

1 Vince M. Verde, CA Bar No. 202472
 vince.verde@ogletreedeakins.com
 2 Hanna B. Raanan, CA Bar No. 261014
 hanna.raanan@ogletreedeakins.com
 3 OGLETREE, DEAKINS, NASH, SMOAK & STEWART, P.C.
 Park Tower, Suite 1500
 4 695 Town Center Drive
 Costa Mesa, CA 92626
 5 Telephone: 714.800.7900
 Facsimile: 714.754.1298

6 Attorneys for Defendant
 7 Liberty Mutual Insurance Company

8 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
 9 **CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA – SOUTHERN DIVISION**

11 MARY B. PAYDAR, an individual,
 12 Plaintiff,
 13 vs.
 14 LIBERTY MUTUAL INSURANCE
 COMPANY, a business entity, exact form
 15 unknown, and Does 1-100,
 16 Defendants.

Case No. 8:16-CV-01535-DOC (JCGx)

**STIPULATED PROTECTIVE
 ORDER**

[DISCOVERY DOCUMENT:
 REFERRED TO MAGISTRATE
 JUDGE JAY C. GANDHI]

17
 18
 19
 20
 21
 22
 23
 24
 25
 26
 27
 28

1. A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary or private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles.

B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

This action is likely to involve trade secrets, proprietary internal documents and other valuable research, development, commercial, financial, technical and/or proprietary information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecution of this action is warranted. Such confidential and proprietary materials and information consist of, among other things, confidential business or financial information, information regarding confidential business practices, or other confidential research, development, or commercial information (including information implicating privacy rights of third parties), information otherwise generally unavailable to the public, or which may be privileged or otherwise protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes, court rules, case decisions, or common law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery materials, to adequately protect information the parties are entitled to keep confidential, to ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the end of the litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that information

1 will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so
2 designated without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential,
3 non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public
4 record of this case.

5 C. ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF PROCEDURE FOR FILING UNDER SEAL

6 The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3, below, that this
7 Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information
8 under seal; Local Civil Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and
9 the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to
10 file material under seal.

11 There is a strong presumption that the public has a right of access to judicial
12 proceedings and records in civil cases. In connection with non-dispositive motions,
13 good cause must be shown to support a filing under seal. *See Kamakana v. City and*
14 *County of Honolulu*, 447 F.3d 1172, 1176 (9th Cir. 2006), *Phillips v. Gen. Motors*
15 *Corp.*, 307 F.3d 1206, 1210-11 (9th Cir. 2002), *Makar-Welbon v. Sony Electrics,*
16 *Inc.*, 187 F.R.D. 576, 577 (E.D. Wis. 1999) (even stipulated protective orders require
17 good cause showing), and a specific showing of good cause or compelling reasons
18 with proper evidentiary support and legal justification, must be made with respect to
19 Protected Material that a party seeks to file under seal. The parties' mere designation
20 of Disclosure or Discovery Material as CONFIDENTIAL does not—without the
21 submission of competent evidence by declaration, establishing that the material
22 sought to be filed under seal qualifies as confidential, privileged, or otherwise
23 protectable—constitute good cause.

24 Further, if a party requests sealing related to a dispositive motion or trial, then
25 compelling reasons, not only good cause, for the sealing must be shown, and the
26 relief sought shall be narrowly tailored to serve the specific interest to be protected.
27 *See Pintos v. Pacific Creditors Ass'n*, 605 F.3d 665, 677-79 (9th Cir. 2010). For
28 each item or type of information, document, or thing sought to be filed or introduced

1 under seal in connection with a dispositive motion or trial, the party seeking
2 protection must articulate compelling reasons, supported by specific facts and legal
3 justification, for the requested sealing order. Again, competent evidence supporting
4 the application to file documents under seal must be provided by declaration.

5 Any document that is not confidential, privileged, or otherwise protectable in
6 its entirety will not be filed under seal if the confidential portions can be redacted. If
7 documents can be redacted, then a redacted version for public viewing, omitting only
8 the confidential, privileged, or otherwise protectable portions of the document, shall
9 be filed. Any application that seeks to file documents under seal in their entirety
10 should include an explanation of why redaction is not feasible.

11 2. **DEFINITIONS**

12 2.1 Action: The case titled Mary B. Paydar v. Liberty Mutual Insurance
13 Company, et al., U.S. District Court, Central District of California, Case No. 8:16-
14 CV-01535-DOC (JCGx).

15 2.2 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation
16 of information or items under this Order.

17 2.3 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of
18 how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for
19 protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in the
20 Good Cause Statement.

21 2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and in-House Counsel (as well as
22 their support staff).

23 2.5 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or
24 items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as
25 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

26 2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless
27 of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including,
28 among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or

1 generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

2 2.7 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter
3 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as
4 an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

5 2.8 In-House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this
6 Action. In-House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other
7 outside counsel.

8 2.9 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association or
9 other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

10 2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party
11 to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and have
12 appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm that
13 has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

14 2.11 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,
15 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their
16 support staffs).

17 2.12 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
18 Discovery Material in this Action.

19 2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support
20 services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or
21 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)
22 and their employees and subcontractors.

23 2.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
24 designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

25 2.15 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material
26 from a Producing Party.

27 3. **SCOPE**

28 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only

1 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or
2 extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or
3 compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or
4 presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

5 Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the
6 trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

7 4. **DURATION**

8 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations
9 imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees
10 otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be
11 deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this Action, with
12 or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and
13 exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this Action,
14 including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time
15 pursuant to applicable law.

16 5. **DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL**

17 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.

18 Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under
19 this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that
20 qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for
21 protection only those parts of material, documents, items or oral or written
22 communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents, items
23 or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably
24 within the ambit of this Order.

25 Mass, indiscriminate or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations
26 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper
27 purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose
28

1 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating
2 Party to sanctions.

3 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it
4 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must
5 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

6 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in
7 this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise
8 stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection
9 under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or
10 produced.

11 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

12 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents,
13 but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the
14 Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" (hereinafter
15 "CONFIDENTIAL legend"), to each page that contains protected material. If only a
16 portion of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also
17 must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings
18 in the margins).

19 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection
20 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated
21 which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and
22 before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be
23 deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting Party has identified the
24 documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which
25 documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before
26 producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the
27 "CONFIDENTIAL legend" to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a
28 portion of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also

1 must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings
2 in the margins).

3 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party identifies the
4 Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the deposition all
5 protected testimony.

6 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for
7 any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the
8 exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the legend
9 “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information warrants
10 protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected
11 portion(s).

12 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent
13 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive
14 the Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such material.
15 Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable
16 efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this
17 Order.

18 6. **CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS**

19 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a
20 designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court’s
21 Scheduling Order.

22 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute
23 resolution process under Local Rule 37.1, *et seq.*

24 6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on
25 the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper
26 purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other
27 parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating
28 Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall

1 continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is
2 entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the Court rules on the
3 challenge.

4 7. **ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

5 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
6 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this
7 Action only for prosecuting, defending or attempting to settle this Action. Such
8 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the
9 conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a
10 Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL
11 DISPOSITION).

12 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a
13 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons
14 authorized under this Order.

15 7.2 Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items. Unless
16 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a
17 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated
18 "CONFIDENTIAL" only to:

19 (a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as well as
20 employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to
21 disclose the information for this Action;

22 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including in-House Counsel) of the
23 Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;

24 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom
25 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the
26 "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

27 (d) the court and its personnel;

28 (e) court reporters and their staff;

1 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional
2 Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have
3 signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

4 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a
5 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

6 (h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the
7 Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing party
8 requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit 1 hereto; and (2) they will
9 not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign the
10 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise
11 agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed
12 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may be
13 separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as
14 permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

15 (i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel,
16 mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

17
18 8. **PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED**
19 **PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION**

20 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation
21 that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as
22 “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

23 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall
24 include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

25 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to
26 issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena
27 or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of
28 this Stipulated Protective Order; and

1 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued
2 by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

3 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with
4 the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this
5 action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the
6 subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s
7 permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking
8 protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions
9 should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action
10 to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

11
12 9. **A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE**
13 **PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION**

14 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-
15 Party in this Action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information
16 produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the
17 remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be
18 construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

19 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to
20 produce a Non-Party’s confidential information in its possession, and the Party is
21 subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party’s
22 confidential information, then the Party shall:

23 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that
24 some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement
25 with a Non-Party;

26 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective
27 Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific
28 description of the information requested; and

1 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party,
2 if requested.

3 (c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within 14
4 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may
5 produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery
6 request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall
7 not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the
8 confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court.
9 Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense
10 of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

11
12 10. **UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

13 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed
14 Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this
15 Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in
16 writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts
17 to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or
18 persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order,
19 and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and
20 Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

21
22 11. **INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE**
23 **PROTECTED MATERIAL**

24 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain
25 inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection,
26 the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil
27 Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure
28 may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior

1 privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the
2 parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or
3 information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the
4 parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted
5 to the court.

6
7 12. **MISCELLANEOUS**

8 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any
9 person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

10 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this
11 Protective Order, no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to
12 disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this
13 Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any
14 ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

15 12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any
16 Protected Material must comply with Local Civil Rule 79-5. Protected Material may
17 only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the
18 specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material
19 under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information
20 in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

21
22 13. **FINAL DISPOSITION**

23 After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60
24 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return
25 all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in
26 this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations,
27 summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected
28 Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving

1 Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same
2 person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies
3 (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or
4 destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies,
5 abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any
6 of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to
7 retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing
8 transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert
9 reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such
10 materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or
11 constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in
12 Section 4.

13

14 14. **VIOLATION**

15 Any violation of this Order may be punished by appropriate measures including,
16 without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary sanctions.

17

18 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

19

20 DATED: March 27, 2017

SOTTILE BALTAXE

21

22

By: /s/ Payam I. Aframian
Timothy B. Sottile
Michael F. Baltaxe
Jeremy D. Scherwin
Payam I. Aframian

23

24

25

Attorneys for Plaintiff,
MARY B. PAYDAR

26

27

28

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

DATED: March 28, 2017


OGLETREE, DEAKINS, NASH,
SMOAK & STEWART, P.C.

By: /s/ Hanna B. Raanan _____
Vince M. Verde
Hanna B. Raanan

Attorneys for Defendant
Liberty Mutual Insurance Company

FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.

DATED: March 28, 2017



HON. JAY C. GANDHI
United States Magistrate Judge

1 EXHIBIT A

2 ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

3

4 I, _____ [print or type full name], of

5 _____ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury

6 that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that

7 was issued by the United States District Court for the Central District of California

8 on [date] in the case of _____ [**insert formal name of the case and the**

9 **number and initials assigned to it by the court**]. I agree to comply with and to be

10 bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and

11 acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment

12 in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner

13 any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any

14 person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

15 I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the

16 Central District of California for enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective

17 Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action. I

18 hereby appoint _____ [print or type full name] of

19 _____ [print or type full address and

20 telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with

21 this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective

22 Order.

23 Date: _____

24 City and State where sworn and signed: _____

25

26 Printed name: _____

27

28 Signature: _____