

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
WESTERN DIVISION (LOS ANGELES)**

OCEAN S., et al.,  
Plaintiffs,  
vs.  
LOS ANGELES COUNTY, et al.,  
Defendants.

Case No. 2:23-cv-06921-JAK-E

**FIRST ADDENDUM TO  
STIPULATED PROTECTIVE  
ORDER**

Before: Magistrate Judge Charles F.  
Eick

**NOTE CHANGES MADE BY THE COURT**

1 **I. INCORPORATION BY REFERENCE**

2 1.0 The Stipulated Protective Order (Protective Order) entered on December  
3 22, 2023, (ECF Dkt. # 65) is incorporated herein by reference. All terms in this First  
4 Addendum have the same definitions as those provided in the Protective Order.

5 **II. DEFINITIONS**

6 2.0 Plaintiffs' Case Files: The following records pertaining to the named  
7 Plaintiffs:

- 8 a) All documents and information contained in DCFS or DMH's files for each  
9 named Plaintiff's dependency case.
- 10 b) All documents and information contained in DCFS or DMH's files pertaining  
11 to referrals regarding each named Plaintiff, or services, case plans, or  
12 placements provided to each named Plaintiff, to the extent not already  
13 covered by section (a).
- 14 c) All documents and information within the scope of "juvenile case file" as set  
15 forth in Cal. Welfare and Institutions Code section 827(e) and/or Cal. Rule of  
16 Court 5.552 that are in the possession, custody, or control of any Party; and
- 17 d) All documents and information containing information related to each named  
18 Plaintiff's Juvenile Case File, as described in subdivision (a)(4) of Cal.  
19 Welfare and Institutions Code section 827, that are in the possession, custody,  
20 or control of CDSS.

21 2.1 Plaintiffs' Case Files shall be included in the definition of "Confidential  
22 Information."

23 **III. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT**

24 3.0 There is good cause for this Order. In addition to the reasons stated in  
25 the Protective Order, there is good cause for the First Addendum because the  
26 Plaintiffs' Case Files in this case likely will also include Confidential Information of  
27 third parties, and other categories of Confidential Information as set out in Section V.  
28

1 3.1 The Parties agree that disclosure of the Confidential Information covered  
2 by this addendum requires the parties to either seek relief before the relevant juvenile  
3 court, in compliance with applicable statutes, including, but not limited to, Cal.  
4 Welfare and Institutions Code Section 827, or seek an order from this Court.

5 3.2 The Parties also agree that, absent this First Addendum to the Protective  
6 Order, the Confidential Information covered by this addendum would be restricted  
7 from dissemination pursuant to Cal. Welfare and Institutions Code section 827(a)(4).

8 3.3 Federal district courts have the power to order disclosure of juvenile case  
9 files, as defined by California Rule of Court Rule 5.552 and Cal. Welfare and  
10 Institutions Code section 827(e), notwithstanding State confidentiality laws. *Gonzalez*  
11 *v. Spencer*, 336 F.3d 832, 835 (9th Cir. 2003). Although federal courts have found  
12 that Cal. Welfare & Institutions Code section 827 is not binding in federal lawsuits,  
13 <sup>SOME</sup> federal courts ~~should~~ still weigh the needs of the case against the State's interest in  
14 non-disclosure. *Estate of Maldonado v. Sec'y of the Cal. Dep't of Corr. & Rehab.*,  
15 No. 2:06CV02696-MCE/GGH, 2007 WL 4249811, at \*5-7 (E.D. Cal. Nov. 30, 2007);  
16 *Van Horn v Hornbeak*, No. 1:08CV1622 LJO DLB, 2010 WL 1027508, at \*4-6 (E.D.  
17 Cal. Mar. 18, 2010); *Doe No. 59 v. Santa Rosa City Sch.*, No. 3:16-CV-012560WHO,  
18 2017 WL 11837754, at \*1-1 (N.D. Cal. Mar. 1, 2017).

19 3.3 Federal district courts also have the power to authorize disclosure of  
20 HIPAA- and FERPA-protected material in discovery proceedings, without a  
21 patient's consent in response to a court order, or in discovery where a qualifying  
22 protective order is in place. *See* 45 C.F.R. §§ 164.512(e)(1)(i); (e)(1)(ii)(B);  
23 (e)(1)(v); *see also Briggs v. Adel*, No. CV-18-02684-PHX-EJM, 2020 WL 4003123,  
24 at \*12 (D. Ariz. July 15, 2020); *Garey v. Anderson*, No. 2:22-CV-0069-TOR, 2022  
25 WL 17327846, at \*2 (E.D. Wash. Nov. 29, 2022).

26 3.4 <sup>THE PARTIES REPRESENT THAT:</sup> Plaintiffs' Case Files, and other Confidential Information in the  
27 possession of the Parties and/or interested non-parties contain sensitive and  
28 Confidential Information regarding Plaintiffs that is significantly relevant to the

C.P.C.

The parties also represent that:

1 instant action. Obtaining these records via State procedures may result in delays,  
2 and the unnecessary expenditure of judicial resources. See *Dadisman v. Cnty. of Los*  
3 *Angeles*, 2019 WL 8645759, at \*2 (C.D. Cal. Oct. 28, 2019) (granting protective  
4 order obviating the need to comply with Cal. Welfare & Institutions Code section  
5 827).

6 3.5 While portions of Plaintiffs' juvenile case files are accessible to  
7 Plaintiffs upon their own request, County Defendants have agreed to produce  
8 Plaintiffs' Case Files in their possession, for the sake of judicial economy, and in  
9 light of the protections provided by this First Addendum.

C.P.C.

10 3.6 In order to avoid further delay and preserve judicial resources, and ~~with~~  
11 the parties having a good faith belief that the records satisfy the tests in *Maldonado* and *Doe No. 59*,  
12 *supra*, the parties hereby stipulate to and the Court orders the production of  
13 Confidential Information, including but not limited to, named Plaintiffs' Case Files  
14 that are within the Parties' possession, custody, or control, and that are within the  
15 scope of the objections and responses to requests for production served in this case.

16 **IV. PLAINTIFFS' CASE FILES**

17 4.0 The Parties hereby stipulate to and the Court orders the production of  
18 Confidential Information covered by this addendum, including but not limited to, (a)  
19 named Plaintiffs' Case Files that are within the Parties' possession, custody, or  
20 control, and (b) documents containing information related to the named Plaintiffs'  
21 Case Files, that are in the Parties' possession, custody, or control, and that are within  
22 the scope of the objections and responses to requests for production served in this  
23 case. The Court further orders that, notwithstanding Cal. Welfare and Institutions  
24 Code section 827(a)(4), the Parties may use and disclose named Plaintiffs' Case  
25 Files for purposes of this litigation consistent with Paragraph 8.2 of the Protective  
26 Order and this Addendum.

27 4.1 For avoidance of doubt, pursuant to this Order, the Parties will not  
28 withhold information pertaining to the named Plaintiffs themselves from Plaintiffs'

1 Case Files, or from documents containing information related to the named  
2 Plaintiffs' Case Files, that are in the Parties' possession, custody, or control, subject  
3 to the limitations in Section V., on the basis of Cal. Welfare & Institutions Code  
4 section 827, California Rule of Court 5.552, HIPAA, FERPA, or the Comprehensive  
5 Alcohol Abuse and Alcoholism Prevention, Treatment and Rehabilitation Act of  
6 1970.

7 4.2 Plaintiffs' Case Files shall be produced pursuant to the protections  
8 established in this Protective Order and First Addendum, except that the following  
9 additional procedures and protections shall apply: Materials falling within the  
10 definition of Plaintiffs' Case Files shall be marked: "PLAINTIFF'S CASE FILE"  
11 rather than "CONFIDENTIAL SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER." If a Party  
12 is aware that a document falls within the definition of Plaintiffs' Case Files, the  
13 Party shall treat that document as if it were marked, "PLAINTIFF'S CASE FILE,"  
14 notwithstanding the markings on the document. Plaintiffs' Case File materials may  
15 be disclosed as set forth in Part IX of the Protective Order, except that:

16 4.3 Named Plaintiffs shall only have access to their own Plaintiff's Case  
17 File materials and not the Plaintiff's Case File materials of any other Named  
18 Plaintiff.

19 4.4 Plaintiffs' counsel represents that Plaintiffs have been given notice of  
20 the production of their Confidential Information covered by this addendum and the  
21 Protective Order and all Plaintiffs consent to it, including but not limited to any  
22 Confidential Information subject to Cal. Welfare & Institutions Code section 827,  
23 California Rule of Court 5.552, the California Information Practices Act, HIPAA,  
24 FERPA, or the Comprehensive Alcohol Abuse and Alcoholism Prevention,  
25 Treatment and Rehabilitation Act of 1970.

26 4.5 In light of the foregoing, the parties agree that the Named Plaintiffs'  
27 identifying information in Plaintiff's Case File materials need not be redacted prior  
28 to production.

1           4.6    In order to further reduce the burden on the Producing Party, the Parties  
2 may, but are not obligated to, stipulate that sensitive information within Plaintiffs’  
3 Case File materials shall be viewed only by persons listed in paragraphs 8.2(a), (c)-  
4 (e) and (h) of the Protective Order. The Receiving Party shall redact any such  
5 information prior to sharing the document with persons listed in paragraphs 8.2(b),  
6 (f)-(g), or (i).

7           4.7    Plaintiffs’ Case File materials may be filed under seal pursuant to Part  
8 IX of the Stipulated Protective Order.

