1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	 15554 Eric Landau (State Bar No. 138849) elandau@jonesday.com Travis Biffar (State Bar No. 217593) tbiffar@jonesday.com Kevin H. Logan (State Bar No. 242206) klogan@jonesday.com JONES DAY 3161 Michelson Drive, Suite 800 Irvine, California 92612 Telephone: (949) 851-3939 Facsimile: (949) 553-7539 Attorneys for defendants Emulex Corpora Bruce C. Edwards, Jeffrey W. Benck, Gro S. Clark, Gary J. Daichendt, Paul F. Folin Beatriz V. Infante, John A. Kelley, Rahul Merchant, Nersi Nazari and Dean A. Yoo (Additional counsel listed on signature page) 	egory no, l N. ost	
10			
12	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT		
13	CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA		
14			
15	GARY VARJABEDIAN, On Behalf of Himself and All Others Similarly	Case No. 8:15-cv-554-CJC-JCG	
16	Situated,	CLASS ACTION	
17	Plaintiff,	STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER RE	
18	V.	CONFIDENTIALITY	
19 20	EMULEX CORPORATION, BRUCE C. EDWARDS, JEFFREY W. BENCK, GREGORY S. CLARK,	Date Action Filed: April 8, 2015	
21	GARY J. DAICHENDT, PAUL F. FOLINO, BEATRIZ V. INFANTE,		
22	JOHN A. KELLEY, RAHUL N. MERCHANT, NERSI NAZARI, DEAN A. YOOST, AVAGO		
23	TECHNOLOGIES WIRELESS		
24	(U.S.A.) MANUFACTURING, INC., and EMERALD MERGER SUB, INC.,		
25	Defendants.		
26			
27			
28			
		STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER Case No. 8:15-cv-554-CJC-JCG Dockets.Justia.com	

[PROPOSED] PROTECTIVE ORDER

In order to protect the confidentiality of confidential information obtained by the parties in connection with the above-captioned matter (the "Action"), the parties, by and through their undersigned counsel, hereby request that the Court enter this agreed-upon protective order (the "Protective Order") to govern the production of materials in this Action:

7 **I. P**

1

I. <u>PREAMBLE</u>

8 1. In the course of this Action, the parties may propound discovery that
9 seeks sensitive, proprietary, trade secret or otherwise confidential information (the
10 "Confidential Information").

A party's assent to this Protective Order shall not be deemed an
 admission that any discovery propounded is appropriate or that any other party's
 information is truly sensitive, proprietary, trade secret or otherwise confidential, but
 merely that such other party regards the information so designated as such.

The parties hereto agree that Confidential Information obtained
 through the pretrial phase of this Action should be protected from unwarranted use
 or disclosure to third parties and shall be used solely for the purposes of the litigation
 of this Action.

4. This Protective Order shall govern the handling of material designated
 "Confidential" or "Highly Confidential Information—Attorneys' Eyes Only" prior
 to trial, whether during discovery, settlement negotiations or otherwise.

22 23

II. <u>"CONFIDENTIAL" AND "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL</u> <u>INFORMATION— ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" DESIGNATIONS</u>

5. Any party or non-party may in good faith designate as "Confidential"
any document, discovery response, or portion thereof which contains or discloses
any of the following:

(a) Nonpublic inside information, private individual financial
 information, confidential and/or commercially sensitive information, personnel files

and other sensitive or proprietary information, including but not limited to, non-1 public materials containing information related to: financial or business plans or 2 projections; acquisition offers or expressions of interest; proposed strategic 3 transactions or other business combinations, trade secrets as defined under California 4 Civil Code § 3426.1(d) and proprietary technical information; business and 5 marketing plans and strategies; studies or analyses by internal or outside experts; 6 7 financial or tax data; customer lists and information; competitive analyses; product development and planning; financial results or data; personal financial information; 8 or commercially sensitive information; and 9

10 (b) Information that the party or non-party is under a duty to
11 preserve as confidential under an agreement with or other obligation to another
12 person.

Any party or non-party may in good faith designate as "Highly 6. 13 Confidential Information—Attorneys' Eyes Only" any nonpublic document or 14 15 portion thereof which contains or discloses any sensitive Confidential Information that any party to the litigation or any producing party contends contains trade secrets 16 as defined under California Civil Code § 3426.1(d), or business strategies or other 17 sensitive, proprietary, private or financial information, which, if disclosed to third 18 parties, would or could cause damage to a party's competitive position in the 19 market(s) in which the party operates. 20

7. Any party or non-party may in good faith designate any nonpublic
document or portion thereof as Confidential Information ("Designating Party")
pursuant to this Protective Order by either of the following methods:

(a) For information in documentary form, by affixing the legend
"Confidential" or "Highly Confidential Information—Attorneys' Eyes Only" (unless
specifically referred to otherwise, these designations are respectively referred to
herein as "Confidential" or "Highly Confidential Information—Attorneys' Eyes

Only") on the first page and each page on which Confidential Information subject to
 the provisions of this Protective Order appears in any multi-page document; or

The inadvertent production of Confidential Information in (b) 3 4 documents, regardless of whether they have been expressly designated as such, shall not waive any protection for such documents or information under this Protective 5 Order. If a producing party or non-party fails to stamp certain documents upon their 6 production, any party may designate such documents as Confidential Information by 7 giving notice in writing to all parties, not later than ten (10) days after production of 8 the material that the material is to be designated as Confidential Information. All 9 parties shall then stamp or otherwise affix the "Confidential" or "Highly 10 Confidential Information— Attorneys' Eyes Only" legend to the designated material 11 as described above. If a party wants to designate as Confidential Information 12 material which has already been produced prior to the date of this Protective Order, 13 it shall do so by giving notice to all parties that the material is to be so designated by 14 stamping or otherwise affixing the "Confidential" or "Highly Confidential 15 Information— Attorneys' Eyes Only" legend. 16

8. In the case of Confidential Information revealed during a deposition, if 17 counsel for any party or non-party designates testimony or any portion thereof, 18 including exhibits, as "Confidential" or "Highly Confidential Information— 19 Attorneys' Eyes Only" on the record, or otherwise, before the stenographer 20 transcribing such deposition has disseminated the transcript of the deposition, the 21 stenographer shall affix the legend "Confidential" or "Highly Confidential 22 Information— Attorneys' Eyes Only" to the cover page and all appropriate pages of 23 the transcript, and to each copy thereof. After the conclusion of the deposition, any 24 party may designate a deposition transcript, or a portion thereof, including exhibits, 25 as "Confidential" or "Highly Confidential Information— Attorneys' Eyes Only" by 26 27 informing counsel for all parties to this Action in writing within ten (10) days after

receipt of the transcript, as to the specific pages deemed confidential, and thereafter
 such pages shall constitute Confidential Information pursuant to this Protective
 Order. Upon receipt of such notice, any party in possession of copies of such
 designated transcript shall affix the legend "Confidential" or "Highly Confidential
 Information— Attorneys' Eyes Only" to the cover page and all appropriate pages of
 the transcript, and to each copy thereof.

7

III. <u>RESTRICTIONS ON USE OF CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION</u>

9. Unless otherwise ordered by the Court, or otherwise agreed by the
parties hereto, all documents, information and other material designated
"Confidential" or "Highly Confidential Information—Attorneys' Eyes Only" shall
be treated as Confidential Information under this Protective Order.

12 10. All documents, material or information produced in this case that are
13 designated "Confidential" or "Highly Confidential Information—Attorneys' Eyes
14 Only" may be used only for purposes of this Action, including, without limitation,
15 discovery, motions, briefs, preparation for trial in this Action and on appeal, if any,
16 and for no other purpose ("the Permitted Purpose").

17 11. Except as set forth herein, documents marked "Confidential," all
18 copies thereof, and any summaries, charts or notes made therefrom, and any
19 Confidential Information contained therein or derived therefrom, shall be disclosed
20 only to the Court (pursuant to the procedures set forth in paragraph 14 below) and/or
21 to:

(a) parties to the Action and the employees, officers, agents and
directors of such parties who may review the information in connection with this
Action only to the extent necessary for the Permitted Purpose;

(b) in-house attorneys of each party (including support staff) who
are responsible for or working directly in the prosecution or defense of this case only
to the extent necessary for the Permitted Purpose;

28

(c) outside attorneys for the parties hereto and their agents,
 including private investigators, employees, paralegals, or other secretarial and
 clerical employees or agents only to the extent necessary for the Permitted Purpose;

4 (d) experts and consultants retained by one or more of the parties to
5 this Action or their counsel to assist in discovery and/or in preparation of this Action
6 for trial only to the extent necessary for the Permitted Purpose;

7 (e) actual and anticipated deponents and their counsel only to the
8 extent necessary for the Permitted Purpose;

9 (f) stenographic reporters who are involved in depositions, the trial
10 or any hearings or proceedings before the Court in this Action; and

11

(g) any mediator in any mediation of this Action.

12 Documents containing "Confidential" information may be disclosed to persons listed in (d) and (e) of this paragraph only after such person has been shown 13 a copy of this Stipulation and Protective Order, and has been advised of the terms 14 15 and operation of this Protective Order, and agrees to be bound by the terms of this Protective Order by signing a Written Assurance attached hereto as Exhibit A; 16 provided, however, that any party who designated the document "Confidential" may 17 disclose such documents to any persons, with or without any conditions to such 18 disclosure as it deems appropriate. 19

12. Except as set forth herein, documents marked "Highly Confidential
Information—Attorneys' Eyes Only," all copies thereof, and any summaries, charts
or notes made therefrom, and any facts or information contained therein or derived
therefrom, shall be disclosed only to the Court (pursuant to the procedures set forth
in paragraph 14 below) and/or to:

(a) outside attorneys for the parties hereto and their agents,
including private investigators, employees, paralegals, or other secretarial and
clerical employees or agents only to the extent necessary for the Permitted Purpose;

5

(b) experts and consultants retained by one or more of the parties to 1 2 this Action or their counsel to assist in discovery and/or in preparation of this Action for trial only to the extent necessary for the Permitted Purpose, and provided that (i) 3 such experts and consultants have been certified by the party hiring them that they 4 do not work for and are not engaged by a competitor of Emulex Corporation, Avago 5 Technologies Wireless (U.S.A.) Manufacturing, Inc., or any of their affiliates, and 6 7 will not work for, or be engaged by, such a competitor for a period of two (2) years following the receipt of information designated as "Highly Confidential 8 Information—Attorneys' Eyes Only"; or (ii) the party who has designated the 9 information as "Highly Confidential Information—Attorneys' Eyes Only" agrees to 10 share the information with the experts and consultants; or (iii) the party who wishes 11 to have its experts and consultants review information that has been designated as 12 "Highly Confidential Information—Attorneys' Eyes Only" seeks, and obtains, Court 13 approval under the court review procedures set forth in this Protective Order. 14 15 (c) actual and anticipated deponents that drafted, created, or received or are employed by the company creating or producing said Confidential 16 Information and their counsel only to the extent necessary for the Permitted Purpose; 17 (d) stenographic reporters who are involved in depositions, the trial 18 or any hearings or proceedings before the Court in this Action; and 19 any mediator in any mediation of this Action. (e) 20 Documents containing "Highly Confidential Information—Attorneys' Eyes 21 22 Only" information may be disclosed to persons listed in (b) or (c) of this paragraph only after such person has been shown a copy of this Stipulation and Protective 23 Order, and has been advised of the terms and operation of this Protective Order, and 24 agrees to be bound by the terms of this Protective Order by signing a Written 25 Assurance attached hereto as Exhibit A; provided, however, that any party who 26 designated the document "Highly Confidential Information-Attorneys' Eyes Only" 27 28

may disclose such documents to any persons, with or without any conditions to such
disclosure as it deems appropriate. Notwithstanding the foregoing provisions,
without disclosing the specific contents of any document designated "Highly
Confidential," unless included in a pleading or motion, counsel may discuss with
their client information that they deem necessary to render legal advice.

