2	jhong48@gmail.com LAW OFFICES OF JUAN HONG, ALC 4199 Campus Drive Suite 550
3	Irvine, California 92612
4	Telephone: 949-509-6505 Facsimile: 949-335-6647
5	Attorney for Plaintiff MYUNG CHOI
6	SANDRA L. McDONOUGH (SBN 193308)
7	smcdonough@paulplevin.com CORRIE J. KLEKOWSKI (SBN 251338)
8	cklekowski@paulplevin.com KEVIN M. BROWN (SBN 306698)
9	kbrown@paulplevin.com PAUL, PLEVIN, SULLIVAN & CONNAUGHTON LLP
10	1101 West Broadway, Ninth Floor
11	San Diego, California 92101-8285 Telephone: 619-237-5200 Facsimile: 619-615-0700
12	
13	Attorneys for Defendants BOARD OF TRUSTEES OF THE CALIFORNIA STATE UNIVERSITY, AURORA WOLFGANG, TERRI J. NELSON, MARIA ANTONIETA GALLEGOS-
14	WOLFGANG, TERRI J. NELSON, MARIA ANTONIETA GALLEGOS-
15	RUIZ, ARTURO FERNANDEZ- GIBERT, ERI YASUHARA, RISA
16	DICKSON, and ANDREW BODMAN
17	(CAPTION CONTINUED ON NEXT
18	PAGE)
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	

1 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT 2 FOR THE CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA, WESTERN DIVISION 3 4 Case No. 5:14 CV 01707 VAP (SHKx) LEAD CASE NUMBER 5 MYUNG CHOI, Plaintiff. 6 [Consolidated With Case No. 2:14-cv-08337 VAP (DTBx)] 7 v. STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED] PROTECTIVE ORDER FOR_ AURORA WOLFGANG, TERRI J. NELSON, MARIA ANTÓNIETA GALLEGOS-RUIZ, ARTURO CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION FERNANDEZ-GIBERT, ERI YASUHARA, RISA DIĆKSON, AND Judge: Hon. Virginia A. Phillips Mag. Judge: Hon. Shashi Kewalramani 10 ANDREW BÓDMAN, DOES 1 THROUGH 10. Courtroom: 3, Riverside 11 **EXEMPT FROM FEES** Defendants. 12 **GOVT. CODE § 6103** 13 MYUNG CHOI, 14 Plaintiff, 15 v. 16 BOARD OF TRUSTEES OF THE CALIFORNIA STATE UNIVERSITY, 17 Defendants. 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27

PAUL, PLEVIN, SULLIVAN & CONNAUGHTON LLP

1. A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary or private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to enter the proposed Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Stipulation and proposed Protective Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulation and proposed Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the Court to file material under seal.

B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

This action is likely to involve personal and academic review information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecution of this action is warranted. Such information consists of, among other things, confidential research and internal dialogue regarding performance and evaluation information related to California State University, San Bernardino, deliberative processes and tenure evaluations, confidential financial information, employee personnel files, information regarding confidential academic review practices, other information implicating privacy rights of third parties, information otherwise generally unavailable to the public, or which may be privileged or otherwise protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes, court rules, case decisions, or common law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery

materials, to adequately protect information the parties are entitled to keep confidential, to ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the end of the litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that information will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so designated without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential, non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public record of this case.

2. DEFINITIONS

- 2.1 Action: This pending federal law suit.
- 2.2 <u>Challenging Party</u>: A Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information or items under this Order.
- 2.3 <u>"CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items</u>: Information (regardless of how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in the Good Cause Statement.
- 2.4 <u>Counsel</u>: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their support staff).
- 2.5 <u>Designating Party</u>: A Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as "CONFIDENTIAL."
- 2.6 <u>Disclosure or Discovery Material</u>: All items or information, regardless of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

S || / / .

///

2.	7	Expert: A person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter
pertinen	t to	the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as
an exper	t wi	tness or as a consultant in this Action.

- 2.8 <u>House Counsel</u>: Attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action. House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.
- 2.9 <u>Non-Party</u>: Any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.
- 2.10 <u>Outside Counsel of Record</u>: Attorneys who are not employees of a party to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and have appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.
- 2.11 <u>Party</u>: Any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors, employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their support staffs).
- 2.12 <u>Producing Party</u>: A Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or Discovery Material in this Action.
- 2.13 <u>Professional Vendors</u>: Persons or entities that provide litigation support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and subcontractors.
- 2.14 <u>Protected Material</u>: Any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as "CONFIDENTIAL."
- 2.15 <u>Receiving Party</u>: A Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a Producing Party.

3. <u>SCOPE</u>

The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Protective Order cover not only Protected Material (as defined above) but also: (1) any information copied or

3 Case No. 5:14 CV 01707 VAP (SHKx)

7

8

9 10

11 12

13 14

15

16 17

18 19

20 21

22

23

24

25 26

27

28

extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

4. **DURATION**

Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the later of: (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and exhaustion of all appeals, re-hearings, remands, trials or reviews of this Action, including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to applicable law.

DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items or oral or written communications that qualify – so that other portions of the material, documents, items or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber or retard the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

5.2 <u>Manner and Timing of Designations</u>. Except as otherwise provided in this Order (*see*, *e.g.*, second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

a. for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party affix the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" to each page that contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents or materials available for inspection need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which material it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the "CONFIDENTIAL" legend to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

b. for testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial proceedings,

5 Case No. 5:14 CV 01707 VAP (SHKx)

10 11

12 13

14

15 16

17 18

19 20

21

22 23 24

27 28

25

26

that the Designating Party identify on the record, before the close of the deposition, hearing or other proceeding, all protected testimony.

