

NOTE: This disposition is nonprecedential.

**United States Court of Appeals  
for the Federal Circuit**

---

**CREATIVE TECHNOLOGY LTD., CREATIVE LABS,  
INC.,**  
*Appellants*

v.

**INTERNATIONAL TRADE COMMISSION,**  
*Appellee*

**GOOGLE LLC, MOTOROLA MOBILITY LLC,  
LENOVO (UNITED STATES) INC., LENOVO  
GROUP LTD., BLACKBERRY LTD., BLACKBERRY  
CORPORATION, HTC CORPORATION, HTC  
AMERICA, INC., LG ELECTRONICS, INC., LG  
ELECTRONICS U.S.A., INC., LG ELECTRONICS  
MOBILECOMM U.S.A., INC., SAMSUNG  
ELECTRONICS CO., LTD., SAMSUNG  
ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC., SONY  
CORPORATION, SONY MOBILE  
COMMUNICATIONS INC., SONY MOBILE  
COMMUNICATIONS AB, SONY MOBILE  
COMMUNICATIONS (USA) INC., ZTE  
CORPORATION, ZTE (USA) INC.,**  
*Intervenors*

---

2016-2715

---

Appeal from the United States International Trade  
Commission in Investigation No. 337-TA-994.

---

**JUDGMENT**

---

JONATHAN DANIEL BAKER, Farney Daniels PC, San Mateo, CA, argued for appellants. Also represented by MICHAEL D. SAUNDERS, GURTEJ SINGH.

HOUDA MORAD, Office of the General Counsel, United States International Trade Commission, Washington, DC, argued for appellee. Also represented by WAYNE W. HERRINGTON, SIDNEY A. ROSENZWEIG, DOMINIC L. BIANCHI.

DAN L. BAGATELL, Perkins Coie LLP, Hanover, NH, argued for all intervenors. Intervenors Google LLC, and Motorola Mobility LLC, Lenovo (United States) Inc., Lenovo Group Ltd., Blackberry Ltd., and Blackberry Corporation also represented by VERONICA SUSANA ASCARRUNZ, Wilson, Sonsini, Goodrich & Rosati, PC, Washington, DC. Intervenors Blackberry Ltd. and Blackberry Corporation also represented by DANIEL P. MUINO, Morrison & Foerster LLP, Washington, DC; VINCENT JOSEPH BELUSKO, Los Angeles, CA.

FRED WILLIAMS, Vinson & Elkins LLP, Austin, TX, for intervenors HTC Corporation and HTC America, Inc. Also represented by JONATHAN LLOYD HARDT.

SCOTT ANDREW ELENGOLD, Fish & Richardson, PC, Washington, DC, for intervenors LG Electronics, Inc., LG Electronics U.S.A., Inc., and LG Electronics Mobilecomm U.S.A., Inc. Also represented by CHRISTIAN A. CHU, MICHAEL J. MCKEON.

RICHARD L. RAINEY, Covington & Burling LLP, Washington, DC, for intervenors Samsung Electronics Co., Ltd. and Samsung Electronics America, Inc. Also represented by ALEXANDER CHINOY; GREGORY SCOTT NIEBERG, New York, NY; ALICE JUWON AHN, San Francisco, CA.

MICHAEL N. RADER, Wolf, Greenfield & Sacks, PC, Boston, MA, for intervenors Sony Corporation, Sony Mobile Communications Inc., Sony Mobile Communications AB, and Sony Mobile Communications (USA) Inc. Also represented by CHRISTOPHER HENRY, GERALD B. HRYCYSZYN; JAMES ALTMAN, BARBARA A. MURPHY, Foster, Murphy, Altman & Nickel, PC, Washington, DC.

LYLE BRENT VANDER SCHAAF, Brinks Gilson & Lione, Washington, DC, for intervenors ZTE Corporation and ZTE (USA) Inc. Also represented by JEFFREY J. CATALANO, RALPH JOSEPH GABRIC, Chicago, IL.

---

THIS CAUSE having been heard and considered, it is

ORDERED and ADJUDGED:

PER CURIAM (NEWMAN, HUGHES, and STOLL, *Circuit Judges*).

**AFFIRMED. See Fed. Cir. R. 36.**

ENTERED BY ORDER OF THE COURT

October 13, 2017  
Date

/s/ Peter R. Marksteiner  
Peter R. Marksteiner  
Clerk of Court