David I. Donner	et al v. FCA US LLC et al	Doc. ₄ 4	
1			
2			
3			
4			
5		gii .	
6			
7			
8	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT		
9	CENTRAL DIST	TRICT OF CALIFORNIA	
10			
11	DAVID I. DONNER, et al,) Case No: 2:17-cv-2303 MRW	
12	Plaintiff,	}	
13	vs.	STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER	
14	FCA US LLC, A Delaware Limited) (MRW VERSION 2/17)	
15	FCA US LLC, A Delaware Limited Liability Company; and DOES 1 through 20, inclusive	}	
16	Defendants.	{	
17		}	
18			
19	1. <u>INTRODUCTION</u>		
20	1.1 <u>PURPOSES AND LIMITA</u>	TIONS	
21	Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential,		
22			
23	proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure		
24	and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted.		
25 26	Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate	to and petition the Court to enter the following	
27	Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer		
28	blanket protections on all disclosures or	responses to discovery and that the protection it	

affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

1.2 GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

This is an action brought by owners of a 2011 Jeep Grand Cherokee against the vehicle's manufacturer alleging violations of the Song-Beverly Consumer Warranty Act as well as a claim for fraudulent concealment of a vehicle defect. Plaintiff seeks discovery from Convergys Corporation, a non-party subcontractor of Defendant FCA US LLC ("FCA") that provides call center and customer support services. Plaintiff requests certain information from Convergys and FCA, including call center procedures and guidelines, telephone scripts, and internal corporate policies and communications, which Stericycle, Convergys and/or FCA claim to be proprietary and confidential and that the unauthorized disclosure of said information would cause harm to Stericycle, Convergys Corporation and/or FCA if their respective competitors were able to acquire and utilize this information to their advantage.

25 ///

2. <u>DEFINITIONS</u>

- 2.1 <u>Action:</u> the above-captioned federal law suit, as well as any related or consolidated law suits in this Court brought on behalf of plaintiffs alleging violations of the Song-Beverly Consumer Warranty Act against FCA in which plaintiffs are represented by Knight law Group as set forth in the Appendix of Actions attached hereto
- 2.2 <u>Challenging Party</u>: A Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information or other items under this Order.
- 2.3 "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in the Good Cause Statement.
- 2.4 <u>Counsel</u>: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their support staff.)
- 2.5 <u>Designating Party:</u> a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it produces in disclosures or in response to discovery as "CONFIDENTIAL."
- 2.6 <u>Disclosure or Discovery Material:</u> all items or information, regardless of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained, (including, among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

- 2.7 <u>Expert:</u> a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to the ligation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.
- 2.8 <u>House Counsel:</u> attorneys who are employees of a Party to this Action. House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.
- 2.9 <u>Non-Party:</u> any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.
- 2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and have appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.
- 2.11 <u>Party:</u> any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors, employees, consultants, retained experts, Outside Counsel of Record (and their support staffs).
- 2.12 <u>Producing Party:</u> A Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or Discovery Material in this Action.
- 2.13 <u>Professional Vendors:</u> persons or entities that provide litigation support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and subcontractors.

- 2.14 <u>Protected Material:</u> any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as "CONFIDENTIAL".
- 2.15 <u>Receiving Party:</u> a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a Producing Party.

3. SCOPE

The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

Any use of Protected Material at trial will be governed by the orders of the trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

4. <u>DURATION</u>

Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this Order will remain in effect until Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition will be deemed to be the later (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this Action (including all related law suits as defined above), with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials or reviews of this Action (including all related law suits as defined above), including the time limits for

filing any motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to applicable law.

5. <u>DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL</u>

5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.

Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or times for protection under this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambient of this Order.

Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that is designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing that inapplicable designation.

5.2 <u>Manner and Timing of Designations.</u> Except as otherwise provided in this Order (see, e.g. second paragraph of section 5.2 (a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

(a) For information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at minimum, the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" (hereinafter "CONFIDENTIAL legend"), to each page that contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection will be deemed "CONFIDENTIAL". After the inspecting party has identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix "CONFIDENTIAL legend" to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

- (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party identify the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the deposition all protected testimony.
- (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any other tangible items, that Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior or the container or containers in which the information is stored the legend "CONFIDENTIAL." If only a portion or portions of the information warrants protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, will identify the protected portion(s).
- 5.3 <u>Inadvertent Failures to Designate.</u> If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party's right to secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

- 6.1 <u>Timing of Challenges.</u> Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court's Scheduling Order.
- 6.2 <u>Meet and Confer.</u> The Challenging Party will initiate the dispute resolution process (and, if necessary, file a discovery motion) under Local Rule 37.1 et seq.

