19 | A. Yes. |
| 20 | Q. You can answer. | 20 | Q. With a tree kind of on a slant? |
| 21 | A. I would take the title at face | 21 | A. Yes. |
| 22 | value. | 22 | Q. Do you notice that same palm tree in |
| 23 | Q. Well, are they supposed to be the | 23 | the Guanahani painting by Mr. Prince? |
| 24 | Amazons in point 3 of the additional notes? | 24 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 25 | A. I don't know. | 25 | Q. You can answer. |


|  | 37 |  | 39 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Neri |
| 2 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 2 | others are, quote, dragged on, unquote, |
| 3 | A. I see a palm tree. | 3 | using a primitive collage technique |
| 4 | Q. It looks different to you? | 4 | whereby printed figures are roughly cut |
| 5 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 5 | out, then the backs of those figures |
| 6 | Q. Does it look different to you? | 6 | painted and pasted directly onto the base |
| 7 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 7 | canvas with a squeegee so that the excess |
| 8 | Q. You can answer. That doesn't mean | 8 | paint squirts out on and around the image, |
| 9 | you can't answer the question. | 9 | period, unquote. |
| 10 | MS. BART: She knows that. | 10 | Did you write those words, the ones |
| 11 | MR. BROOKS: I don't know. | 11 | I just read? |
| 12 | MS. BART: \| think she's studying | 12 | A. Yes. |
| 13 | the pictures. | 13 | Q. And that was based - you were able |
| 14 | MR. BROOKS: Okay, fine. | 14 | to write those words based on what information? |
| 15 | (Witness looks at exhibit.) | 15 | A. Based on looking at the images that |
| 16 | A. I can't say for sure. | 16 | I had been given in JPEG form and speaking, |
| 17 | MR. BROOKS: Again, just so the | 17 | discussing it a bit with Richard. |
| 18 | record will be clear, let's mark as | 18 | Q. So you did discuss this with |
| 19 | Plaintiff's Exhibit 108 a photocopy of | 19 | Richard? |
| 20 | those two pages that we were just | 20 | A. Yes, at one point. |
| 21 | discussing from the Patrick Cariou book. | 21 | Q. Oh, okay. At what point? |
| 22 | (Plaintiff's Exhibit 108, photocopy | 22 | A. I can't remember. |
| 23 | of two pages from Yes Rasta, was marked | 23 | Q. Where were you when you discussed it |
| 24 | for identification, as of this date.) | 24 | with him? |
| 25 | Q. Just so the record is clear, does | 25 | A. In my office. |
|  | 38 |  | 40 |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Neri |
| 2 | Exhibit 108 appear to be a photocopy of the | 2 | Q. Where was he? |
| 3 | pages in the Yes Rasta book we were just looking | 3 | A. I assume he was in his studio. |
| 4 | at? | 4 | Q. He was on the phone? |
| 5 | A. Is this a copy of -- | 5 | A. Yes. |
| 6 | Q. Yes. | 6 | Q. And what do you remember about that |
| 7 | A. Yes. | 7 | discussion now? |
| 8 | Q. Do you know -- l'm still on the | 8 | A. I think just what I wrote here. |
| 9 | Guanahani painting, C00164. Do you know by what | 9 | It's very brief. |
| 10 | means the vegetation part of the painting came | 10 | Q. All right. When you said some |
| 11 | to be on the canvas? | 11 | images scanned from originals, what did you mean |
| 12 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 12 | by originals? |
| 13 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 13 | A. Originals can mean any source, any |
| 14 | Q. You can answer. | 14 | source image. |
| 15 | A. No. | 15 | Q. For instance, l'm going to show you |
| 16 | Q. Can you turn to the second page of | 16 | Exhibits 107 and 108 again. |
| 17 | your press release -- and you can close that for | 17 | Could those be originals that were |
| 18 | now -- which is Exhibit 31, right? | 18 | scanned onto two of the paintings? |
| 19 | I'm going to read from the second | 19 | MS. BART: I'd like to hear the |
| 20 | page of Exhibit 31 and then l'm going to ask you | 20 | question back, please. |
| 21 | if you wrote those words, but I'm going to read | 21 | (Record read.) |
| 22 | it into the record. | 22 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 23 | At the top of the second page: | 23 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
| 24 | Some images, scanned from originals, | 24 | Q. You can answer. |
| 25 | are printed directly onto the base canvas; | 25 | A. I'm not sure, because when I just |


|  | 41 |  | 43 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Neri |
| 2 | identified what I thought originals were in | 2 | dreadlocks, do you see it? |
| 3 | Prince's work that does not necessarily mean an | 3 | A. Yes. |
| 4 | original image, it means whatever he is working | 4 | Q. Is that an image? |
| 5 | with in the studio at the time. It can be a | 5 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 6 | collage. | 6 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
| 7 | Q. Well, I'm asking you about these two | 7 | A. It's a photograph. |
| 8 | images, Exhibits 107 and 108? | 8 | Q. So it's a photograph. |
| 9 | MS. BART: She just answered the | 9 | Is it an original photograph? |
| 10 | question. She said she's not sure. | 10 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 11 | Q. You're not sure about what? | 11 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
| 12 | A. I'm not sure that these are images | 12 | A. I don't know. |
| 13 | that I would call originals from which scans | 13 | Q. Well, can you just explain what you |
| 14 | were made. I can't answer that. | 14 | meant when you said some images, scanned from |
| 15 | Q. Okay, whether they're original or | 15 | originals, are printed directly onto the base |
| 16 | not, do you believe scans were made, for | 16 | canvas? |
| 17 | instance, the fellow on the donkey? | 17 | A. An image already indicates that some |
| 18 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 18 | transformation has taken place. |
| 19 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form too. | 19 | Q. What do you mean? |
| 20 | MS. BART: Calls for speculation. | 20 | A. Exactly what I said. An image is |
| 21 | Q. As part of Back to the Garden? | 21 | not to be confused with an original. An image |
| 22 | MS. BART: Objection, form, and | 22 | is usually figurative, a picture that has been |
| 23 | asked and answered. | 23 | somehow developed from various sources. |
| 24 | Q. You can answer. | 24 | I'm using image as opposed to a |
| 25 | A. I don't have anything more to add. | 25 | photograph or an original source. |
|  | 42 |  | 44 |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Neri |
| 2 | Q. What? | 2 | Q. Where did you get the understanding |
| 3 | A. I don't have anything more to add to | 3 | that some scanning had taken place in this with |
| 4 | what l've already said. | 4 | respect to these paintings? |
| 5 | Q. Who told you that originals were | 5 | A. In my research as to how the work |
| 6 | scanned directly onto the base canvas? | 6 | was made, how the work came together. |
| 7 | A. That's not actually correct. I | 7 | Q. Okay. So let's stay with the |
| 8 | think you are mixing a couple of words there. | 8 | scanning part of it. How did that affect the |
| 9 | Q. Okay, you wrote some images, scanned | 9 | making of these paintings? |
| 10 | from originals are printed directly onto the | 10 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 11 | base canvas. Who told you that some originals | 11 | Q. How did the scanning affect the |
| 12 | were scanned? | 12 | making of the paintings? |
| 13 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 13 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 14 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 14 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
| 15 | Q. You can answer. | 15 | Q. You can answer. |
| 16 | A. There is a difference between images | 16 | A. It would have been one of many |
| 17 | being scanned from originals and originals being | 17 | processes. |
| 18 | scanned. I wrote some images scanned from | 18 | Q. But l'm only asking about -- we'll |
| 19 | originals. So l'm not saying the originals are | 19 | get to the other processes later. I'm focusing |
| 20 | being scanned. I'm saying images that are | 20 | on that process only in these questions. |
| 21 | created from original sources. It's a -- | 21 | So how did scanning enter into the |
| 22 | there's a distinction. | 22 | making of these paintings? |
| 23 | Q. Okay. I'm going to show you | 23 | MS. BART: Objection, form, and |
| 24 | Plaintiff's book again. | 24 | asked and answered. |
| 25 | There's a picture of a man with | 25 | Q. You can answer. |


|  | 45 |  | 47 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Neri |
| 2 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 2 | MS. BART: Can we lay a foundation |
| 3 | A. I've answered your question. I have | 3 | then as to her involvement in that book? |
| 4 | nothing more to add. | 4 | BY MR. BROOKS: |
| 5 | Q. Who did the scanning? | 5 | Q. Take a look at the first painting. |
| 6 | A. I don't know. | 6 | It's called Graduation. It's on page C0096. |
| 7 | Q. Did Mr. Prince tell you he sent | 7 | And if you wouldn't mind, put 109 so |
| 8 | pictures out to be scanned at a laboratory? | 8 | she can look at it. |
| 9 | A. No. | 9 | Does that appear to be the same |
| 10 | Q. With all due respect, you haven't | 10 | person? |
| 11 | answered my question, because I'm not stupid, I | 11 | MS. BART: Objection, form, calls |
| 12 | don't understand what you're saying, honestly. | 12 | for speculation. |
| 13 | It's not a trick question. You're | 13 | MR. HAYES: Form. |
| 14 | saying here something was scanned from | 14 | Q. You can answer. |
| 15 | originals. What does that mean? | 15 | A. The same person, I don't know. It |
| 16 | MS. BART: Okay, she's answered your | 16 | could be. |
| 17 | question. She's -- | 17 | Q. Look at 168, C00168. It's a |
| 18 | MR. BROOKS: No, she answered with | 18 | painting called Tales of Brave Ulysses. |
| 19 | gibberish. | 19 | All right. Do you see the same man |
| 20 | THE WITNESS: Excuse me. Wow -- | 20 | who is in Exhibit 109? |
| 21 | MS. BART: No, no, no, don't engage | 21 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 22 | with him. We're not -- | 22 | A. Yes. |
| 23 | THE WITNESS: I don't need to be | 23 | Q. Now, with respect to Tales of Brave |
| 24 | insulted. | 24 | Ulysses, which is painting number 16 in the |
| 25 | MR. BROOKS: Hold on. Leave that. | 25 | book, do you know if that image of this man was |
|  | 46 |  | 48 |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Neri |
| 2 | Let's mark as Exhibit 109 a copy of | 2 | scanned on, squeegeed on, or ended up there by |
| 3 | the image photograph that we've been | 3 | some other technological method? |
| 4 | looking at in the book. | 4 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 5 | (Plaintiff's Exhibit 109, copy of | 5 | Q. You can answer. |
| 6 | photograph, was marked for identification, | 6 | A. It's a collage process. |
| 7 | as of this date.) | 7 | Q. So it was neither scanned nor |
| 8 | Q. First of all, 109, does it appear to | 8 | squeegeed on? |
| 9 | you be to be a photocopy of the page in the | 9 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 10 | Yes Rasta book we've been looking at? | 10 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
| 11 | A. Yes. | 11 | A. The squeegee is simply the |
| 12 | Q. Now, with respect to 109 did you see | 12 | instrument that's used. It's not a technique in |
| 13 | an image of the same man in any of the Canal | 13 | itself. So it's simply what is used to stick |
| 14 | Zone paintings? | 14 | one surface to another. |
| 15 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 15 | Q. When you say it's a collage what do |
| 16 | MR. HAYES: Form. | 16 | you mean? |
| 17 | A. I would have to look at them again. | 17 | A. A collage can be any series of |
| 18 | Q. Okay. So let's start with the first | 18 | different surfaces or substances joined together |
| 19 | painting, Graduation. | 19 | usually with some form of adhesive. |
| 20 | MS. BART: And you're talking about | 20 | Q. Okay. So the pictures -- |
| 21 | the ones that she looked at before she | 21 | A. It means to stick literally. |
| 22 | wrote the press release? | 22 | Q. So the pictures of the man with the |
| 23 | MR. BROOKS: No, I'm not. I'm | 23 | dreadlocks in Tales of Brave Ulysses that you're |
| 24 | asking her to look at the book, the Canal | 24 | looking at now, page C00168, are you saying that |
| 25 | Zone book. | 125 | those images, those four images of that same man |


|  | 49 |  | 51 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Neri |
| 2 | are on there by virtue of some adhesive that | 2 | A. Yes. |
| 3 | make them stick on there? | 3 | Q. Okay. What did you mean when you |
| 4 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 4 | said some were quote/unquote dragged on, what |
| 5 | Q. Is that what you're saying? | 5 | does that mean? |
| 6 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 6 | A. I'm referring to composing using |
| 7 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 7 | computer tools where you drag, where you can |
| 8 | Q. You can answer. | 8 | drag an image across a screen to make a |
| 9 | MS. BART: Objection to form. | 9 | superimposition. |
| 10 | MR. BROOKS: Saying it three times | 10 | Q. And your understanding is that some |
| 11 | doesn't -- | 11 | of the images in the Canal Zone paintings were |
| 12 | A. I would have to see the painting | 12 | put on the paintings that way by being dragged |
| 13 | again. | 13 | on? |
| 14 | Q. There it is. | 14 | A. No, I'm using it with a degree of |
| 15 | A. I can't see the way the painting is | 15 | license here because l'm trying to write these |
| 16 | made from a photograph. I'm sorry. It's very | 16 | press releases for a public, and the idea -- |
| 17 | flat. | 17 | everyone knows in this day and age how to drag |
| 18 | Q. I see. | 18 | images across the screen, so l'm making an |
| 19 | A. One important thing about these | 19 | analogy between dragging on a screen and then |
| 20 | paintings is how they're made, and that does not | 20 | I -- you know, you can't take it out of context. |
| 21 | carry through in the photograph so I can't | 21 | It's dragging on using a primitive |
| 22 | verify that for you. | 22 | collage technique whereby printed figures are |
| 23 | Q. Right. But when you wrote the press | 23 | roughly cut out and the backs of these figures |
| 24 | release all you had seen -- you hadn't even seen | 24 | painted and pasted directly onto the canvas with |
| 25 | paintings, you had just seen JPEGs, right? | 25 | a squeegee so that the excess paint, et cetera, |
|  | 50 |  | 52 |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Neri |
| 2 | A. And I had spoken to Mr. Prince -- | 2 | et cetera. |
| 3 | Q. Ah, to Mr. Prince. | 3 | I'm not just saying dragged on. |
| 4 | A. -- about the technique. | 4 | I go on to qualify exactly how that dragging |
| 5 | Q. And what did he tell you about how | 5 | process occurs. |
| 6 | these Rastafarians ended up being on these | 6 | But l'm using a form of -- a kind of |
| 7 | paintings? | 7 | language to intrigue people. That's what press |
| 8 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 8 | releases are for. |
| 9 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 9 | Q. Okay. Further down in that |
| 10 | Q. You can answer. | 10 | paragraph you said this has become a completely |
| 11 | A. I didn't ask him. | 11 | new way for Prince to make a painting. |
| 12 | Q. All right. Who told you that some | 12 | Where did you get that concept? |
| 13 | of the images -- let me find Exhibit 31 -- who | 13 | MS. BART: Read the rest of that |
| 14 | told you that some of the images had been pasted | 14 | sentence in light of the witness's last |
| 15 | directly onto the base canvas with a squeegee? | 15 | answer. |
| 16 | A. He told me about his technique of | 16 | Q. All right. I'll read the whole |
| 17 | using a squeegee. | 17 | sentence, but my question is about why it's |
| 18 | Q. Who is he? | 18 | completely new. |
| 19 | A. Richard Prince. | 19 | This has become a completely new way |
| 20 | Q. And again, who told you that some | 20 | for Prince to make a painting, where much |
| 21 | had been scanned? | 21 | of what shows up on the surface is |
| 22 | MS. BART: Objection, form, and | 22 | incidental to the process, unquote. |
| 23 | asked and answered. | 23 | Have I read that accurately? |
| 24 | A. I've already answered that question. | 24 | A. Yes. |
| 25 | Q. Mr. Prince? | 25 | Q. Now, l'd like to focus on your |


|  | 53 |  | 55 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Neri |
| 2 | words, completely new way. Can you tell us | 2 | the first time he did it that way, right? |
| 3 | what's completely new about this method that he | 3 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
| 4 | employed? | 4 | MS. BART: Join. |
| 5 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 5 | A. He said it was a completely new way |
| 6 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 6 | for him to work. |
| 7 | Q. You can answer. | 7 | Q. Are you aware that in his deposition |
| 8 | A. As l've explained in the preceding | 8 | he said, no, it's a completely new way for |
| 9 | sentences, there's a degree of -- quite an | 9 | everyone, that no one had ever done this before? |
| 10 | involved degree of process and spontaneous | 10 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
| 11 | process used, various techniques used in making | 11 | A. I'm not aware of his deposition. |
| 12 | these paintings. | 12 | Q. You haven't read his deposition? |
| 13 | So it's quite sort of a spontaneous | 13 | A. No. |
| 14 | way of working with various techniques to create | 14 | (Interruption by reporter.) |
| 15 | a single final image is a new way for him to | 15 | (Discussion off the record.) |
| 16 | work. | 16 | BY MR. BROOKS: |
| 17 | And as I said, whereby much of what | 17 | Q. Look at the third page of |
| 18 | shows up on the surface is incidental to the | 18 | Exhibit 31. This again is something you wrote, |
| 19 | process, meaning that a number of things | 19 | correct? |
| 20 | happened in the process of him working. | 20 | A. Yes. |
| 21 | You know, we're speaking about the | 21 | Q. When you said -- I'm going to read |
| 22 | spontaneity of the paint that's used and so on. | 22 | what you said here, the second sentence. |
| 23 | Q. And this is something he had never | 23 | Mining images from mass media, |
| 24 | done before? | 124 | advertising and entertainment since the |
| 25 | A. Not to my knowledge. | 25 | late '70s, Prince has redefined the |
|  | 54 |  | 56 |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Neri |
| 2 | Q. Did you ask him if he had ever done | 2 | concepts of authorship, ownership, and |
| 3 | it before? | 3 | aura. |
| 4 | A. He volunteered that. | 4 | Do you see that? |
| 5 | Q. That he had never done it before? | 5 | A. Yes. |
| 6 | A. Mm-hmm. | 6 | Q. What did you mean that he has |
| 7 | Q. Did he tell you no one has ever done | 7 | redefined the concepts of -- let's take them one |
| 8 | it before also? | 8 | by one, authorship? |
| 9 | MS. BART: But the words -- | 9 | MR. HAYES: Objection to form, by |
| 10 | MR. BROOKS: No, no, I'm asking her | 10 | the way. |
| 11 | what he told -- | 11 | MS. BART: Join. |
| 12 | MS. BART: I know, but her words -- | 12 | MR. BROOKS: What's the objection? |
| 13 | MR. BROOKS: No, I'm asking her -- | 13 | MR. HAYES: Because you're saying |
| 14 | please don't coach. | 14 | you're taking it one by one and we haven't |
| 15 | MS. BART: I'm not coaching. She | 15 | established with the witness that they're |
| 16 | doesn't need coaching, Mr. Brooks. | 16 | separate concepts. |
| 17 | BY MR. BROOKS: | 17 | In other words, she could be writing |
| 18 | Q. Did he tell you that no one had ever | 18 | this saying -- |
| 19 | done it that way before? | 19 | MR. BROOKS: All right. We don't |
| 20 | A. No. | 20 | need coaching. |
| 21 | MS. BART: And that's not what she | 21 | MR. HAYES: There's no coaching. |
| 22 | wrote. | 22 | MS. BART: The witness doesn't need |
| 23 | MR. BROOKS: I know she didn't. | 23 | coaching. |
| 24 | BY MR. BROOKS: | 24 | MR. HAYES: You asked me what the |
| 25 | Q. He just said he's the only one, it's | 25 | basis of the objection was. I'll tell |


|  | 57 |  | 59 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Neri |
| 2 | you. Do you want the basis of the | 2 | Q. What did you mean in this case with |
| 3 | objection or not? | 3 | respect to Mr. Prince that he had redefined |
| 4 | MR. BROOKS: No. | 4 | ownership, the concept of ownership? |
| 5 | MR. HAYES: Well, then why did you | 5 | MR. HAYES: Form objection. |
| 6 | ask? | 6 | MS. BART: Join. |
| 7 | MR. BROOKS: Because it seemed like | 7 | And asked and answered. |
| 8 | a ridiculous objection. | 8 | Q. You can answer. |
| 9 | MR. HAYES: No, because it's a | 9 | A. He challenged and expanded them. |
| 10 | statement obviously that can be connected. | 10 | Q. Meaning? |
| 11 | You're breaking it up -- | 11 | A. In his own use, in his own practice |
| 12 | MR. BROOKS: Well, it's up to her to | 12 | of mining images from other sources. |
| 13 | say, not you. | 13 | Q. So he took other people's images, |
| 14 | BY MR. BROOKS: | 14 | right? |
| 15 | Q. What did you mean when you said he | 15 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 16 | has redefined the concept of authorship? | 16 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
| 17 | Did you mean anything by that? | 17 | Q. That's what you mean? |
| 18 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 18 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 19 | Q. You can answer. | 19 | A. No, he took -- I wouldn't say other |
| 20 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 20 | people's images. He took images from mass |
| 21 | MS. BART: It was just asked being | 21 | media, advertising and entertainment. |
| 22 | hostile. | 22 | Q. What about the Brooke Shields |
| 23 | A. I used the three terms together, | 23 | photograph Spiritual America? |
| 24 | authorship, ownership, and aura. | 24 | MS. BART: It's not a question. |
| 25 | MR. BROOKS: Thank you, Mr. Hayes. | 25 | There's no question. |
|  | 58 |  | 60 |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Neri |
| 2 | MS. BART: Let her finish, please. | 2 | Q. Did he take that? |
| 3 | A. I wrote it, so I'm telling you what | 3 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 4 | 1 wrote. | 4 | MR. HAYES: Form. |
| 5 | Q. Okay, so tell me what you meant. | 5 | Q. You can answer. |
| 6 | A. That he redefined the concepts of | 6 | A. I can't give you an accurate answer. |
| 7 | authorship, ownership, and aura because these | 7 | Q. Did you ever hear of Gary Gross? |
| 8 | are the three tenets and primary concepts that | 8 | A. Yes. |
| 9 | have defined a work of art up until the late | 9 | Q. Who is he? |
| 10 | modernist period. | 10 | A. Photographer. |
| 11 | And Prince belongs to a generation, | 11 | Q. And he's the one who took the |
| 12 | which, by the way, began many years before even | 12 | picture of Brooke Shields, right? |
| 13 | with Picasso, who began to push at the | 13 | A. Yes. |
| 14 | boundaries of what those values could mean | 14 | Q. When she was ten, correct? |
| 15 | basically. | 15 | A. Yes. |
| 16 | Q. What does ownership mean? | 16 | Q. And Mr. Prince rephotographed that |
| 17 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 17 | same photograph, right? |
| 18 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 18 | MS. BART: Objection, form. |
| 19 | Q. As you used it? | 19 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. |
| 20 | MS. BART: Same. | 20 | Q. Correct? |
| 21 | A. The most general, the most general | 21 | MS. BART: Form. |
| 22 | definition of ownership, you know, to own the | 22 | A. I can't remember. |
| 23 | rights, to own the property, and to own, you | 23 | Q. You don't know? |
| 24 | know, let's say the soul of an image or an | 24 | A. I can't give you an accurate |
| 25 | object. | 25 | response. |


|  | 61 |  | 63 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Neri |
| 2 | Q. Okay. But is that an example of | 2 | you're badgering the witness. |
| 3 | redefining the concepts of authorship and | 3 | RL MR. BROOKS: Just mark that. |
| 4 | ownership and aura? | 4 | BY MR. BROOKS: |
| 5 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 5 | Q. When you had your discussion with |
| 6 | MR. HAYES: Form. | 6 | Mr. Prince did you discuss with him where he |
| 7 | Q. Is that? | 7 | obtained the various images that are in the |
| 8 | MS. BART: And badgering. | 8 | Canal Zone paintings? |
| 9 | Q. You can answer. | 9 | A. No. |
| 10 | MS. BART: Objection, form, and | 10 | Q. You didn't ask him? |
| 11 | badgering. | 11 | A. No. |
| 12 | Q. You can answer. | 12 | Q. He didn't tell you? |
| 13 | A. It's an example of the challenge, | 13 | A. I didn't ask him. |
| 14 | yes. | 14 | Q. Well, he could have told you without |
| 15 | Q. And how about when he rephotographed | 15 | being asked, did he? |
| 16 | the Marlboro -- are you aware of that, the | 16 | A. No. |
| 17 | Marlboro Cowboy photos? | 17 | MR. BROOKS: Give me a few minutes |
| 18 | A. Yes. | 18 | and I'll see if I'm finished. |
| 19 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 19 | (Recess taken: 5:06 p.m.) |
| 20 | Q. You're aware he rephotographed | 20 | (Proceedings resumed: 5:17 p.m.) |
| 21 | those? | 21 | MR. BROOKS: I have no further |
| 22 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 22 | questions. Thank you very much. |
| 23 | Q. Yes? | 23 | MR. HAYES: I have no questions. |
| 24 | A. Yes. | 24 | MR. SHERMAN: I have no questions. |
| 25 | Q. And is that an example of redefining | 25 | MS. BART: Thank you. |
|  | 62 |  | 64 |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Neri |
| 2 | the concepts of authorship, ownership, and aura? | 2 | MR. HAYES: Thank you. |
| 3 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 3 | (Time noted: 5:17 p.m.) |
| 4 | Q. You can answer. | 4 |  |
| 5 | A. Yes. | 5 |  |
| 6 | Q. And when he took the covers from the | 6 | LOUISE NERI |
| 7 | nurse books, created those paintings, is that | 7 |  |
| 8 | another example of redefining the concepts of | 8 | Subscribed and sworn to |
| 9 | authorship, ownership, and aura? | 9 | before me this ___ day |
| 10 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 10 | of __, 2009. |
| 11 | MS. BART: Objection, form. | 11 |  |
| 12 | A. A different concept altogether. | $h 2$ |  |
| 13 | Q. How is it different? | 13 |  |
| 14 | A. Completely - I mean a different way | 14 |  |
| 15 | of working with material. And there was no | 15 |  |
| 16 | rephotography involved. | 16 |  |
| 17 | Q. Well, there can be appropriation | 17 |  |
| 18 | without rephotography, correct, in this day of | 18 |  |
| 19 | computers? | 19 |  |
| 20 | MS. BART: I'm not going to -- no, | 20 |  |
| 21 | we're not going to have her answer. She's | 21 |  |
| 22 | not here as an expert witness on | 22 |  |
| 23 | appropriation art. | 23 |  |
| 24 | I've given you a certain amount of | 24 |  |
| 25 | leeway, but this has gone too far and | 25 |  |

## A-1502

|  | 65 |  | 67 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | DEPOSITION ERRATA SHEET |
| 2 | CERTIFICATE | 2 | RE: Esquire Deposition Solutions |
| 3 |  | 3 | File No. 13829 |
| 4 | STATE OF NEW YORK ) | 4 | Case Caption: PATRICK CARIOU |
| 5 | )ss: | 5 | vs. RICHARD PRINCE |
| 6 | COUNTY OF NEW YORK) | 6 | Deponent: LOUISE NERI |
| 7 |  | 7 | Deposition Date: December 17, 2009 |
| 8 | I, BRYAN NILSEN, a Notary Public | 8 | To the Reporter: |
| 9 | within and for the State of New York, do | 9 | I have read the entire transcript of my Deposition taken |
| 10 | hereby certify: | 10 | in the captioned matter or the same has been read to me. |
| 11 | That LOUISE NERI, the witness whose | 11 | 1 request that the following changes be entered upon the |
| 12 | deposition is hereinbefore set forth, was | 12 | record for the reasons indicated. I have signed my name to |
| 13 | duly sworn by me and that such deposition | 13 | the Errata Sheet and the appropriate Certificate and |
| 14 | is a true record of the testimony given by | 14 | authorize you to attach both to the original transcript. |
| 15 | such witness. | 15 |  |
| 16 | I further certify that I am not | $16$ | Page No.___Line No.___Change to: |
| 17 | related to any of the parties to this | 17 | Page No.__Lme No.__Change to. |
| 18 | action by blood or marriage and that I am | 18 | Reason for change: |
| 19 | in no way interested in the outcome of | 18 | Reason for change: $\quad$ Page No. Line No. Change to: |
| 20 | this matter. | 19 | Page No. $\qquad$ Line No. $\qquad$ Change to: |
| 21 | IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto | 20 |  |
| 22 | set my hand this ___ day of ___ , 2009. | 21 | Reason for change: |
| 23 |  | 22 | Page No.___Line No.___Change to: |
| 24 |  | 23 |  |
|  | BRYAN NILSEN, RPR | 24 | Reason for change: |
| 25 |  | 25 |  |
|  | 66 |  | 68 |
| 1 | Neri | 1 | Deposition of LOUISE NERI |
| 2 | -------------------------------1 | 2 |  |
| 3 | WITNESS EXAMINATION BY PAGE | 3 | Page No. ___ Line No.___Change to: |
| 4 | LOUISE NERI MR. BROOKS............... 6 | 4 |  |
| 5 |  | 5 | Reason for change: |
| 6 |  | 6 | Page No.___Line No. ___Change to: |
| 7 |  | 7 |  |
| 8 | ------------- INFORMATION REQUESTS ----------- | 8 | Reason for change: |
| 9 | RULINGS: page 63 | 9 | Page No. ___ Line No. ___Change to: |
| 10 |  | 10 |  |
| 11 |  | 11 | Reason for change: |
| 12 |  | 12 | Page No.___Line No.___Change to: |
| 13 | ------------------ EXHIBITS ----------------- | 13 |  |
| 14 | PLAINTIFF'S FOR ID. | 14 | Reason for change: |
| 15 | 106 E-mail with pitch attachment............ 9 | 15 | Page No.___Line No.___Change to: |
| 16 | 107 Two pages from Yes Rasta............... 28 | 16 |  |
| 17 | 108 Photocopy of two pages from Yes Rasta... 37 | 17 | Reason for change: |
| 18 | 109 Copy of photograph.................... 46 | 18 | Page No.___Line No.___Change to: |
| 19 |  | 19 |  |
| 20 | ** EXHIBITS RETAINED BY COUNSEL ** | 20 | Reason for change: |
| 21 |  | 21 |  |
| 22 |  | 22 |  |
| 23 |  | 23 |  |
| 24 |  | 24 | SIGNATURE: __ DATE: |
| 25 |  | 25 | LOUISE NERI |

Condensed Transcript

## UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT <br> SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

PATRICK CARIOU,
Plaintiff,
vs.
Index No.: 08 CIV 11327 (DAB)
RICHARD PRINCE, GAGOSIAN
GALLERY, INC., LAWRENCE
GAGOSIAN, and RIZZOLI
INTERNATIONAL PUBLICATIONS, INC.,

Defendants.

## DEPOSITION OF <br> PATRICK CARIOU

Tuesday, January 12, 2010
New York, New York

Reported by:
Bryan Nilsen, RPR

|  | ```1 Cariou UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK patrick Cariou, Plaintiff, Index No.: ve. richard prince, gagosian GALLERY, INC., LAWRENCE GAGOSIAN, and RIZZOLI international publications, INC., \\ Defendants. \\ deposition of patrick cariou New York, New York Tuesday, January 12, 2010 \\ Reported by: \\ Bryan Nilsen, RPR \\ JOB NO. 306677``` | 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 14 15 16 17 18 18 19 20 21 | Cariou <br> APPEARANCES: <br> SCHNADER HARRISON SEGAL \& LEWIS LLP <br> Attorneys for Plaintiff 140 Broadway, Suite 3100 <br> New York, New York 10005-1101 <br> BY: DANIEL J. BROOKS, ESQ. <br> BY: ERIC A. BODEN, ESQ. <br> PHONE: (212)973-8000 <br> EMAIL: dbrooks@schnader.com <br> WITHERS BERGMAN LLP <br> Attorneys for Defendants Gagosian Gallery, Inc., and Lawrence Gagosian 430 Park Avenue, 10th Floor New York, New York 10022-3505 <br> BY: HOLLIS GONERKA BART, ESQ. <br> BY: DARA HAMMERMAN, ESQ. <br> PHONE: (212)848-9800 <br> EMAIL: hollis.bart@withers.us.com |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 2 |  | 4 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 |  | 2 | APPEARANCES (Cont'd.) |
| 3 |  | 3 |  |
| 4 |  | 4 | HANLY CONROY BIERSTEIN SHERIDAN FISHER \& HAYES LLP |
| 5 |  | 5 | Attorneys for Defendant Richard Prince |
| 6 | January 12, 2010 | 6 | 112 Madison Avenue |
| 7 | 10:00 a.m. | 7 | New York, New York 10016-7416 |
| 8 |  | 8 | BY: STEVEN M. HAYES, ESQ. |
| 9 |  | 9 | PHONE: (212)784-6400 |
| 10 | Deposition of PATRICK CARIOU, held | 10 | EMAIL: shayes@hanlyconroy.com |
| 11 | at the offices of Withers Bergman, LLP, | 11 |  |
| 12 | 430 Park Avenue, New York, New York, | 12 | WEISMANN CELLER SPETT \& MODLIN P.C. |
| 13 | pursuant to Notice and Agreement, before | 13 | Attorneys for Defendant Rizzoli International |
| 14 | Bryan Nilsen, RPR, a Notary Public of | 14 | Publications, Inc. |
| 15 | the State of New York. | 15 | 445 Park Avenue, No. 1500 |
| 16 |  | 16 | New York, New York 10022 |
| 17 |  | 17 | BY: JOHN B. SHERMAN, ESQ. |
| 18 |  | 18 | PHONE: (212)371-5400 |
| 19 |  | 19 | EMAlL: jsherman@wcsm445.com |
| 20 |  | 20 |  |
| 21 |  | 21 |  |
| 22 |  | 22 |  |
| 23 |  | 23 |  |
| 24 |  | 24 |  |
| 25 |  | 25 |  |

Toll Free: 800.944.9454 Facsimile: 212.557.5972

|  | 5 |  | 7 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 |  | 2 | Q. And you're also a full-time resident |
| 3 |  | 3 | of Paris? |
| 4 | IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, by and among the attomeys for the | 4 | A. Yes. |
| 5 |  | 5 | Q. And do you consider French to be |
| 6 | respective parties herein, that filing and | 6 | your native language? |
| 7 | sealing be and the same are hereby waived. | 7 | A. Yes. |
| 8 | IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED | 8 | Q. And your attorney has told us that |
| 9 |  | 9 | you speak English fluently, is that correct? |
| 10 | that all objections, except as to the form | 10 | MR. BROOKS: Objection. |
| 11 | of the question, shall be reserved to the | 11 | A. I speak English. Fluently is |
| 12 | time of the trial. | 12 | another matter. |
| 13 | IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED | 13 | Q. Okay. Well, he's also told us that |
| 14 |  | 14 | you do not need a translator for purposes of |
| 15 | that the within deposition may be swom to | 15 | this deposition, is that correct? |
| 16 | and signed before any officer authorized | 16 | A. Yes, that is correct. |
| 17 | to administer an oath, with the same force | 17 | Q. And you're prepared to proceed in |
| 18 | and effect as if signed and swom to | 18 | the English language without a translator? |
| 19 | before the Court | 19 | A. Absolutely. |
| 20 |  | 20 | Q. Of course, you know, if I ask you a |
| 21 |  | 21 | question that you don't understand, please let |
| 22 |  | 22 | me know. |
| 23 |  | 23 | A. Sure. |
| 24 |  | 24 | Q. Otherwise we're going to presume |
| 25 |  | 25 | that if l've asked a question and you've |
|  | 6 | 8 |  |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | PATRICK CARIOU, called as a | 2 | answered it you understood the question that was |
| 3 | witness, having been duly swom by a | 3 | being posed to you? |
| 4 | Notary Public, was examined and testified | 4 | A. Okay, no problem. |
| 5 | as follows: | 5 | Q. Now, you heard in the depositions |
| 6 | THE COURT REPORTER: Please state | 6 | that you've attended previously in this case for |
| 7 | your name and address for the record. | 7 | Mr. Prince and Mr. Gagosian that the court |
| 8 | THE WITNESS: Patrick Cariou, | 8 | reporter needs to take down every word that's |
| 9 | C-A-R-I-O-U, 4 Rue De La Chaise -- Rue is | 9 | said? |
| 10 | R-U-E, then De, D-E, La, L-A, Chaise is | 10 | A. Mm-hmm. |
| 11 | C-H-A-I-S-E, Paris, France. | 11 | Q. So I would appreciate it if you |
| 12 | EXAMINATION BY | 12 | would let me ask the complete sentence before |
| 13 | MS. BART: | 13 | you answer. This will also give Mr. Brooks an |
| 14 | Q. Good moming, Mr. Cariou. We've met | 14 | opportunity to object if he sees fit. |
| 15 | before, but just for the record my name is | 15 | As a matter of housekeeping, under |
| 16 | Hollis Gonerka Bart, and I represent Gagosian | 16 | the federal rules, each of the defendants' |
| 17 | Gallery and Larry Gagosian. | 17 | counsel, each of the defendants gets a total of |
| 18 | And with me today is Steve Hayes who | 18 | seven hours to conduct their examination of you, |
| 19 | represents Richard Prince, and also John Sherman who represents Rizzoli Bookstore. I'm also | 19 | and that's total testimony time. |
| 20 |  | 20 | To try to make this as easy on |
| 21 | who represents Rizzoli Bookstore. I'm also accompanied by my colleague Dara Hammerman who | 21 | everyone as possible, the defense counsel has |
| 22 | also represents the Gagosian defendants. | 22 | agreed among ourselves that Withers Bergman |
| 23 | Do I understand correctly from your | 23 | would take the lead in this deposition, however, |
| 24 | papers that you are a French citizen? | 24 | the defense counsel will reserve their right to |
| 25 | A. Yeah. | 25 | ask additional questions, and we're going to |

Suite 4715
One Penn Plaza
New York, NY 10119
www.esquiresolutions.com

|  | 9 |  | 11 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | just do it as a combined total of the time. | 2 | least the last page. |
| 3 | I'm hoping we can get this done in a | 3 | (Discussion off the record.) |
| 4 | day if we all work together. | 4 | MS. BART: Can we, just for purposes |
| 5 | A. Okay. | 5 | of the record, add this. |
| 6 | MR. BROOKS: Just note my objection | 6 | BYMS. BART: |
| 7 | or disagreement with that statement. | 7 | Q. Mr. Cariou, I'm handing you what's |
| 8 | I believe you're entitled to a total | 8 | been marked as Defendant's Exhibit 1, which is a |
| 9 | of seven hours, but let's proceed. | 9 | copy of the amended complaint that's been filed |
| 10 | MS. BART: Not when there's | 10 | in this case. |
| 11 | different defendants with different | 11 | Have you seen this document before? |
| 12 | interests. | 12 | A. Yes. |
| 13 | MR. BROOKS: I don't agree. You | 13 | Q. Did you read it before it was filed? |
| 14 | have the same interest and you have seven | 14 | A. Yes, I did. |
| 15 | hours, but go ahead. | 15 | Q. And did you satisfy yourself that |
| 16 | MS. BART: Again, we're trying to | 16 | all of the allegations in the amended complaint |
| 17 | do this to avoid asking duplicative | 17 | are accurate? |
| 18 | questions. | 18 | A. Yes. |
| 19 | MR. BROOKS: I understand. | 19 | Q. And looking at it today is there |
| 20 | BY MS. BART: | 20 | anything in that complaint that you feel you |
| 21 | Q. Now, just to make sure that you and | 21 | would want to state differently or would change? |
| 22 | I are talking about the same thing, I'm going to | 22 | A. Well, I haven't read it for a while |
| 23 | be talking to you about the images which appear | 23 | to be honest with you. So that will take me the |
| 24 | in the Yes Rasta book, which has been previously | 24 | reading in order to answer your question |
| 25 | marked as Plaintiff's Exhibit 41. | 25 | properly. |
|  | 10 |  | 12 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | And when I refer to the Yes Rasta | 2 | Q. Perhaps you could do that on a break |
| 3 | images I am referring to the reproductions of | 3 | and let us know if there is anything. But for |
| 4 | the photographs that you took which appear in | 4 | now we'll assume that the complaint was accurate |
| 5 | the book Yes Rasta, is that acceptable? | 5 | when it was filed and that it's still accurate |
| 6 | A. Yes, absolutely. | 6 | today. Is that acceptable to you? |
| 7 | Q. The Yes Rasta images. | 7 | A. Okay. |
| 8 | And then you've also seen the book | 8 | Q. Now, according to your complaint |
| 9 | Canal Zone. You've seen also the images of the | 9 | you are the sole owner of the copyrights in the |
| 10 | Canal Zone book? | 10 | Yes Rasta images, is that correct? |
| 11 | A. Yeah. | 11 | A. Yes, it is correct. |
| 12 | Q. And so we'll refer to those works of | 12 | Q. And it was filed as a compilation |
| 13 | art as the Canal Zone paintings, and those refer | 13 | copyright registration? |
| 14 | to the works of art by Mr. Prince, is that | 14 | A. Absolutely. |
| 15 | acceptable? | 15 | MS. BART: I'd like to mark as |
| 16 | A. Okay. | 16 | Defendant's Exhibit 2 a copy of the |
| 17 | MS. BART: I'd like to mark as | 17 | certificate of copyright registration |
| 18 | Defendant's Exhibit 1 a copy of the | 18 | dated November 5th, 2001. |
| 19 | amended complaint that's been filed in | 19 | (Defendant's Exhibit 2, copyright |
| 20 | this case on January 14th, 2009. | 20 | registration dated November 5, 2001, was |
| 21 | (Defendant's Exhibit 1, amended | 21 | marked for identification, as of this |
| 22 | complaint dated January 14, 2009, was | 22 | date.) |
| 23 | marked for identification, as of this | 23 | MS. BART: I'll just ask the court |
| 24 | date.) | 24 | reporter to hand it to the witness. |
| 25 | MR. BROOKS: My copy is missing at | 25 | THE WITNESS: Thank you. |


| 13 |  |  | 15 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Cariou |  | 1 | riou |
| 2 | BYMS. BART: | 2 | MS. BART: Mr. Brooks, don't |
| Q. Mr. Cariou, you have that document |  | 3 | to me in that tone or tenor. Let's keep |
| 4 | in front of you? | 4 | it civil today. |
|  | A. Yes. | 5 | And second of all, I want to say |
| 5 | Q. Is this the copyright registration | 6 | that all we're trying to do is to |
| 7 | that was filed in respect of the Yes Rasta | 7 | understand his theory of his claims, |
| 8 | images? | 8 | not your theory. |
|  | A. Yes, itis. | 9 | MR. BROOKS: He's not a lawyer. |
| O | Q. And is this the only copyright | 10 | MS. BART: I'm not asking him to be |
| 10 | registration that's been filed for the Yes Rasta images? | 11 | a lawyer. |
| $1 \begin{aligned} & 12 \\ & 13\end{aligned}$ |  | 12 | MR. BROOKS: It's improper. |
|  | A. Yes, it is. | 13 | MS. BART: No, it's not. I'm trying |
| 14 | Q. Going back to your complaint and the claims that you've alleged in this case, can you | 24 | to understand what his claims in this case |
|  |  | 15 |  |
| 16 | tell us please in your own words why you believe you have a claim against Richard Prince in | 16 | BYMS. BART: |
| 178 |  | 17 | Q. Mr. Cariou, will you please tum to |
|  | respect of the Yes Rasta images? | 18 | paragraph 18 of your amended complaint, and if |
| 19 | MR. BROOKS: Object to the form, | 19 | you would go to the portion that's on page 6? |
| 20 |  | 20 | A. Yeah. |
| 21 | MS. BART: No, it's in his own | 21 | Q. About five or six lines down it |
|  | words. This isn't a legal form. This is | 22 | says - there's a dash there and it says Prince |
| 22 23 | not legal. | 23 | copied the photographs in various ways, |
| $\begin{aligned} & 23 \\ & 24 \end{aligned}$ | MR. BROOKS: Subject to my objection | 24 | including by scanning them and printing them |
| $\begin{aligned} & 24 \\ & 25 \end{aligned}$ | you can answer. | 25 | directly onto the base canvas of the paintings. |
|  | 14 |  | 16 |
|  | Cariou | 1 | Cario |
|  | A. It's a simple fact Mr. Prince used | 2 | A. Yeah. |
|  | over 30 of my pictures in his Canal Zone | 3 | Q. Is that why you believe you have a |
| 4 | artwork. | 4 | claim against Mr. Prince for copyright |
|  | Q. And it is simply in your view the | 5 | infringement? |
| 6 | use of those works of art or portions of them in | 6 | MR. BROOKS: Object to the form |
| 7 | the Canal Zone paintings that gives rise to your | 7 | Q. You can answer the question. |
| 8 | claim? | 8 | A. Yeah. |
| 9 | MR. BROOKS: Object to the form, | 9 | MR. BROOKS: Limited to that one |
| 10 | calls for a legal conclusion. He's not | 10 | sentence? Object to the form. |
| 11 | competent to answer that. | 11 | MS. BART: We have his answer as |
| 12 | MS. BART: I'm just asking him -- | 12 | yes? Did you get that down, please. |
| 13 | MR. BROOKS: It also misrepresents | 13 | BY MS. BART: |
| 14 | what's in the complaint. That's not all | 14 | Q. Is there anything else that |
| 15 | that's alleged in the complaint. | 15 | Mr. Prince did to the Yes Rasta or with the |
| 16 | MS. BART: Well, let's look at the | 16 | Yes Rasta images that you believe entitles you |
| 17 | complaint then. | 17 | to receive damages from him in this case? |
| 18 | MR. BROOKS: That would be a better | 18 | MR. BROOKS: Objection, calls for a |
| 19 | way to proceed. | 19 | legal conclusion. And I'm going to direct |
| 20 | MS. BART: Don't tell me how to run | 20 | him not to answer anymore questions about |
| 21 | my deposition. | ${ }^{21}$ | law. Okay? |
| 22 | MR. BROOKS: I'm going to tell you. | 22 | MS. BART: I'm not. I'm asking |
| 23 | If you ask objectionable questions I'm | 23 | him - |
| 24 | going to tell you, and l just did. | 24 | MR. BROOKS: Just like you did when |
| 25 | So move on. | 25 | Itried to ask your client and Mr. Prince |


| 17 |  | 19 |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | Cariou |  |  |
| 2 | questions. | 2 |  | question. |
| 3 | MS. BART: You didn't ask that | 3 |  | MS. BART: I think this is wholly |
| 4 | question. | 4 |  | proper. |
| 5 | MR. BROOKS: No, I didn't ask that | 5 |  | MR. BROOKS: Move on. You can go to |
| 6 | question. I asked what's original about | 6 |  | the judge. He's not answering that |
| 7 | this and you directed him not to answer. | 7 |  | question. |
| 8 | You can take it up with the judge. | 8 |  | MS. BART: Why not? |
| 9 | I'm not going to have a lay witness | 9 |  | MR. BROOKS: He's a layman. It |
| 10 | sitting here arguing with you about | 10 |  | doesn't matter what he thinks. The facts |
| 11 | copyright law. | 11 |  | are the facts. His photos were copied. |
| 12 | MR. HAYES: We're entitled to get | 12 |  | The judge will decide whether there's a |
| 13 | his understanding of what he says was done | 13 |  | claim for copyright infringement. |
| 14 | wrong. That's all we're asking for, his | 14 |  | MR. HAYES: Again, he's a percipient |
| 15 | understanding. We're entitled to it. | 15 |  | witness who is a man who has a claim. |
| 16 | MS. BART: His understanding. It's | 16 |  | We are entitled to get his statement |
| 17 | not a legal conclusion. | 17 |  | about what he says was done. We are |
| 18 | MR. BROOKS: He already answered. | 18 |  | entitled to that. |
| 19 | He said he copied over 30 of his photos. | 19 |  | MS. BART: Yes, we are. |
| 20 | MR. HAYES: And we asked is there | 20 |  | MR. BROOKS: He said Mr. Prince |
| 21 | anything else. | 21 |  | copied over 30 of his photographs. |
| 22 | MS. BART: Right. That's all I did. | 22 |  | MS. BART: Then I asked is that it, |
| 23 | MR. BROOKS: That's objectionable. | 23 |  | and -- |
| 24 | MS. BART: And you objected and said | 24 |  | MR. BROOKS: No, that's improper. |
| 25 | go to the complaint, so I went to the part | 25 |  | There are also newspaper ads, there's a |
|  | 18 |  |  | 20 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 |  | Cariou |
| 2 | of the complaint that says you copied. | 2 |  | book, the Canal Zone book. It's improper. |
| 3 | MR. BROOKS: That's not the only | 3 |  | You're trying to trick him into limiting |
| 4 | part of the complaint. You selected that | 4 |  | it to one little thing. |
| 5 | one phrase. There are many parts of the | 5 |  | The complaint talks about the Canal |
| 6 | complaint that say other things that were | 6 |  | Zone book, it talks about newspaper |
| 7 | copied and done improperly. | 7 |  | advertisements, it talks about having it |
| 8 | MS. BART: Mr. Brooks - | 8 |  | on a website, it talks about all kinds |
| 9 | MR. BROOKS: So it's misleading. | 9 |  | of - |
| 10 | MS. BART: I just started the | 10 |  | MS. BART: Those are all copied. |
| 11 | examination, which you've now interrupted | 11 |  | MR. BROOKS: Yes, but you're trying |
| 12 | probably more than l've gotten out on the | 12 |  | to limit it now to one thing about |
| 13 | record. Can we continue? | 13 |  | scanning it onto a canvas. It's |
| 14 | BY MS. BART: | 14 |  | misleading, it's improper, and I'm not |
| 15 | Q. Mr. Cariou, we're not asking you for | 15 |  | going to let him answer - |
| 16 | a legal conclusion. We're only asking you for | 16 |  | MS. BART: Enough of the speeches. |
| 17 | why you believe that there is -- why you believe | 17 |  | MR. BROOKS: If you want to ask a |
| 18 | that you're entitled to damages from Mr. Prince | 18 |  | specific question about what's in the |
| 19 | by reason of his use of some or portions of the | 19 |  | complaint, go ahead. |
| 20 | Yes Rasta images. | 20 |  | Unlike your clients, he read the |
| 21 | Just why you think - like if you | 21 |  | complaint. |
| 22 | were telling a friend, what would you tell your | 22 | MO | MS. BART: Move to strike. It's |
| 23 | friend? | 23 |  | just highly improper and unprofessional. |
| 24 | MR. BROOKS: No, no, no. I direct | 24 |  | MR. BROOKS: It's unprofessional not |
| 25 | him not to answer. Try to ask a proper | 25 |  | to show your clients their own answer. |


| 21 |  | 23 |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 |  | Cariou |
| 2 | It's absurd. Both of you. | 2 |  | MR. BROOKS: He arready explained |
| 3 | MS. BART: Are you done with the | 3 |  | Mr . Prince copied his photos. |
| 4 | speech now, Mr. Brooks? | 4 |  | MS. BART: Don't coach him. |
| 5 | MR. BROOKS: I'm ready for your next | 5 |  | MR. BROOKS: I'm not coaching him. |
| 6 | question. | 6 |  | He already said that. |
| 7 | MS. BART: No, we're asking him -- | 7 |  | MS. BART: Does that apply for every |
| 8 | BY MS. BART: | 8 |  | one? |
| 9 | Q. Your attorney has said that your | 9 |  | MR. BROOKS: He's not a law |
| 10 | view is that the basis for your claims against | 10 |  | professor or a lawyer. |
| 11 | Richard Prince in this case are for copying of | 11 |  | MS. BART: I'm not trying to turn |
| 12 | the Yes Rasta images, is that my understanding? | 12 |  | him into - |
| 13 | A. Yes. | 13 |  | MR. BROOKS: Whether that gives rise |
| 14 | Q. And while there may be various forms | 14 |  | to claim under the copyright act, maybe it |
| 15 | of copying which appears, or reproduction which | 15 |  | doesn't. That's not for him to know or |
| 16 | appears throughout your complaint, which we had | 16 |  | decide. It's for the judge and the jury |
| 17 | not gotten to because of his interruptions, it | 17 |  | to decide. Go to Judge Batts if you think |
| 18 | is certainly the same - it rises out of what | 18 |  | I'm wrong. |
| 19 | you believe to be improper copying, scanning of | 19 |  | MS. BART: I think we might do that. |
| 20 | images onto the canvas as alleged in your | 20 |  | MR. BROOKS: Go ahead. |
| 21 | complaint, correct? | 21 |  | Q MS. BART: Would you kindly certify |
| 22 | A. Yeah. | 22 |  | this line of questions, please? |
| 23 | MR. BROOKS: The complaint also says | 23 |  | I think it's highly proper for us - |
| 24 | it was exhibited, offered for sale, sold. | 24 |  | MR. BROOKS: Totally improper. |
| 25 | Those are all acts of infringement. | 25 |  | Absurd. |
|  | 22 |  |  | 24 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 |  | Cariou |
| 2 | MS. BART: And we've also | 2 |  | MS. BART: I believe its |
| 3 | established that this witness says that | 3 |  | completely - |
| 4 | this complaint when he read it was | 4 |  | MR. BROOKS: Okay. Move on to your |
| 5 | accurate. | 5 |  | next area. |
| 6 | MR. BROOKS: Fine. | 6 |  | MS. BART: Dan, let me finish my |
| 7 | MS. BART: So we're not trying to | 7 |  | statement for the record. We've endured |
| 8 | limit him. You think there's a trick | 8 |  | yours. |
| 9 | here, but there's no trick here, | 9 |  | It's totaily proper for us to have |
| 10 | Mr. Brooks. I'm just trying to get a | 10 |  | a full understanding of why this man, as |
| 11 | story out. | 11 |  | opposed to you, thinks he has a claim |
| 12 | We're entitled to know why this man | 12 |  | against our clients. |
| 13 | thinks he can sue our client. | 13 |  | MR. BROOKS: He aiready explained. |
| 14 | BY MS. BART: | 14 |  | MS. BART: |
| 15 | Q. So l'd like to ask you the same | 15 |  | Q. Now, when did you first become aware |
| 16 | question in your own words, not a legal | 16 |  | at portions, all or portions of the Yes Rasta |
| 17 | conclusion, but in your own words why do you | 17 |  | mages were used in some of the Canal Zone |
| 18 | believe that you have a claim against Gagosian | 18 |  | aintings? |
| 19 | Gallery? | 19 |  | A. Could you define portions, please, |
| 20 | MR. BROOKS: Objection. That calls | 20 |  | A cause I have a problem with that word. |
| 21 | for a legal conclusion. | 21 |  | Q. All right. We know that portions of |
| 22 | MR. HAYES: She's asking what he | 22 |  | e images, not all of the images were there - |
| 23 | believes. | 23 |  | A. Yes, all of the images. |
| 24 | MS. BART: It's just what he | 24 |  | Q. Well, how about if we say were any |
| 25 | believes. | 25 |  | your images used in any of the Canal Zone |

Toll Free: 800.944.9454
Facsimile: 212.557.5972

| 25 |  | 27 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | paintings, when did you first become aware of | 2 | complaint. And we represent him. How he |
| 3 | that? | 3 | found us is irrelevant. |
| 4 | A. I became aware of it I think in | 4 | MS. BART: How many more speeches |
| 5 | mid-November 2009 through an ad in the Art | 5 | are we going to have today? |
| 6 | Newspaper. | 6 | MR. BROOKS: Well, it's an improper |
| 7 | Q. And you saw the ad or did someone | 7 | question. |
| 8 | bring the ad to your attention? | 8 | MR. HAYES: Are you directing him |
| 9 | A. A friend of mine called me a bit | 9 | not to answer or no? |
| 10 | confused with the ad, asking me if I did a | 10 | MR. BROOKS: You can answer, over my |
| 11 | collaboration with Richard Prince, and I didn't | 11 | objection. She wants to know how you |
| 12 | know what he was talking about at the time. | 12 | found me. |
| 13 | And I went to his place and looked | 13 | A. A friend of mine recommended them |
| 14 | at the ad and was a bit surprised I must say. | 14 | and we got in contact, and that was it. |
| 15 | MR. BROOKS: Can I interject. He | 15 | Q. And who was the friend? |
| 16 | said 2009, is that what you meant? | 16 | A. My friend was - his name is Terry |
| 17 | A. 2008, sorry. | 17 | Daher, D-A-H-E-R. |
| 18 | MS. BART: Thank you. | 18 | Q. And does Mr. Daher live in New York? |
| 19 | BY MS. BART: | 19 | A. He lives in New York, mm-hmm. |
| 20 | Q. And who was this friend? | 20 | Q. And when you spoke with Mr. Daher |
| 21 | A. Francesco Solari. | 21 | was this - this is obviously after you had gone |
| 22 | Q. This was the person you listed in | 22 | on the website and seen -- |
| 23 | your initial disclosures, correct? | 23 | A. Yeah. |
| 24 | A. Yes. | 24 | Q. And what did you tell Mr. Daher you |
| 25 | Q. So after you went to his place what | 25 | needed? |
|  | 26 |  | 28 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | did you do next after making this discovery? | 2 | A. To go -- first thing I told him to |
| 3 | A. I went on the web and on the | 3 | go see the show. He went and was amazed by it |
| 4 | Gagosian website and looked at the Canal Zone | 4 | and told me that we had to do something. At |
| 5 | show and realized that the main subject of the | 5 | that particular moment I didn't know I was going |
| 6 | show was Rastas. | 6 | to have a lawsuit. I just - and he went and |
| 7 | Q. And therl what did you do? | 7 | told me that the Rastas were all over the |
| 8 | A. Then I started to make a few phone | 8 | paintings and that something should be done. |
| 9 | calls to friend in New York in order to know | 9 | Q. And did he take photographs when he |
| 10 | what to do and to find a lawyer. | 10 | went to the exhibit? |
| 11 | Q. And how was it that you came to find | 11 | A. No, I don't think so. |
| 12 | the Schnader Hamison firm? | 12 | Q. He just -- then he called you back? |
| 13 | MR. BROOKS: What's the relevance of | 13 | A. He called me back, yeah. |
| 14 | that? What's the relevance of it? | 14 | Q. And how do you know Terry Daher? |
| 15 | How did Prince find you? I mean | 15 | A. Well, he's an old friend of mine. |
| 16 | it's not relevant how he found me. | 16 | Q. Do you work with him? |
| 17 | MS. BART: I think I'm entitled to | 17 | A. No. |
| 18 | ask that question. | 18 | Q. Other than your counsel did you |
| 19 | MR. BROOKS: Why? Tell me why and I | 19 | speak to anyone else - anyone other than your |
| 20 | will let him answer. | 20 | counsel and Mr. Daher, did you speak to anyone |
| 21 | MS. BART: Because it's part of the | 21 | else at this time about the exhibition? |
| 22 | process of what he did to press his | 22 | A. I don't think so, no. |
| 23 | rights. | 23 | Q. And then the next thing you did was |
| 24 | MR. BROOKS: What he did to press | 24 | contact counsel -- |
| 25 | his rights is irrelevant. You've got the | 25 | A. Right. |


|  | 29 |  | 31 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | Q. - and then we have what's ensued? | 2 | your complaint appear in these images. I'm not |
| 3 | A. Yeah. | 3 | trying to trick you with these words, |
| 4 | MS. BART: Let's give him a copy of | 4 | Mr. Cariou. |
| 5 | Plaintiff's Exhibit 40. | 5 | A. No, no, I thought it was a bit funny |
| 6 | Q. Mr. Cariou, I'm handing you what's | 6 | though. |
| 7 | been marked as Plaintiff's Exhibit 40 in this | 7 | MR. BROOKS: No. Just answer the |
| 8 | lawsuit. Do you see this document? | 8 | question. |
| 9 | A. Yeah. | 9 | A. Yeah, yeah. |
| 10 | Q. And can you just tell us in your own | 10 | Q. And since you prepared this document |
| 11 | words what this document is? | 11 | have you found any other images that you believe |
| 12 | A. Well, it's a compilation of | 12 | are incorporated? |
| 13 | Mr. Prince's work and my work and the | 13 | A. Yes. |
| 14 | photographs he used in the Canal Zone show. | 14 | Q. And I'm going to hand you what's |
| 15 | Q. And who prepared this document? | 15 | been marked as -- previously been marked as |
| 16 | A. Me and a friend of mine in Paris. | 16 | Plaintiff's Exhibit 41. |
| 17 | Q. And who was that? | 17 | I only have one copy of this with |
| 18 | A. Philippe Le Bihan, L-E, B-I-H-A-N. | 18 | all the tabs, so we're going to have to kind of |
| 19 | Q. Did anyone else assist you? | 19 | work with it together. |
| 20 | A. No. | 20 | You'll see on the bottom - we |
| 21 | Q. Was this something that - and | 21 | talked about this before the deposition |
| 22 | I'm not trying to encroach at all on the | 22 | started - we've added numbers to the images |
| 23 | attorney/client privilege - but was this | 23 | that appear in the Yes Rasta book. |
| $24$ | something that Mr. Brooks asked you to do or was | 24 | Can you please give me the page |
| 25 | this something -- | 25 | numbers for the additional images that you say |
|  | 30 |  | 32 |
| 1 | Caniou | 1 | Caniou |
| 2 | MR. BROOKS: Wait. Hold on. That | 2 | appear in the Canal Zone paintings but which are |
| 3 | is encroaching. | 3 | not found in Plaintiff's Exhibit 40? |
| 4 | Don't answer that question. | 4 | A. In order to do that I will need a |
| 5 | If $l$ asked him to do something, we | 5 | printout of the painting called Canal Zone 2007 |
| 6 | had a conversation, that's a privileged | 6 | that l've never seen really. We used -- which |
| 7 | conversation. | 7 | is the first painting Mr. Prince did was showed |
| 8 | He's not going to answer. Go to the | 8 | in St. Barth's and has probably 20 pictures in |
| 9 | judge if you don't agree with me. He's | 9 | itself. If you show me that one -- |
| 10 | not going to ask him who told him to do | 10 | Q. You could mark a copy of that? |
| 11 | it. He's not going to testify about any | 11 | A. I could find the image. |
| 12 | conversations he had with me. | 12 | Q. All right. Why don't we get a copy |
| 13 | Q. Did you prepare this document with | 13 | of that at a break and then we'll come back to |
| 14 | the assistance of counsel? | 14 | that at the end of the sequence of questions, is |
| 15 | A. No. | 15 | that acceptable? |
| 16 | Q. So this is something you prepared | 16 | MR. BROOKS: It's a deposition |
| 17 | and then you provided it to your attorneys who | 17 | exhibit. |
| 18 | then provided it to us? | 18 | MS. BART: Right. I know. We're |
| 19 | A. Yes. | 19 | getting it. We don't have it in here. |
| 20 | Q. Plaintiff's Exhibit 40 represents | 20 | MR. BROOKS: Fine. Whatever. |
| 21 | the Yes Rasta images which you claim appear in | 21 | BY MS. BART: |
| 22 | some of the Canal Zone paintings, correct? | 22 | Q. I'd like to take you through the |
| 23 | A. That I claim appear? They do | 23 | images that appear in Plaintiff's Exhibit 40 |
| 24 | appear. | 24 | which you have shown to us. |
| 25 | Q. Well, a claim is what you say in | 25 | I'm going to hand you Plaintiff's |