9 **V.   ISSUES UNAFFECTED BY THIS ADDENDUM**

10          5.0    This Order does not waive any Party’s right, in responding to requests  
11 for production calling for Plaintiffs’ Case File Materials, to withhold or redact for  
12 reasons of third party confidentiality or any other reason, including but not limited  
13 to the following:

- 14           a) Identifying information of third parties, including but not limited to  
15           family members of named Plaintiffs, minors and/or dependents other  
16           than named Plaintiffs, and individuals who have lived/resided with  
17           named Plaintiffs;
- 18           b) Identifying information of individuals who have reported suspected  
19           child abuse or neglect;
- 20           c) Confidential Information regarding individuals other than named  
21           Plaintiffs such as medical, mental health, and substance abuse  
22           information, DCFS case histories, and referrals;
- 23           d) Live Scan/CLETS reports relating to individuals other than named  
24           Plaintiffs;
- 25           e) Law enforcement reports marked “Confidential;”
- 26           f) Adoption records, including home studies;
- 27           g) Open, ongoing investigations;
- 28           h) Confidential placements or addresses of child or parent; and

1 i) Resource Family Approval Information and associated reports

2 5.1 This Order also does not waive any Party's right to dispute that such  
3 redactions are necessary or appropriate. The Parties agree to meet and confer in  
4 good faith regarding any such proposed redactions and agree that disputes, if any,  
5 will be resolved in the ordinary course pursuant to Local Rule 37.

6 5.2 The First Addendum is limited to named Plaintiffs' Case Files; the  
7 Protective Order and First Addendum may be subject to further revision by  
8 additional addenda.

9 5.3 Determinations of confidentiality and privilege are separate, and  
10 nothing in the First Addendum constitutes a waiver of attorney-client privilege,  
11 attorney work product, or any privilege recognized under state or federal law.

12 5.4 Documents and information pertaining to each named Plaintiff not  
13 identified in Section 2.0(a)-(c) supra shall not be treated as Plaintiffs' Case Files  
14 under this First Addendum, but may be designated Confidential Information  
15 pursuant to the Stipulated Protective Order (ECF Dkt. # 65).

16 **VI. ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND**

17 6.0 Any person who signed Exhibit A to the Protective Order need not re-  
18 sign it in light of this addendum.

19

20

21 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

22 Dated: May 31, 2024

23

24

25

26

27

28

By: /s/ Grant A. Davis-Denny  
Grant A. Davis-Denny  
grant.davis-denny@mto.com  
MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP  
350 South Grand Avenue, Fiftieth Floor Los  
Angeles, California 90071-3426 Telephone:  
(213) 683-9100  
Facsimile: (213) 687-3702  
*Attorney for Plaintiffs*

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

Dated: May 31, 2024

By: /s/ Farbod S. Moridani  
Farbod S. Moridani (SBN 251893)  
fmoridani@millerbarondess.com  
Miller Barondess, LLP  
2121 Avenue of the Stars, Suite 2600 Los Angeles, California 90067  
Telephone: (310) 552-4400  
Facsimile: (310) 552-8400  
*Attorney for County Defendants*

Dated: May 31, 2024

By: /s/ Andrew Z. Edelstein  
Andrew Z. Edelstein  
andrew.edelstein@doj.ca.gov  
California Department of Justice  
300 S Spring St, Ste 1702  
Los Angeles, CA 90013-1256 Deputy *Attorney General Attorney for State Defendants*

Pursuant to Local Rule 5-4.3.4(a)(2)(i), I certify that all of the above signatories concur in this filing's content and have authorized the filing.

By: /s/ Grant A. Davis-Denny  
Grant A. Davis-Denny  
grant.davis-denny@mto.com  
MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP  
350 South Grand Avenue, Fiftieth Floor Los Angeles, California 90071-3426 Telephone: (213) 683-9100  
Facsimile: (213) 687-3702  
*Attorney for Plaintiffs*

FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.

DATED: *JUNE 3, 2024*

~~/s/ Charles F. Eick~~   
United States Magistrate Judge Charles F. Eick



1 **EXHIBIT A**

2 **ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND**

3 I \_\_\_\_\_, am aware of the litigation in *Ocean S. et*  
4 *al. v. Los Angeles County, et al.*, No. 2:23-cv-06921-JAK-E (C.D. Cal.) in the capacity  
5 of \_\_\_\_\_. I do solemnly swear or aver that I am fully  
6 familiar with the terms of the Stipulated Protective Order (“Protective Order”) in the  
7 above referenced matter and hereby agree to comply with and be bound by its terms  
8 and conditions unless and until it is modified by further Order of the United States  
9 District Court for the Central District of California (“Court”). I understand that any  
10 Protected Material disclosed to me in that capacity, including the names of the  
11 plaintiffs and putative class members, shall not be disclosed, disseminated, or  
12 distributed to any person who is not authorized to receive it in accordance with the  
13 Protective Order. I understand that nothing in the Protective Order shall limit or in  
14 any way restrict me from discussing the cases of individuals whose Confidential  
15 Information is protected by this Order in order to carry out my legitimate job  
16 functions. I understand that nothing in the Protective Order shall restrict me from  
17 performing statutorily authorized functions as they pertain to such individuals, and I  
18 will not be held liable for executing such authority in the ordinary course,  
19 notwithstanding the Protective Order. For these reasons, I specifically acknowledge  
20 consent and agree to the disclosure requirements, limits and restrictions of the  
21 Protective Order and hereby consent to the jurisdiction of the Court for purposes of  
22 enforcing this Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of  
23 this Action.

24 Executed this \_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_ by \_\_\_\_\_  
25 (Print Name)

26  
27 Signed \_\_\_\_\_  
28