

1 BENJAMIN B. WAGNER  
2 United States Attorney  
3 YOSHINORI H. T. HIMEL #66194  
4 Assistant U. S. Attorney  
5 501 I Street, Suite 10-100  
Sacramento, California 95814  
Telephone: (916) 554-2760  
Facsimile: (916) 554-2900  
Email: yoshinori.himel@usdoj.gov

6 Attorneys for Defendants

7

8 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE  
9 EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

10

11 C. BROOKS CUTTER,

12 Plaintiff,

13 v.

14 FOOD AND DRUG ADMINISTRATION and  
15 DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH AND  
HUMAN SERVICES,

16 Defendants.

17

18 No. 1:09-cv-00107-LJO-DLB

19

20 **PARTIES' STIPULATION TO EXTEND  
PROTEST DATE AND RESET STATUS  
CONFERENCE**

21

22 Defendants, the United States Food and Drug Administration ("FDA") and Department of  
Health and Human Services, by and through their attorneys, Benjamin B. Wagner, United States  
Attorney, and Yoshinori H. T. Himel, Assistant United States Attorney; and Plaintiff, C. Brooks  
Cutter, respectfully request that this Court modify the schedule set forth in the Court's Order dated  
February 19, 2010.

23

24 In the "Parties' Stipulation to Extend Protest Date, and Reset Status Conference" approved  
February 19, 2010, the Court extended the time in which the Plaintiff may challenge FDA's  
withholdings until April 13, 2010.

25

26 In the time since the Court's February 19th Order, the parties have made significant progress  
27 in narrowing the remaining issues and moving toward a resolution of this case. On March 25, 2010,  
28 Plaintiff sent FDA a list of about one thousand specific withholdings from FDA's November 2009

1 document production about which he had concerns. A list this specific gives the parties a useful tool  
2 to find out what is and is not at issue. FDA is reviewing the list and intends to restore some of the  
3 information that Plaintiff requested.

4 FDA estimates that it will take approximately two months to restore the information and to  
5 produce the revised versions of those documents to Plaintiff. FDA has agreed to produce the revised  
6 versions of the documents to Plaintiff on or before June 14, 2010. The parties have agreed that  
7 Plaintiff will have thirty days, until July 14, 2010, to review the revised documents and to determine  
8 whether to formally challenge FDA's withholdings. Should Plaintiff decide not to challenge the  
9 withholdings, there would be nothing left to litigate, and the parties should be able to stipulate  
10 dismissal. If Plaintiff decides to challenge FDA's withholdings, the issues remaining for the Court to  
11 resolve would likely be narrowed.

12 The parties will not know the case status until July 14, 2010, which is after the status  
13 conference set for May 19, 2010, at 9:30 a.m., before Judge Beck. To serve judicial efficiency,  
14 the parties request that the status conference be continued until August 11, 2010, at 9:30 a.m. before  
15 Judge Beck.

16 The parties previously agreed that FDA will not prepare a Vaughn index of redacted  
17 information at this time. If Plaintiff decides to challenge FDA's withholdings, FDA agrees to produce  
18 a Vaughn index within thirty (30) calendar days after Plaintiff gives defense counsel of record and  
19 FDA counsel a notice of his intent to challenge the withholdings.

20 The time period for Plaintiff's deadline to challenge Defendants' withholdings has already  
21 been extended a total of two hundred and thirty-one (231) days, from August 25, 2009, to allow the  
22 parties to continue their ongoing efforts to reach a mutually agreeable resolution to this matter.

23 Based upon the foregoing, the parties move this Court to enter an order granting Plaintiff until  
24 July 14, 2010, to challenge Defendants' withholdings, consistent with the terms set forth in this  
25 stipulation, and to reset the status conference currently scheduled for May 19, 2010 at 9:30 am to  
26 August 11, 2010, at 9:30 a.m. before Judge Beck.

1  
2 Dated: April 12, 2010

/s/ C. Brooks Cutter  
3  
4 C. BROOKS CUTTER

5  
6 Dated: April 13, 2010

7  
8 BENJAMIN B. WAGNER  
9 United States Attorney

10 By:

/s/ Y H T Himel  
11 YOSHINORI H. T. HIMEL  
12 Assistant U.S. Attorney

13 Of Counsel:

14 DAVID S. CADE  
15 Acting General Counsel  
16 RALPH S. TYLER  
17 Associate General Counsel  
18 Food and Drug Division  
19 ERIC M. BLUMBERG  
20 Deputy Chief Counsel, Litigation  
21 MICHAEL HELBING  
22 Assistant Chief Counsel, Litigation  
23 U.S. Dept. of Health & Human Services  
24 Office of the General Counsel  
25 5600 Fishers Lane  
26 Rockville, MD 20857

27  
28 ORDER

29 Good cause appearing, Plaintiff's deadline for challenging Defendant's withholdings is  
30 extended until July 14, 2010. The status conference presently set for 9:30 a.m. on May 19, 2010, is  
31 CONTINUED until 9:30 a.m. on August 11, 2010, before Judge Beck.

32 IT IS SO ORDERED.

33 Dated: April 13, 2010

34 /s/ Dennis L. Beck  
35 UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE