RICHARD D. WILLIAMS (SBN 58640) rwilliams@lyttonwilliams.com MINA HAKAKIAN (SBN 237666) mhakakian@lyttonwilliams.com LYTTON & WILLIAMS LLP 3 1539 Westwood Blvd., Suite 200 Los Angeles, California 90024 Tel.: (310) 982-2733; Fax: (310) 277-5952 4 5 Attorneys for Plaintiff. BRAND TARZANA SURGICAL 6 INSTITUTE, INC. 7 KAREN A. BRAJE 8 kbraje@reedsmith.com REED SMITH LLP 101 Second Street, Suite 1800 San Francisco, CÁ 94105 Tel.: (415) 659-5948; Fax: (415) 391-8269 10 11 12 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT 13 CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA, WESTERN DIVISION 14 15 BRAND TARZANA SURGICAL Case No. 2:17-CV-08177-DSF (ASx) **INSTITUTE, INC.,** a California Limited 16 Liability Company 17 **Plaintiff** 18 AMENDED JOINT STIPULATION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER RE VS. 19 PRODUCTION AND USE OF BLUE CROSS OF CALIFORNIA, dba CONFIDENTIAL DOCUMENTS ANTHEM BLUE CROSS and related 20 entity names; and **Does 1 through 100**; 21 **Defendants** Complaint Filed: 11/9/2017 22 23 24 **PURPOSE AND LIMITATIONS** 1. 25 Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve production 26 of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from 27 public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation 28 may be warranted. Accordingly, the Parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court

11

10

12

25

26

27

28

to enter the following Amended Joint Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles. The Parties further acknowledge, as set for in Section 12.3, below, that this Proposed Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information under seal; Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

#### **B.** GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

This Action will involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information and/or material for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted. The information and/or material qualify for a protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26 (c), including but not limited to, information the Producing Party believes in good faith to be protected under relevant provisions of applicable law regarding confidential business, competitive or privacy information, trade secret information, non public financial or business information, or private health or personal information protected from disclosure under the health Insurance Probability and Accountability Act of 1996 ("HIPPA") 42 U.S.c §1330, et seq., California Health & Safety Code § 1280.15, the California Confidentiality of Medical Information Act, Cal.Civ. Code §56, et seq. or the Lanterman-Petris-Short Act, Welfare & Institution Code § 5000, et seq., which the Producing Party is prohibited from revealing or would not normally reveal to third parties except in confidence, or has undertaken with others to maintain its confidence. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery and

#### 2. **DEFINITION**

record of this case.

2.1 <u>Action:</u> Action shall refer to the above-titled action, United States District Court, Central District of California, Case No. 2:17-CV-008177-DSF (Asx).

disclosure of material, to adequately protect information the Parties are entitled to

keep confidential, to ensure that the Parties are permitted reasonably necessary uses of

such material in preparation for an in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at

the end of the litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such

will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so

information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the Parties that information

designated without a good faith and belief that it has been maintained in confidential,

non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public

- 2.2 <u>Challenging Party</u>: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information or items under this Order.
- 2.3 "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26 (c), including but not limited to patient records and data, claim files, non-public financial records and data, employee or personnel files, customer or client lists, trade secrets or competitive information, confidential, financial or business information, confidential contracts, other healthcare-related information protected by The Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996, and all other information that the party in good faith believes will, if disclosed, cause harm to the producing Party's competitive position.
- 2.4 <u>"CONFIDENTIAL-ATTORNEY'S EYES ONLY" Information or Items</u>: Subset of information (regardless of how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal rule of Civil Procedure 26 (c)

15

16 17

18 19

20 21

22

23 24

25 26

27 28 subject to limited disclosure as set forth in Paragraph 7.3, that will, if disclosed, cause substantial competitive and economic harm to the Producing Party. This includes, but is not limited to trade secrets, Blue Cross's proprietary claims-review and audit processes, and all other non-public, proprietary financial, regulatory, or strategic information and data, to the extent that any of these categories of information or tangible things will, if disclosed, cause substantial competitive and economic harm to the Producing Party.

- 2.5 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action. House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.
- 2.6 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and have appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.
- Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or 2.7 items that it produces in disclosures or in response to discovery as "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY."
- 2.8 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are provided, produced or generated in relation to the claims and disputes in this matter or in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.
- Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter 2.9 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.
- 2.10 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation association, or other legal entity not named as a Party to this Action.

