STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER

Dockets.Justia.com

Plaintiffs, Saber Ahmed and John Mantelone, and Defendants, PHH Mortgage Corporation and HSBC Mortgage Corporation (USA) ("HSBC") (erroneously sued as HSBC Bank USA, National Association), hereby stipulate and agree to the terms if this Stipulated Protective Order. Accordingly, it is ORDERED:

1. A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

This action is likely to involve confidential and private consumer information, confidential agreements, confidential and proprietary methods and practices, trade secrets and other valuable research, development, commercial, financial, technical and/or proprietary information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecution of this action is warranted.

Such confidential and proprietary materials and information consist of, among other things, confidential and private information regarding consumers'

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

finances, confidential agreements between businesses, confidential business information, information regarding confidential business methods and practices, or other confidential research, development, or commercial information (including information implicating privacy rights of third parties), information otherwise generally unavailable to the public, or which may be privileged or otherwise protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes, court rules, case decisions, or common law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery materials, to adequately protect information the parties are entitled to keep confidential, to ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the end of the litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that information will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so designated without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential, non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public record of this case.

2. <u>DEFINITIONS</u>

- 2.1 <u>Action:</u> This pending federal law suit.
- 2.2 <u>Challenging Party:</u> a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information or items under this Order.
- 2.3 <u>"CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items:</u> information (regardless of how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in the Good Cause Statement.
- 2.4 <u>Counsel:</u> Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their support staff).

28

- 2.5 <u>Designating Party:</u> a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as "CONFIDENTIAL."
- 2.6 <u>Disclosure or Discovery Material:</u> all items or information, regardless of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.
- 2.7 <u>Expert:</u> a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.
- 2.8 <u>House Counsel:</u> attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action. House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.
- 2.9 <u>Non-Party:</u> any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.
- 2.10 <u>Outside Counsel of Record:</u> attorneys who are not employees of a party to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and have appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.
- 2.11 <u>Party:</u> any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors, employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their support staffs).
- 2.12 <u>Producing Party:</u> a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or Discovery Material in this Action.
- 2.13 <u>Professional Vendors:</u> persons or entities that provide litigation support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, graphic and design services, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and subcontractors.

- 2.14 <u>Protected Material:</u> any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as "CONFIDENTIAL."
- 2.15 <u>Receiving Party:</u> a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a Producing Party.

3. SCOPE

The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

4. DURATION AND USE AT TRIAL

Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this Action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this Action, including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to applicable law.

Nothing in this Order shall be construed to affect the use of any document, material, or information at any trial or hearing. A party that intends to present or that anticipates that another party may present Confidential Information at a hearing or trial may bring that issue to the Court's and parties' attention by motion or in a pretrial memorandum without disclosing the Confidential Information. The Court may thereafter make such orders as are necessary to govern the use of such documents or information at trial. If Confidential Information is presented at a

6 7 8

9

10 11

12

13 14 15

17 18

16

20

19

22

21

23

24

25

26 27

28

hearing or trial, that Confidential Information will be presumptively available to members of the public.

DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. 5.1 Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

(a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend

"CONFIDENTIAL" (hereinafter "CONFIDENTIAL legend"), to each page that contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins). A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the "CONFIDENTIAL legend" to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

- (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party identify the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the deposition all protected testimony.
- (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the legend "CONFIDENTIAL." If only a portion or portions of the information warrants protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).
- 5.3 <u>Inadvertent Failures to Designate.</u> If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party's right to secure protection under this Order for such

material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

- 6.1 <u>Timing of Challenges.</u> Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court's Scheduling Order.
- 6.2 <u>Meet and Confer.</u> The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution process under Local Rule 37.1 et seq.
- 6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the Court rules on the challenge.

7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

7.1 <u>Basic Principles.</u> A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

(i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel, mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION

If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as "CONFIDENTIAL," that Party must:

- (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;
- (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and
- (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as "CONFIDENTIAL" before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party's permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

9. <u>A NON-PARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION</u>

- (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in this Action and designated as "CONFIDENTIAL." Such information produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.
- (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's confidential information, then the Party shall:
- (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;
- (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the information requested; and
- (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party, if requested.
- (c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has

11. <u>INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED MATERIAL</u>

When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted to the court.

12. MISCELLANEOUS

- 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.
- 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in

this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

- 12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.
- 12.4 Monteleone previously filed a Complaint against HSBC in the United States District Court For The Northern District of Illinois Eastern Division. The Court entered an Agreed Confidentiality Order in that action. HSBC and PHH (in response to a third-party subpoena) produced documents and marked some of those documents as Confidential under the Agreed Confidentiality Order. The Parties agree that the documents previously produced in that action that were marked as Confidential are now considered designated as CONFIDENTIAL under this Stipulated Protective Order and that the other provisions of this Stipulated Protective Order apply to those documents.

13. FINAL DISPOSITION

After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was

1	returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that	t the Receiving Party has not retained any
2	copies, abstracts, compilations, summario	es or any other format reproducing or
3	capturing any of the Protected Material.	Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel
4	are entitled to retain an archival copy of	all pleadings, motion papers, trial,
5	deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal	memoranda, correspondence, deposition
6	and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney	work product, and consultant and expert
7	work product, even if such materials con-	tain Protected Material. Any such archiva
8	copies that contain or constitute Protected	d Material remain subject to this
9	Protective Order.	
10	14. Any violation of this Order	may be punished by any and all
11	appropriate measures including, without	limitation, contempt proceedings and/or
12	monetary sanctions.	
13	IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROU	GH COUNSEL OF RECORD.
14	DATED this 18th day of May, 2017.	DATED this 18th day of May, 2017.
15	TERRELL MARSHALL LAW	BALLARD SPAHR LLP
16	GROUP PLLC	
17	By: /s/ Beth E. Terrell	By: /s/ Scott M. Pearson
18	Beth E. Terrell, SBN #178181 Email: bterrell@terrellmarshall.com	Scott M. Pearson, SBN #173880
19	Jennifer Rust Murray, Admitted Pro Hac Vice	Email: pearsons@ballardspahr.com Taylor Steinbacher, SBN #285335
20	Email: jmurray@terrellmarshall.com 936 North 34th Street, Suite 300	Email: steinbachert@ballardspahr.com 2029 Century Park East, Suite 800
21	Seattle, Washington 98103 Telephone: (206) 816-6603	Los Angeles, California 90067-2909 Telephone: (424) 204-4400
22	Facsimile: (206) 319-5450	Facsimile: (424) 204-4350
23	Todd M. Friedman, SBN #216752 Email:	Matthew A. Morr,
24	tfriedman@attorneysforconsumers.com Adrian R. Bacon, SBN #280332	Admitted Pro Hac Vice Email: morrm@ballardspahr.com
25	Email: abacon@attorneysforconsumers.com	BALLARD SPAHR LLP 1225 17th Street, Suite 2300
26	TRIEDMAN, L.C.	Denver, Colorado 80202 Telephone: (303) -292-2400
- 1		
27	324 South Beverly Drive, Suite 25 Beverly Hills, California 90212 Telephone: (877) 206-4741	Facsimile: (303) 296-3956 Attorneys for Defendants HSBC

- 1		
1	Abbas Kazerounian, SBN #249203 PHH Mortgage Corporation	
2	Email: ak@kazlg.com Jason A. Ibey, SBN #284607	
3	Email: jason@kazlg.com KAZEROUNI LAW GROUP, APC	
4	245 Fischer Avenue, Unit D1 Costa Mesa, California 92626	
5	Telephone: (800) 400-6808 Facsimile: (800) 520-5523	
6	Joshua B. Swigart, SBN #225557	
7	Email: josh@westcoastlitigation.com HYDE & SWIGART 2221 Caming Del Rio South, Suite 101	
8	2221 Camino Del Rio South, Suite 101 San Diego, California 92108	
9	Telephone: (619) 233-7770 Facsimile: (619) 297-1022	
10	Alexander H. Burke,	
11	Admitted Pro Hac Vice Email: aburke@burkelawllc.com Daniel I. Marovitah	
12	Daniel J. Marovitch Email: dmarovitch@burkelawllc.com	
13	BURKE LAW OFFICES, LLC 155 North Michigan Avenue	
14	Suite 9020 Chicago, Illinois 60601	
15	Telephone: (312) 729-5288 Facsimile: (312) 729-5289	
16	Matthew R. Mendelsohn Email: mmendelsohn@mskf.net	
17	MAZIE SLATER KATZ & FREEMAN, LLC	
18	103 Eisenhower Parkway Roseland, New Jersey 07076	
19	Telephone: (973) 228-9898 Facsimile: (973) 228-0303	
20	Attorneys for Plaintiffs	
21	mome ys for 1 minigs	
22	All signatories listed on whose behalf this filing is submitted concur in the filing's	
23	content and have authorized the filing (L.R. 5-4.3.4(a)(2)(i)).	
24		
25	FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.	
26	As	
27	DATED: May 22, 2017 Honorable Sheri Pym	
28	Honorable Sheri Pym United States Magistrate Judge	

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER

EXHIBIT A 1 ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND 2 I, _____ [print or type full name], of 3 _____ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury 4 that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that 5 was issued by the United States District Court for the Central District of California 6 on [date] in the case between Plaintiffs, Saber Ahmed and John Mantelone, and 7 Defendants, PHH Mortgage Corporation and HSBC Mortgage Corporation (USA) 8 ("HSBC") (erroneously sued as HSBC Bank USA, National Association), Case 9 No. 5:15-cv-02057-FMO-SP. I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the 10 terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that 11 failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of 12 contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any 13 information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person 14 or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order. 15 I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District 16 Court for the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms 17 of this Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur 18 after termination of this action. I hereby appoint _____ 19 [print or type full name] of ______ [print 20 or type full address and telephone number] as my California agent for service of 21 process in connection with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of 22 this Stipulated Protective Order. 23 Date: _____ 24 City and State where sworn and signed: 25

Printed name: _____

Signature:

28

DMEAST #28999157 v2

26

27

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE 1 I hereby certify that on this 18th day of May 2017, I electronically filed a true 2 and correct copy of the foregoing STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER 3 through the Court's CM/ECF system, which will send a notice of electronic filing 4 5 to the following: 6 Beth Terrell, Esq. bterrell@terrellmarshall.com Jennifer Rust Murray, Esq. jmurray@terrellmarshall.com **Terrell Marshall Law Group PLLC** 8 9 Todd M. Friedman, Esq. tfriedman@attorneysforconsumers.com 10 Adrian R. Bacon, Esq. abacon@attorneysforconsumers.com Law Offices of Todd M. Friedman, P.C. 11 12 Abbas Kazerounian, Esq. ak@kazlg.com 13 Jason A. Ibey, Esq. Jason@kazlg.com Kazerouni Law Group, APC 14 15 Joshua B. Swigart, Esq. josh@westcoastlitigation.com 16 **Hyde & Swigart** 17 Alexander H. Burke, Esq. Daniel J. Marovitch, Esq. **Burke Law Offices, LLC** aburke@burkelawllc.com dmarovitch@burkelawllc.com 20 Matthew R. Mendelsohn, Esq. mmendelsohn@mskf.net 21 Mazie Slater Katz & Freeman, LLC 22 23 /s/ Scott M. Pearson Scott M. Pearson 24 25 26 27 28

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE