American Payroll Outsourcing, Inc. v. Southeast Personnel Leasing, Inc. et al.

Doc. 27

34

6

5

8

7

1011

9

12

13 14

1516

17

18 19

2021

22

2324

25

26

27

28

1. <u>PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS</u>

There is good cause for entry of this Stipulated Protective Order because discovery in this action is likely to involve the production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted. For example, the parties anticipate that they will produce information that refers to workers compensation claimants by names, addresses, their work-related injuries and may contain their social security numbers or parts thereof. The claimants may have privacy interests in such information. The parties may also exchange confidential information related to the defense and settlement of various workers compensation claims that remain open, the public disclosure of which may prejudice the parties with respect to that pending litigation. In addition, the production of Defendants South East Personnel Leasing, Inc. and Packard Claims Administration, Inc. (collectively, "Defendants") may contain proprietary underwriting information that Defendants would not share with their competitors, such as Defendants' pricing analysis, the terms and conditions on which Defendants would accept the risk and Defendants' implementation of the insurance program.

Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Paragraph 12.3 below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the Court to file material under seal.

2. DEFINITIONS

- 2.1. <u>Challenging Party</u>: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information or items under this Order.
- 2.2. "Claim File(s)": refers to the term of art used in the insurance industry to describe the documents, information and/or tangible things (regardless of how they are generated, stored or maintained) that make up the "file" kept by Defendants and/or Plaintiff American Payroll Outsourcing, Inc. ("Plaintiff") for any workers compensation claims. Claim File does not refer to any documents, information or tangible things (regardless of how they are generated, stored or maintained) that may generally refer to a claim or claimant but are not part of the actual file kept by Defendants and/or Plaintiff for any particular workers compensation claim.
- 2.3 <u>"CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items</u>: information and/or tangible things (regardless of how they are generated, stored or maintained) that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c).
- 2.4. <u>Counsel (without qualifier)</u>: Outside Counsel of Record and In-House Counsel (as well as their support staff).
- 2.5. <u>Designating Party</u>: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY."
- 2.6. <u>Disclosure or Discovery Material</u>: all items or information, regardless of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things, testimony, transcripts and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.
- 2.7. Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this action.

 $_{28} \parallel_{/}$

- 2.8. "CONFIDENTIAL ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" Information or Items: Claim Files, as well as information and/or tangible things (regardless of how they are generated, stored or maintained) that would otherwise be exempted from disclosure under California Labor Code Section 3762.
- 2.9. <u>In-House Counsel</u>: attorneys who are employees of a Party to this action. In-House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.
- 2.10. <u>Non-Party</u>: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.
- 2.11. <u>Outside Counsel of Record</u>: attorneys who are not employees of a Party to this action but are retained to represent or advise a Party to this action and have appeared in this action on behalf of that Party or are affiliated with a law firm which has appeared on behalf of that Party.
- 2.12. <u>Party</u>: any party to this action, including all of its officers, directors, employees, consultants, retained experts and Outside Counsel of Record (and their support staffs).
- 2.13. <u>Producing Party</u>: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or Discovery Material in this action.
- 2.14. <u>Professional Vendors</u>: persons or entities that provide litigation support services (*e.g.*, photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstratives and organizing, storing or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and subcontractors.
- 2.15. <u>Protected Material</u>: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY."
- 2.16. <u>Receiving Party</u>: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a Producing Party.

3. SCOPE

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any deposition testimony, conversations or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material, other than during a court hearing or at trial. However, the protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order do not cover the following information: (a) any information that is in the public domain at the time of disclosure to a Receiving Party or becomes part of the public domain after its disclosure to a Receiving Party as a result of publication not involving a violation of this Order, including becoming part of the public record through trial or otherwise; and (b) any information known to the Receiving Party prior to the disclosure or obtained by the Receiving Party after the disclosure from a source who obtained the information lawfully and under no obligation of confidentiality to the Designating Party. Any use of Protected Material during a court hearing or at trial shall be governed by the orders of the presiding judge. This Stipulation and Order do not govern the use of Protected Material during a court hearing or at trial.

4. DURATION

Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. "Final Disposition" shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials or reviews of this action, including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to applicable law.

5. <u>DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL</u>

5.1. Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written communications that qualify – so that other portions of the material, documents, items or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

Mass, indiscriminate or routinized designations are prohibited. If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

5.2. <u>Manner and Timing of Designations</u>. Except as otherwise provided in this Order (*see*, *e.g.*, second paragraph of Paragraph 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

(a) For information in documentary form (*e.g.*, paper or electronic documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party affix the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" to each page that contains protected material.

A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents or materials available for inspection need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which material it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all of the material made available for

which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order.

Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" legend to each page that contains Protected Material.

(b) For testimony given in deposition, that the Designating Party identify on the record, before the close of the deposition, all protected testimony.

(c) For information produced in some form other than documentary and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a

inspection shall be deemed "CONFIDENTIAL," or "CONFIDENTIAL –

ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" if it concerns any potential claims information or

corporate financial information. After the inspecting Party has identified the

documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine

prominent place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information or item is stored the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY." If only a portion or portions of the information or item warrant protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

5.3. <u>Inadvertent Failures to Designate</u>. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party's right to secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

6.1. <u>Timing of Challenges</u>. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of confidentiality at any time consistent with the District Judge's Scheduling Order(s). Unless a prompt challenge to a Designating Party's confidentiality designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial

9

11

10

1314

12

15 16

17

1819

20

21

22

2324

25

2627

2728

unfairness, unnecessary economic burdens or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a Party does not waive its right to challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the original designation is disclosed.

- 6.2. Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution process by providing written notice of each designation it is challenging and describing the basis for each challenge. To avoid ambiguity as to whether a challenge has been made, the written notice must recite that the challenge to confidentiality is being made in accordance with this specific Paragraph of this Stipulated Protective Order. The Parties shall attempt to resolve each challenge in good faith and must begin the process by conferring directly (in voice to voice dialogue; other forms of communication are not sufficient) within 10 days of the date of service of notice. In conferring, the Challenging Party must explain the basis for its belief that the confidentiality designation was not proper and must give the Designating Party an opportunity to review the designated material, to reconsider the circumstances, and, if no change in designation is offered, to explain the basis for the chosen designation. A Challenging Party may proceed to the next stage of the challenge process only if it has engaged in this meet and confer process first or establishes that the Designating Party is unwilling to participate in the meet and confer process in a timely manner.
- 6.3. <u>Judicial Intervention</u>. If the Parties cannot resolve a challenge without court intervention, the Designating Party shall file and serve a motion to retain confidentiality (in compliance with Civil Local Rules 37-1, 37-2, and 79-5) within 21 days of the initial notice of challenge or within 14 days of the Parties agreeing that the meet and confer process will not resolve their dispute, whichever is earlier. Any motion brought pursuant to this provision is subject to Civil Local Rules 37-1 and 37-2, including, but not limited to, the requirement that a joint stipulation shall be filed and served with the notice of motion. Each such motion

28 || ,

///

must be accompanied by a competent declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the meet and confer requirements imposed in the preceding Paragraph. Failure by the Designating Party to make such a motion including the required declaration within 21 days (or 14 days, if applicable) shall automatically waive the confidentiality designation for each challenged designation. In addition, the Challenging Party may file a motion challenging a confidentiality designation at any time consistent with the District Judge's Scheduling Order(s) if there is good cause for doing so, including a challenge to the designation of a deposition transcript or any portions thereof. Any motion brought pursuant to this provision must be accompanied by a competent declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the meet and confer requirements imposed by the preceding Paragraph.

The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating Party. Unless the Designating Party has waived the confidentiality designation by failing to file a motion to retain confidentiality as described above, all Parties shall continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the Court rules on the challenge.

7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

7.1. <u>Basic Principles</u>. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this case only for prosecuting, defending or attempting to settle this litigation. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the litigation has been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of Paragraph 13 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

- 7.2. <u>Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items</u>. Unless otherwise ordered by the Court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated "CONFIDENTIAL" only to:
- (a) The Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this action, as well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this litigation;
- (b) The officers, directors and employees (including In-House Counsel) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation;
- (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);
 - (d) The Court and its personnel;
 - (e) Court reporters, Professional Vendors and their staffs;
- (f) Professional jury or trial consultants or mock jurors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);
- (g) During their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order. The Parties will endeavor to have the witness sign and execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A), but their refusal to execute will not prevent them from being questioned regarding the Protected Material; and

7.2(b) above [the officers, directors and employees (including In-House Counsel) of the Receiving Party]; and

- (g) The author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.
- B. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED

 IN OTHER LITIGATION

If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY," that Party must:

- (a) Promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;
- (b) Promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and
- (c) Cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" before a determination by the Court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party's permission or unless otherwise required by the law or court order. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" material – and nothing in

these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

9. <u>A NON-PARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE</u> PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION

- (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in this action and designated as "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY." Such information produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.
- (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Non-Party's "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" information, then the Party shall:
- (1) Promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;
- (2) Promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order in this litigation, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the information requested; and
- (3) Make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party.
- (c) If a Non-Party represented by counsel fails to commence the process called for by Local Rules 45-1 and 37-1, et seq. within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information or fails contemporaneously to notify the Receiving Party that it has done so, the Receiving Party may produce

the Non-Party's "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" information responsive to the discovery request. If an unrepresented Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the Non-Party's "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court unless otherwise required by the law or court order. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

10. <u>UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL</u>

If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify the Designating Party in writing of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

11. <u>INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE</u> <u>PROTECTED MATERIAL</u>

When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify

whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the Parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the Parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted to the Court.

12. MISCELLANEOUS

- 12.1. <u>Right to Further Relief</u>. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.
- 12.2. Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Stipulated Protective Order, no Party waives any right it would otherwise have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to the use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Stipulated Protective Order.
- 12.3. Filing Protected Material. Without a court order secured after appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Party may not file any Protected Material in the public record in this action. A Party that seeks to file any Protected Material under seal must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at issue. If a Receiving Party's request to file Protected Material under seal pursuant to Civil Local Rule 79-5 is denied by the Court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in the public record, unless otherwise instructed by the Court.

13. FINAL DISPOSITION

Within 60 days after the Final Disposition of this action, as defined in Paragraph 4, each Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this subdivision, "all

1	Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries and				
2	any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether				
3	the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a				
4	written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity,				
5	to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by category,				
6	where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed, and				
7	(2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts,				
8	compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any of the				
9	Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to retain				
10	an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition and hearing				
11	transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert				
12	reports, attorney work product and consultant and expert work product, even if				
13	such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain				
14	or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Stipulated Protective Order				
15	as set forth in Paragraph 4 (DURATION).				
16	IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.				
17	DATED:	November 15, 2017	DOSS LEGAL SERVICES		
18			By: /s/ Bryan S. Doss BRYAN S. DOSS		
19			JOHN MENDONZA		
20			Attorneys for Plaintiff, AMERICAN PAYROLL		
21			OUTSOURCING, INC. dba APO		
22			STAFFING, INC.		
23	DATED:	November 15, 2017	OGLETREE, DEAKINS, NASH, SMOAK		
24			& STEWART, PC		
25			By: /s/ Rafael G. Nendel-Flores		
25 26			By:/s/ Rafael G. Nendel-Flores Rafael G. Nendel-Flores Patricia Matias		
			Rafael G. Nendel-Flores		

1	DATED:	November 15, 2017	GORDON & REES, LLP		
2			By:/s/ Eric Deitz		
3			Eric R. Deitz		
4			Carrie A. Stringham Attorneys for Defendant, South East		
5			Personnel Leasing, Inc.		
6	<u>CERTIFICATION</u>				
7 8	Pursuant to L.R. 5-4.3.4(a)(2)(i), the filing attorney attests that he has				
9	obtained concurrence regarding this document's content and authorization to file				
10	this document from the indicated signatories to the document.				
10		November 15, 2017	By: /s/ John Mendonza		
12			JOHN MENDONZA		
13					
14	PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.				
15					
16	DATED: 1	November 28, 2017	/s/		
17			Honorable Jacqueline Chooljian United States Magistrate Judge		
18			Officed States Wagistrate Judge		
19					
20					
21					
22					
23					
24					
25					
26					
27					
28					

1 EXHIBIT A ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND 2 I, _____ [print or type full name], of 3 _____ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury 4 5 that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for the Central District of 6 7 California on November 28, 2017 in the case of *American Payroll Outsourcing*, Inc. v. South East Personnel Leasing, Inc., et al., Case No. 8:17 CV00329 JVS 8 9 JC. I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply 10 11 could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I 12 solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item 13 that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in 14 strict compliance with the provisions of this Order. 15 I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District 16 Court for the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms 17 of this Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur 18 after termination of this action. 19 20 Date: _____ 21 22 City and State where sworn and signed: 23 Printed name: 24 25 Signature: 26 27 28