1	WO	
2		
3		
4		
5		
6	IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT	
7	FOR THE DISTRICT OF ARIZONA	
8		
9	Kim Cramton,	No. CV-17-04663-PHX-DWL
10	Plaintiff,	ORDER
11	V.	
12	Grabbagreen Franchising LLC, et al.,	
13	Defendants.	
14		
15	On June 7, 2019, attorneys Erin A. Hertzog, Jeff Bouma, Larry Cohen, and Joel	
16	Fugate of Cronus Law, PLLC ("Cronus") filed a "Notice of Substitution of Counsel"	
17	("Notice"), purporting to inform the Court that they were substituting themselves into this	
18	action as counsel for Defendants/Counterclaimants Grabbagreen Franchising, LLC, Eat	
19	Clean Operations, LLC, Eat Clean Holdings, LLC, and Keely Newman, currently	
20	represented by Tiffany & Bosco PA ("T&B"). (Doc. 187.) This is impermissible.	
21	Pursuant to LRCiv 83.3(b), a notice will suffice only when there is a change of counsel	
22	within the same law office. Otherwise, "no attorney shall be permitted to withdraw or be	
23	substituted as attorney of record in any pending action except by formal written order of	
24	the Court, supported by written application setting forth the reasons therefor," and	
25	following certain procedural requirements. LRCiv 83.3(b).	
26	The docket in this action appears to inaccurately reflect the representation of	
27	Defendants/Counterclaimants Grabbagreen Franchising, LLC, Eat Clean Operations, LLC,	
28	Eat Clean Holdings, LLC, and Keely Newman,	as well as Defendant/Counterclaimant Kelli

Newman and Counterclaimant Gulf Girl Squared Incorporated. Rather than attempting to summarize the convoluted representations as currently listed in the docket, the Court will instead explain what happened.

As of April 16, 2019, all of the above-mentioned parties were represented by T&B attorneys Jack Robert Vrablik, Robert A. Royal, and Erin A. Hertzog.¹ (E.g., Docs. 163, 172.)

7 On April 26, 2019, Erin Hertzog (at that time an attorney at T&B, currently an 8 attorney at Cronus) filed—on T&B letterhead—a "Notice of Disassociation of Counsel" 9 (Doc. 174), stating: "Pursuant to Local Rule of Civil Procedure 83.3(b)(4), Erin A. 10 Hertzog, an attorney of record for Defendants/Counterclaimants Grabbagreen Franchising, 11 LLC, Eat Clean Operations, LLC, Eat Clean Holdings, LLC, Gulf Girl Squared, Inc., Kelli 12 Newman and Keely Newman, is withdrawing her association as an attorney of record for 13 Defendants/Counterclaimants Grabbagreen Franchising, LLC, Eat Clean Operations, LLC, 14 Eat Clean Holdings, LLC, Gulf Girl Squared, Inc., Kelli Newman and Keely Newman in the above-referenced matter. All communications, pleadings, correspondence and the like 15 16 shall be directed to Defendants'/Counterclaimants' lead counsel of record, Robert A. 17 Royal, as of the date of this filing." Thus, after this filing, Erin Hertzog represented no one 18 in this action, and all of the above-mentioned parties were represented by T&B attorneys 19 Jack Robert Vrablik and Robert A. Royal only.

20 On May 15, 2019, Defendant/Counterclaimant Kelli Newman (not her spouse, 21 Keely Newman) filed her Ex Parte Motion for Withdrawal of Counsel and Substitution As 22 Self-Represented Litigant. (Doc. 176.) On May 16, 2019, the Court granted the motion. 23 (Doc. 178.)

24

1

2

3

4

5

6

Thus, as of May 16, 2019, Kelli Newman appeared pro se, and all of the other above-25 mentioned parties were represented by T&B attorneys Jack Robert Vrablik and Robert A. 26 Royal. Indeed, all of the filings from May 16, 2019 for all of the 27 Defendants/Counterclaimants except Kelli Newman have been filed by T&B attorneys

¹ T&B attorney Amy D. Sells appears in the signature block on various filings but apparently never appeared in this action as counsel of record, as required by LRCiv 83.3(a).

²⁸

Vrablik and Royal, as recently as June 3, 2019 (Doc. 185), until terminated attorney Erin Hertzog purported to file a "Notice" substituting Cronus attorneys Erin Hertzog, Larry Cohen, Jeff Bouma, and Joel Fugate on June 7, 2019. (Doc. 187.)

3 4

1

2

To the extent that the "Notice" at Doc. 187 can be construed as a motion, it will be 5 denied for failure to conform with the requirements of LRCiv 83.3. Thus, 6 Defendant/Counterclaimant Kelli Newman remains pro se (for both her defense and 7 counterclaim), Defendants/Counterclaimants Grabbagreen Franchising, LLC, Eat Clean 8 Operations, LLC, Eat Clean Holdings, LLC, and Keely Newman remain represented (in 9 their defenses and counterclaims) by T&B attorneys Jack Robert Vrablik and Robert A. 10 Royal, and Counterclaimant Gulf Girl Squared Incorporated likewise remains represented 11 by T&B attorneys Jack Robert Vrablik and Robert A. Royal. No party in this action is 12 currently represented by Cronus attorneys Erin Hertzog, Larry Cohen, Jeff Bouma, and 13 Joel Fugate, because they have not yet sought and obtained an Order from the Court 14 permitting them to be substituted as counsel of record. Thus, the Court will not consider 15 the statement of discovery dispute (Doc. 188), filed by Cronus attorney Erin Hertzog, 16 unless and until Ms. Hertzog becomes counsel of record for the parties she purports to 17 represent in this action.

18

Accordingly,

19 IT IS ORDERED that the "Notice" (Doc. 187) is denied. The Clerk of Court is 20 directed to update the docket to indicate that Defendant/Counterclaimant Kelli Newman is 21 pro se (for both her defense and counterclaim) pursuant to the Court's May 16, 2019 Order 22 (Doc. 178), Defendants/Counterclaimants Grabbagreen Franchising, LLC, Eat Clean 23 Operations, LLC, Eat Clean Holdings, LLC, and Keely Newman are represented (in their 24 defenses and counterclaims) by T&B attorneys Jack Robert Vrablik and Robert A. Royal, 25 and Counterclaimant Gulf Girl Squared Incorporated likewise is represented by T&B 26 attorneys Jack Robert Vrablik and Robert A. Royal. The docket should reflect that Erin 27 Hertzog was terminated per her April 26, 2019 "Notice of Disassociation of Counsel" (Doc. . . . 28

174). The docket should further reflect that Cronus attorneys Larry Cohen, Jeff Bouma, and Joel Fugate have never represented any party in this action. Dated this 17th day of June, 2019. Dominic W. Lanza United States District Judge

- 4 -