8:16-cv-00059

1 a 2 h 3 C 4 v 5 d 6 f 7 d 8 t 1 9 l i

and Life Care Centers of America, Inc. ("Defendants") (collectively, "the Parties") hereby stipulate and petition the Court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The Parties agree that this Order does not apply to documents that were filed with the Court before the date of this Order, nor does it require redaction of documents previously filed with this Court, or a related application for leave to refile such documents under seal. The Parties further acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles.

B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

This action is likely to involve information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecution of this action is warranted. Such confidential information consists of confidential business or financial information, employee personnel information subject to the third-party right to privacy, confidential social security identification information, personal credit or other background information of putative class members, confidential propriety information, information otherwise generally unavailable to the public, or which may be privileged or otherwise protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes, court rules, case decisions, or common law.

Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery materials, to adequately protect information the Parties are entitled to keep confidential, to ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the end of the litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the Parties that information will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so designated without a good

faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential, non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public record of this case.

C. ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF PROCEDURE FOR FILING UNDER SEAL

The Parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information under seal; Local Civil Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a Party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

There is a strong presumption that the public has a right of access to judicial proceedings and records in civil cases. In connection with non-dispositive motions, good cause must be shown to support a filing under seal. *See Kamakana v. City and County of Honolulu*, 447 F.3d 1172, 1176 (9th Cir. 2006), *Phillips v. Gen. Motors Corp.*, 307 F.3d 1206, 1210-11 (9th Cir. 2002), *Makar-Welbon v. Sony Electrics, Inc.*, 187 F.R.D. 576, 577 (E.D. Wis. 1999) (even stipulated protective orders require good cause showing), and a specific showing of good cause or compelling reasons with proper evidentiary support and legal justification, must be made with respect to Protected Material that a Party seeks to file under seal. The Parties' mere designation of Disclosure or Discovery Material as "CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" does not—without the submission of competent evidence by declaration, establishing that the material sought to be filed under seal qualifies as confidential, privileged, or otherwise protectable—constitute good cause.

Further, if a Party requests sealing related to a dispositive motion or trial, then compelling reasons, not only good cause, for the sealing must be shown, and the relief sought shall be narrowly tailored to serve the specific interest to be protected. *See Pintos v. Pacific Creditors Ass'n*, 605 F.3d 665, 677-79 (9th Cir. 2010). For each item or type of information, document, or thing sought to be filed or introduced

2.8

8:16-cv-00059

Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter

5

7

6

23

24

25

17

18

5.1

26

27

28

extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

4. **DURATION**

Once a case proceeds to trial, information that was designated as CONFIDENTIAL or "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" or maintained pursuant to this protective order is used or introduced as an exhibit at trial becomes public and will be presumptively available to all members of the public, including the press, unless compelling reasons supported by specific factual findings to proceed otherwise are made to the trial judge in advance of the trial. See Kamakana, 447 F.3d at 1180-81 (distinguishing "good cause" showing for sealing documents produced in discovery from "compelling reasons" standard when meritsrelated documents are part of court record). Accordingly, the terms of this protective order do not extend beyond the commencement of the trial.

DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

Protection. Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items or oral or written communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents, items or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for

Mass, indiscriminate or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose

unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

5.2 **Manner and Timing of Designations**. Except as otherwise provided in this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

(a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" (hereinafter "CONFIDENTIAL legend") or "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" (hereinafter "AEO legend"), to each page that contains protected material. If only a portion of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the "CONFIDENTIAL legend" or "AEO legend" to each page that contains

Protected Material. If only a portion of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

- (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party identifies the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the deposition all protected testimony.
- (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY-CONFIDENTIAL ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY." If only a portion or portions of the information warrants protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).
- 5.3 **Inadvertent Failures to Designate**. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party's right to secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

6. <u>CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS</u>

- 6.1 **Timing of Challenges**. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court's Scheduling Order.
- 6.2 **Meet and Confer**. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution process under Local Rule 37-1 *et seq*.
- 6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating

the court and its personnel;

28

(d)

Stipulated Protective Order

8:16-cv-00059

8:16-cv-00059

subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's

confidential	information,	then the	Party	shall.
Communities	minormanon,	men me	1 arty	sman.

- (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;
- (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the information requested; and
- (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party, if requested.
- (c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

10. <u>UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL</u>

If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED MATERIAL

When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted to the court.

12. **MISCELLANEOUS**

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

- 12.1 **Right to Further Relief**. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.
- 12.2 **Right to Assert Other Objections**. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order, no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.
- 12.3 **Filing Protected Material**. A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected Material must comply with Local Civil Rule 79-5. Protected Material may only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

13. FINAL DISPOSITION

After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60

days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return
all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in
this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations,
summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected
Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving
Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same
person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies
(by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or
destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies,
abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any
of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to
retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing
transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert
reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such
materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or
constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in
Section 4 (DURATION).
14. <u>VIOLATION</u>
Any violation of this Order may be punished by appropriate measures

including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary sanctions.

FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.

DATED: <u>April 27, 2017</u>

Koren E.	Scott
KAREN E. SCOTT	
United States Magistrate	Judge

8:16-cv-00059

EXHIBIT A

ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

1

	ll
3	I, [print or type full name], of [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury
4	[print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that
5	was issued by the United States District Court for the Central District of California
	on [date] in the case of Maria Chona Rodriguez v. El Toro Medical
6	Investors Limited Partnership, and Life Care Centers of America, Inc. I agree to
7	comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and
8	I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to
9	sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated
	Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the
10	provisions of this Order. I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United
11	States District Court for the Central District of California for enforcing the terms of
12	this Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after
13	termination of this action. I hereby appoint [print or type full name] of [print or type
	or type full name] of [print or type full address and telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in
14	connection with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this
15	Stipulated Protective Order.
16	
17	Date:
18	City and State where sworn and signed:
19	Printed name:
	Frinted name.
20	Signature:
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
	8:16-cv-00059 Stipulated Protective Order