1		
2		
3		
4		
5	UNITED STATE:	S DISTRICT COURT
6	CENTRAL DISTR	ICT OF CALIFORNIA
7		
8	BENJAMIN LIMON,	Case No. 2:16-cv-03938 FMO (JPRx)
9	Plaintiff,	STIPULATED PROTECTIVE
10	V.	ORDER
11	CITY OF RIALTO; DAN STORDAHL; and DOES 1-5,	NOTE CHANGES MADE BY THE
12	Defendants.	COURT
13		

14 15

1. A. <u>PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS</u>

Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential, 16 proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public 17 disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may 18 be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to 19 enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this 20 21 Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends 22 only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment 23 under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth 24 in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to 25 26 file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a 27 party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal. 28

B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

1

This action is likely to involve confidential information for which special 2 protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than 3 prosecution of this action is warranted. Such confidential and proprietary materials 4 and information consist of, among other things, confidential business or financial 5 information, information regarding police tactics and strategies, police officer 6 personnel files, or other confidential research, development, or commercial 7 information (including information implicating privacy rights of third parties), 8 information otherwise generally unavailable to the public, or which may be 9 privileged or otherwise protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes, 10 court rules, case decisions, or common law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of 11 information, to facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of 12 discovery materials, to adequately protect information the parties are entitled to 13 keep confidential, to ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses 14 15 of such material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the end of litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for 16 such information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that 17 information will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that 18 nothing be so designated without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a 19 confidential, non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part 20of the public record of this case. 21

22

2. <u>DEFINITIONS</u>

23 2.1 <u>Action</u>: This pending federal lawsuit and any consolidated or related
24 actions.

25 2.2 <u>Challenging Party</u>: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the
26 designation of information or items under this Order.

27 2.3 <u>"CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items</u>: information (regardless of 28 how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in
 the Good Cause Statement.

2.4 <u>Counsel</u>: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their support staff).

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

2.5 <u>Designating Party</u>: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as "CONFIDENTIAL."

2.6 <u>Disclosure or Discovery Material</u>: all items or information, regardless of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

2.7 <u>Expert</u>: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

15 2.8 <u>House Counsel</u>: attorneys who are employees of a party to this action.
16 House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside
17 counsel.

18 2.9 <u>Non-Party</u>: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association,
19 or other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

20 2.10 <u>Outside Counsel of Record</u>: attorneys who are not employees of a 21 party to this action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and 22 have appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm 23 which has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

24 2.11 <u>Party</u>: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,
25 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their
26 support staffs).

27 2.12 <u>Producing Party</u>: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
28 Discovery Material in this Action.

Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation 2.13 support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and subcontractors.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

1

2

3

4

any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is 2.14 Protected Material: designated as "CONFIDENTIAL."

2.15 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a Producing Party.

3. <u>SCOPE</u>

The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the trial judge. This order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

Defendant City of Rialto designates as Protected Material (1) any and all police officer bodycam videos depicting the incident complained of by Plaintiff and (2) any and all police officer personnel files and/or portions thereof. The Court does not at this time make any finding concerning whether any of that information is in fact entitled to protection as confidential.

4.

DURATION

23 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees 24 otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be 25 deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this action, with 26 or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and 27 exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this action, 28

including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time
 pursuant to applicable law.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

20

21

22

23

24

5.

DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written communications that qualify – so that other portions of the material, documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber or retard the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it
designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must
promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

5.2 <u>Manner and Timing of Designations</u>. Except as otherwise provided in this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

25

Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

(a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic
documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial
proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend

2 3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

1

"CONFIDENTIAL" (hereinafter "CONFIDENTIAL legend"), to each page that contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents or materials available for inspection need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which material it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the "CONFIDENTIAL legend" to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

(b) for testimony given in deposition that the Designating Party identify on the record, before the close of the deposition all protected testimony.

(c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information or item is stored the legend "CONFIDENTIAL." If only a portion or portions of the information or item warrant protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

5.3 <u>Inadvertent Failures to Designate</u>. If timely corrected, an inadvertent
failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive
the Designating Party's right to secure protection under this Order for such
material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make

reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the
 provisions of this Order.

3

4

5

6

7

8

6.

CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

6.1 <u>Timing of Challenges</u>. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court's scheduling order.

6.2 <u>Meet and Confer</u>. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution process under Local Rule 37.1 et seq.

