Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. v. Valueclick, Inc.

Doc. 1 Att. 5

EXHIBIT 5

535 Smithfield Street Pittsburgh, PA 15222-2312 412.355.6500 Fax 412.355.6501 www.klng.com

Kelly A. DeMarchis

412.355.6305 Fax: 412.355.6501 kdemarchis@klng.com

May 17, 2005

Via E-MAIL and CERTIFIED MAIL/RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED

Kirkpatrick & Lockhart Nicholson Graham LLP

RewardsGateway / Member Promotions c/o VC Ecommerce Solutions 22647 Ventura Boulevard, Suite 258 Woodland Hills, CA 91364

Pressreleasers.net c/o Harrison Direct **Network Operations** 2648 E. Workman Avenue, #476 West Covina, CA 91791

> RewardsGateway-Unauthorized Use of Re:

> > WAL-MART Intellectual Property; Our File: 020717-A141

Dear Sir or Madam:

We represent Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. ("Wal-Mart"). Wal-Mart is the owner of the Wal-Mart trade name and numerous trademarks and service marks, including the famous WAL*MART name and logo and the SAM'S CLUB name and logo, among others (collectively, the "WAL-MART Marks"). Wal-Mart has established substantial and valuable good will in its marks and trade name and has the exclusive right to use its marks and trade name.

It has come to Wal-Mart's attention that RewardsGateway has been sending solicitations via e-mail that offer \$500 Sam's Club gift cards in exchange for enrolling in its "Rewards" program at www.rewardsgateway.com. This program does not appear to be legitimate and we are aware of numerous complaints by participants who have never received the promised gift card. Wal-Mart has not authorized RewardsGateway to use the WAL-MART Marks and name in connection with publicizing its business. In addition, Wal-Mart is not affiliated, connected, or associated with RewardsGateway and does not sponsor or endorse RewardsGateways's business or the business of any other sites affiliated with RewardsGateway. RewardsGateway's use of the WAL-MART Marks and name is likely to cause the consuming public to believe that RewardsGateway's activities are affiliated with or authorized by Wal-Mart.

Consequently, RewardsGateway's actions may constitute, among other things, trademark infringement and false designation of origin. We therefore demand that RewardsGateway cease and desist from infringing Wal-Mart's intellectual property. To that end, RewardsGateway must immediately:

Kirkpatrick & Lockhart Nicholson Graham LLP Rewards Gateway May 17, 2005 Page 2

- Cease using the Wal-Mart name, any WAL-MART Marks, and any other 1. intellectual property owned by Wal-Mart or any other intellectual property confusingly similar thereto on www.rewardsgateway.com, any other websites or other materials, in e-mail solicitations or otherwise in connection with its business activities:
- Identify an authorized RewardsGateway representative by providing his or 2. her real name, complete mailing address and telephone number; and
- Confirm in writing that RewardsGateway has fully complied with all of 3. Wal-Mart's demands by signing and returning the attached acknowledgement.

RewardsGateway must fully comply with Wal-Mart's demands by June 1, 2005. Should RewardsGateway fail to comply and should Wal-Mart choose to exercise all of its legal rights, Wal-Mart may be entitled to, among other things, an injunction, RewardsGateway's profits, Wal-Mart's actual damages, and/or Wal-Mart's attorney's fees and costs.

The demands made herein are not made to the exclusion of other rights or remedies to which Wal-Mart is entitled, and nothing in this letter, nor any act or omission by Wal-Mart, shall be construed as a waiver of any right or remedy possessed by Wal-Mart, all of which are expressly reserved.

We look forward to your prompt response.

Sincerely.

Kelly A. DeMarchis

KAD/kat

Case 5:05-cv-05189-RTD

Kirkpatrick & Lockhart Nicholson Graham LLP Rewards Gateway May 17, 2005 Page 3

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

RewardsGateway, through the authorized representative set forth below, agrees to, and has fully complied with, the provisions set forth in Wal-Mart's letter.

| Signed: | |
|---------------|--|
| Name Printed: | |
| Title: | |
| Date: | |

DeMarchis, Kelly A.

From: Bennet Kelley [bkelley@valueclick.com]

Sent: Thursday, May 26, 2005 7:57 PM

To: DeMarchis, Kelly A.

Cc: Itownsend@owe.com

Subject: WAL-MART File 02717-A141

Dear Ms. DeMarchis:

I am writing in response to your May 17, 2005 letter addressed to RewardsGateway.com which is a division of our subsidiary VC E-Commerce Solutions ("VCES"). I apologize for the delay in responding, but I was on holiday.

As an initial matter, VCES vigorously disputes your contention that RewardsGateway "does not appear to be legitimate." VCES is committed to proper Internet practices and follows FTC disclosure guidelines. RewardsGateway fully stands by its representations and provides the reward advertised to qualifying users.

VCES also disputes your contention that we are infringing Wal-Mart's trademark rights, as we have taken steps to avoid any likelihood of consumer confusion. The gift card image used is distinct from Wal-Mart's and our copy plainly states in large print that the site has "no affiliation or association" with Wal-Mart or the other entities listed on the site.

The site also states that the "trademarks, service marks, logos, and/or domain names (including, without limitation, the individual names of products and retailers) are the property of their respective owners, who have no association with or make any endorsement of the products or services provided by RewardsGateway.com." In addition, the promotion makes no suggestion of affiliation with Wal-Mart since it merely offers to purchase a gift card of the consumer's choosing and Wal-Mart is just one of several gift cards listed in the promotion which includes the gift cards of Wal-Mart's competitors.

Nonetheless, we are happy to engage in a dialogue as to how to move forward in a way acceptable to Wal-Mart that still preserves VCES' right to advertise the products we offer. I hope we can work together to achieve a prompt and amicable resolution of this matter.

Very truly yours,

Bennet G. Kelley

ValueClick, Inc. 30699 Russell Ranch Road Suite 250 Westlake Village, CA 91361 (818) 575-4739 (702) 924-8740 (efax) bkelley@valueclick.com

535 Smithfield Street Pittsburgh, PA 15222-2312 412.355.6500 Fax 412.355.6501 www.klna.com

Kelly A. DeMarchis

412.355.6305 Fax: 412.355.6501 kdemarchis@klng.com

Kirkpatrick & Lockhart Nicholson Graham LLP

June 9, 2005

Via E-MAIL, FACSIMILE and CERTIFIED MAIL/RETURN RECEIPT REOUESTED

Mr. Bennet G. Kelley ValueClick, Inc. 30699 Russell Ranch Road Suite 250 Westlake Village, CA 91361

> Re: VC E-Commerce Solutions / RewardsGateway—Unauthorized Use of

WAL-MART Intellectual Property; Our File: 020717-A141

Dear Mr. Kelley:

As you are aware, we represent Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. ("Wal-Mart"). We write in response to your email communication of May 26, 2005. After reviewing your email, we disagree with your assessment that VC E-Commerce Solutions ("VCES") and RewardsGateway.com are not infringing Wal-Mart's rights in its intellectual property.

Our understanding of your business is that you send unsolicited emails that include the Sam's Club name and/or mark both in the subject header and the body of the emails. We believe that this activity is likely to cause confusion, cause mistake or deceive consumers as to the source of the emails by leading consumers to believe that the advertisement originates from Sam's Club or an entity affiliated with Sam's Club. In addition, such actions are likely to cause confusion, cause mistake or deceive as to Sam's Club sponsorship of, approval of or affiliation with you, your promotion and/or the email solicitations. Although these emails may link to a website that purports to disclaim affiliation with the listed products or retailers and states that the "trademarks, service marks, logos, and/or domain names ... are the property of their respective owners," no such statements appear in the email solicitations. As such, even if these purported disclaimers are sufficient to prevent confusion among visitors to your website, such disclaimers are not sufficient to prevent confusion among the recipients of your unsolicited emails.

In light of the above, we reiterate our demand that you immediately cease and desist from all infringement of Wal-Mart's intellectual property as outlined in our previous letter. In addition, you must confirm in writing that you have fully complied with Wal-Mart's demands by signing and returning the acknowledgement included in that letter. If you fail to immediately comply with Wal-Mart's demands, we will recommend to Wal-Mart that it pursue any and all remedies available to it under the law.



Kirkpatrick & Lockhart Nicholson Graham LLP

Mr. Bennet G. Kelley June 9, 2005 Page 2

We look forward to your prompt response.

Sincerely,

Kelly A. DeMarchis

DeMarchis, Kelly A.

From: Bennet Kelley [bkelley@valueclick.com]

Sent: Monday, June 13, 2005 2:48 PM

To: DeMarchis, Kelly A.

Subject: RE: VC E-Commerce Solutions / RewardsGateway-Unauthorized Use of WAL-MART Intellectual Property;

Our File: 020717-A141

If we used the same disclaimers used in our website in email texts, would that be sufficient for Wal-Mart?

Very truly yours,

Bennet G. Kelley ValueClick, Inc. bkelley@valueclick.com

From: DeMarchis, Kelly A. [mailto:kdemarchis@klng.com]

Sent: Thursday, June 09, 2005 8:17 AM

To: Bennet Kelley

Subject: VC E-Commerce Solutions / RewardsGateway-Unauthorized Use of WAL-MART Intellectual Property; Our File:

020717-A141

Dear Mr. Kelley:

As you are aware, we represent Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. ("Wal-Mart"). We write in response to your email communication of May 26, 2005. After reviewing your email, we disagree with your assessment that VC E-Commerce Solutions ("VCES") and RewardsGateway.com are not infringing Wal-Mart's rights in its intellectual property.

Our understanding of your business is that you send unsolicited emails that include the Sam's Club name and/or mark both in the subject header and the body of the emails. We believe that this activity is likely to cause confusion, cause mistake or deceive consumers as to the source of the emails by leading consumers to believe that the advertisement originates from Sam's Club or an entity affiliated with Sam's Club. In addition, such actions are likely to cause confusion, cause mistake or deceive as to Sam's Club sponsorship of, approval of or affiliation with you, your promotion and/or the email solicitations. Although these emails may link to a website that purports to disclaim affiliation with the listed products or retailers and states that the "trademarks, service marks, logos, and/or domain names ... are the property of their respective owners," no such statements appear in the email solicitations. As such, even if these purported disclaimers are sufficient to prevent confusion among visitors to your website, such disclaimers are not sufficient to prevent confusion among the recipients of your unsolicited emails.

In light of the above, we reiterate our demand that you immediately cease and desist from all infringement of Wal-Mart's intellectual property as outlined in our previous letter. In addition, you must confirm in writing that you have fully complied with Wal-Mart's demands by signing and returning the acknowledgement included in that letter. If you fail to immediately comply with Wal-Mart's demands, we will recommend to Wal-Mart that it pursue any and all remedies available to it under the law.

We look forward to your prompt response.

Case 5:05-cv-05189-RTD Document 1 Filed 11/22/2005 Page 10 of 15

Sincerely,
Kelly A. DeMarchis
Kirkpatrick & Lockhart Nicholson Graham LLP
Henry W. Oliver Building
535 Smithfield Street
Pittsburgh, PA 15222
412.355.6305 (phone)
412.355.6501 (fax)
kdemarchis@klng.com

This electronic message contains information from the law firm of Kirkpatrick & Lockhart Nicholson Graham LLP that may be privileged and confidential. The information is intended for the use of the addressee(s) only. If you are not an addressee, note that any disclosure, copying, distribution, or use of the contents of this message is prohibited. If you have received this E-mail in error, please contact the sender at the number listed above.

For more information about K&LNG, visit us at www.klng.com.

C D COMMITTEE SOURCES / Remainscalemay Chaudionized Osc of WAD-WART Interfectual ... Fage 1 01 2

Case 5:05-cv-05189-RTD Document 1 Filed 11/22/2005 Page 11 of 15

DeMarchis, Kelly A.

From: DeMarchis, Kelly A.

Sent: Tuesday, June 14, 2005 10:17 AM

To: 'Bennet Kelley'

Subject: RE: VC E-Commerce Solutions / RewardsGateway-Unauthorized Use of WAL-MART Intellectual Property;

Our File: 020717-A141

Mr. Kelley,

Thank you for your email. Although disclaimers are sometimes effective in preventing consumer confusion, we do not believe that adding disclaimers to your email texts will prevent consumer confusion especially in situations where the subject line of the email contains the Wal-Mart Marks. Upon receiving such emails, consumers are likely to believe that the unsolicited email originated from Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. ("Wal-Mart") or that Wal-Mart approved the unsolicited email. The consumer may not open the email or may not read through the entire text of the email and as such, the disclaimer would not be effective. As such, we once again must demand that you cease and desist from sending emails using the Wal-Mart Marks either in the text or in the subject line of the email.

