1	RAUL PEREZ, Bar No. 174687 RPerez@InitiativeLegal.com			
2	MELISSA GRANT, Bar No. 205633			
3	MGrant@InitiativeLegal.com SUZY E. LEE, Bar No. 271120			
4	SuzyLee@InitiativeLegal.com INITIATIVE LEGAL GROUP APC			
5	1800 Century Park East, 2nd Floor Los Angeles, California 90067			
6	Telephone: 310.556.5637 Facsimile: 310.861.9051			
7	Attorneys for Plaintiffs BRIAN BUTTERWORTH AND MARGO CHUI			
8				
9	MICHAEL LEGGIERI, Bar No. 253791 mleggieri@littler.com			
10	LITTLER MENDELSON, P.C. 500 Capitol Mall, Suite 2000			
11	Sacramento, CA 95814 Telephone: 916.830.7200			
12	Facsimile: 916.561.0828			
13	Attorneys for Defendant AE RETAIL WEST			
14				
15	ADDITIONAL COUNSEL OF RECORD ON 1 PAGE	FOLLOWING		
16				
17	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT			
18	EASTERN DISTR	RICT OF CALIFORNIA		
19	BRIAN BUTTERWORTH and MARGO	Case No. 1:11-cv-01203-LJO-DLB		
20	CHUI, individually, and on behalf of other members of the general public similarly	STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER		
21	situated,	AND ORDER		
22	Plaintiffs,			
23	V.			
24	AE RETAIL WEST, a Corporation; and DOES 1 through 10, inclusive,			
25	Defendants.			
26				
27				
28				

1	LEE J. HUTTON, Admitted Pro Hac Vice
2	<u>Ihutton@littler.com</u> TIMOTHY S. ANDERSON, Admitted Pro Hac Vice
3	tanderson@littler.com LITTLER MENDELSON, P.C.
4	1100 Superior Avenue, 20th Floor Cleveland, OH 44114
5	Telephone: 216.696.7600 Facsimile: 216.696.2038
6	Attorneys for Defendant AE RETAIL WEST
7	AE RETAIL WEST
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

This is a putative wage and hour class action. Consequently – while the parties reserve the right to object to and/or challenge whether certain information is confidential, proprietary, a trade secret, personal, and/or private – the parties believe that they, as well as nonparties, will be required to produce or disclose information that is confidential, proprietary, and/or that is of a private or personal nature. The parties believe that if such information is disclosed in this action without restriction on its use or further disclosure, it may cause disadvantage, harm, damage and/or loss to the disclosing party or nonparties.

Therefore, believing that good cause exists, the parties hereby stipulate and agree that, subject to the Court's approval, the following procedures shall be followed in this action to facilitate the orderly and efficient discovery of relevant information while minimizing the potential for unauthorized disclosure or use of personal, private, confidential, and/or proprietary information.

14

1.

13

PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve production of 15 confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure 16 and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted. Accordingly, 17 the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to enter the following Stipulated Protective 18 Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all 19 disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use 20 extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the 21 applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3 below, that 22 this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information under seal; 23 Local Rules of Practice for the United States District Court, Eastern District of California 140 and 24 141 set forth the procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a 25 26 party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

2. 27

28

DEFINITIONS

2.1 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information or items under this Order.

2.2 "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is 2 generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of 3 Civil Procedure 26(c), as well as confidential or sensitive proprietary, business, commercial or 4 personal information, including, but not limited to, compensation and payroll information, personnel records, employee data, employee schedules, employee training materials, employee complaints, 6 internal investigations, audits, financial records, internal policies and procedures, business planning 7 information, budgets, floor plans, internal compliance materials, marketing information, private contracts, and sales and profit information.

1

5

8

9

11

21

22

23

24

28

2.3 Counsel (without qualifier): Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well 10 as their support staff).

Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it 2.4 12 produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as "CONFIDENTIAL." 13

2.5 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of the medium 14 or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things, testimony, 15 transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to 16 discovery in this matter. 17

2.6 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to the 18 litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a 19 consultant in this action. 20

2.7 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this action. House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.

2.8 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

2.9 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party to this action 25 26 but are retained to represent or advise a party to this action and have appeared in this action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which has appeared on behalf of that party. 27

2.10 Party: any party to this action, including all of its officers, directors, employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their support staffs).

2.11 <u>Producing Party</u>: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or Discovery Material in this action.

2.12 <u>Professional Vendors</u>: persons or entities that provide litigation support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and subcontractors.