Toll Free: 800.944.9454
Facsimile: 212.557.5972

|  | 33 |  | 35 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Caniou |
| 2 | Exhibit 41. | 2 | Q. And l've read that correctly? |
| 3 | A. So you want me to actually tell | 3 | A. Yeah. |
| 4 | you -- | 4 | Q. When did you first approach this - |
| 5 | Q. No, no, no. I just want you to have | 5 | MR. BROOKS: Hold on. He's not on |
| 6 | the book in front of you along with Plaintiff's | 6 | paragraph 16. |
| 7 | Exhibit 40. | 7 | MS. BART: Sure. No problem. |
| 8 | A. Okay. | 8 | BY MS. BART: |
| 9 | Q. I don't believe you told me, | 9 | Q. It's the first sentence. |
| 10 | approximately when did you prepare the document | 10 | A. Yeah, yeah. I got it. |
| 11 | that's been marked as Plaintiff's Exhibit 40? | 11 | Q. Right. |
| 12 | A. It must have been around February I | 12 | MS. BART: He had already agreed |
| 13 | would say. | 13 | that it was correct. |
| 14 | Q. Of 2009? | 14 | BY MS. BART: |
| 15 | A. Of 2009, yeah. | 15 | Q. When did you first approach this |
| 16 | Q. On the first page of Plaintiff's | 16 | particular Rastafarian community about the |
| 17 | Exhibit 40, which is the comparison that you've | 17 | possibility of gaining access to them? |
| 18 | done -- | 18 | A. In spring '92. |
| 19 | A. Yeah. | 19 | Q. And is there a reason why you |
| 20 | Q. - if you will look at the first | 20 | approached this community? |
| 21 | page. | 21 | A. Well, first of all, it's not a |
| 22 | A. Yeah, uh-huh. | 22 | community. It's just Rasta all over Jamaica. |
| 23 | Q. No, no. | 23 | It's not one particular community. It's, you |
| 24 | A. Sorry. | 24 | know, it's a community at large. |
| 25 | Q. No problem. | 25 | Well, yeah, my love for Reggae |
|  | 34 |  | 36 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | We see two images there, one of | 2 | music, my love for Jamaica, my love for their |
| 3 | Canal Zone and one of the Yes Rasta book. And | 3 | culture, their look, and also the fact that no |
| 4 | it says Yes Rasta photographs by Patrick Cariou, | 4 | book has ever been done about Rastafarians. |
| 5 | do you see that? | 5 | Q. And so when you first approached |
| 6 | A. Yeah. | 6 | them you approached them with the idea of |
| 7 | Q. And you made this comparison because | 7 | preparing a book containing images and |
| 8 | the Yes Rasta images you took are found in the | 8 | documenting -- |
| 9 | Yes Rasta book? | 9 | A. Yeah, absolutely. |
| 10 | A. Excuse me. Come again, please. | 10 | Q. -- and documenting the Rastafarian |
| 11 | Q. Yes. In other words, I'm just | 11 | lifestyle? |
| 12 | trying to understand, you juxtaposed the Canal | 12 | A. Yes. |
| 13 | Zone book and the Yes Rasta book because you are | 13 | Q. And when you first approached them |
| 14 | saying that the images are -- some of the | 14 | did you tell them that's what you wanted to do? |
| 15 | Yes Rasta images are found in the Canal Zone | 15 | A. Yes. |
| 16 | book? | 16 | Q. And what did they say to you? |
| 17 | A. Correct. | 17 | A. It depends on which one. |
| 18 | Q. Now, according to your complaint | 18 | Q. I see. I guess I understood from |
| 19 | which you have in front of you, I believe it's | 19 | Mr. Henzeli's description in the front part of |
| 20 | paragraph 16, you say that you spent parts of | 20 | the Yes Rasta book that you had gone and lived |
| 21 | six years in the secluded mountains of Jamaica | 21 | with one particular community, not that it was |
| 22 | gaining access to and living and working with | 22 | communities everywhere. |
| 23 | and earning the trust of the Rastafarians who | 23 | So what you're saying is there are |
| 24 | are the subjects of Yes Rasta? | 24 | different Rasta communities -- |
| 25 | A. Yes. | 25 | A. There is no such thing as a Rasta |


|  | 37 |  | 39 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | community. Most of them live by themselves, you | 2 | Jamaican Rastafarians? |
| 3 | know. So they are individual -- extremely | 3 | And I'm going to put them -- I'm |
| 4 | individualistic. It's not like you have a Rasta | 4 | trying not to call them a community, because I |
| 5 | village or Rasta town. It doesn't -- that's not | 5 | appreciate that's not how you see it, but did |
| 6 | the way it works. They are intertwined into the | 6 | someone introduce you to this group of people? |
| 7 | Jamaican population. | 7 | A. No. I went by myself and, you know, |
| 8 | Some would live in the city, some | 8 | that's what I'm good at, and make friends with |
| 9 | would live way up in the mountains, you know. | 9 | someone who knew someone who knew someone and |
| 10 | It's various possibilities. | 10 | developed a network. And that was it. |
| 11 | Q. I see. So when it says that you | 11 | And it also took me six years to |
| 12 | spent part of six years in the secluded | 12 | complete it. You know, it wasn't like a quick |
| 13 | mountains of Jamaica, it wasn't just a group | 13 | space, quick space sort of thing, you know. You |
| 14 | of Rastafarians -- | 14 | had to be very patient and find the right moment |
| 15 | A. No, no. It was moving around. | 15 | to talk to someone. |
| 16 | Q. And it wasn't just in the mountains? | 16 | Q. And when it says you spent parts of |
| 17 | A. It was most of the time it was in | 17 | six years, you didn't live with them the whole |
| 18 | the mountains, but not all the time in the | 18 | six years -- |
| 19 | mountains. | 19 | A. No. |
| 20 | Sometimes we had to go back to town | 20 | Q. - you just went in and out? |
| 21 | to get some, you know, food or whatever we | 21 | A. Yeah. |
| 22 | needed. Sometimes I needed batteries or | 22 | Q. And during this six-year period did |
| 23 | whatever. So that's how it works. | 23 | you continue your career as a professional |
| 24 | Q. But you lived with differen | 24 | photographer? |
| 25 | would it be proper to call them families, | 25 | A. Yeah. |
|  | 38 |  | 40 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | Rastafarian families - you lived with different | 2 | Q. So -- |
| 3 | Rastafarian families or different individuals? | 3 | MR. BROOKS: Sorry. Yes. Say yes. |
| 4 | A. Yeah, you could say that. | 4 | A. Yes, yes. |
| 5 | Q. During this time period? | 5 | MS. BART: We can have an |
| 6 | A. Yeah, yeah. | 6 | understanding that yeah means yes. |
| 7 | Q. In various parts of Jamaica? | 7 | I'm okay with it. |
| 8 | A. Yeah. | 8 | A. Yes. |
| 9 | Q. Some in the mountains, some in the | 9 | MS. BART: Could you read back my |
| 10 | town? | 10 | last question, please. |
| 11 | A. Yeah. Well, most of them -- | 11 | (Record read.) |
| 12 | MR. BROOKS: Say yes, not yeah. | 12 | BY MS. BART: |
| 13 | THE WITNESS: All right. Okay. | 13 | Q. So approximately how much of any |
| 14 | Sorry. | 14 | given year during that six-year period did you |
| 15 | MR. BROOKS: I'm sorry, what was the | 15 | spend living with a Rastafarian person or |
| 16 | question? | 16 | family? |
| 17 | MS. BART: I think you might have | 17 | A. About six months a year. |
| 18 | interrupted his last answer. | 18 | Q. And did you do this during a |
| 19 | (Record read.) | 19 | particular time of the year or just when your |
| 20 | BY MS. BART: | 20 | assignments allowed you to do it? |
| 21 | Q. And then you were about to say | 21 | A. When my assignment allowed me to do |
| 22 | something else? | 22 | - |
| 23 | A. Yeah, most of them in the mountains, | 23 | Q. So when you first approached someone |
| 24 | not in the town. | 24 | about do you know ariy Rastafariars, you went |
| 25 | Q. Did someone introduce you to the | 25 | there with this concept to document the |


|  | 41 |  | 43 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | Rastafarians - I think you mentioned their | 2 | A. Yeah. |
| 3 | culture, their looks - | 3 | Q. Now, it says in the sentence that I |
| 4 | A. Mm-hmm. | 4 | skipped over, it says that it was only after |
| 5 | Q. -- document those images, you went | 5 | living with them for years that Plaintiff was |
| 6 | there with that purpose? | 6 | finally permitted to photograph them? |
| 7 | A. Yeah. | 7 | A. Yeah. |
| 8 | Q. And that's why you were in Jamaica? | 8 | Q. Okay. So you first went to Jamaica |
| 9 | A. Yeah. | 9 | and made your first approach in 1992, so at what |
| 10 | Q. How were you first sort of | 10 | point did you first get the first person to |
| 11 | introduced to or exposed to the Rastafarian | 11 | agree to allow you to photograph them? |
| 12 | culture? | 12 | A. I went in Jamaica twice without |
| 13 | A. Well, through Reggae music, you | 13 | camera before - |
| 14 | know. | 14 | MR. BROOKS: With a what? |
| 15 | Q. And when did you first begin | 15 | A. Without a camera. And that was in |
| 16 | listening to Reggae music? | 16 | spring '93 that I took my first picture of |
| 17 | A. In - let me think. I don't know. | 17 | Rasta. I was, you know, close enough to some |
| 18 | I must have been 15, which is, you know, early | 18 | of them to be able to ask and to start taking |
| 19 | '80s - no, not -- late '70s. | 19 | pictures. They felt comfortable about it. |
| 20 | Q. Now, in the second line of your | 20 | Q. And they gave you permission to do |
| 21 | complaint, paragraph 16 -- | 21 | that? |
| 22 | A. Yeah. | 22 | A. Yes. |
| 23 | Q. - it says the Rastafarians are a | 23 | MR. BROOKS: Excuse me. |
| 24 | spiritual society living simply, independently, | 24 | Did you get the word comfortable? |
| 25 | and in harmony with nature, apart from the | 25 | (Discussion off the record.) |
|  | 42 |  | 44 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | industrialized world of environmental pollution | 2 | BY MS. BART: |
| 3 | and materialism which they reject and refer to | 3 | Q. When you approached a Rasta for the |
| 4 | as, quote, Babylon. | 4 | purpose of taking their photograph, I assume |
| 5 | A. Mm-hmm. | 5 | you -- do I understand you correctly to be |
| 6 | Q. So it was that society and the | 6 | saying you asked each Rasta or each family that |
| 7 | simple sort of independent way in which they | 7 | you photographed for their permission to |
| 8 | live that you wanted to take images of to | 8 | photograph them? |
| 9 | document, if you will? | 9 | A. Well, you better -- no, you start to |
| 10 | A. Yeah. | 10 | know them, live with them -- not necessarily |
| 11 | Q. In fact, we find this focus in your | 11 | live with them in the sense of. .living with them |
| 12 | complaint in this allegation that says, you | 12 | in their house, but hang out with them for a few |
| 13 | know, they're living this simple life and then | 13 | days, few weeks, sometimes months. It depends. |
| 14 | you look down and it says the next paragraph, or | 14 | And at some point, yeah, you ask |
| 15 | a couple of lines down, it says the result was | 15 | permission to take their picture. |
| 16 | the photographs in Yes Rasta? | 16 | Q. And when you say live with them, the |
| 17 | A. Mm-hmm. | 17 | ones that are up in the mountains of Jamaica, |
| 18 | Q. Approximately 100 strikingly | 18 | would you actually go and camp out in the |
| 19 | original black and white photographs, mostly | 19 | mountains - |
| 20 | close-up portraits of stern, mystical-looking | 20 | A. Yeah. |
| 21 | men within a distinctive tropical landscape? | 21 | Q. - or would you stay in a hotel and |
| 22 | A. Yeah. | 22 | go back and forth? |
| 23 | Q. And so the results of the | 23 | A. No, no. I never stayed in a hotel. |
| 24 | culmination of the photographing of this culture | 24 | Q. And so you would stay there for a |
| 25 | is what resulted in Yes Rasta? | 25 | period of time? |


|  | 45 |  | 47 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Cariou |  | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | A. Yeah. | 2 | in the community or - |
| 3 | Q. Did any of the Rastafarians whose | 3 | A. Yeah. |
| 4 | images appear in the Yes Rasta images give you | 4 | Q. What did you do? |
| 5 | written permission to take their photograph? | 5 | A. Well, everything was to be done, you |
| 6 | A. No. | 6 | know, you need to go get water out of the river, |
| 7 | Q. Now, according to your complaint, | 7 | you need to go get the coconuts, you need to |
| 8 | your photographs, the subjects of your | 8 | cook, you need to clean, you need to be - to |
| 9 | photographs, it's portraiture? | 9 | make yourself part of the small group who is |
| 10 | A. Yeah. | 10 | there and, you know, not just sit and wait until |
| 11 | Q. And landscapes? | 11 | they've done. You participate to whatever needs |
| 12 | A. Yeah. | 12 | to be done. |
| 13 | Q. And that was part of your effort to | 13 | Q. So you were just trying to embed |
| 14 | document what I will call the Rastafarian | 14 | yourself, if you will, in this society, perhaps |
| 15 | culture? | 15 | one or two groups at a time, to really be able |
| 16 | A. Yeah. It's also my style of | 16 | to capture its essence through photography? |
| 17 | photography. | 17 | A. Exactly. |
| 18 | Q. Why don't you tell us what your | 18 | Q. So when I think of the word work |
| 19 | style of photography is? | 19 | with them, I think of maybe doing a job or |
| 20 | A. What my style of photography is? | 20 | performing a job, but in this particular society |
| 21 | Oh, that's - I'm into portraiture and masters, | 21 | making sure there's water and food is the job |
| 22 | Paul Strand, August Sander, Edward Curis, who | 22 | itself? |
| 23 | were traveling photographers, and it's sort of a | 23 | A. Exactly. |
| $\begin{aligned} & 24 \\ & 25 \end{aligned}$ | static way of taking a picture of when someone is looking at you -- the viewer, either the | $\mathfrak{2 4} \begin{aligned} & 25 \end{aligned}$ | Q. And that's how you're using the word work in this complaint? |
| 25 | is looking at you -- the viewer, ether the |  |  |
|  | 46 |  | 48 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | viewer or anybody understands that the person | 2 | A. Yeah. |
| 3 | whose portrait, in the portrait, has agreed and | 3 | Q. So it wasn't that you went there to |
| 4 | is aware that someone is taking his photograph. | 4 | photograph them and that was your job in regards |
| 5 | That's -- | 5 | to the Rastafarians, that was what you were |
| 6 | Q. Because you are trying to stage it | 6 | there to do but it wasn't the work you were |
| 7 | in a certain way? | 7 | performing for them? |
| 8 | A. I stage it, yeah. | 8 | A. No, no, no. |
| 9 | Q. And you're trying to capture as | 9 | Q. What l'd like to do is take you |
| 10 | closely as possible the essence of the person | 10 | through the images that are in Plaintiff's |
| 11 | whose image you're taking? | 11 | Exhibit 40. So if you could keep the book out, |
| 12 | A. Yeah, absolutely. | 12 | you might want to keep the complaint handy, and |
| 13 | Q. Did anyone assist you in the taking | 13 | go through Plaintiff's Exhibit 40. |
| 14 | of any of the Yes Rasta images? | 14 | And if we could, go to the second |
| 15 | A. No. | 15 | page which is marked C00018. |
| 16 | Q. So that was done strictly on your | 16 | A. Yes. |
| 17 | own? | 17 | MR. BROOKS: Excuse me. This is 40. |
| 18 | A. Yeah. | 18 | A. Oh, yeah, okay. |
| 19 | Q. Now, in your complaint it says that | 19 | Q. That's 41. |
| 20 | you -- in the first line -- | 20 | MR. BROOKS: And she's talking about |
| 21 | MR. BROOKS: Which paragraph? | 21 | this first page, C00018. |
| 22 | MS. BART: 16. | 22 | MS. BART: Yes. |
| 23 | Q. It says that you not only lived with | 23 | A. Yeah. |
| 24 | the Rastas but you also worked with them. | 24 | Q. Those are numbers, Mr. Cariou, that |
| 25 | Did you actually perform like work | 25 | your counsel placed on this particular document, |


|  | 49 |  | 51 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | and it's just to help us with identification. | 2 | Q. When you took this your artistic |
| 3 | So when you're talking about a page | 3 | purpose was strictly to capture this man in his |
| 4 | we'll try to refer to it and the same thing with | 4 | environment, is that correct? |
| 5 | the numbers. | 5 | A. No, it was to make a beautiful |
| 6 | A. Okay. | 6 | portrait. |
| 7 | Q. So let's start with this person | 7 | Q. Did you choose the setting for this |
| 8 | which you put as the first image in your | 8 | or is this around where he lives? |
| 9 | comparison, and carn you tell me when this | 9 | A. No, I choose the setting. |
| 10 | photograph was taken? | 10 | Q. And what was it about the landscape |
| 11 | A. It must have been taken in around | 11 | surrounding this gentleman that caused you to |
| 12 | '95. | 12 | choose him, choose this particular setting for |
| 13 | Q. And how is it that you place this | 13 | this particular image? |
| 14 | particular image in 1995? | 14 | A. Because he was -- it fits with him. |
| 15 | A. How? Why? | 15 | It was right in the middle of the jungle. |
| 16 | Q. How do you know - you said it must | 16 | Q. Now, could you please go to the |
| 17 | have -- | 17 | image in the book, and if you will look on the |
| 18 | A. Because I remember when I was with | 18 | right-hand side you will see numbers with blue |
| 19 | that man. | 19 | tabs? |
| 20 | Q. And this would have been about three | 20 | A. Yeah. |
| 21 | years into your sojoum into the Rastafarian | 21 | Q. Those numbers correspond to the |
| 22 | culture? | 22 | Bates Number that your lawyer has put on this |
| 23 | A. Yeah. | 23 | page. |
| 24 | Q. And was this a staged photograph? | 24 | A. Okay. |
| 25 | A. Yeah, absolutely. | 25 | Q. So if you will find the actual |
|  | 50 |  | 52 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | Q. And how long did it take you to | 2 | image -- |
| 3 | shoot this particular image? | 3 | A. Okay. |
| 4 | A. I don't know. We tried a few | 4 | Q. Do you find number 18 there? |
| 5 | positions. Maybe an hour. | 5 | A. No, but I will soon. |
| 6 | Q. And is there a reason why you wanted | 6 | (Witness looks through exhibit.) |
| 7 | to photograph this particular man, in other | 7 | A. Yes, I got it. |
| 8 | words, was he just one of the Rastas that was | 8 | Q. Okay. In looking at that photograph |
| 9 | willing to give you permission, or was there | 9 | or that image, I see that the back, the |
| 10 | something specific about this particular man | 10 | landscape behind him is largely blurred -- |
| 11 | that you wanted to capture on film? | 11 | A. Yeah. |
| 12 | A. There's something really specific | 12 | Q. - in part? |
| 13 | that I wanted to capture about that man. | 13 | A. Yeah. |
| 14 | Q. And what is that? | 14 | Q. Why did you choose to do that? |
| 15 | A. There's a few things. Like his | 15 | A. Because it's like that mostiy in the |
| 16 | strength, for one. His dreads. You know, the | 16 | book, and I decided to do that, which is -- |
| 17 | fact that he lives really high up in the | 17 | there is a thing in photography called depth of |
| 18 | mountains. As you can see, he's wearing boots, | 18 | field, which is, you know, you can see more or |
| 19 | plastic boots, because it's so humid. | 19 | less of the background. |
| 20 | And I like that man and, you know, | 20 | And I decided long before I actually |
| 21 | it's hard to explain why a portraitist wants to | 21 | started that book that I wanted to - I would |
| 22 | take a picture of someone. I liked him. He | 22 | like to -- I wanted to use little depth of field |
| 23 | liked me. And I thought -- it's actually one | 23 | and a certain lens in order to have my pictures |
| 24 | of my favorite pictures. I think it's also | 24 | like that. |
| 25 | Mr. Prince's favorite picture too. | 25 | MR. BROOKS: Excuse me. |

Toll Free: 800.944.9454
Facsimile: 212.557.5972

|  | 53 |  | 55 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | Did you get lens? | 2 | A. Exactly. |
| 3 | (Record read.) | 3 | Q. To save time, Mr. Cariou, did you |
| 4 | (Discussion off the record.) | 4 | use that same camera and lens on all of these or |
| 5 | BY MS. BART: | 5 | only some of them? |
| 6 | Q. What type of lens did you choose? | 6 | A. No, I used two lenses. |
| 7 | A. What type of lens? | 7 | Q. Well, then we'll do it photograph by |
| 8 | Q. You said you had chosen a specific | 8 | photograph. |
| 9 | lens? | 9 | So I guess then when you blur out |
| 10 | A. Yeah, it was a 165 -millimeter Pentax | 10 | the background I take it then that other than |
| 11 | lens on a medium camera, medium-format camera, | 11 | the fact that this man lives in the tropical |
| 12 | sorry. | 12 | area that he does, in this particular image the |
| 13 | Q. And is there something special about | 13 | background then for artistic purposes is really |
| 14 | the use of a 165-millimeter Pentax lens on a | 14 | not that important? |
| 15 | medium-size camera? | 15 | MR. BROOKS: Object to the form. |
| 16 | A. Yeah. | 16 | You can answer. |
| 17 | Q. And what is that? | 17 | A. No, it's not --because, as you can |
| 18 | In other words, you were obviously | 18 | notice, there's lights around. And the way - |
| 19 | going for a particular type of look? | 19 | the angle you choose and the bush you choose |
| 20 | A. Yeah. | 20 | behind is going to make a huge difference in the |
| 21 | Q. And that's what l'm trying to | 21 | picture. |
| 22 | understand. | 22 | If it's backlit or it's n |
| 23 | A. Yeah. | 23 | backlit - you see all the little dots? Those |
| 24 | Q. So you must have chosen that lens | 24 | are important. Those are extremely important |
| 25 | and that camera for a specific reason? | 25 | when you take those type of pictures. |
|  | 54 |  | 56 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | A. Well, then in order to answer that | 2 | Q. Were you using artificial light or |
| 3 | properly we would need to go into photography | 3 | was this done -- |
| 4 | principles, you know, the size of the lens, the | 4 | A. No, it's natural light. |
| 5 | F-stop. Everything goes with it. The size of | 5 | Q. - with natural lighting? |
| 6 | the neg, et cetera, et cetera. | 6 | A. And of course you have the -- you |
| 7 | You know, why did I use the 165? | 7 | choose the period, the time of the day when |
| 8 | Because I knew I was getting that effect for | 8 | you're going to take the picture. |
| 9 | that picture. | 9 | Q. To get that light from the correct |
| 10 | Q. And that effect is what? | 10 | angle? |
| 11 | A. That effect is to have the | 11 | A. To get what you want, yeah. |
| 12 | background to be a bit blurry. | 12 | Q. How long did it take you to find |
| 13 | Q. And you could also achieve that by | 13 | this particular setting? |
| 14 | narrowing the F-stop, correct? | 14 | A. You know, it's hard to say because |
| 15 | A. You could do that too, yeah. Yeah. | 15 | I was living with that man for a few days, you |
| 16 | Q. For a narrow depth of field? | 16 | know, waiting for the right moment to take a |
| 17 | A. Yeah. | 17 | picture, and I was looking around for days. |
| 18 | Q. And so what that does -- and I'm | 18 | Not taking the picture, but like -- |
| 19 | trying to understand, does that then make | 19 | Q. I call it scouting. |
| 20 | landscape fade into the background and the | 20 | A. We could call it scouting. I went |
| 21 | subject that you're taking the portrait of | 21 | scouting for a few days before. |
| 22 | become more prominent? | 22 | But I was also waiting for him to be |
| 23 | A. Exactly. | 23 | in a mood to have his picture taken. |
| 24 | Q. And that was the purpose of doing | 24 | Q. And that's because the essence of |
| 25 | that? | 25 | this picture is really the portrait? |


| 57 |  | 59 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | A. It's him, yeah. It's him. It's | 2 | A. Yes. |
| 3 | about -- you know, as you can notice it, he's | 3 | Q. And if you could go back to the |
| 4 | right in the middle, and you can't be more | 4 | image of this particular Rastafanian -- |
| 5 | simple as far as framing is concerned. It's | 5 | MR. BROOKS: This is on page -- what |
| 6 | about him and his strength. | 6 | you've marked C18? |
| 7 | Q. Now, in paragraph 16 of your | 7 | MS. BART: C18, right. |
| 8 | complaint you say that the images were taken in | 8 | BY MS. BART: |
| 9 | black and white? | 9 | Q. Did you have it processed in a |
| 10 | A. Mm-hmm. | 10 | particular way? |
| 11 | Q. Was there a specific kind of film | 11 | A. Yeah. We used a specific chemical. |
| 12 | you were using or did it depend on the time of | 12 | Well, first of all, I had it exposed a |
| 13 | day you were shooting? | 13 | particular way. |
| 14 | A. No, I only used one film. | 14 | Q. And that would be with the F-stop? |
| 15 | Q. And what was the type of film? | 15 | A. No, with - |
| 16 | A. It's TRI-X 320. | 16 | Q. With the chemicals? |
| 17 | Q. TRI-X? | 17 | A. No, with the - you know, each film |
| 18 | A. Yeah. | 18 | has a sensitivity, ASA, you know, 400 ASA. |
| 19 | Q. Could you spell that for us? | 19 | Q. Right. |
| 20 | A. T-X 320. | 20 | A. But you don't have to -- you can |
| 21 | Q. But it's T-R-I-X 320? | 21 | over or underexpose it when you shoot. You |
| 22 | A. Yeah. | 22 | know, that's a decision you can take. |
| 23 | Q. And who makes that? | 23 | And then you process it, but you |
| 24 | A. Kodak. | 24 | have to know what you have done before in order |
| 25 | MR. HAYES: Is it T-R-1-X or | 25 | to process it properly and in order to get what |
|  | 58 |  | 60 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | T-R-I-A-X? | 2 | you want. |
| 3 | A. You can put $T$ and $X$ and that's good. | 3 | Q. And when you were out in the field |
| 4 | Q. And is there a reason that you chose | 4 | did you keep a field notebook? |
| 5 | the TX 320 film - | 5 | A. No. |
| 6 | A. Yeah. | 6 | Q. You kept no notes, so how would you |
| 7 | Q. -- for this particular series of | 7 | know then what you had done in the field in |
| 8 | images? | 8 | terms of the ASA so that you could then give the |
| 9 | A. Oh, yeah. Because I want - from | 9 | right instructions? |
| 10 | the get-go I wanted to have a really specific | 10 | A. Because I'm a good photographer and |
| 11 | look for the whole book. And it's a film that I | 11 | I know what I do. |
| 12 | thought would give me this look. | 12 | Q. I see. So did you label the films |
| 13 | But on top of choosing a film, you | 13 | so you could keep track? |
| 14 | need to know how to expose it and to process it | 14 | A. No. |
| 15 | and then how to print it in order to get what | 15 | Q. And is that because you were taking |
| 16 | you want. | 16 | not that many pictures? |
| 17 | Q. And can you explain what the | 17 | A. I wasn't taking that many pictures. |
| 18 | specific overall look you were going for was? | 18 | Q. So it was easy for you to keep it in |
| 19 | A. Well, I knew I was going to shoot | 19 | your mind? |
| 20 | black man and black woman, you know, obviously. | 20 | A. Yeah, plus I knew the technique, I |
| 21 | And I wanted to - I wanted the overall book to | 21 | knew what I wanted and, you know, with the light |
| 22 | be dark, you know, but still to have a lot of | 22 | meter and camera it was easy for me to get what |
| 23 | details and grays in the book, and that's what I | 23 | I wanted. |
| 24 | did. | 24 | Q. Now, a few minutes ago when you |
| 25 | Q. Now, you mentioned processing? | 25 | first started talking about the processing of |


|  | 61 | 63 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | the images you used the word we processed. | 2 | Q. Yes. I'm trying to just understand, |
| 3 | Who helped you with the processing? | 3 | you said there was a trial-and-error period, and |
| 4 | A. My lab. It's called Richard | 4 | then once you came up with the look that you |
| 5 | Foulster, F-O-U-L-S-T-E-R. | 5 | liked you then exposed and developed each of the |
| 6 | Q. And you've referred to his name by | 6 | other images that appear in Yes Rasta in the |
| 7 | looking in the back of Plaintiff's Exhibit 41, | 7 | same way. |
| 8 | right, in the acknowledgments? | 8 | MR. BROOKS: Can I just say |
| 9 | A. Yeah. | 9 | something? i think the exposing -1 |
| 10 | Q. He was one of the people that you | 10 | could be wrong -- is done when he's |
| 11 | acknowledged? | 11 | shooting the picture. |
| 12 | A. Yes. | 12 | The processing is in the lab, I |
| 13 | Q. Now, did you give Mr. Foulster | 13 | think. |
| 14 | specific instructions for how you wanted this | 14 | MS. BART: He actually used the word |
| 15 | image, for example - | 15 | exposure in connection with processing, so |
| 16 | A. Of course. | 16 | I'm trying to follow his - |
| 17 | Q. -- to be exposed and printed? | 17 | A. No, no, no. But if I did, that's my |
| 18 | A. Yes. | 18 | mistake. |
| 19 | Q. And what did you tell Mr. Foulster | 19 | Q. Okay. |
| 20 | you wanted done with the image that appears on | 20 | A. The exposure is done -- |
| 21 | C18? | 21 | Q. That's how I usually understand it, |
| 22 | A. Well, C18-you have to take the | 22 | is the exposure is through the lens. That is |
| 23 | whole book as a whole. You know, C18 didn't | 23 | how I understood it. |
| $\begin{aligned} & 24 \\ & 25 \end{aligned}$ | come as the first image. You know, we already had images that we were, you know, happy with | $\begin{aligned} & 24 \\ & 25 \end{aligned}$ | But you were using it in the lab context? |
| 25 | had images that we were, you know, happy with |  |  |
|  | 62 |  | 64 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | the look of it. | 2 | A. Yeah, that's my mistake. Sorry. |
| 3 | And it was - then it became sort of | 3 | Q. Okay. So what about the processing, |
| 4 | a routine of, you know, having -- you know, when | 4 | what was it that you were trying to capture in |
| 5 | you process a film you get contact sheets. Then | 5 | the processing? |
| 6 | from the contact sheets you go to printing. | 6 | A. We were trying to get extremely dark |
| 7 | And we did -- we print -- we always | 7 | images but still keeping a lot of details. |
| 8 | print together. You know, I'm here when he's | 8 | C18 is not the best example. I can |
| 9 | printing my picture. | 9 | show you another example, like the black man in |
| 10 | Q. In the darkroom? | 10 | the shade but you can still see every details |
| 11 | A. In the darkroom. | 11 | that there is to see in this picture. |
| 12 | Q. And so is it fair to say -- again, | 12 | Q. And may the record reflect that the |
| 13 | I'm just trying to understand the process -- but | 13 | witness has showed us the image that appears on |
| 14 | is it fair to say then once you developed the | 14 | page 13 of Plaintiff's Exhibit 41. |
| 15 | technique that you wanted to create the certain | 15 | MR. BROOKS: Is that 13 ? |
| 16 | dark look with accents, that is how all of the | 16 | MS. BART: Down on the bottom. |
| 17 | images that appear in the Yes Rasta book were | 17 | MR. BROOKS: I'm sorty, I think -- |
| 18 | developed? | 18 | oh, it's 13, okay. |
| 19 | A. Yes. | 19 | A. As an example. |
| 20 | Q. Okay. So could you just describe | 20 | Q. Yes, I understand. |
| 21 | for us what the process was that you finally | 21 | A. That's what we were trying to get. |
| 22 | settled upon for this particular -- for the | 22 | And it's not easy to get that, to shoot black |
| 23 | Yes Rasta book? | 23 | people in the shade, because most of them are |
| 24 | A. Could you repeat your question, | 24 | shot in the shade, and still getting details is |
| 25 | please? | 25 | something which takes work to do. |


|  | 65 |  | 67 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | And we went through the whole | 2 | Q. Other than through the sale of the |
| 3 | process of trying one way and another way and | 3 | Yes Rasta book have you marketed this particular |
| 4 | another way up until we managed to have it. | 4 | image, which appears on page - |
| 5 | Q. And I think you testified earlier | 5 | A. 118. |
| 6 | that you began taking images in 1993 that was | 6 | Q. --118 of the book and C18 of |
| 7 | your first image? | 7 | Plaintiff's Exhibit 40, have you marketed it in |
| 8 | A. Yes. | 8 | any way other than through the book? |
| 9 | Q. And so approximately how long did it | 9 | A. No. |
| 10 | take you to sort of work out this process with | 10 | Q. Have you licensed any rights to any |
| 11 | Mr. Foulster? | 11 | person other than Powerhouse to use this image? |
| 12 | A. Well, we've been working together | 12 | A. No. |
| 13 | forever. And I just want to show you - you | 13 | Q. Now, if you would go back to the |
| 14 | know what I mean, that's what we were trying to | 14 | complaint, paragraph 16, which you have in front |
| 15 | get. | 15 | of you. |
| 16 | (Witness indicating.) | 16 | A. Yeah. |
| 17 | MS. BART: May the record reflect | 17 | Q. In that paragraph you make a |
| 18 | that the witness has shown me a two-page | 18 | collective reference to the images in the |
| 19 | image which is marked pages 43 and 44 in | 19 | Yes Rasta book, and it starts off with -- we |
| 20 | the Yes Rasta book. | 20 | read it before -- the result was the |
| 21 | A. You know, I was doing - I was | 21 | photographs? |
| 22 | trying things, not being in Jamaica, you know, | 22 | A. Yeah. |
| 23 | when I was on location sometimes for my | 23 | Q. And you say of approximately 100 |
| 24 | professional work, on the island, I was trying | 24 | strikingly-original black and white photographs, |
| 25 | things, and I couldn't tell you exactly how long | 25 | can you tell me in your own words why you |
|  | 66 |  | 68 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | it took us to define the whole process. | 2 | believe this is strikingly original, this image |
| 3 | Q. A year, a month, approximately? | 3 | that appears on C18 and page 118 of Plaintif's |
| 4 | A. I would say a year. | 4 | Exhibit 41? |
| 5 | Q. And this is trial and error over a | 5 | A. You know, l've been trying for 25 |
| 6 | period of time? | 6 | years to take good pictures, and I think that's |
| 7 | A. Mm-hmm, yes. | 7 | pretty good. I think it's - I would even say |
| 8 | Q. Returning now, if you wouldn't mind, | 8 | it's a great photograph. |
| 9 | please, you can either look at it on Plaintifi's | 9 | You know, some people consider this |
| 10 | Exhibit 40 or you can look at it in the book, | 10 | book the ultimate book ever done on Rasta. |
| 11 | which is marked - the image that appears on | 11 | Q. But there are others - |
| 12 | C00018, which is this gentleman that we first | 12 | A. No. |
| 13 | started talking about? | 13 | Q. -in the marketplace? |
| 14 | A. Yeah, yeah, the first guy. | 14 | A. No. |
| 15 | Q. Does this photograph have, or this | 15 | Q. Now, in your complaint in paragraph |
| 16 | image, does this have a title? | 16 | 16 you then say these portraits were taken |
| 17 | A. No. | 17 | within a distinctive tropical landscape? |
| 18 | Q. Did it ever have a title? | 18 | A. Mm-hmm. |
| 19 | A. No, not yet. | 19 | Q. And I would like to understand why |
| 20 | Q. Is there a reason why you didn't | 20 | you think the landscape that appears in this |
| 21 | title these works of art or these images? | 21 | particular image is distinctive, in your view? |
| 22 | A. No. | 22 | A. It's a group. It's a book. You |
| 23 | Q. Have you ever sold any individual | 23 | know, next to it you have a tropical landscape. |
| 24 | prints of this photograph, of this image? | 24 | You obviously associate both. And the next page |
| 25 | A. Of that image? No. | 25 | is the same thing. |


|  | 69 |  | 71 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | Q. And the next page, what's the number | 2 | the beginning of the series or was he towards |
| 3 | there, page $115 ?$ | 3 | the end? |
| 4 | A. 115, you know - | 4 | A. That must have been towards the |
| 5 | Q. So it's not that particular | 5 | middle. |
| 6 | landscape? | 6 | Q. Okay. Towards the middle. |
| 7 | A. No, it's not that particular | 7 | And was this a staged photograph? |
| 8 | landscape, no. | 8 | A. Yeah. |
| 9 | Q. Okay. Turning back to Plaintiff's | 9 | Q. And was this a single Rastafarian |
| 10 | Exhibit 40, if you would turn to the page number | 10 | that you lived with for a period of time? |
| 11 | that's marked C00021. | 11 | A. Yeah, he's a friend of mine |
| 12 | Mr. Cariou, Plaintiff's Exhibit 40 | 12 | actually. |
| 13 | is your comparison, and I think -- | 13 | Q. And when did you first meet him? |
| 14 | A. Yeah, I have it. | 14 | A. I met him towards the beginnirig of |
| 15 | Q. Oh, I see. You're going to the | 15 | my trips in Jamaica, the first or the second |
| 16 | image itself? | 16 | trip. |
| 17 | A. Yes. | 17 | Q. 1992 time period? |
| 18 | Q. And you'll find that on the tab, the | 18 | A. '93 I think we met. |
| 19 | blue tab on -- | 19 | Q. '93? |
| 20 | A. 21. | 20 | A. Yeah. |
| 21 | Q. - the book, the page marked C21? | 21 | Q. And where does this gentleman live? |
| 22 | A. Yeah. | 22 | A. He lives west - in the west end in |
| 23 | Q. Do you have both of those in front | 23 | Negril. And actually he's the first individual |
| 24 | of you? | 24 | in the book, if you - that's the same man. |
| 25 | A. Yes. | 25 | Q. I'm sorry, could you give us - |
|  | 70 |  | 72 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | Q. Okay. Now, this actually appears on | 2 | that's on page 4? |
| 3 | pages 83 and 84 of Yes Rasta, correct, this | 3 | A. Page 4, yeah. |
| 4 | image -- | 4 | Q. Mr. Cariou, since I don't have a |
| 5 | A. Yeah. | 5 | copy of the book here can you just turn it |
| 6 | Q. - that we see at the bottom of C21? | 6 | around sol can see -- |
| 7 | A. 83 and 84 , yeah. | 7 | A. Sure. Sorry, about that. |
| 8 | Q. Okay. To try to save time, was this | 8 | He's the first individual in the |
| 9 | taken with the same lens and the same camera? | 9 | book. |
| 10 | A. It was - everything was taken with | 10 | Q. And that's, again, on page 4 of the |
| 11 | the same camera. The whole book was taken with | 11 | book, the fourth image of the book? |
| 12 | the same. | 12 | A. Yeah. |
| 13 | Q. And the same film? | 13 | MR. BROOKS: Well, it's page 4. |
| 14 | A. And the same film. | 14 | Q. Returning back to the image which |
| 15 | And that's probably the same lens | 15 | appears on the bottom of C00021 and pages 83 of |
| 16 | that the picture we talked earlier. | 16 | the book, how long did it take you to shoot this |
| 17 | Q. Can you tell us when this photograph | 17 | particular work? |
| 18 | was taken? | 18 | A. I don't know. |
| 19 | A. No, I couldn't. | 19 | Q. But it was staged? |
| 20 | Q. And is there a reason you can't | 20 | A. Yeah, it was staged. |
| 21 | place the timing of this? | 21 | Q. And other than this is a frlend of |
| 22 | A. Well, because, you know, that's six | 22 | yours or someone who's become a friend of yours, |
| 23 | years of long traveling, and I couldn't tell you | 23 | is there a particular reason why you wanted to |
| 24 | when exactly it was taken. | 24 | photograph this particular person? |
| 25 | Q. And could you say whether it was at | 25 | A. Yeah, because he represents exactly |


|  | 73 |  | 75 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | what a young Rasta should represent to me. | 2 | A. $\mathrm{Mm}-\mathrm{hmm}$. |
| 3 | Q. And is there a reason why you wanted | 3 | Q. - to take this particular image? |
| 4 | him seated on a donkey? | 4 | A. Yeah. |
| 5 | A. It was a collaboration. He has a | 5 | Q. And that's because what you were |
| 6 | donkey. He wanted to have his picture taken. | 6 | focusirg on was the portrait of this particular |
| 7 | I was with the idea and we did it that way. | 7 | man? |
| 8 | You know, sometimes you don't have | 8 | A. Yeah. |
| 9 | an explanation for why things happen a certain | 9 | Q. And did you obtain his permission to |
| 10 | way. | 10 | take this image? |
| 11 | Q. And so your reason for taking this | 11 | A. Yeah. |
| 12 | particular image was just another example, was | 12 | Q. You actually said he wanted to have |
| 13 | that to you he tipifies I think you said a young | 13 | his image taken? |
| 14 | Rastafarian? | 14 | A. Yeah. |
| 15 | A. Yeah. | 15 | Q. Did you pay any of the Rastafarians |
| 16 | Q. Now, could you spell for the record | 16 | any money? |
| 17 | the place where he lives, I think you said it | 17 | A. No, I never paid any - to take |
| 18 | was Negril? | 18 | their pictures, no. |
| 19 | A. He lives on the west end in Negrii. | 19 | Q. And so did you give them any other |
| 20 | Q. Could you spell -- | 20 | kind of -- let me finish - |
| 21 | A. Negril. Negril is N-E-G-R-I-L. | 21 | A. Sorry. |
| 22 | Q. You can do the French spelling of | 22 | Q. - any kind of -- I want to use the |
| 23 | you want. I could stay with you. I could see | 23 | word consideration, but I don't want to draw a |
| 24 | you trying to do N - | 24 | legal conclusion here. |
| 25 | A. Yeah. | 25 | In other words, did you give them |
|  | 74 |  | 76 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | Q. Is the west end of Negril a | 2 | anything in return for letting you take their |
| 3 | community, like a town, or is it more out in a | 3 | photograph or their image? |
| 4 | rural setting? | 4 | A. That's not the way it works. But I |
| 5 | A. It's more of a little town. | 5 | would bring back bags of clothes, you know, to |
| 6 | Q. So was this shot near his home or | 6 | friends, to guys I really appreciated. |
| 7 | did you have to go somewhere to shoot this | 7 | Whether I photographed them or not, |
| 8 | image? | 8 | it wasn't really an issue. But, you know, 1 |
| 9 | A. We had to go somewhere to shoot | 9 | had a contact with Adidas at that time and I |
| 10 | this. | 10 | could - you know, they would give me big bags |
| 11 | Q. And is there a reason why you chose | 11 | of clothes and I would bring them that, or I |
| 12 | this particular setting for this photograph? | 12 | would, you know, help them out or if they need |
| 13 | A. How can I answer that? You know, it | 13 | some food or things like that. Things you do in |
| 14 | felt good. It felt right. | 14 | a normal way. But I never paid a Rasta to |
| 15 | Q. Now, again, would you mind just | 15 | photograph them. |
| 16 | holding up the book so I can see the image once, | 16 | Q. And that's because they don't |
| 17 | please, because this is very blurred, the PEX 40 | 17 | actually use money in their - |
| 18 | is very blurred. | 18 | A. No, that's not - they do use money. |
| 19 | If you notice -- you can turn it | 19 | I mean they use a little bit of money, as little |
| 20 | back around -- the background is quite blurred | 20 | as possible. But no one can live without money, |
| 21 | out -- | 21 | you know. Sometimes you need a new machete, so. |
| 22 | A. Sure. | 22 | No, it's a personal ethical thing to |
| 23 | Q. - a substantial portion. | 23 | me not to pay people to photograph them. |
| 24 | Again, you used a narrow depth of | 24 | They either accept it or they don't, |
| 25 | field -- | 25 | but I don't pay people to photograph them. |


| 77 |  | 79 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | Q. For these books that you're going to | 2 | (Defendant's Exhibit 3, page from |
| 3 | then sell? |  | Yes Rasta GGP0043113, was marked for |
| 4 | A. Yeah. | 4 | identification, as of this date.) |
| 5 | Q. Does this particular image that | 5 | BY MS. BART: |
| 6 | appears on pages 83 and 84 and C00021, does it | 6 | Q. Mr. Cariou, I'm handing you what's |
| 7 | have a title? | 7 | been marked for identification as Defendant's |
| 8 | A. No. | 8 | Exhibit 3. And is this a correct copy of the |
| 9 | Q. Did it ever have a title? | 9 | page that you just read to us from? |
| 10 | A. No. | 10 | A. Yes, it is. |
| 11 | Q. I don't want to ask you the same | 11 | Q. Okay. You can put that down now. |
| 12 | question for all of the images, so maybe we can | 12 | Thank you. |
| 13 | rush this through. | 13 | Returning now to the image that |
| 14 | Is it fair to say that none of the | 14 | appears on pages 83 and 84 and C00021, can you |
| 15 | images have titles, is that correct? | 15 | tell me if you've ever sold any individual |
| 16 | A. It's correct. | 16 | prints of this particular photograph? |
| 17 | Q. And none of them have ever had | 17 | A. No. |
| 18 | titles? | 18 | Q. And other than the sale of the |
| 19 | A. It's correct. | 19 | Yes Rasta book have you marketed this photograph |
| 20 | Q. Is there a reason why you chose to | 20 | in any way? |
| 21 | make these a collection of untitled works? | 21 | MR. BROOKS: Object to the form. |
| 22 | A. Yeah. | 22 | I don't know what marketed means, |
| 23 | Q. And what is that? | 23 | but he can answer. |
| 24 | A. It's right in the end of the book. | 24 | A. No. |
| 25 | Out of respect for the privacy of the Rasta in | 25 | Q. Marketed to me -- I mean you |
|  | 78 |  | 80 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | Yes Rasta caption and names and places have been | 2 | answered the question, so do you understand that |
| 3 | excluded. | 3 | to mean selling or trying to get people to buy |
| 4 | Q. And that is something that you asked | 4 | it or in some way commercialize it? |
| 5 | to have put in the book? | 5 | A. No. |
| 6 | A. Yeah, I- | 6 | Q. And have you licensed, other than |
| 7 | Q. That's something you wrote? | 7 | the Powerhouse agreement which you've produced |
| 8 | A. Yeah. | 8 | to us, have you licensed any rights in this |
| 9 | Q. And that's part of the materials | 9 | image to any person? |
| 10 | that you contributed to the publisher? | 10 | A. No. |
| 11 | A. Yeah. | 11 | MR. BROOKS: 83 and 84? |
| 12 | MS. BART: Can we go off the record | 12 | MS. BART: That's correct, same |
| 13 | for a second? | 13 | photograph. |
| 14 | (Discussion off the record.) | 14 | BY MS. BART: |
| 15 | MS. BART: I'm just going hand the | 15 | Q. I believe you have answered this, so |
| 16 | court reporter a copy of the page that you | 16 | I apologize if l've already asked it, when you |
| 17 | just read from which appears at the end of | 17 | said you just thought he embodies the strong |
| 18 | the Yes Rasta book, and for the record | 18 | young gentleman, but is that why you believe |
| 19 | we'll just mark it. | 19 | this particular photograph is among the 100 |
| 20 | It has -- I guess we're producing | 20 | strikingly beautiful original works that you've |
| 21 | it, but from your work, it's got | 21 | done? |
| 22 | Bates Number GGP0043113. | 22 | A. It's one of the many reasons why, |
| 23 | MR. BROOKS: This is Defendant's | 23 | yeah. |
| 24 | Exhibit 3? | 24 | Q. So are there other reasons why you |
| 25 | MS. BART: Yes. | 25 | think this is strikingly original? |


|  | 81 |  | 83 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | A. The composition, the way he looks at | 2 | talking about, which is in the middle of C00024, |
| 3 | us, you know, the way his body looks, you know, | 3 | correct? |
| 4 | the nature he's in, the light, being slightly | 4 | A. Yeah. |
| 5 | backlit, and the quality of the black and white. | 5 | Q. Can you tell me approximately when |
| 6 | Q. And in terms of the landscaping, a | 6 | this photograph was taken? |
| 7 | portion of which is blurred out, what do you | 7 | A. Once again, you know, it's hard for |
| 8 | feel is distinctive about this, or is this just | 8 | me to have a recollection of every picture in my |
| 9 | another example of you have to look at the whole | 9 | book and when they were taken. |
| 10 | book to get what's distinctive about the | 10 | Q. Where would you place it in the |
| 11 | landscape? | 11 | six-year span that you were -- |
| 12 | A. Yeah, you have to look at the whole | 12 | A. I would put it towards the end. |
| 13 | book in order to get a better feel of the place | 13 | Q. Just again, Mr. Cariou, kindly let |
| 14 | than looking at one picture, definitely. | 14 | me just get my question all the way out before |
| 15 | MS. BART: Off the record. | 15 | you answer. |
| 16 | (Discussion off the record.) | 16 | A. Sorry. |
| 17 | (Recess taken: 11:38 a.m.) | 17 | Q. I know in a conversation that's |
| 18 | (Proceedings resumed: 11:51 a.m.) | 18 | acceptable, but in this forum it's a little |
| 19 | BY MS. BART: | 19 | artificial. |
| 20 | Q. Mr. Cariou, will you please turn on | 20 | I take it this is another photograph |
| 21 | Plaintif's Exhibit 40 to the page that's marked | 21 | that you staged and this is a venue that you |
| 22 | C00024? | 22 | chose for this particular shot, is that correct? |
| 23 | A. Yes. | 23 | A. Absolutely. |
| 24 | Q. Do you have that in front of you? | 24 | Q. And is there a reason why you wanted |
| 25 | A. Yeah, I do. | 25 | to focus this particular - sorry, photograph |
|  | 82 |  | 84 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | Q. Now, this page contains multiple | 2 | this particular man, or is he just another one |
| 3 | images from the Yes Rasta book. The first one | 3 | of the strong Rastafarian men that you refer to |
| 4 | which appears on the bottom left-hand comer, | 4 | in your complaint? |
| 5 | there's three in a row, the first one in the | 5 | A. He is in the middle of his |
| 6 | bottom left-hand corner we've already taiked | 6 | plantation. |
| 7 | about. | 7 | MR. BROOKS: Objection. I don't |
| 8 | I'd like to turn next to the | 8 | think the complaint says strong. |
| 9 | that's in the middle at the bottom. | 9 | MS. BART: I certainly don't want to |
| 10 | A. Mm-hmm. | 10 | mischaracterize the complaint, but hold on |
| 11 | Q. Do you see that one there? | 11 | a second, let me get to paragraph 16. |
| 12 | A. Yeah. | 12 | And he's referred to strong men as |
| 13 | Q. It's in essence a person's head and | 13 | well -- |
| 14 | it looks like it's in the middle of vegetation? | 14 | MR. BROOKS: He has, yes. The |
| 15 | A. Yeah. | 15 | complaint doesn't. |
| 16 | Q. Is that him? | 16 | MS. BART: Mostly close-up portraits |
| 17 | A. Yeah. | 17 | of stern, mystica-looking men within a |
| 18 | Q. Can you please turn to the first | 18 | distirictive landscape, tropical landscape. |
| 19 | blue tab on Plaintiff's Exhibit 41 that is | 19 | BY MS. BART: |
| 20 | marked C24, that should be the same image, and | 20 | Q. Is there a reason why you wanted to |
| 21 | we can get a page number. | 21 | photograph this particular Rastafarian? |
| 22 | And what page is that, 33? | 22 | A. Yeah, he's someone that 1 really |
| 23 | A. 33, yeah. | 23 | wanted to photograph. I liked his eyes and his |
| 24 | Q. Thank you. | 24 | look. And I liked the location, made it |
| 25 | So that is the image that we're | 25 | visually compelling, and that's about it. |


|  | 85 |  | 87 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | Q. And in this particular instance your | 2 | Q. Would it help you to see your |
| 3 | focus is - you used the surrounding hemp to | 3 | answers to your initial disclosures? |
| 4 | draw attention to the facial features of this | 4 | A. I don't know. |
| 5 | man that you thought were important? | 5 | MR. BROOKS: Answers to |
| 6 | A. Mm-hmm. | 6 | interrogatories, to your interrogatories. |
| 7 | Q. Or that you wanted to capture? | 7 | MS. BART: Okay. |
| 8 | MR. BROOKS: Excuse me, you should | 8 | Why don't we just mark this as the |
| 9 | say yes. You can say yeah, but not | 9 | next exhibit. |
| 10 | uh-huh. | 10 | (Defendant's Exhibit 4, answers and |
| 11 | A. Yes. | 11 | objections to interrogatories, was marked |
| 12 | MS. BART: Thank you, Mr. Brooks. | 12 | for identification, as of this date.) |
| 13 | BY MS. BART: | 13 | Q. Have you found the place where you |
| 14 | Q. And we've already talked about | 14 | wrote -- |
| 15 | processing, et cetera, and you've said you | 15 | A. Yeah. |
| 16 | staged it. Do you know approximately how long | 16 | Q. I'm sorry, I've handed you what's |
| 17 | it took you to take this shot? | 17 | been marked as Defendant's Exhibit 4, which |
| 18 | A. It took us about two hours to get to | 18 | are Plaintiff Patrick Cariou's answers and |
| 19 | the plantation. That's one thing. | 19 | objections to Defendants Gagosian Gallery, Inc., |
| 20 | And then, I don't know, maybe an | 20 | and Lawrence Gagosian's interrogatories. |
| 21 | hour in order to get the proper lighting and the | 21 | Do you have that in front of you? |
| 22 | proper shot. | 22 | A. Yeah. |
| 23 | Q. And where is this plantation | 23 | Q. And these are the responses that you |
| 24 | located? | 24 | prepared? |
| 25 | A. It's in - what did I say? Out of | 25 | A. Yes. |
|  | 86 |  | 88 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | respect for the privacy of Rasta in Yes Rasta, | 2 | Q. And it says in the last response |
| 3 | caption, names and places have been excluded. | 3 | that you participated in the preparation of |
| 4 | Q. Yes. You've given us towns and | 4 | these responses? |
| 5 | things where this -- | 5 | A. Yes. |
| 6 | A. Yes, but that's in Westmoreland, the | 6 | Q. So have you found the answer that |
| 7 | Parish of Westmoreland. | 7 | you were thinking of? |
| 8 | Q. I'm not going there, so it's okay, | 8 | A. Yes. |
| 9 | to the plantation. | 9 | Q. Is that response to number 1C? |
| 10 | And did you have to ask for anyone | 10 | A. Yeah. |
| 11 | else's permission to access the plantation? | 11 | Q. So can you tell us who purchased the |
| 12 | A. No, that was his plantation and | 12 | image that appears on page 33 of Plaintiff's 41? |
| 13 | everyone that he agreed on could be there. | 13 | A. Nicolas Laurent Olivier Girard. |
| 14 | Q. Have you licensed any rights in this | 14 | Q. How do you know Mr. Girard? |
| 15 | image other than those that were licensed to | 15 | A. He's a friend of mine. |
| 16 | Powerhouse? | 16 | Q. And how long have you known |
| 17 | A. No. | 17 | Mr. Girard? |
| 18 | Q. And have you attempted to market, as | 18 | A. I would say about 10 years. |
| 19 | we defined it earlier, this image other than | 19 | Q. And how long before Mr. Girard |
| 20 | through Yes Rasta? | 20 | purchased the image that appears on page 33 did |
| 21 | A. No, I sold a print. | 21 | you know Mr. Girard? |
| 22 | Q. You sold a print? | 22 | A. He bought it - I don't remember |
| 23 | A. Yeah. | 23 | when he bought it. He bought it like two years |
| 24 | Q. To whom did you sell this? | 24 | ago. I must have known him for six years at |
| 25 | A. To -- I don't have the list of -- | 25 | least. |

Toll Free: 800.944 .9454
Facsimile: 212.557.5972

|  | 89 |  | 91 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | Q. And what were the circumstances that | 2 | of the -- what other two prints or images he |
| 3 | caused you to sell him a copy of this particular | 3 | purchased prints of? |
| 4 | image? | 4 | A. Yeah. |
| 5 | A. Well, I like him very much, and he | 5 | Q. Just keep those other materials out |
| 6 | always wanted to have a print. And some day, | 6 | there. |
| 7 | you know, I decided that I liked him enough to | 7 | A. I know. I'm just going to put them |
| 8 | sell him a print. | 8 | there. |
| 9 | Q. And that was before this lawsuit was | 9 | Q. Okay, good. |
| 10 | filed? | 10 | A. And I'm going to have to go through |
| 11 | A. Yeah. | 11 | the book in order to - |
| 12 | Q. And it was before you found out | 12 | (Witness looks through exhibit.) |
| 13 | about the Canal Zone exhibition? | 13 | A. This one. |
| 14 | A. Yeah. | 14 | Q. Which appears on page 30? |
| 15 | Q. And so do I understand from your | 15 | A. On page 30. |
| 16 | answer that you only sell your images or prints | 16 | Q. Okay. |
| 17 | of your images to people that you like? | 17 | A. And this one on page 11. |
| 18 | A. Yeah. | 18 | Q. Did Mr. Girard select the images -- |
| 19 | Q. And is there a reason for that? | 19 | A. Yeah. |
| 20 | A. No. | 20 | Q. I'm sorry, the images that he wanted |
| 21 | Q. Had you and Mr. Girard been talking | 21 | prints of? |
| 22 | about him purchasing a print of one of the | 22 | A. Yeah. |
| 23 | images? | 23 | Q. And had you displayed them somewhere |
| 24 | Had the two of you been talking | 24 | and he'd seen them or did he just come to your |
| 25 | about him purchasing -- | 25 | studio or come to your place and see them? |
|  | 90 |  | 92 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | A. Yeah. | 2 | A. Sorry to -- |
| 3 | Q. - one of the images? | 3 | Q. We'll break you by the end of the |
| 4 | A. Yeah. | 4 | day. |
| 5 | Q. A print of one of the images? | 5 | A. Yeah. No, I have a bunch of books |
| 6 | A. He has three actually. He has three | 6 | of prints at home, you know, and he hangs out a |
| 7 | prints. | 7 | lot at home, and he was going through it. |
| 8 | Q. So did he pay - your answer says | 8 | And he also has a book, and he liked |
| 9 | that he paid 1,500 Euros, so he purchased three? | 9 | those pictures very much. |
| 10 | A. Yeah. | 10 | MR. BROOKS: Can I just say which |
| 11 | Q. And it says original photographs, | 11 | book does he have? |
| 12 | what you really mean is a print of an original | 12 | A. The Yes Rasta book. |
| 13 | photograph, correct? | 13 | MS. BART: I'm sorry, the record |
| 14 | MR. BROOKS: Well, it says per | 14 | reflected that he had pointed to the |
| 15 | photograph. | 15 | Yes Rasta book. |
| 16 | A. Yeah. | 16 | BY MS. BART: |
| 17 | MS. BART: Right. I know. That's | 17 | Q. Mr. Cariou, how did you arrive at |
| 18 | what I just said. | 18 | the price of 1,500 dollars per print? |
| 19 | MR. BROOKS: 1,500 Euros. | 19 | MR. BROOKS: Euros. |
| 20 | BY MS. BART: | 20 | Q. Euros? |
| 21 | Q. So you received 4,500 Euros | 21 | A. It was a mutual agreement, you know. |
| 22 | collectively from Mr. Girard -- | 22 | It was more a friend's price than anything else. |
| 23 | A. Yeah. | 23 | Q. And did you sign any of these three |
| 24 | Q. - from the print? | 24 | prints for Mr. Girard? |
| 25 | Can you tell us from memory which | 25 | A. Yeah. |

Suite 4715
One Penn Plaza
New York, NY 10119 www.esquiresolutions.com

|  | 93 |  | 95 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | Q. And are they signed on the front or | 2 | Q. And when you say you always wanted |
| 3 | on the back? | 3 | it, did you have that plan at the time that you |
| 4 | A. On the back. | 4 | first began working on the Yes Rasta -- I'll |
| 5 | Q. And do you have any notation to | 5 | call it a collection, if that's all right with |
| 6 | Mr. Girard on any of the backs or just your | 6 | you? |
| 7 | name? | 7 | A. Yes. |
| 8 | A. No, it's my name and edition, artist | 8 | Q. And you said you always wanted to |
| 9 | edition of three. | 9 | do this but you were waiting for the right |
| 10 | Q. And what do you mean by artist | 10 | opportunity. When you say right opportunity |
| 11 | edition of three? | 11 | were you looking for the right person to |
| 12 | A. It means that -- it means that three | 12 | distribute or sell those or was it just the |
| 13 | prints were mine out of an edition of eight, | 13 | right opportunity in terms of your career? |
| 14 | because l'd always been planning of selling | 14 | A. The right opportunity -- the right |
| 15 | prints at some point. | 15 | person to take care of it, yeah. |
| 16 | And it would be under the edition of | 16 | Q. And would that be like an agent? |
| 17 | eight. But out of those eight three are called | 17 | A. More like a gallery. |
| 18 | artist edition. And that's usual in the | 18 | Q. And have you found such an |
| 19 | photographic world. | 19 | opportunity? |
| 20 | Q. And did you select the three for the | 20 | A. Yeah. |
| 21 | artist edition because they were the three | 21 | Q. And which gallery is that? |
| 22 | chosen by Mr. Girard, or did he -- let me | 22 | A. It's called Clic Gallery. |
| 23 | finish - or did he want to purchase those that | 23 | Q. C-L-I-C, correct? |
| 24 | would be designated the artist edition? | 24 | A. C-L-I-C, yeah. |
| 25 | A. No, no, it just - it happened to be | 25 | Q. And where is that located? |
|  | 94 |  | 96 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | that way. There wasn't really thinking, you | 2 | Is that here in New York? |
| 3 | know, much thinking about it. | 3 | A. Yeah, it's in New York. |
| 4 | Q. Now, you mentioned in your last | 4 | Q. How did you first leam about Clic |
| 5 | answer I believe that you're planning to do an | 5 | Gallery? |
| 6 | edition of eight, that this is something that | 6 | A. She contacted - it's owned by a |
| 7 | you've been planning to do? | 7 | lady called Christiane Celle, and she contacted |
| 8 | A. Yeah. | 8 | me on summer 2008 asking me to represent me and |
| 9 | Q. When did you first develop the plan | 9 | to -- she wanted to do my shows. |
| 10 | to produce an edition of eight of the images | 10 | Q. And, in fact, you and Ms. Celle |
| 11 | that appears in the Yes Rasta book? | 11 | communicated by e-mail - |
| 12 | A. Well, I always waited for the right | 12 | A. Yeah. |
| 13 | opportunity, and I just finished my fourth book | 13 | Q. -in French on that subject, |
| 14 | of portraits. And so l've been developing this | 14 | correct? |
| 15 | plan for quite a while now. | 15 | A. Correct. |
| 16 | But I wasn't feeling ready to put -- | 16 | Q. And after the two of you |
| 17 | to make those prints available up until | 17 | communicated by e-mail you then retained her |
| 18 | recently. | 18 | services - you then said I want you to be my |
| 19 | Q. And why is that? | 19 | agent? |
| 20 | A. Because I felt that I needed to | 20 | A. Yeah. |
| 21 | complete my fourth book of portraits. | 21 | Q. Or my gallery to represent me? |
| 22 | Q. And you felt that it might enhance | 22 | A. Exactly. |
| 23 | the value or the price that you could command | 23 | Q. Is that on an exclusive basis, |
| 24 | for a print of your images? | 24 | Mr. Cariou? |
| 25 | A. Yeah. | 25 | A. Yeah. |

Toll Free: 800.944.9454
Facsimile: 212.557.5972

|  | 97 |  | 99 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | Q. And is there a writing that | 2 | about the Canal Zone exhibition and happened to |
| 3 | memorializes your relationship? | 3 | learn that Mr. Prince has used some of my Rastas |
| 4 | A. No. | 4 | picture in his work and canceled my show. |
| 5 | Q. And what percentage of every, l'll | 5 | Q. And when did she do this? |
| 6 | call them prints, that is sold by the gallery, | 6 | A. She did it in I think it's December. |
| 7 | what percentage does the gallery keep? | 7 | Q. Of 2009? |
| 8 | A. 50 percent. | 8 | A. Of 2009. |
| 9 | Q. And you mentioned that the three | 9 | Q. And when -- |
| 10 | images that Mr. Girard picked out, one is found | 10 | MR. BROOKS: Wait a second, I'm |
| 11 | in the middle of 22, I believe it was on page | 11 | sorry. Nine or eight? |
| 12 | 33, the three images? | 12 | Q. This year or last year? |
| 13 | A. What are we talking? Sorry. | 13 | A. Last year, 2008. Sorry about that. |
| 14 | Q. In the book you pointed to I believe | 14 | MR. BROOKS: That's okay. |
| 15 | it was page 11 of the book -- l'm just trying to | 15 | Q. And she first approached you I |
| 16 | come back to the record here. | 16 | believe in June of 2008? |
| 17 | At page 11 was one of them? | 17 | MR. BROOKS: Objection. It's August |
| 18 | MR. BROOKS: These are the three | 18 | if you look at the documents. |
| 19 | prints that he sold to Mr. Girard? | 19 | A. Yeah, Ithink it's August, yeah. |
| 20 | MS. BART: These are what he's | 20 | Q. And do you know what prompted |
| 21 | called the artist edition. | 21 | Ms. Celle to first contact you in August of |
| 22 | A. Yeah, yeah. | 22 | 2008? |
| 23 | Q. And the other one was on page 33? | 23 | A. Because she knew about my work. |
| 24 | A. Yeah. | 24 | Q. And so she just approached you for |
| 25 | Q. And then, I'm sorry, I just don't | 25 | the possibility? |
|  | 98 |  | 100 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | remember the third one. | 2 | A. Yes. |
| 3 | A. I'll find it. It's 30. | 3 | Q. What specifically did Ms. Celle say |
| 4 | Q. 30, right. | 4 | to you when she told you that she was going to |
| 5 | MR. BROOKS: And what's the other | 5 | cancel your show? |
| 6 | one? 11? | 6 | A. Well, she told me that she didn't |
| 7 | A. 11, yeah, 33 and 30. | 7 | want to look opportunistic and ride on |
| 8 | Q. Now, you mentioned that there would | 8 | Mr. Prince's fame and hype and that it wasn't |
| 9 | be an edition of eight. Can you tell me by | 9 | a good idea to show the Rasta picture while they |
| 10 | reference to the page numbers in Plaintiff's | 10 | were in another gallery. |
| 11 | Exhibit 41 what the other eight would be that | 11 | Q. Did she tell you that once the |
| 12 | would be included in your edition of eight? | 12 | lawsuit is resolved she would be willing to |
| 13 | A. The edition of eight is an edition | 13 | resume the representation or to represent you? |
| 14 | of eight of one photograph. | 14 | A. I don't know. |
| 15 | Q. I see. I see. | 15 | Q. She didn't say it? |
| 16 | A. Eight prints of the same photograph. | 16 | A. No. |
| 17 | Q. I see. So there's no other special | 17 | Q. Did you discuss it with her? |
| 18 | compilation? | 18 | A. She didn't say anything about it. |
| 19 | A. No, no. | 19 | We didn't discuss about it. |
| 20 | Q. Are prints of the images that appear | 20 | Q. Did you make any efforts to persuade |
| 21 | in the Yes Rasta book available currently for | 21 | Ms. Celle to continue on with the relationship? |
| 22 | sale at Clic Gallery? | 22 | A. Yeah. |
| 23 | A. No. | 23 | Q. And what did you say? |
| 24 | Q. Why is that? | 24 | A. Well, that, you know, I have other |
| 25 | A. Because Christiane Celle found out | 25 | body of work and eventually maybe, you know, |

Facsimile: 212.557.5972

|  | 101 |  | 103 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | when the time is good we could eventually do | 2 | this fit with the gallery, did she give you an |
| 3 | something. | 3 | explanation for that? |
| 4 | Q. And what did she say? | 4 | A. Well, she does a lot of ethnic |
| 5 | A. She said maybe. | 5 | photography show. |
| 6 | Q. The other body of work that you have | 6 | Q. And she considered the - did she |
| 7 | done, one is called Surfer I believe? | 7 | tell you if she considered the Canal Zone show |
| 8 | A. Mm-hmm. | 8 | to be an ethnic collection? |
| 9 | Q. And there's the -- what are the | 9 | MR. BROOKS: Hold on. |
| 10 | other two? | 10 | Canal Zone or Yes Rasta? |
| 11 | A. The other book is called Trench Town | 11 | Q. I'm sorry, Yes Rasta to be an ethnic |
| 12 | Love. | 12 | collection? |
| 13 | Q. And are there any other -- | 13 | A. Yeah. |
| 14 | A. Well, there is one book which is | 14 | Q. How recently have you spoken with |
| 15 | completed but with nothing pressed yet. It's | 15 | Ms. Celle? |
| 16 | called Gypsies. It's about gypsies. | 16 | A. Last week. |
| 17 | Q. And that's the one that appears on | 17 | Q. And was that about the lawsuit? |
| 18 | your website? | 18 | A. No. |
| 19 | A. Yeah, I have a few pictures of that | 19 | Q. You spoke about works that you're |
| 20 | on my website. | 20 | working on? |
| 21 | Q. And there are no images that appear | 21 | A. Yeah. |
| 22 | from the Surfer, Trench Town Love, or the Gypsy | 22 | Q. And she's still considering taking |
| 23 | collections that appear in any of Mr. Prince's | 23 | you on as an artist? |
| 24 | Canal Zone paintings, correct? | 24 | A. Eventually. We'll see if it happens |
| 25 | MR. BROOKS: I just want to hear | 25 | or not. I don't know. |
|  | 102 |  | 104 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | that question again. | 2 | Q. But you've not approached anyone |
| 3 | (Record read.) | 3 | else about the possibility of helping you |
| 4 | A. Correct. | 4 | implement your plan to sell prints of your |
| 5 | Q. Have you had any subsequent | 5 | various bodies of work? |
| 6 | conversations with Ms. Celle about the | 6 | A. No. |
| 7 | possibility of her representing you or being | 7 | Q. Okay. If we could return to the |
| 8 | your exclusive gallery? | 8 | image that we were discussing, which is the |
| 9 | A. Yeah. | 9 | gentleman in the - |
| 10 | Q. And what have been those | 10 | A. In the field? |
| 11 | conversations? | 11 | Q. -- in the field. |
| 12 | A. You know, about finding -- our plan | 12 | MR. BROOKS: I'm sorry, I'm just |
| 13 | was to show the Rasta. And because she said it | 13 | lost, but it's probably my fault. |
| 14 | would fit in very well with the gallery and now, | 14 | Which one are we discussing? |
| 15 | you know, we're in the midst of seeing what's | 15 | MS. BART: 24. It's on C00024 and |
| 16 | going on and what l'm going to produce next and | 16 | it was on page 33 of the book. |
| 17 | if it's going to fit with the gallery or not. | 17 | MR. ${ }^{\text {PROOKS: Okay. }}$ |
| 18 | Q. And why did she think that the | 18 | A. It's on page what, please? |
| 19 | Yes Rasta collection fit with her gallery? | 19 | Q. 33 of the book. |
| 20 | MR. BROOKS: Object to the form. | 20 | A. Thank you. |
| 21 | MS. BART: What's the basis? | 21 | Q. Actually, you know, It think we had |
| 22 | MR. BROOKS: You asked him why did | 22 | gotten through most of the questions that I had |
| 23 | she think. | 23 | on this, so my apologies. |
| 24 | BY MS. BART: | 24 | Why don't we turn to the next image |
| 25 | Q. Did she tell you why she thought | 25 | that appears to the right of the man -- l'll |


|  | 105 |  | 107 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | just call it in the hemp grove, if that's all | 2 | A. Correct. |
| 3 | right with you? | 3 | Q. So it's only something that comes |
| 4 | A. Yeah. | 4 | from the left-hand side? |
| 5 | Q. Which appears to be a man walking | 5 | A. Exactiy. |
| 6 | among rocks, do you see that? | 6 | MR. BROOKS: Well, it's the |
| 7 | A. Yeah. | 7 | right-hand side. |
| 8 | Q. You'll find that image on page 80 of | 8 | A. This side. |
| 9 | the book, the Yes Rasta book. | 9 | MR. BROOKS: It's his right hand. |
| 10 | A. $80 ?$ | 10 | MS. BART: I know. It's my left |
| 11 | Q. Yes. | 11 | hand. |
| 12 | MS. HAMMERMAN: It's the yellow 80. | 12 | MR. BROOKS: His right hand. |
| 13 | A. Sorry, thanks. | 13 | MS. BART: Okay, I got it. |
| 14 | Q. Or you can find it the other way. | 14 | BY MS. BART: |
| 15 | We've got both ways. It's the second 24. | 15 | Q. Page 88? |
| 16 | A. It's me. My fault. Okay, 80. | 16 | MR. BROOKS: Right. |
| 17 | MR. BROOKS: Wait a minute. What's | 17 | Q. Mr. Cariou, I notice that there |
| 18 | yellow? Oh, orange okay. I think that's | 18 | isn't a line that goes from the image of this |
| 19 | this one. | 19 | page 88 that's on Plaintiff's Exhibit 40 to |
| 20 | MS. BART: No, that's not right. | 20 | something in the work by Mr. Prince, which is |
| 21 | This number is wrong. I'm terribly sorry. | 21 | entitled Canal Zone 2008, is there a reason why, |
| 22 | MR. BROOKS: Can you find this guy? | 22 | were you not sure? |
| 23 | THE WITNESS: Yeah. | 23 | A. Yeah, it's a mistake. I forgot. |
| 24 | BY MS. BART: | 24 | Q. So it's just a mistake? |
| 25 | Q. Try page 88. | 25 | A. Yeah. |
|  | 106 |  | 108 |
|  | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | A. Yeah. | 2 | Q. Why don't you take this red pen that |
| 3 | MR. BROOKS: It's 87 and 88. | 3 | I'm going to hand you and mark on the deposition |
| 4 | MS. BART: I hadn't gotten there | 4 | exhibit where in the Canal Zone work you think |
| 5 | yet. | 5 | that image appears. |
| 6 | BY MS. BART: | 6 | MR. BROOKS: Is this painting called |
| 7 | Q. It think your lawyer wants to take | 7 | Canal Zone? |
| 8 | your deposition, Mr. Cariou. | 8 | MS. BART: Well, you guys put it up |
| 9 | A. No, no, he's fine. | 9 | there. I think it's called Canal Zone |
| 10 | Q. You now have in front of you a | 10 | 2008. |
| 11 | two-page reproduction of an image that appears | 11 | MR. HAYES: It is. |
| 12 | on pages 87 and 88, and is that the same image | 12 | MR. BROOKS: Okay. |
| 13 | that appears in the bottom of C00024 in | 13 | MS. BART: If you want to check |
| 14 | Plaintiff's Exhibit 40? | 14 | that, you can. We're just taking your |
| 15 | It's to the right of the man in the | 15 | example. |
| 16 | hemp grove? | 16 | (Witness marks exhibit.) |
| 17 | A. Yes, it is. | 17 | A. Okay. |
| 18 | Q. Now, I notice that in your | 18 | Q. May I see what you've drawn? |
| 19 | companison that appears in page, I'm sorry, | 19 | A. Sure. |
| 20 | PEX40, that only one half of the actual total | 20 | Q. All right. So what you've focused |
| 21 | image appears in PEX40, and that's because the | 21 | on are the three trees - |
| 22 | material that appears on page 87 of the book | 22 | A. Exactly. |
| 23 | you're not saying that that appears in any of | 23 | Q. -- or the three-headed tree, they |
| 24 | Mr. Prince's works, in this particular work, is | 24 | look like poofs, that appear in the upper part |
| 25 | that correct? | 25 | of Mr. Prince's work, is that what you're |

Toll Free: $\mathbf{8 0 0 . 9 4 4 . 9 4 5 4}$ Facsimile: 212.557.5972

|  | 109 |  | 111 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | saying? | 2 | because it's easier for me to see? |
| 3 | A. Yeah. | 3 | A. Sure. |
| 4 | Q. And that's the portion of that | 4 | Q. Thank you kindly. |
| 5 | particular work that appears, correct? | 5 | I notice that a significant portion |
| 6 | A. Yeah. | 6 | of the vegetation that he's seen standing in has |
| 7 | Q. Can you tell me what you think is | 7 | been blurred out, and is that again to draw |
| 8 | distinctive about that particular landscape, | 8 | emphasis on the person whose image you're trying |
| 9 | portion of the landscape, because I take it the | 9 | to photograph? |
| 10 | man is not in the image? | 10 | A. I would not agree on that one. It's |
| 11 | A. $\mathrm{Mm}-\mathrm{hmm}, \mathrm{mm}$-hmm. | 11 | like there is much more depth of field than the |
| 12 | Q. So it's just focusing on that tree. | 12 | other picture we talked about. This is all, you |
| 13 | Can you tell me what you think is | 13 | know, in focus. |
| 14 | distinctive about that particular -- | 14 | Q. Yes, but -- |
| 15 | A. What's distinctive about it is that | 15 | MR. BROOKS: Just let him finish |
| 16 | it is mine. | 16 | what he was saying. |
| 17 | Q. Now, have you sold any portion of | 17 | MS. BART: Right. He was. |
| 18 | the image that appears either -- well, I would | 18 | MR. BROOKS: I'm not sure he's |
| 19 | say 87 and 88 , have you sold -- | 19 | finished. |
| 20 | A. No, I haven't sold. | 20 | BY MS. BART: |
| 21 | Q. And have you marketed, other than | 21 | Q. Look at page 79, the leaves that are |
| 22 | through the Yes Rasta book? | 22 | on page 79, to my eye that looks more blurred, |
| 23 | A. No. | 23 | but if you say no? |
| 24 | Q. And I notice that the Rasta in this | 24 25 | See, it starts to become blurred all |
| 25 |  | 25 |  |
|  | 110 |  | 112 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Caniou |
| 2 | 88, is walking away from you. Is this just | 2 | A. Yeah, because it goes further. |
| 3 | something you snapped while you were there? | 3 | Q. It goes further, but then the back |
| 4 | A. Yeah. | 4 | portion of it is blurred out, is that correct? |
| 5 | Q. Let's go back now to the image that | 5 | A. It's correct. |
| 6 | appears on page 80 of Plaintiff's Exhibit 40 in | 6 | Q. But again, it was just a place to |
| 7 | the book. | 7 | put this man that sort of draws upon the |
| 8 | A. 80? | 8 | tropical theme, correct? |
| 9 | Q. Yes, please. | 9 | A. Yeah. And it was visually |
| 10 | And that is the gentleman that | 10 | appealing. |
| 11 | appears in the bottom right of the page that's | 11 | Q. The individual himself? |
| 12 | been marked C00024 of Plaintiff's Exhibit 40, | 12 | A. The setting, the shape of the |
| 13 | correct? | 13 | leaves, the backit, the composition of the |
| 14 | A. Mm-hmm, yes. | 14 | picture. |
| 15 | Q. When did you take this particular | 15 | Q. But again, the focus was to use |
| 16 | photograph? | 16 | that backdrop to really focus or highlight the |
| 17 | A. Towards the end of my project. | 17 | individual? |
| 18 | Q. And was this a staged portraiture? | 18 | A. Yeah. |
| 19 | A. Yeah. | 19 | Q. Have you sold any prints of the |
| 20 | Q. And was this just another example of | 20 | image that appears on pages 79 and 80? |
| 21 | the Rastafarian men you were attempting to sort | 21 | A. No. |
| 22 | of document in this collection? | 22 | Q. And other than in the Yes Rasta book |
| 23 | A. Yes. | 23 | have you attempted to market this image in any |
| 24 | Q. Now, would you mind, Mr. Cariou, | 24 | way? |
| 25 | just holding up the book so I can see it, | 25 | A. No. |

Toll Free: 800.944.9454
Facsimile: 212.557.5972

|  | 113 |  | 115 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | Q. I believe I forgot to ask you on | 2 | Q. Is this something that you snapped |
| 3 | the image that appears on page 88 of the book, | 3 | along your way while you were trying to find a |
| 4 | because we got a little phumphered around, | 4 | setting, it just looked of interest to you? |
| 5 | that's the two-page image 87 and 88, I believe I | 5 | A. It was probably traveling on foot |
| 6 | forgot to ask you when you took that image? | 6 | from one location to another - |
| 7 | A. When I took that image? | 7 | Q. To do a portraiture? |
| 8 | Q. Yes, sir. | 8 | A. Yeah -- and shooting some landscape. |
| 9 | A. That was in -- right -- it must have | 9 | Q. Was this a staged shot for you or |
| 10 | been in '95. | 10 | just while - |
| 11 | Q. And why is it that you're able to | 11 | A. No, I wouldn't consider that as a |
| 12 | place that particular -- | 12 | staged shot. |
| 13 | A. Because I know exactly - this type | 13 | Q. And what was your purpose for |
| 14 | of moment, that I remember very well and I | 14 | including this particular image in the Yes Rasta |
| 15 | remember which trip it was. | 15 | book? |
| 16 | Q. And that image that's on 87 and 88, | 16 | A. Well, because - simply because, you |
| 17 | that's up on the mountain? | 17 | know, Rasta and even Jamaican and marijuana goes |
| 18 | A. Oh, yeah. | 18 | together. I needed to have some shots of |
| 19 | Q. Right towards the top? | 19 | plantations. |
| 20 | A. High up. | 20 | Q. And vegetation? |
| 21 | Q. High up, okay. | 21 | A. And vegetation. |
| 22 | If you'll now look at the | 22 | Q. Again, to kind of sort of bolster |
| 23 | comparison, Plaintiff's Exhibit 40, and in the | 23 | this whole idea of the culture as a whole? |
| 24 | upper right-hand corner you'll see another | 24 | A. Exactly. |
| 25 | hemp -- I'll call it a hemp grove I believe? | 25 | Q. Have you sold any prints of the |
|  | 114 |  | 116 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Caniou |
| 2 | A. Yeah. | 2 | image that -- |
| 3 | Q. And you can find it on pages 159 and | 3 | A. No. |
| 4 | 160 of the book. | 4 | Q. -- appears on 159 and 160? |
| 5 | MR. BROOKS: This is the top right? | 5 | A. No. |
| 6 | A. Yeah. | 6 | Q. And have you made any attempts to |
| 7 | MS. BART: Yes. Because the top | 7 | market that image other than through the |
| 8 | left is Mr. Prince's painting. | 8 | Yes Rasta book? |
| 9 | BY MS. BART: | 9 | A. No. |
| 10 | Q. Mr. Cariou, would you kindly just | 10 | Q. Let's now turn to the image that |
| 11 | let me see the actual photograph of that? | 11 | appears just below the one that we were -- |
| 12 | Okay, thank you. | 12 | A. Yeah. |
| 13 | Can you tell me what's depicted in | 13 | Q. The hemp grove. So this one I would |
| 14 | this photograph? | 14 | call it a banana tree in the middle. So it's on |
| 15 | A. It's a plantation of marijuana. | 15 | the right in the middle of $\mathrm{COOO24}$, and you can |
| 16 | Q. And so the vegetation that is | 16 | find it on page 79 and 80 of the book. |
| 17 | towards the back of the background of this | 17 | A. Not 79 and 80, it's -- |
| 18 | photo, to me, from the picture I have in front | 18 | MR. BROOKS: No, that's a different |
| 19 | of me, they look like Christmas trees, but | 19 | one. It's similar, but it's different. |
| 20 | indeed they're not. Those are also just hemp? | 20 | MS. BART: No, he's on 77 and 78. |
| 21 | A. For a happy Christmas. | 21 | A. Which page you want me to be on? |
| 22 | Q. So when did you take this particular | 22 | MS. BART: Will you see if you can |
| 23 | image? | 23 | find -- I apologize -- |
| 24 | A. I don't remember. I don't know. | 24 | MR. BROOKS: The middle one? |
| 25 | I really don't know. | 25 | MS. BART: Yes, please. The one |


| 117 |  | 119 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | that is between the hemp grove and the man | 2 | Exhibit 40, the page that's marked C 00026. |
| 3 | in the lower right-hand comer of C24. | 3 | Do you have that in front of you, |
| 4 | A. I got it. | 4 | sir -- and you can find that I believe hopefully |
| 5 | Q. You have it? | 5 | on page 128 of the Yes Rasta book. |
| 6 | A. It's 95 and 96. | 6 | A. Yeah. |
| 7 | Q. Mr. Cariou, do you recall when this | 7 | Q. You have that in front of you? |
| 8 | particular image, two-page image was shot? | 8 | A. Yeah. |
| 9 | A. I think it was early into - it must | 9 | Q. When was this particular shot taken? |
| 10 | have been in '94. | 10 | A. I don't remember. I know this guy |
| 11 | Q. And this is not on the mountainside, | 11 | very well, and we hang out a lot together. And |
| 12 | this would be down in the more tropical regions | 12 | I don't remember when I took that picture. |
| 13 | of Jamaica, yes? | 13 | It was one of the first guys that I |
| 14 | A. A little bit, yeah. | 14. | got to know when I was in Jamaica. So through |
| 15 | Q. And this is just another photograph | 15 | the end. So I don't know -- we spent a lot of |
| 16 | of a landscape that you shot, again, to create | 16 | time together, sol couldn't tell you when we |
| 17 | this whole feeling of the whole book? | 17 | took this picture. |
| 18 | A. Yeah. | 18 | Q. So this was towards the end of the |
| 19 | Q. It was not a staged shot, it was | 19 | series or -- |
| 20 | just something you were shooting? | 20 | A. Middle to the end. |
| 21 | A. Well, what do you mean by staged | 21 | Q. And it looks to me like he's in a |
| 22 | shot? This one I took - it took me a long - | 22 | more - I don't want to use the word urban, but |
| 23 | not a long time, but it took me time to frame it | 23 | it looks to me like there's a house or something |
| 24 | properly, to find the proper light to do it and | 24 | behind him, but it's hard to tell? |
| 25 | to, you know, to make it the way it is. | 25 | A. Yeah. It's in Negril. |
|  | 118 |  | 120 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | Q. And you were on your way to another | 2 | Q. In Negnil? |
| 3 | shot? | 3 | A. Yeah. |
| 4 | A. No, I was probably waiting for | 4 | Q. So this is more in town as opposed |
| 5 | someone or doing scouting like you say all the | 5 | to the mountains? |
| 6 | time, you just like -- and that's what I did. | 6 | A. Yeah. |
| 7 | Also, what was interesting to me in | 7 | Q. And this is another portraiture, |
| 8 | that picture is, as you noticed, you have banana | 8 | another example of a Rastafarian that you wanted |
| 9 | trees. | 9 | to photograph? |
| 10 | Q. Yes, I see. I can see them. | 10 | A. Yes, absolutely. |
| 11 | A. And plus different food plant, but | 11 | Q. For part of this documentary, is |
| 12 | you also have ganja that no one noticed in the | 12 | that correct? |
| 13 | picture. So it was for me a way to show how | 13 | A. Yeah. |
| 14 | intertwined ganja is with Jamaica. It's | 14 | MR. BROOKS: Objection to the form |
| 15 | everywhere. | 15 | documentary, the word documentary. I |
| 16 | Q. And ganja is another word for hemp | 16 | don't know what that means. |
| 17 | or manjuana, correct? | 17 | MS. BART: Well, he's previously |
| 18 | A. Yeah, yeah. | 18 | testified that this is a documentary of |
| 19 | Q. Have you ever sold any prints of | 19 | the lives of people, the Rastafarians and |
| 20 | this particular image? | 20 | their culture. |
| 21 | A. No. | 21 | MR. BROOKS: That's why I'm |
| 22 | Q. And have you marketed this image in | 22 | objecting, I don't think he ever used the |
| 23 | any way other than through the Yes Rasta book? | 23 | word documentary. |
| 24 | A. No. | 24 | MS. BART: Let's just stand on the |
| 25 | Q. Let's now turn to Plaintiff's | 25 | transcript. But let's move on. |


|  | 121 |  | 123 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | BY MS. BART: | 2 | Q. And the focus here, we can see from |
| 3 | Q. By the way, on the previous image | 3 | the blurred background, is really on the man, so |
| 4 | which was on pages 95 and 96 , you said it was | 4 | this is another portrait? |
| 5 | something that you probably did while you were | 5 | A. Yes. |
| 6 | waiting for someone but you took some time to | 6 | Q. Have you sold any copies of prints |
| 7 | set up, it took you about a half hour or so to | 7 | of this particular image? |
| 8 | set up for the shot? | 8 | A. Yes, I have. |
| 9 | A. Yeah. | 9 | Q. And to whom did you sell - if you |
| 10 | Q. The image that appears on page | 10 | would refer back to I believe Defendant's |
| 11 | C00026, have you ever sold a print of this | 11 | Exhibit 4? |
| 12 | image? | 12 | A. To Caroline De Maigret. |
| 13 | A. No. | 13 | Q. When did you sell the painting to |
| 14 | Q. Have you ever marketed other than in | 14 | Ms. De Maigret? |
| 15 | this book? | 15 | A. When? |
| 16 | A. No. | 16 | Q. Yes. |
| 17 | Q. And have you licensed any rights in | 17 | A. That must have been in 2002. |
| 18 | this image - | 18 | Q. And how is it that she came to |
| 19 | A. No. | 19 | purchase -- |
| 20 | Q. -- other than to Powerhouse? | 20 | A. She's a friend of mine. |
| 21 | A. No. | 21 | Q. Again, if could just finish the |
| 22 | Q. Would you please tum to C27, same | 22 | question. |
| 23 | thing, and you can find this image on page 48 of | 23 | A. Sorry. Sorry. |
| 24 | the book, or you can also look for the tab | 24 | Q. So she's a friend of yours, and so |
| 25 | number 47, either way. | 25 | this is - and did she approach you to purchase |
|  | 122 |  | 124 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | A. C - | 2 | one of your prints? |
| 3 | MR. BROOKS: 48. | 3 | A. Yes. |
| 4 | A. Okay. | 4 | MR. BROOKS: Let her finish. |
| 5 | Q. Do you have the image in front of | 5 | A. Sorry. |
| 6 | you? | 6 | MR. BROOKS: It's not going to make |
| 7 | A. Yes. | 7 | it go faster. |
| 8 | Q. When was this photograph taken? | 8 | A. Sorry guys. |
| 9 | A. Once again, middle of the trip. In | 9 | Q. It's all right. You're doing fine, |
| 10 | '96 probably. | 10 | Mr. Cariou. I know it's an artificial |
| 11 | Q. And where approximately was this | 11 | circumstance, so. |
| 12 | photograph taken? | 12 | And I believe I just asked you - |
| 13 | A. Excuse me? | 13 | MS. BART: I asked him if she |
| 14 | Q. Where? Was it up in the mountains? | 14 | approached him, correct, and he answered |
| 15 | A. Yeah, that was really high up in the | 15 | that one? |
| 16 | mountains. | 16 | (Record read.) |
| 17 | Q. And this is another example of the | 17 | BY MS. BART: |
| 18 | Rastafarian men that you were attempting to -- | 18 | Q. Ms. De Maigret, did she select this |
| 19 | A. Absolutely. | 19 | particular image or this particular print or was |
| 20 | Q. -- photograph and document? | 20 | this something that you selected for her? |
| 21 | In other words, you were looking to | 21 | A. No, she selected. |
| 22 | take this man's photo as another example of | 22 | Q. And did you give her an opportunity |
| 23 | these stern-looking men that you've alleged in | 23 | to look at all of the images in the Yes Rasta |
| 24 | your complaint, correct? | 24 | book? |
| 25 | A. Yes, correct. | 25 | A. Yeah, she had the book first of all. |

Toll Free: 800.944 .9454
Facsimile: 212.557.5972

|  | 125 |  | 127 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | And yeah, she saw -- she saw quite a bit -- I | 2 | really of your lawyer. |
| 3 | don't know if she saw all the prints, but she | 3 | A. Sure, sure. |
| 4 | saw, yeah, quite a few. | 4 | Q. So when you say two original |
| 5 | Q. So she selected this one from the | 5 | photographs, what you actually did was give her |
| 6 | book? | 6 | a print of the original images, correct? |
| 7 | A. Yeah. | 7 | A. Yeah. |
| 8 | Q. And said she wanted to purchase that | 8 | Q. And did you sign these two prints |
| 9 | particular image? | 9 | for her? |
| 10 | A. Yes. | 10 | A. Yes. |
| 11 | Q. And how long have you known | 11 | Q. And did it have any personal |
| 12 | Caroline? | 12 | inscription or just your name on the back? |
| 13 | A. Fifteen years. | 13 | A. Just my name on the back. |
| 14 | Q. And what caused her to approach you | 14 | Q. And did you date them? |
| 15 | to purchase - | 15 | A. I don't remember. |
| 16 | MR. BROOKS: Objection. | 16 | Q. Do you know whether Caroline has |
| 17 | MS. BART: He testified she | 17 | exhibited those two prints anywhere? |
| 18 | approached him. | 18 | A. I don't know. |
| 19 | MR. BROOKS: You said what caused | 19 | Q. You don't know where she has them |
| 20 | her to do something. How would he know? | 20 | today? |
| 21 | I don't mind if you rephrase it. | 21 | A. It think she has them at home, but I |
| 22 | BY MS. BART: | 22 | don't know. No, I know she has them at home, |
| 23 | Q. How did it come about that she just | 23 | but -- |
| 24 | wanted to purchase one of your images? | 24 | Q. Hanging in her house? |
| 25 | A. Well, she liked my work. And she | 25 | A. Yeah, mm-hmm. |
|  | 126 |  | 128 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | asked me repeatedly that she wanted to have two | 2 | Q. And what about Mr. Girard, where are |
| 3 | prints. And one day I was in a good mood and | 3 | his - |
| 4 | she got a chance to get my prints. | 4 | A. At home too. |
| 5 | Q. Lucky her. | 5 | Q. Hanging? |
| 6 | MR. BROOKS: Off the record for one | 6 | A. Yeah. |
| 7 | second. | 7 | Q. Okay. Did Caroline tell you why she |
| 8 | (Discussion off the record.) | 8 | wanted to purchase, why she selected the image |
| 9 | BY MS. BART: | 9 | that appears on C27? |
| 10 | Q. Now, it says in Defendant's | 10 | A. No, she just liked it very much. |
| 11 | Exhibit 4 that you sold her two original | 11 | Q. And the man in the hemp grove, did |
| 12 | photographs, I think you just mentioned it | 12 | she tell you why? These are just two that she |
| 13 | there. What was the other image that you sold | 13 | selected? |
| 14 | her? | 14 | A. Yeah. |
| 15 | A. To tell you the truth, l'm not sure. | 15 | Q. I apologize if l'm asking you a |
| 16 | I think that -- but l'm - it wasn't - I think | 16 | duplicate question, maybe I need lunch as well, |
| 17 | it's the one - I am not sure. | 17 | but did you market this image that appears on |
| 18 | I think it's the image of the guy in | 18 | C27 other than through the Yes Rasta book? |
| 19 | the plantation that we talked about again. | 19 | A. No. |
| 20 | Q. The face and the hemp field? | 20 | Q. And you've not licensed any rights |
| 21 | A. Yeah, yeah. | 21 | other than those rights that were licensed to |
| 22 | Q. Okay. Could we just ask you to let | 22 | Powerhouse -- |
| 23 | us know which of the images is the second print? | 23 | A. No. |
| 24 | A. Sure. | 24 | Q. - is that correct? Okay. |
| 25 | Q. At some point, I'm asking that | 25 | Okay. So let's go to the image that |


|  | 129 |  | 131 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Caniou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | appears on C28 of Plaintiff's 40. | 2 | A. Yes. |
| 3 | Can you tell me when this photograph | 3 | Q. Okay. So now page 6, which is the |
| 4 | was taken? | 4 | gentleman whose image appears at the bottom of |
| 5 | A. I would say '96. | 5 | C29, correct? |
| 6 | Q. And this is something that you | 6 | A. Yeah. |
| 7 | staged or is this something that you snapped | 7 | Q. Can you tell me when this photograph |
| 8 | while you were -- | 8 | was taken? |
| 9 | A. No, I staged it. | 9 | A. Towards the end. It must have been |
| 10 | Q. You staged it? | 10 | like 1997 or '98. |
| 11 | And where is this Rastafarian, where | 11 | Q. And was this one staged? |
| 12 | is this man located generally? | 12 | A. Yeah. |
| 13 | A. He's in the Blue Mountains. | 13 | Q. And this is another example of the |
| 14 | Q. So he's up high? | 14 | stern-looking Rastafarian men whose images you |
| 15 | A. Yeah. | 15 | were wanting to -- |
| 16 | Q. And that is another example of the | 16 | A. To produce. |
| 17 | stern-looking Rastafarian men whose images you | 17 | Q. -- to photograph? |
| 18 | wanted to capture for this book, correct? | 18 | A. Yeah. Otherwise none of them would |
| 19 | A. Exactly. | 19 | be in the book. |
| 20 | Q. Have you sold any copies of the | 20 | Q. Well, I'm sorry, I'm just doing my |
| 21 | image that appears on C28 or you can also see it | 21 | job here. |
| 22 | on page 59? | 22 | A. Yeah. |
| 23 | A. No. | 23 | Q. I do notice that the background is |
| 24 | Q. And I notice in my copy, perhaps you | 24 | blurred out. So again, the focus here is to |
| 25 | could tum to page C59, that the images or the | 25 | really try to hone in on a closeup of this man's |
|  | 130 |  | 132 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Caniou |
| 2 | background is completely blurred? | 2 | portrait, correct? |
| 3 | A. Yes. It's mainly because it's | 3 | A. Correct. |
| 4 | backlit. | 4 | Q. Where was this particular image |
| 5 | Q. Right. And you're wanting to really | 5 | taken, do you know? |
| 6 | focus on your subject? | 6 | A. I think it was in a little town |
| 7 | A. Yeah, and it's a close-up portrait | 7 | called Lucille. |
| 8 | so I could focus on his dreads and on his face, | 8 | Q. In Jamaica? |
| 9 | you know. So by using - the closer you go the | 9 | A. In Jamaica, yeah. |
| 10 | less depth of field you get. | 10 | Q. So he's not one of the Rastafarians |
| 11 | Q. The less depth of field? | 11 | you lived with up in the mountains? |
| 12 | A. Yeah. | 12 | A. No. I mean all - I don't know |
| 13 | Q. Turning now to $\mathbf{C} 29$ of Plaintiff's | 13 | all - because I didn't spend much time with |
| 14 | Exhibit 40 there's an image that appears on the | 14 | that man, or it was just passing through also. |
| 15 | bottom. You can also find this image I believe | 15 | I was with a few Rasta friends, they |
| 16 | on page 6 of your book. | 16 | knew each other, I thought this guy looked |
| 17 | Mr. Cariou, l'm temibly sorry, | 17 | amazing and I want to take a picture, and they |
| 18 | before we move on, would you look at the | 18 | ask for me and -- |
| 19 | image - hold your finger on that page because | 19 | Q. And you snapped it? |
| 20 | we will go back to it -- but also tum to page | 20 | A. Well, snapped is -1 took my time |
| 21 | 62 of the book. | 21 | to make a beautiful picture. |
| 22 | A. Yeah. | 22 | Q. And about how long did it take you |
| 23 | Q. Can you tell me if that is a side | 23 | to make this image? |
| 24 | image of the same gentleman who appeared on page | 24 | A. I don't know. Fifteen minutes. |
| 25 | 59 that you just talked to me about? | 25 | MS. BART: This is probably as good |

Toll Free: 800.944.9454
Facsimile: 212.557.5972


| 137 |  | 139 |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | Cariou |  |  |
| 2 | 47 of the Yes Rasta book. | 2 | image? |  |
| 3 | Are you there? | 3 | A. No. |  |
| 4 | A. Yeah. | 4 | Q. Have you marketed it for sale in any |  |
| 5 | Q. When was this particular shot taken, | 5 | way other than through the Yes Rasta book? |  |
| 6 | Mr. Caniou? | 6 | A. No. |  |
| 7 | A. I don't remember. | 7 | Q. And have you licensed any rights in this image other than through Powerhouse? |  |
| 8 | Q. Was it early in the series or later? | 8 |  |  |
| 9 | A. It think it was later in the series. | 9 | A. No. |  |
| 10 | Q. Was this a shot that you just saw | 10 | Q. All right. Now, skipping ahead to |  |
| 11 | these individuals and you took it or was this a | 11 |  |  |
| 12 | staged shot? | 12 | C39, there's an image of a gentleman on the bottom of this page. You can also find it on |  |
| 13 | A. No, it was a staged shot. | 13 | page 125 of that book. |  |
| 14 | Q. And how long did it take you to put | 14 | A. Yes. <br> Q. Do you recall when this image was |  |
| 15 | together this shot? | 15 |  |  |
| 16 | A. Quite a long time actually, because | 16 | Q. Do you recall when this image was taken? |  |
| 17 | we - once again, we were -- I was waiting for | 27 | A. Right in the middle. It must have |  |
| 18 | the specific light when it comes with tropical | 18 | been '96. |  |
| 19 | storms, and we had to wait until the storm was | 19 | Q. And this is another example of a portraiture of a Rastafarian man that you wanted |  |
| 20 | close to us to take this picture and make it the | 20 |  |  |
| 21 | way it looks. | 21 | to include in this book? |  |
| 22 | Q. Now, in this particular image, at | 22 | A. Yeah. Any of them, if they are in |  |
| 23 | least on the copy I have, it looks to me like | 23 |  |  |
| 24 | you used a fairly long depth of field, is that | 24 | Q. Understood. But l'm trying to just focus on like the portraiture aspect. The last |  |
| 25 | fair to say? | 25 |  |  |
| 138 |  |  | 140 |  |
| Cariou |  | 1 | Cariou |  |
| 2 | A. Yeah. | 2 | one you said no, you were kind of more focused |  |
| 3 | Q. And is there a reason why you chose | 3 | on de-emphasizing -- it was a portrait, but you were de-emphasizing the gentleman by bringing in |  |
| 4 | to use a longer depth of field in this image? | 4 |  |  |
| 5 | A. Well, I'm sure that at the moment I | 5 | more of the landscape, and here we see a |  |
| 6 | had a reason. I don't know. | 6 | diffused background and the focus is really on the closeup of the man. |  |
| 7 | Q. But the focus of this image is on | 7 |  |  |
| 8 | these two Rastafarian gentlemen, correct? | 8 | Have you ever sold any prints of this particular image? |  |
| 9 | A. It is and it is not. Not as much as | 9 |  |  |
| 10 | other portraits in the book. I wanted - that's | 10 | A. No. <br> Q. Have you marketed this image other than through the Yes Rasta book? |  |
| 11 | the reason why I wanted to have more depth of | 11 |  |  |
| 12 | field is I wanted to feel more about the | 12 |  |  |
| 13 | environment around them. | 13 | A. No. |  |
| 14 | Q. And why was that? That's what you | 14 | Q. And have you licensed any rights in this image to any person? |  |
| 15 | thought was good at the time? | 15 |  |  |
| 16 | A. Yeah. | 16 | A. No. |  |
| 17 | Q. Where was this particular shot | 17 | Q. Let's turn now to C40. |  |
| 18 | taken? | 18 | A. Yes. |  |
| 19 | A. That's in St. Elizabeth. It's a | 19 | Q. And we've already talked about the images that appear on the bottom left and the |  |
| 20 | parish called St. Elizabeth. | 20 |  |  |
|  | Q. And this looks to me like it's sort | 21 | bottom right, so we'll focus this line of |  |
| 2 | of in a village or town? | 22 | questioning on the middle gentieman who is sort of - - |  |
| 23 | A. It's a little town - yeah, a little | 23 |  |  |
|  | village, yeah. | 24 | A. Crown. Having a crown. <br> Q. Is that what they call it? |  |
| 25 | Q. And have you sold a print of this | 25 |  |  |



|  | 145 |  | 147 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | seven images -- | 2 | MR. BROOKS: Okay, fine. |
| 3 | A. If you don't mind, excuse me. | 3 | MS. BART: I know we had trouble |
| 4 | That's the artwork I was talking | 4 | with printing them off in Summation in |
| 5 | about earlier. | 5 | time for the production. |
| 6 | (Witness indicating.) | 6 | MR. BROOKS: Okay. |
| 7 | Q. From the newspaper? | 7 | BY MS. BART: |
| 8 | A. No, from -- it's calied Canal Zone | 8 | Q. Mr. Cariou, we've handed you what's |
| 9 | 2007. That's just a part of it. | 9 | been marked as Defendant's Exhibit 5. And the |
| 10 | Q. Right. And I'm just reading from | 10 | bottom of this document bears in the left-hand |
| 11 | the top of what you prepared, which says it's | 11 | column or corner Bates Number GG0083. |
| 12 | from the Art Newspaper. | 12 | A. Yes. |
| 13 | A. Yeah, but they only use a portion of | 13 | Q. And it appears to be a color |
| 14 | the artwork what was -- you know when we talked | 14 | reproduction of a work by Richard Prince |
| 15 | earlier this morning? | 15 | entitled The Canal Zone 2007, mixed media on |
| 16 | Q. Yes. | 16 | homasote, and then it gives the dimensions. |
| 17 | A. Just to -- you know. | 17 | Do you have that in front of you? |
| 18 | MS. BART: All right. Why don't we, | 18 | A. Yeah. |
| 19 | at this point in time, mark as the next | 19 | Q. Is this the image, the larger image |
| 20 | Defendant's Exhibit - I think we're up | 20 | to which you were just referring in your last |
| 21 | to 5 . | 21 | answer? |
| 22 | (Defendant's Exhibit 5, color | 22 | A. Yes. |
| 23 | reproduction of Canal Zone 2007, was | 23 | Q. So the image that we see on 43 is |
| 24 | marked for identification, as of this | 24 | just a portion of the image, the total image |
| 25 | date.) | 25 | that appears in Defendant's Exhibit 5, correct? |
|  | 146 |  | 148 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Caniou |
| 2 | MR. BROOKS: Just for the record, | 2 | A. Absolutely. |
| 3 | I don't think we ever received a copy of | 3 | Q. Would you take this yellow |
| 4 | this with colors. | 4 | highlighter please, sir, and highlight the |
| 5 | I think we did receive it and we | 5 | section that is on C43? |
| 6 | marked it as Plaintiff's 15, this work, | 6 | MR. BROOKS: On the original |
| 7 | but I don't think we've ever seen it with | 7 | exhibit? |
| 8 | colors, for what it's worth. | 8 | MS. BART: Yes, that's fine, on the |
| 9 | MS. BART: Yes, we produced | 9 | original, please. |
| 10 | this because we paid extra for color | 10 | (Witness marks exhibit.) |
| 11 | photography to send all these images to | 11 | BY MS. BART: |
| 12 | you. | 12 | Q. Mr. Cariou, looking at what's been |
| 13 | MR. BROOKS: Yes, but we didn't get | 13 | marked as Defendant's Exhibit 5, is it your |
| 14 | a copy with the colors on it. | 14 | position that images from Yes Rasta appear in |
| 15 | MS. BART: It's GG0083. It was | 15 | each one of the squares? |
| 16 | produced just like this with the stamp on | 16 | A. Yeah. |
| 17 | it. | 17 | Q. So, for example, in the upper |
| 18 | MS. HAMMERMAN: I think we mailed | 18 | left-hand corner it says -- someone's written |
| 19 | it. | 19 | the words Canal Zone and there's vegetative |
| 20 | MS. BART: We mailed them to you | 20 | matter underneath that, it looks like banana |
| 21 | because you had asked us for color images | 21 | leaves to me, and small print? |
| 22 | 1 think. | 22 | A. Yeah. |
| 23 | MR. BROOKS: It doesn't matter. We | 23 | Q. Can you show me where in the |
| 24 | have it now. | 24 | Yes Rasta book that image appears? |
| 25 | MS. BART: I know we had -- | 125 | A. That's a bad reproduction, so it's a |


| 149 |  | 151 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | bit complicated. But I can - yeah, I could | 2 | The image that appears on page 77 |
|  | find it. I mean it's going to take time but \| | 3 | and 78, can you just hold that up for me, |
| 4 | can find you everything. | 4 | please? |
| 5 | Q. Well, the only thing is we want to | 5 | A. Yeah, okay. |
| 6 | know what your position is on this, if this | 6 | Q. Thank you. |
| 7 | is -- | 7 | We've not talked about this one |
| 8 | A. My position is on that, that 1,2, | 8 | before, have we? |
| 9 | 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, | 9 | A. No. |
| 10 | 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27, 28, | 10 | Q. All right. When was this particular |
| 11 | 29, 30, 31, 32, 33, 34, 35 pictures, photographs | 11 | image taken? |
| 12 | of Yes Rasta were used in a single artwork from | 12 | A. I don't remember. I don't know. |
| 13 | Mr. Prince. That's my position. | 13 | At some point. |
| 14 | Q. Understood. | 14 | Q. Was this imagery that you took to |
| 15 | A. 35 photographs. | 15 | create -- to have more like tropical vegetation |
| 16 | Q. Understood. So now what I'd like to | 16 | to create the tropical look and feel of the |
| 17 | try to do, if we could, is have you find - some | 17 | Yes Rasta book? |
| 18 | of these we've gone over, so I won't make you do | 18 | A. Yeah. |
| 19 | those again, they're obvious, or we will be | 19 | Q. In your view what about the image |
| 20 | going through them, but if you could, for | 20 | that appears on pages 77 and 78 is distinctive? |
| 21 | example, find the vegetation that is on the | 21 | A. Same thing, it's a beautiful |
| 22 | upper left-hand corner in the book. | 22 | landscape. |
| 23 | (Witness looks through exhibit.) | 23 | Q. Was this something that you staged |
| 24 | MS. BART: May the record reflect | 24 | or was it something that you might have -- |
| 25 | that the witness is flipping through each | 25 | A. Staging a landscape is quite |
|  | 150 |  | 152 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | page of Plaintif's Exhibit 41 at this | 2 | complicated. You don't really move trees |
| 3 | time. | 3 | around, you know. So its a matter of being a |
| 4 | MR. BROOKS: Is that it? | 4 | photographer, having an eye and choosing the |
| 5 | MS. BART: Did you get that? | 5 | right moment and framing the picture. |
| 6 | (Clarification by reporter.) | 6 | Q. Of course. But there was another |
| 7 | MR. BROOKS: I thought that might | 7 | picture that we spoke about earlier this morning |
| 8 | have been it. | 8 | where you said you were just in passing on |
| 9 | A. That's it. | 9 | somewhere else -- |
| 10 | (Witness indicating.) | 10 | A. Yeah. |
| 11 | Q. And can you just state for the | 11 | Q. - and so that was something you |
| 12 | record the page of the book where you say this | 12 | took because it caught your eye, it wasn't like |
| 13 | image in the upper left-hand corner appears? | 13 | the one with the sun and the oncoming storm and |
| 14 | A. Yes, it's page 77 and page 78. | 14 | that road where you said you waited until the |
| 15 | Q. Okay. Is the entirety of the image | 15 | sun reached the exact place? |
| 16 | that appears on 77 and 78 reproduced here or is | 16 | A. It's the same thing on this one, the |
| 17 | it only a portion? | 17 | storm coming in. |
| 18 | A. It's a portion of it. | 18 | Q. And you're waiting? |
| 19 | Q. Now, can we go, for purposes of this | 19 | A. And l'm waiting. |
| 20 | exercise, from left to right and then we'll move | 20 | Q. So how long did it take you to do |
| 21 | down to the next row and go left to right to | 21 | this image? |
| 22 | help with the record? | 22 | A. I don't remember how long. I really |
| 23 | A. Okay. | 23 | don't remember how long. I was probably waiting |
| 24 | Q. The next image appears to be --I | 24 | for my Rasta friend to do what they had to do, |
| 25 | guess I shouid stop. | 25 | and I don't know, maybe an hour. |


| 153 |  | 155 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | Q. Have you ever sold the image that | 2 | time together. |
| 3 | appears on pages 77 and 78? | 3 | Q. You just pointed to something on his |
| 4 | A. No. | 4 | shirt. What is it? |
| 5 | Q. Have you ever licensed any rights to | 5 | A. It's Haile Selassie. |
| 6 | this image to any person other than Powerhouse? | 6 | Q. And why is that of significance to |
| 7 | A. No. | 7 | you? |
| 8 | Q. And you have in any way marketed the | 8 | A. Because that's the Rastafarian god. |
| 9 | image other than through the Yes Rasta book? | 9 | Q. And so he's considered to be a |
| 10 | A. No. | 10 | leader, or is this just a symbol -- |
| 11 | Q. Okay. Let's move to the right of | 11 | A. No, no, no, because it's just he |
| 12 | that image. We're in the first row, so it's the | 12 | liked -- |
| 13 | second one from the left. There's an image of a | 13 | Q. He liked the symbol? |
| 14 | Rastafariar, he appears to be wearing a black | 14 | A. He liked the symbol. |
| 15 | knitted hat or cap? | 15 | Q. Were you finished with your answer, |
| 16 | A. Yeah. We talked about this picture | 16 | sir? |
| 17 | before. | 17 | A. Oh, yeah, I'm sorry. Yeah. |
| 18 | Q. We did? | 18 | Q. Okay. This was a staged portrait? |
| 19 | A. Yeah. | 19 | A. Yeah, really staged portrait. |
| 20 | Q. Okay. Was this the gentleman with | 20 | Q. And what do you mean by really |
| 21 | the long beard? | 21 | staged? |
| 22 | A. Exactly. | 22 | A. Well, I took a lot of time to find |
| 23 | Q. So let's move on. | 23 | the perfect lighting, the perfect depth of field |
| 24 | The image to the right of that, | 24 | in order to have the leaves that I really like |
| 25 | which is the third from the left in the top row | 25 | in the background to be the way they are. And |
|  | 154 |  | 156 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | on Defendant's 5, the gentleman in a white | 2 | he was extremely calm and peaceful and he was |
| 3 | shirt? | 3 | willing to take as much time as I wanted to to |
| 4 | A. Yeah. | 4 | take this portrait. |
| 5 | Q. Can you please find that image in | 5 | So we - yeah, we tried to take a |
| 6 | the book? | 6 | powerful portrait and I think we succeed. |
| 7 | A. Sure. | 7 | Q. And the we here is you and someone |
| 8 | (Witness looks at exhibit.) | 8 | else or you and this gentleman? |
| 9 | A. It's page 98. | 9 | A. No, no. He and I. |
| 10 | Q. Mr. Cariou, would you mind just | 10 | Q. Have you sold this particular |
| 11 | holding that image up for me please, just so I | 11 | portrait, the image to anyone? |
| 12 | can see it? | 12 | A. Have I? That's a good question. |
| 13 | A. Sure. | 13 | Hold on one second. |
| 14 | Q. Thank you kindly. | 14 | Yes, I have actually. |
| 15 | Would you put this in the category | 15 | Q. And you've, in answering that |
| 16 | of portraitures of Rastafarians that you wanted | 16 | question, picked up your answers to |
| 17 | to include in this book? | 17 | interrogatories? |
| 18 | A. Yeah. That's actually one of my | 18 | A. Yeah, yeah. |
| 19 | favorite portraits. | 19 | Q. Or your initial disclosures, I can't |
| 20 | Q. When was this particular shot taken, | 20 | see what you have? |
| 21 | do you know? | 21 | A. No, the - |
| 22 | A. It probably must have been in '96. | 22 | (Clanification by reporter.) |
| 23 | Q. And why do you place it in '96? | 23 | Q. The answers to interrogatories. |
| 24 | A. Because I remember this man very | 24 | And I think those were marked as |
| 25 | well. I liked him very well, and we had a good | 25 | Defendarit's Exhibit 4. Yes, okay. |


|  | 157 |  | 159 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | And are you looking at answer 1C? | 2 | MR. BROOKS: Off the record. |
| 3 | A. Yeah. | 3 | (Discussion off the record.) |
| 4 | Q. And so who is the -- | 4 | BY MS. BART: |
| 5 | A. Salina Hori, the last person. | 5 | Q. Where we were is we were talking |
| 6 | Q. And so you sold a copy of this one | 6 | about the third image from the left in the top |
| 7 | for 2,000 Euros, correct? | 7 | row. And while we were off the record, |
| 8 | A. Yeah. | 8 | Mr . Cariou, we were trying to explore ways of |
| 9 | Q. Who is Salina Hori? | 9 | shortcutting this examination. |
| 10 | A. She's an acquaintance of mine. | 10 | Unfortunately, we need to understand |
| 11 | Q. And when did Ms. Hori purchase a | 11 | your reasoning for each of the images, but we'll |
| 12 | print of this? | 12 | try to find ways to short-circuit the questions. |
| 13 | A. That must have been by the summer | 13 | So let me finish the sequence with |
| 14 | last year. | 14 | this gentleman and I'll try to see if we can |
| 15 | MR. BROOKS: Excuse me one second. | 15 | lump some of the other ones together. |
| 16 | Do you mean '09 or '08 when you say | 16 | The gentleman in the white shirt, |
| 17 | last year? We're now in January 2010. | 17 | you said you sold one to Ms. Hori? |
| 18 | A. '09 this time. | 18 | A. Yes. |
| 19 | Q. So she purchased this after the | 19 | Q. And have you licensed any rights to |
| 20 | lawsuit was filed, which was in January - well, | 20 | this image other than Powerhouse? |
| 21 | your amended complaint was filed on | 21 | A. No. |
| 22 | January 14th? | 22 | Q. And have you otherwise marketed this |
| 23 | A. No, it's 2008 then. No, it's not | 23 | image other than through the Yes Rasta book? |
| 24 | 2009. Yeah, yeah. Sorry about that. | 24 | A. No. |
| 25 | Q. Under what circumstances did you | 25 | Q. Okay. So in an effort to try to |
|  | 158 |  | 160 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | sell the photograph to Ms. Hori? | 2 | deal with those three questions collectively, |
| 3 | A. Same old story, you know, I like | 3 | I know you testified about some of the other |
| 4 | her, she's a friend, she really like that | 4 | images that appear on this on Defendant's |
| 5 | picture and I was like why not. She was like I | 5 | Exhibit 5, but are there any other images that |
| 6 | want to put that there in my place, and she got | 6 | are in Defendant's Exhibit 5 where you have sold |
| 7 | it. | 7 | a print of that image? |
| 8 | Q. And I see that this particular piece | 8 | A. Yeah. On the second row, the third, |
| 9 | was sold for 2,000 Euros whereas the others were | 9 | starting from the left where Mr. Prince drew a |
| 10 | sold for 1,500? | 10 | monkey face on a beautiful Rasta. This print |
| 11 | A. Yeah. | 11 | was sold. And it's -- |
| 12 | Q. How did you set the price for this | 12 | Q. Is that page 10? |
| 13 | particular photograph or print? | 13 | I think you may have already |
| 14 | A. Because I think it was -- sorry to | 14 | testified about that. |
| 15 | interrupt - the size was a little bit bigger. | 15 | A. Page 10? Maybe. Yeah. |
| 16 | Q. And do you know if Ms. Hori still | 16 | Page 11. |
| 17 | has this image displayed in that place in her | 17 | Q. Page 11? All right. |
| 18 | home? | 18 | A. This one was sold. |
| 19 | A. Yeah. | 19 | Q. And was it sold to any of the |
| 20 | Q. And, again, just for the record, | 20 | individuals that are listed in 1C? |
| 21 | this was a print of the image that appears on | 21 | A. Yeah. It was sold to Nicolas |
| 22 | the top row of Defendant's Exhibit 9, correct? | 22 | Laurent Olivier Girard. |
| 23 | A. Yeah. | 23 | Q. So this is one of the ones that |
| 24 | MR. BROOKS: In page 98 of the book. | 24 | Mr. Girard purchased, and we've already talked |
| 25 | MS. BART: Yes. | 25 | about this work of art this morning so we don't |


|  | 161 |  | 163 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | need to go over it again. | 2 | third row, the third image from the left - |
| 3 | Other than that one are there any | 3 | A. Mm -hmm. |
| 4 | others that appear on Defendant's Exhibit 5 | 4 | Q. I'm sorry, the first image from the |
| 5 | where you've sold prints of those images? | 5 | left, the third image from the left, the fourth |
| 6 | A. No. | 6 | image from the left, the sixth image from the |
| 7 | Q. And taking the images as a whole | 7 | left, and then the last image in that row? |
| 8 | in Defendant's Exhibit 5, other than through | 8 | A. Yeah. |
| 9 | Powerhouse Magazine have you licensed any rights | 9 | Q. Taking those, and then going to the |
| 10 | to any of these images? | 10 | fourth row, the second image from the left? |
| 11 | A. No. | 11 | A. $M m-\mathrm{hmm}$. |
| 12 | MR. BROOKS: It's not a magazine. | 12 | Q. And that's it. |
| 13 | MS. BART: What did I say? | 13 | All of those that we've just talked |
| 14 | MR. BROOKS: Powerhouse Magazine. | 14 | about, those would be examples, additional shots |
| 15 | MS. BART: Powerhouse - | 15 | that you took as portraitures of Rastafarians |
| 16 | MR. BROOKS: Books. | 16 | for inclusion in this book, correct? |
| 17 | BYMS. BART: | 17 | A. Yeah, correct. |
| 18 | Q. Other than through Powerhouse have | 18 | Q. in the portraiture style? |
| 19 | you licensed any rights to any image on | 19 | A. Correct. |
| 20 | Defendant's Exhibit 5? | 20 | Q. And were all of those images |
| 21 | A. No. | 21 | staged -- |
| 22 | Q. And have you otherwise marketed any | 22 | A. Yeah. |
| 23 | of the other images on Defendant's Exhibit 5 | 23 | Q. - by you, or were any of them taken |
| 24 | other than through Yes Rasta? | 24 | spontaneously? |
| 25 | A. No. | 25 | A. No, none of them were taken |
|  | 162 |  | 164 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | Q. If we could now go back to the top | 2 | spontaneously. They were all staged. |
| 3 | row. We've already talked about the fourth | 3 | Q. And the focus of each of the images |
| 4 | image from the left and the fifth image from the | 4 | that we've just talked about is all -- they're |
| 5 | left. I don't believe we've talked about the | 5 | all on the subject that you're photographing, |
| 6 | sixth image from the left. | 6 | that's the primary focus of those images, |
| 7 | But in the interest of trying to | 7 | correct? |
| 8 | speed this along, if we could take that image | 8 | A. Yeah, correct. |
| 9 | and then go to the second row? | 9 | Q. Okay. Now, going, if we could, back |
| 10 | A. Yeah. | 10 | to the top row, there is a man who is the third |
| 11 | Q. The first image from the left? | 11 | from the right. It looks to me like he's |
| 12 | A. Yeah. | 12 | standing in front of a stream? |
| 13 | Q. The fourth image from the left? | 13 | A. Yeah. |
| 14 | A. Yeah. | 14 | MR. BROOKS: Isn't that the second |
| 15 | Q. The fith image from the left? | 15 | from the right? |
| 16 | A. Fifth image from the left? | 16 | Q. Well, there's - I don't know if |
| 17 | Q. That's the gentleman there where the | 17 | it's a single image or not? |
| 18 | hands have been drawn? | 18 | A. I see the image. |
| 19 | A. Yeah, okay. | 19 | Q. It looks like it's a waterfall? |
| 20 | Q. The seventh image from the left, | 20 | MR. BROOKS: Ocho Rios? |
| 21 | which is the man with the -- it looks like a | 21 | Is that Ocho Rios? |
| 22 | drink? | 22 | A. No, but it could be. |
| 23 | A. Yeah, a pipe. | 23 | Q. Could you please find that image in |
| 24 | Q. Like a soda or something in it. | 24 | the Yes Rasta book? |
| 25 | Then going down to the next row, the | 25 | A. I got it. It's page 55 and 56. |


|  | 165 |  | 167 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | Q. So that is a two-page image, | 2 | Q. A gang symbol? |
| 3 | correct? | 3 | A. Yeah, it's like a gun. |
| 4 | A. Yeah. | 4 | Q. All right. |
| 5 | Q. Or it's been printed that way in the | 5 | Moving on then to the image on |
| 6 | book? | 6 | Defendant's Exhibit 5 that appears to the right |
| 7 | A. Yeah, it's a spread. | 7 | of that, can you tell me what that is? |
| 8 | Q. Couid I ask you please, sir, to hold | 8 | A. Could you come again, please? |
| 9 | that up just so that I could see the original? | 9 | Q. Yes. Get Defendant's Exhibit 5, |
| 10 | A. Sure. | 10 | which is the Canal Zone. |
| 11 | Q. Okay, thank you. | 11 | A. Yeah. |
| 12 | Is this a portrait that you took | 12 | Q. And can you tell me where in the |
| 13 | having staged -- not a portrait -- is this an | 13 | book that particular image appears? |
| 14 | image that you took having staged it for the | 14 | A. The first one on the -- |
| 15 | shot, or were you taking out -- | 15 | Q. No, the farthest one on the right. |
| 16 | A. Absolutely. | 16 | A. Yeah. |
| 17 | Q. This was a staged shot? | 17 | (Witness looks at exhibit.) |
| 18 | A. Yeah. | 18 | A. Here. Page 146. |
| 19 | Q. And how long did it take you to | 19 | MR. BROOKS: Can I see that? |
| 20 | stage this particular shot? | 20 | THE WITNESS: Sure. |
| 21 | A. Quite a long time, you know. We | 21 | BY MS. BART: |
| 22 | were both in the water, all in the water, I had | 22 | Q. And having now seen the original - |
| 23 | my camera with me, and it took us a couple hours | 23 | MR. BROOKS: Ocho Rios. |
| 24 | to make it right. | 24 | A. Sorry. |
| 25 | Q. And what is the expression - are | 25 | Q. That's all right. He knows his |
|  | 166 |  | 168 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | these more examples of Rastafarian men that | 2 | waterfalls. |
| 3 | you're trying to show in their natural setting? | 3 | MR. BROOKS: I walked down it or up |
| 4 | A. The first one. | 4 | it. I don't remember. It was a long time |
| 5 | Q. The first one meaning the closest | 5 | ago. |
| 6 | one to us? | 6 | Q. Having now seen the original image |
| 7 | A. Yeah, the closest one, yeah. Not | 7 | is it fair to say that this is probably included |
| 8 | the two others. The two other ones are not | 8 | with the other group of portraiture? |
| 9 | Rastafarians. They're what they call in Jamaica | 9 | A. Yeah. |
| 10 | Rude Boys. Rude Boys. | 10 | Q. Going now to the second row of |
| 11 | Q. R-U-D-E? | 11 | Defendant's Exhibit 5, the second from the left? |
| 12 | A. Yeah. | 12 | A. The second from the left? Yeah. |
| 13 | Q. And I just have to ask? | 13 | Q. It looks to me to be -- on the |
| 14 | A. They're gangsters. | 14 | smaller image it looks to me to be a waterfall? |
| 15 | Q. Gangsters? | 15 | A. It's actually a river after a storm. |
| 16 | A. Yeah. If you can take the book and | 16 | You want me to -- |
| 17 | you look, the sign, he's like that. | 17 | Q. If you would please, sir, yes. |
| 18 | (Witness indicating.) | 18 | A. Yeah. There's a few, but that's the |
| 19 | Q. Like this? | 19 | one. |
| 20 | A. Yes. | 20 | Q. On page 17 of Plaintiff's Exhibit 41 |
| 21 | Q. And this is your index and third | 21 | in the book? Page 17 of the book, correct? |
| 22 | finger pointed at an angle downward? | 22 | A. Yes. |
| 23 | A. Yeah. | 23 | Q. And was this a landscape picture |
| 24 | Q. And that's a symbol? | 24 | that you included in Yes Rasta to just try to, |
| 25 | MR. HAYES: Gang sign. | 25 | again, connote the tropical -- |

Toll Free: 800.944.9454 Facsimile: 212.557.5972

|  | 169 |  | 171 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | A. Yeah. Look, it doesn't get much | 2 | that I know. So, yeah. |
| 3 | more tropical than that. | 3 | (Witness looks through exhibit.) |
| 4 | Q. And what, in your mind, is | 4 | A. Yeah, I got it. |
| 5 | distinctive about that particular image? | 5 | Q. And what's the page number? |
| 6 | A. Well, the fact, once again, the | 6 | A. 147 and 148. |
| 7 | storm is passing by, it's really high up in the | 7 | Q. Can you just hold that up so I can |
| 8 | mountains, the river is - how do you say it - | 8 | see it? |
| 9 | the river is -- | 9 | A. Sure. |
| 10 | Q. Rushing? | 10 | Q. Thank you. |
| 11 | A. Rushing. And I like the light. And | 11 | And was that shot up in the |
| 12 | 1 like this picture. | 12 | mountains of Jamaica? |
| 13 | Q. All right. The next image in that | 13 | A. High up in the mountains of Jamaica. |
| 14 | same row that I think we have not talked about | 14 | Q. And this was again a landscape shot |
| 15 | is the second from the right? | 15 | that you included to set the stage for the |
| 16 | A. Yeah. | 16 | Yes Rasta book? |
| 17 | Q. Can you find that image in the | 17 | A. Absolutely. |
| 18 | Yes Rasta book? | 18 | Q. And in your view what's distinctive |
| 19 | A. Yes. It's page 142. | 19 | about the image that appears on pages 147 and |
| 20 | Q. Can I just see it, sir? | 20 | 148 of Plaintiff's 41? |
| 21 | A. Is that the one you want? | 21 | A. It's a beautiful landscape. |
| 22 | Q. No, no, the second from the right, | 22 | Q. Turning now to the next row, the |
| 23 | which to me -- we've included him as part of the | 23 | first image on the left, can you find that image |
| 24 | portraiture group thing, so I did that short | 24 | in the book, please? |
| 25 | form. | 25 | A. It's page 150. |
|  | 170 |  | 172 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | A. Oh, the second one? Yeah, I think I | 2 | Q. Could you kindly hold that image up |
| 3 | know what it is but, you know, I would really | 3 | for me, Mr. Cariou? |
| 4 | need a better reproduction of that to - but I | 4 | A. Sure. |
| 5 | think I know what it is. | 5 | Q. Okay. Now, that image is an image |
| 6 | (Witness looks through exhibit.) | 6 | of two women and a young boy? |
| 7 | MS. BART: May the record reflect | 7 | A. It's an image of one woman and two |
| 8 | that the witness is looking through the | 8 | young boys. |
| 9 | Yes Rasta book for the image that appears | 9 | Q. Can you hold it up again? |
| 10 | second to the right. | 10 | A. That's the boy. |
| 11 | THE WITNESS: Which one is it again? | 11 | Q. That's the boy. I see. |
| 12 | MR. BROOKS: This one. | 12 | And would you classify that as a |
| 13 | MS. BART: On row 2 of | 13 | portraiture? |
| 14 | Defendant's 5. | 14 | A. I hope so. |
| 15 | A. 1 missed it. | 15 | Q. Okay. And what you were trying to |
| 16 | Q. Would you like to do this on a break | 16 | show there is part of the family life that is |
| 17 | and we'll fill it in later? | 17 | part of the fabric of the Rastafarian society? |
| 18 | A. If you want me to, yeah. | 18 | A. Yes. |
| 19 | Q. But you're sure this is one of your | 19 | Q. And there are other women that |
| 20 | images? | 20 | appear in the Yes Rasta book? |
| 21 | A. I'm pretty sure, yeah, because - | 21 | A. Very few actually. |
| 22 | yeah. I mean, you know, as you see, that's a | 22 | Q. But there are other women in the |
| 23 | bad - it's a small reproduction. | 23 | Yes Rasta book, correct? |
| 24 | Q. It's just a portion of an image? | 24 | A. I would have to check for that. |
| 25 | A. Yeah, it's a portion of a picture, | 25 | MR. BROOKS: No, no. |


|  | 173 |  | 175 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | Q. That's all right. I can represent | 2 | an evergreen tree, so I will beg apologies to |
| 3 | to you that there are several works that depict | 3 | the artis |
| 4 | women. | 4 | A. It's a happy Christmas tree. |
| 5 | A. Okay. | 5 | Q. Okay. Staying on that same row, |
| 6 | Q. And my question to you simply is you | 6 | there's the second picture from the right. |
| 7 | were trying to show another aspect of the | 7 | A. Second picture from the right. |
| 8 | Rastafarian culture, which is the emphasis on | 8 | Yeah. |
| 9 | family? | 9 | Q. There's handwriting, the words |
| 10 | A. Yeah. | 10 | canal? |
| 11 | Q. Turning now to I believe it's the | 11 | A. Yeah. |
| 12 | fifth image from the left in that same row, it | 12 | Q. Could you find that image please for |
| 13 | looks like a hut on top of some stones. | 13 | us in the Yes Rasta book? |
| 14 | A. It's page 45 and 46. | 14 | MR. BROOKS: After this one I would |
| 15 | Q. Mr. Cariou, could you just let me | 15 | like to take a short break |
| 16 | take a look, hold it up? | 16 | (Witness looks through exhibit.) |
| 17 | A. Sure. | 17 | MS. BART: May the record reflect |
| 18 | Q. And again, there are women in that | 18 | that the witness is flipping through the |
| 19 | picture, correct? | 19 | book to find the image. |
| 20 | A. Yeah. | 20 | BY MS. BART: |
| 21 | Q. And this is another example of an | 21 | Q. I'm sorry, what did you say, sir? |
| 22 | attempt to show family life in the Rastafarian | 22 | A. No, l'm just trying to -- |
| 23 | society? | 23 | Q. To see if that's it? |
| 24 | A. Yeah, exactly. | 24 | A. I'm just mumbling. |
| 25 | Q. In your view - well, you'll notice | 25 | Q. You're not sure? |
|  | 174 |  | 176 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | in Defendant's Exhibit 5, Mr. Cariou, only a | 2 | A. No, I'm not sure. It's too dark and |
| 3 | portion of the image that appears on 45 and 46 | 3 | too small. It's either this one - |
| 4 | is shown here, and that looks principally to be | 4 | Q. And this one is pages -- |
| 5 | the image with the house, so perhaps it's only | 5 | A. 91 and 92. |
| 6 | the page 46 ? | 6 | Q. A portion of it? |
| 7 | A. It is only page 46. | 7 | A. Yeah. Or it might be - no, that's |
| 8 | Q. And a portion of it? | 8 | the one. It's 111 and 112. |
| 9 | A. Yeah. | 9 | MS. BART: I believe counsel has |
| 10 | Q. Because we don't see the sky at the | 10 | asked for a break, so let's do that now. |
| 11 | top? | 11 | MR. BROOKS: Very short. |
| 12 | A. Yeah. | 12 | (Recess taken: 2:38 p.m.) |
| 13 | Q. In your view what is distinctive | 13 | (Proceedings resumed: 2:46 p.m.) |
| 14 | about the house or the structure that appears on | 14 | BY MS. BART: |
| 15 | page 46 of Defendant's 5 ? | 15 | Q. Mr. Cariou, l'm going to direct your |
| 16 | A. Well, it's a really old house for | 16 | attention to the bottom row of Defendant's |
| 17 | Jamaica. It was actually built by the Spanish | 17 | Exhibit 5, third image from the left. Is that |
| 18 | before they left the island to the British. | 18 | the same image that appears on page 17 and $18 ?$ |
| 19 | And, you know, it's a family that I | 19 | A. No. |
| 20 | liked and I thought that it was a nice place to | 20 | Q. Different? Can you just find it in |
| 21 | take a picture. | 21 | the book? |
| 22 | And if you notice right in the | 22 | And while you're looking is it fair |
| 23 | middle of the picture, right rext to the house | 23 | to say that this is another example of trying to |
| 24 | you have a huge marijuana tree. | 24 | provide Jamaican landscape to create a look in |
| 25 | Q. Being from Peoria I thought it was | 25 | the book? |

Toll Free: 800.944 .9454
Facsimile: 212.557.5972

|  | 177 |  | 179 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | A. Yeah. | 2 | Q. Bottom row. |
| 3 | Q. So in that respect it's similar to | 3 | A. Bottom row, yeah. |
| 4 | 17 is all I'm trying to get at, I'm just going | 4 | Q. And the words zone canal have been |
| 5 | to lump those two together? | 5 | painted on top of it. Can you tell which image |
| 6 | MR. BROOKS: Hold that one because | 6 | that is? |
| 7 | we're going to come back to that one. | 7 | A. On that one? Honestly, no. |
| 8 | What number is that? 90 ? | 8 | Q. So the rest of them you're sure |
| 9 | Okay, I got it. | 9 | they're from your book, this one you're not |
| 10 | MS. BART: The house? | 10 | sure? |
| 11 | MR. BROOKS: Yeah, it's 90. | 11 | A. Well, it's not that l'm not sure |
| 12 | Is that it? No. | 12 | it's from my book, it's just that it's such a |
| 13 | A. No. It's a big river. | 13 | small reproduction of the artwork that, you |
| 14 | Yeah, page 51. | 14 | know. |
| 15 | Q. Thank you. | 15 | I might - I could find it, but it |
| 16 | Is that 51 and 52? | 16 | would take me hours. You know, I would have to |
| 17 | A. Yeah, 51 and 52. | 17 | go through the book thoroughly. |
| 18 | Q. And the portion that is at the | 18 | Q. All right. Then let's not take the |
| 19 | bottom row is only page 51, correct? | 19 | time to do that. I don't think that's a good |
| 20 | A. Yeah. Right. | 20 | use of your time. |
| 21 | Q. In that same row I believe your | 21 | MR. BROOKS: I have a suggestion. |
| 22 | counsel had you identify page 90 as the house? | 22 | Maybe Mr. Prince knows where he took it |
| 23 | A. Yeah. | 23 | from. |
| 24 | Q. That's the fourth image from the | 24 | MS. BART: Well, this exercise is |
| 25 | right? | 25 | about your client's comparison and how he |
|  | 178 |  | 180 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | A. Yeah. | 2 | got to this picture was he said no - |
| 3 | Q. Could you kindly just hold the book | 3 | MR. BROOKS: He didn't do a |
| 4 | up, because I don't remember this image at all? | 4 | comparison of this. |
| 5 | A. Sure. | 5 | MS. BART: That's my point. |
| 6 | Q. Okay. So that's really 89 and 90, | 6 | If you let me finish, Mr. Brooks, I |
| 7 | it's a two-page image? | 7 | handed him Plaintiff's Exhibit 40 and I |
| 8 | A. Yeah. | 8 | asked him if they were all images and he |
| 9 | Q. And this is an image of a house, and | 9 | said no, and that's how he got to this |
| 10 | is that a person in sort of the foreground? | 10 | one. |
| 11 | A. No, there's nobody in the | 11 | (Defendant's Exhibit 6, document, |
| 12 | foreground. | 12 | was marked for identification, as of this |
| 13 | Q. So this is just to show another part | 13 | date.) |
| 14 | of family life? | 14 | MS. BART: I'd like to hand you |
| 15 | A. Yeah, the habitat, and it's also | 15 | what's been marked as Plaintiff's |
| 16 | extremely visually appealing. | 16 | Exhibit 6. And this is, just for the |
| 17 | Q. Appealing? | 17 | record, to show that in fact color images |
| 18 | A. Yeah. | 18 | of Defendant's Exhibit 5 were produced to |
| 19 | Q. And that's why in your mind it's | 19 | you on August 14th, 2009, via Federal |
| 20 | distinctive? | 20 | Express. |
| 21 | A. Yeah. | 21 | MR. BROOKS: Okay. |
| 22 | Q. Now, looking now in Defendant's | 22 | MS. BART: You can set that book |
| 23 | Exhibit 5, the second from the right there's | 23 | aside for right now, but keep it handy |
| 24 | a - | 24 | where you can get to it. |
| 25 | A. On which row? | 25 | I was able to knock off several |


|  | 181 |  | 183 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | pages of my outline, Mr. Brooks, as an | 2 | MS. BART: Right. Let me just |
| 3 | accommodation to your client. | 3 | finish, Mr. Brooks. |
| 4 | I'd like to mark Defendant's | 4 | BY MS. BART: |
| 5 | Exhibit 7, please. | 5 | Q. That the proprietor grants the |
| 6 | (Defendant's Exhibit 7, Powerhouse | 6 | publisher Powerhouse the first option for the |
| 7 | agreement, was marked for identification, | 7 | initial term of this agreement on all future |
| 8 | as of this date.) | 8 | licenses the right to distribute the book, and |
| 9 | Q. Mr. Cariou, I'm handing you what's | 9 | then it also gives him a right to include |
| 10 | been marked as Defendant's Exhibit 7, which is a | 10 | additional books. And that appears in I think |
| 11 | copy of the agreement between you and Powerhouse | 11 | section 35. |
| 12 | to which we've been referring throughout the day | 12 | Does this help you refresh your mind |
| 13 | today, and it's dated June 9, 2000. | 13 | as to whether or not you're familiar with what |
| 14 | And you see it's between Powerhouse | 14 | an option is? |
| 15 | Cultural Enteriainment, Inc., and yourself. | 15 | A. No, I'm not familiar with what an |
| 16 | Is this the Powerhouse agreement? | 16 | option is. |
| 17 | A. Yes, it is. | 17 | Q. Okay. When you first published the |
| 18 | Q. And if you go to the last page which | 18 | Surfer book did you give Powerhouse just the |
| 19 | bears Bates stamp number $\mathbf{C 7}$, that's your | 19 | right to publish the first book? |
| 20 | signature on the last page? | 20 | MR. BROOKS: Objection, calls for a |
| 21 | A. Yes. | 21 | legal conclusion. |
| 22 | Q. Is there a reason why Yes Rasta was | 22 | You can answer. |
| 23 | published by Powerhouse Cultural Entertainment | 23 | A. I don't know. |
| 24 | as opposed to Powerhouse Books, do you know? | 24 | Q. Did you have an agreement in the |
| 25 | A. It's the same entity. | 25 | first book? |
|  | 182 |  | 184 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | Q. It's the same entity? | 2 | A. Did I have a contract for the first |
| 3 | A. Yeah. | 3 | book? |
| 4 | Q. When you approached or when you had | 4 | Q. Yes. |
| 5 | discussions with Powerhouse did you approach | 5 | A. Yeah. |
| 6 | them or did they approach you about publishing | 6 | Q. And in that contract did it talk |
| 7 | this book? | 7 | about what would happen if you came up with |
| 8 | A. Well, they aiready had published my | 8 | another idea of the book? |
| 9 | first book called Surfers. | 9 | In other words, if you came up with |
| 10 | Q. The Surfers? | 10 | book number 2 did Powerhouse have any right to |
| 11 | A. Yeah. | 11 | publish that before anybody else or make a |
| 12 | Q. Did they have an option on your next | 12 | decision to publish that? |
| 13 | book after Surfers? | 13 | A. I don't know. |
| 14 | MR. BROOKS: I just want to make | 14 | Q. You don't know? |
| 15 | sure he knows what that means. If he does | 15 | A. I don't know. I really don't know. |
| 16 | he can answer. | 16 | Q. So the publication of the Yes Rasta |
| 17 | Q. If you turn to page 24 of the | 17 | book wasn't just an option to purchase your |
| 18 | Powerhouse agreement -- | 18 | second book? |
| 19 | MR. HAYES: You mean paragraph 24? | 19 | A. No, it was just we were really |
| 20 | Q. Paragraph 24. It says in that | 20 | friendly, the first book went really well and |
| 21 | paragraph, the proprietor - which is in this | 21 | they were really supportive from the beginning |
| 22 | case Powerhouse -- hereby grants the | 22 | on this project. |
| 23 | publisher - | 23 | Q. This meaning Yes Rasta? |
| 24 | MR. BROOKS: No, he's the | 24 | A. Yeah. And that's it. |
| 25 | proprietor. | 25 | Q. Did Powerhouse Books or Powerhouse |


|  | 185 |  | 187 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | Cultural Entertainment -- we'll just call it | 2 | didn't have a name then, but let's just refer to |
| 3 | Powerhouse - did they subsidize any portion of | 3 | it that way - did you give to the Powerhouse |
| 4 | your expenses for the Yes Rasta project? | 4 | representatives any description about your |
| 5 | A. No. | 5 | concept for this book? |
| 6 | Q. So those are all expenses that you | 6 | A. Yeah. |
| 7 | bore in that project? | 7 | Q. And what did you tell them? |
| 8 | A. Yes. | 8 | A. Well, I told them that I wanted to |
| 9 | Q. Do you know how much money you spent | 9 | have a book of photographs, obviously it would |
| 10 | putting together producing the Yes Rasta book? | 10 | be of extreme classical photography, of |
| 11 | A. Not really. I never - no. | 11 | portraiture, and I didn't want that book to look |
| 12 | Q. You didn't keep track of it? | 12 | pop culture at all, and I explain them the way I |
| 13 | A. No, I didn't keep track of it. | 13 | saw - the way I envisioned the print to be and |
| 14 | Q. When you first sat down with the | 14 | so on and so forth, and I brought them the first |
| 15 | people at Powerhouse to talk about the | 15 | couple images, and that was it. |
| 16 | possibility of publishing Yes Rasta, or perhaps | 16 | Q. Now, if you look at paragraph 1 of |
| 17 | a collection of images, you know, showcasing the | 17 | the Powerhouse agreement, in the first sentence |
| 18 | Rastafarian society, was there any discussion | 18 | there it gives Powerhouse the right to publish |
| 19 | about what audience they would try to target | 19 | the book in all languages in all territories? |
| 20 | with your book? | 20 | A. Mm-hmm. |
| 21 | A. You know, they publish artist book | 21 | Q. And my question to you is whether it |
| 22 | you know, and that's what they do really. So | 22 | was ever published in any language other than in |
| 23 | they're not much into -- I mean I didn't really | 23 | the English language? |
| 24 | have any conversation about the marketing aspect | 24 | A. No. |
| 25 | of it, you know. | 25 | Q. In what territories was it marketed |
|  | 186 |  | 188 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | What I'm into is to make beautiful | 2 | and sold, and by territories I mean let's try |
| 3 | books. And they were willing to let me do that. | 3 | countries first? |
| 4 | And that's what we concentrate about. | 4 | A. Well, mainly I would say obviously |
| 5 | Q. Did you, when you first approached | 5 | the United States, but also Europe and probably |
| 6 | them, I guess that would be sometime in 2000, | 6 | Australia. And, you know, maybe a bit of |
| 7 | about this project, did you tell them what you | 7 | South America. I don't know. But definitely |
| 8 | had in your mind -- | 8 | Europe and the States. |
| 9 | MR. BROOKS: Obje | 9 | Q. And was there a reason why those two |
| 10 | Q. -- with this project? | 10 | territories were being focused on at least |
| 11 | A. Oh, yeah. | 11 | initially? |
| 12 | MR. BROOKS: Assumes a fact not in | 12 | A. Yeah, that's where people buy artist |
| 13 | evidence that he approached them in 2000. | 13 | books. |
| 14 | Q. I think I corrected it mid-sentence, | 14 | Q. So they were targeting the market of |
| 15 | but when you first spoke with Powerhouse in | 15 | consumers of artist books? |
| 16 | 2000, and I believe you told me you approached | 16 | A. Yes. |
| 17 | them, you said I have another idea for the book, | 17 | Q. And that's one of the best markets, |
| 18 | that's how they found out about it, right? | 18 | followed by Australia? |
| 19 | A. No, not exactly. It think that | 19 | A. Yeah. |
| 20 | Surfers was published in '97, and I was already | 20 | Q. Okay. If you'll turn to paragraph |
| 21 | well into the Rasta project, and they knew about | 21 | 22 on C5 it says the publisher shall be the |
| 22 | it and they loved it, and they wanted to publish | 22 | exclusive producer of this work, the sales of |
| 23 | it when it will be finished. | 23 | said work to other exclusive territorial |
| 24 | Q. Okay. So when you first talked to | 24 | publishers are subject to separate agreements. |
| 25 | them about the Yes Rasta project -- perhaps it | 25 | Were there separate publishing |


|  | 189 |  | 191 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | agreements or any other type of agreement with | 2 | So I wanted to pay an homage to the Rasta by |
| 3 | respect to the Yes Rasta book or the images? | 3 | saying that they were staying strong against |
| 4 | A. No. | 4 | barbanism. |
| 5 | Q. So they were just protecting | 5 | Q. And this homage you talked about, |
| 6 | themselves in the event one might be entered | 6 | is that what we see in paragraph 16 of your |
| 7 | into? | 7 | complaint that says that the Rastafarians are a |
| 8 | MR. BROOKS: Objection to the form. | 8 | spiritual society living simply, independently, |
| 9 | Q. You can answer the question. | 9 | and in harmony with nature apart from the |
| 10 | A. Yeah, I guess so. 1 mean -- | 10 | industrialized world of environmental pollution |
| 11 | MR. BROOKS: Don't guess. | 11 | and materialism which they reject and refer to |
| 12 | Q. Don't guess. I don't want you to | 12 | as Babylon? |
| 13 | guess. Did you discuss paragraph 22 and why it | 13 | A. Yeah. |
| 14 | was in the agreement? | 14 | Q. Now, was the Henzell essay among the |
| 15 | A. I think what it is is that, you | 15 | materials that you provided to Powerhouse? |
| 16 | know, in the case of the book could be | 16 | A. No. Perry Henzell provided the |
| 17 | translated in French or Italian or whatever, | 17 | material himself. |
| 18 | they had the right to be in control. That's | 18 | Q. He provided what? |
| 19 | what it means. | 19 | A. He provided the material himself. |
| 20 | Q. Now, in paragraph 2, back on | 20 | MR. BROOKS: Material. |
| 21 | page C3, that's marked C3, it states that you're | 21 | Q. And how did it come to be that |
| 22 | going to provide to the publisher certain types | 22 | Henry - |
| 23 | of materiais. Do you see that? | 23 | A. Perry Henzell. |
| 24 | A. Yeah. | 24 | Q. - Perry Henzell was going to write |
| 25 | Q. Including the original images and | 25 | the introduction, did you select him? |
|  | 190 |  | 192 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | some other items, which included text, and I | 2 | A. Yeah, I was a great -- well, he's |
| 3 | wondered what materials besides the images you | 3 | dead -- and I am a great admirer of his work. |
| 4 | provided to Powerhouse? | 4 | He did a really famous movie about Jamaica |
| 5 | A. Nothing. | 5 | called The Harder They Come, and I really |
| 6 | Q. But you did provide the text -- | 6 | thought it was an honor for me to have a text |
| 7 | A. Yeah. | 7 | about my book. |
| 8 | Q. -- that appears in Defendant's | 8 | Q. By Mr. Henzell? |
| 9 | Exhibit - | 9 | A. Yeah. So I did what I had to do to |
| 10 | A. That text, yeah, that's -- | 10 | meet him and convince him to write the essay. |
| 1 | Q. -2 , is it? | 11 | Q. And you're the one who did that, not |
| 12 | A. There's another text that I wrote. | 12 | the publisher? |
| 13 | Which means they stand strong against barbarism. | 13 | A. Yeah. |
| 14 | Q. And you're pointing to one of the | 14 | Q. You're the one who convinced |
| 15 | white pages at the beginning of the book? | 15 | Mr. Henzell to write that? |
| 16 | A. Yeah, the first page that is white. | 16 | A. Yeah. |
| 17 | Q. And that's something you provided to | 17 | Q. When he did that, prepared that |
| 18 | the publisher? | 18 | essay, did he interview you? |
| 19 | A. Yeah. | 19 | A. No. Well, we had a couple - we |
| 20 | Q. And what did you mean by that | 20 | went to lunch a couple of times, you know, to |
| 21 | sentence? | 21 | talk about my experience in Jamaica or my |
| 22 | A. It meant that - | 22 | experience with Rastafarians, but no formal |
| 23 | Q. I'm sorry, what? | 23 | interview. |
| 24 | A. Jamaica is a really violent country, | 24 | MS. BART: We're going to mark a |
| 25 | and Rasta are men of peace within that society. | 25 | copy of the essay. |

Suite 4715
One Penn Plaza
New York, NY 10119 www.esquiresolutions.com

|  | 193 |  | 195 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | (Defendant's Exhibit 8, copy of | 2 | been marked as Defendant's Exhibit 9, which |
| 3 | essay by Mr. Henzell, was marked for | 3 | appears in the back of the Yes Rasta book. I |
| 4 | identification, as of this date.) | 4 | would call this the acknowledgments page. |
| 5 | Q. I've handed you what's been marked | 5 | A. Yeah. |
| 6 | as Defendant's Exhibit 8, which is a photocopy | 6 | Q. Does this refresh your recollection |
| 7 | of the full text of the essay by Mr. Henzell | 7 | that you provided additional text to the |
| 8 | which appears in the front portion of the | 8 | publisher? |
| 9 | Yes Rasta book. | 9 | A. Absolutely. |
| 10 | Do you have that in front of you? | 10 | Q. And you wrote what appears in this |
| 11 | A. Yes. | 11 | acknowledgment? |
| 12 | Q. And you agree that this is the essay | 12 | A. Yeah. |
| 13 | that appears? | 13 | Q. Is that correct? |
| 14 | A. Ido agree. | 14 | A. Yeah. |
| 15 | Q. Did you participate in the drafting | 15 | Q. Let's start with the first sentence |
| 16 | of this document? | 16 | that says, first of all, thanks to all the |
| 17 | A. No. | 17 | Rastas in this book for allowing me into their |
| 18 | Q. Did you make any corrections to it? | 18 | lives and showing me what rightfulness and |
| 19 | A. No. | 19 | strength is all about. |
| 20 | Q. And when Mr. Henzell - did he give | 20 | Do you see that sentence? |
| 21 | it to you before he gave it to the publisher or | 21 | A. Yeah. |
| 22 | did you get it at the same time? | 22 | Q. And that is the essence of what your |
| 23 | A. We -- I'm not exactly sure, but I | 23 | Yes Rasta book is trying to communicate about |
| 24 | think we got it at the same time, and we were | 24 | this society, correct? |
| 25 | both pleased with the essay, and there was not | 25 | A. Absolutely. |
|  | 194 |  | 196 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | much discussion about it. | 2 | Q. Now, the next line you're giving |
| 3 | Q. Okay. Returning back to the | 3 | thanks to people, and one is a person whose name |
| 4 | Powerhouse agreement, other than the originals | 4 | is -- l'll just try to pronounce the name -- |
| 5 | of the images and the written text which you've | 5 | Zutumer? |
| 6 | just described to us, did you provide any other | 6 | A. Yeah. |
| 7 | materials to Powerhouse? | 7 | Q. For sharing her love of Jamaica. |
| 8 | MR. BROOKS: Hold on a second. | 8 | Who is Ms. Zutumer? |
| 9 | You're not suggesting he provided | 9 | A. She is a good friend of mine who at |
| 10 | the Perry Henzell text? | 10 | that time was going out with a Jamaican man and |
| 11 | MS. BART: No, he already testified | 11 | told me -- and was going down to Jamaica a lot |
| 12 | he didn't, Mr. Henzell did. | 12 | and told me a lot of stories that made me dream |
| 13 | MR. BROOKS: So what text are you | 13 | about going. And she actually started the whole |
| 14 | referring to? The one sentence? | 14 | process by making me dream about going down to |
| 15 | MS. BART: The homage, and It think | 15 | Jamaica. |
| 16 | he's also testified to -- | 16 | Q. So she was sort of the impetus for |
| 17 | A. Did I provide? | 17 | you going and doing this project? |
| 18 | Q. Any other materials? | 18 | A. Yeah. |
| 19 | A. No, I don't think so, no. | 19 | Q. And I think I asked you earlier |
| 20 | MS. BART: All right. Let's mark | 20 | in one of my earlier questions whether or not |
| 21 | this as the next exhibit. | 21 | anyone had introduced you to any of the |
| 22 | (Defendant's Exhibit 9, | 22 | Rastafarians whose images appeared in the book, |
| 23 | acknowledgments page, was marked for | 23 | and you had said no, not really, you Just met |
| 24 | identification, as of this date.) | 24 | them. |
| 25 | Q. Mr. Cariou, I've handed you what's | 25 | But does this now refresh your |


|  | 197 |  | 199 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | recollection that Ms. Zutumer had introduced | 2 | Q. So did he get two thirds of the |
| 3 | you to some of the Rastafarians? | 3 | six-thousand-dollar advance, I call it an |
| 4 | A. No, she's not - we've never been to | 4 | advance? |
| 5 | Jamaica together. | 5 | A. No. |
| 6 | Q. I see. But did she hook you up with | 6 | Q. No, he did not? |
| 7 | any of the people? | 7 | A. No. |
| 8 | A. No. | 8 | Q. Is that because he passed away |
| 9 | Q. Who is Lisa Schnepf? | 9 | before the publication? |
| 10 | A. She is a-she owns a hotel in | 10 | A. No. |
| 11 | Negril. | 11 | Q. He never took the money? |
| 12 | Q. And when you say for showing me the | 12 | A. He never took the money. |
| 13 | way, what did she do for you in relation to this | 13 | Q. So you took the full 6,000 |
| 14 | project? | 14 | nonrefundable portion? |
| 15 | A. Well, she lived - she lived in | 15 | A. Yeah. |
| 16 | Jamaica for 25 years, so she had a clear view of | 16 | Q. Marie Gerard and Lisa Scheubel from |
| 17 | what Jamaica was about. And she enlightened me | 17 | Adidas, which is -- |
| 18 | about, you know, mistakes - not mistake -- | 18 | A. Adidas, yeah. Those are the two |
| 19 | excuse me -- she enlighted me about things not | 19 | ladies who were holding the press bureau in |
| 20 | to do, things to do, how to behave in order to | 20 | Paris where I could pick up as much Adidas |
| 21 | achieve what I wanted to achieve. | 21 | clothes as I wanted. |
| 22 | Q. Helped you with the cultural aspects | 22 | And for some reason Jamaicans love |
| 23 | of the project? | 23 | Adidas more than anything else. So every time |
| 24 | A. Exactly. Thank you. | 24 | I was coming I could give it away and, you know, |
| 25 | Q. Now, Messrs Power and Cohen, you're | 25 | make presents to my friends. |
|  | 198 |  | 200 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | thanking them for their commitment to beautiful | 2 | Q. And did you also bring the Au Chip |
| 3 | photography books, and those are the | 3 | shorts that appear in some of the photographs? |
| 4 | representatives of Powerhouse with whom you've | 4 | A. No. |
| 5 | developed a relationship, correct? | 5 | Q. No? |
| 6 | A. Yes. | 6 | A. No. |
| 7 | Q. Herve Morel for his unconditional | 7 | Q. And who is - well, we've heard |
| 8 | support? | 8 | about Francesco Solari? |
| 9 | A. He's a really close friend of mine, | 9 | A. Yeah. |
| 10 | always, you know, when I was down was picking me | 10 | Q. She's one of the people who |
| 11 | up and helping me in any way possible in order | 11 | purchased -- |
| 12 | to make me move forward. | 12 | MR. BROOKS: It's a man. |
| 13 | Q. On this particular or just in | 13 | Q. Oh, he. |
| 14 | general? | 14 | MR. BROOKS: No, it's the man who |
| 15 | A. No, in general. | 15 | told him. Well - |
| 16 | Q. Do you have some sort of commercial | 16 | Q. Who is Mr. Solari? |
| 17 | relationship with Mr. Morel? | 17 | A. Solari is a good friend of mine. |
| 18 | A. No, he's dead. | 18 | He's actually the man who told me about the |
| 19 | Q. Well, I notice in paragraph 7 of the | 19 | Canal Zone. |
| 20 | publishing agreement there's moneys that are to | 20 | Q. And you've known him for a long time |
| 21 | be given to Mr. Morel? | 21 | I think you've already testified, right? |
| 22 | A. Yeah, at some point he got into | 22 | A. Yeah. |
| 23 | publishing. I couldn't really recall exactly | 23 | Q. And what perspective on the art |
| 24 | what was the deal with that, but I don't know. | 124 | world did he give you at the time this book was |
| 25 | To tell you the truth I have no idea. | 25 | being published? |


|  | 201 |  | 203 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | A. You know, we were always talking | 2 | Q. Oh, and you did this as a courtesy |
| 3 | about art and what we liked, what we didn't | 3 | to her? |
| 4 | like. He was showing me things, I was showing | 4 | A. Yeah. |
| 5 | him things, you know, between two friends who | 5 | Q. I'm sorry. Okay. I thought it was |
| 6 | have a common interest. | 6 | the other way around. |
| 7 | Q. In photographs as art? | 7 | A. No. |
| 8 | A. In photographs and paintings also, | 8 | Q. Understood. |
| 9 | and all those things. | 9 | Now, there are two other individuals |
| 10 | Q. Who is Marion de Beaupre? | 10 | on the next line, Laurent Le Moing and David |
| 11 | A. She's a fellow collector in Paris, | 11 | Hazan? |
| 12 | photo collector in Paris. | 12 | A. Those are two people who retouch the |
| 13 | MR. BROOKS: A what? | 13 | pictures, you know, by hand. You know, when you |
| 14 | A. Photography collector. | 14 | print, when you do a print it's never perfect, |
| 15 | Q. Has she purchased any of your works? | 15 | you need to -- and that's what they do. And |
| 16 | A. No. I gave her some. | 16 | they're two friends of mine and they did that on |
| 17 | Q. You gave her some? | 17 | every print. |
| 18 | Did you give her works of art from | 18 | Q. Every print that appears in the |
| 19 | the Yes Rasta book? | 19 | Yes Rasta book? |
| 20 | A. I couldn't tell you. I might have. | 20 | A. Yeah. |
| 21 | I don't know. | 21 | Q. Did you pay them for their services? |
| 22 | Q. Is she a collector specifically of | 22 | A. No. |
| 23 | your work or - | 23 | Q. Was the touch-up work that was |
| 24 | A. No, no, no, no. She collects. | 24 | required to the images that appear in the |
| 25 | Q. Why is it then that you chose to | 25 | Yes Rasta work, would you describe that as |
|  | 202 |  | 204 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | recognize her or acknowledge her in this | 2 | substantial? |
| 3 | particular publication - | 3 | A. No, no. It was really little. |
| 4 | A. Because she - | 4 | Q. Who is Tom Palmer and why are you |
| 5 | Q. Let me finish -- in this particular | 5 | thanking him for being part of the project? |
| 6 | publication? | 6 | A. Tom Palmer is the man who took the |
| 7 | A. Sorry. Because at that time I was | 7 | prints, the photographic prints, and made the |
| 8 | seeing her a lot I think and her son that I'm | 8 | film to be able to print it that way. He was |
| 9 | close to, and they were extremely supportive. | 9 | part of the - you know, when you make a book at |
| 10 | Q. Richard Foulster we've already heard | 10 | some point you end up with a box of prints, |
| 11 | about today. Who is Jessica Palazzo? | 11 | those prints have to be transformed to go on the |
| 12 | A. His wife. | 12 | plant. |
| 13 | Q. And she also assisted with this | 13 | Q. So the image has to be transformed |
| 14 | project it says for their persistence and | 14 | to fit the size of the book or the formatting - |
| 15 | beautiful prints? | 15 | A. The format, in order to go on the |
| 16 | A. Well, she was more like his -- how | 16 | huge machine. And that's what he did, you know, |
| 17 | do you say -- to be nice, what's the proper | 17 | he took the print and made it a technical thing |
| 18 | term? | 18 | that you need to do in order to reproduce a |
| 19 | MR. BROOKS: Courtesy. | 19 | book. |
| 20 | A. Courtesy. To put courtesy. | 20 | Q. And that's done electronically? |
| 21 | Q. I'm not sure I understand how that | 21 | A. It is now. Before it was not. |
| 22 | fits with the production of the photographs. | 22 | Before it was films that - I mean it's |
| 23 | You said that Mr. -- | 23 | complicated. |
| 24 | A. Well, she - they both were running | 24 | Q. But at the time of the Yes Rasta |
| 25 | the lab called a small darkroom. | 25 | book though it was done -- |


|  | 205 |  | 207 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | A. It was manually. He did it | 2 | Q. This was just more hemp vegetation |
| 3 | manually, yeah. | 3 | that you wanted to sort of create like -- almost |
| 4 | Q. So he manipulated the image to fit | 4 | like I think of it like wrapping paper, it's |
| 5 | the book? | 5 | like a repetition of pattern? |
| 6 | A. Yeah. | 6 | A. Exactly. |
| 7 | Q. When the book was being put together | 7 | MS. BART: Now, if we could get the |
| 8 | by Powerhouse did you have any input as to how | 8 | jacket, I'm going to mark the jacket next. |
| 9 | the images would be ordered in the book, or did | 9 | (Defendant's Exhibit 10, photocopy |
| 10 | they decide that? | 10 | of inside jacket of Yes Rasta, was marked |
| 11 | A. Oh, no, no, no. I did it. I did | 11 | for identification, as of this date.) |
| 12 | it with Paul Ritter, which is on the first | 12 | Q. Mr. Cariou, I'm handing you what's |
| 13 | paragraph of the agreement. He's an art | 13 | been marked as Defendant's Exhibit 10, which is |
| 14 | director. And so we did the mock-up together | 14 | a photocopy of the inside jacket, the text on |
| 15 | for a long time actually, trying to find the | 15 | the inside jacket of Yes Rasta. |
| 16 | proper rhythm, and I did -- I went to the plant | 16 | Do you have that in front of you? |
| 17 | when they printed it, so on and so forth. I was | 17 | A. Yes. |
| 18 | all along the way. | 18 | Q. Did you contribute any of the text |
| 19 | Q. Was there something about the | 19 | that appears on either the front of the inside |
| 20 | ordering of the images that is why they ended up | 20 | jacket or the back? |
| 21 | being in that particular order, or was it just a | 21 | A. Hold on one second. |
| 22 | visual like how it looked as you flipped through | 22 | (Witness looks at exhibit.) |
| 23 | the book? | 23 | A. No. |
| 24 | A. It's both actually when you think | 24 | Q. The biographical material on the |
| 25 | about it. There is obviously a visual thing | 25 | back side, is that something that you wrote or |
|  | 206 |  | 208 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | about that man after that man after landscape | 2 | someone else wrote? |
| 3 | and so and so. But there's also what each | 3 | A. No, someone else wrote it. |
| 4 | picture says and how you want to bring it to -- | 4 | Q. Did you get an opportunity to review |
| 5 | it's almost like a movie. You know, there's a | 5 | it before it was published when you looked at |
| 6 | slow start and then there's action and then it | 6 | the mock-up? |
| 7 | goes down. That's the way I would describe | 7 | A. Yeah, yeah. |
| 8 | that. | 8 | Q. And you were satisfied with the text |
| 9 | Q. And what was sort of the movie that | 9 | of the jacket cover? |
| 10 | was playing in your head while you were putting | 10 | A. Yeah. |
| 11 | this together? | 11 | Q. And you feel that it accurately |
| 12 | A. God knows. | 12 | depicts the book that you were attempting to put |
| 13 | Q. Okay. Now, on the inside cover of | 13 | together? |
| 14 | Yes Rasta we see a color image of hemp, which is | 14 | A. Yeah. |
| 15 | a departure from the black and white images that | 15 | Q. Do you know if -- Mr. Henzell wrote |
| 16 | appear in the book itself. | 16 | the piece that's in quotes, correct? |
| 17 | Who decided that that would be sort | 17 | A. Yeah. |
| 18 | of the inside jacket cover? | 18 | Q. That's written by him? |
| 19 | A. Me. | 19 | A. Mm-hmm, yes. |
| 20 | Q. And you decided to use color for a | 20 | Q. Did anyone ever -- I think we |
| 21 | specific reason? | 21 | covered this, so I'll move on. |
| 22 | A. Yeah, It thought it looked nice. It | 22 | Did anyone ever write a review or a |
| 23 | was visually appealing, you know. It was | 23 | critique of Yes Rasta? |
| 24 | like -- and then knowing that the rest is black | 24 | A. Yeah. |
| 25 | and white was interesting to me. | 25 | Q. And who did that? |

Toll Free: $\mathbf{8 0 0} .944 .9454$ Facsimile: 212.557.5972

|  | 209 |  | 211 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | A. A few different persons. I don't | 2 | A. Yeah. |
| 3 | have the list right now with me, you know, but a | 3 | Q. Did you ever conduct an interview |
| 4 | few different magazines did. | 4 | with anyone conceming the book, now we've moved |
| 5 | Q. And have you given those reviews to | 5 | from reviews to interviews? |
| 6 | your attorneys? | 6 | A. Yes, I did. Once in Paris for |
| 7 | MR. BROOKS: We gave them to you. | 7 | French Vogue. |
| 8 | MS. BART: We have them? | 8 | Q. And who arranged for that? |
| 9 | MR. BROOKS: Yes. | 9 | A. I was actually working for that |
| 10 | BY MS. BART: | 10 | magazine at the time and the director wanted to |
| 11 | Q. And other than the reviews that we | 11 | do a review about me and the Rasta book. So |
| 12 | have been provided, I believe many of them were | 12 | that was, you know, on a personal level it was |
| 13 | in French, some of them were French? | 13 | done. |
| 14 | MR. BROOKS: English. | 14 | Q. As a result of the publication of |
| 15 | MS. BART: English? | 15 | these reviews and also the interview that |
| 16 | MR. BROOKS: The ones we gave you | 16 | appeared in the French Vogue magazine, did you |
| 17 | were all in English. | 17 | receive any inquiries concerning the possible |
| 18 | BY MS. BART: | 18 | sale of a print of any of the images that appear |
| 19 | Q. And are there others besides those? | 19 | in Yes Rasta? |
| 20 | A. There might have been a few that l'm | 20 | A. I might have received it. I don't |
| 21 | not aware of. But I think we gave you pretty | 21 | remember. I don't know. |
| 22 | much what we had. | 22 | Q. Do you know whether Powerhouse |
| 23 | Q. And there are no other reviews of | 23 | received any inquiries about the possibility of |
| 24 | the book besides those? | 24 | being able to purchase prints of the images? |
| 25 | A. No, I don't think so. | 25 | A. I don't know. |
|  | 210 |  | 212 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | Q. Did you arrange for those interviews | 2 | Q. Do you know if Powerhouse ever sold |
| 3 | or did Powerhouse? | 3 | any prints of the images in the book? |
| 4 | MR. BROOKS: Are you talking about | 4 | A. I would be -- no, I don't think so, |
| 5 | interviews or reviews? Those are not | 5 | they don't have them. |
| 6 | necessarily the same thing. | 6 | Q. So that was a right you reserved |
| 7 | What interviews? | 7 | to - |
| 8 | MS. BART: He answered the question | 8 | A. Yeah, yeah. |
| 9 | yes about interviews -- | 9 | Q. That was something you reserved for |
| 10 | MR. BROOKS: No, reviews and | 10 | yourself to do? |
| 11 | interviews are two completely different | 11 | A. Yeah. |
| 12 | things. You've been asking about reviews. | 12 | Q. Besides placement on the Powerhouse |
| 13 | MS. BART: Let me break the question | 13 | website was the book advertised anywhere? |
| 14 | down and we can move on. | 14 | A. I don't know. |
| 15 | BY MS. BART: | 15 | Q. And you have no copies of any |
| 16 | Q. Did you arrange to have the book | 16 | advertising by Powerhouse? |
| 17 | reviewed or did Powerhouse have the book -- | 17 | A. No. |
| 18 | A. Powerhouse did it. | 18 | Q. Since the publication of the |
| 19 | Q. And were you satisfied with the | 19 | Yes Rasta collection has anyone done an |
| 20 | reviews that you received for your book? | 20 | appraisal or attempted to place a value on the |
| 21 | A. Yeah. | 21 | images that are found in the Yes Rasta book? |
| 22 | Q. And did you think that they had | 22 | A. I don't understand your question. |
| 23 | accurately captured the reviews -- accurately | 23 | Q. Do you know what an appraisal is? |
| 24 | captured what you were trying to express through | 24 | A. Sort of. |
| 25 | the book? | 25 | Q. I don't mean to make this a legal |


|  | 213 |  | 215 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | definition, it's just a layperson definition. | 2 | received? |
| 3 | An appraisal would be if I wanted to | 3 | A. I don't remember. |
| 4 | know how much this yellow highlighter was worth | 4 | Q. Is it less than a thousand dollars? |
| 5 | and there wasn't another yellow highlighter -- | 5 | A. No, I think it would be more than a |
| 6 | in other words, you can't just go and there's | 6 | thousand dollars. |
| 7 | not a retail price for it, I could maybe go to | 7 | Q. Do you have any idea of how much you |
| 8 | Steve Hayes if he was a specialist in valuing, | 8 | received? |
| 9 | putting a value on yellow highlighters, and ask | 9 | A. No. I'm really bad with that. No, |
| 10 | him could you tell me what this is worth. | 10 | I have no idea. I don't know. |
| 11 | A. Yeah, yeah. | 11 | Q. From the period 2000 to the present |
| 12 | Q. It's like the people at Sotheby's | 12 | what portion of your annual income would you say |
| 13 | that value antiques. | 13 | was derived from the sale of the Yes Rasta book? |
| 14 | A. I understand. I understand. | 14 | A. Very little. |
| 15 | Q. So did anyone ever appraise or put a | 15 | Q. Less than 1 percent? |
| 16 | value on the images that appear in the Yes Rasta | 16 | A. Less than 1 percent? I don't know. |
| 17 | book? | 17 | I really don't know. Yeah, maybe. |
| 18 | A. Not that I know of. | 18 | Less than 10 percent, that's for |
| 19 | Q. You've never asked anyone to do | 19 | sure. |
| 20 | that? | 20 | RQ MS. BART: We'd like to call for |
| 21 | A. No. | 21 | the production of records showing the |
| 22 | Q. Let's turn back to the Powerhouse | 22 | amounts -- |
| 23 | agreement. And you said that you received the | 23 | MR. BROOKS: You aiready got them. |
| 24 | entirety of the nonreturnable sum of \$6,000 | 24 | MS. BART: - that he received. |
| 25 | which is mentioned in section paragraph 7. | 25 | He said he doesn't have them. |
|  | 214 |  | 216 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Caniou |
| 2 | And then later on in that section - | 2 | MR. BROOKS: We gave you records in |
| 3 | MS. BART: We're missing - in your | 3 | document production. You have all the |
| 4 | production copy it looks like we're | 4 | records. |
| 5 | missing paragraphs because it jumps from | 5 | We went and got them from |
| 6 | paragraph 7 right up to paragraph 11. | 6 | Powerhouse, we Bates stamped them, we gave |
| 7 | See? We look at C3 is paragraph 7 | 7 | them to you months ago. |
| 8 | and then - | 8 | MS. BART: We'll check for those on |
| 9 | MR. BROOKS: No, the next paragraph | 9 | a break because that's not ringing a bell |
| 10 | is 8. What are you talking about? | 10 | for me. But we'll check that. |
| 11 | It goes 7, 8, 9, 10, 11. | 11 | So whatever the numbers are that |
| 12 | MS. BART: Oh, I'm sorry, it's up | 12 | are in those documents, that would be the |
| 13 | there. Let me get it. It's my eyes. | 13 | amounts that he received from Powerhouse? |
| 14 | it's not anything else. | 14 | MR. BROOKS: I believe so. |
| 15 | BY MS. BART: | 15 | According to Powerhouse. |
| 16 | Q. Paragraphs 8 and 10 also talk about | 16 | BY MS. BART: |
| 17 | additional amounts that you would receive from | 17 | Q. Do you know what the original sales |
| 18 | the sale of Yes Rasta or in connection with the | 18 | price for the book is? |
| 19 | publication of Yes Rasta. | 19 | I know there's limited quantities |
| 20 | Did you receive any other moneys | 20 | available for a hundred dollars. |
| 21 | besides the \$6,000 from Powerhouse? | 21 | A. It was $\$ 60$. |
| 22 | A. I might have received a check or | 22 | Q. And at what point did it increase? |
| 23 | two. Yeah, I don't recall precisely but I might | 23 | A. At what point did it increase? |
| 24 | have. | 24 | I don't know. I don't know. |
| 25 | Q. Do you recall the amount that you | 25 | Q. Did it increase once or did it |

Suite 4715
Orie Penn Plaza
New York, NY 10119
www.esquiresolutions.com

|  | 217 |  | 219 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | increase several times? | 2 | Borders? |
| 3 | A. It think it increased once. | 3 | MS. BART: There's absolutely |
| 4 | Q. And do you know if it increased | 4 | nothing wrong, Mr. Brooks. I'm not |
| 5 | after the lawsuit was commenced? | 5 | responding to your questions. |
| 6 | A. No, it was way before. | 6 | BY MS. BART: |
| 7 | Q. The hundred dollars? | 7 | Q. Mr. Caniou, we'll move on a lot |
| 8 | A. Yeah. | 8 | faster if your counsel will just let me do the |
| 9 | Q. The increase to $\$ 100$ ? | 9 | examination. I'm sorry for the interruption. |
| 10 | A. Yeah. | 10 | Do you know if any bookstores -- a |
| 11 | Q. Did Powerhouse ever give you any | 11 | better bookstore would be like a premium-tier |
| 12 | projected sales figures for the books? | 12 | bookstore? |
| 13 | A. No. | 13 | A. Yeah, yes. |
| 14 | Q. And do you know -- | 14 | Q. Rizzoli might be considered one of |
| 15 | A. You know, it's a small operation. | 15 | those? |
| 16 | MR. BROOKS: Just answer the | 16 | A. Yeah. They definitely sold them |
| 17 | question. | 17 | there. |
| 18 | Q. It's a small what? | 18 | Q. In the United States and Europe? |
| 19 | A. It's a small operation, you know, | 19 | A. Yeah. |
| 20 | Powerhouse. | 20 | Q. But you don't have a list of where |
| 21 | Q. But it's a Powerhouse. | 21 | they were distributed? |
| 22 | Do you know how many copies of | 22 | A. No. |
| 23 | Yes Rasta were initially published? | 23 | Q. And you don't know whether or not |
| 24 | A. Published? | 24 | they were sold in a mass distribution channel, |
| 25 | Q. Well, produced for sale? | 25 | do you? |
|  | 218 |  | 220 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | A. It think it's 5,500 . | 2 | A. No, I don't know. |
| 3 | Q. And do you know how many of those | 3 | Q. If you will look at paragraph 13 of |
| 4 | have been sold? | 4 | the Powerhouse agreement it gives you the right |
| 5 | A. No. | 5 | to examine their books and records. Here we |
| 6 | Q. Do you know what the phrase channel | 6 | call that an audit. |
| 7 | of distribution means? | 7 | A. Yeah. |
| 8 | A. Yeah. | 8 | Q. Did you ever exercise that right? |
| 9 | Q. Do you know what channels of | 9 | A. No. |
| 10 | distribution Powerhouse attempted to sell | 10 | Q. Other than the cash that you have |
| 11 | Yes Rasta through? | 11 | received from Powerhouse have you ever received |
| 12 | A. I have no idea now. I have no idea. | 12 | any other types of remuneration or consideration |
| 13 | They changed a few times. I couldn't tell you. | 13 | from anything else tangible or intangible I |
| 14 | Q. Do you know if they were sold in | 14 | guess from Powerhouse? |
| 15 | museums, for example? | 15 | A. No. |
| 16 | A. They might have. | 16 | Q. Like no Adidas shorts? |
| 17 | Q. But you don't know? | 17 | A. No Adidas shorts. You know, I can |
| 18 | A. No, I don't know. | 18 | go pick up a book if I need a book that I like. |
| 19 | Q. Better book stores? | 19 | You know, it's - you know what I mean? |
| 20 | MR. BROOKS: Objection. What does | 20 | Q. Right. It's miniscule? |
| 21 | that mean? | 21 | A. Yeah, whatever. |
| 22 | A. What do you mean better book stores? | 22 | Q. Okay. So speaking of picking up |
| 23 | Q. Something other than Borders, not a | 23 | a book that you might like, let's turn to |
| 24 | mass distribution? | 24 | paragraph 20 of the contract. And it says there |
| 25 | MR. BROOKS: What's wrong with | 25 | that you are entitled to receive 70 free coples |

Suite 4715
One Penn Plaza

|  | 221 |  | 223 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | of the first edition once it's published. | 2 | so hostile all the time, Mr. Brooks. Just |
| 3 | Did you receive those 70 copies? | 3 | ask me for the paragraph number. |
| 4 | A. Yeah. | 4 | BY MS. BART: |
| 5 | Q. And what did you do with them? | 5 | Q. Mr. Cariou, if you'll go back to |
| 6 | A. I send quite a bit of them in | 6 | that same paragraph -- |
| 7 | Jamaica. | 7 | MR. BROOKS: I asked you for the |
| 8 | Q. To the Rastafarians whose images | 8 | paragraph number and you said the same one |
| 9 | appear in the book? | 9 | he was looking at, and he's not looking at |
| 10 | A. I send them to Ms. Schnepf, you | 10 | it anymore. |
| 11 | know, to -- | 11 | MS. BART: Just stop, Brooks. |
| 12 | Q. In Negril? | 12 | MR. BROOKS: You stop, Bart. |
| 13 | A. Yeah, in Negri.. And I gave the | 13 | MS. BART: Just stop. |
| 14 | rest to my friends. | 14 | MR. BROOKS: This is ridiculous. |
| 15 | Q. Did you give any of them to | 15 | This is a complete colossal waste of time. |
| 16 | galleries or to museums? | 16 | MS. BART: You'll see how we intend |
| 17 | A. No. | 17 | to -- |
| 18 | Q. Did you give any copies of Yes Rasta | 18 | MR. BROOKS: Yeah, well see. |
| 19 | to any person who might be interested in trying | 19 | MS. BART: Fine. We endured your |
| 20 | to help you market -- | 20 | depositions, Mr. Brooks. |
| 21 | A. No. | 21 | BY MS. BART: |
| 22 | Q. - the images? | 22 | Q. Mr. Cariou, looking back at |
| 23 | A. No. 1-yeah. | 23 | paragraph 32, do you have that in front of you? |
| 24 | Q. Did you want to add something? | 24 | A. Yeah. |
| 25 | A. I wasn't ready at the time to market | 25 | Q. All right. I did not notice that |
|  | 222 |  | 224 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | my photographs. I was waiting for the proper | 2 | you had closed the document. I'm sory for |
| 3 | opportunity and the proper timing to do so. | 3 | tha |
| 4 | Q. If you'll turn to paragraph 32 of | 4 | A. That's okay. |
| 5 | the Powerhouse agreement, it says for publicity | 5 | Q. If you will look at the second |
| 6 | purposes the publisher shall have the right to | 6 | sentence, it says the proprietor and the |
| 7 | publish or permit to be published or to be | 7 | publisher will agree on 10 photographs of the |
| 8 | broadcast by television or radio or through | 8 | work for publicity. Did you and Powerhouse |
| 9 | online services without charge or royalty such | 9 | choose 10 works for publicity? |
| 10 | selections from the work as in the opinion of | 10 | A. I can't recall. I can't recall it. |
| 11 | the publisher may benefit its sale. | 11 | We probably did. I have no idea. |
| 12 | Do you know, Mr. Cariou, whether | 12 | Q. Would Powerhouse have kept a record |
| 13 | there were any broadcasts in any other form of | 13 | of that? |
| 14 | media besides the print media? | 14 | MR. BROOKS: Objection. |
| 15 | A. No, I don't think so. | 15 | Q. If you know? |
| 16 | Q. Now, if you'll look at the last | 16 | A. I don't know. |
| 17 | sentence or the next sentence, it says the | 17 | RQ MS. BART: We would call for the |
| 18 | proprietor and the publisher will agree on 10 | 18 | production of any identification of the |
| 19 | photographs from the work. | 19 | 10 photographs that were selected by |
| 20 | MR. BROOKS: Hold on, which | 20 | Mr. Cariou and Powerhouse for publicity. |
| 21 | paragraph is this? | 21 | MR. BROOKS: He has no records and I |
| 22 | MS. BART: The same paragraph -- | 22 | have no access to what Powerhouse might |
| 23 | MR. BROOKS: He closed the document. | 23 | have. |
| 24 | So I'm asking you -- | 24 | MS. BART: Well, you did get the |
| 25 | MS. BART: You just don't have to be | 25 | sales. |


|  | 225 |  | 227 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | MR. BROOKS: Yes, as a courtesy to | 2 | I probably didn't want to have a |
| 3 | you. We went out of our way and got | 3 | little print, because when you do a deluxe |
| 4 | documents that you apparently haven't | 4 | edition you usually include a print, and I |
| 5 | looked at them yet. | 5 | didn't want to include a print in the book. |
| 6 | MS. BART: Oh, we've looked at them. | 6 | And we didn't know if there was a |
| 7 | MR. BROOKS: You haven't. | 7 | market for it anyway. |
| 8 | MS. BART: Mr. Brooks, you've asked | 8 | MR. BROOKS: I want to caution the |
| 9 | me to move this deposition along, and so | 9 | witness don't guess. If you know the |
| 10 | far your obstreperous remarks have done | 10 | answer to a question, tell her. |
| 11 | nothing but slow us down. Just stop it. | 11 | If you don't know just don't guess |
| 12 | It's not necessary. | 12 | as to what might have happened. |
| 13 | You want to talk about this -- | 13 | MS. BART: Okay. Enough coaching. |
| 14 | MR. BROOKS: I'll take it under | 14 | BY MS. BART: |
| 15 | advisement. | 15 | Q. Is there a reason why you wouldn't |
| 16 | MS. BART: Thank you very much. | 16 | want to include a copy of the print, of a print? |
| 17 | That's all you had to say at the | 17 | A. Yeah, I think it's silly. |
| 18 | beginning. | 18 | Q. Prior to November of 2008 did you |
| 19 | MR. BROOKS: Thank you. I need you | 19 | have any plans to make any derivative works of |
| 20 | to tell me what I have to say. | 20 | Yes Rasta? |
| 21 | BY MS. BART: | 21 | A. Yeah, the show coming up in New York |
| 22 | Q. Mr. Cariou, I have to apologize | 22 | where I would make big prints for - with |
| 23 | for these rude and entirely unprofessional | 23 | Christiane Celle. |
| 24 | interruptions. | 24 | MR. BROOKS: For who? |
| 25 | A. Don't forget, he's on my team. | 25 | A. Christiane Celle. |
|  | 226 |  | 228 |
| 1 | Caniou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | Q. Well, I'm sorry for that. | 2 | MR. BROOKS: I don't know if he got |
| 3 | If you'll look please, Mr. Caniou, | 3 | it. |
| 4 | to the rider on the Powerhouse agreement, which | 4 | (Clarification by reporter.) |
| 5 | appears on C 7 at the bottom. | 5 | (Record read.) |
| 6 | A. Yeah. | 6 | BY MS. BART: |
| 7 | Q. Do you see that? | 7 | Q. Other than making big prints -- and |
| 8 | A. Yeah. | 8 | this would be of some of the images from |
| 9 | Q. Rider A says that you're going to - | 9 | Yes Rasta? |
| 10 | that the publisher may at its option work with | 10 | A. Yeah. |
| 11 | the proprietor to produce a limited or deluxe | 11 | Q. Other than that did you have any |
| 12 | edition of Yes Rasta? | 12 | other plans at any time between the period 2000 |
| 13 | A. Mm-hmm. | 13 | and 2008 to make derivative works of the images? |
| 14 | Q. Did you ever work to produce a | 14 | A. Between 2000 and 2008 ? |
| 15 | limited or deluxe edition of Yes Rasta? | 15 | Q. November of 2008, yes. |
| 16 | A. No, we never did. | 16 | A. No. |
| 17 | Q. Is there a reason why you did not do | 17 | Q. Now, if you look at paragraph 26 |
| 18 | that? | 18 | of the Powerhouse agreement it says that this |
| 19 | A. I couldn't tell you exactly why, but | 19 | agreement will be valid for an initial period of |
| 20 | we didn't do it. | 20 | 10 years. Has there been any indication from |
| 21 | Q. Did you ever discuss it and then | 21 | Powerhouse as to whether they would renew this |
| 22 | just decide not to do it? | 22 | publishing agreement for Yes Rasta? |
| 23 | A. That's - I would have to - you | 23 | A. I don't know. |
| 24 | know, I would have to ask Dan Power. I don't | 24 | Q. There's been no discussions? |
| 25 | know. I don't know why we didn't do it. | 125 | A. No, no discussions. |


|  | 229 |  | 231 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Caniou |
| 2 | Q. And when I pointed to you earlier I | 2 | BY MS. BART: |
| 3 | think one of the provisions we talked about, the | 3 | Q. You may answer the question. |
| 4 | first edition of this book, has there been a | 4 | MR. BROOKS: He's not going to |
| 5 | second edition? | 5 | answer that. Go on to the next question. |
| 6 | A. No. | 6 | I direct him not to answer. |
| 7 | Q. So there's strictly the one edition | 7 | MS. BART: You've got to be kidding |
| 8 | that we all have? | 8 | me. |
| 9 | A. Yes. | 9 | MR. BROOKS: I'm not kidding. Ask |
| 10 | Q. Is it currently being published? | 10 | your next question. |
| 11 | A. Being published? | 11 | CQ MS. BART: Would you please mark |
| 12 | Q. Well, in other words, reproduced, | 12 | that question as well. |
| 13 | are copies being printed, are they out of print? | 13 | BY MS. BART: |
| 14 | A. No, they're not producing any copies | 14 | Q. Is Powehouse still the only entity |
| 15 | right now. | 15 | that you've given the ability to publish the |
| 16 | Q. An do you know when that started, | 16 | images that appear in Yes Rasta or Yes Rasta |
| 17 | when they stopped producing copies? | 17 | itself? |
| 18 | A. Well, they did it in one batch. It | 18 | A. Yes. |
| 19 | was one run of like those 5,500 copies, and that | 19 | Q. Have you approached anyone else |
| 20 | was it. It's not like going back to the -- on | 20 | about the possibility of publishing Yes Rasta or |
| 21 | artist book it cost too much to put the machine | 21 | the images that appear in that book? |
| 22 | together in order to - you don't reprint it | 22 | A. No. |
| 23 | every month or every year like that. You decide | 23 | Q. If you look at paragraph 15 - l'd |
| 24 | that you want $5,000,6,000,7,000$ copies and | 24 | like to now focus on your exhibitions. |
| 25 | that's it. | 25 | If you look at paragraph 15 of this |
|  | 230 |  | 232 |
| 1 | Caniou | 1 | Caniou |
| 2 | Q. And is Yes Rasta out of print a | 2 | Powerhouse agreement, it speaks to the use of |
| 3 | this time? | 3 | the work as to be utilized as the exclusive |
| 4 | A. I'm not sure. I don't know. | 4 | catalog of exhibitions planned in said |
| 5 | Q. In paragraph 28 it says that you can | 5 | territories for a period of four years following |
| 6 | terminate the contract if the book is out of | 6 | the first publication. |
| 7 | print. Have you ever taken any steps -- | 7 | Do you see that language? |
| 8 | MR. BROOKS: Where does it say that? | 8 | A. Yes. |
| 9 | MS. BART: If at any time during the | 9 | Q. My focus on it is really just -- |
| 10 | initial term specified above the said work | 10 | was a catalog put together or some catalog put |
| 11 | shall go out of print with the publisher, | 11 | together of the Yes Rasta book? |
| 12 | or to the extent of it selling fewer than | 12 | A. No. |
| 13 | 200 copies, then the proprietor shall be | 13 | Q. And were there, at the time when |
| 14 | at liberty to dispose of such rights that | 14 | you entered into this agreement, plans to do |
| 15 | were granted under this agreement to his | 15 | exhibitions? |
| 16 | full discretion. | 16 | A. No, I didn't. It was just like, you |
| 17 | A. Yeah, we had no discussion about | 17 | know, their contract, their standard contract. |
| 18 | that. | 18 | Q. Okay. So Powerhouse did not arrange |
| 19 | Q. So at this point the publishing | 19 | for any exhibitions of this work? |
| 20 | rights that were given to Powerhouse still | 20 | A. No. |
| 21 | remain with Powerhouse? | 21 | Q. Have any of the Yes Rasta images |
| 22 | MR. BROOKS: Objection, calls for | 22 | been displayed or exhibited in any museums? |
| 23 | a legal conclusion. | 23 | A. No. |
| 24 | MS. BART: No, it doesn't. It's a | 24 | Q. And have the images appeared in any |
| 25 | fact. | 25 | print media other than perhaps media associated |


| 233 |  | 235 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | with this lawsuit? | 2 | A. Yeah. |
| 3 | A. In French Vogue, yeah, once. | 3 | Q. I know it. |
| 4 | Q. There was one? | 4 | At the time that was the only |
| 5 | A. Yeah. | 5 | exhibition that you had at Gallery 213? |
| 6 | Q. And I should have excluded that out | 6 | A. Yeah. |
| 7 | of course. | 7 | Q. And who arranged for that |
| 8 | A. Yeah. | 8 | exhibition? |
| 9 | Q. Anything other than that instance? | 9 | A. The owner of the gallery called |
| 10 | A. I don't think so. | 10 | Marion de Beaupre. |
| 11 | Q. Now, if you'll get Defendant's | 11 | Q. Who we've seen in the |
| 12 | Exhibit 4, which are your responses to | 12 | acknowledgments? |
| 13 | interrogatories - I think it's that one right | 13 | A. Yeah. |
| 14 | there in your left hand. | 14 | Q. During this exhibition at Gallery |
| 15 | A. Yeah, I got it. | 15 | 213 were any of the images or prints of the |
| 16 | Q. Okay. And if you turn to response | 16 | images offered for sale? |
| 17 | number 3F? | 17 | A. No. |
| 18 | A. 3 what? | 18 | Q. They were not. |
| 19 | Q. 3F as in Frank. | 19 | And was that your choice? |
| 20 | MR. BROOKS: Page 10. | 20 | A. Yeah. |
| 21 | It's on page 10. | 21 | Q. Was there a reason why you did not |
| 22 | A. Yeah, I just want to make sure. | 22 | want any of them to be offered for sale? |
| 23 | Q. Why don't you just take a second. | 23 | A. Yeah, once again, I wasn't ready to |
| 24 | We asked in the question - the way this is done | 24 | make my work available, and I was waiting for my |
| 25 | you have to flip back and forth, so if you look | 25 | work to develop in a more consistent way and |
|  | 234 |  | 236 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | at the question we asked you in $F$ for the date | 2 | waiting for the right opportunity. |
| 3 | and location of each exhibition of the | 3 | Q. And did anyone do a review or |
| 4 | photographs, which are defined as the Yes Rasta | 4 | critique of the exhibition at Gallery 213 ? |
| 5 | images, for every such exhibition state the cash | 5 | A. I have no idea. I don't know. |
| 6 | or other consideration you received. | 6 | THE WITNESS: You know what, I need |
| 7 | And then in your answer you talk | 7 | a five-minute break, if you don't mind. |
| 8 | about a two-month exhibition at Gallery 213 in | 8 | MS. BART: No, that's all right. |
| 9 | Panis? | 9 | (Recess taken: 3-57 p.m.) |
| 10 | A. Yeah. | 10 | (Proceedings resumed: 4:23 p.m.) |
| 11 | Q. From September through October of | 11 | BY MS. BART: |
| 12 | 2000? | 12 | Q. Mr. Cariou, before the break we were |
| 13 | A. Mm -hmm. | 13 | talking about the exhibition at Gallery 213 in |
| 14 | Q. Is that the only instance in which | 14 | Paris? |
| 15 | the images from the Yes Rasta book have been | 15 | A. Yeah. |
| 16 | exhibited in a gallery? | 16 | Q. You said there were no sales and so |
| 17 | A. Yes. | 17 | none were offered, so a price list wasn't put |
| 18 | Q. And that was a one-person show, | 18 | together for that show, correct? |
| 19 | correct? | 19 | A. Correct. |
| 20 | A. Yeah. | 20 | Q. Did you have anyone contact you |
| 21 | Q. One-artist show? | 21 | following the exhibition at Gallery 213 about |
| 22 | A. Yeah. | 22 | the possible purchase of any print of any image |
| 23 | Q. And Gailery 213, where was that -- | 23 | from Yes Rasta? |
| 24 | I know it's no longer in business, I think it's | 24 | A. Yes. |
| 25 | become a photography bookstore, correct? | 25 | Q. Who called you, who contacted you? |


|  | 237 |  | 239 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | A. A few people that I didn't like very | 2 | that correct? |
| 3 | much, so I didn't sell them the prints. | 3 | A. Yeah. |
| 4 | Q. You didn't like them as people? | 4 | Q. And the only place that I might do |
| 5 | A. As people. | 5 | that, as an interested person, to be able to |
| 6 | Q. You met with them? | 6 | contact you, is through the website that you |
| 7 | A. No. I knew who they were and I | 7 | maintain, correct? |
| 8 | wasn't interested for them to get. | 8 | A. I don't even maintain this website. |
| 9 | Q. So who -- can you give me the names | 9 | You know, it was made like eight years ago, and |
| 10 | of the people that called you? | 10 | I don't - I think that the e-mail on the |
| 11 | A. No, I couldn't remember. | 11 | website goes to my website, to my mailbox. |
| 12 | Q. How did you know them? | 12 | But yeah, I guess it's a way to |
| 13 | A. Through our, you know, through | 13 | contact me if you want to. |
| 14 | people. | 14 | Q. But when you say it's been up for |
| 15 | Q. Your professional affiliations? | 15 | eight years and you don't really maintain it, |
| 16 | A. Yeah. | 16 | yet what we do see are all of your subsequent |
| 17 | Q. When you say a few, is that less | 17 | projects and books, you know, the Polynesian, |
| 18 | than five? | 18 | Trench Town Love? |
| 19 | A. Yeah, it's less than five. | 19 | A. Polynesian was done after. |
| 20 | Q. And approximately when did they call | 20 | Trench Town Love was done in 2000. |
| 21 | you, did they call you during the exhibition or | 21 | Q. Right. |
| 22 | at some point afterwards? | 22 | A. And the few pictures you can see of |
| 23 | A. At some point afterwards. | 23 | Gypsies are the first, the very first one of the |
| 24 | Q. And so there was no other interest | 24 | project, so. |
| 25 | in your work after the Gallery 213 exhibition? | 25 | Q. Maybe I didn't make myself clear, |
|  | 238 |  | 240 |
| 1 | Caniou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | MR. BROOKS: Objection to the form. | 2 | and I apologize, it's getting late in the day, |
| 3 | You can answer. | 3 | is that what I was trying to say is that you are |
| 4 | A. Well, it wasn't - the thing is it | 4 | adding new content to your website? |
| 5 | was all made really clear they were not for | 5 | A. No. |
| 6 | sale, they were not available to buy. So people | 6 | Q. No? |
| 7 | who went to the show didn't even try to buy | 7 | A. No, I have not since the day it's |
| 8 | them. They knew they were not for sale. | 8 | been up I have not add one picture. |
| 9 | Q. But you did get some expressions of | 9 | MS. BART: Can we mark that exhibit, |
| 10 | interest notwithstanding that? | 10 | please, the website. |
| 11 | A. Yeah. | 11 | We're going to mark as the next |
| 12 | Q. And those handful of people, less | 12 | exhibit - I think we're up to 11-- your |
| 13 | than five, were the only inquiries you got -- | 13 | website. |
| 14 | A. Yeah. | 14 | (Defendant's Exhibit 11, printout of |
| 15 | Q. -- as a result of the Gallery 213 | 15 | Patrick Cariou website, was marked for |
| 16 | exhibition? | 16 | identification, as of this date.) |
| 17 | A. Absolutely. | 17 | Q. Mr. Cariou, l'm handing you what's |
| 18 | Q. You've said that during the period | 18 | been marked as Defendant's Exhibit 11. And this |
| 19 | 2000 to until you had the conversations with | 19 | is a printout of the entirety of your web page. |
| 20 | Ms. Celle you were not represented by a gallery | 20 | And as you know, when you click on |
| 21 | at that time, is that correct? | 21 | the images of your web page the way it's |
| 22 | A. Yeah. | 22 | designed is it travels, the images travel to |
| 23 | Q. So the only place that someone could | 23 | the right. |
| 24 | approach you about the possible purchase of one | 24 | A. Yeah. |
| 25 | of your prints was to contact you directly, is | 25 | Q. So in order to capture all of the |


|  | 241 |  | 243 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | images that are on your web page we had to | 2 | Q. Is it maintained - is the web page |
| 3 | figure a way to -- in other words, there wasn't | 3 | maintained by Powerhouse or is it -- |
| 4 | a piece of paper long enough to capture them, so | 4 | (Nonverbal response.) |
| 5 | that's why it seems so long. | 5 | Q. No? lt's just something that you |
| 6 | A. Okay. | 6 | started and that's it? |
| 7 | Q. All right. So would you take a look | 7 | A. Yeah, exactly. |
| 8 | through this and tell me if this looks like the | 8 | Q. Now, a little bit earlier we talked |
| 9 | information that's on your website? | 9 | about the advertising that had been done for |
| 10 | (Witness looks through exhibit.) | 10 | the book, and your counsel pointed out to us |
| 11 | A. Yeah, it is. | 11 | information that was posted to - pointed out |
| 12 | Q. Did you select the content that | 12 | that there are in fact productions of |
| 13 | would be posted on the website? | 13 | interviews, and I asked you a question whether |
| 14 | A. Yes, I did. | 14 | there were any others and you said no? |
| 15 | Q. And one of the things that you | 15 | MR. BROOKS: Excuse me. The word is |
| 16 | selected was - I'm trying to find, I believe | 16 | review, it's not interview. |
| 17 | it's in the back - to describe the Yes Rasta | 17 | MS. BART: Reviews. And I believe |
| 18 | book is the Henzell essay, correct? | 18 | there's also testimony about an interview |
| 19 | A. Correct. | 19 | with Vogue Magazine, which is also |
| 20 | Q. And you posted it in its original | 20 | produced in here. |
| 21 | form as it appears in the book? | 21 | So I'm going to mark as the next |
| 22 | A. Yeah, correct. | 22 | exhibit, Exhibit 12 -- |
| 23 | MR. BROOKS: Could you give us the | 23 | MR. BROOKS: I'm not saying there |
| 24 | pages for that? | 24 | isn't, but I'm still looking at 11 to see |
| 25 | THE WITNESS: It's at the very end. | 25 | the images from Yes Rasta. |
|  | 242 |  | 244 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | MS. BART: We just printed it as it | 2 | I don't actually see any, but maybe |
| 3 | comes off the Intemet. It's at the end. | 3 | I'm missing them. You asked him about |
| 4 | MR. BROOKS: I see. | 4 | images from Yes Rasta? |
| 5 | BY MS. BART: | 5 | MS. BART: Yes. |
| 6 | Q. And you also selected the images | 6 | MR. BROOKS: And I don't see any, |
| 7 | that appear in this document for Yes Rasta, | 7 | but I could be missing them. |
| 8 | which I'm trying to find at this point in time, | 8 | Are there any? I don't see any. |
| 9 | is that correct? | 9 | MS. BART: I just mentioned this |
| 10 | A. Yeah. | 10 | to Dara, so we're going to correct the |
| 11 | Q. Is there a reason why you chose the | 11 | record. |
| 12 | particular images that appear for Yes Rasta on | 12 | All they are are the images that go |
| 13 | your website? | 13 | to the right, so perhaps it was during the |
| 14 | A. That was my mood of the day. | 14 | production period. |
| 15 | Q. Do you monitor -- l'm done with that | 15 | What I would like to do to keep the |
| 16 | exhibit for right now, Mr. Cariou. | 16 | deposition going is supplement the record |
| 17 | Do you monitor your website for the | 17 | with the pictures that trail off to the |
| 18 | number of hits that you get? | 18 | right. |
| 19 | A. Not at all. | 19 | MR. BROOKS: From Yes Rasta? |
| 20 | Q. Not at all? | 20 | MS. BART: Yes. |
| 21 | So you have no way of knowing, for | 21 | MR. BROOKS: And you're going to |
| 22 | example, the number of hits that took place | 22 | supplement the exhibit? |
| 23 | after you posted the information about | 23 | MS. BART: Yes. |
| 24 | Yes Rasta? | 24 | MR. BROOKS: That's fine. |
| 25 | A. I have no idea. | 25 | Is this 12 now? |


|  | 245 |  | 247 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | MS. BART: Yes. | 2 | Q. This comes from TurntabieLab.com, |
| 3 | (Defendant's Exhibit 12, interviews | 3 | and it's an image for or a place where you can |
| 4 | and/or articles, was marked for | 4 | purchase your book. And I see the print date is |
| 5 | identification, as of this date.) | 5 | 9/11/2009? |
| 6 | Q. Mr. Cariou, the court reporter is | 6 | A. Mm-hmm. |
| 7 | handing you what's been marked as Defendant's | 7 | Q. And it's being offered for sale for |
| 8 | Exhibit 12. These are materials that were in | 8 | \$35. Now, was this a book that was being |
| 9 | your production that appear to be interviews | 9 | distributed through Turntable or Powerhouse, or |
| 10 | and/or articles that came out about Yes Rasta. | 10 | do you not know? |
| 11 | It's not clear to me - is that | 11 | A. I don't know. I have no idea. |
| 12 | correct what we put together for you in this | 12 | Q. Have you ever seen the review that's |
| 13 | exhibit, if you take a look at it? | 13 | there dated 9/13/2006? |
| 14 | A. Hold on. | 14 | A. Yeah, l've seen that one. I like it |
| 15 | MR. BROOKS: Take your time. Look | 15 | though. |
| 16 | through it. | 16 | Q. And what is it that you like about |
| 17 | (Witness looks through exhibit.) | 17 | it? |
| 18 | A. Yeah. | 18 | A. Well, he said that it's the best |
| 19 | Q. Why don't we, if we could please, | 19 | photography book ever seen on Rasta community. |
| 20 | let's go to the first page which has been marked | 20 | That's not bad for a review. |
| 21 | C218, and at the bottom right-hand corner it | 21 | Q. And it says in the last line |
| 22 | says Vogue Hommes international. I think it's | 22 | beautiful photography any way you scrutinize it, |
| 23 | spring edition? | 23 | an essential tribute to Rasta culture for those |
| 24 | A. Yeah. | 24 | interested. |
| 25 | Q. I guess that's spring-summer | 25 | Again, it's a correct statement |
|  | 246 |  | 248 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | edition, correct? | 2 | about what the book is about, the Rasta culture? |
| 3 | A. Correct. | 3 | A. Yeah. |
| 4 | Q. And this C218, C219 through 220, | 4 | Q. Tuming to the next page of this |
| 5 | that is the interview and corresponding images | 5 | composite exhibit, it's C222. And this is |
| 6 | that appeared in the Vogue interview? | 6 | aStore.Amazon.com. |
| 7 | A. Yes. | 7 | MR. BROOKS: Where does it say that? |
| 8 | Q. The middle image which appears on | 8 | MS. BART: Down at the bottom where |
| 9 | C219 is actually from the Polynesian project, | 9 | it was printed at the bottom it says |
| 10 | correct? | 10 | aStore.Amazon.Rastafari. |
| 11 | A. It's actually a picture of me, of | 11 | BY MS. BART: |
| 12 | myself getting tattooed. | 12 | Q. Is this a piece from the Internet |
| 13 | Q. In your armpit? | 13 | from Amazon -- 1 see it says it's powered by |
| 14 | A. Yeah. | 14 | Amazon.com at the upper right-hand comer? |
| 15 | Q. Did it hurt? | 15 | A. I guess so. I'm not familiar with |
| 16 | I'm sorry, I just had to ask. | 16 | that one. |
| 17 | A. Yes. I passed out eight times on | 17 | Q. And it says that new or used copies |
| 18 | that one. | 18 | of this book are available from $\$ 6.77$ ? |
| 19 | Q. Did you submit these particular | 19 | A. Yeah, I don't know anything about |
| 20 | images to Vogue to accompany this or are these | 20 | that one. |
| 21 | images that they selected? | 21 | Q. And had you not seen the review or |
| 22 | A. I brought them a choice and they did | 22 | the sort of product description that's here |
| 23 | whatever they had to do. | 23 | before? |
| 24 | Q. If you'll turn now to page C221? | 24 | A. Let me-- |
| 25 | A. 221, yeah. | 25 | (Witness looks at exhibit.) |


|  | 249 |  | 251 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | A. No, l've seen this review before. | 2 | A. It is an accurate quote from me. |
| 3 | I don't know where, but l've seen this review | 3 | Q. Did you give an interview to High |
| 4 | before. | 4 | Times? |
| 5 | Q. Now, we have attached to that it | 5 | A. Through a phone call I think, yeah. |
| 6 | looks like page 2 of 3 on C223, at the top of | 6 | Q. And was that published? |
| 7 | the page it says the Library Journal? | 7 | A. I think it was, yeah. |
| 8 | A. Mm-hmm. | 8 | Q. Do you have a copy of that? |
| 9 | Q. And it says this particular author | 9 | A. No. |
| 10 | Joan Levin from Chicago writes that the book is | 10 | Q. What about the Newsday review, do |
| 11 | about the 100 black and white photographs, | 11 | you have a copy of that, which is the second one |
| 12 | mostly closeups of stern mystical men within a | 12 | from the top? |
| 13 | tropical landscape, is that an accurate | 13 | A. I don't keep any review. |
| 14 | statement about your book? | 14 | Q. So you have no copies of any of |
| 15 | A. Yeah, that's one way to describe it. | 15 | these? |
| 16 | Q. And also in it it says -- it refers | 16 | A. No. |
| 17 | to the Henzell essay as depicting the | 17 | Q. Okay. And about midway down it says |
| 18 | Rastafarian culture as a Spiritual society | 18 | there's a quote attributed to you in something |
| 19 | living simply, independently and in harmony with | 19 | called The Fader? |
| 20 | the natural environment. | 20 | A. Yeah. |
| 21 | And that language we've seen from | 21 | Q. What is The Fader? |
| 22 | your complaint, in your complaint as well, | 22 | A. The Fader was a pop-culture magazine |
| 23 | correct? | 23 | which closed down I think a couple years ago. |
| 24 | A. Yes. | 24 | MR. BROOKS: Can you say that again? |
| 25 | Q. Now, there's a customer review here, | 25 | MS. BART: Pop-culture magazine. |
|  | 250 |  | 252 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | do you know who did this customer review? | 2 | BY MS. BART: |
| 3 | A. No idea. | 3 | Q. And it's a quote by you. |
| 4 | Q. On page C 225 it says check out -- | 4 | Jamaicans in general hate having |
| 5 | the title of this page is Check Out the Latest | 5 | their pictures taken, so to me they bless |
| 6 | Media Coverage of Powerhouse Books, it's been | 6 | me. They gave me their confidence. It |
| 7 | updated September 2002. | 7 | wasn't easy. Every time it was a battle. |
| 8 | And in it it describes certain press | 8 | Every second of my time spent in Jamaica |
| 9 | that has -- it's taken snippets from various | 9 | was a battle. |
| 10 | press about your Yes Rasta book, is that | 10 | Is that an accurate quote? |
| 11 | correct, do you see that there? | 11 | A. Yes, it is. |
| 12 | A. It is correct. | 12 | Q. The descriptions that you've given |
| 13 | Q. Now, if you look part of the way | 13 | to us earlier today suggest that you actually |
| 14 | down it says -- let's see, it looks like it's | 14 | got on fairly well with the Rastafarians that |
| 15 | three quotes from the bottom? | 15 | you photographed? |
| 16 | A. Okay. | 16 | A. Yeah, absolutely. |
| 17 | Q. It's written by a publication called | 17 | Q. And I didn't understand that to be a |
| 18 | High Times and it says ganja - quote, ganja is | 18 | battle to get -- |
| 19 | very important to Rasta life but it's only one | 19 | A. Because in between one Rasta to |
| 20 | part, Cariou says, I was most impressed with the | 20 | another you have Rude Boys, the other Jamaican |
| 21 | organic lifestyle and the strength of the | 21 | people, the gangsters. |
| 22 | people? | 22 | And every step of the way they're |
| 23 | A. Yes. | 23 | going to make you pay and make sure it's painful |
| 24 | Q. And that's an accurate quote from | 24 | to get there. |
| 25 | you? | 25 | Q. I see. And I did notice in some of |


|  | 253 |  | 255 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Caniou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | your production that you actually have started | 2 | Bates Number C245-- |
| 3 | some photographs about the Rude Boys? | 3 | A. Mm-hmm, yeah. |
| 4 | A. Mm-hmm. | 4 | Q. -- through 253? |
| 5 | Q. Is that a culture that you're now | 5 | A. Okay. |
| 6 | focusing on? | 6 | Q. Yes? |
| 7 | A. Well, Trenched -- I mean part of | 7 | A. Yes. |
| 8 | Trench Town Love is about the Rude Boys. You | 8 | Q. And so can you show me on this |
| 9 | know, it's downtown Kingston, it's much more | 9 | report what the total sales have been over the |
| 10 | urban, and it's a whole different vibe. | 10 | life of Yes Rasta since Powerhouse has been |
| 11 | Q. And was that part of the payoff for | 11 | publishing your book? |
| 12 | letting you get to take pictures of the | 12 | (Witness looks at exhibit.) |
| 13 | Rastafarians? | 13 | Q. If you look at C 252 ? |
| 14 | A. It's just, you know, Jamaica is | 14 | A. 252 or 253 ? |
| 15 | hectic and it's, you know, it could be a violent | 15 | Q. It gives you like a summary? |
| 16 | culture. And to survive you have to fight your | 16 | A. If we take 252 it's 2,630 books. |
| 17 | way in. So, yeah. | 17 | Q. Oh, I see. Ithink that 251 and 253 |
| 18 | And the same time I did enjoy my | 18 | are a spreadsheet that must go like this, it |
| 19 | time with the Rastas, but I had to move around | 19 | must go this way, laterally. |
| 20 | too. | 20 | So Yes Rasta, if you go across the |
| 21 | Q. To stay away from the Rude Boys? | 21 | line, where are you seeing the total $-2,630$ ? |
| 22 | A. No, to go see someone else, you | 22 | A. Yeah. |
| 23 | know, simply. | 23 | Q. And for a total sales of $\$ 80,154$ ? |
| 24 | Q. I'm sorry, I don't understand. | 24 | A. Yeah. |
| 25 | A. I'm in one place, I have to go on | 25 | Q. Is that correct? |
|  | 254 |  | 256 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | the other side of the island because I have to | 2 | A. Yes. |
| 3 | meet another Rasta that I know of. In between | 3 | Q. Now, looking at this document does |
| 4 | it's not going to be easy, just by -- just the | 4 | this refresh your recollection as to - remember |
| 5 | fact of driving in Jamaica is complicated. | 5 | l asked you earlier about the channels of |
| 6 | Q. Yes. | 6 | distribution where the book was sold - we see |
| 7 | A. You know, and so on and so forth, | 7 | Bames super, Bames small? |
| 8 | and finding food and, you know, et cetera, | 8 | A. Yeah, I can read Amazon, MusicLand, |
| 9 | et cetera. | 9 | Tower, yeah. But no, it doesn't refresh my |
| 10 | Q. Has anyone - and forgive me if l've | 10 | memory. I don't have any memory about that. |
| 11 | asked you this question before -- has anyone | 11 | Q. Okay. Do you know whether based on |
| 12 | contacted you through this website about the | 12 | the way the royalty statements you've received |
| 13 | possible purchase of any images? | 13 | in the past, does this tell you who has sold |
| 14 | A. No. | 14 | your books and how many? |
| 15 | MS. BART: Let's mark this as the | 15 | A. Who has sold my book? No, I have no |
| 16 | next exhibit, please. | 16 | idea. |
| 17 | (Defendant's Exhibit 13, sales | 17 | Q. And would we be able to get that |
| 18 | records, was marked for identification, as | 18 | information from Powerhouse? |
| 19 | of this date.) | 19 | A. I suppose so. |
| 20 | Q. Mr. Cariou, I'm handing you what's | 20 | Q. If you look at the document that's |
| 21 | been marked as Defendant's Exhibit 13. And I | 21 | marked C253? |
| 22 | believe these are the sales records to which | 22 | A. Yeah. |
| 23 | your counsel referred to previously, is that | 23 | Q. This is a royalty report. |
| 24 | correct? | 24 | Now, this document, which is dated |
| 25 | And for the record, they bear | 25 | as of December 2007, says the total books sold |

Toll Free: 800.944.9454
Facsimile: 212.557.5972

| 257 |  | 259 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | are 2,338. Do you see that? | 2 | total amount -- |
| 3 | A. No. | 3 | A. Me too. |
| 4 | Q. It's way at the bottom. | 4 | Q. You need to exercise that audit |
| 5 | MR. BROOKS: On the last page. | 5 | right. |
| 6 | Q. On this page. | 6 | A. Yeah. |
| 7 | A. Yeah, okay, total books sold. | 7 | Q. So is the total that you received to |
| 8 | 3,453 or 5,791? | 8 | date $\$ 8,087.75$, and what we're seeing on the |
| 9 | Q. Is the total? | 9 | prior page for the $\$ 80,154$ was actually the |
| 10 | A. Yeah, total books sold, 5,791. | 10 | gross sales as opposed to the amount that you've |
| 11 | Q. Do you see the document where it | 11 | made? |
| 12 | says sales last period, it's four or five boxes | 12 | A. Yeah, that's -- definitely, the |
| 13 | down, and it says 391 sold below cost? | 13 | 80,000 is the gross sales. |
| 14 | A. Yeah. | 14 | Q. And do you know when - because we |
| 15 | Q. And there we have a list price | 15 | see here this is a document that's dated |
| 16 | of \$60? | 16 | October 2009, and it's showing the list price of |
| 17 | A. List price, yeah. | 17 | the book at \$60, but when you look at the web |
| 18 | Q. See that right underneath it? | 18 | page for Powerhouse it lists it for \$100 a book, |
| 19 | A. Yeah, yeah. | 19 | do you know when the price increased? |
| 20 | Q. So what this chart is telling us is | 20 | A. I have no idea. I haven't talked to |
| 21 | that there have been 391 that have been sold | 21 | them in a while. Otherwise -- |
| 22 | below cost, correct? | 22 | MR. BROOKS: Okay, you answered. |
| 23 | A. Probably, yeah. | 23 | You have no idea. |
| $24$ | Q. Okay. And what you made for that | $24$ | A. Okay. |
| $25$ | group is $\$ 293.25$, correct? | 25 | Q. Is there a reason why you haven't |
|  | 258 |  | 260 |
| 1 | Caniou | 1 | Caniou |
| 2 | A. Correct, I guess, yeah. | 2 | spoken with them for a while? |
| 3 | Q. And the trade sales up at the top | 3 | A. I was finishing up my Gypsy book and |
| 4 | are $\$ 6,033.60$, and direct sales, is that direct | 4 | it takes a lot of travel. |
| 5 | sales would be off of their website? | 5 | Q. I can imagine. |
| 6 | A. I don't know what is direct sales. | 6 | Has anyone ever contacted you |
| 7 | Q. So you don't know if those came off | 7 | through the PatrickCariou.com website about this |
| 8 | of the website sales for Powerhouse? | 8 | lawsuit? |
| 9 | A. I have no idea. | 9 | A. Contacted me through - I received a |
| 10 | MR. BROOKS: Holly, when you make a | 10 | mail through my mailbox, but not through my |
| 11 | copy of this exhibit for everyone would | 11 | website. I mean I don't even know if my website |
| 12 | you mind - and we should have done | 12 | works as far as - |
| 13 | this - white out or black out his Social | 13 | Q. The link? |
| 14 | Security number? | 14 | A. Yeah. Actually there is a link |
| 15 | MS. BART: Oh, goodness, yes. Let's | 15 | between the e-mail address for the website which |
| 16 | all do that right now. | 16 | goes directly to the mailbox I use. |
| 17 | Mr. Cariou, may I please have that | 17 | So l've, yeah, actually been |
| 18 | copy that you are holding? | 18 | contacted. |
| 19 | MR. BROOKS: When you make a copy | 19 | Q. And who has contacted you? |
| 20 | of it make it of a document without the | 20 | A. It was an organization from |
| 21 | number. | 21 | somewhere in --where was it -- Anguilla I |
| 22 | (Discussion off the record.) | 22 | think. |
| 23 | BY MS. BART: | 23 | Q. And what was the subject of the |
| 24 | Q. So the total - I'm just trying to | 24 | inquiry? |
| 25 | understand how much you've received - is the | 25 | A. It was a letter of protest against |


|  | 261 |  | 263 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | the Canal Zone show that I read briefly. | 2 | what happened. |
| 3 | Q. And do you still have that e-mail? | 3 | (Defendant's Exhibit 14, printout |
| 4 | A. Yeah, probably, if I look through | 4 | of Internet page, was marked for |
| 5 | it. But yeah. | 5 | identification, as of this date.) |
| 6 | RQ MS. BART: And we ask for the | 6 | Q. Defendant's Exhibit 14 has been |
| 7 | production. | 7 | handed to you by the court reporter. |
| 8 | MR. BROOKS: It was produced by | 8 | When you click the link on your |
| 9 | Mr. Prince. | 9 | web page this is the Internet page on |
| 10 | MS. BART: You've seen it? | 10 | www.Powerhouse.com to which it takes you. |
| 11 | MR. BROOKS: It was produced in | 11 | A. Great. |
| 12 | Mr. Prince's document production. | 12 | Q. And if you look, there's an image of |
| 13 | MS. BART: I've seen that one, | 13 | the Yes Rasta book there? |
| 14 | but -- | 14 | A. Mm-hmm. |
| 15 | MR. BROOKS: That's the same one. | 15 | Q. And right underneath it it says |
| 16 | THE WITNESS: Yeah, that's the one | 16 | artist book slash portraiture slash monograph? |
| 17 | I'm talking about. | 17 | A. Mm-hmm. |
| 18 | MS. BART: How do you know if you've | 18 | Q. Would you agree with the |
| 19 | not seen it? | 19 | characterization of this particular book? |
| 20 | BY MS. BART: | 20 | A. Absolutely. |
| 21 | Q. Have you seen the letter that | 21 | Q. And the monograph refers to the |
| 22 | Mr. Prince produced? | 22 | essay by Mr. Henzell, correct? |
| 23 | A. Yeah. | 23 | A. No, the monograph refers to the fact |
| 24 | Q. And you're saying it's the same one? | 24 | that l'm the author of the book. It refers to |
| 25 | A. Yeah. | 25 | the fact that I'm the only one who took pictures |
|  | 262 |  | 264 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | Q. And do you recall when you received | 2 | in that book. In photo books it's called |
| 3 | the letter of protest? | 3 | monography when a photographer has his own book. |
| 4 | A. I think February, something like | 4 | Q. Now, if you look just below that, |
| 5 | that. | 5 | the ISBN number, it lists \$100? |
| 6 | Q. Of 2009? | 6 | A. Mm-hmm, yes. |
| 7 | A. Of 2009, yeah. | 7 | Q. Now you see where we got the number, |
| 8 | Q. Now, on your website there is a link | 8 | but you don't know when the price went from $\$ 60$ |
| 9 | back to Powerhouse, www.PowerhouseBooks.com? | 9 | to \$100? |
| 10 | A. Really? | 10 | A. No idea. |
| 11 | Q. Yes. Yes, there is. | 11 | Q. From December to January 2010? |
| 12 | A. Wow. | 12 | A. Noidea. |
| 13 | MR. BROOKS: Where is that? | 13 | MR. BROOKS: From December what? |
| 14 | MS. BART: If you click on | 14 | MS. BART: Let me get the document |
| 15 | Yes Rasta. | 15 | out. |
| 16 | MR. BROOKS: Well, I don't see it on | 16 | BY MS. BART: |
| 17 | the exhibit. | 17 | Q. I'm sorry, October 1st, 2009, which |
| 18 | MS. BART: It's a link and then it | 18 | appears in Exhibit 13 on page C253, the book is |
| 19 | takes you to Powerhouse Books. | 19 | listed with a list price of \$60? |
| 20 | MR. BROOKS: Well, that's what | 20 | A. Yeah, on that, yeah. |
| 21 | you're saying. I don't see it on the | 21 | Q. But here it's listed for a hundred. |
| 22 | exhibit, just like I didn't see the -- | 22 | Have you ever seen the description |
| 23 | MS. BART: And we told you that was | 23 | of your book before on Yes Rasta? |
| 24 | a mistake and we're correcting it. | 24 | And perhaps this will help you |
| 25 | I apologize for it. I don't know | 25 | remember where you saw that prior description |


|  | 265 |  | 267 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | that was on the other web page. | 2 | language, it was just posted? |
| 3 | A. Yeah, I just realized it. | 3 | A. I must have read it once quickly and |
| 4 | Q. Now? | 4 | liked it and said yeah, that's fine, and that |
| 5 | A. Yeah. | 5 | was it, you know. |
| 6 | Q. Okay. So that was one that was | 6 | Q. And so this was written in or about |
| 7 | written by Powerhouse. | 7 | 2002 when the book was first published? |
| 8 | And did you participate in the | 8 | A. Yeah. |
| 9 | writing of this particular description? | 9 | Q. Now, if you look - |
| 10 | A. No. | 10 | MR. BROOKS: The book was published |
| 11 | Q. Do you want to take a minute to read | 11 | in 2000. |
| 12 | this -- I guess we can read it into the record | 12 | MS. BART: What did I say? |
| 13 | since it's so short. It's described as: | 13 | MR. BROOKS: 2002. |
| 14 | With a penchant for adventure it is | 14 | MS. BART: I meant 2000. |
| 15 | no wonder photographer Patrick Cariou, | 15 | BY MS. BART: |
| 16 | whose first book Surfers drew tidal waves | 16 | Q. If you will look back at Defendant's |
| 17 | of praise, journeyed to Jamaica, a land | 17 | Exhibit 14 you will see in all caps that it says |
| 18 | which he calls, quote, pure madness and | 18 | limited availability, please inquire, and then |
| 19 | one of the most dangerous places on earth | 19 | there's a phone number that's given. |
| 20 | that is not at war. There he entered the | 20 | Do you see that there, right |
| 21 | secluded world of the Rastafarians, a | 21 | underneath the title? |
| 22 | world culture and religion closed to | 22 | A. Yeah. |
| 23 | outsiders. Cariou slowly gained their | 23 | Q. Do you know why people who want to |
| $24$ | trust and they began to let him take their | 24 | purchase this book have to call as opposed to |
| 25 | picture. With bold black and white | 25 | being able to just purchase it? |
|  | 266 |  | 268 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | portraits and landscapes Cariou indelibly | 2 | A. In a bookstore? |
| 3 | captured the strict separatist | 3 | Q. Or clicking on the website? |
| 4 | jungle-dwelling fruit-of-the-land | 4 | A. Because they probably have only a |
| 5 | lifestyle popularized by Reggae legends | 5 | few boxes left, I would say. That would be -- |
| 6 | Bob Marley, Peter Tosh, and Burning Spear | 6 | I think that's what it is. |
| 7 | in never-before-seen images until now. In | 7 | Q. It's not tied in any way then to the |
| 8 | Yes Rasta, the phrase spoken by true | 8 | lawsuit? |
| 9 | Rastafari when greeting each other, | 9 | A. Oh, no. |
| 10 | Cariou's direct classical photographs | 10 | Q. Do you know if this page on the |
| 11 | reveal men whose style and attitude are as | 11 | Powerhouse website has always described the |
| 12 | distinctive as their dreadlocks, men who | 12 | number of available copies as limited |
| 13 | have left the modem world of Babyion in | 13 | availability? |
| 14 | pursuit of their own independence, men | 14 | A. It must have been, yeah. |
| 15 | whose lives are intertwined with the | 15 | Q. But you don't - |
| 16 | tropical landscape and whose rituals, | 16 | A. I mean I don't know when they |
| 17 | symbols, philosophies, religion, medicine, | 17 | started to do that. But you're going to have to |
| 18 | agriculture, family structure, and | 18 | ask them about that because I have no idea |
| 19 | remarkable strength make the definitive | 19 | about, you know -- I'm busy, I have things to |
| 20 | statement of self-reliance. | 20 | do, I'm not with them all the time, you know. |
| 21 | Do you think that that is an | 21 | Q. And you don't know how many copies |
| 22 | accurate description of your book? | 22 | Powerhouse still has available for sale? |
| 23 | A. Yeah, it is. | 23 | A. No idea. |
| 24 | Q. This was not something though that | 24 | MS. BART: Let's mark as the next |
| 25 | you had an opportunity to comment on the | 25 | exhibit this document, please. |

Toll Free: 800.944.9454 Facsimile: 212.557.5972

|  | 269 |  | 271 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | (Defendant's Exhibit 15, exchanges | 2 | have an opportunity to look through Defendant's |
| 3 | and commentary of Perry Henzell draft, was | 3 | Exhibit 15 and confirm that none of the |
| 4 | marked for identification, as of this | 4 | handwritten notes are yours? |
| 5 | date.) | 5 | A. No, none of them is not. |
| 6 | Q. Mr. Cariou, the court reporter has | 6 | MS. BART: Let's mark as the next |
| 7 | handed you what's been marked as Defendant's | 7 | exhibit Defendant's Exhibit 16. |
| 8 | Exhibit 15. This is a composite exhibit of | 8 | (Defendant's Exhibit 16, letter |
| 9 | documents that were in your document production | 9 | from Craig Cohen, was marked for |
| 10 | showing various exchanges and commentary of the | 10 | identification, as of this date.) |
| 11 | draft. | 11 | MS. BART: Does he have that in |
| 12 | And I think when I asked you earlier | 12 | front of him? |
| 13 | I asked whether or not you had participated in | 13 | MR. BROOKS: He has it. |
| 14 | commenting in any way on the draft of the | 14 | BY MS. BART: |
| 15 | document, and you said no, and I wondered if | 15 | Q. I've handed you what's been marked |
| 16 | this document changes your answer? | 16 | as Defendant's Exhibit 16 and ask you if you |
| 17 | A. No, it does not. I am aware of the | 17 | have ever seen this document before? |
| 18 | document. l've been aware of the document like | 18 | A. No, I have not. |
| 19 | a couple days, but I had no idea like that Perry | 19 | Q. So this letter is not a letter from |
| 20 | Henzell and Powerhouse were communicating on | 20 | you? |
| 21 | that matter. | 21 | A. No. |
| 22 | Q. For example, on C315 we see a bunch | 22 | Q. This is a letter from someone at |
| 23 | of handwriting, it looks to me on $7 / 12 / 2000$ ? | 23 | Powerhouse? |
| 24 | A. 315, yeah. | 24 | A. It's a letter from Craig Cohen. |
| 25 | Q. That's not your handwriting? | 25 | Q. And how did you obtain this |
|  | 270 |  | 272 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | A. No, not at all. | 2 | document, it was produced by your counsel? |
| 3 | Q. So as you look through this document | 3 | A. By talking to Powerhouse I guess. |
| 4 | none of the edits to this, to the Henzell essay, | 4 | Q. So this didn't come from your |
| 5 | came from you, is that correct? | 5 | records? |
| 6 | A. Yeah, correct. | 6 | A. No. |
| 7 | Q. But you were satisfied with the end | 7 | Q. This is something you obtained from |
| 8 | product? | 8 | Powerhouse? |
| 9 | A. Yeah, absolutely. | 9 | MR. BROOKS: I obtained. |
| 10 | Q. And, for example, on 326 the | 10 | MS. BART: Well, you as the |
| 11 | handwritten notes there are not yours? | 11 | collective you. |
| 12 | A. None of those is mine. | 12 | BY MS. BART: |
| 13 | MR. BROOKS: Here's 326. | 13 | Q. On page C352 there's a list of names |
| 14 | A. Yeah. | 14 | and addresses, some people have businesses |
| 15 | Q. Will you just take a second while | 15 | associated with their names, do you know what |
| 16 | the court reporter marks the next exhibit and | 16 | this list is? |
| 17 | just make sure that none of those handwritten | 17 | A. No. No idea. |
| 18 | notations are yours? | 18 | Q. Do you know any of the people that |
| 19 | A. Okay. | 19 | are on this list? |
| 20 | MR. HAYES: Can we just take a | 20 | A. Sure. I know -- do I know them |
| 21 | two-minute break? | 21 | personally or do I know their name? |
| 22 | (Recess taken: 5:10 p.m.) | 22 | Q. No, personally? |
| 23 | (Proceedings resumed: 5:14 p.m.) | 23 | We see Herve Morel on there? |
| 24 | BY MS. BART: | 24 | A. Yeah. 1 knew Irving Penn. He just |
| 25 | Q. Mr. Cariou, during the break did you | 25 | died two months ago. It's actually a list of |


|  | 273 |  | 275 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | famous photographers, that's what it is. | 2 | culture? |
| 3 | Q. And do you know why this list was | 3 | A. I'm just reading it as -- |
| 4 | compiled? | 4 | MR. BROOKS: No, no. Just answer |
| 5 | A. No idea. | 5 | her question. Do you know? |
| 6 | Q. Do you know whether or not any | 6 | A. Can you ask me the question again, |
| 7 | information relating to Yes Rasta was sent to | 7 | please? |
| 8 | any of the individuals on this document? | 8 | Q. Yes, of course. |
| 9 | A. I really don't know. I don't think | 9 | Did you know in November of 1999 |
| 10 | so. No, I really don't know. | 10 | that Powerhouse Books was, quote, looking for a |
| 11 | Q. Turning then to the next page of | 11 | specialist's view of Jamaican reality and Rasta |
| 12 | this document, which is how it was produced to | 12 | culture, closed quote? |
| 13 | us, there's something there that says it's C353 | 13 | A. No. |
| 14 | and 354? | 14 | Q. Did Powerhouse Books give you the |
| 15 | A. Yeah. | 15 | idea for Yes Rasta? |
| 16 | Q. And there is a piece about | 16 | A. No. |
| 17 | Yes Rasta, which is not the same as the one that | 17 | Q. And so how is it that Yes Rasta is |
| 18 | was by Henry. | 18 | looking for a specialist's view in 1990? |
| 19 | Is this background material that was | 19 | MR. BROOKS: Objection. He's never |
| 20 | provided to Mr. Henzell? | 20 | seen this document before. |
| 21 | A. Could you please repeat the | 21 | A. A specialist's view -- |
| 22 | question? I didn't understand. | 22 | MR. BROOKS: Hold on. He's never |
| 23 | Q. Do you know if this information was | 23 | seen the document. |
| 24 | provided to Mr. Henzell or was this an early | 24 | MS. BART: Don't coach this witness, |
| 25 | draft? | 25 | Mr. Brooks. |
|  | 274 |  | 276 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | A. That's an early draft. That's | 2 | MR. BROOKS: He has never seen the |
| 3 | Mr. Henzell writing. | 3 | document. |
| 4 | Q. I see. So all of this is his? | 4 | MS. BART: I understand that. Just |
| 5 | A. Yeah. | 5 | let me continue. |
| 6 | MR. BROOKS: Excuse me, what do you | 6 | BY MS. BART: |
| 7 | mean by all of it? The last two pages? | 7 | Q. Did you understand at that point |
| 8 | MS. BART: Yes. I had already | 8 | in time that Powerhouse Books was looking for |
| 9 | previously noted it as 353 and 354, but | 9 | exactly the same book that you ended up |
| 10 | thank you for pointing that out. | 10 | producing? |
| 11 | Let's mark this as the next exhibit, | 11 | A. No, that's not what it says. |
| 12 | please. | 12 | Q. Well, it says we're looking for a |
| 13 | (Defendant's Exhibit 17, document | 13 | specialist's view of Jamaican reality and Rasta |
| 14 | dated November 9, 1999, was marked for | 14 | culture. |
| 15 | identification, as of this date.) | 15 | A. Yeah, someone being able to write |
| 16 | Q. I've handed you a document bearing | 16 | text. To write text. I might have not come up |
| 17 | Bates Number C342, and it's dated November 9, | 17 | with Perry Henzell at that point. |
| 18 | 1999? | 18 | Q. I see. So this is a vitae of what |
| 19 | A. Mm-hmm, yes. | 19 | you were looking for for the essay for the book? |
| 20 | Q. Have you ever seen this document | 20 | MR. BROOKS: Objection. |
| 21 | before? | 21 | A. Exactly. |
| 22 | A. No. | 22 | MR. BROOKS: He wasn't looking for |
| 23 | Q. Did you understand that in November | 23 | it. He's never seen this document. |
| 24 | of 1999 Powerhouse Books was looking for a | 24 | Q. Did you ever give to Powerhouse |
| 25 | specialist's view of Jamaican reality and Rasta | 25 | Books any input about what the essay should look |


|  | 277 |  | 279 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou |  | ario |
| 2 | like or what you thought the contents should | 2 | A. Yeah. |
| 3 | contain? | 3 | Q. You can set that aside or give it to |
| 4 | A. Yes, Ithought Perry Henzell was the | 4 | the court reporter. |
| 5 | guy, the ultimate, and I was totally convinced | 5 | Mr. Cariou, in your description of |
| 6 | that I would get him, and I did. | 6 | your work you have talked about doing this for a |
| 7 | MS. BART: Let's mark this as the | 7 | long period of time. How long have you been a |
| 8 | next exhibit. | 8 | professional photographer? |
| 9 | (Defendant's Exnibit 18, document, | 9 | A. About 24 years. |
| 10 | was marked for idenifification, as of this | 10 | Q. And did you take any special |
| 11 | date.) | 11 | schooling to become a professional photographer? |
| 12 | Q. The court reporter has handed you | 12 | A. No. |
| 13 | what's been marked as Defendant's Exhibit 18. | 13 | Q. Do you have a college education? |
| 14 | Have you ever seen this document | 14 | A. No. |
| 15 | before? | 15 | Q. Would you consider yourself to be |
| 16 | A. No. | 16 | a self-trained photographer? |
| 17 | Q. This came from your production. You | 17 | A. No, l actually started as an |
| 18 | don't know what this is at all? | 18 | assistant. I was assisting some of the, you |
| 19 | A. No, not at all. | 19 | know, greatest photographers at that time. |
| 20 | Q. And you've not seen it before? | 20 | Q. And who were you assistant to? |
| 21 | A. No. | 21 | A. Peter Limberg, Paulo Roversi, you |
| 22 | MS. BART: At this time I'd like to | 22 | know, major fashion photographers. |
| 23 | supplement what was previously marked as I | 23 | Q. And do you consider yourself |
| 24 | believe Defendant's Exhibit 11 to include | 24 | primarily to be a fashion photographer? |
| 25 | the specific pages from the website for | 25 | A. No. |
|  | 278 |  | 280 |
|  | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | Yes Rasta, so I will hand this to the | 2 | Q. How would you describe your |
|  | witness and ask counsel toj just add this | 3 | profession as a photographer? |
| 4 | to the packet for Exhibit 11. | 4 | A. I'm a portraitist. |
| 5 | (Discussion off the record.) | 5 | Q. That is your specialty? |
| 6 | MR. BROOKS: So what are we calling | 6 | A. That's what I do, yeah. |
| 7 | this? Are we calling this 11A? | 7 | Q. So whether it's for your own books |
| 8 | MS. BART: No, we're just adding it | 8 | or whether it's for fashion, that is your style |
|  | to 11. We just said on the record that 1 | 9 | of photography? |
| 10 | was going to ask everyone to supplement it | 10 | A. Yes. |
| 11 | by just adding it to it. | 11 | Q. And you leamed that trade through |
| 12 | Mr. Brooks, you asked earier about | 12 | other specialists or experts in the area of |
| 13 | the link, and it's order now when you | 13 | portraiture? |
| 14 | click on Yes Rasta it takes you to the | 14 | A. Well, you know, I developed my own |
| 15 | page with Powerhouse. | 15 | style over the years. You know, they taught me |
| 16 | MR. BROOKS: Okay. | 16 | a lot on photography but, you know, and then |
| 17 | MS. BART: And that was right on the | 17 | after that 1 had to develop my own thing. |
| 18 | first page of Defendant's Exhibit 11. | 18 | Q. Your website shows that you've done |
| 19 | BY MS. BART: | 19 | photographic work for a travel magazine, is that |
| 20 | Q. Mr. Cariou, the only question I have | 20 | correct? |
| 21 | about those - l'd asked you this before - but | 21 | A. Yes, it's correct. |
| 22 | those are the photographs that appear on your | 22 | Q. And is it Conde Nast Travel that you |
| 23 | web page? | 23 | did a spread for? |
| 24 | A. Yeah. | 24 | A. Yeah. |
| 25 | Q. For Yes Rasta? | 25 | Q. And that was of Jamaica or it was |

