

1 JESSE M. JAUREGUI (SBN 129586)
 2 LISA GARCIA (SBN 301362)
 3 **ALSTON & BIRD LLP**
 333 South Hope Street, 16th Floor
 3 Los Angeles, CA 90071-1410
 Telephone: 213-576-1000
 4 E-mail: jesse.jauregui@alston.com
 lisa.garcia@alston.com

5 Attorneys for Defendant
 6 **VOYAGER SOPRIS LEARNING, INC.**

7 MATTHEW A. KAUFMAN (SBN 166986)
 8 **THE KAUFMAN LAW FIRM**
 4195 E. Thousand Oaks Blvd., Suite 250
 Westlake Village, CA 91362
 9 Telephone: 818-990-1999
 E-mail: mkaufman@allklf.com

10 Attorneys for Plaintiff
 11 **CECELIA ORTIZ**

12
 13 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
 14 **CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

15
 16 CECILIA ORTIZ, an individual,
 17 Plaintiff,
 18 v.
 19 VOYAGER SOPRIS LEARNING, INC., a
 20 Colorado corporation; and DOES 1 through
 10, inclusive,
 21 Defendants.

Case No.: 2:17-cv-05200-RGK (JEMx)

**STIPULATED PROTECTIVE
 ORDER**

1 1. A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

2 Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential,
3 proprietary or private information for which special protection from public disclosure
4 and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted.
5 Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to enter the
6 following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does
7 not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the
8 protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited
9 information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable
10 legal principles.

11 B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

12 This action is likely to involve trade secrets, customer and pricing lists and
13 other valuable development, commercial, financial, technical and/or proprietary
14 information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any
15 purpose other than prosecution of this action is warranted. Such confidential and
16 proprietary materials and information consist of, among other things, confidential
17 business or financial information, information regarding confidential business
18 practices, or other confidential development, or commercial information (including
19 information implicating privacy rights of third parties), information otherwise
20 generally unavailable to the public, or which may be privileged or otherwise protected
21 from disclosure under state or federal statutes, court rules, case decisions, or common
22 law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the prompt
23 resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery materials, to adequately
24 protect information the parties are entitled to keep confidential, to ensure that the
25 parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material in preparation for and
26 in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the end of the litigation, and serve
27 the ends of justice, a protective order for such information is justified in this matter. It
28 is the intent of the parties that information will not be designated as confidential for

1 tactical reasons and that nothing be so designated without a good faith belief that it
2 has been maintained in a confidential, non-public manner, and there is good cause
3 why it should not be part of the public record of this case.

4 C. ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF PROCEDURE FOR FILING UNDER
5 SEAL

6 The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3, below, that this
7 Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information under
8 seal; Local Civil Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and the
9 standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file
10 material under seal.

11 There is a strong presumption that the public has a right of access to judicial
12 proceedings and records in civil cases. In connection with non-dispositive motions,
13 good cause must be shown to support a filing under seal. *See Kamakana v. City and*
14 *County of Honolulu*, 447 F.3d 1172, 1176 (9th Cir. 2006), *Phillips v. Gen. Motors*
15 *Corp.*, 307 F.3d 1206, 1210-11 (9th Cir. 2002), *Makar-Welbon v. Sony Electronics, Inc.*,
16 187 F.R.D. 576, 577 (E.D. Wis. 1999) (even stipulated protective orders require good
17 cause showing), and a specific showing of good cause or compelling reasons with
18 proper evidentiary support and legal justification, must be made with respect to
19 Protected Material that a party seeks to file under seal. The parties' mere designation
20 of Disclosure or Discovery Material as CONFIDENTIAL does not— without the
21 submission of competent evidence by declaration, establishing that the material sought
22 to be filed under seal qualifies as confidential, privileged, or otherwise protectable—
23 constitute good cause.

24 Further, if a party requests sealing related to a dispositive motion or trial, then
25 compelling reasons, not only good cause, for the sealing must be shown, and the relief
26 sought shall be narrowly tailored to serve the specific interest to be protected. *See*
27 *Pintos v. Pacific Creditors Ass'n.*, 605 F.3d 665, 677-79 (9th Cir. 2010). For each
28 item or type of information, document, or thing sought to be filed or introduced under

1 seal in connection with a dispositive motion or trial, the party seeking protection must
2 articulate compelling reasons, supported by specific facts and legal justification, for
3 the requested sealing order. Again, competent evidence supporting the application to
4 file documents under seal must be provided by declaration.

5 Any document that is not confidential, privileged, or otherwise protectable in its
6 entirety will not be filed under seal if the confidential portions can be redacted. If
7 documents can be redacted, then a redacted version for public viewing, omitting only
8 the confidential, privileged, or otherwise protectable portions of the document, shall
9 be filed. Any application that seeks to file documents under seal in their entirety
10 should include an explanation of why redaction is not feasible.

11 2. DEFINITIONS

12 2.1 Action: This pending federal lawsuit.

13 2.2 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation
14 of information or items under this Order.

15 2.3 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of
16 how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection
17 under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in the Good
18 Cause Statement.

19 2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their
20 support staff).

21 2.5 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or
22 items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as
23 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

24 2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of
25 the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including,
26 among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or
27 generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.
28

1 2.7 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter
2 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an
3 expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

4 2.8 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action.
5 House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside
6 counsel.

7 2.9 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association or
8 other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

9 2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party
10 to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and have
11 appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm that has
12 appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

13 2.11 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,
14 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their
15 support staffs).

16 2.12 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
17 Discovery Material in this Action.

18 2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support
19 services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or
20 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)
21 and their employees and subcontractors.

22 2.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
23 designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

24 2.15 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material
25 from a Producing Party.

26 3. SCOPE

27 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only
28 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted

1 from Protected Material which contains confidential or proprietary information; (2) all
2 copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any
3 testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might
4 reveal Protected Material.

5 Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the trial
6 judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

7 4. DURATION

8 Once a case proceeds to trial, information that was designated as
9 CONFIDENTIAL or maintained pursuant to this protective order used or introduced
10 as an exhibit at trial becomes public and will be presumptively available to all
11 members of the public, including the press, unless compelling reasons supported by
12 specific factual findings to proceed otherwise are made to the trial judge in advance of
13 the trial. *See Kamakana*, 447 F.3d at 1180-81 (distinguishing “good cause” showing
14 for sealing documents produced in discovery from “compelling reasons” standard
15 when merits-related documents are part of court record). Accordingly, the terms of
16 this protective order do not extend beyond the commencement of the trial.

17 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

18 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.

19 Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this
20 Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies
21 under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for protection
22 only those parts of material, documents, items or oral or written communications that
23 qualify so that other portions of the material, documents, items or communications for
24 which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this
25 Order.

26 Mass, indiscriminate or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations
27 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper
28 purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose

1 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating Party
2 to sanctions.

3 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it
4 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must
5 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

6 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in
7 this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise
8 stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection
9 under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or
10 produced.

11 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

12 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic
13 documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial
14 proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend
15 "CONFIDENTIAL" (hereinafter "CONFIDENTIAL legend"), to each page that
16 contains protected material. If only a portion of the material on a page qualifies for
17 protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s)
18 (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

19 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection
20 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated
21 which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before
22 the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be deemed
23 "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants
24 copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents, or
25 portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing the
26 specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the "CONFIDENTIAL legend"
27 to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion of the material on a
28

1 page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the
2 protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

3 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party identifies
4 the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the deposition
5 all protected testimony.

6 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for
7 any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the
8 exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the legend
9 “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information warrants
10 protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected
11 portion(s).

12 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent
13 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the
14 Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such material.
15 Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable
16 efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this
17 Order.

18 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

19 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a
20 designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court’s
21 Scheduling Order.

22 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute
23 resolution process under Local Rule 37-1 *et seq.*

24 6.3 Joint Stipulation. Any challenge submitted to the Court shall be via a
25 joint stipulation pursuant to Local Rule 37-2.

26 6.4 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on
27 the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose
28 (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may

1 expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived or
2 withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall continue to afford the
3 material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing
4 Party’s designation until the Court rules on the challenge.

5 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

6 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
7 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this
8 Action only for prosecuting, defending or attempting to settle this Action. Such
9 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the
10 conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a Receiving
11 Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

12 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a
13 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons
14 authorized under this Order.

