

1 David Martinez, Bar No. 193183  
 DMartinez@rkmc.com  
 2 **ROBINS, KAPLAN, MILLER & CIRESI L.L.P.**  
 2049 Century Park East, Suite 3400  
 3 Los Angeles, CA 90067-3208  
 Telephone: (310) 552-0130  
 4 Facsimile: (310) 229-5800

5 Martin R. Lueck (*pro hac vice*)  
 MRLueck@rkmc.com  
 6 Jan M. Conlin (*pro hac vice*)  
 JMConlin@rkmc.com  
 7 Stacie E. Oberts (*pro hac vice*)  
 SEOberts@rkmc.com  
 8 **ROBINS, KAPLAN, MILLER & CIRESI L.L.P.**  
 2800 LaSalle Plaza  
 9 800 LaSalle Avenue  
 Minneapolis, MN 55402-2015  
 10 Telephone: (612) 349-8500  
 Facsimile: (612) 339-4181

11 Attorneys for Plaintiffs MEDTRONIC  
 12 COREVALVE LLC, MEDTRONIC CV  
 LUXEMBOURG S.A.R.L., and MEDTRONIC  
 13 VASCULAR GALWAY LTD.

14 William S. O'Hare, Bar No. 082562  
 wohare@swlaw.com  
 15 Deborah S. Mallgrave, Bar No. 198603  
 dmallgrave@swlaw.com  
 16 **SNELL & WILMER L.L.P.**  
 600 Anton Blvd., Suite 1400  
 17 Costa Mesa, CA 92626-7689  
 Telephone: (714) 427-7000  
 18 Facsimile: (714) 427-7799

19 John E. Nathan (*pro hac vice*)  
 jnathan@paulweiss.com  
 20 Catherine Nyarady (*pro hac vice*)  
 cnyarady@paulweiss.com  
 21 Brian P. Egan (*pro hac vice*)  
 began@paulweiss.com  
 22 Christopher Terranova (*pro hac vice*)  
 cterranova@paulweiss.com  
 23 **PAUL, WEISS, RIFKIND, WHARTON &  
 GARRISON LLP**  
 1285 Avenue of the Americas  
 24 New York, NY 10019-6064  
 Telephone: (212) 373-3000  
 25 Facsimile: (212) 757-3990

26 Attorneys for Defendants EDWARDS  
 27 LIFESCIENCES CORPORATION, EDWARDS  
 LIFESCIENCES LLC and EDWARDS  
 28 LIFESCIENCES (U.S.) Inc.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

MEDTRONIC COREVALVE LLC,  
et al.,  
  
Plaintiffs,  
  
v.  
  
EDWARDS LIFESCIENCES  
CORPORATION, et al.,  
  
Defendants.

Case No. SACV11- 00961-JVS (MLGx)

**[PROPOSED] PROTECTIVE ORDER**

**PROTECTIVE ORDER**

Pursuant to Rule 26(c) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, the following order shall govern the production or provision of confidential information or things by the parties in this case and any third parties (provided such third parties recognize and accept the procedures herein) for the purpose of responding to discovery requests or inquiries.

1. Any party to this action, and any non-party from whom discovery is sought in connection with this action, may designate as “Confidential” or “Highly Confidential” any documents, testimony or other discovery material that contains information of a confidential nature (“confidential information”). The term “Party” shall refer to the named Parties in this litigation; all predecessors and successors thereof; all present divisions, subsidiaries or affiliates of any of the foregoing entities; and all directors, officers, employees, agents, attorneys, or other representatives of any of the foregoing entities.

1           2. No “Confidential” designation shall be made unless the designating  
2 party (or non-party from whom discovery is sought) reasonably believes in good  
3 faith that the designated material constitutes confidential research, development,  
4 financial, technical or commercial information or other information the receiving  
5 party would not have access to but for this lawsuit. Such material shall include  
6 information that is not freely accessible by the public, information to which the  
7 producing party’s employees have only limited access, and/or information, the  
8 dissemination or disclosure of which would present a real or potential economic  
9 threat to the producing party. No “Highly Confidential” designation shall be made  
10 unless the designating party (or non-party from whom discovery is sought)  
11 reasonably believes in good faith that the designated material comprises or contains  
12 competitively sensitive information that could be used by the receiving party to  
13 obtain a business (not legal) advantage over the producing party, including, but not  
14 limited to, trade secrets, highly sensitive, non-public technical information,  
15 documents disclosing the past, present, or intended design, development,  
16 configuration, materials, manufacture, testing or trial, and the results of such testing  
17 or trials, of the products of any Party, documents or information related to damages  
18 (e.g. sales numbers, profit margins), or documents or information related to  
19 pending and not yet published patent applications.