2.13 <u>Protected Material</u>: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as "CONFIDENTIAL."

2.14 <u>Receiving Party</u>: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a Producing Party.

3. <u>SCOPE</u>

The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material. However, the protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order do not cover the following information: (a) any information that is in the public domain at the time of disclosure to a Receiving Party or becomes part of the public domain after its disclosure to a Receiving Party as a result of publication not involving a violation of this Order, including becoming part of the public record through trial or otherwise; and (b) any information known to the Receiving Party prior to the disclosure or obtained by the Receiving Party after the disclosure from a source who obtained the information lawfully and under no obligation of confidentiality to the Designating Party. Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by a separate agreement or order.4. DURATION

Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this action, including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to applicable law.

5.

DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written communications that qualify – so that other portions of the material, documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber or retard the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

5.2 <u>Manner and Timing of Designations</u>. Except as otherwise provided in this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

(a) <u>for information in documentary form</u> (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but
excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party
affix the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" to each page that contains protected material. If only a portion
or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly
identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

2

3

A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents or materials available for inspection need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which material it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the "CONFIDENTIAL" legend to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

(b) <u>for testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial or trial proceedings</u>, that the Designating Party identify on the record, before the close of the deposition, hearing, or other proceeding, all protected testimony.

(c) <u>for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any other</u> <u>tangible items</u>, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information or item is stored the legend "CONFIDENTIAL." If only a portion or portions of the information or item warrant protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

5.3 <u>Inadvertent Failures to Designate</u>. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party's right to secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

25

6.

CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

6.1 <u>Timing of Challenges</u>. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of
confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a Designating Party's confidentiality
designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic burdens,
or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a Party does not waive its right to challenge a

2

3

confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the original designation is disclosed.

6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution process 4 by providing written notice of each designation it is challenging and describing the basis for each 5 challenge. To avoid ambiguity as to whether a challenge has been made, the written notice must 6 recite that the challenge to confidentiality is being made in accordance with this specific paragraph 7 of the Protective Order. The parties shall attempt to resolve each challenge in good faith and must 8 begin the process by conferring directly (in voice to voice dialogue; other forms of communication 9 are not sufficient) within 14 days of the date of service of notice. In conferring, the Challenging 10 Party must explain the basis for its belief that the confidentiality designation was not proper and 11 must give the Designating Party an opportunity to review the designated material, to reconsider the 12 circumstances, and, if no change in designation is offered, to explain the basis for the chosen 13 designation. A Challenging Party may proceed to the next stage of the challenge process only if it 14 has engaged in this meet and confer process first or establishes that the Designating Party is 15 unwilling to participate in the meet and confer process in a timely manner. 16

6.3 Judicial Intervention. If the Parties cannot resolve a challenge without court 17 intervention, the Designating Party shall file and serve a motion to retain confidentiality under LR 18 141.1 within 21 days of the initial notice of challenge or within 14 days of the parties agreeing that 19 the meet and confer process will not resolve their dispute, whichever is later. Each such motion 20 must be accompanied by a competent declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the 21 meet and confer requirements imposed in the preceding paragraph. Failure by the Designating Party 22 to make such a motion including the required declaration within 21 days (or 14 days, if applicable) 23 shall automatically waive the confidentiality designation for each challenged designation. In 24 addition, the Challenging Party may file a motion challenging a confidentiality designation at any 25 26 time if there is good cause for doing so, including a challenge to the designation of a deposition transcript or any portions thereof. Any motion brought pursuant to this provision must be 27 accompanied by a competent declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the meet and 28 confer requirements imposed by the preceding paragraph.

The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived the confidentiality designation by failing to file a motion to retain confidentiality as described above, all parties shall continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the court rules on the challenge.

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

21

22

23

24

7.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

7.1 <u>Basic Principles</u>. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this case only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the litigation has been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

18 7.2 <u>Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items</u>. Unless otherwise ordered by
 19 the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any
 20 information or item designated "CONFIDENTIAL" only to:

(a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this action, as well as employees
 of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for
 this litigation and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" that is
 attached hereto as Exhibit A;

(b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the Receiving
Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the
"Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

- (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

(d)

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

the court and its personnel;

(e) court reporters and their staff, professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and
 Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have
 signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

9 (f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is reasonably 10 necessary and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A), 11 unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed 12 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material must be separately 13 bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this 14 Stipulated Protective Order.