- for information produced in some form other than documentary c. and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information or item is stored the legend "CONFIDENTIAL." If only a portion or portions of the information or item warrant protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).
- <u>Inadvertent Failures to Designate</u>. If timely corrected, an inadvertent 5.3 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party's right to secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

- Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court's Scheduling Order.
- 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution process under Local Rule 37.1, et seq.
- 6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties), may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the Court rules on the challenge.

7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

7.1 <u>Basic Principles</u> . A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this
case only for prosecuting, defending or attempting to settle this litigation or the
related state court litigation, Choi v. Board of Trustees of the California State
University, California Superior Court Case No. BC554054. Such Protected Material
may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions
described in this Order. When the litigation has been terminated, a Receiving Party
must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

- 7.2 <u>Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items</u>. Unless otherwise ordered by the Court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated "CONFIDENTIAL" only to:
- a. the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this action, as well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this litigation;
- b. the officers, directors and employees (including House Counsel) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation;
- c. Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);
 - d. the Court and its personnel;
 - e. court reporters and their staff;
- f. professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and

 Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation

 Case No. 5:14 CV 01707 VAP (SHKx)

PAUL, PLEVIN, SULLIVAN & CONNAUGHTON LLP

and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

- g. the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;
- h. during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing party requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit 1 hereto; and (2) they will not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the Court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and
- i. any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel, mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

8. <u>PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED</u> <u>IN OTHER LITIGATION</u>

If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as "CONFIDENTIAL," that Party must:

- a. promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;
- b. promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and
 - c. cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be

 8 Case No. 5:14 CV 01707 VAP (SHKx)

pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as "CONFIDENTIAL" before a determination by the Court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party's permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material, and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION

- a. The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in this action and designated as "CONFIDENTIAL." Such information produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.
- b. In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's confidential information, then the Party shall:
- i. promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;
- ii. promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order in this action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the information requested; and
- iii. make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party, if requested.

1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		

c. If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this Court within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the Court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this Court of its Protected Material.

10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately: (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures; (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material; (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order; and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

11. <u>INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE</u> <u>PROTECTED MATERIAL</u>

When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the Stipulated

Protective Order submitted to the Court. 1

12. **MISCELLANEOUS**

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

- Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.
- Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order, no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Stipulated Protective Order.
- Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

13. FINAL DISPOSITION

After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any

CONNAUGHTON LLP

of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to 1 retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing 2 transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert 3 reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such 4 materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or 5 constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in 6 Section 4 (DURATION). 7 8 9 /// 10 11 /// 12 13 14 /// 15 16 /// 17 18 19 20 /// 21 /// 22 /// 23 /// 24 /// 25 /// 26 27 28

PAUL, PLEVIN, SULLIVAN & CONNAUGHTON LLP

1	14. Any violation of this Order may be punished by any and all appropriate		
2	measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary		
3	sanctions.		
4	IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.		
5	THE SO STILLE, TIMES OF COUNTRY OF RECORD.		
6	Dated: November 28, 2018 PAUL, PLEVIN, SULLIVAN &		
7	CONNAUGHTON LLP		
•			
8	By: /s/ Kevin M. Brown		
9	SANDRA L. McDONOUGH		
10	CORRIE J. KLEKOWSKI KEVIN M. BROWN		
11	Attorneys for Defendants BOARD OF		
12	TRUSTEES OF THE CALIFORNIA		
	STATE UNIVERSITY, AURORA		
13	WOLFGANG, TERRI J. NELSON,		
14	MARIA ANTONIETA GALLEGOS-RUIZ, ARTURO FERNANDEZ-GIBERT, ERI		
15	YASUHARA, RISA DICKSON, and		
	ANDREW BODMAN		
16			
17	Dated: November 28, 2018 LAW OFFICES OF JUAN HONG, ALC		
18			
19	By: /s/ Juan Hong		
20	JUAN HONG Attorney for Plaintiff MYUNG CHOI		
21	Attorney for Frankfir WT ONG CHO		
22	FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.		
23			
	Dated: December 3, 2018		
24			
25			
26	HON. SHASHI H. KEWALRAMANI United States Magistrate Judge		
27			

PAUL, PLEVIN, SULLIVAN & CONNAUGHTON LLP

EXHIBIT A

2	ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND
3	I, [print or type full name], of
4	[print of type ran name], or
5	[print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its
6	entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the
7	United States District Court for the Central District of California on [date] in the
8	case of Choi v. Board of Trustees of the California State University, et al., 5:14 CV
9	01707 VAP (DTBx). I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this
10	Stipulated Protective Order, and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so
11	comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I
12	solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that
13	is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict
14	compliance with the provisions of this Order.
15	I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court
16	for the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this
17	Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after
18	termination of this action.
19	I hereby appoint [print or type full name] of
20	[print or type full address and
21	telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with
22	this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective
23 24	Order.
25	Date:
26	City and State where sworn and signed:
27	Printed name:
28	Signature:

PAUL, PLEVIN, SULLIVAN & CONNAUGHTON LLP

SIGNATURE CERTIFICATION

Pursuant to Section 5-4.3.4(a) of the Local Rules, I hereby certify that the content is acceptable to Juan Hong, counsel for Plaintiff, and that I obtained authorization from him to affix his electronic signature to this document.

Dated: November 28, 2018 By: /s/

By: /s/ Kevin M. Brown

SANDRA L. McDONOUGH
KEVIN M. BROWN
Attorneys for Defendants BOARD OF
TRUSTEES OF THE CALIFORNIA
STATE UNIVERSITY, AURORA
WOLFGANG, TERRI J. NELSON,
MARIA ANTONIETA GALLEGOS-RUIZ,
ARTURO FERNANDEZ-GIBERT, ERI
YASUHARA, RISA DICKSON, and
ANDREW BODMAN

1.5

Case No. 5:14 CV 01707 VAP (SHKx)