

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

ESTATE OF LIONEL GIBSON, JR.
and as Successors in Interest to Lionel
Gibson, deceased, ALICE V.
CORLEY AND LIONEL GIBSON,
SR.,

Plaintiffs,

vs.

CITY OF LONG BEACH; CHIEF
ROBERT G. LUNA, in his individual
and official capacity; OFFICER
CHRISTOPHER BRAMMER, in his
individual and official capacity;
OFFICER FERNANDO D.
ARCHULETA, in his individual and
official capacity; OFFICER
BERANDO BARAJAS, in his
individual and official capacity;
OFFICER CRAIG M.
HAZLEWOOD, in his individual and
official capacity; OFFICER
RANDALL J. BEACH, in his
individual and official capacity;
OFFICER RUDOLFO RIOS, in his
individual and official capacity; and
DOES 1 through 50 inclusive,

Defendants.

Case No.: 2:16-cv-6962-DSF-FFM

DISCOVERY MATTER

Honorable Frederick F. Mumm
United States Magistrate Judge

**[PROPOSED] STIPULATED
PROTECTIVE ORDER**

Trial Date: December 12, 2017

///

///

1 1. A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

2 Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential,
3 proprietary, or private information from peace officer personnel records for which
4 special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than
5 prosecuting this litigation may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby
6 stipulate to and petition the Court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order.
7 The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all
8 disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public
9 disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled
10 to confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles. The parties further
11 acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective
12 Order does not entitle them to file confidential information under seal; Civil Local
13 Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and the standards that will
14 be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

15 B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

16 It appearing that information from the files of the Long Beach Police
17 Department, requested by Plaintiffs during discovery in this matter, is information
18 for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose
19 other than prosecution of this action is warranted. Such confidential and proprietary
20 materials and information consist of, among other things, confidential business or
21 financial information, information regarding confidential business practices, or other
22 confidential research, development, or commercial information (including
23 information implicating privacy rights of third parties), information otherwise
24 generally unavailable to the public, or which may be privileged or otherwise
25 protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes, court rules, case decisions,
26 or common law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the
27 prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery materials, to
28 adequately protect information the parties are entitled to keep confidential, to ensure

1 that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material in
2 preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the end of the
3 litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such information is
4 justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that information will not be
5 designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so designated
6 without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential, non-public
7 manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public record of this
8 case.

9 **2. DEFINITIONS**

10 2.1 Action: this pending federal law suit

11 2.2 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the
12 designation of information or items under this Order.

13 2.3 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of
14 how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for
15 protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in
16 the Good Cause Statement.

17 2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as
18 their support staff).

19 2.5 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or
20 items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as
21 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

22 2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless
23 of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including,
24 among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or
25 generated in disclosures or as a consultant in this Action.

26 2.7 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter
27 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as
28 an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

1 2.8 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action.
2 House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside
3 counsel.

4 2.9 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or
5 other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

6 2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a
7 party to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and
8 have appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm
9 which has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

10 2.11 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,
11 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their
12 support staffs).

13 2.12 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
14 Discovery Material in this Action.

15 2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation
16 support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or
17 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)
18 and their employees and subcontractors.

19 2.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
20 designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

21 2.15 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery
22 Material from a Producing Party.

23 3. SCOPE

24 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only
25 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or
26 extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or
27 compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or
28 presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

1 Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the
2 trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

3 4. DURATION

4 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations
5 imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees
6 otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be
7 deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this Action, with
8 or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and
9 exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this Action,
10 including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time
11 pursuant to applicable law.

12 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

13 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.

14 Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under
15 this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that
16 qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for
17 protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written
18 communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents,
19 items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept
20 unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

21 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations
22 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper
23 purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose
24 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating
25 Party to sanctions.

26 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it
27 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must
28 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

1 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in
2 this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise
3 stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection
4 under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or
5 produced.

6 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

7 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic
8 documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial
9 proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend
10 “CONFIDENTIAL” (hereinafter “CONFIDENTIAL legend”), to each page that
11 contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page
12 qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected
13 portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

14 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection
15 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated
16 which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and
17 before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be
18 deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting Party has identified the
19 documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which
20 documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before
21 producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the
22 “CONFIDENTIAL legend” to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a
23 portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing
24 Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate
25 markings in the margins).