## Suite 4715

One Penn Plaza
New York, NY 10119
www.esquiresolutions.com

|  | 281 |  | 283 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Caniou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | some tropical area? | 2 | A. Yeah, I have a Polynesian project |
| 3 | A. No, it was in Greece. Greece and | 3 | I'm working on. |
| 4 | Cuba. I did a lot of different trips for them. | 4 | Q. And when did you start working on |
| 5 | Q. But those are the only ones relating | 5 | the Polynesian project? |
| 6 | to travel or there are other travel trips that | 6 | A. Oh, a long time ago. It must have |
| 7 | you've done for them? | 7 | been - the first time I went there was in the |
| 8 | A. You mean for travel and leisure? | 8 | early '90s, like '89 or '90. |
| 9 | Q. Yes. | 9 | Q. And has anyone agreed to publish |
| 10 | A. I did quite a bit of trips for them. | 10 | your Polynesian works? |
| 11 | I went to the Maldives, I went to Tunisia, I | 11 | A. If's not done yet. |
| 12 | went to Cuba, I went to a few other places. | 12 | Q. So it's still in - |
| 13 | Q. And those were freelance | 13 | A. If's still in the process of. |
| 14 | assignments? | 14 | Q. Other than the images or the prints |
| 15 | A. Yeah. | 15 | of the Yes Rasta images have you sold any other |
| 16 | Q. And the focus there though was not | 16 | prints of your images of any of the photography |
| 17 | on portraiture, it was on the places that they | 17 | work you've done? |
| 18 | were wanting to showcase in their magazine? | 18 | A. Yes, I have. |
| 19 | A. Absolutely. | 19 | Q. Can you tell me what images you've |
| 20 | Q. For what publications have you done | 20 | sold? |
| 21 | photographic work? | 21 | A. I couldn't tell you which images I |
| 22 | A. Well, I worked for -- I did work for | 22 | sold, but there is - where is the list of - |
| 23 | French Vogue. I worked for Italian Vogue. I | 23 | I don't know - that's something I can't provide |
| 24 | worked for Mademoiselle when it was still alive. | 24 | to you now, but l've sold a few prints of |
| 25 | I worked for The Fader. I worked for so many of | 25 | different projects to Mr. Girard. |
|  | 282 |  | 284 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | them actually. | 2 | Q. Were you looking for a particular |
| 3 | I worked for Vibe Magazine. I | 3 | document like your web page? |
| 4 | worked for German Marie Claire and Spanish -- | 4 | A. No, no -- well, I wanted to have the |
| 5 | yeah, I worked for Elle. | 5 | name, the exact name of the person, you know, |
| 6 | MR. BROOKS: E-L-L-E. | 6 | who bought two Rasta prints. |
| 7 | A. And so on and so forth. I worked | 7 | Q. It's right there. |
| 8 | for quite a bit of magazines. | 8 | A. Yeah, he got four different other |
| 9 | Q. Approximately how much of your | 9 | prints from me. |
| 10 | annual revenues income is derived from freelance | 10 | Q. Mr. Girard did? |
| 11 | assignments for magazines? | 11 | A. Yeah. |
| 12 | A. I stopped commercial photography a | 12 | Q. And have you sold any other prints |
| 13 | few years ago now. I'm just doing my personal | 13 | to Mr. Girard or anyone else? |
| 14 | photography. | 14 | A. I might have sold a few Surfer |
| 15 | Q. I see. So these were all -- the | 15 | prints. I have sold a few Surfer prints. |
| 16 | French Vogue, the Italian Vogue, Mademoiselle, | 16 | Q. And were any of the Surfer prints, |
| 17 | Fader, all of that was before what year? | 17 | were those sold again to Mr. Girard? |
| 18 | A. Before - we're in 2010 -- I would | 18 | A. No, no, to different people. |
| 19 | say before 2004. | 19 | Q. To people that you know? |
| 20 | Q. And so at this point in time you | 20 | A. Yeah. |
| 21 | were your doing projects like Trench Town Love, | 21 | Q. Is your view with the Surfer prints |
| 22 | It think you had the gypsies? | 22 | the same as Yes Rasta, you only sell them if you |
| 23 | A. Yeah, the Gypsies is the one. | 23 | like the person? |
| 24 | Q. Do you have any other projects | 24 | A. Up until the moment I'm ready to be |
| 25 | you're working on? | 25 | out in the world and say, you know, that's - my |

Toll Free: $\mathbf{8 0 0 . 9 4 4 . 9 4 5 4}$ Facsimile: 212.557.5972

|  | 285 |  | 287 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | conception is -- and I have produced three books | 2 | someone else. We'll see. |
| 3 | of portraits, the Gypsies is the fourth one, and | 3 | Q. Are you talking to other people |
| 4 | that's the end of a circle when that particular | 4 | about that? |
| 5 | body of work on portraiture is ready to be out | 5 | A. Yeah, yeah. |
| 6 | in the world. | 6 | Q. And are you in active negotiations |
| 7 | Then I'll go to landscape or I'll | 7 | for that publishing, the publishing of the Gypsy |
| 8 | go to, you know, still life or different type of | 8 | book? |
| 9 | photography. | 9 | A. Sort of. I'm still working a little |
| 10 | But for the past 20 years l've been | 10 | bit on the layout. There's still things that |
| 11 | doing serious portraiture, but I don't -- I'm | 11 | I'm not completely happy with, so -- l'm talking |
| 12 | not in a rush. I never really thought of, in | 12 | to people. |
| 13 | essence, recognition. I like things to slowly, | 13 | Q. And what companies or individuals, |
| 14 | you know - | 14 | publishers - |
| 15 | Q. Germinate? | 15 | MR. BROOKS: I don't think that's |
| 16 | A. -- mature. | 16 | relevant. |
| 17 | Q. Mature? | 17 | MS. BART: Well, I think it is |
| 18 | A. Yeah. | 18 | relevant to show -- it is relevant because |
| 19 | Q. And by that you mean your work or | 19 | it shows that he still has a viable |
| 20 | your style to mature? | 20 | commercial career. |
| 21 | A. No, the pictures that are done | 21 | So l'd like to know who he's |
| 22 | already to mature. You don't look at that book | 22 | speaking to. It's my last - |
| 23 | now the same way you were looking at it when it | 23 | MR. BROOKS: l'm not going to let |
| 24 | comes out, when it came out, and you will not | 24 | him speak to people that he doesn't have |
| 25 | look at that book in 20 years the way you look | 25 | contracts with yet. I'm not going to let |
|  | 286 |  | 288 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Caniou |
| 2 | at it now. | 2 | him do it. It's confidential. |
| 3 | You know, things change around, | 3 | MR. HAYES: So you're directing him |
| 4 | aesthetics change, people change. And that's | 4 | not to answer? |
| 5 | why l've never been in a rush to sell prints | 5 | MR. BROOKS: Yes. |
| 6 | or - whenever I could, you know. | 6 | CQ MS. BART: Let's certify that |
| 7 | Q. And what changed for you in 2008 | 7 | question, please. |
| 8 | that caused you to be open to the possibility of | 8 | BY MS. BART: |
| 9 | Ms. Celle representing you, like you were ready? | 9 | Q. Mr. Cariou, we're really not trying |
| 10 | A. The completion of Gypsies, the fact | 10 | to pry into your personal business, we're trying |
| 11 | that I have spent eight years doing the Gypsy | 11 | to understand your profession. |
| 12 | book. It's done. It's not published yet, but | 12 | Can you tell me if these publishers |
| 13 | there is the mock-up and all the pictures are | 13 | with whom you're actively engaged in dialogue |
| 14 | done. | 14 | are recognized publishing houses? |
| 15 | And those four books will be my | 15 | A. Yes, they are. |
| 16 | four books of portraits, and then I'll go on | 16 | Q. And are they international in scope? |
| 17 | something else. You know, and that was the | 17 | A. Yes, they are. |
| 18 | time - | 18 | Q. Has your Surfer collection ever been |
| 19 | Q. I see. It was the completion of the | 19 | displayed, exhibited in a gallery? |
| 20 | books? | 20 | A. It was displayed with the Rastas in |
| 21 | A. Yeah, that was the completion of | 21 | Paris in Gallery 213, yeah. |
| 22 | those four books. | 22 | Q. So it was - |
| 23 | Q. And is Powerhouse publishing the | 23 | A. Yeah, it was a dual thing. |
| 24 | Gypsy book? | 24 | Q. Have you exhibited any images from |
| 25 | A. Maybe. I'm not sure. It could be | 25 | the Surfer book in any other -- |

Toll Free: 800.944 .9454
Facsimile: 212.557.5972

|  | 289 |  | 291 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | A. No. | 2 | A. I might have. Yeah, for Surfer I |
| 3 | Q. No museum? | 3 | might have. |
| 4 | A. No. | 4 | Q. And do you know what publications |
| 5 | Q. What about Trench Town Love, have | 5 | you were interviewed in? |
| 6 | any of the images from that book -- | 6 | A. I don't remember. That was quite a |
| 7 | A. Trench Town Love has been exhibited | 7 | bit ago, you know. |
| 8 | in a museum last summer in Paris. | 8 | Q. Have you had the Surfer images |
| 9 | Q. Which museum? | 9 | appraised or valued by anyone? |
| 10 | A. It's called La Villette, and the | 10 | A. No. |
| 11 | exhibition was called Creole Factory. | 11 | Q. Same question for Trench Town Love? |
| 12 | Q. Creole? | 12 | A. No. |
| 13 | A. Creole Factory. | 13 | MS. BART: I have just a few more |
| 14 | Q. And when was the Trench Town - when | 14 | questions, but if you don't mind l'd like |
| 15 | were those exhibited in La Villette? | 15 | to just step outside with Mr. Hayes for |
| 16 | A. Last summer. | 16 | one second and then I think we can wrap |
| 17 | Q. And for how long? | 17 | this up. |
| 18 | A. For two months. | 18 | THE WITNESS: Sure. |
| 19 | Q. Was that a one-person exhibition or | 19 | (Recess taken: 5:41 p.m.) |
| 20 | were you -- | 20 | (Proceedings resumed: 5:46 p.m.) |
| 21 | A. No. | 21 | BY MS. BART: |
| 22 | Q. Let me finish. | 22 | Q. I only have a couple more questions |
| 23 | A. Sorry. | 23 | and we can call it a day, Mr. Cariou, save for |
| 24 | Q. Or were you part of a bigger | 24 | the certified questions. |
| 25 | collection? | 25 | Have you spoken with any of the |
|  | 290 |  | 292 |
| 1 | Cariou | 1 | Cariou |
| 2 | A. It was a group show. It was a huge | 2 | Rastafarians whose images appear in the |
| 3 | group show. | 3 | Yes Rasta photos about the Canal Zone |
| 4 | Q. Was there a particular genre of work | 4 | exhibition? |
| 5 | that was being exhibited as part of that show? | 5 | A. No, I have not. |
| 6 | A. Yeah. It was all based on the fact | 6 | Q. And have you spoken to them about |
| 7 | of being Creole. That was the theme of the | 7 | this lawsuit? |
| 8 | exhibition. So you had photographs from 80 or | 8 | A. No, I have not. |
| 9 | sculpture from - it was all about the islands | 9 | Q. If you are successful on your claims |
| 10 | basically. | 10 | do you intend to share any portion of your |
| 11 | Q. The islands? | 11 | recovery with the Rastafarians whose images |
| 12 | And the Yes Rasta was not part of | 12 | appear in the Yes Rasta book? |
| 13 | that? | 13 | MR. BROOKS: He's not answering that |
| 14 | A. No. | 14 | question. I direct him not to answer. |
| 15 | Q. And the focus on the Creole that is | 15 | CQ MS. BART: Let's certify that |
| 16 | it was focusing on that sort of ethnicity, that | 16 | question as well. |
| 17 | sort of genre? | 17 | I'd also like to have a proffer now |
| 18 | A. Yeah. | 18 | as to why you won't let him answer that |
| 19 | Q. That sort of culture, if you will? | 19 | question? |
| 20 | A. Exactly. | 20 | MR. BROOKS: It's irrelevant. |
| 21 | Q. Have you ever been interviewed for | 21 | MS. BART: I think it's highly |
| 22 | your Trench Town Love works? | 22 | relevant. |
| 23 | A. No, I don't think so. | 23 | MR. BROOKS: You think it is and I |
| 24 | Q. Surfer, were you interviewed as part | 24 | think it's not, that's why. |
| 25 | of Surfer? | 25 | MS. BART: I'm finished with my |

$\square$

|  | 1 |  | 3 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK <br> PATRICK CARIOU, <br> vs. <br> RICHARD PRINCE, GAGOSIAN GALIERY, INC., LAWRENCE GAGOSIAN, and RIZZOLI <br> INTERNATIONAL PUBLICATIONS, INC., $\qquad$ <br> DEPOSITION OF CHRISTIANE CELLE New York, New York Tuesday, January 26, 2010 <br> Reported by: <br> Bryan Nilsen, RPR <br> JOB NO. 307077 | 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 17 18 19 20 21 | APPEARANCES: <br> SCHNADER HARRISON SEGAL \& LEWIS LLP <br> Attorneys for Plaintiff <br> 140 Broadway, Suite 3100 <br> New York, New York 10005-1101 <br> BY: DANIEL J. BROOKS, ESQ. <br> BY: ERIC A. BODEN, ESQ. <br> PHONE: (212)973-8000 <br> EMAIL: dbrooks@schnader.com <br> WITHERS BERGMAN LLP <br> Attorneys for Defendants Gagosian Gallery, Inc., and Lawrence Gagosian 430 Park Avenue, 10th Floor New York, New York 10022-3505 <br> BY: DARA HAMMERMAN, ESQ. <br> PHONE: (212)848-9800 <br> EMAIL: dara.hammerman@withers.us.com |
|  | 2 |  | 4 |
| 1 |  | 1 |  |
| 2 |  | 2 | APPEARANCES (Cont'd.) |
| 3 |  | 3 |  |
| 4 |  | 4 | HANLY CONROY BIERSTEIN SHERIDAN FISHER \& HAYES LLP |
| 5 |  | 5 | Attorneys for Defendant Richard Prince |
| 6 | January 26, 2010 | 6 | 112 Madisor Avenue |
| 7 | 10:00 a.m. | 7 | New York, New York 10016-7416 |
| 8 |  | 8 | BY: STEVEN M. HAYES, ESQ. |
| 9 |  | 9 | PHONE: (212)784-6400 |
| 10 | Deposition of CHRISTIANE CELLE, held | 10 | EMAIL: shayes@hanlyconroy.com |
| 11 | at the offices of Schnader Harrison Segal | 11 |  |
| 12 | \& Lewis, LLP, 140 Broadway, New York, | 12 |  |
| 13 | New York, pursuant to Subpoena, before | 13 |  |
| 14 | Bryan Nilsen, RPR, a Notary Public of | 14 |  |
| 15 | the State of New York. | 15 |  |
| 16 |  | 16 |  |
| 17 |  | 17 |  |
| 18 |  | 18 |  |
| 19 |  | 19 |  |
| 20 |  | 20 |  |
| 21 |  | 21 |  |
| 22 |  | 22 |  |
| 23 |  | 23 |  |
| 24 |  | 24 |  |
| 25 |  | 25 |  |


|  | 5 |  | 7 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  | 1 | Celle |
| 2 |  | 2 | to prepare for today's deposition? |
| 3 |  | 3 | A. I only met Mr. Brooks yesterday. |
| 4 | IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, | 4 | Q. And did you meet with Mr. Brooks |
| 5 | by and among the attorneys for the | 5 | alone or was anyone else there? |
| 6 | respective parties herein, that filing and | 6 | A. Just alone. |
| 7 | sealing be and the same are hereby waived. | 7 | Q. And did you talk to Mr. Brooks about |
| 8 |  | 8 | the deposition? |
| 9 | IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED | 9 | A. We talk about, yes, what, you know, |
| 10 | that all objections, except as to the form | 10 | the deposition will look like and, you know, |
| 11 | of the question, shall be reserved to the | 11 | detail of question you will ask me, and if I |
| 12 | time of the trial. | 12 | don't understand to ask again and, you know, |
| 13 |  | 13 | like that. |
| 14 | IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED | 14 | Q. How long was the meeting? |
| 15 | that the within deposition may be sworn to | 15 | A. About one hour, yesterday. |
| 16 | and signed before any officer authorized | 16 | Q. And just so l'm clear, was anyone |
| 17 | to administer an oath, with the same force | 17 | else present? |
| 18 | and effect as if signed and sworn to | 18 | A. No. |
| 19 | before the Court. | 19 | Q. And did you look at any documents? |
| 20 |  | 20 | A. I only look at my -- like my e-mail |
| 21 |  | 21 | document. |
| 22 |  | 22 | Q. E-mail. You looked at an e-mail or |
| 23 |  | 23 | multiple e-mails? |
| 24 |  | 24 | A. There was a few pages. |
| 25 |  | 25 | Q. I see. |
|  | 6 |  | 8 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | CHRISTIANE CELLE, called as a | 2 | A. Like three pages. |
| 3 | witness, having been duly sworn by a | 3 | Q. Okay. And can you tell me as best |
| 4 | Notary Public, was examined and testified | 4 | you can recall what you said to Mr. Brooks and |
| 5 | as follows: | 5 | what he said to you during that meeting? |
| 6 | THE COURT REPORTER: Please state | 6 | MR. BROOKS: Objection. I'm |
| 7 | your name and address for the record. | 7 | representing her. |
| 8 | THE WITNESS: Christiane Celle, | 8 | MR. HAYES: Oh, you're asserting a |
| 9 | 129 Lafayette Street, New York, New York | 9 | privilege. I didn't know that. |
| 10 | 10013. | 10 | MR. BROOKS: That's okay. |
| 11 | EXAMINATION BY | 11 | BY MR. HAYES: |
| 12 | MR. HAYES: | 12 | Q. I'd like to ask you, if you could, |
| 13 | Q. Ms. Celle, my name is Steve Hayes. | 13 | could you tell me briefly your educational |
| 14 | I represent Richard Prince in this case. I'm | 14 | background? |
| 15 | going to be asking you some questions today. | 15 | Did you attend college after -- |
| 16 | And Dara Hammerman, representing the | 16 | did you attend school after high school? |
| 17 | Gagosian defendants, may also ask you questions. | 17 | A. No, I graduate and I start traveling |
| 18 | If I ask you a question at any time | 18 | the world. That's what I did. |
| 19 | you don't understand, please tell me and I'll | 19 | Q. And you currently own an art |
| 20 | rephrase it, okay? | 20 | gallery, correct? |
| 21 | A. Okay. | 21 | A. Yes. |
| 22 | Q. If you don't hear it, please tell me | 22 | Q. How long have you had the art |
| 23 | and I'll rephrase it as well. | 23 | gallery? |
| 24 | A. Thank you. | 24 | A. I opened the gallery last -- in |
| 25 | Q. First, what did you do, if anything, | 25 | 2008, in April. April 2008. |


|  | 9 | 11 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | Q. And l'd like to get a brief | 2 | New York. |
| 3 | description -- not to take too much time -- of | 3 | Q. New York, you said in the State of |
| 4 | your work history after you graduated school and | 4 | what? |
| 5 | before you started the gallery. | 5 | A. Albany is where I registered my |
| 6 | A. Right. So I graduated school in | 6 | company. Albany, New York. |
| 7 | late '78 I believe, yeah. I travel. I grew up | 7 | Q. Oh, it was registered in the |
| 8 | in the South of France, so I travel -- I lived | 8 | State of New York, but you registered in Albany? |
| 9 | in Paris. I lived in Washington D.C. I lived | 9 | A. Yes. |
| 10 | in New York. | 10 | Q. Going back for a moment to 1989, I |
| 11 | 1 always work in retail basically. | 11 | think you said you developed a retail concept |
| 12 | And I moved to New York definitely in 1984. I | 12 | for a store or a company in Paris? |
| 13 | was a fashion stylist from '84 to '89, so I work | 13 | A. Yes. |
| 14 | with a lot of photographer in fashion. | 14 | Q. What was that? |
| 15 | And then in ' 891 moved back to | 15 | A. The company was called Charles |
| 16 | Paris, developed a retail concept for a company | 16 | Chevignon. They were a really big company in |
| 17 | in France. | 17 | France doing men's clothing, women's and |
| 18 | And in 1992 I moved to St. Barths to | 18 | children. And I developed for them the whole |
| 19 | open my first retail store called Calypso. And | 19 | concept, and it was called Chevignon Trading |
| 20 | when I met my husband in '93 and having my first | 20 | Post. |
| 21 | child in '94 I moved back definitely in New York | 21 | Q. And Chevignon Trading Post, was that |
| 22 | in '95 where I developed my retail company that | 22 | a line of clothing? |
| 23 | I sold in 2007. | 23 | A. It was -- no, it was based on the |
| 24 | Q. Okay. The company Calypso, what | 24 | home, interior design, fumiture. I developed |
| 25 | business was that in? | 25 | a license with a company called Fremaux Delorme, |
|  | 10 |  | 12 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | A. It was a fashion company. | 2 | F-R-E-M-A-U-X, D-E-L-O-R-M-E. |
| 3 | Women fashion and children. | 3 | Q. And then I think you said you |
| 4 | Q. And did you develop your own fashion | 4 | started up in the fashion business in New York |
| 5 | lines? | 5 | in 1996, is that correct? |
| 6 | A. Yes, I did. | 6 | A. I started being a fashion stylist -- |
| 7 | Q. Was that a retail store or was it a | 7 | I move in New York in '84, worked two years for |
| 8 | manufacturing business or both? | 8 | a jewelry company called Reminiscence, and in |
| 9 | A. It was both actually. | 9 | '86 I started to be a fashion stylist until '89. |
| 10 | Q. Were you the designer of the line? | 10 | Q. Until ' 89 when you went to Paris? |
| 11 | A. I had a designer. I was just not a | 11 | A. When I moved back to France, yeah. |
| 12 | designer. | 12 | Q. And then you went from France to |
| 13 | Q. And you told me I think that that | 13 | St. Barths? |
| 14 | business was started in St. Barths? | 14 | A. Yes, correct. |
| 15 | A. Yes. | 15 | Q. And St. Barths to the United States? |
| 16 | Q. And that was in 1992? | 16 | A. Correct. |
| 17 | A. 1992. | 17 | Q. And you came back to the |
| 18 | Q. And did you have a location -- so | 18 | United States in ninety -- |
| 19 | you had your entire operation was in St. Barths, | 19 | A. '95 back and forth, but full-time in |
| 20 | that is to say the design and the store? | 20 | '96. |
| 21 | A. No. The first store was opened in | 21 | Q. And sometime in '96 or after you |
| 22 | St. Barths in '92. And when I moved to New York | 22 | started in the fashion business in New York or |
| 23 | I reopen a New York company I believe in '96 in | 23 | restarted? |
| 24 | the State of Albany. And that's where I started | 24 | A. Sorry. Immediately I signed a lease |
| 25 | my business. So everything was located in | 25 | I think in '96 in New York. I opened a shop in |


|  | 13 |  | 15 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | the Hamptons, so. | 2 | A. Just related to art, and more than |
| 3 | Q. Is that also called Calypso? | 3 | art, especially photography, mainly photography. |
| 4 | A. It was called Calypso, yeah. | 4 | Q. Was there a particular reason why |
| 5 | Q. Did that sell the same type of | 5 | you decided to start that business with an |
| 6 | clothing you sold in St. Barths? | 6 | emphasis on photography? |
| 7 | A. Same type of things, yeah. | 7 | A. My passion was always photography. |
| 8 | Q. And did you design that clothing or | 8 | I collect photography books. So l've been for |
| 9 | was it designed by somebody else? | 9 | many years amassing a lot of books. |
| 10 | A. At the time, I was not designing. | 10 | And because I left Calypso I had a |
| 11 | I started design in '97 I believe. | 11 | clause of noncompetition for a few years, sol |
| 12 | Q. And did you design the clothes or | 12 | knew I would not do fashion. And my second, you |
| 13 | did you have someone else design them? | 13 | know, love was photography, and I'm married to a |
| 14 | A. At the beginning I did design them | 14 | photographer too, so. |
| 15 | with a young assistant. | 15 | Q. You're married to a photographer, |
| 16 | Q. Did you subsequently hire a | 16 | what's his name? |
| 17 | designer, a lead designer? | 17 | A. Antoine Verglas. |
| 18 | A. Sorry? | 18 | Q. Could you spell it? |
| 19 | Q. Did you subsequently hire a designer | 19 | A. A-N-T-O-I-N-E, V-E-R-G-L-A-S. |
| 20 | to design clothes for you? | 20 | Q. And is he a commercial photographer |
| 21 | A. Yes, I did. | 21 | or fine art photographer or both? |
| 22 | Q. Who was that? | 22 | A. Commercial. |
| 23 | A. At the time it was Joelle Klein. | 23 | Q. So prior to the opening of the |
| 24 | Q. Is Mr. Klein here in New York, do | 24 | photography and art bookstore in October of '08 |
| 25 | you know? | 25 | you had no involvement in the art business |
|  | 14 |  | 16 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | A. It's a lady. Joelle, she's still in | 2 | before, correct? |
| 3 | New York. | 3 | A. What happened is immediately when I |
| 4 | Q. And then you had the business until | 4 | left Calypso in April 2008, you know, I started |
| 5 | 2007? | 5 | getting really active. I signed a lease for a |
| 6 | A. In 2007 I sold 51 percent of the | 6 | space I believe in May, and I already started |
| 7 | company. And I sold back the rest in -- sorry, | 7 | contacting different artists. |
| 8 | I have to remember -- in June 2009. | 8 | The bookstore was my first step, but |
| 9 | Q. There came a time when you went into | 9 | my main thing was the gallery. |
| 10 | art business -- | 10 | I also signed a lease for a gallery |
| 11 | MR. BROOKS: 2009 or 2008? | 11 | at 255 Centre in the same time period. I think |
| 12 | A. No, officially June 2009. | 12 | I signed a lease for 255 Centre where the |
| 13 | The rest of the stake of the | 13 | gallery will be probably May or June, I can't |
| 14 | company. | 14 | recall exactly. |
| 15 | Q. And there came a time when you | 15 | Q. May or June of 2008? |
| 16 | started involvement in the art business in | 16 | A. Yes. |
| 17 | New York? | 17 | Q. And did you subsequently open a |
| 18 | A. Okay. The first -- I resigned from | 18 | gallery at 255 Centre? |
| 19 | Calypso in April 2008. And I opened the first | 19 | A. I did. |
| 20 | really business connected to the art business in | 20 | Q. Do you still have the bookstore at |
| 21 | October 2008, and it was an art bookstore. | 21 | 189 Lafayette? |
| 22 | Q. Where was that located? | 22 | A. Yes, Ido. |
| 23 | A. 189 Lafayette Street. | 23 | Q. So you have two locations at the |
| 24 | Q. And it soid books just relating to | 24 | present time? |
| 25 | art? | 25 | A. Actually I have another, a third one |


| 17 |  | 19 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | at 424 Broome Street. | 2 | A. My husband is partner. |
| 3 | Q. The location at 189 Lafayette, is | 3 | Q. In all three? |
| 4 | that still a bookstore? | 4 | A. Yes. |
| 5 | A. Yes, bookstore with photography book | 5 | Q. And it's basically 50/50? |
| 6 | only. | 6 | A. Exactly, yeah. |
| 7 | Q. Do you exhibit artists there at all? | 7 | Q. Day to day who runs the art |
| 8 | A. No. | 8 | galleries, you or you and your husband? |
| 9 | Q. The space at 255 Centre, that is a | 9 | A. Only me. |
| 10 | gallery space? | 10 | Q. And the 424 Broome space, that show |
| 11 | A. Gallery space, yeah. | 11 | is only photography? |
| 12 | Q. And what type of work do you exhibit | 12 | A. It's only photography, yes, correct. |
| 13 | there? | 13 | Q. And you've had that space open for |
| 14 | A. At the 424 space l do a lot of | 14 | how long? |
| 15 | event, book signing. Right now I have actually | 15 | A. That one I open in April 2009. |
| 16 | a show that's drawing-painting, it's mixed | 16 | Q. And do you presently have a show |
| 17 | media, when 424 is photography only. | 17 | there? |
| 18 | Q. 424 Broome is photography only? | 18 | A. Yes. |
| 19 | A. Only, yes. | 19 | Q. Who is showing? |
| 20 | Q. The space at 255 Centre, is there a | 20 | A. Right now I have it's called |
| 21 | drawing-painting show there now? | 21 | Bande-A-Part, B-A-N-D-E-A-P-A-R-T. |
| 22 | A. Right now, yeah, mixed media. | 22 | Q. And can you give me an English |
| 23 | Q. And who are the artists? | 23 | translation of that? |
| 24 | A. Jody, J-O-D-Y, Morlock, | 24 | A. Yes. I mean actually it's a French |
| 25 | M-O-R-L-O-C-K. | 25 | word that really doesn't translate too much. |
|  | 18 |  | 20 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | Q. And what type of work does | 2 | It's all the bands from the '60s, '70s, and |
| 3 | Ms. Morlock do? | 3 | '80s. It's underground music. |
| 4 | A. Ms. Morlock does, first of all, | 4 | And the show actually the title |
| 5 | photography, and then she does a little painting | 5 | Bande-A-Part came because there is a book to, |
| 6 | or tattoos on top of them. Then she does a lot | 6 | you know, to assist the show. Because what l'm |
| 7 | of oil paintings. She does sculpture and she | 7 | trying to do is have, you know, book signing and |
| 8 | does drawings. | 8 | shows together. |
| 9 | Q. So the photo-based work is a photo | 9 | Q. And the photographers who are |
| 0 | upon which she in turn paints or makes some | 10 | showing in this show, they're one photographer |
| 11 | other marks of some kind? | 11 | or more than one? |
| 12 | A. It looks like, yeah, like tattoos on | 12 | A. There are nine photographers. |
| 13 | paintings. | 13 | Q. Nine photographers? |
| 14 | Q. And do you know the process, does | 14 | A. Yes. |
| 15 | she use oil paint or what does she do to affix | 15 | MR. BROOKS: You're talking about |
| 16 | those tattoos to the photographs? | 16 | the current show? |
| 17 | A. On those photos in particular, there | 17 | MR. HAYES: The current show, yes. |
| 18 | are only two in the show, I'm not sure what she | 18 | BY MR. HAYES: |
| 19 | used. | 19 | Q. And the subject matter of the |
| 20 | Q. And do you know the source of the | 20 | current show is a single band photographed or |
| 21 | photographs? | 21 | multiple bands photographed? |
| 22 | A. No, I don't. | 22 | A. Multiple bands, New York |
| 23 | Q. These three spaces, so-called | 23 | underground. |
| 24 | gallery spaces, if that's okay, do you own them | 24 | Q. From the '60s -- |
| 25 | entirely yourself or do you have partners? | 25 | A. $60 \mathrm{~s}, 70 \mathrm{~s}, 80 \mathrm{~s}$, yes. |


|  | 21 |  | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | Q. The space at 424 Broome, you've told | 2 | hearing this correctly, the name of the show is |
| 3 | us that it's only a photography space, does it | 3 | Samburu? |
| 4 | specialize in any particular type of photography | 4 | A. The Samburu, yeah. |
| 5 | or has it been giving shows of different types | 5 | Q. What does that mean? |
| 6 | of photography? | 6 | A. It's the warrior in North Kenya. |
| 7 | A. So far I have been doing different | 7 | When you go to Kenya -- l've been a few years |
| 8 | type of photography. It's true that when the | 8 | ago, in the north there is a tribe that are not |
| 9 | gallery started I had something really in mind | 9 | the Masai, and they're called Samburu. So |
| 10 | which was more travel-oriented photography. But | 10 | they're warriors. So it's a show about the |
| 11 | things evolved. | 11 | civilization. |
| 12 | Q. Evolved into being more general? | 12 | Q. So it's about the warriors in |
| 13 | A. It think evolved because sometimes a | 13 | North Kenya? |
| 14 | show you want doesn't happen or, you know, you | 14 | A. Yes. |
| 15 | have to kind of tweak it around, and you have | 15 | Q. And that show lasted for how long? |
| 16 | once a great opportunity that not necessarily | 16 | A. That show I believe six weeks. |
| 17 | are what you were expecting but such a great | 17 | I don't really remember, but I guess six weeks. |
| 18 | opportunity that you have to do the show. | 18 | Q. I'm just looking for approximations. |
| 19 | Q. At the present time do you have both | 19 | A. Yeah. |
| 20 | male and female photographers? | 20 | Q. And if you can recall, what shows |
| 21 | A. That's interesting. Yes, I do. | 21 | did you have after that? |
| 22 | Q. And do you have any other point of | 22 | A. After that I had the surf show. |
| 23 | emphasis for the gallery, if travel is not the | 23 | Q. And the surf show is surfing-related |
| 24 | point of emphasis at the moment, do you have any | 24 | photography? |
| 25 | other point of emphasis in terms of what the | 25 | A. Yes. It was a group show actually. |
|  | 22 |  | 24 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | gallery shows or doesn't show? | 2 | Q. And who was in the group show, if |
| 3 | A. So far, besides the rock-and-roll | 3 | you recall? |
| 4 | show that I have right now, most of the | 4 | A. In the group show I had Tony, |
| 5 | photographers exhibit in connection with the | 5 | T-O-N-Y, Caramanico, C-A-R-A-M-A-N-I-C-O. |
| 6 | traveling. | 6 | I had Jean-Philippe Piter, |
| 7 | Q. So you opened the space in April | 7 | P-I-T-E-R. |
| 8 | of '09, correct? | 8 | Q. Jean-Philippe Piter? |
| 9 | A. Yes. | 9 | A. Yes. |
| 10 | Q. And since that time to the present | 10 | Q. Okay? |
| 11 | how many shows have you had? | 11 | A. I had Jean-Philippe Piter, Tony |
| 12 | A. April -- sorry, I don't remember by | 12 | Caramanico. I had Antoine Verglas, my husband, |
| 13 | heart. | 13 | because he does kind of underwater photography. |
| 14 | Q. Take your time. | 14 | A-N-T-O-I-N-E, V-E-R-G-L-A-S. |
| 15 | A. In the 424 or in the whole -- | 15 | Then I had a gentleman called |
| 16 | Q. Well, let's start with 424. | 16 | Burton, B-U-R-T-O-N, Machen, M-A-C-H-E-N. He |
| 17 | A. Okay. So my first one was the | 17 | does sky and beach and everything. |
| 18 | Samburu. Samburu is photography from North | 18 | I'm missing somebody -- oh, yes, |
| 19 | Kenya, so that was the first one, S-A-M-B-U-R-U. | 19 | I have one more from Hawaii, Wayne Lewin, |
| 20 | And you want the name of the | 20 | W-A-Y-N-E, and Lewin is L-E-W-I-N. |
| 21 | photographer too? | 21 | I'm sure I forgot a few of them. |
| 22 | Q. Please. | 22 | Q. And how long did the surf show last |
| 23 | A. Lyle Owerko, L-Y-L-E, O-W-E-R-K-O. | 23 | approximately? |
| 24 | That was my first show. | 24 | A. I think it last a long time, all |
| 25 | Q. By the way, pardon me for not | 25 | summer, like mid May, June, July. |


|  | 25 |  | 27 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | Q. That would take us then into the | 2 | And those collages were in turn |
| 3 | summer of '09? | 3 | photographed and exhibited? |
| 4 | A. Yes. | 4 | A. Yes, definitely. |
| 5 | Q. And since the summer of '09 to the | 5 | Q. And then in addition to the --I |
| 6 | present before the current show have you had any | 6 | apologize for the mispronunciation -- Fournier? |
| 7 | other shows? | 7 | A. Vincent Fournier. |
| 8 | A. Can you repeat the question? | 8 | Q. Vincent Fournier. |
| 9 | Q. Sure. Between the ending of the | 9 | Were there any other shows before |
| 10 | surf show and your current show at 424 Broome | 10 | the present show? |
| 11 | have you had any other shows? | 11 | A. Yes, there was. |
| 12 | A. Yes, I did. | 12 | At that location only you mean? |
| 13 | Q. What shows were there? | 13 | Q. At the moment just that location, |
| 14 | A. I had Vincent Fournier, | 14 | yes. |
| 15 | V-I-N-C-E-N-T, F-O-U-R-N-I-E-R. | 15 | A. Yes. |
| 16 | Q. And that was a solo show? | 16 | Q. Just to kind of keep it organized. |
| 17 | A. It's a solo show. And it's about | 17 | A. Bande-A-Part, the one right now, it |
| 18 | all places around the world where astronaut | 18 | was Bande-A-Part. And I'm trying not to forget |
| 19 | trains. | 19 | anybody, which I might. |
| 20 | Q. So photographs that were American | 20 | With all the location, you know, |
| 21 | astronauts trained, Russian astronauts trained? | 21 | because I have a location in the Hamptons and |
| 22 | A. Actually, yeah, Russia astronaut, | 22 | St. Barths, so it's -- they might have another |
| 23 | French, yeah, all around the world, China. | 23 | one. I might remember, if you don't mind, |
| 24 | Q. Black and white or color? | 24 | later. I might forget somebody. |
| 25 | A. Color. | 25 | Q. So as of the moment would it be |
|  | 26 |  | 28 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | Q. The surf show, was that surfers from | 2 | fair to say that that gallery is a general |
| 3 | around the world? | 3 | photography gallery? |
| 4 | A. There was a collage, a surfer | 4 | A. Yes. |
| 5 | from Montauk, photograph from Hawaii, from | 5 | Q. Then I will turn now to the 255 |
| 6 | St. Barths, and from California, but always like | 6 | Centre Street space. That is also a gallery? |
| 7 | surf and beach related. We call it Sea, Surf | 7 | A. It's a gallery. |
| 8 | and Sun. That was the title actually. | 8 | Q. And that opened in '08? |
| 9 | Q. Sea, Surf and Sun? | 9 | A. It opened in '09. |
| 10 | A. Yes. | 10 | Q. Sorry. |
| 11 | Q. And when you say collage, you mean | 11 | . And when in '09 did it open? |
| 12 | different photographs of different places? | 12 | A. It opened June '09. |
| 13 | A. Yeah. One of the artists had | 13 | Q. And since June '09 can you just tell |
| 14 | traveled for 20 years, and during his travel he | 14 | me how many exhibitions have you had there? |
| 15 | had made some journal, like this journal -- | 15 | A. Well, a lot. We had a lot of |
| 16 | MR. BROOKS: Journal. | 16 | different things. The first one was painting, |
| 17 | A. -- journals, yeah, a collage of | 17 | photography. You need the name of the painter? |
| 18 | different photographs and writing. And the show | 18 | Q. Please. |
| 19 | was actually a photograph of the surf journals. | 19 | A. Jeannie, J-E-A-N-N-I-E, Weissglass, |
| 20 | Q. So his journals were collage | 20 | W-E-I-S-S, and glass, G-L-A-S-S. That was my |
| 21 | journals? | 21 | really first show there. |
| 22 | A. Yes. | 22 | Then there was -- so many things. |
| 23 | Q. Consisting of writing and pictures? | 23 | There was a lot of actually book signing and |
| 24 | A. A lot of everything. | 24 | shows. We had Christoff Hoenenberg book |
| 25 | Q. A lot of everything. | 25 | signing. I have to spell it for you maybe, |



|  | 33 |  | 35 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | I keep contact. | 2 | Q. Did you sell them? |
| 3 | Q. Where? | 3 | A. Yes. |
| 4 | A. Rio. | 4 | Q. All of them? |
| 5 | Q. Okay. And so you had heard about | 5 | A. Frequently, yes, I sold them. And |
| 6 | Mr. Cariou? | 6 | actually what's interesting is Powerhouse didn't |
| 7 | A. Yes. | 7 | have any more, so I went online and I bought a |
| 8 | Q. And what happened next in terms of | 8 | few online also. |
| 9 | your having any contact with him? | 9 | Q. Do you know how many copies of |
| 10 | A. I mean I heard when the book was -- | 10 | Yes Rasta you sold out of your store? |
| 11 | I bought the book. When I open the bookstore, | 11 | A. Probably in all combined, in all my |
| 12 | you know, I had in mind to carry a lot of books, | 12 | store, I won't tell you exactly, no. But I know |
| 13 | new books and out-of-print books. I bought | 13 | it's selling, you know, basically in different |
| 14 | right away Surfer actually. I find a copy | 14 | store. |
| 15 | somewhere online that was signed actually. | 15 | Q. Is it more than a dozen, less than a |
| 16 | And, you know, I find out about all | 16 | dozen? |
| 17 | the other books that he did. So I find out | 17 | A. More than a dozen. |
| 18 | about Yes Rasta. | 18 | Q. More than a hundred? |
| 19 | I was trying to get a book called | 19 | A. Less than a hundred. |
| 20 | Trench Town Love, but I don't think I could find | 20 | Q. And have you sold copies of the |
| 21 | that one. Or sometime the price was really | 21 | Surfer book or any other books by him in the |
| 22 | high. That's how I really, you know, get to | 22 | bookstore? |
| 23 | know more his work. But I never met him. | 23 | A. Only a few because they are hard to |
| 24 | Q. So you found out about him you said | 24 | find and they are very expensive. |
| 25 | about his work, is that by going online? | 25 | Q. You had to buy them online? |
|  | 34 |  | 36 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | A. When I wanted to open the bookstore | 2 | A. Online because they're already from |
| 3 | I started researching a lot of photographer | 3 | 170 to 300 dollars, so I can't really mark up on |
| 4 | books, you know, editor. And I mean I had | 4 | those books. |
| 5 | Surfer at home, I didn't have the Yes Rasta. | 5 | Q. By the way, do you have any records |
| 6 | But when I start looking at, you | 6 | as to how many copies of Yes Rasta you sold? |
| 7 | know, what kind of book he did, I came up upon | 7 | A. We have that because we keep |
| 8 | Rasta. And as I see Trench Town on the website, | 8 | bookkeeping of all the sales. |
| 9 | he had a black website with there was a lot of | 9 | Q. So if I was to leave a space in the |
| 10 | documentation about all the work he did. | 10 | deposition could you just insert the number for |
| 11 | Q. So you went to Mr. Cariou's website? | 11 | me? |
| 12 | A. Yes. | 12 | A. Yes, of course. |
| 13 | Q. And is that where you found out | 13 | Q. Thank you. I appreciate that. |
| 14 | about Yes Rasta? | 14 | TO BE FURNISHED: |
| 15 | A. Yes. It's even where I found out | 15 |  |
| 16 | his address or e-mail address I think, because I | 16 | Q. By the way, you've been selling |
| 17 | wanted to contact him. | 17 | the books by Mr. Cariou out of the space on |
| 18 | Q. And when you first opened the | 18 | Lafayette Street, also out of ariy other space? |
| 19 | bookshop you carried one or more copies of the | 19 | A. Lafayette, St. Barths, because I |
| 20 | Surfer book? | 20 | have a space in St. Barths, and also East |
| 21 | A. Yes. I had two copies and then I | 21 | Hampton. That's the three space basically. |
| 22 | contacted Powerhouse, the company who made the | 22 | Q. So you actually have three |
| 23 | book, to get some Yes Rasta, and I got a few. | 23 | galleries - you have the gallery in New York? |
| 24 | Q. And you offered them for sale? | 24 | A. Yes. |
| 25 | A. Yes. | 25 | Q. You have a gallery in St. Barths? |


|  | 37 |  | 39 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | A. Yes. | 2 | work. |
| 3 | Q. And a gallery in East Hampton? | 3 | And I was in the Hamptons, I |
| 4 | A. Yeah, the gallery is small in | 4 | remember, you know, I was preparing my gallery. |
| 5 | East Hampton, very small. | 5 | And I had in mind to open the gallery. I had |
| 6 | Q. And the one in East Hampton, what | 6 | signed a lease, but I knew I could not open a |
| 7 | kind of work does that show? | 7 | gallery in three months. It was a long project. |
| 8 | A. It's mainly a bookstore because it's | 8 | So I was planning for spring 2009. |
| 9 | very tiny. And work, last year we had mainly | 9 | And I looked at his e-mail contact |
| 10 | surfing-oriented work. | 10 | or his website and I sent him an e-mail, you |
| 11 | Q. What's the address in East Hampton? | 11 | know, asking if he would be interested to do a |
| 12 | A. It's 23 Newtown Lane. | 12 | show with me. |
| 13 | Q. And how long have you had that | 13 | Q. And did he respond to that? |
| 14 | store? | 14 | A. He did respond to that, yeah. Yeah. |
| 15 | A. I open it - I don't know the dates | 15 | Q. And subsequent to that e-mail, you |
| 16 | exactly. Last year 2009 was my first season, so | 16 | e-mailed him and he e-mailed back, did you have |
| 17 | I probably opened April. | 17 | further contacts with Mr. Cariou about a show or |
| 18 | Q. And the store in St. Barths, the | 18 | in general? |
| 19 | gallery in St. Barths, what does that show? | 19 | A. Later on, yes. Once he answer me |
| 20 | A. That one opened in November 2008. | 20 | that, yes, we have to talk, or I can't remember |
| 21 | And my first show was Andy Warhol, show of Andy | 21 | what he answer me, but, you know, he wanted to |
| 22 | Warhol Polaroid, and also surfer show, same | 22 | engage the conversation. |
| 23 | artist Tony Caramanico, the collage. | 23 | Then I remember him coming to |
| 24 | Q. And the Andy Warhol you were selling | 24 | New York after that. We had drink or lunch at |
| 25 | the Polaroids? | 25 | Cafe Select. He came - I can't recall if it's |
|  | 38 |  | 40 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | A. Yes. | 2 | September or October, but he came in New York. |
| 3 | Q. And did you obtain them from the | 3 | Q. September or October of 2008? |
| 4 | Andy Warhol Foundation or from where? | 4 | A. 2008. He came to see me, and we |
| 5 | A. Yes, it was done with a gentleman | 5 | went to Cafe Select. It's a little cafe close |
| 6 | called Tim Hunt from the foundation, and Fergus | 6 | to Broome Street. We had lunch. |
| 7 | McCaffrey -- I might have to spell that for you, | 7 | And, you know, I explained to him |
| 8 | F-E-R-G-U-S, McCaffrey, C-A-F-F-R-E-Y. | 8 | that I was interested to do a show and I had two |
| 9 | And this was a partnership with | 9 | things in mind. I had the Rasta for New York |
| 10 | that person. And we got everything from the | 10 | City for probably spring. And I was also |
| 11 | foundation. And the person in charge was | 11 | interested in his Surfer photographs for |
| 12 | Tim Hunt. He's the director. | 12 | St. Barths or East Hampton. I was not really |
| 13 | Q. Going back to the chronology of your | 13 | sure. |
| 14 | contact with Mr. Cariou. | 14 | Q. And what did Mr. Cariou say to you |
| 15 | A. Yeah. | 15 | at lunch about that idea or those ideas? |
| 16 | Q. So what I understand is that first | 16 | A. He was very interested. He told me |
| 17 | you were aware of his Surfer book and you bought | 17 | that he had a show before at Marion de Beaupre |
| 18 | one copy? | 18 | in France -- Marion de Beaupre, it's |
| 19 | A. Yes. | 19 | B-E-A-U-P-R-E -- and he'd be interested. |
| 20 | Q. And then you subsequently bought | 20 | I asked him where the prints are of |
| 21 | perhaps another copy for your bookstore? | 21 | his photographs, because I always ask that first |
| 22 | A. I had one copy for years that | 22 | question to know if people are organized. |
| 23 | belonged to me personally. And when I was | 23 | He told me everything was in |
| 24 | looking for photographer books and what to do | 24 | New York because he had lived in New York for |
| 25 | I came upon his work and I discovered the Rasta | 25 | the past 12 years and he had his own printer in |


|  | 41 |  | 43 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | New York and the prints were in New York. | 2 | Rasta in the portrait of people. |
| 3 | So I told him that I was seriously | 3 | And then I remember there was some |
| 4 | interested. We had a conversation. He was | 4 | landscape, but there was a lot of marijuana |
| 5 | there actually a few days. We talk about | 5 | everywhere, so I remember I have two teenagers |
| 6 | photography. He told me that he had been | 6 | so I was like maybe I have to be easy on that. |
| 7 | collecting books about photography for years. | 7 | But, you know, I really like the |
| 8 | We talked about his favorite | 8 | project and, you know, I show him a few things |
| 9 | photographer, that it was Mary Ellen Mark, a | 9 | that I like in the book. But nothing was like |
| 10 | wonderful woman. And he was here for a short | 10 | settled and we didn't choose the photo that day, |
| 11 | time, but he said, well, if you go to Paris call | 11 | you know. |
| 12 | me, you know. | 12 | Q. And you also looked at the Surfer |
| 13 | So later on I went to Paris | 13 | book at the same time? |
| 14 | actually, not for him, for personal reason. And | 14 | A. We did. |
| 15 | we also had another -- I call him again, I say | 15 | Q. And did you talk about putting |
| 16 | I'm very interested, I'd love to do the show. | 16 | certain of the Surfer prints in the show? |
| 17 | So we also had coffee in the morning | 17 | A. Yes, the Surfer actually I ask him |
| 18 | at Cafe del Esplanade. | 18 | and he told me that will be easy because he had |
| 19 | Q. This is in Paris? | 19 | some copies also in New York. I was trying to |
| 20 | A. Yes. That's where I live in Paris. | 20 | see when can I get them but, you know, he was -- |
| 21 | Q. Do you recall when that was? | 21 | what I remember also is at the time - I think |
| 22 | A. I knew it was for sure after | 22 | the reason also he was in New York, he was |
| 23 | September-October. I don't -- I mean if you | 23 | preoccupied because he had done a project about |
| 24 | need to know I can look maybe in my agenda. | 24 | gypsy work and he was trying to find somebody to |
| 25 | But it was shortly after his visit, | 25 | help him to edit the gypsy work to turn it into |
|  | 42 |  | 44 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | I had to do a trip in France, so I took | 2 | a book. |
| 3 | advantage to meet him. And we talk again, and I | 3 | Q. Prior to the time you had your |
| 4 | was trying to pressure him to have an agreement | 4 | first contact with Mr. Cariou had you seen the |
| 5 | and say yes, because I was really planning for a | 5 | Yes Rasta book? |
| 6 | show in April probably, my opening of the | 6 | A. I've seen the Rasta book, yes. |
| 7 | gallery, because with construction I knew it | 7 | Q. Before then? |
| 8 | would take at least six months. | 8 | A. Before that, yeah. |
| 9 | So I would have loved to have maybe | 9 | Q. So is there anything else at the |
| 10 | a commitment or something. | 10 | lunch conversation that you haven't told us |
| 11 | Q. So go back for a moment to the lunch | 11 | about that you and Mr. Cariou discussed? |
| 12 | meeting, was there a discussion there about any | 12 | A. No. Basically I was, you know, the |
| 13 | financial terms? | 13 | gallery trying to, you know, pursue the artist |
| 14 | A. Oh, yes. Yes. | 14 | to do a show. And he was interested. He wanted |
| 15 | Q. What was that discussion? | 15 | to do a show. So it was a matter of, you know, |
| 16 | A. The discussion was I was telling him | 16 | when I will be ready, when he will be ready. |
| 17 | usually the photographer give me all the prints, | 17 | And, you know, he was interested. |
| 18 | I don't pay for the prints, that's their | 18 | Q. Did you discuss with him doing a |
| 19 | responsibility, but I do all the framing, and | 19 | solo show or a group show, or how did that -- |
| 20 | then we split 50 percent each. | 20 | A. It was a solo show. And we were |
| 21 | Q. Did you discuss what photographs | 21 | planning April or May if the gallery will be |
| 22 | would be in the show? | 22 | ready. |
| 23 | A. We had a copy of the book. I had a | 23 | Q. Of 2009? |
| 24 | copy of both books actually. We went through | 24 | A. 2009. |
| 25 | some of them. I was very interested in for the | 125 | Q. And did you discuss how long the |


|  | 45 |  | 47 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | show would last? | 2 | A. He was supposed to come before |
| 3 | A. I don't remember if we discussed | 3 | Christmas because I was telling him that the |
| 4 | that. But usually it's a month or six weeks | 4 | time was running, and after Christmas I felt |
| 5 | that I know. | 5 | like, wow, Christmas, you know, everybody - |
| 6 | Q. And the proposal to make it a solo | 6 | nobody don't do anything. |
| 7 | show, was that your proposal or his? | 7 | So I wanted to pressure him to try |
| 8 | A. It was my proposal. | 8 | to come before the end of the year so to give me |
| 9 | Q. And why did you propose that? | 9 | really the material and we could pick together |
| 10 | A. Because I thought the material was | 10 | the show. |
| 11 | very strong in the book. I thought about also | 11 | Because I didn't know if he had |
| 12 | the timing, you know, like this is a subject | 12 | everything printed, we might have to print extra |
| 13 | that you think about people going out, and it's | 13 | thing, and then you need the framing. So, you |
| 14 | not a winter show, it's like surfing. It's a | 14 | know, it's time consuming. |
| 15 | summer show. | 15 | You know, I wanted him to commit. |
| 16 | And I usually do solo show most of | 16 | And he told me that he will probably come back |
| 17 | the time. And because, as I said, I really | 17 | in November. |
| 18 | loved the material in the book, Ithought, you | 18 | Q. Come back in November of '08? |
| 19 | know, it was worthy. And also because of the | 19 | A. Of 2008. November-December he will |
| 20 | subject, I knew I had a lot of people in the | 20 | come back. |
| 21 | entertainment business that will be very | 21 | Q. And did he come back in November |
| 22 | attracted to that. | 22 | of 2008? |
| 23 | Q. And the Surfer photographs you | 23 | A. No. |
| 24 | talked about doing, were they portrait-type | 24 | Q. When did he next come back or when |
| 25 | photographs as well? | 25 | did you next have contact with him? |
|  | 46 |  | 48 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | A. Yes, portrait of surfers. I mean | 2 | A. I saw Patrick actually recently |
| 3 | beautiful image of like some of them -- one is | 3 | I think because he came to do his deposition |
| 4 | Joel Trudeau, as a young surfer, who is now like | 4 | he told me. |
| 5 | in his 30s, but he had photographed him in | 5 | Q. From the time that you had this |
| 6 | probably 2000 . So it was a very, you know, it | 6 | meeting in Paris -- which was sometime in the |
| 7 | was a long, long project. | 7 | fall of 2008, correct? |
| 8 | Q. So the idea was to do a show of | 8 | A. Yes. |
| 9 | portraits by Patrick Cariou? | 9 | Q. When did you next speak to him? |
| 10 | A. It was -- the Surfer I couldn't do | 10 | A. When I next saw him after that -- |
| 11 | portraits only because he had a lot of beautiful | 11 | I'm trying to -- I think I saw him once. |
| 12 | photos of the surfer in the wave, so it was | 12 | Yeah, I think he came in New York -- |
| 13 | mixed. | 13 | yeah, he came in New York because of this |
| 14 | Q. And then back to, if I could, the | 14 | situation we are here today. |
| 15 | meeting in Paris -- which I understand was the | 15 | Q. Because of the lawsuit? |
| 16 | next meeting after the lunch meeting in | 16 | A. Yes. |
| 17 | New York? | 17 | In the summer maybe. I can't |
| 18 | A. Yes. | 18 | remember. |
| 19 | Q. What was discussed there? | 19 | Q. Summer of '09, 2009? |
| 20 | A. What was discussed there was that he | 20 | A. I can't remember. He came in 2009. |
| 21 | will try to come before the end of the year in | 21 | I know he came to the gallery because he saw my |
| 22 | New York to get all the prints together. | 22 | show, but I can't remember what time exactly it |
| 23 | Q. Before the end of 2008 ? | 23 | was. I think it was in the spring. I think the |
| 24 | A. Yes. | 24 | gallery was open. |
| 25 | Q. Okay, go ahead. | 25 | Q. The gallery was open in the spring |


