

1 VEDDER PRICE (CA), LLP
 2 LISA M. SIMONETTI (SB# 165996)
 3 lsimonetti@vedderprice.com
 4 CHRISTOPHER R. RAMOS (SB# 301556)
 5 cramos@vedderprice.com
 1925 Century Park East, Suite 1900
 Los Angeles, California 90067
 T: +1 424 204 7700
 F: +1 424 204 7702

IT IS SO ORDERED.
 DATED: 10/11/2017
 Alicia G. Rosenberg
 UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE

6 *Attorneys for Defendant*
 7 *Navient Solutions, LLC,*
 8 *formerly known as Navient Solutions, Inc.*

9 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
 10 CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

11 ANDRA JAY AS EXECUTOR OF
 12 THE ESTATE OF RITA CUTLER,

Case No. 5:16-cv-02026-MWF-AGR

13 Plaintiff,

**STIPULATED PROTECTIVE
 ORDER**

14 v.

15 NAVIENT SOLUTIONS, INC.,

16 Defendant.

17
 18 1. A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

19 Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential,
 20 proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public
 21 disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may
 22 be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to
 23 enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this
 24 Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to
 25 discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends
 26 only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment
 27 under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth
 28 in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to

1 file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the
2 procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a
3 party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

4 B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

5 This action is likely to involve commercial, financial, technical and/or
6 proprietary information for which special protection from public disclosure and
7 from use for any purpose other than prosecution of this action is warranted. Such
8 confidential and proprietary materials and information consist of, among other
9 things, confidential business or financial information, information regarding
10 confidential business practices, or other confidential research, development, or
11 commercial information (including information implicating privacy rights of third
12 parties), information otherwise generally unavailable to the public, or which may be
13 privileged or otherwise protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes,
14 court rules, case decisions, or common law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of
15 information, to facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of
16 discovery materials, to adequately protect information the parties are entitled to
17 keep confidential, to ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses
18 of such material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their
19 handling at the end of the litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order
20 for such information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that
21 information will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that
22 nothing be so designated without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a
23 confidential, non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part
24 of the public record of this case.

25 2. DEFINITIONS

26 2.1 Action: This pending federal law suit.

27 2.2 Challenging Party: A Party or Non-Party that challenges the
28 designation of information or items under this Order.

1 2.3 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: Information (regardless of
2 how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for
3 protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in
4 the Good Cause Statement.

5 2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as
6 their support staff).

7 2.5 Designating Party: A Party or Non-Party that designates information
8 or items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as
9 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

10 2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: All items or information, regardless
11 of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including,
12 among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced
13 or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

14 2.7 Expert: A person with specialized knowledge or experience in a
15 matter pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to
16 serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

17 2.8 House Counsel: Attorneys who are employees of a party to this
18 Action. House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other
19 outside counsel.

20 2.9 Non-Party: Any natural person, partnership, corporation, association,
21 or other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

22 2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: Attorneys who are not employees of a
23 party to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and
24 have appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm
25 which has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

26 2.11 Party: Any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,
27 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their
28 support staffs).

1 2.12 Producing Party: A Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
2 Discovery Material in this Action.

3 2.13 Professional Vendors: Persons or entities that provide litigation
4 support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or
5 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)
6 and their employees and subcontractors.

7 2.14 Protected Material: Any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
8 designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

9 2.15 Receiving Party: A Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery
10 Material from a Producing Party.

11 3. SCOPE

12 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only
13 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or
14 extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or
15 compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or
16 presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

17 Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the
18 trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

19 4. DURATION

20 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations
21 imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees
22 otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be
23 deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this Action,
24 with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and
25 exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this Action,
26 including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time
27 pursuant to applicable law.

28

1 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

2 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.

3 Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under
4 this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that
5 qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for
6 protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written
7 communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents,
8 items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept
9 unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

10 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations
11 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper
12 purpose (*e.g.*, to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to
13 impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the
14 Designating Party to sanctions.

15 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it
16 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must
17 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

18 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in
19 this Order (*see, e.g.*, second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise
20 stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection
21 under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or
22 produced.

23 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

24 (a) For information in documentary form (*e.g.*, paper or electronic
25 documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial
26 proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend
27 "CONFIDENTIAL" (hereinafter "CONFIDENTIAL legend"), to each page that
28 contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a

1 page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the
2 protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

3 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection
4 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated
5 which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and
6 before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be
7 deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting Party has identified the
8 documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine
9 which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order.

10 Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the
11 "CONFIDENTIAL legend" to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a
12 portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing
13 Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making
14 appropriate markings in the margins).

15 (b) For testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party identify
16 the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the
17 deposition all protected testimony.

18 (c) For information produced in some form other than documentary and
19 for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on
20 the exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the
21 legend "CONFIDENTIAL." If only a portion or portions of the information
22 warrants protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the
23 protected portion(s).

24 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent
25 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive
26 the Designating Party's right to secure protection under this Order for such
27 material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make
28

1 reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the
2 provisions of this Order.

3 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

4 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a
5 designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court's
6 Scheduling Order.

7 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute
8 resolution process under Civil Local Rule 37.1 *et seq.*

9 6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on
10 the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper
11 purpose (*e.g.*, to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other
12 parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating
13 Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall
14 continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is
15 entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the Court rules on the
16 challenge.

17 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

18 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
19 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this
20 Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such
21 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the
22 conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a
23 Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL
24 DISPOSITION).

25 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a
26 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons
27 authorized under this Order.
28

1 7.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless
2 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a
3 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated

4 “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

5 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as
6 well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably
7 necessary to disclose the information for this Action;

8 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of
9 the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;

10 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom
11 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the
12 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

13 (d) the court and its personnel;

14 (e) court reporters and their staff;

15 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional
16 Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have
17 signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

18 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a
19 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

20 (h) during their depositions, witnesses ,and attorneys for witnesses, in the
21 Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing
22 party requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit 1 hereto; and
23 (2) they will not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign
24 the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise
25 agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed
26 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may
27 be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone
28 except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

1 (i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel,
2 mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

3 8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED
4 IN OTHER LITIGATION

5 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation
6 that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as
7 “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

8 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification
9 shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

10 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order
11 to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the
12 subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall
13 include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

14 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be
15 pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

16 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with
17 the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this
18 action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the
19 subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s
20 permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking
21 protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions
22 should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action
23 to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

24 9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE
25 PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION

26 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a
27 Non-Party in this Action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information
28 produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the

1 remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be
2 construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

3 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to
4 produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is
5 subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's
6 confidential information, then the Party shall:

7 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-
8 Party that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality
9 agreement with a Non-Party;

10 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated
11 Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably
12 specific description of the information requested; and

13 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the
14 Non-Party, if requested.

15 (c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within
16 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party
17 may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery
18 request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall
19 not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the
20 confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court.
21 Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and
22 expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

23 10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

24 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed
25 Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this
26 Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in
27 writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best
28 efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the

1 person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of
2 this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the “Acknowledgment
3 and Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

4 11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE
5 PROTECTED MATERIAL

6 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain
7 inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other
8 protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal
9 Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify
10 whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for
11 production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence
12 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure
13 of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work
14 product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated
15 protective order submitted to the court.

16 12. MISCELLANEOUS

17 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any
18 person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

19 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this
20 Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to
21 disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in
22 this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on
23 any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective
24 Order.

25 12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any
26 Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material
27 may only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the
28 specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party’s request to file Protected Material

1 under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information
2 in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

3 13. FINAL DISPOSITION

4 After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60
5 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must
6 return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As
7 used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts,
8 compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the
9 Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the
10 Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if
11 not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that
12 (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was
13 returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any
14 copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or
15 capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel
16 are entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial,
17 deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition
18 and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert
19 work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival
20 copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective
21 Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

22 14. Any violation of this order may be punished by any and all appropriate
23 measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary
24 sanctions.

25 ///

26

27

28

1 **IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.**

2 Dated: September 28, 2017

Dated: September 28, 2017

3

4

5 By: /s/ Matthew M. Loker
MATTHEW M. LOKER

By: /s/ Lisa M. Simonetti
LISA M. SIMONETTI

6

KAZEROUNI LAW GROUP, APC

ABBAS KAZEROUNIAN
MATTHEW M. LOKER
245 Fischer Avenue, Unit D1
Costa Mesa, CA 92626
Telephone: (800) 400-6808
Facsimile: (800) 520-5523

VEDDER PRICE (CA), LLP

LISA M. SIMONETTI
CHRISTOPHER R. RAMOS
1925 Century Park East, Suite 1900
Los Angeles, California 90067
Telephone: (424) 204-7700
Facsimile: (424) 204-7702

10

HYDE & SWIGART

JOSHUA B. SWIGART
DAVID MCGLOTHLIN
2221 Camino Del Rio South, Suite 101
San Diego, CA 92108
Telephone: (619) 233-7770
Facsimile: (619) 297-1022

*Attorneys for Defendant
Navient Solutions, LLC,
formerly known as Navient Solutions,
Inc.*

14

*Attorneys for Plaintiff
Andra Jay As Executor Of The Estate Of
Rita Cutler*

16

*** * * ATTESTATION PURSUANT TO LOCAL RULE 5-4.3.4(2)(i) * * ***

17

I, Lisa M. Simonetti, am the registered CM/ECF filer whose login and password is being used to file this Stipulated Protective Order. I hereby attest that all other signatories listed, and on whose behalf this filing is being submitted, concur in the filing's content and have authorized the filing.

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

EXHIBIT A

ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, _____ [print or type full name], of
[print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its
entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the
United States District Court for the Central District of California on [date] in the
case of _____ [insert formal name of the case and the number and
initials assigned to it by the court]. I agree to comply with and to be bound by all
the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that
failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of
contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any
information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person
or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court
for the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this
Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after
termination of this action. I hereby appoint _____ [print or
type full name] of _____ [print or type full address
and telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in connection
with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated
Protective Order.

Date: _____

City and State where sworn and signed: _____

Printed name: _____

Signature: _____