

SHOOK, HARDY & BACON L.L.P.

JANET HICKSON (SBN 198849)
jhickson@shb.com
5 Park Plaza, Suite 1600
Irvine, CA 92614
TEL: (949) 475-1500 | FAX: (949) 475-0016

SHOOK, HARDY & BACON L.L.P.

AMIR NASSIHI (SBN 235936)
anassihi@shb.com
JOAN R. CAMAGONG (SBN 288217)
jcamagong@shb.com
555 Mission Street, Suite 2300
San Francisco, CA 94105
TEL: (415) 544-1900 | FAX: (415) 391-0281

Attorneys for Defendant
MITSUBISHI MOTORS NORTH
AMERICA, INC.

Tarek H. Zohdy (SBN 247775)
Cody R. Padgett (SBN 275553)
Laura E. Goolsby (SBN 321721)
Nathan N. Kiyam (SBN 317677)
CAPSTONE LAW APC
1875 Century Park East, Suite 1000
Los Angeles, California 90067
Tel.: (310) 556-4811
Fax: (310) 943-0396
Tarek.Zohdy@capstonelawyers.com
Cody.Padgett@capstonelawyers.com
Laura.Goolsby@capstonelawyers.com
Nate.Kiyam@capstonelawyers.com

Russell D. Paul (admitted *PHV*)
Amey J. Park (admitted *PHV*)
BERGER MONTAGUE PC
1818 Market Street, Suite 3600
Philadelphia, PA 19103
Tel.: (215) 875-3000
Fax: (215) 875-4604
rpaul@bm.net
apark@bm.net
agertner@bm.net

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

RYAN HARDY, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

MITSUBISHI MOTORS NORTH
AMERICA, INC., and MITSUBISHI
MOTORS CORP.,

Defendants.

Case No. 8:21-cv-01983-MEMF-KES

[Discovery Document: Referred to
Magistrate Judge Karen E. Scott]

**STIPULATED PROTECTIVE
ORDER**

1 1. A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

2 Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential,
3 proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure
4 and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted.
5 Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to enter the
6 following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does
7 not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that
8 the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited
9 information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable
10 legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3, below,
11 that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential
12 information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be
13 followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from
14 the court to file material under seal.

15 B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

16 This action is likely to involve trade secrets, customer and pricing lists and
17 other valuable research, development, commercial, financial, technical and/or
18 proprietary information for which special protection from public disclosure and from
19 use for any purpose other than prosecution of this action is warranted. Such
20 confidential and proprietary materials and information consist of, among other things,
21 confidential business or financial information, information regarding confidential
22 business practices, or other confidential research, development, or commercial
23 information (including information implicating privacy rights of third parties),
24 information otherwise generally unavailable to the public, or which may be privileged
25 or otherwise protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes, court rules, case
26 decisions, or common law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to
27 facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery materials,
28 to adequately protect information the parties are entitled to keep confidential, to

1 ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material in
2 preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the end of the
3 litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such information is
4 justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that information will not be
5 designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so designated
6 without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential, non-public
7 manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public record of this
8 case.

9 10 2. DEFINITIONS

11 2.1 Action: *Hardy et. al, v. Mitsubishi Motors North America, Inc. and*
12 *Mitsubishi Motors Corp.*, Case No. 8:21-cv-01983-MEMF-KES (C.D. Cal.).

13 2.2 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation
14 of information or items under this Order.

15 2.3 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of how
16 it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection
17 under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in the Good
18 Cause Statement.

19 2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their
20 support staff).

21 2.5 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or
22 items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as
23 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

24 2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of
25 the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including,
26 among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or
27 generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

1 2.7 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter
2 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as
3 an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

4 2.8 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action.
5 House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside
6 counsel.

7 2.9 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or
8 other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

9 2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party to
10 this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and have
11 appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which
12 has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

13 2.11 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,
14 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their
15 support staffs).

16 2.12 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
17 Discovery Material in this Action.

18 2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support
19 services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or
20 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)
21 and their employees and subcontractors.

22 2.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
23 designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

24 2.15 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material
25 from a Producing Party.

26 //

27 //

28 //

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

3. SCOPE

The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material. However, the protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order may not cover information that is in the public domain at the time of disclosure to a Receiving Party or becomes part of the public domain after its disclosure to a Receiving Party as a result of publication not involving a violation of this Order. Should either party possess or receive information prior to the disclosure or after the disclosure from a source who obtained the information lawfully and under no obligation of confidentiality to the Designating Party, the parties shall meet and confer prior to disclosure.

Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

4. DURATION

Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this Action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this Action, including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to applicable law.

//
//

1 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

2 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.

3 Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this
4 Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies
5 under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for protection
6 only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written communications that
7 qualify so that other portions of the material, documents, items, or communications
8 for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of
9 this Order.

10 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations
11 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper
12 purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose
13 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating Party
14 to sanctions.

15 If it comes to a Designating Party’s attention that information or items that it
16 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must
17 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

18 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this
19 Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated
20 or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this
21 Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

22 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

23 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents,
24 but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the
25 Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend “CONFIDENTIAL” (hereinafter
26 “CONFIDENTIAL legend”), to each page that contains protected material. If only a
27 portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing
28

1 Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate
2 markings in the margins).

3 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection
4 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated
5 which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before
6 the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be deemed
7 “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants
8 copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents, or
9 portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing the
10 specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the “CONFIDENTIAL legend”
11 to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or portions of the
12 material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly
13 identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the
14 margins).

15 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party identify,
16 within 30 days after the transcript is delivered, as Protected Material. All deposition
17 testimony taken in this case shall be treated as Protected Material until the expiration
18 of the thirtieth day after the transcript is delivered to any party or the witness. Within
19 this time period, a Designating Party may serve a Notice of Designation to all parties
20 of record as to the specific portions of the testimony that are designated Protected
21 Material, and thereafter only those portions identified in the Notice of Designation
22 shall be protected by the terms of this Order.

23 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for
24 any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the
25 exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the legend
26 “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information warrants
27 protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected
28 portion(s).

1 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent
2 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the
3 Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such material.
4 Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable
5 efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this
6 Order.

7
8 **6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS**

9 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation
10 of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court’s Scheduling Order.

11 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution
12 process under Local Rule 37.1 et seq. or follow the procedures for informal,
13 telephonic discovery hearings on the Court's website.

14 6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on
15 the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose
16 (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may
17 expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived
18 or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall continue to afford the
19 material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing
20 Party’s designation until the Court rules on the challenge.

21
22 **7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

23 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
24 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this
25 Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such
26 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the
27 conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a Receiving
28 Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

1 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a
2 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons
3 authorized under this Order.

4 7.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless otherwise
5 ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving
6 Party may disclose any information or item designated “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

7 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as well as
8 employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to
9 disclose the information for this Action;

10 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the
11 Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;

12 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom
13 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the
14 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

15 (d) the court and its personnel;

16 (e) court reporters and their staff;

17 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional
18 Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have
19 signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

20 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a
21 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

22 (h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the
23 Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing party
24 requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit 1 hereto; and (2) they will
25 not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign the
26 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise
27 agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed
28 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may be

1 separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as
2 permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

3 (i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel,
4 mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.
5

6 8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN
7 OTHER LITIGATION

8 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation
9 that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as
10 “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

11 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall
12 include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

13 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to
14 issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena
15 or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of
16 this Stipulated Protective Order; and

17 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued
18 by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

19 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with
20 the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this
21 action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the
22 subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s
23 permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking
24 protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions
25 should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action to
26 disobey a lawful directive from another court.

27 //

28 //

1 9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED
2 IN THIS LITIGATION

3 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-
4 Party in this Action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information
5 produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the
6 remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be
7 construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

8 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to
9 produce a Non-Party’s confidential information in its possession, and the Party is
10 subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party’s
11 confidential information, then the Party shall:

12 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that
13 some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with
14 a Non-Party;

15 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective
16 Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific
17 description of the information requested; and

18 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-
19 Party, if requested.

20 (c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within 14
21 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may
22 produce the Non-Party’s confidential information responsive to the discovery request.
23 If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce
24 any information in its possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality
25 agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court. Absent a court
26 order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking
27 protection in this court of its Protected Material.
28

1 10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

2 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed
3 Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this
4 Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in
5 writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts
6 to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or
7 persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order,
8 and (d) request such person or persons to execute the “Acknowledgment and
9 Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

10
11 11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE
12 PROTECTED MATERIAL

13 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain
14 inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection,
15 the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil
16 Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure
17 may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior
18 privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the
19 parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or
20 information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the
21 parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted
22 to the court.

23
24 12. MISCELLANEOUS

25 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any
26 person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

27 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this
28 Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to

1 disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this
2 Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any
3 ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

4 12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any
5 Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may
6 only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific
7 Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material under seal is
8 denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in the public
9 record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

10
11 13. FINAL DISPOSITION

12 After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60
13 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return
14 all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this
15 subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations,
16 summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected
17 Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party
18 must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person
19 or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by
20 category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed
21 and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts,
22 compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any of the
23 Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an
24 archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing
25 transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert
26 reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such
27 materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or
28

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

14. Any violation of this Order may be punished by any and all appropriate measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary sanctions.

IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

DATED: September 25, 2024

/s/Laura E. Goolsby

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

DATED: September 25, 2024

/s/Joan R. Camagong

Attorneys for Defendant

1 EXHIBIT A

2 ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

3 I, _____ [print or type full name], of
4 _____ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury
5 that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order
6 that was issued by the United States District Court for the Central District of
7 California on [date] in the case of _____ [insert formal name of the case and the
8 number and initials assigned to it by the court]. I agree to comply with and to be bound
9 by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge
10 that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature
11 of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any
12 information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or
13 entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

14 I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court
15 for the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this
16 Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after
17 termination of this action. I hereby appoint _____ [print
18 or type full name] of _____ [print or type
19 full address and telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in
20 connection with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this
21 Stipulated Protective Order.

22 Date: _____

23 City and State where sworn and signed: _____

24
25 Printed name: _____

26
27 Signature: _____

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

RYAN HARDY, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

MITSUBISHI MOTORS NORTH
AMERICA, INC., and MITSUBISHI
MOTORS CORP.,

Defendants.

Case No. 8:21-cv-01983-MEMF-KES

[Discovery Document: Referred to
Magistrate Judge Karen E. Scott]

~~PROPOSED~~ ORDER RE
STIPULATED PROTECTIVE
ORDER

1 Based on the parties' Stipulated Protective Order filed concurrently herewith,
2 and good cause appearing, the Court hereby ENTERS the Protective Order as set forth
3 therein.

4 IT IS SO ORDERED.

5
6 Dated: September 26, 2024

Karen E. Scott

MAGISTRATE JUDGE KAREN E. SCOTT
UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE

7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28