6.3 9 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper 10 purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other 11 parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating 12 Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall 13 continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is 14 entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the court rules on the 15 challenge. 16

17

7.

ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

7.1 <u>Basic Principles</u>. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this
Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such
Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the
conditions described in this Order. When the litigation has been terminated, a
Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL
DISPOSITION).

Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a
location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons
authorized under this Order.

- 28
- 7.2 Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items. Unless

otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a
 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated
 "CONFIDENTIAL" only to:

(a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this action, aswell as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonablynecessary to disclose the information for this Action;

(b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) ofthe Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation;

9 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom
10 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the
11 "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

12

4

5

6

7

8

(d) the court and its personnel;

13

14

15

16

(e) court reporters and their staff;

(f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and ProfessionalVendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and whohave signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

(g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a
custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

(h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the 19 Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing party 20 requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit 1 hereto; and (2) they 21 will not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign the 22 "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A), unless otherwise 23 agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed 24 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material must 25 be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone 26 except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and 27

28

(i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel,

mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

8. <u>PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED</u> <u>IN OTHER LITIGATION</u>

If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as "CONFIDENTIAL," that Party must:

(a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notificationshall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

(b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

(c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as "CONFIDENTIAL" before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party's permission or a court so orders. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

24

9.

25

A NON-PARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION

(a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a
Non-Party in this Action and designated as "CONFIDENTIAL." Such information
produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the

9

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

(b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's confidential information, then the Party shall:

(1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;

(2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated
 Protective Order in this litigation, the relevant discovery request(s), and a
 reasonably specific description of the information requested; and

13 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the14 Non-Party, if requested.

15 (c) If the Non-Party fails to object or seek a protective order from this court within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the 16 Receiving Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive 17 to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the 18 Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that 19 is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a 20 determination by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party 21 shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected 22 Material. 23

24

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best

efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

11. <u>INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE</u> PROTECTED MATERIAL

When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain 7 inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other 8 protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal 9 Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify 10 whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for 11 production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 12 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure 13 of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work 14 15 product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted to the court if the court so permits. 16

17

12.

1

2

3

4

5

6

MISCELLANEOUS

18 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any
19 person to seek its modification by the court in the future.

12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this
Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to
disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in
this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on
any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective
Order.

12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any
Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material
may only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the

specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Materialunder seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the informationin the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

4

1

2

3

13. FINAL DISPOSITION

After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60 5 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must 6 return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As 7 used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, 8 compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the 9 Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the 10 Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if 11 not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that 12 13 (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any 14 15 copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel 16 are entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, 17 deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition 18 and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert 19 work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival 20 copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective 21 Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION). 22

23

//

//

//

- 24
- 25
- 26 //
- 27 //
- 28 //

1	//
2	//
3	IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.
4	
5	I, Allen Christiansen, hereby attest that all other signatures listed, and on
6	whose behalf this filing is submitted, concur in the filing's content and have
7	authorized this filing.
8	
9	DATED: <u>12/15/2016</u>
10	/s/ Allen Christiansen
11	Allen Christiansen Attorneys for Defendants CITY OF RIALTO and DANE STORDAHL
12	
13	
14	DATED: <u>12/15/2016</u>
15	<u>/s/ Joseph M. McMullen</u> Joseph M. McMullen Attorney for Plaintiff BENJAMIN LIMON
16	Attorney for Plaintiff BENJAMIN LIMON
17	
18	
19	PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.
20	
21	DATED: December 27, 2016
22	
23	JEAN ROSENBLUTH
24	Jean P. Rosenbluth United States Magistrate Judge
25	
26	
27	
28	
	13

1	EXHIBIT A		
2	ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND		
3	I, [print or type full name], of		
4	[print or type full address], declare under		
5	penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated		
6	Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for the Central		
7	District of California on [date] in the case of Benjamin Limon v. City		
8	of Rialto, et al.; Case No. 2:16-cv-03938 FMO (JPRx).		
9	I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective		
10	Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me		
11	to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I		
12	will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this		
13	Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with		
14	the provisions of this Order.		
15	I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for		
16	the Northern District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this		
17	Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after		
18	termination of this action.		
19	I hereby appoint [print or type full name] of		
20	[print or type full address and		
21	telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with		
22	this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective		
23	Order.		
24	Date:		
25	City and State where sworn and signed:		
26	Printed name:		
27			
28	Signature:		
	14		