```
1
    WILLARD K. TOM
    General Counsel
                                                         FILED - SOUTHERN DIVISION
 2
                                                         CLERK, U.S. DISTRICT COURT
    DAVID M. NEWMAN (Calif. Bar #54218)
 3
    ERIC D. EDMONDSON
    901 Market Street, Suite 570
                                                            NOV 18 2009
 4
    San Francisco, CA 94103
        (415) 848-5100; F:
                              (415) 848-5184
 5
    dnewman@ftc.gov; eedmondson@ftc.gov
                                                              STRICT OF CALIFORNIA
    RAYMOND E. MCKOWN (Calif. Bar #150975)
    10877 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 700
    Los Angeles, CA 90024
    R: (310) 824-4343; F: (310) 824-4380
    rmckown@ftc.gov
    Attorneys for Plaintiff
    Federal Trade Commission
10
11
                       UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
                      CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
12
13
    FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION,
                                            Case No.
14
         Plaintiff,
                                            SACV-09-01324 CJC (RNBx)
15
                                            [PROPOSED]
              v.
                                            FINAL JUDGMENT AND ORDER
                                            FOR PERMANENT INJUNCTION
16
    COMMERCE PLANET, INC., a
    corporation, and MICHAEL Hill,
                                            AND SETTLEMENT OF CLAIMS
17
    CHARLES GUGLIUZZA, and AARON
                                            FOR MONETARY RELIEF
                                            AGAINST DEFENDANT
    GRAVITZ, individually and as
18
                                            MICHAEL HILL
    Officers of COMMERCE PLANET,
19
         Defendants.
20
21
         The parties, Plaintiff the Federal Trade Commission
22
    ("Commission") and Defendant Michael Hill, having agreed in the
23
    Stipulation for Final Judgment and Order for Permanent
24
    Injunction and Settlement of Claims for Monetary Relief Against
25
   Defendant Michael Hill to the entry of this Order hereby request
26
   that the Court enter the same to resolve all matters in dispute
27
                     Defendant Michael Hill has waived service of
   in this action.
28
   the Summons and Complaint.
```

FINAL ORDER re MICHAEL HILL

BY FAX ORIGINAL Dockets. Justia.com

6

9

25

The Court, being advised of the premises, finds

FINDINGS

- 1. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this case and jurisdiction over Defendant Hill. Venue in the Central District of California is proper.
- 2. The Complaint states a claim upon which relief may be granted against Defendant Hill, and the Commission has the authority to seek the relief it has requested against Defendant Hill.
- 3. The activities of Defendant Hill were and are in or affecting commerce, as defined in Section 4 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. \$ 44.
 - 4. Defendant Hill waives
 - a. all rights to seek review or otherwise challenge or contest the validity of this Order;
 - b. any claim Defendant Hill may have against the Commission, its employees, representatives, or agents;
 - c. all claims under the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412, as amended by Pub. L. 104-121, 110 Stat. 847, 863-64, as of the date of this Order; and
 - d. any rights to attorneys' fees that may have arisen under said provision of law.
- 5. Defendant Hill stipulates and agrees to this Order, without trial or adjudication of any issue of fact or law, to settle and resolve all matters in dispute arising from the Complaint to the date of entry of this Order. Defendant Hill does not admit any of the allegations set forth in the Complaint, other than jurisdictional facts, and denies any and

5

7 8

6

9 10

12 13

11

1415

16 17

19

20

18

2122

2324

26

25

2728

6. This action and the relief awarded herein are in addition to, and not in lieu of, other remedies as may be provided by law, including both civil and criminal remedies.

7. Entry of this Order is in the public interest.

DEFINITIONS

For purposes of this Order, the following definitions shall apply:

- 1. "Billing information" means any data that enables any person to access a consumer's account, including but not limited to a credit card, checking, savings, share or similar account, utility bill, mortgage loan account, or debit card.
- 2. "Clear and conspicuous statement" or statement presented "clearly and conspicuously" means
- a. in print communications, the message shall be in a type size and location sufficiently noticeable for an ordinary consumer to read and comprehend it, in print that contrasts with the background against which it appears;
- b. in oral communications, the message shall be delivered in a volume and cadence sufficient for an ordinary consumer to hear and comprehend it;
- c. in communications made through an electronic medium (including but not limited to television, video, radio, and interactive media including but not limited to the Internet, online services and software), the message shall be presented simultaneously in both the

2021

2223

24

25

27

28

26

audio and visual portions of the communication. any communication presented solely through visual or audio means, the message may be made through the same means in which the communication is presented. communication disseminated by means of an interactive electronic medium, including but not limited to the Internet, online services or software, a disclosure must be unavoidable and presented prior to the consumer incurring any financial obligation. Any audio message shall be delivered in a volume and cadence sufficient for an ordinary consumer to hear and comprehend it. Any visual message shall be of a size and shade, with a degree of contrast to the background against which it appears and shall appear on the screen for a duration and in a location sufficiently noticeable for an ordinary consumer to read and comprehend it; and

- d. regardless of the medium used to disseminate it, the message shall be in understandable language and syntax. Nothing contrary to, inconsistent with, or in mitigation of the message shall be used in any communication.
- 3. "Defendant," unless otherwise specified, means
 Defendant Michael J. Hill.
- 4. "Negative Option Feature" means, in an offer or agreement to sell or provide any product, program or service, a provision under which the consumer's silence or failure to take an affirmative action to

28 l

reject products or services or to cancel the agreement is interpreted by the seller or provider as acceptance of the offer. Offers or agreements with negative option features include, but are not limited to

- a. free or introductory price trial offers in which the consumer receives a product, program or service for free or at a nominal or introductory price for an initial period and will incur an obligation to pay or pay a greater amount for the product, program or service if he or she does not take affirmative action to cancel, reject, or return the product, program or service before the end of that period;
- b. continuity plans in which, subsequent to the consumer's agreement to the plan, the seller or provider automatically ships products to a consumer unless the consumer notifies the seller or provider within a certain time not to ship the products; and
- c. automatic renewal plans in which the seller or provider automatically renews the agreement and charges the consumer unless the consumer cancels before the renewal.

I. PROHIBITION ON MISREPRESENTATIONS

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Defendant Hill, directly or through any partnership, corporation, subsidiary, division or other device, and his officers, agents, servants, employees, and all persons or entities in active concert or participation with him who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, in connection with the advertising, promoting,

offering for sale, or sale of any product, program or service, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from misrepresenting, or assisting others in misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, any material fact, including but not limited to

- A. That a product, program or service is offered on a "free," "trial," or "no obligation" basis, or words of similar import, denoting or implying the absence of any obligation on the part of the recipient of the offer to affirmatively act in order to avoid charges if, in fact, a charge will be assessed pursuant to the offer unless the consumer takes affirmative action to cancel;
- B. The amount that a consumer will be charged or billed;
- C. That a consumer will not be charged or billed;
- D. The timing or manner of any charge or bill (including but not limited to the date of the charge and whether it will be a credit card charge or a checking account debit);
- E. The length of any trial period that consumers receive before being charged or billed; and
- F. That a consumer purchased or agreed to purchase a product, program or service, or that a transaction has been authorized by a consumer, including but not limited to through mailings, email, billings, credit card charges, and checking account debits.

II. REQUIRED DISCLOSURES

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant Hill, directly or

11 12

13 14

15

16 17

18

19 20

21 22

23

24 25

26

27 28

through any partnership, corporation, subsidiary, division or other device, and his officers, agents, servants, employees, and all persons or entities in active concert or participation with him who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, in connection with the advertising, promoting, offering for sale, or sale of any product, program or service, shall

- Α. Clearly and conspicuously disclose, before consumers are asked to pay money, submit consideration, or reveal billing information
 - 1. all fees and costs;
 - 2. all material restrictions, limitations, or conditions applicable to the purchase, receipt, or use of the product, program or service that is the subject of the offer (including any promotion associated with free products or services, or products or services available on a trial basis); and
 - 3. all material terms and conditions of any offer with a negative option feature, including but not limited to
 - the dollar amount of the first payment and when it will be charged, withdrawn, or become due; the dates or frequency (e.g., monthly, quarterly) of all subsequent charges or payments; and the dollar amount or range of costs of all subsequent charges or payments;

- b. when any trial period begins; the length of any trial period; the specific steps and means by which a cancellation request must be submitted; and the date by or period within which a cancellation request must be received to avoid a charge;
- c. the length of any renewal period; the manner in which a notice not to ship or renew must be submitted; the date by or time period within which a notice not to ship or renew must be received to avoid shipment or renewal (e.g., two weeks after the consumer is advised of an upcoming shipment); and the telephone number, email address, or street address to which such a notice must be directed; and
- d. all material conditions, limitations and restrictions on the ability of the consumer to use any product, program or service that is offered "free," "risk-free," with "no obligation," or "discounted," or words of similar import denoting or implying the absence of any obligation.
- B. For any transaction involving a service, within the lesser of ten (10) days after the date of the transaction or half the time of any trial period, send the consumer written confirmation of the transaction, either by email or first class mail, clearly and

conspicuously identified as such in the email subject line or on the outside of the envelope; such written confirmation shall include clear and conspicuous disclosure of all the information required by Subsection A of this Section and of the procedures by which the consumer can cancel or obtain a refund;

- C. For any transaction involving a product, provide written confirmation of the transaction with the first product shipment that includes all of the information required by Subsection A of this Section and a clear and conspicuous statement of the procedures by which the consumer can cancel or obtain a refund;
- D. At least thirty (30) days prior to renewing a consumer's membership, subscription or agreement to purchase for any service (in the case of a membership, subscription or agreement whose term is six (6) months or longer) and prior to the submission for payment of a consumer's billing information for such services, send the consumer written confirmation of such renewal, either by email or first class mail, clearly and conspicuously identified as such in the email subject line or on the outside of the envelope; such written confirmation shall include clear and conspicuous disclosure of all the information required by Subsection A of this Section and of the procedures by which the consumer can cancel or obtain a refund.

III. EXPRESS INFORMED CONSENT

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant Hill, directly or through any partnership, corporation, subsidiary, division or other device, and his officers, agents, servants, employees, and all persons or entities in active concert or participation with him who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, in connection with the advertising, promoting, offering for sale, or sale of any product, program or service, are hereby enjoined from directly or indirectly using billing information to obtain payment in connection with the marketing of any product, program or service, without the express informed consent of the consumer, which shall include consent to be charged for the product, program or service using a specified billing account, and the clear and conspicuous disclosure of the information identified in the Section entitled "Required Disclosures" in close proximity to the consumer's express consent to purchase such products or services. In connection with an offer or agreement with a negative option feature, the following requirements must be met to evidence express informed consent:

A. The consumer's express written authorization to purchase the product, program or service that is the subject of the transaction and the consumer's authorization to assess a charge against a specified account for payment. Such authorization must include the consumer's signature (the term "signature" includes a verifiable electronic or digital form of signature, to the extent such form of signature is

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

23

24

25

26

27

28

recognized as a valid signature under applicable federal law or state contract law); or

- B. The consumer's express oral authorization to purchase the product, program or service that is the subject of the transaction and the consumer's authorization to assess a charge against a specified account for payment for that product, program or service that is audio-recorded, as follows
 - the recording must evidence that the consumer, during that transaction, at a minimum, has provided the last four (4) digits of the account number to be charged;
 - 2. the recording must evidence that the disclosure requirements of the Section entitled "Required Disclosures" have been complied with;
 - 3. the recording must include the entirety of the transaction;
 - 4. the recording can be identified and located by either the consumer's name or telephone number; and
 - 5. a copy of the recording is provided upon request to the consumer, the consumer's bank, credit or debit card company or other billing entity, state attorney general or consumer protection agency, and the Commission.

IV. PROHIBITIONS RELATING TO REFUNDS AND CANCELLATIONS IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant Hill, directly or through any partnership, corporation, subsidiary, division or

 other device, and his officers, agents, servants, employees, and all persons or entities in active concert or participation with him who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, in connection with the advertising, promoting, offering for sale, or sale of any product, program or service, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined

- A. From failing to disclose, clearly and conspicuously, before consumers are asked to pay money, submit consideration, or reveal billing information, all material terms and conditions of any cancellation or refund policy, including but not limited to informing consumers that no cancellations or refunds are permitted;
- B. If a policy allowing consumers to cancel or obtain a refund has been disclosed to the consumer, from failing to honor any request that complies with such policy; and
- C. From misrepresenting, or assisting others in misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, the terms and conditions of any refund or cancellation policy or policies, including but not limited to, that consumers who accept an offer can easily cancel to avoid the assessment of a charge.

V. MONETARY RELIEF

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Judgment is hereby entered against Defendant Hill in the amount of nineteen million seven hundred thirty thousand dollars (\$19,730,000); provided, however, that the Judgment for equitable monetary relief shall

be suspended upon the satisfaction of the obligations imposed by Subsections A through D, and subject to the conditions set forth in Section VI of this Order.

- A. Defendant Hill shall pay to the Commission the sum of two hundred thirty thousand dollars (\$230,000) in equitable monetary relief, including, but not limited to, consumer redress or disgorgement, within 10 business days of the entry of this Order;
- B. Defendant Hill shall pay to the FTC on or by March 10, 2010, all money paid to him by Lenco Mobile, Inc., in satisfaction of the promissory note issued to Defendant Hill by Lenco Mobile, a copy of which is included as Attachment A to this Order. In the event Lenco Mobile defaults on said promissory note, Defendant Hill shall assign the promissory note to the FTC;
- C. Immediately upon entry of this order, Defendant Hill shall assign to the FTC the proceeds of any recovery in the lawsuit Moser-Downum Investment Group, LLC v. Kennedy Funding, Inc. et al, to which he is entitled pursuant to the Settlement and Mutual Release Agreement described in Attachment B to this Order;
- D. Immediately upon entry of this order, Defendant Hill shall assign to the Commission the promissory note in the amount of \$200,000 secured by the real property described in Attachment C to this Order. The FTC shall refrain from executing on its lien and security interest in the aforementioned real property until

10

13

16 17

18 19

2021

22

2324

26

25

27 28 such time as the properties are sold or ownership is otherwise transferred;

- E. Defendant Hill shall pay to the FTC all money and the fair market value of any goods or services that he receives in satisfaction of any undocumented loan extended by Hill to any individual or business between June 1, 2005 and the date of this Order;
- F. Any funds received by the Commission pursuant to this Order shall be deposited into a fund administered by the Commission or its agent to be used for equitable relief, including but not limited to consumer redress and any attendant expenses for the administration of any redress funds. In the event that direct redress to consumers is wholly or partially impracticable or funds remain after redress is completed, the Commission may apply any remaining funds for such other equitable relief, including but not limited to consumer information remedies, as the Commission determines to be reasonably related to the practices alleged in the Complaint. Any funds not used for such equitable relief shall be deposited to the U.S. Treasury as equitable disgorgement. Defendant Hill shall have no right to challenge the Commission's choice of remedies or the manner of distribution;
- G. Defendant Hill agrees that the facts as alleged in the Complaint filed in this action shall be taken as true without further proof in any bankruptcy case or subsequent civil litigation pursued by the Commission

1617

18 19

2021

2223

2425

2627

28

to enforce its rights to any payment or money judgment pursuant to this Order, including but not limited to a nondischargeability complaint in any bankruptcy case; Defendant further stipulates and agrees that the facts alleged in the Complaint establish all elements necessary to sustain an action pursuant to Section 523(a)(2)(A) of the Bankruptcy Code, 11 U.S.C. § 523(a)(2)(A);

- H. The judgment entered pursuant to this Section V is equitable monetary relief, solely remedial in nature, and not a fine, penalty, punitive assessment or forfeiture;
- I. Defendant Hill relinquishes all dominion, control and title to the funds paid to the fullest extent permitted by law. Defendant shall make no claim to or demand return of the funds, directly or indirectly, through counsel or otherwise;
- J. Upon request, Defendant Hill is hereby required, in accordance with 31 U.S.C. § 7701, to furnish to the Commission his tax identification number, which shall be used for purposes of collecting and reporting on any delinquent amount arising out of this Order;
- K. Pursuant to Section 604(1) of the Fair Credit Reporting Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1681b(1), any consumer reporting agency may furnish a consumer report concerning Defendant Hill to the Commission, which shall be used for purposes of collecting and reporting on any delinquent amount arising out of this Order.

VI. RIGHT TO REOPEN

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Commission's agreement to, and the Court's approval of, this Order are expressly premised on the truthfulness, accuracy and completeness of the financial statements dated February 10 and March 20, 2009 that Defendant Hill has submitted to the Commission. If, upon motion by the Commission, the Court finds that his financial statement contains any material misrepresentation or omission, the suspended judgment entered in Section V, above, shall become immediately due and payable, less any amounts turned over to the Commission pursuant to Section V, above, plus interest from the date of entry of this Order as allowed by law; provided, however, that in all other respects this Order shall remain in full force and effect unless otherwise ordered by the Court; and, provided further, that proceedings instituted under this provision would be in addition to, and not in lieu of, any other civil or criminal remedies as may be provided by law, including any other proceedings that the Commission may initiate to enforce this Order. For purposes of this Section VI, Defendant Hill waives any right to contest any of the allegations in the Complaint.

22

1

2

3

4

5

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

23

24

2526

27

28

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant Hill, directly or through any partnership, corporation, subsidiary, division or other device, and his officers, agents, servants, employees, and all persons or entities in active concert or participation with him who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, in connection with the advertising, promoting, offering for sale, or sale of any product, program or service, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from failing to take all reasonable steps sufficient to monitor and ensure that all Defendant's agents, representatives, employees, independent contractors, and contract telemarketers comply with the requirements of this Order. Such reasonable steps shall include, but are not limited to

- A. Establishing and following a procedure for receiving and responding to consumer complaints that allege conduct that constitutes a violation of the FTC Act or this Order;
- B. Ascertaining the number and nature of consumer complaints in which each employee or independent contractor is involved;
- C. Promptly and fully investigating any consumer complaint; and
- D. Creating and retaining records demonstrating compliance with this Section, as required by Section X, including but not limited to, copies of all procedures for receiving and responding to consumer complaints, all documents relating to investigations

of consumer complaints, and all documents demonstrating how each consumer complaint is responded to or addressed; provided, however, that this subsection does not authorize or require any action that violates any federal, state, or local law.

VIII. PROHIBITION ON COLLECTION OF PAYMENTS AND DISCLOSURE OF CUSTOMER INFORMATION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant Hill, directly or through any partnership, corporation, subsidiary, division or other device, and his officers, agents, servants, employees, and all persons or entities in active concert or participation with him who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, in connection with the advertising, promoting, offering for sale, or sale of any product, program or service by means of a negative option feature, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from

- A. Causing any withdrawal, assessment of a fee, or payment to be made against any consumer account, or otherwise causing collection of, or attempts to collect, payment, directly or indirectly, from a consumer, for any order for any such product, program or service offered or provided to consumers, where the purported authorization for such order occurred prior to the effective date of this Order, without first obtaining from the consumer express informed consent for such order that complies with the requirements of Section III of this Order; and
- B. Selling, renting, leasing, transferring or otherwise

disclosing the name, address, birth date, telephone number, email address, Social Security number, credit or debit card number, bank account number, or other financial or identifying personal information of any person from whom or about whom such information was obtained in connection with activities alleged in the Complaint prior to April 1, 2008; provided, however, that such financial or identifying personal information may be disclosed to a law enforcement agency or as required by any law, regulation, or court order.

IX. COMPLIANCE MONITORING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for the purpose of (1) monitoring and investigating compliance with any provision of this Order and (2) investigating the accuracy of Defendant's financial statement upon which the Commission's agreement to this Order is expressly premised:

- A. Within ten (10) days of receipt of written notice from a representative of the Commission, Defendant Hill shall submit additional written reports, which are true and accurate and sworn to under penalty of perjury; produce documents for inspection and copying; appear for deposition; and provide entry during normal business hours to any business location in his possession or direct or indirect control, to inspect the business operation;
- B. In addition, the Commission is authorized to use all other lawful means, including but not limited to:

8

5

1112

13

14

15 16

17

18

19 20

21

2223

2425

26

2728

- obtaining discovery from any person, without further leave of court, using the procedures prescribed by Fed. R. Civ. P. 30, 31, 33, 34, 36, 45, and 69;
- 2. posing as consumers and suppliers to Defendant
 Hill, or any other entity managed or controlled
 in whole or in part by Defendant Hill, or their
 employees, without the necessity of
 identification or prior notice; and
- C. Defendant Hill shall permit representatives of the Commission to interview any employer, consultant, independent contractor, representative, agent, or employee who has agreed to such an interview, relating in any way to any conduct subject to this Order. The person interviewed may have counsel present;

Provided, however, that nothing in this Order shall limit the Commission's lawful use of compulsory process, pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 49, 57b-1, to obtain any documentary material, tangible things, testimony, or information relevant to unfair or deceptive acts or practices in or affecting commerce (within the meaning of 15 U.S.C. § 45(a)(1)).

X. COMPLIANCE REPORTING BY DEFENDANT

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, in order that compliance with the provisions of this Order may be monitored:

A. For a period of three (3) years from the date of entry of this Order, Defendant Hill shall notify the Commission of the following:

- 1. Any changes in his residence, mailing addresses, and telephone numbers, within ten (10) days of the date of such change;
- 2. Any changes in his employment status (including self-employment), and any change in his ownership in any business entity, within ten (10) days of the date of such change. Such notice shall include the name and address of each business that he is affiliated with, employed by, creates or forms, or performs services for; a detailed description of the nature of the business; and a detailed description of his duties and responsibilities in connection with the business or employment; and
- 3. Any changes in his name or use of any aliases or fictitious names; and
- 4. Any changes in structure of any business entity that Defendant Hill directly or indirectly controls, or has an ownership interest in, that may affect compliance obligations arising under this Order, including but not limited to incorporation or other organization; a dissolution, assignment, sale, merger, or other action that would result in the emergence of a successor entity; the creation or dissolution of a subsidiary, parent, or affiliate that engages in any acts or practices subject to this Order; or a change in the business name or address, at

least thirty (30) days prior to such change; provided, however, that, with respect to any proposed change in the business entity about which Defendant Hill learns less than thirty (30) days prior to the date such action is to take place, Defendant Hill shall notify the Commission as soon as is practicable after obtaining such knowledge.

- B. One hundred eighty (180) days after the date of entry of this Order and annually thereafter for a period of three (3) years, Defendant Hill shall provide a written report to the Commission, which is true and accurate and sworn to under penalty of perjury, setting forth in detail the manner and form in which he has complied and is complying with this Order. This report shall include, but not be limited to
 - His then-current residence address, mailing addresses, and telephone numbers;
 - 2. His then-current employment status (including self-employment), including the name, addresses, and telephone numbers of each business that he is affiliated with, employed by, or performs services for; a detailed description of the nature of the business; and a detailed description of his duties and responsibilities in connection with the business or employment;
 - a copy of each acknowledgment of receipt of this
 Order obtained pursuant to Section XI; and

3

8

10

11 12

13

15

14

16 17

18

19 20

2122

2425

23

2627

28

- 4. any other changes required to be reported under subparagraph A of this Section IX;
- C. Defendant Hill shall notify the Commission of the filing of a bankruptcy petition within fifteen (15) days of filing;
- D. For the purposes of this Order, Defendant Hill shall, unless otherwise directed by the Commission's authorized representatives, send by overnight courier all reports and notifications required by this Order to the Commission to the following address:

Associate Director for Enforcement Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W., Room NJ-2122 Washington, D.C. 20580 RE: FTC v. Commerce Planet, Inc.;

Provided that, in lieu of overnight courier, Defendant Hill may send such reports or notifications by first-class mail, but only if he contemporaneously sends an electronic version of such report or notification to the Commission at DEBrief@ftc.gov; and

E. For purposes of the compliance reporting and monitoring required by this Order, the Commission is authorized to communicate with Defendant Hill or, at Defendant Hill's request, his counsel.

XI. RECORD KEEPING PROVISIONS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of six (6) years from the date of entry of this Order, in connection with any business which is managed or controlled in whole or in part by Defendant Hill and which is engaged in recurring billing of consumers, Defendant Hill and his agents, servants, employees,

11

9

1213

1415

1617

18

19

2021

2223

24

2526

27

28

and those persons in active concert or participation with him, whether acting directly or through any sole proprietorship, partnership, limited liability company, corporation, subsidiary, branch, division, or other entity, who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, are hereby restrained and enjoined from failing to create and retain the following records:

- A. Accounting records that reflect the cost of products or services sold, revenues generated, and the disbursement of such revenues;
- B. Personnel records accurately reflecting the name, address, and telephone number of each person employed in any capacity by such business, including as an independent contractor; that person's job title or position; the date upon which the person commenced work; and the date and reason for the person's termination, if applicable;
- C. Customer files containing the names, addresses, phone numbers, dollar amounts paid, quantity of items or services purchased, and description of items or services purchased, to the extent such information is obtained in the ordinary course of business;
- D. Complaints and refund requests (whether received directly, indirectly or through any third party) and any responses to those complaints or requests;
- E. Copies of all sales scripts, training materials, advertisements, or other marketing materials; and
- F. All records and documents necessary to demonstrate

Section X.

XII. DISTRIBUTION OF ORDER BY DEFENDANT

reports submitted to the Commission pursuant to

full compliance with each provision of this Order,

including but not limited to, copies of all procedures

for receiving and responding to consumer complaints,

all documents relating to investigations of consumer

complaints, and all documents demonstrating how each

required by Section VII; acknowledgments of receipt of

this Order, required by Sections XI and XII; and all

consumer complaint was responded to or addressed,

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of five (5) years from the date of entry of this Order, Defendant Hill shall deliver copies of this Order as directed below:

A. For any business that Defendant Hill controls, directly or indirectly, or in which Defendant Hill has a majority ownership interest, Defendant Hill must deliver a copy of this Order to (1) all principals, officers, directors, and managers of that business; (2) all employees, agents, and representatives of that business who engage in conduct related to the subject matter of the Order; and (3) any business entity resulting from any change in structure set forth in Subsection A.4 of the Section entitled "Compliance Reporting by Defendant." For current personnel, delivery shall be within five (5) days of service of this Order upon Defendant Hill. For new personnel, delivery shall occur prior to them assuming their

responsibilities. For any business entity resulting from any change in structure set forth in Subsection A.4 of the Section entitled "Compliance Reporting by Defendant," delivery shall be at least ten (10) days prior to the change in structure.

- B. For any business where Defendant Hill is not a controlling person of a business but otherwise engages in conduct related to the subject matter of this Order, Defendant Hill must deliver a copy of this Order to all principals and managers of such business before engaging in such conduct.
- C. Defendant Hill must secure a signed and dated statement acknowledging receipt of the Order, within thirty (30) days of delivery, from all persons receiving a copy of the Order pursuant to this Section.

XIII. COOPERATION WITH FTC COUNSEL

connection with this action or any subsequent investigations related to or associated with the transactions or the occurrences that are the subject of the FTC's Complaint, cooperate in good faith with the FTC and appear at such places and times as the FTC shall reasonably request, after written notice, for interviews, conferences, pretrial discovery, review of documents, and for such other matters as may be reasonably requested by the FTC. If requested in writing by the FTC, Defendant Hill shall appear and provide truthful testimony in any trial, deposition, or other proceeding related to or

associated with the transactions or the occurrences that are the subject of the Complaint, without the service of a subpoena.

XIV. ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF RECEIPT OF ORDER BY DEFENDANT

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant Hill, within five (5) business days of receipt of this Order as entered by the Court, must submit to the Commission a truthful sworn statement acknowledging receipt of this Order.

XV. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter for purposes of construction, modification, and enforcement of this Order.

IT IS SO ORDERED, this 17th day of

November, 2009.

Honorable Cormac J. Carney United States District Judge

Attachment A

Pages 29 - 35 Redacted

Attachment B

Pages 37 - 52 Redacted

Attachment C

Pages 54 - 58 Redacted