6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding will be on the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties will continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the Court rules on the challenge.

7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

7.1 <u>Basis Principles.</u> A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

7.2 <u>Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items.</u> Unless otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated "CONFIDENTIAL" only to:

depositions that reveal Protected Material may be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

(i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel, mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION

If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as "CONFIDENTIAL," that Party must:

- (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification will include a copy of the subpoena or court order;
- (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification will include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and
- (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena or court order will not produce any information designated in this action as "CONFIDENTIAL" before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party's permission. The

Designating Party will bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

9. <u>A NON-PARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION</u>

- (a) The Terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in this Action and designated as "CONFIDENTIAL." Such information produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.
- (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's confidential information, then the Party will:
- (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and Non-Party that some or all the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;
- (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the information requested, and
- (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party, if requested.

days of receiving the notice of accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party will not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party will bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

10. <u>UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL</u>

If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgement and Agreement to be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

11. <u>INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE</u> <u>PROTECTED MATERIAL</u>

When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil

Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted to the court.

12. MISCELLANEOUS

- 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.
- 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order no Party waives any right or otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.
- Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

13. FINAL DISPOSITION

25

26

27

28

Any such archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION). 14. proceedings, financial or evidentiary sanctions, reference or disciplinary authorities, or other appropriate action at the discretion of the Court.

1	IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.
2	DATED: 2/4/18
3	Attorneys for Plaintiff
4	DATED: 2/5/18 Moth Muliot
5	Attorneys for Defendant
6	
7	
8	FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED
9	DATED: 3/15/2018
10	HON. MICHAEL R. WILNER United States Magistrate Judge
11	Officed States Wagistrate Judge
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	

EXHIBIT A ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I,	[full name], of	
	[full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read	
in its entirety and	d understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the	
United States Di	strict Court for the Central District of California on [date] in the case of	
Donner v. FCA I	US LLC, et al., 2:17-cv-2303. I agree to comply with and to be bound	
by all the terms of	of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge	
that failure to so	comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of	
contempt. I sole	mnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or	
item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in		
strict compliance	with the provisions of this Order.	
I further ag	gree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for	
the Central Distri	ict of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated	
Protective Order,	even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this	
action. I hereby	appoint [full name] of	
	[full address and telephone number] as my	
California agent	for service of process in connection with this action or any proceedings	
related to enforce	ement of this Stipulated Protective Order.	
City and State wh	nere signed:	
Signature:		

APPENDIX

2:17-cv-02267-MRW Kirk Gordon Bisto
2:17-cv-03382-MRW Blaquera, David
2:17-cv-02291-MRW Rafael Cardenas
2:17-cv-05580-MRW Corpeno, Walter
5:17-cv-00562-MRW Carl J. Cieslikowski
2:17-cv-02303-MRW David I. Donner & Kathleen A. Donner
2:16-cv-05415-MRW Juane L. Elenes
5:17-cv-00560-MRW Espudo, Maria
5:17-cv-00557-MRW Flores, Deanna
2:17-cv-02198-MRW Ana S. Garcia
2:17-cv-02665-MRW Garcia, Jose
2:17-cv-02322-MRW Garcia, Robert

5:17-cv-00545-MRW Gonzalez, Josie

2:17-cv-02302-MRW Gonzalez, Maribel & Palacios, Alfredo
2:17-cv-01823-MRW Renee E. Hall
5:17-cv-00549-MRW Hansen, Johan
5:17-cv-00547-MRW Huerta, Michael
2:17-cv-02435-MRW Jordan, Harold & Marna
2:16-cv-05452-MRW Gloria J. Lawrence
2:16-cv-05190-MRW Laura Lee
2:17-cv-02322-MRW Macias, Robert & Karen Macias
2:17-cv-04307-PSG-MRW Martinez, Alvarado, Abel
2:17-cv-04307-MRW Alvarado Murrieta, Julio
5:17-cv-00568-PSG-MRW Schwartz, Donna

2:17-cv-02475-PSG-MRW Tarango, Barbara

and Hernandez, Freddy