20           3. Material designated as “Confidential” or “Highly Confidential” shall  
21 refer to confidential information (as defined above), including documents, data and  
22 information, answers to interrogatories, answers to deposition questions (if the  
23 deposition is so designated), responses to requests for admission, affidavits, expert  
24 reports, and any information copied or extracted therefrom, as well as all copies,  
25 excerpts, summaries, or compilations thereof, plus testimony, conversations, or  
26 presentations by parties or counsel to or in court or in other settings that might  
27 reveal confidential information.  
28

1           4. Unless and until the Court rules otherwise, material marked as  
2 “Confidential” or “Highly Confidential” shall be maintained in confidence by the  
3 party to whom such material is produced and shall not be disclosed to any person  
4 except:

5           (a) Attorneys of record and associated counsel in this litigation, employees  
6 of such attorneys, counsel to whom it is necessary that the information be disclosed  
7 for purposes of this litigation, and vendors or service providers retained by the  
8 parties or attorneys of record, including but not limited to translators and litigation  
9 support services. As used herein, “associated counsel” shall mean attorneys who  
10 are retained to represent or advise a party for purposes of this litigation, including  
11 U.S. bar admitted and located contract attorneys, attorneys of record from Morris,  
12 Nichols, Arsht & Tunnell LLP, Kecker & Van Nest LLP, and Knobbe Martens  
13 Olson & Bear LLP in *Edwards Lifesciences AG v. CoreValve, Inc.* (D. Del. 08-cv-  
14 00091) and *Edwards Lifesciences AG v. Medtronic, Inc.* (D. Del. 09-873-GMS)  
15 (collectively “the Delaware actions”), and attorneys of record from Kilpatrick  
16 Townsend & Stockton LLP in *Medtronic, Inc. v. Edwards Lifesciences Corp.* (D.  
17 Minn. 11-cv-1650) (“the Minnesota action”);

18           (b) Any person hired by a party or its attorneys of record in this litigation,  
19 including testifying experts, investigators, consulting experts, and any other  
20 independent consultant, each of whom is not a competitor or employed by a  
21 competitor of the producing party or an agent of a competitor of the producing  
22 party, and who is not employed by or associated with either party, and who agrees  
23 in writing to be bound by the terms of this Protective Order. Each of these  
24 individuals must provide the following information: (i) the individual’s name and  
25 business title; (ii) business address; (iii) business or profession; (iv) the individual’s  
26 CV; (v) any previous or current relationship (personal or professional) with any of  
27 the parties; (vi) a list of other cases in which the individual has testified (at trial or  
28

1 deposition) within the last six years; (vii) a list of all companies with which the  
2 individual has been employed within the last four years and a brief description of  
3 the subject matter of the employment; and (viii) a complete and signed Protective  
4 Order Undertaking, attached hereto as Exhibit A. The Protective Order  
5 Undertaking must be served on the producing party before any access is allowed to  
6 the producing party's confidential information. Attorneys for the producing party  
7 shall have ten (10) business days from the receipt of the Protective Order  
8 Undertaking to object in writing to disclosure of confidential information to the  
9 identified expert or consultant. After the expiration of the 10-day period, if no  
10 objection has been asserted, then the confidential information may be disclosed  
11 pursuant to the terms of this Protective Order. Any objection must set forth in  
12 detail the grounds on which it is based. Should the parties disagree with the basis  
13 for the objection(s), the disclosing party must first attempt in good faith to resolve  
14 the objection(s) informally with the objecting party. If the informal efforts do not  
15 resolve the dispute within five (5) business days, the disclosing party may file a  
16 motion requesting that the objection(s) be quashed. The objecting party shall have  
17 the burden of proof by a preponderance of evidence on the issue of the sufficiency  
18 the objection(s). Pending a ruling by the Court upon any such objection(s), the  
19 confidential information shall not be disclosed to the person objected to by the  
20 objecting party;

21 (c) Employees of a person qualified under paragraph 4(b) above, each of  
22 whom is not a competitor or employed by a competitor of the producing party or an  
23 agent of a competitor of the producing party, and who is not employed by or  
24 associated with either party. Such employees must sign a Protective Order  
25 Undertaking, and such Protective Order Undertaking must be retained and  
26 preserved during this litigation by the attorney of record, but such Protective Order  
27  
28

1 Undertaking need not be disclosed to the producing party, unless the Court for good  
2 cause orders otherwise;

3 (d) Jury consultant(s) and/or mock jurors, each of whom is not a  
4 competitor or employed by a competitor of the producing party or an agent of a  
5 competitor of the producing party, and who is not employed by or associated with  
6 either party. Such jury consultant(s) and/or mock jurors must sign a Protective  
7 Order Undertaking, and such Protective Order Undertaking must be retained and  
8 preserved during this litigation by the attorney of record, but such Protective Order  
9 Undertaking need not be disclosed to the producing party, unless the Court for good  
10 cause orders otherwise;

11 (e) Two current in-house attorneys per side, each of whom has been  
12 previously identified to and consented to by the producing party. Such attorneys  
13 must sign a Protective Order Undertaking, and such Protective Order Undertaking  
14 must be retained and preserved during this litigation by the attorney of record, but  
15 such Protective Order Undertaking need not be disclosed to the producing party,  
16 unless the Court for good cause orders otherwise. A party designating an in-house  
17 attorney under this Paragraph must, as a part of that designation, state whether the  
18 designated attorney will be provided access to both “Confidential” and “Highly  
19 Confidential” information or will be provided access to only “Confidential”  
20 information. Any party who designates an in-house attorney to receive only  
21 “Confidential” information subsequently may, upon written notice, modify its  
22 designation, subject to triggering the prosecution bar of Paragraph 6, so that the in-  
23 house attorney also receives “Highly Confidential” information. To the extent any  
24 in-house attorney designated under this Paragraph is only provided access to  
25 “Confidential” information of the opposing party and not “Highly Confidential”  
26 information of the opposing party, such attorney is not subject to the provisions of  
27 Paragraph 6 below;  
28

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

(f) The authors and original recipients of the documents;

(g) Persons testifying in depositions or in court proceedings provided that (1) such documents or information were authored by, addressed to, or received by such persons or other persons employed by the same entity as such persons, or (2) such documents or information were produced by or obtained from such persons or their employer;

(h) Court reporters employed in this litigation, including their necessary stenographic, videographic and clerical personnel; and

(i) The Court, any juror or any other entity authorized by the Court or required by law.

5. In the event that a producing party elects to produce original documents or other material for inspection, no markings need be made on the documents or material by the producing party in advance of the inspection. During the inspection, such documents or material shall be considered confidential information to the extent and at the level designated by the producing party prior to the inspection. After selection by the inspecting party of specific documents or material for copying, the producing party shall make the appropriate copies, and the appropriate confidentiality designations shall be placed on the documents or materials before they are provided to the inspecting party.

6. Notwithstanding any provision of this Order, every person of the receiving party who receives and reviews information designated as “Highly Confidential” or “Confidential” under this Order is precluded from drafting, prosecuting, or supervising the drafting or prosecution of, or providing (verbally or in tangible form, in whole or in part) such Confidential or Highly Confidential information received under this Order to any person involved in drafting,

1 prosecuting, or supervising the drafting or prosecution of, any patent applications  
2 with the United States Patent and Trademark Office (“USPTO”) or any similar  
3 proceedings in any other country, involving any patent or patent application having  
4 claims or disclosures related to methods, procedures, or devices that concern  
5 transcatheter aortic valves. This preclusion is limited to proceedings involving  
6 patents and patent applications having an effective filing date before this action,  
7 during this action, or within four (4) years after the termination of this action. For  
8 purposes of clarity, “prosecution” does not include reexamination, reissue,  
9 interference proceedings, or equivalent proceedings (e.g., Post-Grant Review),  
10 except that all persons subject to this Paragraph are prohibited from drafting new or  
11 amended claims in any such proceedings. This Paragraph does not apply to any in-  
12 house attorney designated under Paragraph 4(e) that is only provided access to  
13 “Confidential” information of the opposing party.

14  
15 7. Notwithstanding any provision of this Order, every person of the  
16 receiving party who receives and reviews information designated as “Highly  
17 Confidential” under this Order, is precluded (unless otherwise agreed to in writing)  
18 from performing development work directly or indirectly intended for commercial  
19 purposes related to methods, procedures, or devices that concern transcatheter  
20 aortic valves, for a period of four (4) years after the termination of this action. This  
21 prohibition shall not preclude such persons from consulting in future litigation, so  
22 long as such consulting does not involve development work directly or indirectly  
23 intended for commercial purposes related to methods, procedures, or devices that  
24 concern transcatheter aortic valves.

25 8. Information disclosed at a deposition (or hearing), as well as through  
26 resulting transcripts or exhibits, of a party, the present or former officers, directors,  
27 employees, agents, or independent experts retained by a party for the purpose of  
28 this litigation, or a third party in possession of confidential information of a party,



1 may be designated as “Confidential” or “Highly Confidential” by indicating such  
2 designation on the record, subject to the Protective Order, or by following the  
3 procedure set forth in paragraph 10 below.

4  
5 9. Confidential information produced without the appropriate designation  
6 of confidentiality may be properly designated subsequent to the production or  
7 testimony when the producing party failed to make such designation at the time of  
8 production or during the testimony through inadvertence or error. If discovery  
9 material is subsequently designated, the receiving party shall promptly collect any  
10 copies that have been provided to individuals other than those authorized in  
11 paragraph 4 of this Order.

12 10. Absent any overriding rules of this Court or orders of this Court, no  
13 material containing confidential information shall be filed in the public record of  
14 this action. In the event that any document or information that has been designated  
15 “Confidential” or “Highly Confidential” is included with, or in any way disclosed  
16 in, any pleading, motion, deposition transcript or other paper filed with the Court,  
17 such document or information and related material shall be filed under seal with the  
18 Court in accordance with Local Rule 79-5.1. Any document or thing containing  
19 confidential information that is to be filed in this litigation must be filed in a sealed  
20 envelope bearing such designation on its front face. In addition, the envelope shall  
21 bear the caption of the case, shall contain a concise, non-disclosing inventory of its  
22 contents for docketing purposes, and shall state thereon that it is filed under the  
23 terms of this Protective Order.

24  
25 11. Inadvertent production of privileged information shall be handled as  
26 follows, but this is without prejudice to the right of any party to apply to the Court  
27 for further protection or disclosure relating to discovery:  
28

1 (a) Pursuant to Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5), immediately  
2 upon receiving notice from the producing party that information subject to the  
3 attorney-client privilege or work-product immunity has been inadvertently  
4 produced, the receiving party shall not review, copy, or otherwise disseminate the  
5 documents or materials, nor shall it disclose their substance. The receiving party  
6 shall return or destroy (at the producing party's option) the documents or materials  
7 and all copies within three (3) business days from receiving notice;

8 (b) If the receiving party, without notice from the producing party,  
9 determines that information subject to the attorney-client privilege or work-product  
10 immunity has been inadvertently produced, the receiving party shall immediately  
11 contact the producing party and advise them of the inadvertent disclosure. Pursuant  
12 to Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5), the receiving party shall not review,  
13 copy, or otherwise disseminate the documents or materials, nor shall it disclose  
14 their substance. In addition, the receiving party shall return or destroy (at the  
15 producing party's option) the documents or materials and all copies within three (3)  
16 business days from discovery of the inadvertent disclosure;

17 (c) If the receiving party believes that it has a good-faith basis for  
18 challenging the privilege claim, the receiving party shall provide the producing  
19 party with a written explanation of the good-faith basis for the belief that the  
20 inadvertently produced documents or materials are not privileged within three (3)  
21 business days of the producing party's request for return. The producing party shall  
22 respond in writing to the receiving party's timely challenge to the privilege or  
23 immunity claim within five (5) business days from receipt of the challenge;

24 (d) In the event the parties cannot agree as to the privilege or immunity  
25 status of the inadvertently produced documents or materials, the receiving party  
26 shall have five (5) business days from receipt of the producing party's written  
27  
28

1 response to the privilege challenge to file a motion (in accordance with any  
2 applicable standing orders or local rules) seeking an order compelling production of  
3 the inadvertently produced documents or materials. The receiving party shall not  
4 use the substantive content of the inadvertently produced documents or materials to  
5 challenge their status as privileged or immune, but may submit the document under  
6 confidential seal for the Court's review. In the event that a motion is made, the  
7 producing party shall have the burden of proving that the inadvertently produced  
8 documents or materials are privileged or immune from discovery;

9  
10 (e) Inadvertent disclosure of information subject to the attorney-client  
11 privilege, work-product immunity, or any other applicable privilege or immunity  
12 shall not constitute a waiver of such privilege(s). Pursuant to Rule 502(d) of the  
13 Federal Rules of Evidence, the Court hereby orders that the attorney-client privilege  
14 or work-product protection is not waived by disclosure connected with the above-  
15 referenced matter and any such disclosure is also not waived in any other Federal or  
16 State proceeding.

17 12. A party may challenge the correctness or propriety of a confidentiality  
18 designation of another party by requesting the Court to order a different designation  
19 or de-designation. The designating party shall bear the burden of establishing a  
20 need for the designation by a preponderance of the evidence. No party, however, is  
21 obligated to challenge the correctness or propriety of any designation of  
22 confidentiality under this Order, and any failure to challenge a designation shall not  
23 prejudice or preclude a subsequent challenge to that or any other designation. A  
24 challenge to a designating party's confidentiality designation shall follow the  
25 following provisions:

26 (a) A party that elects to initiate a challenge to a designating party's  
27 confidentiality designation must do so in good faith and must begin the process by  
28

1 conferring directly with counsel for the designating party. In conferring, the  
2 challenging party must explain the basis for its belief that the confidentiality  
3 designation was not proper and must give the designating party an opportunity to  
4 review the designated material, to reconsider the circumstances, and if no change in  
5 designation is offered, to explain the basis for the chosen designation. A  
6 challenging party may proceed to the next stage of the challenge process only if it  
7 has engaged in this meet and confer process first; and

8 (b) A party that elects to press a challenge to a confidentiality designation  
9 after considering the justification offered by the designating party may file and  
10 serve a motion under Civil Local Rule 7 that identifies the challenged material and  
11 sets forth in detail the basis for the challenge. Each such motion must be  
12 accompanied by a competent declaration that affirms that the movant has complied  
13 with the meet and confer requirements imposed in the preceding paragraph and that  
14 sets forth with specificity the justification for the confidentiality designation that  
15 was given by the designating party in the meet and confer dialogue. The burden of  
16 persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the designating party.  
17 Until the Court rules on the challenge, all parties shall continue to afford the  
18 material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the  
19 producing party's designation.  
20

21 13. All discovery material exchanged under this Protective Order between  
22 the parties in this litigation shall be used solely for this litigation, unless otherwise  
23 agreed to beforehand in writing by the producing Party or if the Court so orders.  
24 Each Party reserves its right to seek or oppose an order from the Court permitting  
25 the use in other litigation of confidential discovery material.

26 14. Documents produced in the Delaware actions need not be re-produced,  
27 and the parties agree to treat documents produced in the Delaware actions as if they  
28

1 were documents produced in this litigation. Upon entry of this Protective Order,  
2 the attorneys of record in this litigation may have access to all documents and  
3 things produced in the Delaware actions, as well as to any trial transcripts, trial  
4 exhibits, deposition transcripts, deposition exhibits, expert reports and briefs filed  
5 or served in the Delaware actions or in any appeal from either action. The Parties  
6 represent that they have the authority of the parties to the protective order entered in  
7 *Edwards Lifesciences AG v. CoreValve, Inc.* (D. Del. 08-cv-00091) to use the  
8 documents described in this paragraph for the present litigation despite the  
9 restrictions of paragraph 18 of the Delaware protective order.