(g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or
other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

8. <u>PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER</u> LITIGATION

If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels
disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as "CONFIDENTIAL," that Party
must:

(a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

24 25 26

22

23

17

18

(b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

27 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the
28 Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as "CONFIDENTIAL" before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party's permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material – and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

9. <u>A NON-PARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED IN THIS</u> <u>LITIGATION</u>

The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in this action and designated as "CONFIDENTIAL." Such information produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

15

10. <u>UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL</u>

If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

11. <u>INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED</u> <u>MATERIAL</u>

When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

23

24

1

parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or information covered by
the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement
in the stipulated protective order submitted to the court.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

12.

1

MISCELLANOUS

12.1 <u>Right to Further Relief</u>. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its modification by the court in the future, including the right to seek a modified protective order that contains an "attorneys' eyes only" provision.

12.2 <u>Right to Assert Other Objections</u>. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

12.3 Filing Protected Material. Without written permission from the Designating Party or a 14 court order secured after appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Party may not file in the 15 public record in this action any Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any 16 Protected Material must comply with Local Rules of Practice for the United States District Court, 17 Eastern District of California 140 and 141. Protected Material may only be filed under seal pursuant 18 to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at issue. If a Receiving 19 Party's request to file Protected Material under seal pursuant to LR 140 and 141 is denied by the 20 court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in the public record unless otherwise 21 instructed by the court. 22

12.4 <u>Use of Employee Contact Information</u>. The Parties agree that any employee contact information produced during this case, including current and former employee home addresses and telephone numbers, may only be used for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this litigation or related litigation. Provided, however, it shall not be a violation of this order for Plaintiffs' counsel to use this information to communicate with putative class members.

27 28

23

24

25

2

13.

FINAL DISPOSITION

Within 60 days after the final disposition of this action, as defined in paragraph 4, each 3 Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material, 4 excluding putative class members' contact information and wage records. As used in this 5 subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries, and any 6 other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material 7 is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing 8 Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) 9 identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed 10 and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts, compilations, 11 summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. 12 Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, 13 motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, 14 deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

1		
2	IT IS SO STIPULAT	ED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.
3		
4	DATED: <u>04/23/12</u>	<u>s/ Suzy E. Lee (per e-mail consent)</u> RAUL PEREZ, Bar No. 174687
5		<u>RPerez@InitiativeLegal.com</u> MELISSA GRANT, Bar No. 205633
6		MGrant@InitiativeLegal.com SUZY E. LEE, Bar No. 271120
7		SUZYLEE@InitiativeLegal.com INITIATIVE LEGAL GROUP APC
8		1800 Century Park East, 2nd Floor Los Angeles, California 90067
9		Telephone: 310.556.5637 Facsimile: 310.861.9051
10		Attorneys for Plaintiffs
11		BRIAN BUTTERWORTH AND MARGO CHUI
12		
13	DATED: <u>04/23/12</u>	<u>s/ Timothy S. Anderson</u> LEE J. HUTTON, Admitted Pro Hac Vice
14		<u>lhutton@littler.com</u> TIMOTHY S. ANDERSON, Admitted Pro Hac Vice
15		tanderson@littler.com LITTLER MENDELSON, P.C.
16		1100 Superior Avenue, 20th Floor Cleveland, OH 44114
17		Telephone: 216.696.7600 Facsimile: 216.696.2038
18		MICHAEL LEGGIERI, Bar No. 253791
19 20		mleggieri@littler.com LITTLER MENDELSON, P.C.
20		500 Capitol Mall, Suite 2000 Sacramento, CA 95814 Talanhanan 016 820 7200
21 22		Telephone: 916.830.7200 Facsimile: 916.561.0828
22		Attorneys for Defendant AE RETAIL WEST
23		
25	Firmwide:110631928.1 054194.1026	
26		
27		
28		

1			
2	<u>ORDER</u>		
3	Good cause appearing, the Court hereby approves this Order in its entirety. The Parties in		
4	this matter shall be bound by the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order.		
5	IT IS SO ORDERED.		
6			
7	DATED: 24 April 2012 /s/ Dennis L. Beck THE HONORABLE DENNIS L. BECK		
8	THE HONORABLE DENNIS L. BECK		
9			
10			
11			
12			
13			
14			
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			
28			

<u>)</u> Il name], of halty of perjury that was issued by the
- ll name], of halty of perjury that
halty of perjury that
• • • •
was issued by the
was issued by the
in the case of
O-DLB. I agree to
er and I understand
punishment in the
any information or
ity except in strict
ourt for the Eastern
otective Order, even
e full name] of
lephone number] as
proceedings related