

1 Jonathan M. Genish (SBN 259031)  
2 jgenish@blackstonepc.com  
3 Miriam L. Schimmel (SBN 185089)  
4 ms@blackstonepc.com  
5 Joana Fang (SBN 309623)  
6 jfang@blackstonepc.com  
7 **BLACKSTONE LAW, APC**  
8 8383 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 745  
9 Beverly Hills, California 90211  
10 Telephone: (310) 622-4278

11 Attorneys for Plaintiff,  
12 ALMA GARCIA

13 Daniel B Chammas (SBN 204825)  
14 dchammas@fordharrison.com  
15 Min K. Kim (SBN 305884)  
16 mkim@fordharrison.com  
17 FORD & HARRISON LLP  
18 350 South Grand Avenue, Suite 2300  
19 Los Angeles, CA 90071  
20 Telephone: (213) 237-2400  
21 Facsimile: (213) 237-2401

22 Attorneys for Defendant,  
23 DOLEX DOLLAR EXPRESS, INC.

24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
**CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

1 ALMA GARCIA, individually, and  
2 on behalf of other members of the  
3 general public similarly situated,,

4 Plaintiff,

5 v.

6 DOLEX DOLLAR EXPRESS, INC.,  
7 a Texas corporation; and DOES 1  
8 through 25, inclusive,,

9 Defendant.

10 CASE NO. 2:23-cv-02013 MEMF(ASx)  
11 Assigned to Hon. Maame Ewusi-Mensah  
12 Frimpong, Courtroom 8B

13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**PROTECTIVE ORDER**

29 Action Filed: February 1, 2023  
30 Removal Date: March 17, 2023

1           1.     A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

2           Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential,  
3 proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public  
4 disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation maybe  
5 warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to enter  
6 the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order  
7 does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and  
8 that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the  
9 limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the  
10 applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section  
11 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file  
12 confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the  
13 procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party  
14 seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

15           B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

16           This action is likely to involve trade secrets, customer and pricing lists and  
17 other valuable research, development, commercial, financial, technical and/or  
18 proprietary information for which special protection from public disclosure and from  
19 use for any purpose other than prosecution of this action is warranted. Such  
20 confidential and proprietary materials and information consist of, among other  
21 things, confidential business or financial information, information regarding  
22 confidential business practices, or other confidential research, development, or  
23 commercial information (including information implicating privacy rights of third  
24 parties such as Dolex Dollar Express' current and former employees' contact  
25 information, social security numbers, and pay and time records), information  
26 otherwise generally unavailable to the public, or which may be privileged or  
27 otherwise protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes, court rules, case  
28 decisions, or common law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to

1 facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery  
2 materials, to adequately protect information the parties are entitled to keep  
3 confidential, to ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such  
4 material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the  
5 end of the litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such  
6 information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that information  
7 will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so  
8 designated without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential,  
9 non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public  
10 record of this case.

11                   2. DEFINITIONS

12                   2.1 Action: *Alma Garcia v. Dolex Dollar Express, Inc.*, Case No. 2:23-cv-  
13 02013 MEMF(ASx).

14                   2.2 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of  
15 information or items under this Order.

16                   2.3 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of  
17 how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify  
18 for protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as  
19 specified above in the Good Cause Statement.

20                   2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their  
21 support staff).

22                   2.5 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or  
23 items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as  
24 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

25                   2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of  
26 the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained  
27 (including, among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible  
28 things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to

1 discovery in this matter.

2 2.7 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter  
3 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel  
4 to serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

5 2.8 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action.  
6 House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other  
7 outside counsel.

8 2.9 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or  
9 other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

10 2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party  
11 to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action  
12 and have appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated  
13 with a law firm which has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes  
14 support staff.

15 2.11 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,  
16 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record  
17 (and their support staffs).

18 2.12 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or  
19 Discovery Material in this Action.

20 2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support  
21 services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits  
22 or demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form  
23 or medium) and their employees and subcontractors.

24 2.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is  
25 designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

26 2.15 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material  
27 from a Producing Party.

28 ///

1           3. SCOPE

2           The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only  
3 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or  
4 extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or  
5 compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or  
6 presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

7           Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the  
8 trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

9           4. DURATION

10          Even after final disposition of  
11 this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this Order shall remain in  
12 effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise  
13 directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims  
14 and defenses in this Action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein  
15 after the completion and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or  
16 reviews of this Action, including the time limits for filing any motions or applications  
17 for extension of time pursuant to applicable law.

18

19          5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

20           5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.

21          Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection  
22 under this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that  
23 qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for  
24 protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written  
25 communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents, items,  
26 or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably  
27 within the ambit of this Order.

28          Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations

1 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper  
2 purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose  
3 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating  
4 Party to sanctions.

5 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it  
6 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must  
7 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

8 **5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations.** Except as otherwise provided in this  
9 Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated  
10 or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this  
11 Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

12 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

13 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents,  
14 but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the  
15 Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" (hereinafter  
16 "CONFIDENTIAL legend"), to each page that contains protected material. If only a  
17 portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing  
18 Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate  
19 markings in the margins).

