1	Janice P. Brown, Esq. (SBN 114433)			
2	brown@brownlawgroup.com			
3	Cody J. Cocanig, Esq. (SBN 303894) cocanig@brownlawgroup.com	NOTE: CHANGES MADE BY THE COURT		
	BROWN LAW GROUP			
	600 B Street, Suite 1650 San Diego, California 92101			
5	Telephone: (619) 330-1700 / Facsimile: (6	19) 330-1701		
6	Attorneys for Defendant SAFECO INSU	RANCE COMPANY OF ILLINOIS		
7				
8	Richard T. Miller, Esq. (SBN 155522) rtm@richardtmillerlaw.com			
9	LAW OFFICES OF RICHARD T. MILL	ER		
10	7120 Hayvenhurst Ave., Suite 108 Van Nuys, CA 91406			
11	Telephone: (818) 994-8234 / Facsimile: (818) 994-8235			
12	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT			
13	FOR THE CENTRAL DI	STRICT OF CALIFORNIA		
14				
15	MITCHELL R. PINDUS and POLINA)			
16	K. PINDUS,	CASE NO.: 2:17-cv-08185-PSG-JPR		
17	Plaintiffs,			
18) v.)	STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER		
19) SAFECO INSURANCE COMPANY)			
20	OF ILLINOIS, and DOES 1 through 10,)	Complaint Filed: September 28, 2017 Removal Filed: November 9, 2017		
21	Inclusive,			
22	Defendants.			
23				
24	Plaintiffs MITCHELL R. PINDUS	S and POLINA K. PINDUS ("Plaintiffs")		
25	and Defendant SAFECO INSURANCE COMPANY OF ILLINOIS ("Defendant")			
26	(Plaintiffs and Defendant are collectively referred to as the "Parties") agree to be			
27	bound by, and agree to instruct their rep	resentatives to abide by, the terms of the		
28	following protective order, and hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to enter			
	Pindus vs. Safeco Insurance STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER	Case No.: 2:17-cv-08185-PSG-JPR Page 1		
		Dockets.Justia.		

the following stipulated protective order (hereafter "Stipulated Protective Order" or
 "Order")

3

1.

4

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER

A. <u>PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS</u>

5 Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public 6 7 disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may 8 be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to 9 enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to 10 11 discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends 12 only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment 13 under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth 14 in Section 12, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to 15 file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the 16 procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a 17 party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

. _

18

B. <u>GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT</u>

19 This action is likely to involve trade secrets, actuarial analysis, customer and pricing lists and other valuable research, development, commercial, financial, 2021 technical and/or proprietary information for which the parties believe special 22 protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than 23 prosecution of this action is warranted. Such confidential and proprietary materials and information consist of, among other things, confidential business or financial 24 25 information, information regarding confidential business practices, or other 26 confidential research, development, or commercial information (including 27 information implicating privacy rights of third parties), information otherwise 28 generally unavailable to the public, or which may be privileged or otherwise

protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes, court rules, case decisions, 1 2 or common law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the 3 prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery materials, to 4 adequately protect information the parties are entitled to keep confidential, to 5 ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the end of 6 7 the litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such information 8 is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that information will not be 9 designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so designated 10 without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential, non-public 11 manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public record of 12 this case.

13

2. <u>DEFINITIONS</u>

14

15

DEFINITIONS

2.1 <u>Action</u>: *Mitchell R. Pindus and Polina K. Pindus v. Safeco Insurance Company of Illinois*, Case No. 2:17-cv-08185-PSG-JPR.

16 2.2 <u>Challenging Party</u>: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the
 17 designation of information or items under this Order.

2.3 <u>"CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items</u>: information (regardless of
 how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for
 protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in
 the Good Cause Statement.

22 2.4 <u>Counsel</u>: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as
23 their support staff).

24 2.5 <u>Designating Party</u>: a Party or Non-Party that designates information
 25 or items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as
 26 "CONFIDENTIAL."

27 2.6 <u>Disclosure or Discovery Material</u>: all items or information, regardless
 28 of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including,

among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced 2 or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

3 2.7 a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a Expert: matter pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to 4 5 serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

2.8 attorneys who are employees of a party to this 6 House Counsel: 7 Action. House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other 8 outside counsel.

9 2.9 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, 10 or other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

11 2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a 12 party to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and 13 have appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm 14 which has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

15 2.11 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors, 16 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their 17 support staffs).

18 2.12 <u>Producing Party</u>: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or 19 Discovery Material in this Action.

202.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or 21 22 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and subcontractors. 23

24 2.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is 25 designated as "CONFIDENTIAL."

26 2.15 <u>Receiving Party</u>: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a Producing Party. 27

28

///

1

3. SCOPE

1

9

2 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only 3 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or 4 5 compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material. 6

7 Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the 8 trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

DURATION 4.

10 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations 11 imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees 12 otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be 13 deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this Action, 14 with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and 15 exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this Action, including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of 16 17 time pursuant to applicable law.

- 18
- 5. 19

DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. 5.1

20Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material 21 22 that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must 23 designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, 24 25 documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not 26 swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

27 indiscriminate, routinized designations prohibited. Mass. or are 28 Designations that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for

an improper purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development 1 2 process or to impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may 3 expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

4 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that 5 it designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable 6 designation.

8 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in 9 this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise 10 stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection 11 under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or produced. 12

13

7

Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

14 for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic (a) 15 documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial 16 proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" (hereinafter "CONFIDENTIAL legend"), to each page that 17 18 contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page 19 qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected 20portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

21 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection 22 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated 23 which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be 24 25 deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine 26 27 which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. 28 Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the "CONFIDENTIAL legend" to each page that contains Protected Material. If
only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the
Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making
appropriate markings in the margins).

(b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party identify
the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the
deposition all protected testimony.

(c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and
for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on
the exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the
legend "CONFIDENTIAL." If only a portion or portions of the information
warrants protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify
the protected portion(s).

14 5.3 <u>Inadvertent Failures to Designate</u>. If timely corrected, an inadvertent
15 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive
16 the Designating Party's right to secure protection under this Order for such
17 material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make
18 reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the
19 provisions of this Order.

20

6.

CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

6.1 <u>Timing of Challenges</u>. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a
designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court's
Scheduling Order.

6.2 <u>Meet and Confer</u>. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute
 resolution process under Local Rule 37.1 et seq.

6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be
on the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper
purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other

parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating
Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall
continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is
entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the Court rules on the
challenge.

6

7.

ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

7 7.1 <u>Basic Principles</u>. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
8 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this
9 Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such
10 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the
11 conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a
12 Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL
13 DISPOSITION).

Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a
location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons
authorized under this Order.

17 Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items. 7.2 Unless 18 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving 19 information disclose item Party may any designated or "CONFIDENTIAL" only to: 20

(a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as
well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably
necessary to disclose the information for this Action;

24 25 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;

(c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom
disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the
"Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

- the court and its personnel; (d)
- 2

1

(e) court reporters and their staff;

3 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional 4 Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have 5 signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

6

7

the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a (g) custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

8 (h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the 9 Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing 10 party requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit A hereto; and (2) 11 they will not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A), unless otherwise 12 13 agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed 14 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may 15 be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and 16

17

any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel, (i) 18 mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions or 19 appointed by the court.

20

8.

21

PROTECTED MATERIAL **SUBPOENAED** OR **ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION**

If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation 22 that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as 23 "CONFIDENTIAL," that Party must: 24

25 b) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order unless prohibited by law; 26

27 c) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order 28 to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the

subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

3 ///

1

2

4 d) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be
5 pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served 6 7 with the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in 8 this action as "CONFIDENTIAL" before a determination by the court from which 9 the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party's permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking 10 11 protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions 12 should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action 13 to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

14

9.

15

<u>A NON-PARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE</u> <u>PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION</u>

(a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a
Non-Party in this Action and designated as "CONFIDENTIAL." Such information
produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the
remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be
construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

(b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to
produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is
subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's
confidential information, then the Party shall:

(1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the NonParty that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality
agreement with a Non-Party;

28

(2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated

Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably
 specific description of the information requested; and

3

///

4 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the
5 Non-Party, if requested.

6 If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within (c) 7 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party 8 may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery 9 request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall 10 not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the 11 confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court. 12 Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and 13 expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

14

10.

UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

15 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has 16 disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized 17 under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) 18 notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its 19 best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform 20the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms 21 of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the 22 "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit 23 A.

24 11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR 25 OTHERWISE PROTECTED MATERIAL

When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted to the court if the court so allows.

8

12. <u>MISCELLANEOUS</u>

9 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any
10 person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

11 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this
12 Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to
13 disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in
14 this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on
15 any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective
16 Order.

17 12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any
18 Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material
19 may only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the
20 specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material
21 under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information
22 in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

23

13. FINAL DISPOSITION

After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the

1	Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the
2	Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if
3	not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that
4	(1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was
5	returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any
6	copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or
7	capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel
8	are entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial,
9	deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition
10	and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert
11	work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival
12	copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this
13	Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).
14	///
15	///
16	///
17	///
18	///
19	///
20	///
21	///
22	///
23	///
24	///
25	///
26	///
27	///
28	///

1	///
2	///
3	///
4	///
5	///
6	14. Any violation of this Order may be punished by any and all
7 8	appropriate measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary sanctions.
9	
10	IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.
11 12	LAW OFFICES OF RICHARD T. MILLER
12	WILLER
14	Dated: April 16, 2018 By: /s/ Richard T. Miller
15	Richard T. Miller, Esq.
16	Attorneys for Plaintiffs RAYMOND BAYSTER AND SYLVIA
17	BAYSTER
18	
19	BROWN LAW GROUP
20	
21	
22	Dated: April 16, 2018 By: <u>/s/ Cody J. Cocanig</u> Janice P. Brown, Esq.
23	Cody J. Cocanig, Esq.
24	Attorneys for Defendant LIBERTY INSURANCE
25	CORPORATION
26	
27	PURSUANT TO STIPULATION AND GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.
28	
	Pindus vs. Safeco Insurance Case No.: 2:17-cv-08185-PSG-JPR STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER Page 14

1	DATED: April 25, 2018	for hrenklath
2	r r	Hon. Jean P. Rosenbluth
3		United States Magistrate Judge
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18 19		
20		
20		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
	Pindus vs. Safeco Insurance STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER	Case No.: 2:17-cv-08185-PSG-JPF Page 15

1	EXHIBIT A		
2	ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND		
3	I,[printor type full name], of		
4	[print or type full address],		
5	declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the		
6	Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for		
7	the Central District of California on [date]		
8	in the case of Mitchell R. Pindus and Polina K. Pindus v. Safeco Insurance		
9	Company of Illinois, Case No. 2:17-cv-08185-PSG-JPR, pending in the U.S.		
10	District Court for the Central District of California. I agree to comply with and to		
11	be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and		
12	acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and		
13	punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose		
14	in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective		
15	Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this		
16	Order.		
17	I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District		
18	Court for the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms		
19	of this Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur		
20	after termination of this action. I hereby appoint		
21	[print or type full name] of		
22	[print or type full address and telephone number] as my California agent for service		
23	of process in connection with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement		
24	of this Stipulated Protective Order.		
25	Date:		
26	City and State where sworn and signed:		
27	Printed name:		
28	Signature:		
	Pindus vs. Safeco InsuranceCase No.: 2:17-cv-08185-PSG-JPRSTIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDERPage 16		