

1 **GREATER BAKERSFIELD LEGAL ASSISTANCE, INC.**

2 **GBLA Fair Housing Law Project**

3 Mark A. Roy (SBN 255286)
4 mroy@gbla.org • 661-321-3989
5 Erica S. Fessler (SBN 276944)
6 efessler@gbla.org • 661-326-4788
7 615 California Ave.
8 Bakersfield, CA 93304
9 Phone: 661-334-4679
10 Fax: 661-325-4482

11 **BRANCART & BRANCART**

12 Christopher Brancart (SBN 128475)
13 cbrancart@brancart.com
14 Elizabeth Brancart (SBN 122092)
15 ebrancart@brancart.com
16 P.O. Box 686
17 Pescadero, CA 94060
18 Phone: 650-879-0141
19 Fax: 650-879-1103

20 Attorneys for Plaintiffs

21 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
22 **EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

23 LAREN SALISBURY and KIM DOWNEY,

24 Plaintiffs,

25 v.

26 ARTHUR E. HICKMAN, individually and as trustee
27 of the Hickman Family Trust Dated 9-22-90;
28 JAQUELINE D. HICKMAN, individually and as
trustee of the Hickman Family Trust Dated 9-22-90;
JOSEPH TERMINI, dba CHARTER REALTY AND
PROPERTY MANAGEMENT; and UMBERTO
CRIMI,

Defendants.

Case No.: 1:12-cv-01098-LJO-JLT

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER FOR
STANDARD LITIGATION

1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure

1 and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted. Accordingly,
2 the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to enter the following Stipulated Protective
3 Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all
4 disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use
5 extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the
6 applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3, below, that
7 this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information under seal;
8 Civil Local Rules 141, 141.1 and General Order 62 set forth the procedures that must be followed
9 and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material
10 under seal.

11 2. DEFINITIONS

12 2.1 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information or
13 items under this Order.

14 2.2 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is generated,
15 stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of Civil
16 Procedure 26(c).

17 2.3 Counsel (without qualifier): Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as
18 their support staff).

19 2.4 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it
20 produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

21 2.5 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of the medium or
22 manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things, testimony,
23 transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to
24 discovery in this matter.

25 2.6 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to the
26 litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a
27 consultant in this action.
28

1 2.7 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this action. House Counsel
2 does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.

3 2.8 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or other legal entity
4 not named as a Party to this action.

5 2.9 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party to this action but
6 are retained to represent or advise a party to this action and have appeared in this action on behalf of
7 that party or are affiliated with a law firm which has appeared on behalf of that party.

8 2.10 Party: any party to this action, including all of its officers, directors, employees,
9 consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their support staffs).

10 2.11 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or Discovery
11 Material in this action.

12 2.12 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support services (e.g.,
13 photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and organizing,
14 storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and subcontractors.

15 2.13 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as
16 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

17 2.14 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a
18 Producing Party.

19 3. SCOPE

20 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material (as
21 defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected Material; (2) all
22 copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony,
23 conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.
24 However, the protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order do not cover the following
25 information: (a) any information that is in the public domain at the time of disclosure to a Receiving
26 Party or becomes part of the public domain after its disclosure to a Receiving Party as a result of
27 publication not involving a violation of this Order, including becoming part of the public record
28

1 through trial or otherwise; and (b) any information known to the Receiving Party prior to the
2 disclosure or obtained by the Receiving Party after the disclosure from a source who obtained the
3 information lawfully and under no obligation of confidentiality to the Designating Party. Any use of
4 Protected Material at trial shall be governed by a separate agreement or order.

5 4. DURATION

6 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this
7 Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court order
8 otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and
9 defenses in this action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion
10 and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this action, including the
11 time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to applicable law.

12 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

13 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each Party or
14 Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care to
15 limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The
16 Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or
17 oral or written communications that qualify – so that other portions of the material, documents,
18 items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within
19 the ambit of this Order.

20 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are shown
21 to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily
22 encumber or retard the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on
23 other parties) expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

24 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it designated for
25 protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other Parties
26 that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

27
28

1 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this Order (see,
2 e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or
3 Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so designated
4 before the material is disclosed or produced.

