1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

STEVEN R. EDWARDS,

Plaintiff,

v.

A. DESFOSSES, et al.,

Defendants.

Case No. 1:13-cv-01013-SAB-PC

ORDER DENYING PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR FURTHER DISCLOSURE

(ECF NO. 54)

On January 15, 2016, Plaintiff filed a motion titled as a "motion seeking full disclosure of Dr. Ugwueze, name, background, disciplinary history with inmates, medical board, sues [sic] and judgements [sic] render [sic] against him or her." On January 27, 2015, Defendants filed opposition to the motion. (ECF No. 60.)

On January 4, 2016, Plaintiff received the disclosure of expert witnesses from defense counsel. Plaintiff contends that he was not allowed to obtain the full name of the expert, as well as other information Plaintiff needs to prepare for trial. Plaintiff seeks disclosure of the expert's background, grievances filed against expert by other inmates, and the history of any lawsuits filed against the expert by other inmates. Plaintiff's motion implies that Defendants have failed to comply with the disclosure requirements of Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(a)(2)(B).

1 Defendants support their opposition with Exhibit A, the expert disclosure served on 2 Plaintiff. Defendants disclosed to Plaintiff that they have designated Dr. Ugwueze as an 3 unretained expert from whom they may elicit expert medical opinion. (Ex. A.) Defendants 4 further provided that Dr. Ugwueze is the Chief Medical Executive at California Substance Abuse Treatment Facility at Corcoran (SATF). (Id.) Defendants provided a summary of facts and 5 opinions to which Dr. Ugwueze is expected to testify. (Id.) Federal Rule 26(a)(2)(B) provides 6 7 that a written report must be provided which includes "a complete statement of all opinions the 8 witness will express and the basis and reasons for them, the facts or data that will be used to 9 summarize or support them, any exhibits that will be used to summarize or support them, the witness's qualifications, including a list of all publications authored in the previous 10 years, a 10 11 list of all other cases in the last 4 years that the witnessed testified in as an expert, and a 12 statement of compensation to be paid." However, Rule 26(a)(2)(B) specifically excludes 13 unretained experts.

As stated in Defendants' disclosure of expert witnesses, Dr. Ugwueze is an unretained expert. The disclosure also provides that Dr. Ugwueze is employed as the Chief Medical Executive at SATF. As indicated by his address of record, Plaintiff is presently incarcerated at SATF, and should know that SATF is a California state prison and that Dr. Ugwueze is employed by the CDCR. As an unretained expert, Dr. Ugwueze is specifically exempt from providing a written report with his disclosure.

Defendants correctly argue that they have complied with the requirement of Rule 21 26(a)(2)(C), entitled "Witnesses Who Do Not Provide a Written Report." Specifically, 22 Defendants stated the subject matter on which the witness is expected to present evidence and 23 provided a summary of the facts and opinions to which the witness is expected to testify. (Ex. 24 A.) That is all Defendants were required to do.

Defendants' argue that Plaintiff seeks information that is objectionable. Specifically, Plaintiff seeks "disciplinary history with inmates, and medical board, as well as sues [sic] and judgements [sic] render [sic] against him or her." (ECF No. 54 at 3.) Rule 26 does not require such disclosures. Defendants correctly argue that these requests seek impermissible character

2

1	evidence, are irrelevant, and are not likely to lead to admissible evidence. Defendants correctly
2	argue that Plaintiff's request for the doctor's disciplinary history as it related to other inmates
3	would also violate the inmates' right to privacy and confidentiality.
4	For the above reasons, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Plaintiff's motion for further
5	disclosure regarding Defendants' medical expert is DENIED.
6	
7	IT IS SO ORDERED.
8	Dated: January 29, 2016 UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE
9	UNITED STATES WAOD TRATE JODGE
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
	3