|  | 49 |  | 51 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | of 2009? | 2 | Q. His personal collection of |
| 3 | A. Yeah. | 3 | photography books? |
| 4 | Q. He came to your show? | 4 | A. Yeah, some -- I mean his books, I |
| 5 | A. I think when he came the gallery | 5 | don't know if it's his whole collection, but |
| 6 | was already running and open. | 6 | it's part of his collection. |
| 7 | And ironically, I think the show | 7 | Q. So the idea is you would sell part |
| 8 | that was on, I cannot remember now because, you | 8 | of his collection for him? |
| 9 | know, I say to him, oh, it could have been you, | 9 | A. Yes. |
| 10 | like as a joke, and it was actually a work | 10 | Q. Was there a discussion about |
| 11 | called the Samburu, which is very similar in a | 11 | financial terms of the sale of the collection? |
| 12 | way but, you know, it's made in Kenya. Sol | 12 | A. Of the collection? |
| 13 | opened my first show with that work. | 13 | Q. Yes. |
| 14 | So I think he probably came | 14 | A. I wanted to go through the books, |
| 15 | April-May because that show was on I remember. | 15 | and honestly this came out of the blue, and I |
| 16 | Q. And he was at your gallery for how | 16 | didn't have much time. So night now l'm like |
| 17 | long a period of time, do you recall? | 17 | going through them to see what's interesting, |
| 18 | A. I think he just came to visit and | 18 | because we have a few hundred books, and it's |
| 19 | to look at what l've done. And, you know, he | 19 | time consuming work. |
| 20 | thought the gallery looks great, and he told me | 20 | Q. I understand. |
| 21 | right now he was in a certain situation and, | 21 | Can you tell me again, what was the |
| 22 | you know. | 22 | date of that meeting when he brought the books? |
| 23 | Q. Certain situation meaning this | 23 | A. I remember it was before his |
| 24 | litigation? | 24 | deposition, because he told me I'm here for my |
| 25 | A. Yeah. | 25 | deposition. But not a long time ago. Like |
|  | 50 |  | 52 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | Q. And how long a discussion did you | 2 | probably a week ago or -- yeah, probably a week |
| 3 | have with him at that time, if you recall, a few | 3 | ago or two weeks ago, you know. |
| 4 | minutes, longer, less? | 4 | Q. Between the time that you had time |
| 5 | A. You know, not long because it's not | 5 | with him in Paris - was that lunch or coffee, |
| 6 | like he called me and he say l'm coming to see | 6 | I'm sorry? |
| 7 | you, let's sit down. He was just there. One | 7 | A. Yes. |
| 8 | day he called me and he said l'm in New York, | 8 | Q. Lunch? |
| 9 | and he stopped by. So it was not an organized | 9 | A. Coffee. |
| 10 | meeting, you know. | 10 | Q. Between the time you had coffee with |
| 11 | Q. Have you seen him since then? | 11 | him in Paris and the time he came to see your |
| 12 | A. I saw him actually recently. And he | 12 | show in the spring of '09-- |
| 13 | told me he was doing his deposition. | 13 | A. Yeah. |
| 14 | Q. Where did you see him? | 14 | Q. -- did you speak to Mr. Cariou at |
| 15 | A. He came to visit me at the office. | 15 | all? |
| 16 | Q. And how long was that visit? | 16 | A. When did I speak to him? No, I |
| 17 | A. How long was that visit? He came to | 17 | think we e-mail. We e-mail because, you know -- |
| 18 | bring me some books that, you know, he asked me | 18 | but I don't think, you know -- I left messages |
| 19 | if I would be interested to sell for him. And I | 19 | for him but he not always return his, you know. |
| 20 | say yes. So he stayed the whole day. He showed | 20 | I left - I know I left one or two |
| 21 | me all his books. And I have the books, now I | 21 | messages occasionally, but he never really, you |
| 22 | have to go through them. | 22 | know, call me back. |
| 23 | Q. What books are they? | 23 | Q. So from the fall of ' 09 to the |
| 24 | A. They are very old vintage collection | 24 | spring of -- from the fall of '08 to the spring |
| 25 | of like very, very old books. | 25 | of '09 you didn't speak to him, he may have sent |


|  | 53 |  | 55 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | e-mails -- | 2 | it begins with the line 2008/8/28, Christiane |
| 3 | A. I think we e-mailed, yeah, because | 3 | Celle, and it says bonjour Patrick? |
| 4 | we had some e-mail when the lawsuit happened. | 4 | A. Mm-hmm, correct. |
| 5 | So I know I knew about that because he e-mailed | 5 | Q. And that one continues down to the |
| 6 | me something. | 6 | bottom of the page and then ends with your name |
| 7 | Q. Do you have copies of those e-mails | 7 | Christiane? |
| 8 | still? | 8 | A. Yes, the whole thirg, correct. |
| 9 | A. Yeah. | 9 | Q. And then his response up above |
| 10 | Q. Do you have them with you today? | 10 | starts from Patrick Cariou, it says Bonjour, |
| 11 | A. Yes. Do you want them now? | 11 | Christiane, and ends with Patrick and a cell |
| 12 | Q. Please. | 12 | number? |
| 13 | MR. BROOKS: I have them. | 13 | A. Yes. |
| 14 | MR. HAYES: Okay. Before you do | 14 | Q. Okay, great. |
| 15 | that, I appreciate you doing that, let me | 15 | So starting with the first e-mail |
| 16 | just mark as an exhibit -- off the record. | 16 | from you to him, could you please translate for |
| 17 | (Discussion off the record.) | 17 | me -- I think there's one, two, three, four, |
| 18 | MR. HAYES: I'd like to mark as | 18 | five, six paragraphs as I count them, one of the |
| 19 | Defendant's Deposition Exhibit 1 a | 19 | paragraphs being just one line, do you see that? |
| 20 | single-page document which contains I | 20 | A. Here? |
| 21 | believe an e-mail exchange which is in | 21 | Q. Yes. |
| 22 | French. | 22 | A. Yes. |
| 23 | And the top line says from Patrick | 23 | Q. So could you translate the first |
| 24 | Cariou, and at the bottom -- well, the | 24 | paragraph for me? |
| 25 | third line down has a date on it | 25 | A. The first here? |
|  | 54 |  | 56 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | August 28, 2008. | 2 | Q. Yes, please. |
| 3 | (Defendant's Exhibit 1, e-mail | 3 | A. Hello, Patrick. I am Christiane |
| 4 | exchange, was marked for identification, | 4 | Celle. We never met, but I know your |
| 5 | as of this date.) | 5 | photograph. I live in New York for the last |
| 6 | Q. Can you take a look at what's been | 6 | 20 years with a little break living in |
| 7 | marked as Defendant Celle Exhibit 1? | 7 | St. Barths where I started a company called |
| 8 | This document appears to be an | 8 | Calypso. Then I met Antoine Verglas who is a |
| 9 | e-mail exchange first from you to Mr. Cariou and | 9 | photographer that you know maybe. We have two |
| 10 | then Mr. Cariou to you, is that correct? | 10 | kids 14 and 12, and we are living together since |
| 11 | A. Yes. | 11 | then. |
| 12 | Q. And e-mail exchanges typically start | 12 | Continue? |
| 13 | at the top with the most recent, the latest, and | 13 | Q. That's perfect. |
| 14 | then go down to the earliest, is that correct | 14 | Now, just so the record is clear, |
| 15 | here as well? | 15 | that's the end of that first paragraph, right? |
| 16 | A. I'm sorry -- | 16 | A. Yes. |
| 17 | Q. And take your time to read it. | 17 | Q. Could you please translate for me |
| 18 | A. Yes. | 18 | the second paragraph? |
| 19 | Q. Is it correct -- again, I'm just | 19 | A. Of course. |
| 20 | trying to make sure I understand the document | 20 | I created Calypso in 1992 in |
| 21 | correctly -- that there are two e-mails here, | 21 | St. Barths, and I sold it in 2007. I decided to |
| 22 | one from you to Mr. Cariou and one from him back | 22 | change work and do a gallery in New York. The |
| 23 | to you? | 23 | first show will be in November. You should go |
| 24 | A. Yes, correct. | 24 | online and look at Vincent Fournier. He's |
| 25 | Q. And the first one from you to him, | 25 | having a show right now in Paris at Acte Deux |


|  | 57 |  | 59 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | and one in Tokyo in October. | 2 | Q. That's the fourth paragraph, right? |
| 3 | Q. And that's the end of the second | 3 | A. That's this one, yes. |
| 4 | paragraph, right? | 4 | Q. Go ahead. |
| 5 | A. Yes. | 5 | A. Thierry was my boyfriend in New York |
| 6 | Q. The show that was planned -- I'm | 6 | during many years. It's actually '84 to '89. |
| 7 | going to ask you to go through the rest of them, | 7 | Voila. |
| 8 | but before I do that, the show that you're | 8 | If you could give me a phone number |
| 9 | referring to for Mr. Fournier, that was supposed | 9 | where I would be happy to call you. And my |
| 10 | to be at which space and when? | 10 | name. |
| 11 | A. Okay, this show was supposed to be | 11 | Q. So at that point you were proposing |
| 12 | in 2008. But I signed the lease in June, but | 12 | the possibilities of a show, which would be a |
| 13 | because of a huge problem in the building, you | 13 | surf-photograph-oriented show? |
| 14 | know, that I took at 255 Centre, I could not | 14 | A. At the time, you know, we are |
| 15 | open the gallery until the spring 2009. | 15 | talking about that, yeah. |
| 16 | So that Vincent Fournier happened | 16 | Q. And the idea is that you would do a |
| 17 | but in 2009 October, a year later. | 17 | joint show with Mr. Cariou and Tony -- l'll call |
| 18 | Q. And that's the show you told us | 18 | him Tony C. because I mispronounced his last |
| 19 | about earlier? | 19 | name? |
| 20 | A. Yes, with the moon, the astronaut. | 20 | A. At that time, yes, correct. |
| 21 | Q. Thank you. | 21 | Q. And Tony C's work -- what is his |
| 22 | Could you, on the third paragraph, | 22 | full name again? |
| 23 | please translate that? | 23 | A. Tony Caramanico. |
| 24 | A. Yes. | 24 | Q. And Mr. Caramanico's work is |
| 25 | Will you be interested about talking | 25 | photography? |
|  | 58 |  | 60 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | about a possibility of expo, an exhibition in | 2 | A. Yeah, it's the surf journal and |
| 3 | New York. I will also have a gallery that's | 3 | transfer into photography. |
| 4 | opening in St. Barths, Gustavia is the town. | 4 | Q. So it's collage which has been |
| 5 | And I'm starting with a show of Tony C., it's my | 5 | rephotographed? |
| 6 | surfer that you never heard about. And he's | 6 | A. Yes. |
| 7 | doing print with his diaries. Diaries is the | 7 | Q. Okay, great. |
| 8 | journal. The theme is surf. | 8 | And so that was your idea for the |
| 9 | He's almost 60 and was a big | 9 | show at that point? |
| 10 | longboard champion. He did the longboard | 10 | A. At that moment, yes. |
| 11 | competition. I was thinking also that I could | 11 | Q. And then going above to the top |
| 12 | show you work and Tony work and some of your | 12 | of the document, which would now be what I |
| 13 | surf photographs. | 13 | understand to be Mr. Cariou's response to you, |
| 14 | I also wanted to know if you were | 14 | correct? |
| 15 | interested or if you had an exclusive with | 15 | A. Mm -hmm. |
| 16 | somebody. | 16 | Q. And that appears to be dated |
| 17 | Voila. | 17 | August 28th, that is the same date as your |
| 18 | Q. That's the one-line paragraph? | 18 | e-mail, correct? |
| 19 | A. Yes. | 19 | A. Yes. |
| 20 | Q. Okay. Keep going, please. | 20 | Q. And could you please, starting with |
| 21 | A. I also note Thierry Des Fontaines | 21 | bonjour Christiane -- |
| 22 | that was your assistant for a small period or | 22 | A. Yes. |
| 23 | short moment is living now in Brazil and he has | 23 | Q. - translate that for us? |
| 24 | a website if you want to look. He's devoted his | 24 | A. Hello, Christiane. Thank you very |
| 25 | time to sport photography. | 25 | much for the interest that, you know, you are |


|  | 61 |  | 63 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | calling to my work. I know all the people you | 2 | the photographer for everywhere because, you |
| 3 | are naming in your e-mail. I don't have a | 3 | know, things change, unfortunately. |
| 4 | gallery and I will be interested by a show. The | 4 | Q. Sure. |
| 5 | book Surfer is sold out for a long time, but | 5 | A. At the time, I don't recall, you |
| 6 | there should be a reprint this year. I also | 6 | know. |
| 7 | have another book that I'm trying -- I'm just | 7 | Q. So these e-mails are dated August 28 |
| 8 | finishing after ten years. It's about gypsies. | 8 | of 2008 and you met at Cafe Select in September |
| 9 | Maybe this will be interesting for you. Best. | 9 | or October of '08, right? |
| 10 | Q. And your e-mail to Mr. Cariou does | 10 | A. Yes. Yes. |
| 11 | not make any reference to Yes Rasta, does it? | 11 | Q. And so this conversation you just |
| 12 | A. Not on this one. | 12 | described happened sometime in between? |
| 13 | Q. But by that time you hadn't seen | 13 | A. Yes. |
| 14 | Yes Rasta, correct? | 14 | Q. Did you have any other conversations |
| 15 | A. I think I had seen Yes Rasta | 15 | with Mr. Cariou in between? |
| 16 | because, you know, I always had been on his -- | 16 | A. I don't think so because, you know, |
| 17 | I already had been on his website to get his | 17 | I know I called him later at the end of the |
| 18 | number. | 18 | year. Because one day somebody told me that |
| 19 | Q. And his response also does not refer | 19 | there was a show at Gagosian and there was |
| 20 | to Yes Rasta? | 20 | picture from the, you know, the Rasta book. |
| 21 | A. No. | 21 | So I left a message to him to call |
| 22 | Q. And subsequent to this e-mail you | 22 | me back, but he didn't. |
| 23 | had additional e-mail correspondence with him? | 23 | Q. I'll get to that in a moment. |
| 24 | A. I call him right away because I | 24 | A. Yeah. |
| 25 | wanted his phone because it's difficult to have | 25 | Q. Thank you. 1 just want to keep the |
|  | 62 |  | 64 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | a conversation. And, you know, I call him and | 2 | chronology straight. |
| 3 | I remember having, you know, the website and | 3 | So we have the exchange of e-mails? |
| 4 | going around the website and telling him what I | 4 | A. Yeah. |
| 5 | was interested. | 5 | Q. We have the telephone conversation |
| 6 | I remember that he was mentioning | 6 | you described to us? |
| 7 | also his new work Gypsies. And I was telling | 7 | A. Yes. |
| 8 | him that to do Gypsies would be more interesting | 8 | Q. And then we have the meeting at Cafe |
| 9 | when the book came out, because it's more | 9 | Select in New York? |
| 10 | interesting when the show has a book. | 10 | A. Yes. |
| 11 | And I was telling him that because | 11 | Q. And the meeting in Paris? |
| 12 | my next gallery was going to open soon in | 12 | A. Yes. |
| 13 | St. Barths, you know, I was interested in the | 13 | Q. And then you left him a message at |
| 14 | Surfer, but l'll be interested for spring | 14 | the end of December? |
| 15 | eventually of the Rasta. | 15 | A. When I -- |
| 16 | Q. Does this -- by the way, does this | 16 | Q. I don't mean to put words in your |
| 17 | e-mail talk about opening -- having the show in | 17 | mouth. Sometime in December, is that -- |
| 18 | St. Barths? | 18 | A. I can't remember if it's November or |
| 19 | A. I think at that time it was a mixed | 19 | December, but it's before Christmas because I |
| 20 | show. So I think it was probably St. Barths. | 20 | know I left the 17th of December, so it's before |
| 21 | I don't recall. | 21 | the 17th of December. |
| 22 | Q. You don't recall whether it was | 22 | Q. And your best recollection is he |
| 23 | going to be St. Barths or New York? | 23 | didn't respond to that message? |
| 24 | A. I mean I know right now I try to | 24 | A. No. |
| 25 | do -- when I get a photographer I try to sign | 25 | Q. And the next time you had any verbal |


|  | 65 |  | 67 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | contact with him was he when he came to see your | 2 | A. Yeah, we had a discussion of size of |
| 3 | show in the spring of ' 09 ? | 3 | print. |
| 4 | A. Yes, because I received an e-mail I | 4 | Q. What was that? |
| 5 | think in January, those e-mails, you know, about | 5 | A. We had, you know, discussed to do |
| 6 | informing that he has a lawsuit. | 6 | very big format because, you know, in New York |
| 7 | I'm trying to remember. | 7 | people have big apartment. So nothing less than |
| 8 | I don't think I saw him before that. | 8 | 30 by 40 and then going up. |
| 9 | Q. In the conversations either at Cafe | 9 | We discussed about price too because |
| 10 | Select or the cafe in Paris had there been any | 10 | I wanted to know, you know, in the past what it |
| 11 | start day set for a show? | 11 | was, you know, the background. But he never -- |
| 12 | A. I keep thinking spring, because at | 12 | for example, in the Surfer he had sold some |
| 13 | the time when I met him, probably September or | 13 | photography. |
| 14 | October, I knew already that the gallery will | 14 | The Rasta he had not done a show |
| 15 | not be open by the end of the year. | 15 | with it, so he was trusting me, and I was also |
| 16 | Because for a reason that building | 16 | new on that. But I was basing my price in the |
| 17 | at 255 Centre, okay, I took a building - I took | 17 | market, you know, according to what the book |
| 18 | a space that was huge and that didn't have a | 18 | was. And I think the first price were in the |
| 19 | certificate of occupancy for years. And before | 19 | \$3,000 up to 15 or 20 . But we never set up like |
| 20 | me it was an electrician, it was not a retail | 20 | real on paper any size. |
| 21 | store. So it was like a showroom. | 21 | Q. It was a verbal discussion -- |
| 22 | And when I start getting approval | 22 | A. Yes. |
| 23 | from the City of New York I had so many problem. | 23 | Q. -- about what the price points might |
| 24 | So I started the construction I think around | 24 | be for different sizes? |
| 25 | September-October, but I really open in June. | 25 | A. From 3,000 to 15 or 20 for really |
|  | 66 |  | 68 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | There was so many problems. | 2 | big format. |
| 3 | So I knew already that I could not | 3 | Q. And in line with that, did you |
| 4 | do a show until spring. So my thinking was, | 4 | discuss with Mr. Cariou the sales he made of any |
| 5 | you know, to try to work something for him | 5 | prints prior to that discussion? |
| 6 | April-May. It was always spring. | 6 | A. No. The only thing he told me that |
| 7 | Q. It was always spring? | 7 | he had sold Surfer through Marion de Beaupre in |
| 8 | A. Yeah. | 8 | Pans, and he was selling, you know, privately |
| 9 | Q. Would it be fair to say that the | 9 | to a hotel, you know. |
| 10 | discussions were general? | 10 | Q. You said to a hotel? |
| 11 | A. Yes. | 11 | A. Yeah. He actually -- I can mention |
| 12 | Q. And you had discussed he would | 12 | that because a gentleman came to my store called |
| 13 | provide the prints and you would frame them and | 13 | Robert Novogratz, N-O-V-O-G-R-A-T-Z. He's a |
| 14 | you would split any sales price? | 14 | really famous decorator that I know. And Robert |
| 15 | A. Yes, correct. | 15 | had come to my bookstore looking for kind of new |
| 16 | Q. Did you discuss how many prints | 16 | things and -- you know. |
| 17 | would be in the show? | 17 | And he had come around Yes Rasta and |
| 18 | A. I mean I had an idea because | 18 | Surfer, and Robert had, you know, gotten both |
| 19 | according to the space I wanted around like | 19 | books. And I said to him, I'm trying to do a |
| 20 | between 30 and 40 prints, you know, because I | 20 | show with this photographer. And Robert said, |
| 21 | was trying to map out the Vincent Fournier at | 21 | I'm doing that big hotel in New Jersey, I would |
| 22 | the time, and that's what I was figuring out | 22 | love to get some photo of him. |
| 23 | that I could fit in the space. | 23 | And because I was not representing |
| 24 | Q. Did you have a discussion of the | 24 | Patrick at the time, I say, well, maybe you |
| 25 | sizes of the prints? | 25 | should contact him directly, because, you know. |


|  | 69 |  | 71 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | So I think he contacted him. And | 2 | week after I immediately called him. |
| 3 | when Patrick came in New York in the Cafe Select | 3 | Q. So end of August, early September? |
| 4 | he mentioned that thank you for referring | 4 | A. Yes. |
| 5 | Robert, I'm doing some photographs for him for | 5 | Q. You then had the meeting with him in |
| 6 | the hotel. | 6 | Cafe Select in September-October approximately |
| 7 | Q. And did he say what price they were | 7 | of '08? |
| 8 | going to be at? | 8 | A. Yes. |
| 9 | A. No. And I felt, you know, I didn't | 9 | Q. You then had the meeting in Paris |
| 10 | want to be indiscreet because for me I was | 10 | sometime later in the fall? |
| 11 | thinking I'm not his agent. You know, I would | 11 | A. Yes, correct. |
| 12 | love to but, you know. | 12 | Q. You left him a message in December? |
| 13 | And Robert Novogratz the decorator | 13 | A. End of November, December. I can't |
| 14 | is also a great client of mine, you know, he | 14 | recall exactly. |
| 15 | buys things from me. So I knew that if I was | 15 | Q. And that's the one he didn't respond |
| 16 | referring he will send me clients for something | 16 | to, correct? |
| 17 | else, you know. It's a favor I did to him, | 17 | A. He didn't respond. I just asked him |
| 18 | but -- | 18 | to call me back, you know. I didn't give any |
| 19 | Q. Did Mr. Cariou say anything to you | 19 | detail. |
| 20 | in words or substance about having sold his | 20 | Q. Just please call me? |
| 21 | prints primarily in the past to people that he | 21 | A. I say can you call me back, because |
| 22 | liked or felt good about or friends? | 22 | I was thinking if I say anything he might be |
| 23 | A. He didn't give me the detail, but he | 23 | freaking out. I say just call me back, I need |
| 24 | told me that he had sold prints in the past and | 24 | to talk to you. |
| 25 | mentioned the Robert Novogratz hotel. | 25 | Q. And when was the next contact after |
|  | 70 |  | 72 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | Q. And did he give you any statement as | 2 | that you had with Mr. Cariou? |
| 3 | to what the price points of the prior sales had | 3 | A. Like contact physically seeing him |
| 4 | been? | 4 | you mean? |
| 5 | A. I mean when I say to him like the | 5 | Q. Well, let's say physically seeing |
| 6 | small one, I was referring to the -- I can't | 6 | him, yes, that was when he came to your gallery |
| 7 | remember -- it was to the probably 30 by 40 , and | 7 | for the show, right? |
| 8 | that was in the 3,000 to 5,000, you know, | 8 | A. I think that's it, yeah, in the |
| 9 | according to the market and something similar, | 9 | spring. |
| 10 | and he was in that price range. | 10 | Q. Spring of '09? |
| 11 | Q. He was agreeing to the price range? | 11 | A. I think in the spring he was just |
| 12 | A. Yes. | 12 | here and he told me he was here for a lawsuit. |
| 13 | Q. But did he say anything to you about | 13 | Q. And so between the time you saw him |
| 14 | what he sold prints for in the past? | 14 | in Paris and the time he came to the gallery |
| 15 | A. No. | 15 | show did you speak to him over the telephone at |
| 16 | Q. Just so I make sure I have the | 16 | all? |
| 17 | chronology down, what I understand is we have | 17 | A. I don't think so. |
| 18 | the e-mail exchange in August of '08? | 18 | Q. And so what was the next contact |
| 19 | A. Mm-hmm. | 19 | that you had with him, if any, before you met |
| 20 | Q. You had a phone conversation with | 20 | him at the show in spring of '09, did you get |
| 21 | him sometime after that, probably in September, | 21 | any e-mails from him or send him any e-mails? |
| 22 | is that correct? | 22 | A. I know in January he sent me an |
| 23 | A. I think after that, when he gave me | 23 | e-mail telling me that he was going to do the |
| 24 | his cell I call him right away. I don't know if | 24 | lawsuit and, you know. |
| 25 | it's the same day, but that same week or the | 125 | MR. HAYES: Do we have that e-mail |


|  | 73 |  | 75 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | here? | 2 | Q. Okay. So as we go through it we'll |
| 3 | MR. BROOKS: These are the e-mails | 3 | just identify which are duplicates. |
| 4 | that I have. | 4 | A. Great. Okay. |
| 5 | MR. HAYES: Off the record. | 5 | Q. So the first thing is if you could |
| 6 | (Discussion off the record.) | 6 | translate for us, please, this e-mail on the |
| 7 | MR. HAYES: Let me have marked as | 7 | bottom page 4 with "Chere Christiane"? |
| 8 | Defendant Celle Exhibit 2 a four-page | 8 | A. Page 4, right. Very good. |
| 9 | document which contains what I believe to | 9 | From Patrick. |
| 10 | be a series of e-mails. | 10 | Dear Christiane, I'm happy to know |
| 11 | The top one says from Patrick Cariou | 11 | that all your projects are moving on. I will be |
| 12 | and it bears a date January 29, 2009. | 12 | in New York in the two next month. Something |
| 13 | (Defendant's Exhibit 2, series of | 13 | incredible is happening to me with Richard |
| 14 | e-mails, was marked for identification, as | 14 | Prince. Richard Prince -- that's slang -- "c,es |
| 15 | of this date.) | 15 | vautrer dans Yes Rasta" -- it's hard to |
| 16 | MR. HAYES: While he's doing that | 16 | translate, that means picked something in |
| 17 | let's take a break for a minute. | 17 | Yes Rasta -- Richard Prince picked something in |
| 18 | (Recess taken: 11:15 a.m.) | 18 | Yes Rasta. |
| 19 | (Proceedings resumed: 11:20 a.m.) | 19 | Q. That would be the line -- could you |
| 20 | BY MR. HAYES: | 20 | read the line in French just so I understand? |
| 21 | Q. Ms. Celle, I would like to refer you | 21 | A. Yes. |
| 22 | to what's marked as Defendant Celle Exhibit 2 | 22 | "En effet prince c,es vautrer dans |
| 23 | for identification and ask you, this is an | 23 | yes rasta." |
| 24 | exchange of e-mails between Patrick Cariou and | 24 | Q. And just so I'm accurate, could you |
| 25 | yourself? | 25 | please give me the best translation from French |
|  | 74 |  | 76 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | A. Correct, yes. | 2 | again? |
| 3 | Q. And is it correct -- the document | 3 | A. Yeah, in French "c,es vautrer" it's |
| 4 | physically is four pages, and would it be | 4 | slang, so it's hard to translate. |
| 5 | correct to say that the exchange begins on the | 5 | It's, you know, like kids -- "c,es |
| 6 | last page on January 29, 2009, at 6:04 a.m., | 6 | vautre" is like kids lying on the sofa would |
| 7 | with Mr. Cariou writing to you? | 7 | be -- so it's an expression that's very hard to |
| 8 | A. Yes. | 8 | translate. But what he meant by that is Richard |
| 9 | Q. And then continues in point of time | 9 | Prince went to look into the Yes Rasta. |
| 10 | getting later as we go up this page and through | 10 | Q. That's the meaning you took from it? |
| 11 | the other pages, correct? | 11 | A. Yes, that's what -- you know. |
| 12 | A. Correct. | 12 | Q. Give me, if you would, your best |
| 13 | Q. So just to be clear, and because I | 13 | translation of the actual words? |
| 14 | unfortunately do not speak French, could you | 14 | A. "C,es vautrer," I mean -- |
| 15 | start with the first of the e-mails, the one on | 15 | Q. Just start with the whole line. |
| 16 | January 29, on the bottom portion of the last | 16 | A. It's like Richard Prince is laying |
| 17 | page of this document and translate it for us | 17 | on the Rasta, you know. |
| 18 | beginning with "Chere Christiane"? | 18 | Q. Okay. |
| 19 | A. I'm just confused because I have | 19 | A. It's hard to translate. |
| 20 | doubles here. So I don't know -- | 20 | Q. And the next line? |
| 21 | Q. We have more than one copy of a | 21 | A. He just had a show at Gagosian where |
| 22 | particular e-mail? | 22 | he's using 30 of my photographs as a central |
| 23 | A. Yeah. I think it's the same thing. | 23 | theme. Please see attachment. I am doing a |
| 24 | Q. Perhaps we do. Okay. | 24 | lawsuit. Please see the links. New York Times |
| 25 | A. So it's okay. | 25 | blog -- there is a New York Times link. |


| 77 | 79 |
| :---: | :---: |
| Celle | Celle |
| Q. And was there an attachment to this | A. "Qunad meme pas genial" means not |
| e-mail? | 3 great to do that. And "vendre si cher" means |
| A. Honestly, I'm sure there was one. | sell so expensive. |
| Q. Do you recall seeing one, opening | 5 Q. Okay, go ahead. |
| 6 one, what it was? | A. It is called "plagiat" but that's a |
| A. I opening one -- l opened one, | French name. The French name "plagiat" is like |
| but -- | 8 copying. It's called "plagiat." I don't know |
| Q. Do you remember what it was? | if you use that name here. |
| 10 A. Yeah, there was a whole article | 10 I hope you get something out of it. |
| 11 about the lawsuit, but the detail I don't really | 11 "Dedommage" means like I hope you will get some |
| 12 remember. | 12 money compensation. |
| 13 Q. And did you then also go to this | 13 Q. I'll just ask you a question. The |
| 14 site that that's referred to in the e-mail? | 14 phrase, "non le mot francais," what does that |
| 15 A. I think I opened the blog, New York | 15 mean? |
| 16 Times, yes. | 16 A. "Cela se nomme plagiat" -- "plagiat" |
| 17 Q. So there was an attachment which was | 17 is the French name. I don't know American name, |
| 18 an article about the lawsuit, and then you also | 18 but "plagiat" is copying somebody. |
| 19 went to the blog, is that correct? | 19 Q. And I was actually asking about the |
| 20 A. I remember going somewhere where | 20 four words after that, "non le mot francais"? |
| 21 there was New York Times and, you know, the | 21 A. I don't know why there is "non," |
| 22 article, yes, 1 do remember that. | 22 there should not be that. |
| 23 Q. Just to be clear, were there two | 23 (Clarification by reporter.) |
| 24 articles you read or one, or you don't remember? | 24 A. "Cela se nomme," means this means |
| $25 \quad$ A. I remember one. I remember the | 25 "plagiat," the French word. I don't know why |
| 78 | 80 |
| Celle | Celle |
| New York Times. | there is a "non," I'm sorry, but the French |
| Q. Then the next e-mail up above, is | word. |
| that a response by you to Mr. Cariou? | Q. But do the four words "non le mot |
| A. Patrick, right. | francais" have any meaning to you at all? |
| The "Antoine me dit"? Yeah. | A. No, Ithink "non" it's a typo |
| Q. Yes. And that one, just so we're | because that doesn't mean anything in -- you |
| clear, I think is dated January 29, '09, and | know. |
| it's from you to Mr. Cariou, correct? | Q. In French? |
| 10 A. Yes. | 10 A. Yeah. |
| 11 Q. And then, by the way, above that | 11 Q. How about "le mot francais"? |
| 12 ending with the word Patrick is a response from | 12 A. "Le mot" is the word, French name. |
| 13 him back to you to your e-mail. There are three | 13 "Le mot" is French name. |
| 14 e-mails on this page? | 14 "Plagiat" will be the French name |
| 15 A. Correct. | 15 for that kind of action. |
| 16 Q. So focusing on just the second | 16 Q. But what is "le mot"? |
| 17 e-mail, which is your e-mail to Mr. Cariou, | 17 A. "Le mot"? |
| 18 could you please translate that for us? | 18 Q. Yes. |
| 19 A. Antoine, who is my husband, is | 19 A. The word. |
| 20 telling me that he is used to do this kind of | 20 Q. The word France? |
| 21 thing and then, you know, he has lawyer to deal | 21 A. Yeah. |
| 22 with it. This is not great to do this kind of | 22 Q. So those last three words say the |
| 23 thing and selling the work so expensive. | 23 word French? |
| 24 Q. Selling the work so expensive, what | 24 A. Yeah. |
| 25 line does that appear? | 25 Q. Go ahead. Keep going, please. |


|  | 81 |  | 83 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | A. I hope you will get some kind of | 2 | correct? |
| 3 | money, compensatory, whatever, "dedommage." | 3 | A. Yes. |
| 4 | We should do a show and put all back | 4 | Q. And then we have at the top of the |
| 5 | the clock together -- which is a French | 5 | page a responsive e-mail from Mr. Cariou to you |
| 6 | expression. We should say, wow, you should do a | 6 | appearing to have been sent on January 29 at |
| 7 | show and show everybody who you are. Because, | 7 | 9:43 a.m., Eastern Standard Time? |
| 8 | you know, I was pushing to do a show at the time | 8 | A. Yes. |
| 9 | and until actually I figure it out. | 9 | Q. And it's addressed to you. |
| 10 | Q. But, again, l'd like you just to -- | 10 | And can you please translate for us |
| 11 | the line we're on now, "j, espere que tu seras | 11 | the six lines there? |
| 12 | dedommage"? | 12 | A. I know really well the "travail" or |
| 13 | A. Yes. | 13 | the work of Mr. Prince and his artistic posture. |
| 14 | Q. And what does that line mean? | 14 | I have a lawyer, a good lawyer, who is working |
| 15 | A. I hope you will get some kind of | 15 | and very motivated by this lawsuit. |
| 16 | compensation of -- "dedommage" -- "dommage" | 16 | Q. Let me stop you for a second. The |
| 17 | means, you know, when you suffer like a loss or | 17 | phrase "travaille au pourcentage," what's that? |
| 18 | something. | 18 | A. I have a great lawyer who works -- |
| 19 | Q. Right. And can you then give me | 19 | I guess I'm not sure what does that mean because |
| 20 | your best translation of the next line? | 20 | I'm not a lawyer, but probably on a retainer |
| 21 | A. It's the moment to do a show and | 21 | fee. That's my interpretation, you know, |
| 22 | put back the clock at that time. It's an | 22 | percentage. |
| 23 | expression. | 23 | Q. "Travaille au pourcentage," does |
| 24 | Q. What did you mean by that? | 24 | that mean work on percentage? |
| 25 | A. That means, you know, straighten | 25 | A. Yeah, percentage. |
|  | 82 |  | 84 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | things and show who you are. | 2 | Q. Okay. And then keep going. |
| 3 | Q. So what were you suggesting he do in | 3 | The phrase "et est tres motive"? |
| 4 | that two-line paragraph, or that line? | 4 | A. That is very motivated by the |
| 5 | A. I'm suggesting to him that he should | 5 | lawsuit or this affair means this business, you |
| 6 | really do a show and, you know, show the world | 6 | know. |
| 7 | who is he because these people are copying his | 7 | Q. The lawyer is very motivated by this |
| 8 | work, he should be the one showing his work. | 8 | affair? |
| 9 | Q. So he should have a show is what | 9 | A. Yes. |
| 10 | you're saying? | 10 | Q. I see. Go ahead. |
| 11 | A. I told him, yeah. | 11 | A. The difference this time -- he's |
| 12 | Q. What's the next line? | 12 | talking about Richard Prince. The difference |
| 13 | A. I have to send you photo of Bob | 13 | this time is, you know, he doesn't put his name, |
| 14 | Marley that a gentleman did. He's a 60 years -- | 14 | but he took like 30 photos from one artist, plus |
| 15 | 65 years, there is he a typo -- artist. There's | 15 | a book with a central theme of my work. This |
| 16 | a U missing. | 16 | l've never seen before. |
| 17 | There was a show before and a | 17 | Q. The phrase -- just back up to the |
| 18 | museum, you know, took them. Some prints were | 18 | line that begins "la difference." |
| 19 | lost. And some are excellent. I will try to | 19 | A. Yes. |
| 20 | send you some images. Superb. | 20 | Q. The phrase "cette fois c'est qu'il |
| 21 | The prints are done by Charlie | 21 | s, est vraiment"? |
| 22 | Griffin. He was a photographer in '89, and now | 22 | A. Which one? |
| 23 | he's a printer, and he's printing for Sugimoto. | 23 | Q. Give me the whole line, if you |
| 24 | And wonderful quality. | 24 | would. |
| 25 | Q. And that's the end of that e-mail, | 25 | A. "La difference"? |


|  | 85 |  | 87 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | Q. Yes. | 2 | up now, how far in advance do you generally |
| 3 | A. Oh. The difference this time is he | 3 | prepare the show and what do you do to prepare |
| 4 | really took 30 photos from one artist. | 4 |  |
| 5 | Q. Okay, good. | 5 | A. It depends. Usually I need from |
| 6 | Then the next line? | 6 | three months to six months, according to the |
| 7 | A. Plus one book with the central theme | 7 | artist. |
| 8 | of my work. | 8 | Q. And what do you do during those |
| 9 | Q. "Mon travail du jamais vu," does | 9 | three to six months? |
| 10 | that mean my work or my travel to Jamaica? | 10 | A. Okay. What I do is I meet different |
| 11 | A. Oh, no, this means the central theme | 11 | time to review the work, pick up the work, make |
| 12 | of my work. "Du jamais vu" means never seen. | 12 | a choice of the work. And then it's the |
| 13 | Q. Work never seen? | 13 | responsibility of the artist to print. |
| 14 | A. Yeah. | 14 | And some artists needs two months. |
| 15 | Q. The word "travail" is what? How do | 15 | The framer needs three weeks to one month. |
| 16 | you translate "travail"? | 16 | So usually, you know, once you agree |
| 17 | A. My work. | 17 | on the show it can take two months minimum to |
| 18 | Q. "Travail" is work? | 18 | prepare. |
| 19 | A. Yes. | 19 | Q. Do you do a catalog in connection |
| 20 | Q. Okay. Next line? | 20 | with your shows? |
| 21 | A. It looks like it's the first time | 21 | A. Sometime I do, but not necessarily |
| 22 | this is happening in the art world. We will | 22 | for every show. |
| 23 | see. And best. | 23 | Q. And did you plan a catalog for this |
| 24 | Q. "Nous allons voir" means we will | 24 | show? |
| 25 | see? | 25 | A. For that show I didn't plan a |
|  | 86 |  | 88 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | A. We will see, yeah. | 2 | catalog because what I was planning is a reprint |
| 3 | Q. So this exchange all took place on | 3 | of the book of 5,000 copy and have a show of |
| 4 | January 29, 2009 ? | 4 | Patrick work in conjunction with the reprint of |
| 5 | A. Yes. | 5 | the book and do a book signing too because the |
| 6 | Q. We'll go through everything eise in | 6 | book was hard to find. Powerhouse had sold out |
| 7 | the exhibit in a minute. | 7 | the book. |
| 8 | But at the time that this e-mail | 8 | Q. At this point in time had you made |
| 9 | exchange happened had you done anything to | 9 | any arrangements to have the book reprinted as |
| 10 | actually set up the exhibit at your gallery of | 10 | of the end of January 2009? |
| 11 | Mr. Cariou's photographs? | 11 | A. No, because in November or December |
| 12 | A. No. | 12 | I heard that there was a situation where there |
| 13 | Q. Had you discussed it with any of the | 13 | was a show at Gagosian with certain photograph |
| 14 | other artists? | 14 | of Patrick Cariou. |
| 15 | MR. BROOKS: Discussed what? | 15 | So at the time I had no idea and I |
| 16 | A. With the other artists? | 16 | was thinking two things, maybe Patrick Cariou is |
| 17 | Q. Discussed the possibility of having | 17 | not responding my phone call because he's doing |
| 18 | a Cariou show with any of the other artists you | 18 | something with Richard Prince. |
| 19 | represented? | 19 | You know, I don't know Patrick |
| 20 | A. No, I don't discuss usually each | 20 | Cariou, so I say maybe that's why he's not |
| 21 | artist with the others, you know. It's kind of | 21 | pursuing me because he's doing something better, |
| 22 | confidential. | 22 | bigger with this person. That was my first |
| 23 | Q. I understand. | 23 | reaction when I heard there was a show at |
| 24 | And can you tell me in general if | 24 | Gagosian. |
| 25 | you're going to do a show like the show you got | 25 | First, that was my reaction. That's |


|  | 89 |  | 91 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | why I left a message, you know, for him to call | 2 | Q. And where do you advertise? |
| 3 | me back. Because for me he had done it with | 3 | A. In Photograph Magazine. It's like a |
| 4 | Gagosian and Prince and the big show and then he | 4 | small booklet, like a photographic guide mostly. |
| 5 | didn't want to tell the French girl I'm not | 5 | Q. As of the end of January of 2009 had |
| 6 | doing it with you, you know, because we had | 6 | you made any arrangements for advertisements of |
| 7 | started a relation and that would have been bad. | 7 | a show of photographs by Mr. Cariou? |
| 8 | And I was not sure about that. | 8 | A. No, because the minute I figure out |
| 9 | But I was thinking if it's done | 9 | that there was a Chelsea show of his work, you |
| 10 | already I'm not going to do now a Rasta show | 10 | know, I knew that it was over. |
| 11 | showing, you know, the work. It looks like I'm | 11 | Q. At any time prior to January 29th of |
| 12 | trying to take advantage of the success of | 12 | 2009 had you ordered any advertisements for a |
| 13 | Richard Prince and saying, wow, great, let me do | 13 | show for Mr. Cariou? |
| 14 | the Rasta, and now l'm going to show this. | 14 | A. No. |
| 15 | So at the time I knew that if I will | 15 | Q. Had you printed any invitations? |
| 16 | do something with Patrick it will be probably | 16 | A. No. |
| 17 | the Surfer. But I could not do anymore the | 17 | Q. Had you made any arrangements with |
| 18 | Rasta because it was aiready in Chelsea, a | 18 | Powerhouse Books to reprint Yes Rasta? |
| 19 | beautiful gallery in Chelsea. | 19 | A. No, because it was more Patrick's |
| 20 | And Gagosian is a very famous | 20 | decision to do that. But we were committed to |
| 21 | gallery, so if the work was shown there already | 21 | do something. |
| 22 | with another artist together, you know, I was | 22 | Q. Okay. Now, turning to the third |
| 23 | not sure if Patrick had decided to do something | 23 | page of this document, this is where I guess |
| 24 | with Richard Prince. | 24 | if you can identify -- this appears to be a |
| 25 | And that was my first idea because, | 25 | different e-mail. |
|  | 90 |  | 92 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | you know, a friend of mine told my husband and I | 2 | Looking at the e-mail which appears |
| 3 | went to look on the website and I thought maybe | 3 | to take up the bottom two thirds of this -- |
| 4 | it's a collaboration. And now I was thinking | 4 | sorry. |
| 5 | this is why, you know, I don't have any news | 5 | This page appears to be a copy of |
| 6 | from Patrick. | 6 | the -- I confused myself here. |
| 7 | The second option was we didn't | 7 | On page 3 there appears to me to be |
| 8 | agree and then we see, but I wanted to figure | 8 | some carryover lines or something at the top |
| 9 | out, but I knew there was no way I could do a | 9 | which consists of -- |
| 10 | show because of the situation. | 10 | MR. BROOKS: Excuse me. Hers is |
| 11 | Q. By this time at the end of January | 11 | different than mine. |
| 12 | of 2009 had you printed up any invitations for | 12 | MR. HAYES: Off the record. |
| 13 | the show? | 13 | (Discussion off the record.) |
| 14 | A. No. | 14 | BY MR. HAYES: |
| 15 | Q. Do you typically print invitations? | 15 | Q. Looking at the third page, at the |
| 16 | A. Really I would say a month before | 16 | top of the page is what appears to be two lines, |
| 17 | the show, you know. We do a postcard. | 17 | then a space, one line, then a space, and then |
| 18 | Q. A postcard? | 18 | three lines, do you see that? |
| 19 | A. Yeah. | 19 | (Witness indicating.) |
| 20 | Q. Do you usually take advertisements | 20 | Q. Yes. Top of the page, two lines |
| 21 | for a show? | 21 | beginning "elles ont fait"? |
| 22 | A. Yes, we do. | 22 | A. Yes. |
| 23 | Q. And when do you usually make the | 23 | Q. And then there are two lines there, |
| 24 | arrangements for advertisements? | 24 | then there's a space, one line? |
| 25 | A. At least three months before. | 25 | A. Yes. |


| 93 |  | 95 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | Q. Space, and then three lines? | 2 | at on page 4? |
| 3 | A. Yes. | 3 | A. Correct. |
| 4 | Q. Could you please -- | 4 | Q. The balance of what appears on |
| 5 | MR. BROOKS: We've already looked at | 5 | page 3, was that part of the original e-mail? |
| 6 | that. That's on the fourth page. | 6 | A. Yes, that's all -- yes, correct. |
| 7 | Just to save a little bit of time, | 7 | Q. Okay. So now, by looking at this |
| 8 | those lines are all on the fourth page. | 8 | page, do we now have the complete e-mail that |
| 9 | They're the end of the second e-mail. | 9 | Mr. Cariou sent you at 6:04 a.m. on the 29th? |
| 10 | MR. HAYES: Okay. So these are | 10 | A. Correct. |
| 11 | actually portions of the e-mail which were | 11 | Q. Whereas what we looked at before was |
| 12 | sent -- off the record. | 12 | just partial? |
| 13 | Bear with me for a second. | 13 | A. Correct. |
| 14 | (Discussion off the record.) | 14 | Q. Now, the line beginning "d,autre |
| 15 | BY MR. HAYES: | 15 | pars," and so on -- l apologize for the |
| 16 | Q. So what appears at the top of | 16 | mispronunciation - could you read me that line? |
| 17 | page 3, those six lines are actually a portion | 17 | A. "D,autre pars"? |
| 18 | of the e-mail that you sent to him, to Patrick | 18 | Q. Yes. Translate that, please. |
| 19 | Cariou on the 29th, correct? | 19 | A. On another subject l'm thinking of |
| 20 | A. Correct. | 20 | selling a good part of my collection of photo |
| 21 | Q. You've already translated those? | 21 | books with some beautiful rare pieces. |
| 22 | A. Correct. | 22 | And then he said l'm a little bit |
| 23 | On the artist that's 65 years old. | 23 | confused about your program. Are you going to |
| 24 | Q. Yes. And the balance of this page | 24 | have three gallery, New York, St. Barths, and |
| 25 | appears to be the e-mail portion that we looked | 25 | East Hampton. |
|  | 94 |  | 96 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | at previously on page 4 but with additional | 2 | Q. Yes. |
| 3 | material, is that correct? | 3 | A. He's questioning. |
| 4 | A. Yes. | 4 | Q. Yes. |
| 5 | Q. Okay. So would it be accurate to | 5 | A. And then he asked me, do you know |
| 6 | say that what actually appears on page 3, | 6 | somebody at Eden Rock Gallery. This is in |
| 7 | beginning on January 29, 2009, at 6:04 a.m., | 7 | St. Barths. Prince, which is Richard Prince, |
| 8 | Patrick Cariou wrote -- is that the complete | 8 | had a show there with my photograph but I cannot |
| 9 | e-mail that he sent you at that time? | 9 | find them -- but I cannot find them or, you |
| 10 | A. Yes. | 10 | know, anything about that show. |
| 11 | Q. Whereas what we looked at on page 4 | 11 | I will need some photograph of that |
| 12 | was a partial portion of the e-mail? | 12 | show or reproduction of painting. Thank you. |
| 13 | A. Yeah. Correct. It was missing the | 13 | Q. And A-plus? |
| 14 | two last lines. | 14 | A. A-plus means "a bientot" or see you |
| 15 | Q. Actually, unless I misread it, it | 15 | soon. |
| 16 | misses a number of lines. The prior one, which | 16 | Q. Did you understand this latter |
| 17 | ended up with the line HTTP artsbeat blogs? | 17 | portion of the e-mail to be asking you to obtain |
| 18 | A. Correct. | 18 | the photos for him? |
| 19 | Q. And you see that appears here? | 19 | A. He ask me if I -- yeah, but -- |
| 20 | A. Yes. | 20 | Q. Did you do that? |
| 21 | Q. Then below that there's another line | 21 | A. No. |
| 22 | which begins HTTP www.theartnewspaper? | 22 | Q. Now, let's turn to -- we've now |
| 23 | A. Correct. | 23 | translated the entire e-mail, right? |
| 24 | Q. And now everything on the balance of | 24 | A. Yes. |
| 25 | the page appears to be something we did not look | 125 | Q. Now, let's go back to page 2, the |


|  | 97 |  | 99 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | document which has what appears to be one | 2 | was running out of -- |
| 3 | e-mail. And that appears to be part of the | 3 | MR. BROOKS: No, that's from him. |
| 4 | e-mail that appeared on page 3, so I think we've | 4 | I think you should start and then go up. |
| 5 | already covered that. | 5 | MR. HAYES: That's fine with me too. |
| 6 | A. The same one, yeah. | 6 | BY MR. HAYES: |
| 7 | Q. And let's go now to page 1. | 7 | Q. Let's go back down. |
| 8 | And can you tell me, are those -- | 8 | This e-mail chain begins, does it, |
| 9 | are any of those the same e-mails we've aiready | 9 | with an e-mail from you to him? |
| 10 | looked at or are they different? | 10 | A. Mm -hmm. |
| 11 | A. It's the same. Yeah. | 11 | Q. And is that the one that says "oui |
| 12 | Oh, there's something here that -- | 12 | dans le passe"? |
| 13 | sorry, yeah, page 1. | 13 | A. Yes. |
| 14 | Q. Page 1? | 14 | Q. And the e-mails below that on this |
| 15 | A. Yes. | 15 | page we've already done, correct? |
| 16 | Q. So is that at the very top? | 16 | MR. BROOKS: Those two. |
| 17 | A. Yes. | 17 | A. Yes. |
| 18 | Q. The top of the page? | 18 | Q. So this e-mail chain we're now going |
| 19 | MR. BROOKS: No, what about this | 19 | to do, we'll start with the beginning of this |
| 20 | one? The bottom two we've done. I think | 20 | e-mail chain, which is your four-line e-mail |
| 21 | this one is new. | 21 | beginning "oui dans le passe"? |
| 22 | A. This is the part that's new. | 22 | A. Yeah. |
| 23 | MR. BROOKS: We did that and then | 23 | Q. Translate those four lines for me, |
| 24 | this part? | 24 | please. |
| 25 | A. Yeah. | 25 | A. So here I'm answering to his e-mail |
|  | 98 |  | 100 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | (Witness indicating.) | 2 | where he's explaining that Richard Prince had |
| 3 | Q. Just so we're clear, the part that | 3 | took some photograph from him. And I say, yes, |
| 4 | we've already done, is that the one that begins | 4 | in the past I have seen some old publicity or |
| 5 | from Patrick 12/29? | 5 | small little thing, and what I'm trying by this |
| 6 | Actually, let's do it this way. | 6 | is I mean mixed in Richard Prince photograph |
| 7 | Let's start from the top. | 7 | because I know his work is always, you know, a |
| 8 | A. Yeah. | 8 | mix of other things. |
| 9 | Q. This is Patrick Cariou to you, | 9 | Q. Do me a favor, just because I don't |
| 10 | January 29 at 10:31, Eastern Standard Time. | 10 | translate French at all, can you just give me |
| 11 | A. Right. | 11 | the straight translation of those four lines? |
| 12 | Q. Could you please translate -- and it | 12 | A. Sure. |
| 13 | consists of four lines, correct? | 13 | Q. Thank you. |
| 14 | A. Yes. | 14 | A. So in the past I always, you know, |
| 15 | Q. Could you please translate those | 15 | all publicities, small little thing, but in your |
| 16 | four lines? | 16 | case it's true that it's "plagiat." |
| 17 | A. For Rasta the book you can call my | 17 | "Plagiat" is that copy. |
| 18 | publisher Powerhouse. But I was mentioning my | 18 | MR. BROOKS: Does that mean |
| 19 | private collection of book -- "Grosse collect" | 19 | plagiarism? |
| 20 | means big collection -- with beautiful rare | 20 | A. Probably. |
| 21 | pieces and some not as nice. | 21 | But in that case I think it's a bit, |
| 22 | Q. And what did you understand him to | 22 | you know -- "gonfle" is also slang, that means |
| 23 | be saying to you in this e-mail when you got it? | 23 | that's a lot. You know, he's really thinking |
| 24 | A. I was telling him that I had a hard | 24 | he's ahead of everybody and he can do whatever |
| 25 | time finding more Rasta copy. And, you know, I | 25 | he wants. Good luck to you. And I sign. |


|  | 101 |  | 103 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | Q. "Bonne chance en tout cas" means | 2 | A. Yeah. |
| 3 | good luck in your case? | 3 | Q. Okay. And so between January 29th |
| 4 | A. Yes. | 4 | and the time -- |
| 5 | MR. BROOKS: Does it mean in your | 5 | MR. BROOKS: I'm sorry, that last |
| 6 | case or in any case? | 6 | line, does it say they're less rare but |
| 7 | A. "Bonne chance" in any case, whatever | 7 | very beautiful? |
| 8 | happens, "bonne chance" to you. | 8 | A. Yeah, very beautiful. |
| 9 | Q. And then there is a response by | 9 | MR. BROOKS: And less rare? |
| 10 | Patrick Caniou, what appears to be a one-line | 10 | A. Yes. |
| 11 | response at 16:03 on the 29th? | 11 | Q. Between that e-mail on January 29th |
| 12 | A. Yeah. | 12 | and the time that he came to your gallery to see |
| 13 | Q. And that's one line with two | 13 | the show did you have any e-mail contact with |
| 14 | question marks. | 14 | him? |
| 15 | A. Yeah. He's saying thank you on my | 15 | A. No, but this refreshed my memory. |
| 16 | book, interesting, new, because he wants to sell | 16 | When this happened, as you could |
| 17 | that collection of book, so he's asking if I'm | 17 | see, we are not corresponding. He's talking |
| 18 | interested in those books, his big book | 18 | about his whole collection and I'm talking about |
| 19 | collection. | 19 | the Rasta. |
| 20 | Q. And then you respond to him by | 20 | So I called him. I remember I call |
| 21 | e-mail, which I don't see has time on it, but | 21 | him. And we talk about the whole thing, you |
| 22 | it's also on the 29th and it says "oui bien | 22 | know, and -- well, he was going on and on with |
| 23 | sur"? | 23 | his lawsuit. And, you know, we talk about a |
| 24 | A. Yeah. | 24 | book and everything. |
| 25 | Q. And that consists of -- | 25 | And I say to him, you know, I saw a |
|  | 102 |  | 104 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | A. Yes, of course. I mean that means | 2 | few months ago I try to call you, you know, I |
| 3 | I will be interested to see your collection. | 3 | heard about what was happening in the gallery, |
| 4 | I buy some online. I already bought 40 Rasta | 4 | I tried to call you, you never call me back. |
| 5 | and we sold them. | 5 | Q. Did he say why he didn't call you |
| 6 | "En revanche" means on the other | 6 | back? |
| 7 | side l've not been very lucky with Surfer | 7 | A. You know, he said, you know, my |
| 8 | because they are very hard to find, very | 8 | cellular phone sometimes, you know -- |
| 9 | difficult to find. But every week I am looking | 9 | Q. Your what? |
| 10 | for -- "un par si par la" means everywhere I | 10 | A. He told me that sometimes he doesn't |
| 11 | can. Rasta people adore the book, really love | 11 | get all messages, you know. |
| 12 | it. Can you do a reprint of the book. | 12 | Q. Okay. |
| 13 | Q. And then we have at the very top his | 13 | A. I mean, you know, and because of the |
| 14 | response to you, which I think we established | 14 | holiday I guess. Also in St. Barths I don't |
| 15 | before was at 10:31 on January 29. | 15 | have -- my 917 phone in New York doesn't work |
| 16 | And now with that leading into this | 16 | there. So I don't know -- we didn't communicate |
| 17 | can you then translate those four lines for us, | 17 | really. |
| 18 | please? | 18 | But what I told him at that moment |
| 19 | A. Yeah. | 19 | is of course I want to carry the book, I think |
| 20 | For Rasta you can call my publisher | 20 | you should try to do a reprint because it's a |
| 21 | Powerhouse Book. In reality I was mentioning my | 21 | very important book. |
| 22 | private collection, the big collection, with | 22 | And I say to him, anyway, now I |
| 23 | beautiful, rare, vintage pieces and some not as | 23 | understand more what happened because I didn't |
| 24 | beautiful. | 24 | know when this happened, I didn't know if you |
| 25 | Q. And that's it? | 25 | worked with him. |


|  | 105 |  | 107 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | But I told him that there was no way | 2 | Q. Are you still interested in doing |
| 3 | I could do a Rasta show because it looks like | 3 | a show with Mr. Cariou? |
| 4 | I'm trying to capitalize on, you know, the | 4 | A. I don't know after all this, you |
| 5 | Richard Prince notoriety and say, wow, he did | 5 | know. |
| 6 | this, I'm going to do a show now and show the | 6 | Q. You are still interested in selling |
| 7 | Rasta work, it looks like l'm trying to take | 7 | the Yes Rasta book? |
| 8 | advantage of the situation. And I say there's | 8 | A. The book I still sell it. I always |
| 9 | no way I can do a show right now. | 9 | sold the book, you know, because I have a |
| 10 | Q. And in that conversation did | 10 | bookstore and, you know. So l love the book, |
| 11 | Mr. Cariou try to persuade you to proceed with | 11 | but doing a show, I'm not sure. |
| 12 | the show? | 12 | Q. Anything else in that conversation |
| 13 | A. At the time I think he was very | 13 | that you had with him that you haven't told us |
| 14 | preoccupied by the whole situation more than | 14 | about? |
| 15 | focusing on my conversation. | 15 | A. No. I think that's it. I don't |
| 16 | Q. Preoccupied by the lawsuit? | 16 | think I remember anything else. |
| 17 | A. Yes. | 17 | Q. Were there any other conversations |
| 18 | Q. Rather than focusing on your show in | 18 | that you had between that telephone conversation |
| 19 | your conversation? | 19 | and the time he came to your gallery in the |
| 20 | A. Yes, he was very preoccupied with it | 20 | spring of '09? |
| 21 | because it was something very important for him. | 21 | A. I don't -- no, I don't think so. |
| 22 | And I kind of apologize and say, | 22 | Q. And that conversation was -- these |
| 23 | you know what, this has been -- you know, since | 23 | e-mails are in late January? |
| 24 | November I heard, I call you, you didn't call me | 24 | A. Mm-hmm. |
| 25 | back, and I was thinking, you know, I really | $\underline{25}$ | Q. Was that conversation shortly after |
|  | 106 |  | 108 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | love your work but now if I do a show today it | 2 | the e-mail exchange, do you recall? |
| 3 | looks like I'm taking advantage. | 3 | A. Yes. I call him because I really |
| 4 | Because if there is a New York Times | 4 | wanted -- because we e-mail sometime, you know, |
| 5 | Magazine talking about, you know, this, you get | 5 | he's talking about his collection, I want the |
| 6 | a writeup and I don't want to be the one trying | 6 | Rasta. |
| 7 | to capitalize on the success of that or not the | 7 | Because I had mentioned early on |
| 8 | success or the bad press, you know. Sol say I | 8 | that the book was running out, he shouid do a |
| 9 | don't want to do the show. | 9 | reprint, he should talk to Powerhouse, because |
| 10 | Q. What did he say in response to that? | 10 | I cannot go to the publisher and say can you |
| 11 | A. You know, he asked me will you do | 11 | reprint that book. |
| 12 | any other show. And I say, well, maybe, you | 12 | Q. And that conversation took place, |
| 13 | know, we have to talk. | 13 | would it be fair to say, around the end of |
| 14 | Q. And did you have a discussion, for | 14 | January or beginning of February? |
| 15 | example, about doing a show relating the surfer | 15 | A. Yes, beginning of February probably. |
| 16 | portraits that you talked about putting in the | 16 | Q. And in that conversation did you |
| 17 | show with the Rastas? | 17 | have a more complete conversation about his |
| 18 | A. You know, at the time we didn't go | 18 | collection and him sending you the collection? |
| 19 | anywhere. The proof is like today I still | 19 | MR. BROOKS: I'm sorry, which |
| 20 | haven't gotten anything from him. | 20 | collection? |
| 21 | Q. You haven't gotten any prints from | 21 | MR. HAYES: His collection of his |
| 22 | him or anything? | 22 | own books. |
| 23 | A. Today I mean I'm trying to get | 23 | A. At the time he say to me that the |
| 24 | things, but I think this has to be probably | 24 | books were in the basement in Brooklyn, that his |
| 25 | over, you know. I don't know the situation. | 25 | next trip to New York he will, you know, go |


