

1 TERI T. PHAM (SBN 193383)
 Email: *tpham@enensteinlaw.com*
 2 ROBERT A. RABBAT (SBN 254602)
 Email: *rrabbat@enensteinlaw.com*
 3 **ENENSTEIN RIBAKOFF LAVIÑA & PHAM**
 4 650 Town Center Drive, Suite 840
 Costa Mesa, CA 92626
 Phone: (310) 899-2070
 5 Fax: (310) 496-1930

6 Attorneys for Plaintiff
 Arminak Solutions LLC

7 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
 8 **CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

10 ARMINAK SOLUTIONS, LLC, a)	Case No. 2:17-cv-01820-RGK (PJWx)
California Limited Liability Company,))	
11)	<u>DISCOVERY MATTER:</u>
12 Plaintiff,)	STIPULATED PROTECTIVE
)	ORDER
13 v.)	
)	Honorable Patrick J. Walsh
14 7-ELEVEN, INC., a Texas)	
15 Corporation; PUGS HOLDING,)	
16 LLC, a Delaware Limited Liability)	
17 Company; and DOES 1 through 20,)	
18 inclusive,)	
19 Defendants.)	
20)	

1. A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Discovery in this action has involved and is likely to continue to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and ask the Court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

This action is likely to involve trade secrets, proprietary business information, competitively sensitive information, or other information the disclosure of which would, in good faith judgment of the Party, or as appropriate, Non-Party, designate the material as confidential or highly confidential, be detrimental to the conduct of that Party's or Non-Party's business or the business of any of that Party's or Non-Party's customers or clients including vendor/customer and pricing lists and other valuable research, development, commercial, financial, technical and/or proprietary information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecution of this action is warranted. Such confidential and proprietary materials and information consist of, among other things, confidential business or financial information, information regarding confidential business practices, or other confidential research, development, or commercial information (including information implicating privacy rights of third parties), information

1 otherwise generally unavailable to the public, or which may be privileged or
2 otherwise protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes, court rules, case
3 decisions, or common law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to
4 facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery
5 materials, to adequately protect information the parties are entitled to keep
6 confidential, to ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of
7 such material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling
8 at the end of the litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such
9 information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that information
10 will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so
11 designated without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential,
12 non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public
13 record of this case.

14
15 **2. DEFINITIONS**

16 2.1 Action: The pending case styled *Arminak Solutions, LLC v. 7-Eleven,*
17 *Inc., Pugs Holding, LLC*, Case No. 2:17-cv-01820-RGK (PJWx).

18 2.2 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation
19 of information or items under this Order.

20 2.3 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of
21 how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for
22 protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in the
23 Good Cause Statement.

24 2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their
25 support staff).

26 2.5 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or
27 items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as
28 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

1 2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of
2 the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including,
3 among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or
4 generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

5 2.7 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter
6 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as
7 an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

8 2.8 House Counsel: attorneys and attorney support staff who are employees
9 of a party to this Action. House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record
10 or any other outside counsel.

11 2.9 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or
12 other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

13 2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party
14 to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and have
15 appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which
16 has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

17 2.11 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,
18 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their
19 support staffs).

20 2.12 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
21 Discovery Material in this Action.

22 2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation
23 support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or
24 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)
25 and their employees and subcontractors.

26 2.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
27 designated as "CONFIDENTIAL."

28 2.15 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery

1 Material from a Producing Party.

2
3 3. SCOPE

4 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only
5 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or
6 extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or
7 compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or
8 presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

9 Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the
10 trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

11
12 4. DURATION

13 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations
14 imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees
15 otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be
16 deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this Action, with
17 or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and
18 exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this Action,
19 including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time
20 pursuant to applicable law.

21
22 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

23 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.
24 Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under
25 this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that
26 qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for
27 protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written
28 communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents, items,

1 or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably
2 within the ambit of this Order.

3 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations
4 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper
5 purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose
6 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating
7 Party to sanctions.

8 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it
9 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must
10 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

11 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in
12 this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise
13 stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection
14 under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or
15 produced.

16 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

17 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic
18 documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial
19 proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend
20 "CONFIDENTIAL" (hereinafter "CONFIDENTIAL legend"), to each page that
21 contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page
22 qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected
23 portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

24 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection
25 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated
26 which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and
27 before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be
28 deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting Party has identified the documents

1 it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents,
2 or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing
3 the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the “CONFIDENTIAL
4 legend” to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or portions of
5 the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly
6 identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the
7 margins).

8 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party identify
9 the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the deposition
10 all protected testimony.

11 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for
12 any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the
13 exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the legend
14 “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information warrants
15 protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected
16 portion(s).

17 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent
18 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the
19 Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such material.
20 Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable
21 efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this
22 Order.

23 24 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

25 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a
26 designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court’s
27 Scheduling Order.

28 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute

1 resolution process under Local Rule 37.1 et seq.

2 6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on
3 the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose
4 (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may
5 expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived
6 or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall continue to afford the
7 material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing
8 Party’s designation until the Court rules on the challenge.

9
10 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

11 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
12 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this
13 Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such
14 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the
15 conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a Receiving
16 Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

17 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a
18 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons
19 authorized under this Order.

20 7.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless
21 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a
22 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated
23 “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

24 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as
25 well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably
26 necessary to disclose the information for this Action;

27 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the
28 Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;

1 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom
2 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the
3 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

4 (d) the court and its personnel;

5 (e) court reporters and their staff;

6 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional
7 Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have
8 signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

9 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a
10 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

11 (h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the
12 Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing party
13 requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit 1 hereto; and (2) they will
14 not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign the
15 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise
16 agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed
17 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may be
18 separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as
19 permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

20 (i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel,
21 mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

22
23 8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN
24 OTHER LITIGATION

25 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation
26 that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as
27 “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

28 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification

1 shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

2 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order
3 to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena
4 or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of
5 this Stipulated Protective Order; and

6 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be
7 pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

8 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with
9 the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this
10 action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the
11 subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s
12 permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking
13 protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions
14 should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action to
15 disobey a lawful directive from another court.

16
17 9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE
18 PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION

19 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a
20 Non-Party in this Action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information
21 produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the
22 remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be
23 construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

24 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to
25 produce a Non-Party’s confidential information in its possession, and the Party is
26 subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party’s
27 confidential information, then the Party shall:

28 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party

1 that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement
2 with a Non-Party;

3 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated
4 Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably
5 specific description of the information requested; and

6 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the
7 Non-Party, if requested.

8 (c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within
9 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party
10 may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery
11 request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall
12 not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the
13 confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court.
14 Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense
15 of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

16
17 **10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

18 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed
19 Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this
20 Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in
21 writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts
22 to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or
23 persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order,
24 and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and
25 Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

1 11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE
2 PROTECTED MATERIAL

3 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain
4 inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection,
5 the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil
6 Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure
7 may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior
8 privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the
9 parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or
10 information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the
11 parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted
12 to the court.

13
14 12. MISCELLANEOUS

15 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any
16 person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

17 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this
18 Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to
19 disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this
20 Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any
21 ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

22 12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any
23 Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may
24 only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the
25 specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material
26 under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in
27 the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

1 13. FINAL DISPOSITION

2 After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60
3 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return
4 all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this
5 subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations,
6 summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected
7 Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving
8 Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same
9 person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies
10 (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or
11 destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies,
12 abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any
13 of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to
14 retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing
15 transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert
16 reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such
17 materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or
18 constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in
19 Section 4 (DURATION).

20 14. Any violation of this Order may be punished by any and all appropriate
21 measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary
22 sanctions.

23
24 ///

1 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

2
3 DATED: _____ ENENSTEIN RIBAKOFF LAVIÑA & PHAM

4
5 By: _____
6 TERI T. PHAM
7 ROBERT A. RABBAT
8 Attorneys for Plaintiff
9 ARMIÑAK SOLUTIONS, LLC

10
11 DATED: _____ CALL & JENSEN

12 By: _____
13 JULIE R. TROTTER
14 SCOTT SHAW
15 Attorneys for Defendants 7-ELEVEN,
16 INC., and PUGS HOLDING, LLC

17 FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.

18 DATED: June 12, 2017

19 

20 _____
21 Honorable Patrick J. Walsh
22 United States Magistrate Judge

EXHIBIT A

ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, _____ [print or type full name], of _____ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for the Central District of California on [date] in the case of *Arminak Solutions, LLC v. 7-Eleven, Inc., Pugs Holding, LLC*, Case No. 2:17-cv-01820-RGK (PJWx). I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further understand that I am to retain all copies of all Protected Material provided to me in the Proceeding in a secure manner, and that all copies of such Protected Material are to remain in my personal custody until termination of my participation in this Action, whereupon the copies of such Protected Material will be returned to counsel who provided me with such Protected Material.

I agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action. I hereby appoint _____ [print or type full name] of _____ [print or type full address and telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

Date: _____

City and State where sworn and signed: _____

Printed name: _____

Signature: _____