5 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

6 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but
7 excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party
8 affix the legend “CONFIDENTIAL” to each page that contains protected material. If only a portion
9 or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly
10 identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

11 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents or materials available for inspection
12 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which material it
13 would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all of the
14 material made available for inspection shall be deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting
15 Party has identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must
16 determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then,
17 before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the “CONFIDENTIAL”
18 legend to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or portions of the material on
19 a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s)
20 (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

21 (b) for testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial or trial proceedings, that the
22 Designating Party identify on the record, before the close of the deposition, hearing, or other
23 proceeding, all protected testimony.

24 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any other
25 tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container or
26 containers in which the information or item is stored the legend “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a
27
28

1 portion or portions of the information or item warrant protection, the Producing Party, to the extent
2 practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

3 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to designate
4 qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party's right to secure
5 protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the
6 Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance
7 with the provisions of this Order.

8 **6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS**

9 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of
10 confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a Designating Party's confidentiality
11 designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic burdens,
12 or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a Party does not waive its right to challenge a
13 confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the original
14 designation is disclosed.

15 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution process by
16 providing written notice of each designation it is challenging and describing the basis for each
17 challenge. To avoid ambiguity as to whether a challenge has been made, the written notice must
18 recite that the challenge to confidentiality is being made in accordance with this specific paragraph
19 of the Protective Order. The parties shall attempt to resolve each challenge in good faith and must
20 begin the process by conferring directly (in voice to voice dialogue; other forms of communication
21 are not sufficient) within 14 days of the date of service of notice. In conferring, the Challenging
22 Party must explain the basis for its belief that the confidentiality designation was not proper and
23 must give the Designating Party an opportunity to review the designated material, to reconsider the
24 circumstances, and, if no change in designation is offered, to explain the basis for the chosen
25 designation. A Challenging Party may proceed to the next stage of the challenge process only if it
26 has engaged in this meet and confer process first or establishes that the Designating Party is
27 unwilling to participate in the meet and confer process in a timely manner.
28

1 6.3 Judicial Intervention. If the Parties cannot resolve a challenge without court intervention,
2 the Designating Party shall file and serve a motion to retain confidentiality under Civil Local Rule
3 251 (and in compliance with Civil Local Rule 141.1 and General Order 164, if applicable) within 21
4 days of the initial notice of challenge or within 14 days of the parties agreeing that the meet and
5 confer process will not resolve their dispute, whichever is earlier. Each such motion must be
6 accompanied by a competent declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the meet and
7 confer requirements imposed in the preceding paragraph. Failure by the Designating Party to make
8 such a motion including the required declaration within 21 days (or 14 days, if applicable) shall
9 automatically waive the confidentiality designation for each challenged designation. In addition, the
10 Challenging Party may file a motion challenging a confidentiality designation at any time if there is
11 good cause for doing so, including a challenge to the designation of a deposition transcript or any
12 portions thereof. Any motion brought pursuant to this provision must be accompanied by a
13 competent declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the meet and confer
14 requirements imposed by the preceding paragraph.

15 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating
16 Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose
17 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions.
18 Unless the Designating Party has waived the confidentiality designation by failing to file a motion to
19 retain confidentiality as described above, all parties shall continue to afford the material in question
20 the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the court
21 rules on the challenge.

22 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

23 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or
24 produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this case only for prosecuting,
25 defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to
26 the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the litigation has
27
28

1 been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL
2 DISPOSITION).

3 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and in a
4 secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

5 7.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered by
6 the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any
7 information or item designated “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

8 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this action, as well as
9 employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the
10 information for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be
11 Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A;

12 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the Receiving
13 Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the
14 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

15 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is
16 reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement
17 to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

18 (d) the court and its personnel;

19 (e) court reporters and their staff, professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors,
20 and Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who
21 have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

22 (f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is reasonably
23 necessary and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A),
24 unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed
25 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material must be separately
26 bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this
27 Stipulated Protective Order.
28

1 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or
2 other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

3 8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER
4 LITIGATION

5 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels
6 disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party
7 must:

8 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a
9 copy of the subpoena or court order;

10 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in
11 the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this
12 Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

13 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the
14 Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

15 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena
16 or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL”
17 before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has
18 obtained the Designating Party’s permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and
19 expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material—and nothing in these
20 provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this action to
21 disobey a lawful directive from another court.

22 9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED IN THIS
23 LITIGATION

24 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in
25 this action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information produced by Non-Parties in
26 connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order.
27 Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional
28 protections.

1 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a
2 Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with
3 the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's confidential information, then the Party shall:

4 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that
5 some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;

6 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective
7 Order in this litigation, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the
8 information requested; and

9 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party.

10 (c) If the Non-Party fails to object or seek a protective order from this court within 14
11 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the
12 Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely
13 seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or
14 control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by
15 the court.¹ Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of
16 seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

17 10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

18 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected
19 Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order,
20 the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized
21 disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c)
22 inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this
23 Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to
24 Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

25
26
27
28 ¹ The purpose of this provision is to alert the interested parties to the existence of confidentiality rights of a
Non-Party and to afford the Non-Party an opportunity to protect its confidentiality interests in this court.

1 11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED
2 MATERIAL

3 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced
4 material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties
5 are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to
6 modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production
7 without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the
8 parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or information covered by
9 the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement
10 in the stipulated protective order submitted to the court.

11 12. MISCELLANEOUS

12 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek
13 its modification by the court in the future.

14 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order
15 no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any
16 information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no
17 Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by
18 this Protective Order.

19 12.3 Filing Protected Material. Without written permission from the Designating Party or
20 a court order secured after appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Party may not file in the
21 public record in this action any Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any
22 Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rules 141, 141.1 and General Order 164.
23 Protected Material may only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of
24 the specific Protected Material at issue. Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 79-5 and General Order 62, a
25 sealing order will issue only upon a request establishing that the Protected Material at issue is
26 privileged, protectable as a trade secret, or otherwise entitled to protection under the law. If a
27 Receiving Party's request to file Protected Material under seal pursuant to Civil Local Rules 141,
28

1 141.1 (e) and General Order 164 is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the
2 information in the public record pursuant to Civil Local Rule 141(e)(1) unless otherwise instructed
3 by the court.

4 13. FINAL DISPOSITION

5 Within 60 days after the final disposition of this action, as defined in paragraph 4, each
6 Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material.
7 As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations,
8 summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether
9 the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written
10 certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party)
11 by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material
12 that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies,
13 abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected
14 Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an archival copy of all
15 pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda,
16 correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant
17 and expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival
18 copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set
19 forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

20 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

21 Dated: November 5, 2012

22
23 /s/ Mark A. Roy
24 Mark A. Roy, Attorney for Plaintiffs
25 GREATER BAKERSFIELD LEGAL ASSISTANCE, INC.

26 /s/ Christopher Brancart (as authorized on 11/5/12)
27 Christopher Brancart, Attorney for Plaintiffs
28 BRANCART & BRANCART

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

/s/ Anthony N. DeMaria (as authorized on 11/1/12)
Anthony N. DeMaria, Attorney for Defendants
MCCORMICK, BARSTOW, SHEPPARD, WAYTE &
CARRUTH, LLP

/s/ James J. Braze (as authorized on 11/1/12)
James J. Braze, Attorney for Defendants
BORTON PETRINI, LLP

ORDER

Based upon the stipulation of the parties and good cause appearing, the Court **GRANTS**
the stipulated protective order.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: November 5, 2012

/s/ Jennifer L. Thurston
UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

EXHIBIT A
ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, _____ [full name], of _____
[full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the
Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for the Eastern
District of California on _____ [date] in the case of *Salisbury, et al. v. Hickman, et*
al. (Case No. 1:12-cv-01098-LJO-JLT). I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of
this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could
expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not
disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to
any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the Eastern
District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order, even
if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action.

I hereby appoint _____ [full name] of _____
[full address and telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with
this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

Date: _____
City and State where sworn and signed: _____
Printed name: _____
Signature: _____