

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

SALVADOR FLORES, an Individual,

Plaintiff,

vs.

CITY OF PASADENA, a Municipal
Entity, CITY MANAGER STEVEN
MERMELL, PASADENA POLICE
DEPARTMENT, CHIEF OF POLICE
PHILLIP A. SANCHEZ (former),
CORPORAL SUSAN GOMEZ,
OFFICER THOMAS BUTLER,
OFFICER RAPHAEL SANTIAGO,
OFFICER DEAN BISTERFELDT,
OFFICER MATTHEW GRIFFIN, and
DOES 1 through 100, inclusive,

Defendants.

Case No.: 2:18-cv-03792-DDP-JCx

[Discovery Document: Referred To
Magistrate Judge Jacqueline
Chooljian]

**ORDER RE: STIPULATED
PROTECTIVE ORDER**

TO ALL PARTIES AND THEIR ATTORNEYS OF RECORD, in
reviewing the parties' Stipulation for Protective Order, the Court hereby orders as
follows:

///
///
///

1 1. A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

2 As the parties have represented that discovery in this action is likely to
3 involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which
4 special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than
5 prosecuting this litigation may be warranted, this Court enters the following
6 Protective Order. This Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures
7 or responses to discovery. The protection it affords from public disclosure and use
8 extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential
9 treatment under the applicable legal principles. Further, as set forth in Section 12.3,
10 below, this Protective Order does not entitle the parties to file confidential
11 information under seal. Rather, when the parties seek permission from the court to
12 file material under seal, the parties must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5 and
13 with any pertinent orders of the assigned District Judge and Magistrate Judge.

14 B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

15 In light of the nature of the claims and allegations in this case and the parties’
16 representations that discovery in this case will involve the production of confidential
17 information, and in order to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the
18 prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery materials, to
19 adequately protect information the parties are entitled to keep confidential, to ensure
20 that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material in
21 connection with this action, to address their handling of such material at the end of
22 the litigation, and to serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such information
23 is justified in this matter. The parties shall not designate any information/documents
24 as confidential without a good faith belief that such information/documents have
25 been maintained in a confidential, non-public manner, and that there is good cause
26 or a compelling reason why it should not be part of the public record of this case.

27 ///

28 ///

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

2. DEFINITIONS

2.1 Action: The instant action: Salvador Flores v. City of Pasadena, et al.

2.2 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information or items under this Order.

2.3 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in the Good Cause Statement.

2.4 “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL -- ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY” Information or Items: extremely sensitive “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items, the disclosure of which to another Party or Non-Party would create a substantial risk of serious harm that could not be avoided by less restrictive means.

2.5 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their support staff).

2.6 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL -- ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY.”

2.7 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

2.8 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

///
///

1 2.9 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action.
2 House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside
3 counsel.

4 2.10 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or
5 other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

6 2.11 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a
7 party to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and
8 have appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm
9 which has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

10 2.12 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,
11 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their
12 support staffs).

13 2.13 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
14 Discovery Material in this Action.

15 2.14 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation
16 support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or
17 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)
18 and their employees and subcontractors.

19 2.15 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
20 designated as “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL --
21 ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY.”

22 2.16 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery
23 Material from a Producing Party.

24 3. SCOPE

25 The protections conferred by this Order cover not only Protected Material (as
26 defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected
27 Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material;
28 and (3) any deposition testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties or their

1 Counsel that might reveal Protected Material, other than during a court hearing or at
2 trial.

3 Any use of Protected Material during a court hearing or at trial shall be
4 governed by the orders of the presiding judge. This Order does not govern the use
5 of Protected Material during a court hearing or at trial.

6 4. DURATION

7 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations
8 imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees
9 otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be
10 deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this Action, with
11 or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and
12 exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this Action,
13 including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time
14 pursuant to applicable law.

15 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

16 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.

17 Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under
18 this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that
19 qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for
20 protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written
21 communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents,
22 items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept
23 unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

24 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations
25 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper
26 purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose
27 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating
28 Party to sanctions.

1 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it
2 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must
3 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

4 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in
5 this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of Section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise
6 stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection
7 under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or
8 produced.

9 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

10 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic
11 documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions), that the Producing Party affix
12 at a minimum, the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL --
13 ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" to each page that contains protected material. If
14 only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the
15 Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making
16 appropriate markings in the margins).

17 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection
18 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated
19 which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and
20 before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be
21 deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting Party has identified the
22 documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which
23 documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then,
24 before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the
25 "CONFIDENTIAL", or "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL -- ATTORNEYS' EYES
26 ONLY" legend to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or
27 portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also

28 ///

1 must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings
2 in the margins).

3 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party identifies
4 on the record, before the close of the deposition as protected testimony.

5 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and
6 for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on
7 the exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the
8 legend “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL -- ATTORNEYS’
9 EYES ONLY.” If only a portion or portions of the information warrants protection,
10 the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

11 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent
12 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive
13 the Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such material.
14 Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable
15 efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this
16 Order.

17 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

18 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a
19 designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court’s
20 Scheduling Order.

21 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute
22 resolution process under Local Rule 37-1 et seq.

23 6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on
24 the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper
25 purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other
26 parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating
27 Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall
28 continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is

1 entitled under the Producing Party’s designation until the Court rules on the
2 challenge.

3 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

4 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
5 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this
6 Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such
7 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the
8 conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a
9 Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of Section 13 below.

10 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a
11 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons
12 authorized under this Order.

13 7.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless
14 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a
15 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated
16 “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

17 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as
18 well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably
19 necessary to disclose the information for this Action;

20 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of
21 the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;

22 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom
23 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the
24 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

25 (d) the court and its personnel;

26 (e) private court reporters and their staff to whom disclosure is reasonably
27 necessary for this Action and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and
28 Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

1 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional
2 Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have
3 signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

4 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a
5 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

6 (h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the
7 Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing party
8 requests that the witness sign the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound”
9 (Exhibit A); and (2) they will not be permitted to keep any confidential information
10 unless they sign the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A),
11 unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of
12 transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected
13 Material may be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to
14 anyone except as permitted under this Protective Order; and

15 (i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel,
16 mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

17 7.3 Disclosure of “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL -- ATTORNEYS’ EYES
18 ONLY” Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in
19 writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any information or
20 item designated “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

21 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as well
22 as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary
23 to disclose the information for this Action;

24 (b) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom
25 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the
26 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

27 (c) the court and its personnel;

28 (d) private court reporters and their staff to whom disclosure is reasonably

1 necessary for this Action and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and
2 Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

3 (e) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional
4 Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have
5 signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

6 (f) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a
7 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information; and

8 (g) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel,
9 mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

10 8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED
11 PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION

12 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation
13 that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as
14 “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL -- ATTORNEYS’ EYES
15 ONLY,” that Party must:

16 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification
17 shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order unless prohibited by law;

18 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order
19 to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the
20 subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include
21 a copy of this Protective Order; and

22 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be
23 pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

24 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with
25 the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this
26 action as “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL -- ATTORNEYS’
27 EYES ONLY” before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or
28 order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s permission, or

1 unless otherwise required by the law or court order. The Designating Party shall
2 bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential
3 material and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or
4 encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action to disobey a lawful directive from
5 another court.

6 9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE
7 PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION

8 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a
9 Non-Party in this Action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY
10 CONFIDENTIAL -- ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY.” Such information produced by
11 Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief
12 provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be construed as
13 prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

14 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to
15 produce a Non-Party’s confidential information in its possession, and the Party is
16 subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party’s
17 confidential information, then the Party shall:

18 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party
19 that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality
20 agreement with a Non-Party;

21 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Protective
22 Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific
23 description of the information requested; and

24 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the
25 Non-Party, if requested.

26 (c) If a Non-Party represented by counsel fails to commence the process
27 called for by Local Rules 45-1 and 37-1, et seq. within 14 days of receiving the
28 notice and accompanying information or fails contemporaneously to notify the

1 Receiving Party that it has done so, the Receiving Party may produce the Non-
2 Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If an
3 unrepresented Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within 14
4 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party
5 may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery
6 request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall
7 not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the
8 confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court
9 unless otherwise required by the law or court order. Absent a court order to the
10 contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in
11 this court of its Protected Material.

12 10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

13 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed
14 Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this
15 Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the
16 Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve
17 all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to
18 whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and
19 (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement
20 to Be Bound" (Exhibit A).

21 11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR
22 OTHERWISE PROTECTED MATERIAL

23 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain
24 inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection,
25 the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil
26 Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever
27 procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production
28 without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and

1 (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a
2 communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work
3 product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement into this Protective
4 Order.

5 12. MISCELLANEOUS

6 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any
7 person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

8 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. No Party waives any right it
9 otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item
10 on any ground not addressed in this Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives
11 any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered
12 by this Protective Order.

13 12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any
14 Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5 and with any pertinent
15 orders of the assigned District Judge and Magistrate Judge. Protected Material may
16 only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the
17 specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material
18 under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information
19 in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

20 13. FINAL DISPOSITION

21 After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in Section 4, within 60
22 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return
23 all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in
24 this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations,
25 summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected
26 Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving
27 Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same
28 person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies

1 (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or
2 destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies,
3 abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any
4 of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to
5 retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing
6 transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert
7 reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such
8 materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or
9 constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in
10 Section 4.

11 14. Any violation of this Order may be punished by any and all appropriate
12 measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary
13 sanctions.

14 IT IS SO ORDERED.

15
16 DATED: May 8, 2019

17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

/s/
Honorable Jacqueline Chooljian
United States Magistrate Judge

1 EXHIBIT A

2 ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

3
4 I, _____ [print or type full name], of
5 _____ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of
6 perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Protective Order that was
7 issued by the United States District Court for the Central District of California on
8 May 8, 2019 in the case of Salvador Flores v. City of Pasadena, et al., Case No.
9 2:18-cv-03792-DDP-JC. I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of
10 this Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply
11 could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly
12 promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject
13 to this Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the
14 provisions of this Order.

15 I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court
16 for the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this
17 Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this
18 action. I hereby appoint _____ [print or type full name] of
19 _____ [print or type full address and
20 telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with
21 this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Protective Order.

22 Date: _____

23 City and State where sworn and signed: _____

24
25 Printed name: _____

26
27 Signature: _____

28