

NOTE: This disposition is nonprecedential.

**United States Court of Appeals  
for the Federal Circuit**

---

**ST. CLAIR INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY  
CONSULTANTS INC.,**  
*Plaintiff-Appellee*

v.

**TOSHIBA AMERICA INC.,  
TOSHIBA CORPORATION, TOSHIBA AMERICA  
INFORMATION SYSTEMS, INC.,**  
*Defendants-Appellants*

**APPLE INC.,**  
*Defendant*

---

2016-1355

---

Appeal from the United States District Court for the  
District of Delaware in No. 1:09-cv-00354-KAJ, Circuit  
Judge Kent A. Jordan.

---

**JUDGMENT**

---

MICHAEL E. JOFFRE, Kellogg, Huber, Hansen, Todd,  
Evans & Figel, PLLC, Washington, DC, argued for plain-  
tiff-appellee. Also represented by JOANNA ZHANG; ARTHUR  
A. GASEY, OLIVER YANG, Niro Law, Ltd., Chicago, IL.

JEFFREY K. SHERWOOD, Blank Rome LLP, Washington, DC, argued for defendants-appellants. Also represented by CHARLES J. MONTERIO, JR., GABRIELLA E. ZICCARELLI.

---

THIS CAUSE having been heard and considered, it is

ORDERED and ADJUDGED:

PER CURIAM (TARANTO, BRYSON, and STOLL, *Circuit Judges*).

**AFFIRMED. See Fed. Cir. R. 36.**

ENTERED BY ORDER OF THE COURT

November 8, 2016

Date

/s/ Peter R. Marksteiner

Peter R. Marksteiner  
Clerk of Court