26 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party identify
27 the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the
28 deposition all protected testimony.

1 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and
2 for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on
3 the exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the
4 legend "CONFIDENTIAL." If only a portion or portions of the information
5 warrants protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the
6 protected portion(s).

7 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent
8 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive
9 the Designating Party's right to secure protection under this Order for such material.
10 Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable
11 efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this
12 Order.

13 14 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

15 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a
16 designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court's
17 Scheduling Order.

18 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute
19 resolution process under Local Rule 37.1 et seq.

20 6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on
21 the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper
22 purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other
23 parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating
24 Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall
25 continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is
26 entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the Court rules on the
27 challenge.

28 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

1 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
2 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this
3 Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such
4 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the
5 conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a
6 Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL
7 DISPOSITION).

8 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a
9 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons
10 authorized under this Order.

11 7.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless
12 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a
13 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated
14 “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

15 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as
16 well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably
17 necessary to disclose the information for this Action;

18 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of
19 the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;

20 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom
21 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the
22 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

23 (d) the court and its personnel;

24 (e) court reporters and their staff;

25 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional
26 Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have
27 signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

28 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a

1 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

2 (h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the
3 Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing party
4 requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit 1 hereto; and (2) they will
5 not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign the
6 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise
7 agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed
8 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may
9 be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except
10 as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

11 (i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel,
12 mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

13 8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED
14 IN OTHER LITIGATION

15 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation
16 that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as
17 “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

18 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification
19 shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

20 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order
21 to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the
22 subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include
23 a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

24 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be
25 pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

26 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with
27 the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this
28 action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the

1 subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party's
2 permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking
3 protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions
4 should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action
5 to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

6 9. A NON-PARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE
7 PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION

8 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a
9 Non-Party in this Action and designated as "CONFIDENTIAL." Such information
10 produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the
11 remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be
12 construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

13 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to
14 produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is
15 subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's
16 confidential information, then the Party shall:

17 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party
18 that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality
19 agreement with a Non-Party;

20 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated
21 Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably
22 specific description of the information requested; and

23 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the
24 Non-Party, if requested.

25 (c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within
26 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party
27 may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery
28 request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall

1 not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the
2 confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court.
3 Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and
4 expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

5 **10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

6 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed
7 Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this
8 Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in
9 writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts
10 to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or
11 persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order,
12 and (d) request such person or persons to execute the “Acknowledgment and
13 Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

14 **11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE**
15 **PROTECTED MATERIAL**

16 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain
17 inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection,
18 the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil
19 Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure
20 may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without
21 prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar
22 as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or
23 information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the
24 parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted
25 to the court.

26 **12. MISCELLANEOUS**

27 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any
28 person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

1 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this
2 Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to
3 disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this
4 Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any
5 ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

6 12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any
7 Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may
8 only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the
9 specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material
10 under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information
11 in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

12 13. FINAL DISPOSITION

13 After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60
14 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return
15 all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in
16 this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations,
17 summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected
18 Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving
19 Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same
20 person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies
21 (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or
22 destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies,
23 abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any
24 of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to
25 retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing
26 transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert
27 reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such
28 materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or

1 constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in
2 Section 4 (DURATION).

3 14. Any violation of this Order may be punished by any and all appropriate
4 measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary
5 sanctions.

6
7 FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.

8
9 DATED: February 3, 2017

10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

/S/ Frederick F. Mumm
Hon. Frederick F. Mumm
United States Magistrate Judge

1 EXHIBIT A

2 ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

3
4 I, _____ [print or type full name], of
5 _____ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury
6 that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that
7 was issued by the United States District Court for the Central District of California
8 on [date] in the case of _____ [**insert formal name of the case and the**
9 **number and initials assigned to it by the court**]. I agree to comply with and to be
10 bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and
11 acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment
12 in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner
13 any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any
14 person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

15 I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the
16 Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this
17 Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after
18 termination of this action. I hereby appoint _____ [print
19 or type full name] of _____ [print or type
20 full address and telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in
21 connection with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this
22 Stipulated Protective Order.

23 Date: _____

24 City and State where sworn and signed: _____

25
26 Printed name: _____

27
28 Signature: _____