Case 2:1₁7-cv-00975-RGK-AGR Document 27-1 Filed 12/11/17 Page 1 of 17 Page ID #:75 1 LAW OFFICES OF CHRISTIAN J. GARRIS CHRISTIAN J. GARRIS SBN 175808 633 West Fifth Street, 28th Floor Los Angeles, 2131 624 20071 2 Telephone: (213) 624-2900 Facsimile: (213) 624-2901 Email: cjg@christiangarris.com 3 4 Attorneys for Plaintiff 5 Amir Shlesinger (SBN 204132) ashlesinger@reedsmith.com 6 Jonathan D. Gershon (SBN 306979) 7 gershon@reedsmith.com NOTE CHANGES MADE BY THE COURT REED SMITH LLP 355 South Grand Avenue, Suite 2900 8 Los Angeles, California 90071 Telephone: (213) 457-8000 Facsimile: (213) 457-8080 9 Attorneys for Défendants Aetna Life Insurance Company 10 11 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT 12 CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA 13 14 CHRISTOPHER HELMAN, Case No. CV17-00975-RGK(AGRx) an individual, 15 STIPULATED **PROTECTIVE** Plaintiff, ORDER 16 VS. Magistrate: Hon. Alicia G. Rosenberg 17 Ctrm.: B (Spring) AETNA LIFE **INSURANCE** 18 COMPANY and DOES 1-10. inclusive, NOTE CHANGES MADE BY THE COURT 19 Defendants. 20 21 1. A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS 22 Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential, 23 proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public 24 disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may 25 be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to 26 enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this 27 Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to 28 **Protective Order**

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

TO THE CAPACITUDE ON THE STANDING WITH THE

Plaintiff's Version

Defendant contends that this action is likely to involve disclosure and exchange of details regarding Plaintiff's medical treatment and health information, which is protected and confidential, a qualified protective order is necessary to ensure confidentiality and safeguard the privacy of Plaintiff's medical records, identifiable health information, individually and personally identifiable information contained within the administrative record. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery materials, to adequately protect information the parties are entitled to keep confidential, to ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the end of the litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that information will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so designated without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential, non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public record of this case.

Defendant's Version

This action is likely to involve confidential or proprietary technical,

2

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

18

19

20

21

22

23

25

26

27

scientific, financial, business, health, or medical information including regarding Plaintiffs medical treatment and health information which is protected and confidential, and for which a qualified protective order is necessary to ensure confidentiality and safeguard the privacy of Plaintiff's medical records, individually identifiable health information, and personally identifiable information contained within the administrative record. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery materials, to adequately protect information the parties are entitled to keep confidential, to ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the end of the litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that information will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so designated without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential, non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public record of this case.

2. DEFINITIONS

- 2.1 <u>Action</u>: Helman v. Aetna Life Insurance Co., Case No. CV17-00975-RGK(AGRx).
- 2.2 <u>Challenging Party</u>: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information or items under this Order.
 - 2.3 "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items:

Plaintiffs-Version

information (regardless of how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and any other state or Federal Law. as specified above in the Good-Cause Statement.

28

Defendant's Version

information (regardless of how it is generated, stored or maintained) including but not limited to claim data, claim forms, grievances, appeals, or other documents or records or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c) or any other state or federal law, including 45 C.F.R. Parts 160 and 164 promulgated pursuant to the Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (see 45 C.F.R. §§ 164.501 & 160.103). CONFIDENTIAL Information includes information supplied in any form, or any portion thereof, that identifies an individual or subscriber in any manner and relates to the past, present, or future care, services, or supplies relating to the physical or mental health or condition of such individual or subscriber, the provision of health care to such individual or subscriber, or future payment for the provision of health care to such individual or subscriber, including information which reveal subscriber, patient, or member.

- a. names;
- b. all geographic subdivisions smaller than a State, including street address, city, county, precinct, and zip code;
- c. all elements of dates (except year) for dates directly related to an individual, including birth date, admission date, discharge date, age, and date of death;
- d. telephone numbers;
- e. fax numbers;
- f. electronic mail addresses;
- g. social security numbers;
- h. medical record numbers;
- je health plan beneficiary numbers;
- j. account numbers;
- k. certificate/license numbers;

1	l. vehicle identifiers and serial numbers, including license plate					
2	numbers; and serial numbers, including license plate					
3	m. device identifiers and serial numbers;					
4	n. web universal resource locators ("URLs");					
5	o. internet protocol ("IP") address numbers;					
6	p. biometric identifiers, including finger and voice prints;					
7	q. full face photographic images and any comparable images; and/or					
8	r any other unique identifying number, characteristic, or code					
9	2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their					
10						
11	2.5 <u>Designating Party</u> : a Party or Non-Party that designates information or					
12	items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as					
13	"CONFIDENTIAL."					
14	2.6 <u>Disclosure or Discovery Material</u> : all items or information, regardless of					
15	the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including,					
16	among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced					
17	or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.					
18	2.7 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter					
19	pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve					
20	as an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.					
21	2.8 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action.					
22	House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside					
23	counsel.					
24	2.9 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or					
25	other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.					
26	2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party					
27	to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and have					
28	appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm					

which has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

- 2.1 <u>Party</u>: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors, employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their support staffs).
- 2.12 <u>Producing Party</u>: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or Discovery Material in this Action.
- 2.13 <u>Professional Vendors</u>: persons or entities that provide litigation support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and subcontractors.
- 2.14 <u>Protected Material</u>: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as "CONFIDENTIAL."
- 2.15 <u>Receiving Party</u>: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a Producing Party.