15 7.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless
16 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a
17 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated “CONFIDENTIAL”
18 only to:

19 (a) the Receiving Party, Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this
20 Action, as well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is
21 reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this Action;

22 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the
23 Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;

24 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom
25 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the
26 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

27 (d) the court and its personnel;

28 (e) court reporters and their staff;

1 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional
2 Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have
3 signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

4 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a
5 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

6 (h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the
7 Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing party
8 requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit 1 hereto; and (2) they will
9 not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign the
10 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed
11 by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed deposition
12 testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may be separately
13 bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted
14 under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

15 (i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel,
16 mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

17 8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN
18 OTHER LITIGATION

19 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation
20 that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as
21 “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

22 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall
23 include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

24 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to
25 issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or
26 order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this
27 Stipulated Protective Order; and
28

1 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued
2 by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

3 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with
4 the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this
5 action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the
6 subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s
7 permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking
8 protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions
9 should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action to
10 disobey a lawful directive from another court.

11 9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED
12 IN THIS LITIGATION

13 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-
14 Party in this Action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information
15 produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the
16 remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be
17 construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

18 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to
19 produce a Non-Party’s confidential information in its possession, and the Party is
20 subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party’s
21 confidential information, then the Party shall:

22 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party
23 that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement
24 with a Non-Party;

25 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated
26 Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably
27 specific description of the information requested; and
28

1 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the
2 Non-Party, if requested.

3 (c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within 14
4 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may
5 produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request.
6 If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce
7 any information in its possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality
8 agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court. Absent a court
9 order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking
10 protection in this court of its Protected Material.

11 10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

12 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed
13 Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this
14 Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in
15 writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts
16 to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or
17 persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order,
18 and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and
19 Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

20 11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE
21 PROTECTED MATERIAL

22 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain
23 inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection,
24 the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil
25 Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure
26 may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior
27 privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the
28 parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or

1 information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the
2 parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted to
3 the court.

4 12. MISCELLANEOUS

5 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any
6 person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

7 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this
8 Protective Order, no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to
9 disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this
10 Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any
11 ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

12 12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any
13 Protected Material must comply with Local Civil Rule 79-5. Protected Material may
14 only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the
15 specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material
16 under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in
17 the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

18 13. FINAL DISPOSITION

19 After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60
20 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return
21 all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this
22 subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations,
23 summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected
24 Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party
25 must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person
26 or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by
27 category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed
28 and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts,

1 compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any of the
2 Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an
3 archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts,
4 legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports,
5 attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such materials
6 contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or constitute
7 Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in Section 4
8 (DURATION).

9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

1 14. VIOLATION

2 Any violation of this Order may be punished by appropriate measures
3 including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary sanctions.

4 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

5 DATED: November 29, 2017

6
7 /s/Lisa Garcia
8 JESSE M. JAUREGUI
9 LISA GARCIA
10 **ALSTON & BIRD LLP**
11 Attorneys for Plaintiff

12 DATED: November 29, 2017

13 /s/Matthew A. Kaufman
14 MATTHEW A. KAUFMAN
15 **THE KAUFMAN LAW FIRM**
16 Attorneys for Defendant

17 Attestation: I, Lisa Garcia, hereby attest that I have received the consent of
18 Matthew A. Kaufman to file this document and that they concur with this document's
19 contents.

20 FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.

21 DATED: November 30, 2017

22 
23 HONORABLE R. JOHN E. McDERMOTT
24 UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE

1 **EXHIBIT A**

2 **ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND**

3 I, _____ [print or type full name], of
4 _____ [print or type full address], declare under
5 penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated
6 Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for the Central
7 District of California on [date] in the case of [insert formal name of the case and the
8 number and initials assigned to it by the court]. I agree to comply with and to be
9 bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and
10 acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment
11 in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner
12 any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any
13 person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

14 I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the
15 Central District of California for enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective
16 Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action.

17 I hereby appoint _____ [print or type full name] of
18 _____ [print or type full address and telephone
19 number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with this action or
20 any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

21 Date: _____

22 City and State where sworn and signed: _____

23
24 Printed name: _____

25
26 Signature: _____