6

IV. <u>OBJECTIONS TO CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION</u>

13. In the event that any party objects to the designation of any document, 7 testimony, information or material or portion thereof as "Confidential" and/or 8 "Highly Confidential Information— Attorneys' Eyes Only," the objecting party may 9 seek modification of the designation in accordance with the following procedure and 10 Local Rules 37-1 and 37-2. The party's failure to object shall not constitute an 11 12 admission of any kind or for any purpose. The party designating information as "Confidential" and/or "Highly Confidential Information- Attorneys' Eyes Only" 13 has the burden of establishing that the information is confidential. 14

(a) The objecting party may notify the Designating Party, in
writing, at any time of its contention that the designation as "Confidential" or
"Highly Confidential Information— Attorneys' Eyes Only" does not concur with the
standards set forth in this Protective Order. The parties shall attempt to resolve such
disputes informally and in good faith pursuant to Local Rule 37-1.

(b) In the event that such disputes are not resolved informally 20 counsel shall formulate a written stipulation, which shall be filed and served with the 21 22 notice of motion. The Joint Stipulation shall be drafted in accordance with Local Rule 37-2.1, and may be heard on the Court's regular Motion Day. Failure to file a 23 Joint Stipulation or a declaration explaining this failure, as set forth in Local Rule 24 37-2.4, will result in the Court refusing to consider the discovery motion. In the 25 event that any party files a motion challenging a confidentiality designation, the 26 27 document shall be submitted in its entirety to the Court for in camera inspection. To

7

maintain the designation as "Confidential" or "Highly Confidential Information—
Attorneys' Eyes Only" and to prevail on a motion to the Court, the Designating
Party must show by a preponderance of the evidence that there is good cause for the
Confidential Information designation. The discovering party shall be entitled to
submit a memorandum in opposition to the designating party's motion. Pursuant to
this paragraph the Court shall make an independent determination as to whether or
not any given document is confidential based upon facts then existing.

8 (c) Pending resolution of any motion filed pursuant to this
9 paragraph, all documents or discovery material designated as Confidential
10 Information shall be treated as such until the Court rules otherwise.

V. <u>PROCEDURE FOR USING CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION IN</u> <u>COURT DOCUMENTS</u>

14. In accordance with Local Rule 79-5.1, if any papers to be filed with 13 the Court contain information and/or documents that have been designated as 14 "Confidential" or "Highly Confidential Information-Attorneys' Eyes Only," the 15 proposed filing shall be accompanied by an application to file the papers or the 16 portion thereof containing the designated information or documents (if such portion 17 is segregable) under seal; and the application shall be directed to the judge to whom 18 the papers are directed. For pleadings or motions, the parties shall publicly file a 19 redacted version of the pleading or motion and supporting papers. 20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

11

12

VI. SUBPOENAS SEEKING CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION

15. If at any time any document or information protected by this Protective Order is subpoenaed by any court, administrative or legislative body, or is requested by any other person or entity purporting to have authority to require the production of such information, the party to whom the subpoena or other request is directed shall give prompt written notice thereof to the Designating Party. Notice under this provision shall include whether the party to whom the subpoena or other request is directed has any documents responsive to the subpoena or request and the date on

PROPOSED] STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER Case No. 8:15-cv-554-CJC-JCG

which such production will occur. After receipt of the notice specified under this
 paragraph, the Designating Party shall have the sole responsibility for obtaining any
 Order it believes necessary to prevent disclosure of documents designated
 confidential. Nothing in this Order shall be construed as authorizing a party to
 disobey a lawful subpoena issued in another action.

6

VII. <u>RETURN OF MATERIAL</u>

The termination of proceedings in this Action shall not relieve the 7 16. parties from the obligation of maintaining the confidentiality of all Confidential 8 Information produced and designated pursuant to this Protective Order, unless the 9 Court Orders or permits otherwise. Upon the final disposition of this Action, 10 including the completion or running of time for any available appeals, the attorneys 11 12 for the parties shall have thirty (30) days to destroy or return to the Designating Party any documents (and all copies thereof) which have been designated as 13 Confidential Information. Parties are not required to return or destroy documents 14 15 which have been designated as Confidential Information that are (i) stored on backup storage media in accordance with regular data backup procedures for disaster 16 recovery purposes; (ii) located in an email archive system or archived electronic files 17 of departed employees of the receiving party; or subject to legal hold obligations or 18 other legal or regulatory restrictions. The Court will retain jurisdiction to modify 19 and/or enforce the terms of this Protective Order after the disposition of this Action. 20

21

VIII. SCOPE OF THIS PROTECTIVE ORDER

17. The parties agree that they will not use any material provided in thisAction for any purpose other than this Action.

18. Notwithstanding anything to the contrary contained herein, all
objections as to the admissibility of evidence of the documents, material or
information subject to this Protective Order are reserved and are not waived by any
terms of this Protective Order.