Sincerely,

Kelly A. DeMarchis

From: Bennet Kelley [mailto:bkelley@valueclick.com]

Sent: Monday, June 13, 2005 2:48 PM

To: DeMarchis, Kelly A.

Subject: RE: VC E-Commerce Solutions / RewardsGateway-Unauthorized Use of WAL-MART Intellectual Property; Our

File: 020717-A141

If we used the same disclaimers used in our website in email texts, would that be sufficient for Wal-Mart?

Very truly yours,

Bennet G. Kelley ValueClick, Inc. bkelley@valueclick.com

From: DeMarchis, Kelly A. [mailto:kdemarchis@klng.com]

Sent: Thursday, June 09, 2005 8:17 AM

To: Bennet Kelley

Subject: VC E-Commerce Solutions / RewardsGateway-Unauthorized Use of WAL-MART Intellectual Property; Our File:

020717-A141

Dear Mr. Kelley:

As you are aware, we represent Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. ("Wal-Mart"). We write in response to your email communication of May 26, 2005. After reviewing your email, we disagree with your assessment that VC E-Commerce Solutions ("VCES")

and RewardsGateway.com are not infringing Wal-Mart's rights in its intellectual property.

Our understanding of your business is that you send unsolicited emails that include the Sam's Club name and/or mark both in the subject header and the body of the emails. We believe that this activity is likely to cause confusion, cause mistake or deceive consumers as to the source of the emails by leading consumers to believe that the advertisement originates from Sam's Club or an entity affiliated with Sam's Club. In addition, such actions are likely to cause confusion, cause mistake or deceive as to Sam's Club sponsorship of, approval of or affiliation with you, your promotion and/or the email solicitations. Although these emails may link to a website that purports to disclaim affiliation with the listed products or retailers and states that the "trademarks, service marks, logos, and/or domain names ... are the property of their respective owners," no such statements appear in the email solicitations. As such, even if these purported disclaimers are sufficient to prevent confusion among visitors to your website, such disclaimers are not sufficient to prevent confusion among the recipients of your unsolicited emails.

In light of the above, we reiterate our demand that you immediately cease and desist from all infringement of Wal-Mart's intellectual property as outlined in our previous letter. In addition, you must confirm in writing that you have fully complied with Wal-Mart's demands by signing and returning the acknowledgement included in that letter. If you fail to immediately comply with Wal-Mart's demands, we will recommend to Wal-Mart that it pursue any and all remedies available to it under the law.

We look forward to your prompt response.

Sincerely,
Kelly A. DeMarchis
Kirkpatrick & Lockhart Nicholson Graham LLP
Henry W. Oliver Building
535 Smithfield Street
Pittsburgh, PA 15222
412.355.6305 (phone)
412.355.6501 (fax)
kdemarchis@klng.com

This electronic message contains information from the law firm of Kirkpatrick & Lockhart Nicholson Graham LLP that may be privileged and confidential. The information is intended for the use of the addressee(s) only. If you are not an addressee, note that any disclosure, copying, distribution, or use of the contents of this message is prohibited. If you have received this E-mail in error, please contact the sender at the number listed above.

For more information about K&LNG, visit us at www.klng.com.

DeMarchis, Kelly A.

From: Bennet Kelley [bkelley@valueclick.com]

Sent: Tuesday, June 14, 2005 12:07 PM

To: DeMarchis, Kelly A.

Subject: RE: VC E-Commerce Solutions / RewardsGateway-Unauthorized Use of WAL-MART Intellectual Property;

Our File: 020717-A141

Kelly:

Thank you for your response and consideration of our position.

It appears that you are operating under a false assumption. RewardsGateway does not send unsolicited commercial email and requires that marketers working on its behalf adhere to this same standard and only send to consumers who have consented to receive such messages. Bulk commercial email and unsolicited commercial email are not one and the same.

I believe your demand is too broad under existing law, but we would be willing to consider the following solution:

- 1. The email subject line either will not contain a Wal-Mart mark or such reference is used as part of a list of companies (e.g., Get a Gift Card From Acme, Beta or Wal-Mart); and
- 2. The email text will contain the same disclaimers as the website itself.

We are eager to work with you to resolve this matter in a manner that protects both parties' rights.

Very truly yours,

Bennet G. Kelley ValueClick, Inc. bkelley@valueclick.com

From: DeMarchis, Kelly A. [mailto:kdemarchis@klng.com]

Sent: Tuesday, June 14, 2005 7:17 AM

To: Bennet Kelley

Subject: RE: VC E-Commerce Solutions / RewardsGateway-Unauthorized Use of WAL-MART Intellectual Property; Our

File: 020717-A141

Mr. Kelley,

Thank you for your email. Although disclaimers are sometimes effective in preventing consumer confusion, we do not believe that adding disclaimers to your email texts will prevent consumer confusion especially in situations where the subject line of the email contains the Wal-Mart Marks. Upon receiving such emails, consumers are likely to believe that the unsolicited email originated from Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. ("Wal-Mart") or that Wal-Mart approved the unsolicited email.

- or title the first intonoction ... 1 ago 2 01 J

The consumer may not open the email or may not read through the entire text of the email and as such, the disclaimer would not be effective. As such, we once again must demand that you cease and desist from sending emails using the Wal-Mart Marks either in the text or in the subject line of the email.

Sincerely,

Kelly A. DeMarchis

From: Bennet Kelley [mailto:bkelley@valueclick.com]

Sent: Monday, June 13, 2005 2:48 PM

To: DeMarchis, Kelly A.

Subject: RE: VC E-Commerce Solutions / RewardsGateway-Unauthorized Use of WAL-MART Intellectual Property; Our

File: 020717-A141

If we used the same disclaimers used in our website in email texts, would that be sufficient for Wal-Mart?

Very truly yours,

Bennet G. Kelley ValueClick, Inc. bkelley@valueclick.com

From: DeMarchis, Kelly A. [mailto:kdemarchis@klng.com]

Sent: Thursday, June 09, 2005 8:17 AM

To: Bennet Kelley

Subject: VC E-Commerce Solutions / RewardsGateway-Unauthorized Use of WAL-MART Intellectual Property; Our File:

020717-A141

Dear Mr. Kelley:

As you are aware, we represent Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. ("Wal-Mart"). We write in response to your email communication of May 26, 2005. After reviewing your email, we disagree with your assessment that VC E-Commerce Solutions ("VCES") and RewardsGateway.com are not infringing Wal-Mart's rights in its intellectual property.

Our understanding of your business is that you send unsolicited emails that include the Sam's Club name and/or mark both in the subject header and the body of the emails. We believe that this activity is likely to cause confusion, cause mistake or deceive consumers as to the source of the emails by leading consumers to believe that the advertisement originates from Sam's Club or an entity affiliated with Sam's Club. In addition, such actions are likely to cause confusion, cause mistake or deceive as to Sam's Club sponsorship of, approval of or affiliation with you, your promotion and/or the email solicitations. Although these emails may link to a website that purports to disclaim affiliation with the listed products or retailers and states that the "trademarks, service marks, logos, and/or domain names ... are the property of their respective owners," no such statements appear in the email solicitations. As such, even if these purported disclaimers are sufficient to prevent confusion among visitors to your website, such disclaimers are not sufficient to prevent confusion among the recipients of your unsolicited emails.

In light of the above, we reiterate our demand that you immediately cease and desist from all infringement of Wal-Mart's intellectual property as outlined in our previous letter. In addition, you must confirm in writing that you have fully complied with Wal-Mart's demands by signing and returning the acknowledgement included in that letter. If you fail to immediately comply with Wal-Mart's demands, we will recommend to Wal-Mart that it pursue any and all remedies available to it under

Case 5:05-cv-05189-RTD Document 1 Filed 11/22/2005 Page 15 of 15

the law.

We look forward to your prompt response.

Sincerely,
Kelly A. DeMarchis
Kirkpatrick & Lockhart Nicholson Graham LLP
Henry W. Oliver Building
535 Smithfield Street
Pittsburgh, PA 15222
412.355.6305 (phone)
412.355.6501 (fax)
kdemarchis@klng.com

This electronic message contains information from the law firm of Kirkpatrick & Lockhart Nicholson Graham LLP that may be privileged and confidential. The information is intended for the use of the addressee(s) only. If you are not an addressee, note that any disclosure, copying, distribution, or use of the contents of this message is prohibited. If you have received this E-mail in error, please contact the sender at the number listed above.

For more information about K&LNG, visit us at www.klng.com.