20 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection  
21 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated  
22 which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and  
23 before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be  
24 deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting Party has identified the documents  
25 it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents,  
26 or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing  
27 the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the "CONFIDENTIAL  
28 legend" to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or portions

1 of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must  
2 clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the  
3 margins).

4 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party identify the  
5 Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the deposition all  
6 protected testimony. (c) for information produced in some form other than  
7 documentary and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a  
8 prominent place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the  
9 information is stored the legend "CONFIDENTIAL." If only a portion or portions of  
10 the information warrants protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable,  
11 shall identify the protected portion(s).

12       5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent  
13 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive  
14 the Designating Party's right to secure protection under this Order for such material.  
15 Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable  
16 efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this  
17 Order.

18       6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

19       6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a  
20 designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court's  
21 Scheduling Order.

22       6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the informal dispute  
23 resolution process set forth in the Court's Procedures and Schedules. see  
24 <http://www.cacd.uscourts.gov/honorable-alka-sagar>.

25       6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the  
26 Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose  
27 (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may  
28 expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived

1 or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall continue to afford the  
2 material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing  
3 Party's designation until the Court rules on the challenge.

4

5 **7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

6       7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is  
7 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this  
8 Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such  
9 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the  
10 conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a Receiving  
11 Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

12       Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a  
13 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons  
14 authorized under this Order.

15       7.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless otherwise  
16 ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving  
17 Party may disclose any information or item designated “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

18           (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as well as  
19 employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to  
20 disclose the information for this Action;

21           (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the  
22 Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;

23           (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom  
24 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the  
25 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

26           (d) the court and its personnel;

27           (e) court reporters and their staff;

28           (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional

1 Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have  
2 signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

3 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a  
4 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

5 (h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the  
6 Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing party  
7 requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit A hereto; and (2) they will  
8 not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign the  
9 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise  
10 agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed  
11 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may be  
12 separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as  
13 permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

14 (i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel, mutually  
15 agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

16

17 **8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN**  
18 **OTHER LITIGATION**

19 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation  
20 that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as  
21 “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

22 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall  
23 include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

24 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to  
25 issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena  
26 or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of  
27 this Stipulated Protective Order; and

28 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued

1 by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected. If the  
2 Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena  
3 or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as  
4 “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or  
5 order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s permission. The  
6 Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that  
7 court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions should be construed  
8 as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action to disobey a lawful  
9 directive from another court.

10

11 **9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED**  
12 **IN THIS LITIGATION**

13 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-  
14 Party in this Action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information  
15 produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the  
16 remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be  
17 construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

18 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce  
19 a Non-Party’s confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to  
20 an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party’s confidential  
21 information, then the Party shall:

22 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that  
23 some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with  
24 a Non-Party;

25 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective  
26 Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific  
27 description of the information requested; and

28 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party,

1 if requested.

2       (c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within 14  
3 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may  
4 produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery  
5 request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall  
6 not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the  
7 confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court.  
8 Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense  
9 of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

10

11 10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

12       If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed  
13 Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this  
14 Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in  
15 writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts  
16 to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or  
17 persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order,  
18 and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and  
19 Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

20

21 11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE  
22 PROTECTED MATERIAL

23       When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain  
24 inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection,  
25 the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil  
26 Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure  
27 may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior  
28 privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the

1 parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or  
2 information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the  
3 parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted  
4 to the court.

5

6 **12. MISCELLANEOUS**

7       12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any  
8 person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

9       12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this  
10 Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to  
11 disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this  
12 Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any  
13 ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

14       12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any  
15 Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may  
16 only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the  
17 specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material  
18 under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information  
19 in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

20

21 **13. FINAL DISPOSITION**

22       After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60  
23 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return  
24 all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this  
25 subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations,  
26 summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected  
27 Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving  
28 Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same

1 person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies  
2 (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or  
3 destroyed and (2)affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies,  
4 abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any  
5 of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to  
6 retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing  
7 transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert  
8 reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such  
9 materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or  
10 constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in  
11 Section 4 (DURATION).

12  
13 14. Any violation of this Order may be punished by any and all appropriate measures  
14 including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary sanctions.  
15

16 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.  
17

18 DATED 11/14/2023  
19

20 /s/ Miriam L. Schimmel  
21 Attorneys for Plaintiff  
22

23 DATED: 11/14/2023  
24

25 /s/ Daniel Chammas  
26 Attorneys for Defendant  
27  
28

1 FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.  
2 DATED: November 14, 2023  
3  
4 / s / Sagar \_\_\_\_\_  
5 Honorable Alka Sagar  
6 United States Magistrate Judge  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

EXHIBIT A

## ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

4 I, \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full name], of  
5 \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury  
6 that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was  
7 issued by the United States District Court for the Central District of California on  
8 [date] in the case of Alma Garcia v. Dolex Dollar Express, Inc., Case No. 2:23-cv-  
9 02013 MEMF(ASx). I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this  
10 Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so  
11 comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I  
12 solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that  
13 is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict  
14 compliance with the provisions of this Order. I further agree to submit to the  
15 jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the Central District of California  
16 for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order, even if  
17 such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action. I hereby appoint  
18 \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full name] of  
19 \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full address and  
20 telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with  
21 this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective  
22 Order.

23 Date:

24 || City and State where sworn and signed:

25 Printed name:

Signature: