

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

James D. Weakley, Esq. Bar No. 082853
Jim@walaw-fresno.com
James J. Arendt, Esq. Bar No. 142937
James@walaw-fresno.com

WEAKLEY & ARENDT, LLP
1630 EAST SHAW AVE., SUITE 176
FRESNO, CALIFORNIA 93710
TELEPHONE: (559) 221-5256
FACSIMILE: (559) 221-5262

Attorneys for Defendant, COUNTY OF FRESNO, MARGARET MIMS, TOM GATTIE, RICK HILL, LUE HER, KONG YANG, BRANDON CASTRO, EDWARD MORENO, GEORGE LAIRD AND PRATAP NARAYAN

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

RICHARD PHILLIPS, in his capacity as the) CASE NO. 1:13-cv-00538 AWI BAM
administrator of the ESTATE OF TROY)
PHILLIPS; TIFFANY PHILLIPS,)

Plaintiffs,)

vs.)

**STIPULATION FOR
PROTECTIVE ORDER AND
ORDER THEREON**

COUNTY OF FRESNO; MARGARET MIMS;)
CORRECTIONAL OFFICER L. HERR #9899,)
CORRECTIONAL OFFICER CASTRO;)
JOHN DOE AND RICHARD ROE,)
individually and in their official capacities as)
correctional and classification officers of the)
Fresno County Sheriff's Department;)
EDWARD MORENO, M.D.; GEORGE)
LAIRD; PRATAP NARAYAN; NANCY POE)
and CARL COE, individually and in their)
official capacities as health care workers in the)
Fresno County jail system, and DOES 1-50,)

Complaint Filed: 04/15/13

Defendants.)
_____)

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER¹

1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information under seal. Local Rule 141 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

2. DEFINITIONS

2.1 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information or items under this Order.

2.2 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c).

2.3 Counsel (without qualifier): Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their support staff).

///
///
///

¹ This document is based on the model protective order for standard litigation promulgated by the Northern District of California. It has been modified only to omit or replace references to that district and its local rules.

1 2.4 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or
2 items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as:

3 **CONFIDENTIAL MATERIAL SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER**
4 **Richard Phillips v. County of Fresno**

5
6 2.5 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of
7 the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including,
8 among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or
9 generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

10 2.6 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter
11 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an
12 expert witness or as a consultant in this action.

13 2.7 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this action.
14 House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside
15 counsel.

16 2.8 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or
17 other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

18 2.9 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party
19 to this action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this action and have
20 appeared in this action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which
21 has appeared on behalf of that party.

22 2.10 Party: any party to this action, including all of its officers, directors,
23 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their
24 support staffs).

25 2.11 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
26 Discovery Material in this action.

27 2.12 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support
28 services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or

1 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)
2 and their employees and subcontractors.

3 2.13 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
4 designated as “Confidential Material.”

5 2.14 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material
6 from a Producing Party.

7 3. SCOPE

8 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only
9 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted
10 from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of
11 Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties
12 or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material. However, the protections
13 conferred by this Stipulation and Order do not cover the following information: (a)
14 any information that is in the public domain at the time of disclosure to a Receiving
15 Party or becomes part of the public domain after its disclosure to a Receiving Party as
16 a result of publication not involving a violation of this Order, including becoming part
17 of the public record through trial or otherwise; and (b) any information known to the
18 Receiving Party prior to the disclosure or obtained by the Receiving Party after the
19 disclosure from a source who obtained the information lawfully and under no
20 obligation of confidentiality to the Designating Party. Any use of Protected Material at
21 trial shall be governed by a separate agreement or order.

22 4. DURATION

23 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations
24 imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees
25 otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be
26 deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this action, with or
27 without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and exhaustion
28 of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this action, including the time

1 limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to
2 applicable law.

3 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

4 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.

5 Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this
6 Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies
7 under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for protection
8 only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written communications that
9 qualify – so that other portions of the material, documents, items, or communications
10 for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of
11 this Order.

12 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations
13 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper
14 purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber or retard the case development process or to
15 impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) expose the Designating
16 Party to sanctions.

17 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it
18 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must
19 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

20 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in
21 this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise
22 stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection
23 under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or
24 produced.

25 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

26 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic
27 documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial
28 proceedings), that the Producing Party affix the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" pursuant

1 to section 2.4 above, to each page that contains protected material. If only a portion or
2 portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also
3 must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in
4 the margins).

5 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents or materials available for
6 inspection need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has
7 indicated which material it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and
8 before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be
9 deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting Party has identified the documents
10 it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents,
11 or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing the
12 specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the “CONFIDENTIAL” legend
13 to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or portions of the
14 material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly
15 identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the
16 margins).

17 (b) for testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial or trial proceedings,
18 that the Designating Party identify on the record, before the close of the deposition,
19 hearing, or other proceeding, all protected testimony.

20 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for
21 any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the
22 exterior of the container or containers in which the information or item is stored the
23 legend “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information or item
24 warrant protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the
25 protected portion(s).

26 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent
27 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the
28 Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such material.

1 Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable
2 efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this
3 Order.

4 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

5 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a
6 designation of confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a Designating
7 Party's confidentiality designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial
8 unfairness, unnecessary economic burdens, or a significant disruption or delay of the
9 litigation, a Party does not waive its right to challenge a confidentiality designation by
10 electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the original designation is disclosed.

11 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution
12 process by providing written notice of each designation it is challenging and
13 describing the basis for each challenge. To avoid ambiguity as to whether a challenge
14 has been made, the written notice must recite that the challenge to confidentiality is
15 being made in accordance with this specific paragraph of the Protective Order. The
16 parties shall attempt to resolve each challenge in good faith and must begin the
17 process by conferring directly (in voice to voice dialogue; other forms of
18 communication are not sufficient) within 14 days of the date of service of notice. In
19 conferring, the Challenging Party must explain the basis for its belief that the
20 confidentiality designation was not proper and must give the Designating Party an
21 opportunity to review the designated material, to reconsider the circumstances, and, if
22 no change in designation is offered, to explain the basis for the chosen designation. A
23 Challenging Party may proceed to the next stage of the challenge process only if it has
24 engaged in this meet and confer process first or establishes that the Designating Party
25 is unwilling to participate in the meet and confer process in a timely manner.

26 6.3 Judicial Intervention. If the Parties cannot resolve a challenge without court
27 intervention, the Designating Party shall file and serve a motion to retain
28 confidentiality within 21 days of the initial notice of challenge or within 14 days of

1 the parties agreeing that the meet and confer process will not resolve their dispute,
2 whichever is earlier. Each such motion must be accompanied by a competent
3 declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the meet and confer
4 requirements imposed in the preceding paragraph. Failure by the Designating Party to
5 make such a motion including the required declaration within 21 days (or 14 days, if
6 applicable) shall automatically waive the confidentiality designation for each
7 challenged designation. In addition, the Challenging Party may file a motion
8 challenging a confidentiality designation at any time if there is good cause for doing
9 so, including a challenge to the designation of a deposition transcript or any portions
10 thereof. Any motion brought pursuant to this provision must be accompanied by a
11 competent declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the meet and
12 confer requirements imposed by the preceding paragraph.

13 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the
14 Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose
15 (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may
16 expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived
17 the confidentiality designation by failing to file a motion to retain confidentiality as
18 described above, all parties shall continue to afford the material in question the level
19 of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the
20 court rules on the challenge.

21 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

22 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
23 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this case
24 only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Such Protected
25 Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions
26 described in this Order. When the litigation has been terminated, a Receiving Party
27 must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

28 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a

1 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons
2 authorized under this Order.

3 7.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless
4 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a
5 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated “CONFIDENTIAL”
6 only to:

7 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this action, as well
8 as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to
9 disclose the information for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment
10 and Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A;

11 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the
12 Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and
13 who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

14 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom
15 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the
16 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

17 (d) the court and its personnel;

18 (e) court reporters and their staff, professional jury or trial consultants,
19 mock jurors, and Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary
20 for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be
21 Bound” (Exhibit A);

22 (f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is
23 reasonably necessary and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to
24 Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered
25 by the court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that
26 reveal Protected Material must be separately bound by the court reporter and may not
27 be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order.

28 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a

1 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

2 8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN
3 OTHER LITIGATION

4 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation
5 that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as
6 “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

7 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall
8 include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

9 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to
10 issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or
11 order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this
12 Stipulated Protective Order; and

13 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued
14 by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

15 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with
16 the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this
17 action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the
18 subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s
19 permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking
20 protection in that court of its confidential material – and nothing in these provisions
21 should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this action to
22 disobey a lawful directive from another court.

23 9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED
24 IN THIS LITIGATION

25 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a
26 Non-Party in this action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information
27 produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the
28 remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be

1 construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

2 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to
3 produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is
4 subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's
5 confidential information, then the Party shall:

6 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party
7 that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement
8 with a Non-Party;

9 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated
10 Protective Order in this litigation, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably
11 specific description of the information requested; and

12 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-
13 Party.

14 (c) If the Non-Party fails to object or seek a protective order from this court
15 within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving
16 Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the
17 discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving
18 Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to
19 the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court.
20 Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense
21 of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

22 10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

23 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed
24 Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this
25 Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in
26 writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts
27 to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or
28 persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order,

1 and (d) request such person or persons to execute the “Acknowledgment and
2 Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

3 11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE
4 PROTECTED MATERIAL

5 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain
6 inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection,
7 the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil
8 Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure
9 may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior
10 privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the
11 parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or
12 information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the
13 parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted to
14 the court.

15 12. MISCELLANEOUS

16 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any
17 person to seek its modification by the court in the future.

18 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this
19 Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to
20 disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this
21 Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any
22 ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

23 12.3 Filing Protected Material. Without written permission from the
24 Designating Party or a court order secured after appropriate notice to all interested
25 persons, a Party may not file in the public record in this action any Protected Material.
26 A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected Material must comply with Local
27 Rule 141. Protected Material may only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order
28 authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at issue. A sealing order will

1 issue only upon a request establishing that the Protected Material at issue is
2 privileged, protectable as a trade secret, or otherwise entitled to protection under the
3 law. If a Receiving Party's request to file Protected Material under seal is denied by
4 the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in the public record unless
5 otherwise instructed by the court.

6 13. FINAL DISPOSITION

7 Within 60 days after the final disposition of this action, as defined in paragraph
8 4, each Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or
9 destroy such material. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes
10 all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or
11 capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or
12 destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing
13 Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day
14 deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material
15 that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not
16 retained any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format
17 reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this
18 provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion
19 papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence,
20 deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and
21 expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such
22 archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this
23 Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

24
25 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

26 DATED: December 9, 2014 LAW OFFICES OF ANTHONY BOSKOVICH

27 By: /s/ Anthony Boskovich
28 Anthony Boskovich,
Attorneys for Plaintiff

1 EXHIBIT A

2 ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

3 I, _____ [print or type full name], of
4 _____ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that
5 I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was
6 issued by the United States District Court for the Eastern District of California on
7 [date] in the case of *Richard Phillips, et. al. v. County of Fresno, et. al.*, United States
8 District Court Case No.: 1:13-cv-00538-AWI-BAM. I agree to comply with and to be
9 bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and
10 acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment
11 in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner
12 any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any
13 person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

14 I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the
15 Eastern District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated
16 Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this
17 action.

18 I hereby appoint _____ [print or type full name] of
19 _____ [print or type full address and
20 telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with
21 this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective
22 Order.

23 Date: _____

24 City and State where sworn and signed: _____

25 Printed name: _____

26 Signature: _____

27

28