14 15

16

17

19

18

20 21

23

22

25

24

26

27

28

- Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors, employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their support staffs).
- 2.12 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or Discovery Material in this Action.
- 2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and subcontractors.
- 2.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL - ATTORNEYS'S EYES ONLY."
- Receiving Party: a party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material form a Producing Party.

#### 3. **SCOPE**

The protection conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material (as defined above), but also any and all copies, experts, or compilations of Protected Material. However, the protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order do not cover the following information: (a) any information that is in the public domain at the time of disclosure to a Receiving Party or becomes part of the public domain after its disclosure to a Receiving Party as a result of publication not involving a violation of this order, including becoming part of the public record through trial or otherwise; and (b) any information known to the Receiving Party prior to the disclosure or obtained by the Receiving Party after the disclosure from a source who obtained the information lawfully and under no obligation of confidentiality to the Designating Party. Any use of the Protected Material at trial shall be governed by

3

4

1

#### **DURATION** 4.

Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this Action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this Action, including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to applicable law.

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

11

#### **DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL** 5.

5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards.

If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

- Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in 5 2 this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of Section 5.2 (a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or produced. Designation in conformity with this Order requires:
  - (a) for information in documentary from (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the producing Party affix the legend

"CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES

ONLY" to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion
or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the

Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected protion(s) (e.g.,
by making appropriate markings in the margins).

- (b) for testimony given in a deposition, confidentiality designations shall be made either on the record or by written notice to the other party within 14 days of receipt of the transcript. Unless otherwise agreed, depositions shall be treated as "Confidential" during the 14-day period following receipt of the transcript. The deposition of any witness (or any portion of such deposition) that encompasses Confidential information shall be taken only in the presence of persons who are qualified to have access to such information.
- (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information or item is stored the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY." If only a portion or portions of the information or item warrant protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).
- 5.3 <u>Inadvertent Failures to Designate</u>. If timely corrected, the inadvertent failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party's right to secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable effort to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

6.

# 

## 

## 

## 

## 

#### CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

- 6.1 <u>Timing of Challenges</u>. Any party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court's Scheduling Order.
- 6.2 <u>Meet and Confer.</u> The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution process under Local Rule 37.1 et seq.
- 6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other Parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived or withdraws the confidentiality designation, all Parties shall continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the Court rules on the challenge.

### 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

- 7.1 <u>Basic Principles</u>. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this case only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this litigation or related litigation involving some or all of the Parties hereto. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the litigation has been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with provisions of Section 13 below.
- 7.2 <u>Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items</u>. Unless otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated "CONFIDENTIAL" only to:
  - (a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as well

- as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this litigation;
- (b) the officer, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary of this litigation;
- (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have singed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);
- (d) the court and its personnel;
- (e) court reports and their staff, professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, licensed private investigators retained by Counsel, and Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);
- (f) during the depositions, witnesses in the Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material must be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Amended Joint Stipulation for Protective order.
- (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.
- 7.3 <u>Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL ATTORNEY'S EYES ONLY"</u>

  <u>Information or Items</u>. Unless otherwise ordered by the Court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any information or item

designated "CONFIDENTIAL - ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" only to:

- (a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this Action
- (b) Parties' House Counsel in this Action;
- (c) Expert (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);
- (d) the Court and its personnel;
- (e) court reporters and their staff, professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, licenced private investigators retained by Counsel, and Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);
- (f) during their depositions, witnesses in the Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material must be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Amended Joint Stipulation for Protective Order.
- (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

# 

#### 8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED

If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels disclosure of any information designated by an opposing or third party in this Action as "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES

- (a) unless prohibited by a Court Order, or specifically prohibited by a statute or regulation cited to the producing party by the requesting party, promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order, unless prohibited by law;
- (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the request, or subpoena, or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Amended Joint Stipulation for Protective Order; and
- (c) when applicable, as set forth in ¶ (a), cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected. However, the Parties must follow the procedures set forth in Federal Rule of civil Procedure 45 (d)(2) when asserting that subpoenaed or requested information is subject to a privilege. The filing of a motion for a protective order does not, by itself, stay compliance with a subpoena.

If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order from a court of competent jurisdiction, the Party served with the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this Action as "CONFIDENTIAL" before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party's permission or as otherwise required by law or court order. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its Confidential Material and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

# 9. <u>A NON-PARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE</u> PRODUCED

- 9.1 The terms of this Order are applicable to information, documents and/or tangible things produced by a Non-Party in this Action, and designated as "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL ATTORNEYS'S EYES ONLY." Such information produced by Non-Parties, when so designated by the Non-Party upon production or by any other Party pursuant to Section 9.2 below, is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.
- 9.2 In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's confidential information, then the Party shall:
  - (a) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;
  - (b) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Amended Joint Stipulation for Protective Order in this litigation, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the information requested; and
  - (c) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party.

If the Non-Party fails to object or seek a protective order form this Court within fourteen (14) days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court.

## $_{4}\parallel$

## 12. <u>MISCELLANEOUS</u>

12.1 <u>Right to Further Relief</u>. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its modification by the court in the future.

of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense

### 10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Amended Joint Stipulation for Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to receive all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

## 11. <u>UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PRIVILEGED INFORMATION</u>

In accordance with Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26 (b) (5) (B) and Federal Rule of Evidence 502, any Party who inadvertently produces Discovery Material that is privileged or otherwise immune from discovery shall, promptly upon discovery of such inadvertent production, so advise the Receiving Party and request that the Discovery Material be returned. The Receiving Party shall return, sequester, or

destroy such inadvertently produced Discovery Materials, including all copies, within five (5) business days of receiving such a written request. The Party returning such inadvertently produced Discovery Materials may thereafter seek re-production of any such Discovery Materials pursuant to applicable law.

12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulation to the entry of this Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item or any ground not addressed in this Amended Joint Stipulation for Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

12.3 Filing Protected Material. Without written permission from the Designating Party or a court order secured after appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Party may not file in the public record in this Action any Protected

Designating Party or a court order secured after appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Party may not file in the public record in this Action any Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected Material must comply with Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at issue. Pursuant to Local Rule 79-5, a sealing order will issue only upon a request establishing that the Protected Material at issue is privileged, protectable as a trade secret, or otherwise entitled to protection under the law. If a Receiving Party's request to file Protected Material under seal pursuant to Local Rule 79-5 is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

#### 13. FINAL DISPOSITION

Within 60 days after the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, each Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not

1	retained any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format			
2	reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this			
3	provision, Counsel are entitled to retain any archival copy of all pleadings, motion			
4	papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence,			
5	deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work production, and consultant			
6	and expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such			
7	archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this			
8	Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).			
9				
10	IT IS SO STIPULATED THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.			
11				
12	Dated: March 8, 2018	Respectfully submitted,		
13		LYT	TON & WILLIAMS LLP	
14				
15		By:	/s/ Richard D. Williams	
16 17			Richard D. Williams, Attorneys for Plaintiff, Brand Tarzana Surgical Institute, Inc.	
18	Dated: March 8, 2018			
19				
20				
21		By:	/s/ Karen A. Braje	
22			Karen A. Braje	
23			Attorneys for Defendant, Blue Cross of California, dba Anthem Blue Cross	
24	FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.			
25	<b>Dated:</b> March 9, 2018			
26				
27	/ s / Alka Sagar			
28	Honorable Alka Sagar United States Magistrate Judge			

## 

## 

## **EXHIBIT A**

### ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

Ι	_, declare under penalty of perjury that I			
have read in its entirety and understand the Amended Joint Stipulation for Protective				
Order that was issued by the United States D	District Court for the Central District of			
California on [ ] in the cas	se of Brand Tarzana Surgical Institute,			
Inc. v. Blue Cross of California dba Anthem	Blue Cross, Case No. 2:17-cv-08177-			
DSF (ASx).				
I agree to comply with and to be boun	d by all the terms of this Amended Joint			
Stipulation for Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to do				
so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I				
solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is				
subject to this Amended Joint Stipulation for Protective Order to any person or entity				
except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.				
I further agree to submit to the jurisdic	ction of the United States District Court			
for the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this				
Amended Joint Stipulation for Protective Order, even if such enforcement				
proceedings occur after termination of this Action.				
Date:				
City and State Where sown and signed:				
Printed Name:				
Signature:				