

**UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN  
SOUTHERN DIVISION**

In re:	)	Chapter 9
	)	
CITY OF DETROIT, MICHIGAN,	)	Case No. 13-53846
	)	
Debtor.	)	Hon. Steven W. Rhodes

---

**NOTICE OF APPEAL**

Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 158(a) and (d) and Rule 8001 of the Federal Rules of Bankruptcy Procedure, the Retired Detroit Police & Fire Fighters Association (“RDPFFA”), Donald Taylor, individually, and as President of the RDPFFA, the Detroit Retired City Employees Association (“DRCEA”) and Shirley V. Lightsey, individually, and as President of the DRCEA (collectively “Retiree Association Parties”), through their counsel, Lippitt O’Keefe, PLLC and Silverman & Morris, P.L.L.C., file this notice of appeal of the Opinion Regarding Eligibility (dkt. 1945) and the Order for Relief Under Chapter 9 of the Bankruptcy Code (dkt. 1946) entered on December 5, 2013 by the United States Bankruptcy Court for the Eastern District of Michigan (together, the “Eligibility Order”). Attached as Exhibit 1 is a Bankruptcy Matter Civil Case Cover Sheet.

The names of all parties to the Eligibility Order, and the names, addresses, and telephone numbers of their respective attorneys are set forth below. In addition, approximately 92 individuals were invited to address the Bankruptcy Court at the hearing on September 19, 2013 regarding their objections to eligibility (the “Individual Objectors”). The Individual Objectors are listed on Exhibit 2.

**The Police and Fire Retirement System of the City of Detroit  
The General Retirement System of the City of Detroit**

Represented by:

CLARK HILL PLC

Robert D. Gordon (P48627)

Shannon L. Deeby (P60242)

Jennifer K. Green (P69019)

Evan J. Feldman (P73437)

151 South Old Woodward Avenue, Suite 200

Birmingham, Michigan 48009

Phone: (248) 988-5882 Fax: (248) 988-2502

rgordon@clarkhill.com

ARNOLD & PORTER LLP

Lisa Hill Fenning (admitted *pro hac vice*)

777 South Figueroa Street, 44<sup>th</sup> Floor

Los Angeles, California 90017

Phone: (213) 243-4000 Fax: (213) 243-4199

lisa.fenning@aporter.com

**The City of Detroit, Michigan**

Represented by:

JONES DAY

Bruce Bennett (CA 105430)

555 South Flowers Street, Fiftieth Floor

Los Angeles, California 90071

Phone: (213) 243-2382 Fax: (213) 243-2539

bbennett@jonesday.com

JONES DAY

David G. Heiman (OH 0038271)

Heather Lennox (OH 0059649)

North Point, 901 Lakeside Avenue

Cleveland, Ohio 44114

Phone: (216) 586-3939 Fax: (216) 579-0212

dgheiman@jonesday.com

hlennox@jonesday.com

MILLER, CANFIELD, PADDOCK AND STONE, P.L.C.

Jonathan S. Green (MI P33140)

Stephen S. LaPlante (MI P48063)

150 West Jefferson, Suite 2500

Detroit, Michigan 48226

Phone: (313) 963-6420 Fax: (313) 496-7500

green@millercanfield.com

laplante@millercanfield.com

**The Detroit Fire Fighters Association**

**The Detroit Police Officers Association**

**The Detroit Police Lieutenants & Sergeants Association**

**The Detroit Police Command Officers Association**

Represented by:

ERMAN, TEICHER, MILLER, ZUCKER & FREEDMAN, P.C.

Earle I. Erman (P24296)

Craig E. Zucker (P39907)

Barbara A. Patek (P34666)

400 Galleria Officentre, Suite 444

Southfield, MI 48034

Phone: (249) 827-4100 Fax: (248) 827-4106

bpatek@ermanteicher.com

**International Union of Operating Engineers, Local 324**

Represented by:

SACHS WALDMAN, P.C.