|  | 109 |  | 111 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | through the books and give them to me and -- | 2 | had with Mr. Cariou about not going forward with |
| 3 | which he did last week actually. | 3 | the show at that time, did you discuss that with |
| 4 | Q. So the contacts in ' 09 were the | 4 | anyone else? |
| 5 | e-mail exchange, the phone conversation, the | 5 | A. Probably Polly Campbell who worked |
| 6 | visit to the studio? | 6 | with me, P-O-L-L-Y, C-A-M-B-E-L-L, because she's |
| 7 | A. Yeah. | 7 | my closest person, you know, she's my assistant. |
| 8 | Q. And his bringing the books to you | 8 | Because she can follow up what I do every day. |
| 9 | last week? | 9 | Q. Do you remember having that |
| 10 | A. Yes. | 10 | conversation or are you just assuming you had |
| 11 | Q. Anything else? | 11 | one? |
| 12 | A. No, I don't recall anything else. | 12 | A. I remember informing her, you know, |
| 13 | Q. And after the telephone conversation | 13 | about what was going on. |
| 14 | in early February has there been any further | 14 | But, you know, it's a small office |
| 15 | discussion in any fashion of a show or not | 15 | so I work with her every day. So she knew since |
| 16 | having a show? | 16 | November what was going on, you know, about, you |
| 17 | A. No. | 17 | know, Gagosian and Richard Prince. |
| 18 | Q. Just so l'm clear, no other e-mails | 18 | So, you know, I have about 20 other |
| 19 | after this exchange of e-mails? | 19 | photographer, you know, that I-in five |
| 20 | A. I don't remember, no, I don't think | 20 | galleries. So it is true that Patrick was not |
| 21 | so. | 21 | always, you know, the conversation. |
| 22 | MR. BROOKS: By the way, I should | 22 | Q. Plenty of other things to do? |
| 23 | just say something for the record. | 23 | A. Yeah, especially at the end of the |
| 24 | We don't have the August e-mail | 24 | year because I had St. Barths and, you know. |
| 25 | that you marked as 1 because I told the | 25 | Q. Other than any conversation you |
|  | 110 |  | 112 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | witness -- that came from our production, | 2 | may have had with Ms. Campbell do you recall |
| 3 | and I told the witness they already have | 3 | discussing it with anyone else? |
| 4 | this one, so look for others. | 4 | A. My husband probably because, you |
| 5 | MR. HAYES: Right. | 5 | know, he doesn't take care of the operation of |
| 6 | MR. BROOKS: But she does have that | 6 | the gallery. But, you know, we discuss artists |
| 7 | one also. | 7 | and I tell him what I find, you know, the new |
| 8 | MR. HAYES: Okay, great. | 8 | artist or the exciting one. |
| 9 | BY MR. HAYES: | 9 | And, yeah, we talk about business |
| 10 | Q. Just for the record, you have, of | 10 | because he put some money into the business. |
| 11 | course, what we have marked as Exhibit 1, you | 11 | Q. And do you recall a specific |
| 12 | have that in your own records? | 12 | conversation with your husband about this? |
| 13 | A. I mean I've seen that e-mail. | 13 | A. No. The only thing I recall is the |
| 14 | Can I retrieve from my computer from | 14 | first time I heard about, you know, the |
| 15 | 2008? I don't know. | 15 | Gagosian, Richard Prince, was from my husband. |
| 16 | Q. Okay. But you had it or have it? | 16 | Q. Other than any conversations with |
| 17 | A. Yeah. | 17 | your husband did you discuss it with anyone else |
| 18 | Q. And you have the e-mails which we've | 18 | besides Ms. Campbell and your husband? |
| 19 | marked as Exhibit 2? | 19 | A. No. |
| 20 | A. Yes. | 20 | Q. And Mr. Cariou? |
| 21 | Q. And for e-mails that's it between | 21 | A. No. |
| 22 | you and Mr. Cariou? | 22 | Q. I'd like to go back to your finding |
| 23 | A. Yes. | 23 | out about the show, the Richard Prince show. |
| 24 | Q. No problem. | 24 | A. Yes. |
| 25 | In addition to the conversation you | 25 | Q. Which is entitled Canal Zone? |


|  | 113 |  | 115 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | A. Yes. | 2 | A. No, I didn't. I did not. |
| 3 | Q. So I'll refer to it as the Canal | 3 | Q. You saw the show was up and running |
| 4 | Zone show if that's okay? | 4 | at the time? |
| 5 | A. Yes, mm-hmm. | 5 | A. I saw on the website, yeah, but |
| 6 | Q. When did you first hear about the | 6 | there was some photograph I remember. |
| 7 | Canal Zone show? | 7 | Q. Do you remember, did you have any |
| 8 | A. I can't recall if it's -- it's in | 8 | further conversations with anyone else about the |
| 9 | November I think. I can't remember. | 9 | show other than what you've told us? |
| 10 | Q. 2008? | 10 | A. No. |
| 11 | A. 2008. | 11 | Q. Do you frequently go to art shows in |
| 12 | Q. Did you see the show yourself? | 12 | Chelsea? |
| 13 | A. No. | 13 | A. I have to be honest, interestingly, |
| 14 | Q. How did you hear about the show? | 14 | I don't. I have to say when I was in fashion I |
| 15 | A. My husband came home one evening | 15 | didn't go to fashion shows. I never have time. |
| 16 | and he had -- you know, he had heard through | 16 | You know, I work and I go home and I have kids |
| 17 | somebody from France, who was actually probably | 17 | so -- |
| 18 | a photographer, I can't remember, traveling in | 18 | Q. You're too busy? |
| 19 | New York who saw the show. | 19 | A. I do weekends sometimes, but I don't |
| 20 | And he probably knew Patrick's | 20 | have time. |
| 21 | work or new the Rasta and said, wow, that's | 21 | Q. Other than discussions with -- by |
| 22 | incredible, that French guy or Patrick, his | 22 | the way, without getting into the conversation |
| 23 | photograph is in the show with Richard Prince. | 23 | with Mr. Brooks or anyone else at this law firm, |
| 24 | So my husband told me. | 24 | when did you first hire him as your lawyer? |
| 25 | Q. Just so I'm clear, your husband told | 25 | A. Just yesterday I guess. |
|  | 114 |  | 116 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | you about a conversation he had with someone who | 2 | Q. So prior to hiring him as your |
| 3 | is in France who had seen the show? | 3 | lawyer yesterday had you ever spoken to |
| 4 | A. Yes. I think it's somebody who was | 4 | Mr. Brooks before? |
| 5 | in New York but living in France, somebody I | 5 | A. Two times he asked me if I was |
| 6 | didn't know actually. And he say, wow, you | 6 | called if I will be willing to participate or |
| 7 | should check it out because this is what I heard | 7 | give a deposition or an affidavit. I think |
| 8 | today. | 8 | that's the term. And I say yes, if you need me |
| 9 | Q. Your husband said this to you? | 9 | of course I will. |
| 10 | A. Yes. | 10 | Q. Any substantive discussion about |
| 11 | Q. What did you say to him, if you | 11 | what it will be about? |
| 12 | remember? | 12 | A. Any? |
| 13 | A. I say, well, I have to check it out, | 13 | Q. Substantive discussion about what it |
| 14 | it's weird. | 14 | will be about? |
| 15 | Q. And what, if anything, did you do | 15 | A. Until yesterday when I got more |
| 16 | after that? | 16 | detail, no. |
| 17 | A. After that I went on the Gagosian | 17 | Q. And any conversation with Mr. Brooks |
| 18 | website and there was some images. | 18 | before yesterday? |
| 19 | Q. And did you do anything further | 19 | A. No. Basically the only thing I |
| 20 | after that, did you go to the gallery, did you | 20 | remember Mr. Brooks was telling me that there |
| 21 | talk to anyone from the gallery? | 21 | was an e-mail about a show, and he ask me, you |
| 22 | MR. BROOKS: I'm sorry, I didn't | 22 | know, did you write an e-mail about doing a show |
| 23 | hear. | 23 | with Patrick, and I say, yes, yes, I was very |
| 24 | Q. Did you go to the gallery, did you | 24 | interested to do a show with him. |
| 25 | talk to anyone at the gallery? | 125 | Q. And would that be Exhibit 1? |


|  | 117 |  | 119 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | A. Yes, Exhibit 1. | 2 | I remember that. A lot of nude people and |
| 3 | Q. And did you subsequently give it to | 3 | drawings, that's really what I remember. |
| 4 | him? | 4 | Q. And that would have been December |
| 5 | MR. BROOKS: I got it from Patrick. | 5 | of '09? |
| 6 | Q. And other than Mr. Brooks and before | 6 | A. Yes. |
| 7 | yesterday did you speak to anybody else at this | 7 | Q. Have you ever read any books about |
| 8 | firm? | 8 | Richard Prince? |
| 9 | A. No. | 9 | A. No. No. |
| 10 | Q. Had you ever attended any exhibits | 10 | I mean I know his work a little bit. |
| 11 | that you can recall of works by Richard Prince? | 11 | Q. How do you know his work, from what |
| 12 | A. The only one I saw, so this year I | 12 | sources? |
| 13 | went to see -- oh, my God, I went uptown to see | 13 | A. I know his work from reading |
| 14 | a show, it was not Richard Prince, but I know | 14 | magazine or flipping through. I've seen some |
| 15 | Richard Prince was upstairs. | 15 | books of him, but because I'm more photographic |
| 16 | So I only saw that show, and that | 16 | and I know sometimes he mix photography and |
| 17 | was -- I think it was in December, but I'm | 17 | painting, I'm not super-familiar with his work, |
| 18 | trying to remember the photographer I saw. | 18 | except the Marlboro Man and certain things. |
| 19 | On Madison Avenue. | 19 | Q. I should have asked this earlier, |
| 20 | And there was a Richard Prince | 20 | but let me just go back one second. |
| 21 | exhibit on the top floor. | 21 | Have you ever studied art history? |
| 22 | Q. Was this at the Gagosian Gallery at | 22 | A. No, never. |
| 23 | 980 Madison? | 23 | Q. Have you ever taken any art courses |
| 24 | A. Yes, it was Gagosian Gallery, and it | 24 | at all? |
| 25 | was -- I can't remember the title of the show. | 25 | A. Never. |
|  | 118 |  | 120 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | It was a group show. And he was upstairs. But | 2 | Q. Other than the conversations that |
| 3 | not related to that. | 3 | you've described with Patrick regarding the |
| 4 | Q. So it was a show on the fifth and | 4 | Canal Zone -- with Mr. Cariou regarding the |
| 5 | sixth floors, and you went to the fifth floor? | 5 | Canal Zone exhibit and your husband, and perhaps |
| 6 | A. I'm trying to remember the name of | 6 | Ms. Campbell, have you spoken to anyone else |
| 7 | the show, which I should remember because I have | 7 | about the Canal Zone exhibit other than maybe |
| 8 | a book in the bookstore. | 8 | your attorney yesterday? |
| 9 | Q. Do you remember generally the type | 9 | A. Not that I recall. |
| 10 | of photography it was? | 10 | Q. And the decision to not go forward |
| 11 | A. Yeah, it's a woman, her name is -- | 11 | with the exhibit is only the conversations |
| 12 | I have a great memory, but I forgot her name. | 12 | you've already described to us previously? |
| 13 | She did a lot of photograph about her husband | 13 | A. Yes. |
| 14 | who is actually sick, and it's a lot of muscle | 14 | Q. No one else you've spoken to about |
| 15 | and they are like very interesting black and | 15 | it? |
| 16 | white photography. | 16 | A. No. |
| 17 | And when I saw that show, on top | 17 | Q. As of the time you left the |
| 18 | there was a Richard Prince and so I went and | 18 | voicemail for Mr. Cariou at the end of December |
| 19 | looked at it and it was drawing and painting. | 19 | of 2008 had he sent you any prints at all for |
| 20 | Q. So you actually went upstairs to | 20 | the show? |
| 21 | look at the Richard Prince show? | 21 | A. No. |
| 22 | A. Yes. | 22 | Q. By the time you had the e-mail |
| 23 | Q. And do you recall what the subject | 23 | exchange in January 29 of 2009 had he sent you |
| 24 | matter of the show was at all? | 24 | any prints for the show? |
| 25 | A. No. It was very sexual oriented. | 25 | A. No. |


|  | 121 |  | 123 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | Q. Have you yourself ever contacted | 2 | Q. And did he tell you the price point |
| 3 | Powerhouse about the number of sales of the | 3 | at which they were sold? |
| 4 | Yes Rasta book? | 4 | A. No. |
| 5 | MR. BROOKS: I don't understand the | 5 | MR. BROOKS: Objection, asked and |
| 6 | question. | 6 | answered. |
| 7 | Q. I'll rephrase it. | 7 | Q. Did he tell you how many? |
| 8 | Have you ever had any contacts with | 8 | A. No. |
| 9 | Powerhouse Books yourself? | 9 | Q. You decided not to proceed, at least |
| 10 | A. Except ordering books? | 10 | for the present, with the Cariou exhibit |
| 11 | Q. Yes. | 11 | regarding Yes Rasta photographs in or about |
| 12 | A. And usually it's not me, it's Polly | 12 | January of '09? |
| 13 | Campbell, she does all the ordering books, so | 13 | A. No, actually I decided the end of |
| 14 | she's the one who talk directly to them. | 14 | November, December, and I met -- at the time |
| 15 | Q. Does she actually order it by | 15 | when I saw the Richard Prince situation, I |
| 16 | calling them up and asking for the books? | 16 | committed with another photographer called Lyle |
| 17 | A. I know she call them and was trying | 17 | Owerko. I met him actually end of November |
| 18 | to get the rest of the Rasta. And there was a | 18 | about the same time that there was, you know, |
| 19 | fair in Brooklyn and Powerhouse had a big space, | 19 | the situation that I learned that Richard Prince |
| 20 | and I noticed they had some Surfer. So after | 20 | and Patrick Cariou had maybe done something |
| 21 | the fair we contacted them to try to get more | 21 | together. |
| 22 | copy, but they would not want to give their copy | 22 | So I decided to do my show in |
| 23 | of Surfer. So we could not get more books from | 123 | April with a different photographer called |
| 24 | them. | 24 | Lyle Owerko. And my goal was to replace |
| 25 | Q. But you personally never spoke to | 25 | probably Patrick with that work. And it's |
|  | 122 |  | 124 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | anybody at Powerhouse? | 2 | exactly what I did, I just opened my gallery |
| 3 | A. No, Polly Campbell did, my | 3 | with that show. |
| 4 | assistant. | 4 | Q. Just to make sure I didn't miss |
| 5 | Q. You had told us previously that | 5 | anything, when you say you learned about this |
| 6 | Mr. Cariou gave you some information about his | 6 | Canal Zone exhibition, that consisted of you |
| 7 | prior sales of prints. Did he give you | 7 | having had the conversation with your husband |
| 8 | specifics? He told you he sold some Surfer | 8 | and you going online? |
| 9 | prints, is that correct? | 9 | A. Yes. |
| 10 | A. He told me he sold both actually, | 10 | Q. And the conversation with |
| 11 | but he told me that he had a show about a surfer | 11 | Ms. Campbell? |
| 12 | in Paris. | 12 | A. Yes, exactly. |
| 13 | Q. And that he sold some of the Surfer | 13 | Q. Anything else? |
| 14 | prints? | 14 | A. No. |
| 15 | A. Yes. | 15 | MR. BROOKS: I'm not sure she said |
| 16 | Q. Did he tell you he sold some | 16 | she definitely had a conversation with |
| 17 | Yes Rasta prints? | 17 | Ms. Campbell. And she certainly didn't |
| 18 | A. He sold some Rasta prints, yeah. | 18 | say that's how she learned about it. |
| 19 | Q. Did he tell you to whom? | 19 | MR. HAYES: No, I understand. |
| 20 | A. Independent people, but it was not | 20 | BY MR. HAYES: |
| 21 | in a gallery. It was more independent of | 21 | Q. I think you said previously that |
| 22 | friends or collector, but not in a gallery | 22 | Ms. Campbell works for you? |
| 23 | setting. | 23 | A. Yes. |
| 24 | Q. Private sales? | 24 | Q. You speak to her frequently? |
| 25 | A. Private sales, if I remember. | 25 | A. Yes. |


|  | 125 |  | 127 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | Q. And you expect you did discuss this | 2 | selling about 30 prints from him. |
| 3 | with her? | 3 | Q. In the year 2009 how many prints in |
| 4 | A. Yes. | 4 | total did you sell? |
| 5 | Q. But don't perhaps remember a | 5 | A. In whole gallery? |
| 6 | specific conversation? | 6 | Q. Yes. |
| 7 | A. I probably told her that was | 7 | A. There was an artist where I sold |
| 8 | happening and that I will not do the show | 8 | about 189 exactly. |
| 9 | because, you know, in December I was already | 9 | Q. Who is that? |
| 10 | talking with a photographer. She was aware of | 10 | A. It's called James and Karla Murray, |
| 11 | it. She had met Lyle Owerko. | 11 | M-U-R-R-A-Y, and it's called Store Front. It's |
| 12 | We also had bought a book from him | 12 | coming with a book too, so we did book signing |
| 13 | that we were selling right away. | 13 | and show. I forgot to mention that show before. |
| 14 | Q. And you were intending to sell that | 14 | We are still selling their work. |
| 15 | in your bookstore? | 15 | It's real interesting work about all New York |
| 16 | A. Bookstore and eventually gallery. | 16 | store fronts. |
| 17 | Q. And the title of that book is? | 17 | Q. And what is the price point of those |
| 18 | A. And The Birds Sing, it's a book | 18 | photographs? |
| 19 | about 2011 what happened -- September 11, sorry. | 19 | A. \$2,500 and up. |
| 20 | This young photographer came to show | 20 | MR. BROOKS: Excuse me one second. |
| 21 | me with his work about September 11, which I was | 21 | Did you get the word "store front"? |
| 22 | not interested, and when I ask him what other | 22 | A. Store Front, yeah, the name of the |
| 23 | project he was working on he showed me the | 23 | show, and the book. |
| 24 | Samburu, the North Kenya civilization. | 24 | Q. In your gallery -- or galleries, but |
| 25 | And I immediately, you know, decided | 25 | focusing first on the Broome Street gallery, do |
|  | 126 |  | 128 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | to do a show with him because I knew I was not | 2 | you carry inventory of the photographs? |
| 3 | going to do Rasta. And I had Rasta such in my | 3 | A. Yes, we do. |
| 4 | head that it was the perfect, you know, | 4 | Q. And so you offer those for sale in |
| 5 | replacement. And I really like his work. | 5 | addition to whatever the currently-up show is, |
| 6 | Actually, he just won last week -- | 6 | if there is one? |
| 7 | there was 3,000 candidates in a big contest | 7 | A. Yes, definitely. |
| 8 | called Hasselblad contest. He's the winner this | 8 | Q. And where do you have them |
| 9 | year, and he was chosen from 3,000 people. | 9 | physically in the gallery? |
| 10 | So I knew that if I could not have | 10 | A. We have like a file, a flat file, |
| 11 | Rasta I had to have a replacement. And when I | 11 | so we have them there. Some are also framed. |
| 12 | saw his work I was thinking that's perfect, you | 12 | For example, we keep older show, you know, so we |
| 13 | know. | 13 | have inventory. I have also a huge space. |
| 14 | Q. And that's the show you told us | 14 | I have a 4,000-square-foot space in 255 Centre |
| 15 | about earlier which did in fact take place? | 15 | Street. So we keep inventory. |
| 16 | A. Yes, my opening show in April. | 16 | Q. And you keep inventory then in each |
| 17 | Q. And how did that show go? | 17 | of your galleries? |
| 18 | A. Very well actually. | 18 | A. Yes, because we work with also a lot |
| 19 | Q. Did you sell prints in the show? | 19 | of decorators, you know. |
| 20 | A. Yeah. | 20 | Q. And do you keep inventory primarily |
| 21 | Q. Do you have an average number of | 21 | of the artists you've shown or artists of a |
| 22 | prints you've sold from your photography shows? | 22 | broad spectrum? |
| 23 | A. In this case the prints start at | 23 | A. Only artists we are showing. |
| 24 | 2,500 up to 10,000. You know, it's still a | 24 | Q. Have you ever kept any inventory of |
| 25 | small gallery, but we are right now we have been | 25 | Patrick Cariou? |


|  | 129 | 131 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | A. No. | 2 | A. Yes. |
| 3 | Q. Have you ever asked him whether you | 3 | Q. And so you have conversations with |
| 4 | could carry inventory of Patrick Cariou? | 4 | them about photographs that might be appropriate |
| 5 | A. I've been trying. But, you know, he | 5 | for their decorating jobs? |
| 6 | wanted to do a show and then take it from there. | 6 | A. Correct. |
| 7 | Q. I see. But did you ask him at any | 7 | Q. Have you ever discussed with a |
| 8 | time after the -- withdrawn. | 8 | decorator the possibility of them buying Patrick |
| 9 | At any time since beginning of '09 | 9 | Cariou photographs from you? |
| 10 | have you asked him to give you inventory to | 10 | A. Never, except Robert Novogratz. |
| 11 | sell? | 11 | Q. And did you personally speak to |
| 12 | A. No. | 12 | Robert Novogratz about it? |
| 13 | Q. At any time in ' 08 did you ask him | 13 | A. Robert came to buy books from me and |
| 14 | to give you inventory to sell? | 14 | was interested in Patrick, and I ask him at the |
| 15 | A. No. | 15 | time to contact him and he contact him directly. |
| 16 | Q. Did he ever offer to give you | 16 | Q. Patrick contacted Mr. Novogratz? |
| 17 | inventory to sell other than discussions about | 17 | A. Mr. Novogratz went on Patrick's |
| 18 | the show? | 18 | website, contacted him and bought some |
| 19 | A. No. | 19 | photograph for a hotel in New Jersey. |
| 20 | Q. I think you referred to an artist by | 20 | Q. You personally have not spoken to |
| 21 | the name of Morlock who uses photography in art? | 21 | Mr. Novogratz about selling Patrick Cariou |
| 22 | A. Yes. | 22 | prints? |
| 23 | Q. And in some fashion she puts some | 23 | A. No, I was not involved in the |
| 24 | kind of images over the photographs, at least in | 24 | transaction at all. |
| 25 | part, is that fair to say? | 25 | Q. And so has there ever been a time |
|  | 130 |  | 132 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | A. I mean in the whole show 80 percent | 2 | when you personally went to anyone and offered |
| 3 | is painting and drawings, but she has two | 3 | to sell or try to get them to buy Patrick Cariou |
| 4 | photographs that are vintage photographs she | 4 | photographs? |
| 5 | bought, probably online, she blew up really big | 5 | A. Never. |
| 6 | and then she painted -- I guess it's black ink, | 6 | Q. Robert Novogratz came to your |
| 7 | she painted tattoo on the woman. | 7 | gallery? |
| 8 | Q. Have you ever had any other artists | 8 | A. Yes, correct. |
| 9 | who used photos together with other media in any | 9 | Q. And he was interested in Patrick |
| 10 | show? | 10 | Cariou? |
| 11 | A. Just Tony C., the surfer. | 11 | A. Yes. |
| 12 | Q. And that consisted of photographs of | 12 | Q. And what did he say to you about |
| 13 | his collage works? | 13 | being interested in Mr. Cariou? |
| 14 | A. Yeah, photograph, collage, any kind | 14 | A. He bought two books, loved his work |
| 15 | of paper clip or advertising or publicity that | 15 | and asked me if I knew him. And I say I would |
| 16 | he put in his journal and then it's translated | 16 | love to do a show with him, l'm in conversation, |
| 17 | into a photograph, yeah. | 17 | but I'm not representing him yet. |
| 18 | Q. Forgive me if I asked this, did you | 18 | And because Robert Novogratz is a |
| 19 | ever have a situation where you were thinking | 19 | friend and client, I said best thing is to go |
| 20 | about having an exhibit, other than Mr. Cariou, | 20 | directly and contact him, which he did. |
| 21 | that you did not go forward with, that you | 21 | And when Patrick was in New York |
| 22 | canceled? | 22 | he say to me, thank you, you know, I'm doing |
| 23 | A. Not so far. | 23 | something with Robert, that's very nice of you. |
| 24 | Q. You deal, I think you said, with | 24 | Q. And did he say what it was he was |
| 25 | decorators about photography? | 25 | doing with Robert? |


|  | 133 |  | 135 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | A. He told me that they were buying a | 2 | But no, never. |
| 3 | lot of prints for a hotel in New Jersey. | 3 | Q. Sitting here today has Mr. Cariou |
| 4 | Q. And did he tell you what subject | 4 | ever sent you prints of any photographs he would |
| 5 | matter those prints were? | 5 | like to have you sell? |
| 6 | A. I can't recall. I know they were | 6 | A. No. |
| 7 | related to the book, but I could not give you | 7 | MR. HAYES: I'd like to mark as |
| 8 | more detail. And I was not really indiscreet, | 8 | Defendant Celle Exhibit 3 a four-page |
| 9 | you know. | 9 | document, which I will represent I printed |
| 10 | Q. And the books that Mr. Novogratz | 10 | out off what I believe to be your website, |
| 11 | purchased from you were Yes Rasta books or some | 11 | and I'm not saying it's the entire |
| 12 | other books? | 12 | website, it's four pages from the website. |
| 13 | A. Yes Rasta and Surfer. | 13 | Let me have that marked, and then I |
| 14 | MR. HAYES: Can we take a break for | 14 | want to ask you a few questions about it. |
| 15 | a few minutes? | 15 | (Defendant's Exhibit 3, printout |
| 16 | (Recess taken: 12:19 p.m.) | 16 | from website, was marked for |
| 17 | (Proceedings resumed: 12:42 p.m.) | 17 | identification, as of this date.) |
| 18 | BY MR. HAYES: | 18 | Q. Take a moment to look through those |
| 19 | Q. As of this time do you represent | 19 | four pages. As I said before, 1 think this is |
| 20 | Mr. Cariou in any way in your view? | 20 | not a complete copy of your website. And I may |
| 21 | A. I was very committed, I wanted to | 21 | ask you if I can get a copy. |
| 22 | represent him. We agree on it but we never | 22 | Also, I notice in looking at this |
| 23 | really pursue it, no. | 23 | that some of the photocopying is not good, which |
| 24 | Q. You never got to an agreement? | 24 | I apologize for. But just take a look at it. |
| 25 | A. No. In general when I do a show | 25 | And the first question I would have |
|  | 134 |  | 136 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | with somebody -- when I do a show with an artist | 2 | is does this look like several pages from your |
| 3 | I do not do a show if I don't represent him, | 3 | website? |
| 4 | because it's very expensive to put a show | 4 | A. Yes, correct. |
| 5 | together. | 5 | Q. But there would be more to the |
| 6 | Q. Sure. | 6 | website pages? |
| 7 | As of this moment if Patrick Cariou | 7 | A. Yes. |
| 8 | wants to sell his prints to someone else he can | 8 | Q. And do you have a complete copy of |
| 9 | do so in your view? | 9 | the website pages, not saying here today, but do |
| 10 | A. He's allowed to. | 10 | you have them? |
| 11 | MR. BROOKS: Object to the form. | 11 | A. I never printed one, but I could. |
| 12 | Q. Have you had any discussions with | 12 | Q. And in order to print one would one |
| 13 | Mr. Cariou about him selling his work -- say | 13 | go to the different categories of about, news, |
| 14 | since the beginning of 2010, have you had any | 14 | blog, locations, artists, press, and contact, |
| 15 | discussions with Mr. Cariou about him selling | 15 | and if you printed out all of those you would |
| 16 | his work anywhere else? | 16 | have a complete? |
| 17 | A. No. | 17 | A. Correct. |
| 18 | Q. Did you have any discussions in | 18 | Q. Can I ask you, if you wouldn't |
| 19 | 2009, other than the conversation about the | 19 | mind -- and of course your attorney can take |
| 20 | decorator we talked about, Robert -- | 20 | this under advisement -- if you could just at |
| 21 | A. Novogratz. | 21 | some point print out a copy and ask Mr. Brooks |
| 22 | Q. - Novogratz, any discussions with | 22 | to give me a copy of it? |
| 23 | Mr. Cariou about him selling his work through | 23 | A. Definitely. |
| 24 | anyone else? | 24 | Q. Sometimes we have trouble with |
| 25 | A. Novogratz I think was in 2008. | 25 | different websites, people have trouble printing |


|  | 137 |  | 139 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | out the whole thing. I just want to see if I | 2 | A. Both. Some of them also have a |
| 3 | can get a complete. | 3 | book, some don't have a book. |
| 4 | Okay. The first page that I have | 4 | Q. So this first one with the two |
| 5 | here has some photographs of books and says | 5 | elephants, those artists have a book and sell |
| 6 | January Book Sale, correct? | 6 | prints? |
| 7 | A. Correct. | 7 | A. Yes, correct. |
| 8 | Q. And these are books that you're | 8 | Q. At your gallery? |
| 9 | offering as part of a sales -- were offering as | 9 | A. Yes. |
| 10 | part of a sales process, or are offering now as | 10 | Q. The next one over, what's the next |
| 11 | part of a sales process in January? | 11 | one? |
| 12 | A. Correct. | 12 | A. Sue Kwon. |
| 13 | Q. And one is a book about Africa? | 13 | Q. Again, sells both books and prints |
| 14 | A. Yes, correct. | 14 | at your gallery? |
| 15 | Q. By Leni Riefenstahl? | 15 | A. Yes, the book is called Street |
| 16 | A. Correct. | 16 | Level. |
| 17 | Q. Next is Matthew Rolston book? | 17 | Q. And what's the subject matter of |
| 18 | A. $\mathrm{Mm}-\mathrm{hmm}$. | 18 | that? |
| 19 | Q. Is that a fashion book? | 19 | A. It's New York, old neighborhood that |
| 20 | A. Yes, fashion. | 20 | were photographs starting in the '80s to today, |
| 21 | Q. Next one over, I'm sorry, I can't | 21 | different neighborhood. And I had a show for |
| 22 | read. Do you recognize it? | 22 | Sue Kwon actually in September. |
| 23 | A. Thomas Ruff, yeah. | 23 | Q. Next one over is? |
| 24 | Q. And the next one over is? | 24 | A. Wayne Levin. No book, but I |
| 25 | A. I can't remember. I mean I know | 25 | represent him and his work. He's from Hawaii. |
|  | 138 |  | 140 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | it's representing Eden, but I can't remember the | 2 | Q. So you sell prints of his? |
| 3 | name of the photographer. I have a blank. | 3 | A. Yes. |
| 4 | Q. The next page, which I think is | 4 | Q. And the subject matter is? |
| 5 | printed out when one goes to artists, as you can | 5 | A. Underwater photography. |
| 6 | see from the word "artist" being underlined, is | 6 | Q. Color? |
| 7 | this list artists you represent or have | 7 | A. Black and white mainly in my |
| 8 | represented? | 8 | gallery, but he also does color. |
| 9 | A. Correct. | 9 | Q. And have you done a show for him? |
| 10 | Q. And, again, l apologize for the bad | 10 | A. No, he's always part of group show. |
| 11 | copying. The one at the top left which shows | 11 | Q. And the first two that we just went |
| 12 | two elephants? | 12 | through, did you do shows with them? |
| 13 | A. Yes. | 13 | A. Sue Kwon I did a show. |
| 14 | Q. Who is the artist there? | 14 | Christo and Wilkinson I did a show |
| 15 | A. Christo -- Cyril Christo, and Marie | 15 | and book signing. |
| 16 | Wikinson. | 16 | Q. Next one over, the fourth one with |
| 17 | Q. Are those a husband-and-wife team? | 17 | the picture of a person on it, what's that one? |
| 18 | A. Correct, yeah. | 18 | A. Lyle Owerko. He's the person |
| 19 | Q. What do they show? | 19 | actually we replaced Patrick Cariou in April |
| 20 | A. They show the work from a book | 20 | 2009 opening. That's the Samburu project. No |
| 21 | called Walking Thunder. | 21 | book yet about that special work, but a show. |
| 22 | Q. And by the way, all these on this | 22 | Q. What's the one to the right? |
| 23 | page, are these all books or are these artists | 23 | A. Jean-Philippe Piter, underwater |
| 24 | who are selling prints in the gallery or | 24 | photography. He's from St. Barths. No show. |
| 25 | galleries? | 25 | I'm sorry, no book. Group show. Part of the |


|  | 141 |  | 143 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | surf show. | 2 | right now. |
| 3 | Q. And then on the left where it says | 3 | Q. Next one over is? |
| 4 | James and Karla Murray? | 4 | A. Alfons Alt, we don't have a show |
| 5 | A. Okay. We had a show in July and | 5 | yet. We are planning a show. I already |
| 6 | August 2009 at Centre Street, and there is a | 6 | received work from him. Now it's more about |
| 7 | book and a show. | 7 | finding the right moment. |
| 8 | Q. And those are store fronts? | 8 | Q. The next one? |
| 9 | A. Store fronts, yeah. | 9 | A. Magda Biernat. I have a show coming |
| 10 | Q. And next one over, Wolfgang? | 10 | out February 1st -- 2nd, sorry. And there is a |
| 11 | A. Wolfgang Ludes, he's an artist I | 11 | book to support her work. |
| 12 | represent mainly in St. Barths right now. So | 12 | Q. She's a photographer? |
| 13 | he has a lot of also scenery about water, beach, | 13 | A. She's a photographer, yeah. |
| 14 | sunset, and the horse. No book. | 14 | Q. And you sell her work as well? |
| 15 | Q. His work is all photography? | 15 | A. I sell her work as well, yeah. |
| 16 | A. All photography. | 16 | Q. And the next one is Tony -- |
| 17 | Q. And you sell prints of his work? | 17 | A. -- Caramanico. He's the surfer, the |
| 18 | A. Yes. | 18 | surf journal. |
| 19 | Q. Next one over? | 19 | Q. He does the photographs of his own |
| 20 | A. Burton Machen was part of the group | 20 | collages? |
| 21 | show from Surfer that I did when I opened the | 21 | A. Yes, correct. |
| 22 | gallery in 2009. | 22 | Q. And you've had a show with him? |
| 23 | Q. Right. | 23 | A. He was one of my first artists in |
| 24 | A. In the summer, July-August. | 24 | 2008. And I also made a catalog of his work. |
| 25 | No book, just representing his work. | 25 | Q. Okay. And the next one over is |
|  | 142 |  | 144 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | Antoine Verglas is my husband. I | 2 | Gabe? |
| 3 | represent his work, not exclusive, you know. A | 3 | A. Yeah, Gabe. Same thing, I have -- |
| 4 | lot of people are not exclusive in international | 4 | I'm planning a show for him. Right now I just |
| 5 | of course, but my husband he has different | 5 | have a few prints and, you know, we are trying |
| 6 | gallery. No book. | 6 | to put something together. |
| 7 | Vincent Fournier I did show in | 7 | Q. Does this pretty well describe most |
| 8 | October 2009. He has a book called The Space | 8 | of the major artists that you've had shows with |
| 9 | Project, and this is his work. So I represent | 9 | or represented so far? |
| 10 | him. | 10 | A. Yes. |
| 11 | Q. So all the way through that one | 11 | Q. And by the way, of these artists how |
| 12 | through Vincent Fournier, those are all | 12 | many of them are exclusive to you? |
| 13 | photographers? | 13 | A. I'm sorry? |
| 14 | A. Yes. | 14 | Q. Of these artists how many have an |
| 15 | Q. Now, we turn going down to the next | 15 | exclusive arrangement with you? |
| 16 | line with Jody Morlock is listed? | 16 | A. In New York I mean most of them are |
| 17 | A. Voila. | 17 | exclusive. I mean once you leave New York, you |
| 18 | Q. And she is an artist, in some cases | 18 | know, everybody is free. So it's only in |
| 19 | uses photographic materials, but she's an artist | 19 | New York they're all exclusive. |
| 20 | doing mixed media? | 20 | Q. I see. |
| 21 | A. Yes. | 21 | And do they all have written |
| 22 | Q. And you had a show of hers? | 22 | agreements with you? |
| 23 | A. Yeah. | 23 | A. Yes. |
| 24 | Q. Group show or individual show? | 24 | Q. They do. |
| 25 | A. Individual show. It's still on | 25 | And then the next page is the page |


|  | 145 |  | 147 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | that one gets when printing out about, that says | 2 | A. 255 Centre. |
| 3 | about the bookstore and gallery? | 3 | Q. And the next column says Continental |
| 4 | A. Yes. | 4 | Bounce by Magda Biernat? |
| 5 | Q. Again, not the best photocopy, but | 5 | A. Correct. |
| 6 | it talks generally in the first two paragraphs | 6 | Q. That's at 424 Broome? |
| 7 | about your galleries in general, referring to | 7 | A. Yes. |
| 8 | East Hampton and two galleries and a standalone | 8 | Q. And that's photography? |
| 9 | bookshop in New York City, right? | 9 | A. Mm -hmm. |
| 10 | A. That's correct. | 10 | Q. And the image below it says view the |
| 11 | Q. And it says that you have, in | 11 | images and there's a photograph below that? |
| 12 | addition to selling icons from Helmut Newton, | 12 | A. Yes. |
| 13 | Mary Ellen Mark, Nan Goldin, Richard Avedon, and | 13 | Q. Is that also her photography? |
| 14 | Robert Mapplethorpe, you've carried a number of | 14 | A. Bande-A-Part, actually it's missing |
| 15 | other volumes. That means you're selling | 15 | something. It's the show that I have right now |
| 16 | photography books by those artists? | 16 | that's being over in a week and being replaced |
| 17 | A. Correct. | 17 | by Magda. |
| 18 | Q. Are you selling their prints as well | 18 | Q. I see. |
| 19 | or just the books? | 19 | A. Bande-A-Part. |
| 20 | A. No, just the books. | 20 | Q. And then the right is the Samburu |
| 21 | One exception, Mary Ellen Mark, | 21 | show that we talked about? |
| 22 | I sell her prints in St. Barths, you know. | 22 | A. Correct. |
| 23 | Q. And then it says Clic shows that are | 23 | Q. And then beneath are two pictures |
| 24 | included, and then there's a reference to Lyle | 24 | there from that show? |
| 25 | Owerko's show? | 25 | A. Yeah. This picture there, I mean |
|  | 146 |  | 148 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | A. Mm -hmm. | 2 | it's the St. Barths show. It's a women's show |
| 3 | Q. The nomads of Northern Kenya, the | 3 | with - this is a photo of Mary Ellerı Mark. And |
| 4 | Samburu. And then it identifies the award that | 4 | in the show we have Amy Arbus and other women. |
| 5 | he won, correct? | 5 | Q. Just to have the record clear, |
| 6 | A. That's an old one, yeah. We don't | 6 | you're referring there to the picture showing a |
| 7 | have the new one yet. It should be there. | 7 | man and a woman with the man's arm around the |
| 8 | Q. And the new one again is what? | 8 | woman? |
| 9 | A. It's the Hasselblad 2009. | 9 | A. Yes. |
| 10 | It's actually already on our website | 10 | Q. And who is that by? |
| 11 | but on a different page. | 11 | A. Mary Ellen Mark. |
| 12 | Q. And the next one on the page is the | 12 | MR. BROOKS: Off the record. |
| 13 | news page, and that identifies a group show at | 13 | (Discussion off the record.) |
| 14 | 255 Centre? | 14 | BY MR. HAYES: |
| 15 | A. Correct. | 15 | Q. I just want to make sure I'm clear |
| 16 | Q. And who is in that show? | 16 | about one area. |
| 17 | A. Vincent Fournier, Antoine Verglas, | 17 | You had the discussion with |
| 18 | Karla Murray -- Karla and James Murray. | 18 | Mr. Cariou about doing a show, which we talked |
| 19 | Q. And I see below it there is a | 19 | about extensively. Had you had discussions with |
| 20 | picture of a Jody Morlock piece. Is she also in | 20 | him about selling his prints individually? |
| 21 | the same show at 255 Centre? | 21 | A. Selling his prints individually -- |
| 22 | A. I think that's current, so she's | 22 | MR. BROOKS: In connection with the |
| 23 | still there because the show is not changing | 23 | show or single prints? |
| 24 | until February 1st. | 24 | MR. HAYES: In general, single |
| 25 | Q. Her show is at what gallery? | 25 | prints, at any time. |


|  | 149 |  | 151 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | A. What I was assuming is once I would | 2 | A. Yeah, I'm not sure that he'd be |
| 3 | be like representing him I will do a show about | 3 | willing to participate. I'm not sure what kind |
| 4 | the Rasta. But I was interested in also the | 4 | of prints are available. |
| 5 | Surfer print. So in that case, of course I will | 5 | He showed me some prints but they |
| 6 | sell the Surfer print too. That was my | 6 | were very small. I need big prints. They are |
| 7 | understanding. | 7 | expensive. He needs to print them. I don't |
| 8 | Q. And he has never sent you the Surfer | 8 | know his situation financially, if he can afford |
| 9 | prints? | 9 | to print them, you know. That's all the detail. |
| 10 | A. If he had sent me the Surfer | 10 | You know, some photographer just |
| 11 | prints -- l've seen the Surfer prints. He | 11 | say, okay, you want to do a show, let's do it, |
| 12 | showed me the cover of the book. I've seen a | 12 | and I have the print. |
| 13 | few image but, you know, they don't belong to | 13 | With Patrick we never really went |
| 14 | me. | 14 | farther. And because of the situation now -- |
| 15 | Q. If he were to send you the Surfer | 15 | what is interesting right now is selling his |
| 16 | prints would you sell them, offer them for sale? | 16 | book. And I told him I will help him with that. |
| 17 | A. I mean I will have to think about | 17 | Q. The Rasta book? The Surfer book? |
| 18 | it. I cannot just maybe sell them randomly. | 18 | A. No, the collection of old books. |
| 19 | I would have to maybe organize a show. I have | 19 | And those two books I'm selling no matter what. |
| 20 | a show coming this summer of Surfer maybe. | 20 | Q. I apologize. So you told him you're |
| 21 | Q. Have you had any discussion with | 21 | interested in selling his collection or the |
| 22 | Mr. Cariou about including Surfer images in the | 22 | portion of his collection he's given you to |
| 23 | summer show? | 23 | review? |
| 24 | A. We talked about it before, yes, we | 24 | A. Voila. Right now actually l'm |
| 25 | did. | 25 | trying to review them, but they have probably -- |
|  | 150 |  | 152 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | Q. And what was the discussion about | 2 | he told me 400. I'm trying to do an inventory |
| 3 | it, what did you say to him and what did he say | 3 | and see what books I'm interested in, because I |
| 4 | to you? | 4 | cannot take the 400, you know. |
| 5 | A. I wanted to know if he had, you | 5 | Q. I won't ask a lot of questions about |
| 6 | know, the image, what kind of image he had, and | 6 | this, but l just wanted to know, have you or |
| 7 | if it was consistent enough, you know, because | 7 | your husband ever been involved in any lawsuits? |
| 8 | so far l've not seen really many prints of his | 8 | A. Yes, I had been. |
| 9 | works. I have seen the book but I have not seen | 9 | Q. What lawsuits have you been involved |
| 10 | all the prints. | 10 | in? |
| 11 | Q. But any substantive discussions, | 11 | A. It was when I left Calypso, my |
| 12 | detailed discussions about it? | 12 | previous company. I resign for good cause. And |
| 13 | A. I mean I always told him that, you | 13 | there was a lawsuit, and it was settled, you |
| 14 | know, I would love to do something with the | 14 | know. |
| 15 | Surfer, you know. And I think probably it will | 15 | Q. Has your husband ever been involved |
| 16 | happen. I don't guarantee. | 16 | in a lawsuit? He was involved in that lawsuit I |
| 17 | I know right now his focus is | 17 | guess? |
| 18 | this situation, so I never really got like a | 18 | A. Actually was he involved directly or |
| 19 | 100 percent answer. | 19 | indirectly? Yes, I think he was involved as a |
| 20 | But we discussed that before, | 20 | partner, you know, in the company. |
| 21 | because I mean Yes Rasta is a problem, but the | 21 | Q. Has he been in any other lawsuits |
| 22 | Surfer has no problem. You know, it's very | 22 | that you know? |
| 23 | independent from this. | 23 | A. Not that I know of. |
| 24 | Q. So when you say you never got a | 24 | MR. HAYES: I have no further |
| 25 | 100 percent answer, you mean from Mr. Cariou? | 25 | questions. |


|  | 153 |  | 155 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | MS. HAMMERMAN: I have no questions. | 2 | MS. HAMMERMAN: Join. |
| 3 | MR. BROOKS: I just have a few. | 3 | Q. You can answer. |
| 4 | EXAMINATION BY | 4 | A. I wish. It's hard to say. |
| 5 | MR. BROOKS: | 5 | I wish, I would be very happy today. |
| 6 | Q. Ms. Celle, earlier today you | 6 | Q. And the prices again would have been |
| 7 | testified that if you had done the show for | 7 | between what and what? |
| 8 | Mr. Cariou I believe you said there would have | 8 | A. First price around 3,000, the most |
| 9 | been 30 to 40 prints, is that right? | 9 | expensive, the biggest format I would say 15,000 |
| 10 | A. Correct. | 10 | to 20. |
| 11 | Q. Of different sizes? | 11 | Q. Now, just to be clear, you've talked |
| 12 | A. Different sizes. | 12 | a lot about Lyle -- Owerko? |
| 13 | Q. Now, for any given photograph that | 13 | A. Owerko, yeah. |
| 14 | you had a print of would there only have been | 14 | Q. That was your first show? |
| 15 | one for sale or would there have been more than | 15 | A. Yes. |
| 16 | one for sale? | 16 | Q. At the 424 Broome Street gallery? |
| 17 | A. Okay. What we discussed with | 17 | A. Yes. |
| 18 | Patrick was the edition, because that's a very | 18 | Q. And when you were talking to Patrick |
| 19 | important question. So for each print we were | 19 | was he going to be the first show before you |
| 20 | thinking a series of ten photograph. | 20 | replaced him with Lyle? |
| 21 | Q. And would those have remained for | 21 | A. Yes, Patrick was the opening show. |
| 22 | sale after the show was over? | 22 | Q. And can you explain again what your |
| 23 | A. Yes. | 23 | idea was that you discussed with Patrick about |
| 24 | Q. You would have kept them in | 24 | having a book signing at his show? |
| 25 | inventory? | 25 | A. Usually, I mean it's really more |
|  | 154 |  | 156 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | A. Yes. The way it works is people buy | 2 | powerful when you are able to present the work |
| 3 | sometime at the show. | 3 | of an artist and there is a book to validate the |
| 4 | MR. HAYES: I'm just going to object | 4 | work. |
| 5 | to the question. Calls for speculation. | 5 | I was very surprised that -- in |
| 6 | MS. HAMMERMAN: Join. | 6 | Europe his work is very well-known of course, |
| 7 | Q. Goon. | 7 | because he's French I guess. I really wanted to |
| 8 | A. Also people buy the print at the | 8 | capitalize for, you know, the fact that there |
| 9 | show because there is only one print people | 9 | was that beautiful book. And, you know, the |
| 10 | order, you know, people want the same image, so | 10 | book was very helpful in terms of picking out |
| 11 | we have to print it for them. | 11 | all the photograph and the portrait. |
| 12 | Q. So if there were 30 to 40 photos how | 12 | Q. And which book are you talking about |
| 13 | many copies would there have been of each one | 13 | now? |
| 14 | that you would have offering for sale? | 14 | A. Yes Rasta. |
| 15 | MR. HAYES: Again, object, the | 15 | Q. So again, how many copies were you |
| 16 | question calls for speculation, and form. | 16 | planning to have at the book signing? |
| 17 | MS. HAMMERMAN: Form. | 17 | A. Usually in a book signing I can sell |
| 18 | Q. You can answer. | 18 | from -- I will say an event like that, 50 to |
| 19 | A. At the show I was issuing one of | 19 | 200. |
| 20 | each but, you know, you could make 30 to 40 by | 20 | I had a book signing where I sold |
| 21 | ten, you know. | 21 | 400 books, but that was Patrick Demarchelier. |
| 22 | Q. So there could have been 300 to 400 | 22 | He's much more famous. |
| 23 | that you would have sold? | 23 | But usually guaranteed 50 books. |
| 24 | MR. HAYES: Objection, calls for | 24 | But, you know, up to 200, and the book stays in |
| 25 | speculation. Objection to form. | 25 | the gallery anyway and the show too, so. |


|  | 157 |  | 159 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | Q. And why was it that you -- I think | 2 | or contemporary photography, but this was a show |
| 3 | you said he was going to ask Powerhouse to | 3 | that I thought could have a wide audience, but |
| 4 | reprint the book I think you said? | 4 | especially in the entertainment business because |
| 5 | What was the reason for that? | 5 | of the nature of -- you know, you don't sell the |
| 6 | MR. HAYES: Objection. I don't | 6 | Rasta and the marijuana to the same people that |
| 7 | think it states the testimony correctly. | 7 | necessarily want something for their children's |
| 8 | MS. HAMMERMAN: Join. | 8 | room. |
| 9 | MR. BROOKS: I think she said that. | 9 | So it was I think something very |
| 10 | A. I was the one telling him because | 10 | interesting that when I start looking I really |
| 11 | it's not in my power to go to Powerhouse and | 11 | look to see there was work very similar, you |
| 12 | tell them to reprint the book. | 12 | know, and I didn't find anything on the Rasta |
| 13 | So I was having a conversation with | 13 | because I think it's very difficult to |
| 14 | Patrick to tell him you should really push them | 14 | infiltrate that community and be able to live |
| 15 | to reprint that book, but not only that book, | 15 | with them and take their photo. It's something |
| 16 | the Surfer book too. | 16 | very -- like the Samburu, the same thing. |
| 17 | Q. Now, you don't represent Patrick, | 17 | You know, tourists don't go to that |
| 18 | correct? | 18 | place. He only had access to that place because |
| 19 | A. I don't. | 19 | he worked for the United Nations. |
| 20 | Q. But if you had had a show you would | 20 | Q. This is in northern Kenya? |
| 21 | have entered into a contract to be his agent? | 21 | A. North Kenya, yeah. |
| 22 | MR. HAYES: Objection, calls for | 22 | Q. Did you say that those photos were |
| 23 | speculation. Object to the form. | 23 | similar to the Yes Rasta photos? |
| 24 | MS. HAMMERMAN: Join. | 24 | A. For me it was similar approach in |
| 25 | Q. Is that correct? | 25 | the term that it's a certain civilization that's |
|  | 158 |  | 160 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | A. I would because, as I mentioned | 2 | kind of disappearing one day and you cannot |
| 3 | before, you know, a show -- just framing the | 3 | really take their photograph except if you get |
| 4 | show costs between 20 and 30-thousand dollars. | 4 | their trust and you are able to spend time with |
| 5 | So when you start investing it's a long-term | 5 | them and live with their family. |
| 6 | reward. So I sign the photographer. If not, | 6 | And that's what they both did. It's |
| 7 | I don't do the show. | 7 | a very similar work in different places. |
| 8 | Q. Finally, you said something in one | 8 | Q. They both meaning Patrick Cariou and |
| 9 | of your answers to the effect that you knew | 9 | Lyle -- |
| 10 | people in the entertainment business, do you | 10 | A. And Lyle Owerko, yeah. |
| 11 | remember saying that? | 11 | Q. I have nothing further. |
| 12 | A. Yes, correct. | 12 | BY MR. HAYES: |
| 13 | MS. HAMMERMAN: Objection. | 13 | Q. I have couple questions coming out |
| 14 | MR. HAYES: Objection, form. | 14 | of Mr. Brooks' questions. |
| 15 | Q. What significance, if any, did that | 15 | First, about Mr. Owerko and |
| 16 | have with respect to these Yes Rasta prints? | 16 | Mr. Cariou, so in your view they both document |
| 17 | A. Okay. Because of the different show | 17 | certain civilizations that may be passing? |
| 18 | I've been doing, I know coming from fashion I | 18 | A. Definitely. |
| 19 | have all kind of different customers, so of | 19 | Q. Did you ever give Mr. Cariou a draft |
| 20 | course I have the fashion people. | 20 | contract for him to review or sign? |
| 21 | But I'm really connected with a lot | 21 | A. No, no. It didn't go so far. |
| 22 | of people in the music industry. And I won't | 22 | Q. Of the other photographers -- you |
| 23 | sell -- you know, the Rasta for me was directly | 23 | spoke to Mr. Cariou about doing a series of the |
| 24 | addressed to this kind of people. | 24 | prints? |
| 25 | Like in the Hamptons I sell surfer | 25 | A. Sorry? |


|  | 161 |  | 163 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | Q. You spoke to Mr. Cariou about doing | 2 | those. |
| 3 | a series of the prints, if there was to be a | 3 | MR. HAYES: No further questions. |
| 4 | show, that is to say more than one of each | 4 | Thank you very much. |
| 5 | print? | 5 | MR. BROOKS: Dara, do you have |
| 6 | A. Definitely. | 6 | anything? |
| 7 | Q. And what did you say to him and what | 7 | MS. HAMMERMAN: No. |
| 8 | did he say to you about that? | 8 | MR. BROOKS: I have nothing else. |
| 9 | A. What I ask him is if he had any | 9 | THE WITNESS: Thank you. |
| 10 | printed from the book, and he said his printer | 10 | MR. HAYES: Thank you. |
| 11 | was in New York, that he had some prints | 11 | MR. BROOKS: Thank you very much. |
| 12 | available. | 12 | (Time noted: 1:12 p.m.) |
| 13 | But if I was to choose certain image | 13 |  |
| 14 | he might have to print them for me, and because | 14 |  |
| 15 | of the format, we wanted to go really big, like | 15 | CHRISTIANE CELLE |
| 16 | 80 by 90, big format, these would have to be | 16 |  |
| 17 | printed. | 17 | Subscribed and sworn to |
| 18 | Q. Did you have any specific discussion | 18 | before me this ___ day |
| 19 | as to any individual photographs as to how many | 19 | of ___ 2010. |
| 20 | of each would be produced? | 20 |  |
| 21 | A. For the show, only one of each. | 21 |  |
| 22 | The situation was some format were really big | 22 |  |
| 23 | and needed to be printed. He only had, if I | 23 |  |
| 24 | remember, images that were like 20 by 30 . That | 24 |  |
| 25 | was the biggest sizes he had. I don't think he | 25 |  |
|  | 162 |  | 164 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 |  |
| 2 | had anything bigger. | 2 | CERTIFICATE |
| 3 | And I needed at the time at least | 3 |  |
| 4 | three times the size on certain images. | 4 | STATE OF NEW YORK ) |
| 5 | Q. And talking about other artists, | 5 | )ss: |
| 6 | other photographers, what is the most of any one | 6 | COUNTY OF NEW YORK) |
| 7 | series of prints that you've sold from any other | 7 |  |
| 8 | photographer? | 8 | I, BRYAN NILSEN, a Notary Public |
| 9 | A. It's about the store front, it's | 9 | within and for the State of New York, do |
| 10 | still selling. Right now it's probably | 11 | That CHRISTIANE CELLE, the witne |
| 11 | 90-something. | 11 | whose deposition is hereinbefore set |
| 12 | Q. And after that how many - what's | 13 | forth, was duly sworn by me arid that such |
| 13 | the next most you've sold? | 14 | deposition is a true record of the |
| 14 | A. You know, it all depends like if a | 15 | testimony given by such witness. |
| 15 | show is new. Like I have a new show right now, | 16 | I further certify that I am not |
| 16 | ten, you know. It all depends the price. | 17 | related to any of the parties to this |
| 7 | Q. And what price point was that? | 18 | action by blood or marriage and that I am |
| 18 | A. The one that I sold ten right now | 19 | in no way interested in the outcome of |
| 19 | it's a \$6,000 one. | 20 | this matter. |
| 20 | Q. And the show by Mr. Owerko, how many | 21 | IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto |
| 21 | of those have you sold | 22 | set my hand this $\qquad$ day of January, 2010. |
| 22 | A. Probably around 30 of the biggest | 23 |  |
| 23 | one. And then I'm still selling them, you know. | 24 |  |
| 24 | And then he has a smaller format that he did |  | BRYAN NILSEN, RPR |
| 25 | special edition, you know, like a few dozen of | 25 |  |


|  | 165 |  | 167 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | ------------------ I ${ }^{\text {I }}$ | 2 | DEPOSITION ERRATA SHEET |
| 3 | WITNESS EXAMINATION BY PAGE | 3 | Page No.___Line No.___Change to: |
| 4 | CHRISTIANE CELLE MR. HAYES................ 6 | 4 |  |
| 5 | MR. BROOKS.............. 153 | 5 | Reason for change: |
| 6 |  | 6 | Page No.___Line No.___Change to: |
| 7 |  | 7 |  |
| 8 |  | 8 | Reason for change: |
| 9 | ------------ INFORMATION REQUESTS ----------- | 9 | Page No $\qquad$ Line No. $\qquad$ Change to: |
| 10 | TO BE FURNISHED: PAGE | 10 |  |
| 11 | Number of copies of Yes Rasta sold.......... 36 | 11 | Reason for change: |
| 12 |  | 12 | Page No.___Line No.___Change to: |
| 13 |  | 13 |  |
| 14 |  | 14 | Reason for change: |
| 15 | ----------------- EXHIBITS ---------------- | 15 | Page No.___Line No.___Change to: |
| 16 | DEFENDANT'S FORID. | 16 |  |
| 17 | 1 E-mail exchange....................... 54 | 17 | Reason for change: |
| 18 | 2 Series of e-mails..................... 73 | 18 | Page No.___Line No.___Change to: |
| 19 | 3 Printout from website................. 135 | 19 |  |
| 20 |  | 20 | Reason for change: |
| 21 | ** EXHIBITS RETAINED BY COUNSEL ** | 21 | Page No.___Line No.___Change to: |
| 22 |  | 22 |  |
| 23 |  | 23 | Reason for change: |
| 24 |  | 24 | SIGNATURE: $\qquad$ DATE: |
| 25 |  | 25 | CHRISTIANE CELLE |
|  | 166 |  | 168 |
| 1 | Celle | 1 | Celle |
| 2 | DEPOSITION ERRATA SHEET | 2 | DEPOSITION ERRATA SHEET |
| 3 | Assignment No. 307077 | 3 | Page No. $\qquad$ Line No. $\qquad$ Change to: |
| 4 | Case Caption: PATRICK CARIOU | 4 |  |
| 5 | vs. RICHARD PRINCE, et al. | 5 | Reason for change: |
| 6 | DECLARATION UNDER PENALTY OF PERJURY | 6 | Page No.__Line No.___Change to: |
| 7 | 1 declare under penalty of perjury | 7 |  |
| 8 | that I have read the entire transcript of | 8 | Reason for change: |
| 9 | my Deposition taken in the captioned | 9 | Page No.__Line No.___Change to: |
| 10 | matter or the same has been read to me, | 10 |  |
| 11 | and the same is true and accurate, save | 11 | Reason for change: |
| 12 | and except for changes and/or corrections, | 12 | Page No.___Line No.___Change to: |
| 13 | if any, as indicated by me on the | 13 |  |
| 14 | DEPOSITION ERRATA SHEET hereof, with the | 14 | Reason for change: |
| 15 | understanding that I offer these changes | 15 | Page No.___Line No.___Change to: |
| 16 | as if still under oath. | 16 |  |
| 17 |  | 17 | Reason for change: |
| 18 | CHRISTIANE CELLE | 18 | Page No.___Line No.___Change to: |
| 19 |  | 19 |  |
| 20 | Subscribed and sworn to on the ____ day of | 20 | Reason for change: |
| 21 | $\ldots$ _ 2010, before me, | 21 | Page No.___Line No.___Change to: |
| 22 |  | 22 |  |
| 23 |  | 23 | Reason for change: |
| 24 | Notary Public, | 24 | SIGNATURE:___DATE: |
| 25 | in and for the State of | 25 | CHRISTIANE CELLE |


[^0]:    Valley Reporting Service, Inc. (845) 331-4020

