1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

MICHAEL IOANE, et al,

KENT SPJUTE, et al,

Plaintiffs

Defendants

9

10

11

12

13

14 15

16

17

18 19

20 21

22 23

24

25

26

27

28

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

CASE NO. 1:07-CV-0620 AWI EPG

ORDER RE: REQUESTS FOR DITIONAL MONTHLY PHONE UTES AT TAFT CORRECTIONAL INSTITUION AND TO FILE RECORDS UNDER SEAL

(Docs. 367 and 368)

Plaintiff Michael Ioane, Sr. is incarcerated at Taft Correctional Institute where he is given 300 minutes per month of phone time. Michael Ioane, Sr. is asking for an additional 650 minutes per month to deal with legal issues in this case and other litigation. Defendants oppose the request. Michael Ioane, Sr. states "Absent an order from Court directed to the Bureau of Prisons, Ioane will not be able to prepare this action for trial or appropriately handle his criminal and other civil matters which is in violation of the policy of the federal court to allow inmates access to courts to address their legal matters while in prison." Doc. 367, 4:24-5:3. In a related motion, Michael Ioane, Sr. sought to file his wife's (Plaintiff Shelly Ioane) medical report under seal. Doc. 368. Plaintiff explains that he provides it as evidence in support of his request for an increase in the monthly phone limit: "Because Mrs. Ioane's present condition renders her unable to assist in trial preparation, Mr. Ioane needs reasonable accommodations from the Court, including increased monthly phone minutes so that he may communicate with witnesses, attorneys, paralegals, legal service providers, and others in order to prepare for trial." Doc. 374, 3:2-7. Michael Ioane, Sr. has not shown that the limit placed on his use of the phone constitutes an "actual injury – that is, actual prejudice with respect to contemplated or existing litigation, such as the inability to meet a

filing deadline or to present a claim." Lewis v. Casey, 518 U.S. 343, 348 (1996), citations omitted. Michael Ioane, Sr. asserts that "For example, making a telephonic appearance on a District Court law and motion matter may entail an hour or more on the line until the case is called." Doc. 367, 4:13-15. However, non-party Taft Correctional Institute has clarified that all of Plaintiff's calls for court hearings in this case (including time waiting for the matter to be called) are handled in a special manner that does not count against his monthly limit. This motion can be resolved without examining the medical records of Shelly Ioane. Even assuming that she is unable to take additional steps to assist him in this case, that places Michael Ioane, Sr. in the same position as an inmate without any family outside the prison. No special procedures appear to be warranted. "[J]ail officials are not constitutionally compelled to provide 'ideal' access to the courts, and plaintiff's allegations of limited access to phones, law libraries and legal materials are insufficient to satisfy the 'actual injury' requirement." <u>Lookadoo v. L.A. Cnty. Sheriff's Dep't</u>, 2016 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 14508, *19 (C.D. Cal. Feb. 4, 2016). Plaintiff Michael Ioane, Sr.'s request for 650 minutes per month additional phone time is DENIED. Plaintiff Michael Ioane, Sr.'s request to file medical records under seal is DENIED. IT IS SO ORDERED. Dated: March 29, 2016 SENIOR DISTRICT JUDGE