Andrew Nickelhoff (P37990)

Mami Kato (P74237)

2211 East Jefferson Avenue, Suite 200

Detroit, MI 48207

Phone: (313) 496-9429 Fax: (313) 965-4602

anickelhoff@sachswaldman.com

mkato@sachswaldman.com

**Service Employees International Union, Local 517M**

Represented by:

SACHS WALDMAN, P.C.  
Andrew Nickelhoff (P37990)  
Mami Kato (P74237)  
2211 East Jefferson Avenue, Suite 200  
Detroit, MI 48207  
Phone: (313) 496-9429 Fax: (313) 965-4602  
anickelhoff@sachswaldman.com  
mkato@sachswaldman.com

**David Sole**

Represented by:

JEROME D. GOLDBERG, PLLC  
Jerome D. Goldberg (P61678)  
2921 East Jefferson, Suite 205  
Detroit, MI 48207  
Phone: (313) 393-6001 Fax: (313) 393-6007  
apclawyer@sbcglobal.net

**The Retired Detroit Police & Fire Fighters Association**

**Donald Taylor, individually and as President of the Retired Detroit Police & Fire  
Fighters Association**

**The Detroit Retired City Employees Association**

**Shirley V. Lightsey, individually and as President of the Detroit Retired City  
Employees Association**

Represented by:

LIPPITT O'KEEFE, PLLC  
Brian D. O'Keefe (P39603)  
Ryan C. Plecha (P71957)  
370 East Maple Road, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor  
Birmingham, MI 48009  
Phone: (248) 646-8292 Fax: (248) 646-8375  
rplecha@lippittokeefe.com

SILVERMAN & MORRIS, P.L.L.C.  
Thomas R. Morris (P39141)  
30500 Northwestern Highway, Suite 200  
Farmington Hills, MI 48334  
Phone: (248) 539-1330 Fax: (248) 539-1355  
morris@silvermanmorris.com

**Robbie Flowers**  
**Michael Wells**  
**Janet Whitson**  
**Mary Washington**  
**Bruce Goldman**

Represented by:  
William A. Wertheimer (P26275)  
30515 Timberbrook Lane  
Bingham Farms, MI 48025  
Phone: (248) 644-9200  
billwertheimer@gmail.com

**Michigan Council 25 of The American Federation of State, County & Municipal Employees, AFL-CIO and Sub-Chapter 98, City of Detroit Retirees (AFSCME)**

Represented by:  
LOWENSTEIN SANDLER LLP  
Sharon L. Levine, Esq.  
Wojciech F. Jung, Esq.  
Philip J. Gross, Esq.  
65 Livingston Avenue  
Roseland, NJ 07068  
Phone: (973) 597-2500 Fax: (973) 597-6247  
slevine@lowenstein.com  
wjung@lowenstein.com  
pgross@lowenstein.com

THE SANDERS LAW FIRM PC  
Herbert A. Sanders, Esq.  
615 Griswold St., Suite 913  
Detroit, MI 48226  
Phone: (313) 962-0099 Fax: (313) 962-0044  
jsanders@miafscme.org

MILLER COHEN, P.L.C.  
Richard G. Mack, Jr., Esq.  
600 West Lafayette Boulevard, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Detroit, MI 48226  
Phone: (313) 964-4454 Fax: (313) 964-4490  
richardmack@millercohen.com

**International Union, United Automobile, Aerospace and Agricultural Implement  
Workers of America**

Represented by:  
COHEN, WEISS AND SIMON LLP  
Babette A. Ceccotti  
Keith E. Secular  
Thomas N. Ciantra  
Joshua J. Ellison  
330 West 42<sup>nd</sup> Street  
New York, NY 10036  
Phone: (212) 563-4100 Fax: (212) 695-5436  
bceccotti@cwsny.com

Niraj R. Ganatra (P63150)  
Michael Nicholson (P33421)  
8000 East Jefferson Avenue  
Detroit, MI 48214  
Phone: (313) 926-5216 Fax: (313) 926-5240  
nganatra@uaw.net  
mnicholson@uaw.net

**Center for Community Justice and Advocacy**

Represented by:  
VANESSA G. FLUKER, ESQ. PLLC  
Vanessa G. Fluker (P64870)  
2921 East Jefferson, Suite 200  
Detroit, MI 48207  
Phone: (313) 393-6005 Fax: (313) 393-6007  
vgflawyer@sbcglobal.net

**Retired Detroit Police Members Association**

Represented by:

STROBL & SHARP, P.C.  
Lynn M. Brimer (P43291)  
Meredith E. Taunt (P69698)  
Mallory A. Field (P75289)  
300 East Long Lake Road, Suite 200  
Bloomfield Hills, MI 48304  
Phone: (248) 540-2300 Fax: (248) 645-2690  
lbrimer@stroblpc.com  
mtaunt@stroblpc.com  
mfield@stroblpc.com

**Krystal Crittendon**

19737 Chesterfield  
Detroit, MI 48221  
Phone: (313) 237-3031 Fax: (313) 237-3025  
critk@detroitmi.gov

**The Retiree Committee of the City of Detroit**

Represented by:

DENTONS US LLP  
Carole Neville  
1221 Avenue of the Americas  
New York, New York 10020  
Phone: (212) 768-6700 Fax: (212) 768-6800  
carole.neville@dentons.com

DENTONS US LLP

Sam J. Alberts  
1301 K Street, NW, Ste.600, East Tower  
Washington, DC 20005-3364  
Phone: (202) 408-6400 Fax: (202) 408-6399  
sam.alberts@dentons.com

SALANS FMC SNR DENTON EUROPE LLP  
Claude D. Montgomery (P29212)  
Rockefeller Center, 620 Fifth Avenue  
New York, New York 10020  
Phone: (212) 632-8390  
claude.montgomery@dentons.com

BROOKS WILKINS SHARKEY & TURCO PLLC  
Matthew E. Wilkins (P56697)  
Paula A. Hall (P61101)  
401 South Old Woodward, Suite 400  
Birmingham, Michigan 48009  
Phone: (248) 971-1711 Fax: (248) 971-1801  
wilkins@bwst-law.com  
hall@bwst-law.com

Dated: December 9, 2013

Respectfully submitted,

SILVERMAN & MORRIS, P.L.L.C.

/s/ Thomas R. Morris

Thomas R. Morris (P39141)  
30500 Northwestern Highway, Suite 200  
Farmington Hills, Michigan 48334  
Telephone: (248) 539-1330  
Facsimile: (248) 539-1355  
morris@silvermanmorris.com

LIPPITT O'KEEFE, PLLC  
Brian D. O'Keefe (P39603)  
Ryan C. Plecha (P71957)  
370 East Maple Road, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor  
Birmingham, Michigan 48009  
Telephone: (248) 646-8292  
Facsimile: (248) 646-8375  
bokeefe@lippittokeefe.com  
rplecha@lippittokeefe.com

*Counsel to the Police and Fire Retirement System of  
the City of Detroit and the General Retirement  
System of the City of Detroit*



**EXHIBIT 1**

**Bankruptcy Matter Civil Case Cover Sheet**

{00202372}

In re:

CITY OF DETROIT, MICHIGAN

Case No.: 13-53846-swr

Debtor.

DETROIT RETIRED CITY EMPLOYEES  
ASSOCIATION, SHIRLEY V. LIGHTSEY,  
individually, and as President of the DRCEA,  
RETIRED DETROIT POLICE & FIRE  
FIGHTERS ASSOCIATION, and  
DONALD TAYLOR, individually, and as  
President of the RDPFFA,

Appellant,

v.

CITY OF DETROIT, MICHIGAN,

Appellee.

**CAUSE OF ACTION/NATURE OF SUIT:** (This matter is referred to the district court for the following reasons)

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	[422] 28 U.S.C. 158	Bankruptcy Appeal
<input type="checkbox"/>	[422] 28 U.S.C. 158	Motion for Leave to Appeal
<input type="checkbox"/>	[423] 28 U.S.C. 157(d)	Motion for Withdrawal of Reference
<input type="checkbox"/>	[423] 28 U.S.C. 157(c) (1)	Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law
<input type="checkbox"/>	[423] 28 U.S.C. 158 (c) (a)	Order of Contempt

Date: December 11, 2013

Name: /s/Ryan C. Plecha

Name and Address of Interested Parties: See lists attached to Notice of Appeal

## EXHIBIT 2

### List of Individual Objectors

Approximately 92 Individual Objectors were invited to address the Bankruptcy Court at the hearing on September 19, 2013 regarding their objections to eligibility. Their names and addresses are below.

Michael Abbott  
19391 Heldon Drive  
Detroit, MI

Charles D. Brown  
1365 Joliet Place  
Detroit, MI 48207

The Association of Professional and  
Technical Employee (APTE)  
Dempsey Addison and  
Cecily McClellan  
2727 Second Ave., Ste. 152  
Detroit, MI 48201

Lorene Brown  
2227 Hughes Terrace  
Detroit, MI 48208

Paulette Brown  
19260 Lancashire  
Detroit, MI 48223

Linda Bain  
1071 Baldwin  
Detroit, MI 48214

Rakiba Brown  
612 Clairmount St.  
Detroit, MI 48202

Randy Beard  
16840 Strathmoor St.  
Detroit, MI 48235

Regina Bryant  
2996 Bewick St.  
Detroit, MI 48214

Russell Bellant  
19619 Helen  
Detroit, MI 48234

Mary Diane Bukowski  
9000 E. Jefferson, #10-9  
Detroit, MI 48214

Michael G. Benson  
19395 Parkside  
Detroit, MI 48221

David Bullock  
701 W. Hancock  
Detroit, MI 48201

Cynthia Blair  
8865 Espes  
Detroit, MI 49204

Claudette Campbell  
1021 Winchester Ave.  
Lincoln Park, MI 48146

Dwight Boyd  
19337 Concord  
Detroit, MI 48234

Johnnie R. Carr  
11310 Mansfield  
Detroit, MI

Elmarie Dixon  
4629 Philip St.  
Detroit, MI 48215

Sandra Carver  
10110 S. Outer Dr.  
Detroit, MI 48224

Mary Dugans  
18034 Birchcrest  
Detroit, MI 48221

Raleigh Chambers  
14861 Ferguson St.  
Detroit, MI 48227

Lewis Dukens  
1362 Joliet Pl.  
Detroit, MI 48207

Alma Cozart  
18331 Shaftsbury  
Detroit, MI 48219

David Dye  
19313 Ardmore  
Detroit, MI 48235

Leola Regina Crittendon  
19737 Chesterfield Rd.  
Detroit, MI 48221

Jacqueline Esters  
18570 Glastonbury  
Detroit, MI 48219

Angela Crockett  
19680 Roslyn Rd.  
Detroit, MI 48221

Arthur Evans  
11391 Nottingham Rd.  
Detroit, MI 48224

Lucinda J. Darrah  
482 Peterboro  
Detroit, MI 48201

Jerry Ford  
9750 W. Outer Drive  
Detroit, MI 48223

Joyce Davis  
15421 Strathmoor St.  
Detroit, MI 48227

William D. Ford  
18034 Birchcrest Dr.  
Detroit, MI 48221

Sylvester Davis  
[Address Not Available  
on Rule 2002 Notice List]

Ulysses Freeman  
14895 Faust  
Detroit, MI 48223

William Davis  
9203 Littlefield  
Detroit, MI 48228

Olivia Gillon  
18832 Arleen Court  
Livonia, MI 48152

Donald Glass  
411 Chalmers  
Detroit, MI 48215

Sallie M. Jones  
4413 W. Philadelphia  
Detroit, MI 48204

Lavarre W. Greene  
19667 Roslyn Rd.  
Detroit, MI 48221

Aleta Atchinson-Jorgan  
7412 Henry St.  
Detroit, MI 48214

William Hickey  
14910 Lamphere St.  
Detroit, MI 48223

Zelma Kinchloe  
439 Henry St.  
Detroit, MI 48201

LaVern Holloway  
16246 Linwood Street  
Detroit, MI 48221

Timothy King  
4102 Pasadena  
Detroit, MI 48238

William J. Howard  
17814 Charest  
Detroit, MI 48212

Keetha R. Kittrell  
22431 Tireman  
Detroit, MI

Joanne Jackson  
16244 Princeton  
Detroit, MI 48221

Michael Joseph Karwoski  
26015 Felicity Landing  
Harrison Twp., MI 48045

Ailene Jeter  
18559 Brinker  
Detroit, MI 48234

Roosevelt Lee  
11961 Indiana  
Detroit, MI 48204

Sheilah Johnson  
277 King Street  
Detroit, MI 48202

Althea Long  
9256 Braile  
Detroit, MI 48228

Stephen Johnson  
31354 Evergreen Road  
Beverly Hills, MI 48025

Edward Lowe  
18046 Sussex  
Detroit, MI 48235

Joseph H. Jones  
19485 Ashbury Park  
Detroit, MI 48235

Lorna Lee Mason  
1311 Wyoming  
Detroit, MI 48238

Deborah Moore  
4436 Lemay Road  
Detroit, MI 48214

Deborah Pollard  
20178 Pinehurst  
Detroit, MI 48221

Larene Parrish  
18220 Snowden  
Detroit, MI 48255

Lou Ann Pelletier  
2630 Lakeshore Road  
Applegate, MI 48401

Michael K. Pelletier  
1063 Lakeshore Road  
Applegate, MI 48401

Heidi Peterson  
Represented by:  
Charles Bruce Idelsohn P36799  
P.O. Box 856  
Detroit, MI 48231  
charlesidelsohnattorney@yahoo.com

Helen Powers  
100 Winona  
Highland Park, MI 48203

Alice Pruitt  
18251 Freeland  
Detroit, MI 48235

Samuel L. Riddle  
1276 Navarre Pl.  
Detroit, MI 48207

Kwabena Shabu  
2445 Lamothe St.  
Detroit, MI 48226

Michael D. Shane  
16815 Patton  
Detroit, MI 48219

Karl Shaw  
19140 Ohio  
Detroit, MI 48221

Frank Sloan, Jr.  
18953 Pennington Dr.  
Detroit, MI 48221

Gretchen R. Smith  
3901 Grand River Ave., #913  
Detroit, MI 48208

Horace E. Stallings  
1492 Sheridan St.  
Detroit, MI 48214

Thomas Stephens  
4595 Hereford  
Detroit, MI 48224

Dennis Taubitz  
4190 Devonshire Rd.  
Detroit, MI 48226

Charles Taylor  
11472 Wayburn  
Detroit, MI 48224

Marzelia Taylor  
11975 Indiana  
Detroit, MI 48204

The Chair of St. Peter  
1300 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W.  
Washington, DC 20004

Cheryl Smith Williams  
3486 Baldwin  
Detroit, MI 48214

Dolores A. Thomas  
17320 Cherrylawn  
Detroit, MI 48221

Charles Williams, II  
6533 E. Jefferson, Apt. 118  
Detroit, MI 48207

Shirley Tollivel  
16610 Inverness  
Detroit, MI 48221

Floreen Williams  
16227 Birwood  
Detroit, MI 48221

Tracey Tresvant  
19600 Anvil  
Detroit, MI 48205

Fraustin Williams  
11975 Indiana  
Detroit, MI 48204

Calvin Turner  
16091 Edmore  
Detroit, MI 48205

Leonard Wilson  
100 Parsons St., Apt. 712  
Detroit, MI 48201

Jean Vortkamp  
11234 Craft  
Detroit, MI 48224

Phebe Lee Woodberry  
803 Glastone  
Detroit, MI 48202

William Curtis Walton  
4269 Glendale  
Detroit, MI 48238

Anthony G. Wright, Jr.  
649 Alger St.  
Detroit, MI 48202

Jo Ann Watson  
100 Riverfront Drive, #1508  
Detroit, MI 48226

Judith West  
[Address Not Available  
on Rule 2002 Notice List]

Preston West  
18460 Fairfield  
Detroit, MI 48221

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned certifies that on December 12, 2013, the foregoing document was filed using the Court's CM/ECF system, which CM/ECF system will send notification of such filing to all parties of record.

**LIPPITT O'KEEFE, PLLC**

By: /s/ Ryan C. Plecha

Brian D. O'Keefe (P39603)

Ryan C. Plecha (P71957)

Attorneys for Retiree Association Parties

370 East Maple Road, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor

Birmingham, Michigan 48009

Tel: (248) 646-8292; Fax: (248) 646-8375

bokeefe@lippittokeefe.com

rplecha@lippittokeefe.com

**SILVERMAN & MORRIS, P.L.L.C.**

Thomas R. Morris (P39141)

Karin F. Avery (P45364)

Co-counsel for Retiree Association Parties

30500 Northwestern Hwy., Suite 200

Farmington Hills, Michigan 48334

Tel: (248) 539-1330; Fax: (248) 539-1355

morris@silvermanmorris.com

avery@silvermanmorris.com

Dated: December 12, 2013