28

1 19. Any attorney for any party may furnish Confidential Information to
 2 any attorney for a party without waiving the protected status of such Confidential
 3 Information.

20. Nothing in this Protective Order shall be deemed to limit, prejudice, or 4 waive any right of any party or person: (a) to resist or compel discovery with respect 5 to, or to seek to obtain additional or different protection for, material claimed to be 6 7 protected work product or privileged under California or federal law, material as to which the producing party claims a legal obligation not to disclose, or material not 8 required to be provided pursuant to California or federal law; (b) to seek to modify 9 or obtain relief from any aspect of this Protective Order; (c) to object to the use, 10 relevance or admissibility at trial or otherwise of any material, whether or not 11 12 designated in whole or in part as Confidential Information governed by this Protective Order; or (d) otherwise to require that discovery be conducted according 13 to governing laws and rules. 14

15 21. Designation of material as "Confidential" and/or "Highly Confidential
16 Information—Attorneys' Eyes Only" on the face of such material shall have no
17 effect on the authenticity or admissibility of such material at trial.

18 22. This Protective Order shall not preclude any person from waiving the 19 applicability of this Protective Order with respect to any Confidential Information 20 provided by that person, or using any Confidential Information provided by that 21 person, or using any Confidential Information owned by that person in any manner 22 that person deems appropriate.

23 23. This Protective Order shall not affect any contractual, statutory or
24 other legal obligation or the rights of any party or person with respect to
25 Confidential Information designated by that party.

26 24. The restrictions set out in the Protective Order shall not apply to any
27 material which: (a) at the time it is provided is available to the public; or (b) after it

is provided, becomes available to the public through no act, or failure to act, of the
 discovering party.

3

IX. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION

25. To the extent that any documents protected by the attorney-client 4 privilege, work product privilege, or any other privilege, are inadvertently produced, 5 each party agrees to return such inadvertently produced documents, and not to retain 6 7 copies or other information derived from the inadvertently produced documents, within three (3) days of receiving a written request for such return from the party 8 that inadvertently produced the privileged document. If the receiving party disputes 9 the privileged status of a document, the receiving party shall nonetheless destroy or 10 return the document in accordance with this paragraph. Compliance with this 11 12 paragraph, however, shall not constitute an admission on the part of the receiving party that any document is in fact privileged, and the receiving party shall retain the 13 right to challenge the privileged status of any document. 14

15

IX. EXPERT DISCOVERY

Any draft reports, notes, working papers, or other preparatory materials, in 16 whatever form, prepared by any retained testifying expert witness shall not be 17 subject to discovery. Any communications between counsel and any retained 18 testifying expert witness also shall not be subject to discovery, unless the 19 communications: (i) identify facts or data that counsel provided and that the expert 20 considered in forming the opinions to be expressed; and/or (ii) identify assumptions 21 22 that counsel provided and that the expert relied upon in forming the opinions to be 23 expressed.

24

XI. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

25 26. Rule 26(c) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure permits a court, for
26 good cause, to issue a protective order "requiring that a trade secret or other
27 confidential research, development, or commercial information not be revealed or be

11

revealed only in a specified way." Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(c)(1)(G). Good cause exists to 1 2 issue a protective order where a party shows (a) that the information constitutes a trade secret or other confidential information contemplated by Rule 26(c), and (b) 3 that disclosing the information would be harmful to the party's interest in the 4 property. Nutratech, Inc. v. Syntech (SSPF) Int'l, Inc., 242 F.R.D. 552, 554-55 5 (C.D. Cal. 2007). The Parties agree that good cause exists to protect their 6 7 "CONFIDENTIAL" and "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" information in the manner set forth above. Absent the protections afforded 8 under this Protective Order, the Parties would suffer serious competitive injury from 9 the disclosure of their sensitive and proprietary information. 10 XII. SUBMISSION TO THE COURT 11 27. 12 The parties agree to submit this Protective Order to the Court for

13 adoption as an Order of the Court.