10  
11 15. If confidential information in the possession, custody or control of a  
12 receiving party is sought by subpoena, request for production, interrogatory, or any  
13 other form of discovery request or compulsory process of any court, administrative  
14 body or legislative body, or any other person or tribunal purporting to have  
15 opportunity to seek such information by compulsory process or discovery request,  
16 including private parties, the receiving party shall: (i) within one (1) calendar week  
17 after receipt thereof, give written notice by hand or facsimile or electronic mail of  
18 such process or discovery request together with a copy thereof, to counsel for the  
19 producing party; (ii) cooperate to the extent necessary to permit the producing party  
20 to seek to quash such process or discovery request; and (iii) not produce or disclose  
21 such confidential information until the producing party consents in writing to the  
22 production, or the receiving party is ordered by a court of competent jurisdiction to  
23 produce or disclose the confidential information.

24 16. Within sixty (60) days after the conclusion of this litigation, including  
25 any appeals, all confidential information designated and produced hereunder, and  
26 all copies thereof, shall be returned to the producing party, or, at the option of the  
27 producing party, be destroyed. Opposing counsel shall certify in writing that such  
28 material has been destroyed. Notwithstanding the foregoing, outside counsel of

1 record may retain all of their files from this litigation, including, but not limited to,  
2 pleadings, correspondence, discovery requests and responses, whether or not such  
3 files refer to or include any confidential information designated in this litigation.

4  
5 17. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order no party waives any  
6 right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information  
7 or item on any ground not addressed in this Protective Order. Similarly, no party  
8 waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material  
9 covered by this Protective Order.

10 18. Confidential information that the producing party considers to be  
11 privileged, or subject to the work product immunity doctrine or some other  
12 applicable immunity or privilege under the Federal Rules, that is dated after the  
13 filing of this litigation, or that was created during and for the purpose of the  
14 Delaware actions and involved communication with counsel of record in the  
15 Delaware actions at the time of document creation, is not required to be listed on  
16 any privilege log provided by the producing party to the requesting party. The  
17 Parties agree, however, that should a Party elect not to rely on the advice of counsel  
18 and produce documents in furtherance of that reliance (tentatively June 8, 2012),  
19 the Party shall at the time of such election provide a privilege log of all withheld  
20 documents relating to any opinion of counsel. Counsel for a party producing a  
21 document may redact material deemed exempt from discovery because of the  
22 attorney-client privilege or work-product immunity afforded by Rule 26(b), Fed. R.  
23 Civ. P., or because the redacted material is not reasonably calculated to lead to the  
24 discovery of admissible evidence, and may produce documents in a redacted form.  
25 Any document from which material is redacted must identify in the redacted area  
26 that a redaction was made. The reason for any such redaction must be stated in the  
27 document itself or on a log provided to the receiving party. In the event of any  
28

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

dispute as to the propriety of the redaction, the party objecting to the redaction may submit the issue to the Court for review and determination.

19. The restrictions set forth in this Protective Order shall not apply to information or material that:

(a) was, is, or becomes public knowledge other than by violation of this Protective Order;

(b) is acquired by the non-designating party from a third party having the right to disclose such information or material; or

(c) was lawfully possessed by the non-designating party prior to the entry by the Court of the Protective Order.

20. Nothing contained in this Protective Order shall preclude a party producing confidential information from using its own confidential information in any manner it sees fit without prior consent from any other party or from the Court.

21. Each individual who receives any confidential information so designated under this Protective Order agrees to submit himself/herself to the jurisdiction of this Court for the purpose of any proceedings relating to compliance with the Protective Order.

22. This Protective Order shall remain in full force and effect after the termination of this litigation, until a designating party agrees in writing or until canceled or otherwise modified by this Court.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

23. Any Party hereto may at any time make a motion requesting that the Court modify this Protective Order to provide additional or different protection where it is deemed appropriate.

**SO ORDERED.**



Dated: February 16, 2012

\_\_\_\_\_  
MARC L. GOLDMAN, U.S. Magistrate Judge



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

# EXHIBIT A

1 David Martinez, Bar No. 193183  
DMartinez@rkmc.com  
2 **ROBINS, KAPLAN, MILLER & CIRESI L.L.P.**  
2049 Century Park East, Suite 3400  
3 Los Angeles, CA 90067-3208  
Telephone: (310) 552-0130  
4 Facsimile: (310) 229-5800

5 Martin R. Lueck (*pro hac vice*)  
MRLueck@rkmc.com  
6 Jan M. Conlin (*pro hac vice*)  
JMConlin@rkmc.com  
7 Stacie E. Oberts (*pro hac vice*)  
SEOberts@rkmc.com  
8 **ROBINS, KAPLAN, MILLER & CIRESI L.L.P.**  
2800 LaSalle Plaza  
9 800 LaSalle Avenue  
Minneapolis, MN 55402-2015  
10 Telephone: (612) 349-8500  
Facsimile: (612) 339-4181

11 Attorneys for Plaintiffs and Counterclaim  
12 Defendants MEDTRONIC COREVALVE LLC,  
MEDTRONIC CV LUXEMBOURG S.A.R.L., and  
13 MEDTRONIC VASCULAR GALWAY LTD.

14 William S. O'Hare, Bar No. 082562  
wohare@swlaw.com  
15 Deborah S. Mallgrave, Bar No. 198603  
dmallgrave@swlaw.com  
16 **SNELL & WILMER L.L.P.**  
600 Anton Blvd., Suite 1400  
17 Costa Mesa, CA 92626-7689  
Telephone: (714) 427-7000  
18 Facsimile: (714) 427-7799

19 John E. Nathan (*pro hac vice*)  
jnathan@paulweiss.com  
20 Catherine Nyarady (*pro hac vice*)  
cnyarady@paulweiss.com  
21 Brian P. Egan (*pro hac vice*)  
began@paulweiss.com  
22 Christopher Terranova (*pro hac vice*)  
cterranova@paulweiss.com  
23 **PAUL, WEISS, RIFKIND, WHARTON &  
GARRISON LLP**  
1285 Avenue of the Americas  
24 New York, NY 10019-6064  
Telephone: (212) 373-3000  
25 Facsimile: (212) 757-3990

26 Attorneys for Defendants and Counterclaim-  
27 Plaintiffs EDWARDS LIFESCIENCES  
CORPORATION, EDWARDS LIFESCIENCES  
28 LLC and EDWARDS LIFESCIENCES (U.S.) INC.

1 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
2 FOR THE CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

3 MEDTRONIC COREVALVE LLC,  
4 et al.,

5 Plaintiffs,

6 v.

7 EDWARDS LIFESCIENCES  
8 CORPORATION, et al.,

9 Defendants.

Case No. SACV11 00961 JVS (MLGx)

**PROTECTIVE ORDER  
UNDERTAKING**

10 **PROTECTIVE ORDER UNDERTAKING**

11 I, \_\_\_\_\_, having been retained by \_\_\_\_\_  
12 in connection with the above-captioned lawsuit (or I, \_\_\_\_\_, in-house  
13 counsel for \_\_\_\_\_) hereby acknowledge that I am about to receive  
14 confidential information as defined in the Protective Order agreed to by the parties  
and so ordered by the Court in this case.

15 I certify my understanding that the confidential information is being provided  
16 to me pursuant to the terms and restrictions of the Protective Order, and that I have  
17 been given a copy of and have read and understood my obligations under the Order.  
18 I hereby agree to be bound by the terms of the Protective Order. I clearly  
19 understand that confidential information and my copies of notes relating thereto  
may only be disclosed to or discussed with persons allowed under the Protective  
Order to receive such information.

20 I will return upon request all materials containing confidential information  
21 and all copies thereof.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

I hereby submit to the jurisdiction of this Court for the purposes of enforcement of the Protective Order and waive any and all objections to jurisdiction and venue.

I make all statements above under penalty of perjury.

\_\_\_\_\_

Printed name: \_\_\_\_\_

Company name/address/phone:

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_