3. SCOPE

The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

4. DURATION

Plaintiff's Version

Once a case proceeds to trial, all of the information that was designated as confidential or maintained pursuant to this protective order becomes public and



3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

Defendant's Version

become public absent a separate court order upon written ors of the public, including the press, unless—compolling—reasons—supported—by—specific—factual—findings—to—proceed otherwise are made to the trial-judge in advance of the trial. See Kamakana v. City and County of Honolulu, 447 F.3d 1172, 1180-81 (9th Cir. 2006) (distinguishing good cause. Showing for sealing documents produced in discovery from "compelling reasons" standard when morits related documents are part of sourt record. Accordingly, the terms of this protective order do not extend beyond the commencement of the triple

Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this Action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this Action, including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of 17 Jime pursuant to applicable law

5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited.

Designations that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

5.2 <u>Manner and Timing of Designations</u>. Except as otherwise provided in this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

(a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" (hereinafter "CONFIDENTIAL legend"), to each page that contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix

- (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party identify the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the deposition all protected testimony.
- (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the legend "CONFIDENTIAL." If only a portion or portions of the information warrants protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).
- 5.3 <u>Inadvertent Failures to Designate</u>. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party's right to secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

- 6.1 <u>Timing of Challenges</u>. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court's Scheduling Order.
- 6.2 <u>Meet and Confer</u>. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution process under Local Rule 37.1 et seq.
- 6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper

purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the Court rules on the challenge.

7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

7.1 <u>Basic Principles</u>. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

- 7.2 <u>Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items</u>. Unless otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated "CONFIDENTIAL" only to:
- (a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this Action;
- (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;
 - (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

- (d) the court and its personnel:
- (e) court reporters and their staff;
- (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);
- (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;
- (h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing party requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit A hereto; and (2) they will not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and
- (i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel, mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION

If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as "CONFIDENTIAL," that Party must:

(a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

(c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as "CONFIDENTIAL" before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party's permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

9. A NON-PARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION

- (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in this Action and designated as "CONFIDENTIAL." Such information produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.
- (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's confidential information, then the Party shall:
- (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement

with a Non-Party;

- (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the information requested; and
- (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party, if requested.
- (c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

•

11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED MATERIAL

When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted to the court.

12. MISCELLANEOUS

- 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.
- 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.
- 12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

3

4

5

6

8

Plaintiff's Version

[Plaintiff does not believe that this section should be added to the Court's draft Protective Order.]

Defendant's Version

Use of Protected Material at Hearing or Trial. A party shall only disclose Protected Material at a hearing or trial by requesting the court, prior to the time the information is proffered or adduced, to receive the information only in the presence of those persons designated to receive such information and court personnel, and to designate the transcript appropriately.

11

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

13. FINAL DISPOSITION

After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph within 60 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival

v offices of christian j. garris 633 west fifth street, 28th floor los angeles, california 90071 tax 213,624,2900

Protective Order

Case 2:17-cv-00975-RGK-AGR Document 27-1 Filed 12/11/17 Page 16 of 17 Page ID #:90

law offices of christian j. garris 633 west fifth street, 28th floor los angeles, california 90071 te 213,624,2900 fax 213,624,2901

EXHIBIT A

EAIIIDH A					
ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEME	NT T	ГО ВЕ	BOU	IND	
I,[print					C
[print or type full address], dec					
that I have read in its entirety and understand the Sti					
was issued by the United States District Court for the					
on [date] in the case of Helman v. Aet					
No. CV17-00975-RGK(AGRx). I agree to comply wi					
terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I under					
failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and					
contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not dis					
information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Pr					
or entity except in strict compliance with the provision				any per	SU1
I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction o				too Digts	:,
Court for the Central District of California for the pur					
of this Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enfo					
after termination of this action. I hereby appoint		nem þr	·OUCU	migs oc	Սևո
[print or type full name] of				[pr	
or type full address and telephone number] as my Ca					
process in connection with this action or any proceedin					
this Stipulated Protective Order.	50	laiou i.) OIIIO	IÇCIIICIR	O1
Date:					
City and State where sworn and signed:					
		<u> </u>			•
Printed name:					
		,			
Signature:					
— 17 — Protective Order				-	_