14 28. The parties reserve the right to seek, upon good cause, modification of
15 this Protective Order by the Court. The Court may modify the terms of this
16 Protective Order upon a showing of good cause or for public policy reasons. No
17 modification by the parties shall have the force or effect of a Court order unless the
18 Court approves the modification.

19

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

20 **IT IS SO STIPULATED.**

1	Dated: September 11, 2015	JONES DAY
2		<u>By: /s/<i>Eric Landau</i></u> Eric Landau ¹
3		Counsel for defendants Emulex
4		Corporation, Bruce C. Edwards, Jeffrey W. Benck, Gregory S. Clark, Gary J. Daichendt, Paul F. Folino, Beatriz V.
5 6		Infante, John A. Kelley, Rahul N. Merchant, Nersi Nazari and Dean A.
7		Yoost
8		
9	Dated: September 11, 2015	LATHAM & WATKINS LLP
10		
11		<u>By: /s/Patrick Gibbs</u> Patrick Gibbs Hilary H. Mattis
12 13		140 Scott Drive Menlo Park, California 94025
13		Telephone: (650) 463-4696 Email: patrick.gibbs@lw.com Attorneys for defendants Avago
15		Technologies Wireless (U.S.A.)
16		Manufacturing, Inc. and Emerald Merger Sub, Inc.
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24 25		
25 26		
26 27	¹ Pursuant to Central District of that all of the signatories listed on thi	f California Local Rule 5-4.3.4(a)(2)(i), I attest s signature page, and on whose behalf this g's content.
28	filing is submitted, concur in the filin	g's content.
		PROPOSED] STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER Case No. 8:15-cv-554-CJC-JCG
	•	

1	Dated: September, 2015	FARUQI & FARUQI, LLP
2		By: /s/David E. Bower David E. Bower
3		David E. Bower 10866 Wilshire Boulevard Suite 1470
4		Los Angeles, California 90067
5		Los Angeles, California 90067 Telephone: (424) 256-2884 Facsimile: (424) 256-2885 E-mail: dbower@faruqilaw.com
6		
7		Juan E. Monteverde jmonteverde@faruqilaw.com
8		jmonteverde@faruqilaw.com 369 Lexington Avenue Tenth Floor
9		New York, New York 10017 Telephone: (212) 983-9330 Facsimile: (212) 983-9331
10		
11		Counsel for Plaintiff
12		
13	IT IS SO ORDERED.	
14		afint-
15	Dated: September 15, 2015	HON. JAY C. GANDHI
16		U.S. MAGISTRATE JUDGE
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
		PROPOSED] STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER 14 Case No. 8:15-cv-554-CJC-JCG

1	EXHIBIT A		
2	WRITTEN ASSURANCE PURSUANT TO THE STIPULATED		
3	PROTECTIVE ORDER		
4	I,, have read the Protective Order in the		
5	above-captioned Action. I understand and agree to comply with the terms of the		
6	Protective Order in all respects, and hereby submit and waive any objection to the		
7	jurisdiction of the Central District of California for purposes of resolving any		
8	dispute concerning or related to my compliance with the Stipulation and Order.		
9	I understand that any violation of the terms of this Protective Order may be		
10	punishable by money damages, interim or final injunctive or other equitable relief,		
11	an imposition of sanctions, contempt of court, or other additional relief as deemed		
12	appropriate by the Court.		
13			
14	Dated: Signature:		
15	Please print or type the following:		
16	Name:		
17	Title and Affiliation:		
18	Address:		
19			
20	Telephone:		
21			
22			
23	NAI-1500530770v2		
24			
25			
26			
27			
28			
	STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER Case No. 8:15-cv-554-CJC-JCG		