

UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE SIXTH CIRCUIT

No. 10-3171

**FILED**  
**Aug 16, 2011**  
LEONARD GREEN, Clerk

NATIONAL AIR TRAFFIC CONTROLLERS ASSOCIATION, MEBA, AFL-CIO;  
DAVID CLINKSCALE; MARGARET GRAHAM; DAVID M. KHANOYAN,  
Plaintiffs - Appellants,

v.

SECRETARY OF THE DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION; JANE GARVEY,  
Administrator, Federal Aviation Administration,  
Defendants - Appellees.

Before: KENNEDY, SILER, and McKEAGUE, Circuit Judges.

**JUDGMENT**

On Appeal from the United States District Court  
for the Northern District of Ohio at Cleveland.

THIS CAUSE was heard on the record from the district court and was argued by  
counsel.

IN CONSIDERATION WHEREOF, it is ORDERED that the judgment of the district  
court is AFFIRMED.

**ENTERED BY ORDER OF THE COURT**

---

Leonard Green, Clerk