

Eric P. Oren, #106129
LAW OFFICES OF ERIC P. OREN, INC.
225 West Shaw Avenue, Suite 105
Fresno, California 93704
Telephone: 559.224.5900
Facsimile: 559.224.5905
epo@ericorenlaw.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff CHRISTIANA BORBOA

Jason S. Mills
Rebecca Licht Jensen
MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP
300 South Grand Avenue, Twenty-Second Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90071-3132
Tel: 213.612.2500
Fax: 213.612.2501

Maureen McLoughlin, pro hac vice
DAVIS & GILBERT LLP
1740 Broadway
New York, New York 10019
Tel: 212.468.4800
Fax: 212.468.4888
mmcloughlin@dglaw.com

Attorneys for Defendant MARKETSTAR
CORPORATION

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

CHRISTIANA BORBOA, an individual residing in California,

Case No.:1:13-CV-01249-AWI-GSA

Plaintiff,

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER

VS.

MARKETSTAR CORPORATION, and Does 1 through 50, inclusive.

Defendants.

23

24

25

26

27

1 1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

2 Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve production of
3 confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public
4 disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted.
5 Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to enter the following Stipulated
6 Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on
7 all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure
8 and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment
9 under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section
10 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential
11 information under seal; the Eastern District of California's Local Rules, including Local Rule 141
12 set forth the procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party
13 seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

14 2. DEFINITIONS

15 2.1 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of
16 information or items under this Order.

17 2.2 "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is
18 generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule
19 of Civil Procedure 26(c).

20 2.3 Counsel (without qualifier): Outside Counsel of Record (as well as their support
21 staff).

22 2.4 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that
23 it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as "CONFIDENTIAL."

24 2.5 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of the
25 medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things,
26 testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or
27 responses to discovery in this matter.

1 2.6 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to
2 the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a
3 consultant in this action.

4 2.7 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or other legal
5 entity not named as a Party to this action.

6 2.8 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party to this
7 action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this action and have appeared in this action
8 on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which has appeared on behalf of that party.

9 2.9 Party: any party to this action, including all of its officers, directors, employees,
10 consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their support staffs).

11 2.10 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or Discovery
12 Material in this action.

13 2.11 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support services
14 (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and
15 organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and
16 subcontractors.

17 2.12 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as
18 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

19 2.13 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a
20 Producing Party.

21 3. SCOPE

22 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material
23 (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected Material; (2)
24 all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony,
25 conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.
26 However, the protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order do not cover the following
27 information: (a) any information that is in the public domain at the time of disclosure to a
28 Receiving Party or becomes part of the public domain after its disclosure to a Receiving Party as

1 a result of publication not involving a violation of this Order, including becoming part of the
2 public record through trial or otherwise; and (b) any information known to the Receiving Party
3 prior to the disclosure or obtained by the Receiving Party after the disclosure from a source who
4 obtained the information lawfully and under no obligation of confidentiality to the Designating
5 Party. Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by a separate agreement or order.

6 4. **DURATION**

7 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by
8 this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court
9 order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all
10 claims and defenses in this action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after
11 the completion and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this action,
12 including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to
13 applicable law.

14 5. **DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL**

15 5.1 **Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.** Each Party
16 or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care
17 to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards.
18 The Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents,
19 items, or oral or written communications that qualify – so that other portions of the material,
20 documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept
21 unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

22 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are
23 shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to
24 unnecessarily encumber or retard the case development process or to impose unnecessary
25 expenses and burdens on other parties) expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

1 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it designated
2 for protection do not qualify for protection, the Designating Party must promptly notify all other
3 Parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

4 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this Order
5 (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered,
6 Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so
7 designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

8 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

9 (a) For information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but
10 excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing
11 Party affix the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" to each page that contains protected material. If only
12 a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also
13 must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the
14 margins).

15 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents or materials available for inspection
16 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which
17 material it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all
18 of the material made available for inspection shall be deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the
19 inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party
20 must determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order.
21 Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the
22 "CONFIDENTIAL" legend to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or
23 portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly
24 identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

25 (b) For testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial or trial proceedings, that
26 the Designating Party identify on the record, before the close of the deposition, hearing, or other
27 proceeding, all protected testimony.

28 (c) For information produced in some form other than documentary and for any

1 other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the
2 container or containers in which the information or item is stored the legend “CONFIDENTIAL.”
3 If only a portion or portions of the information or item warrant protection, the Producing Party, to
4 the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

5 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to
6 designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party’s
7 right to secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a
8 designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is
9 treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

10 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

11 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of
12 confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a Designating Party’s confidentiality
13 designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic
14 burdens, or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a Party does not waive its right to
15 challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the
16 original designation is disclosed.

17 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution
18 process by providing written notice of each designation it is challenging and describing the basis
19 for each challenge. To avoid ambiguity as to whether a challenge has been made, the written
20 notice must recite that the challenge to confidentiality is being made in accordance with this
21 specific paragraph of the Protective Order. The parties shall attempt to resolve each challenge in
22 good faith and must begin the process by conferring directly (in voice to voice dialogue; other
23 forms of communication are not sufficient) within 14 days of the date of service of notice. In
24 conferring, the Challenging Party must explain the basis for its belief that the confidentiality
25 designation was not proper and must give the Designating Party an opportunity to review the
26 designated material, to reconsider the circumstances, and, if no change in designation is offered,
27 to explain the basis for the chosen designation. A Challenging Party may proceed to the next
28

1 stage of the challenge process only if it has engaged in this meet and confer process first or
2 establishes that the Designating Party is unwilling to participate in the meet and confer process in
3 a timely manner.

4 6.3 Judicial Intervention. If the Parties cannot resolve a challenge without court
5 intervention, the Designating Party shall file and serve a motion to retain confidentiality within 21
6 days of the initial notice of challenge or within 14 days of the parties agreeing that the meet and
7 confer process will not resolve their dispute, whichever is earlier. Each such motion must be
8 accompanied by a competent declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the meet
9 and confer requirements imposed in the preceding paragraph. Failure by the Designating Party to
10 make such a motion including the required declaration within 21 days (or 14 days, if applicable)
11 shall automatically waive the confidentiality designation for each challenged designation. In
12 addition, the Challenging Party may file a motion challenging a confidentiality designation at any
13 time if there is good cause for doing so, including a challenge to the designation of a deposition
14 transcript or any portions thereof. Any motion brought pursuant to this provision must be
15 accompanied by a competent declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the meet
16 and confer requirements imposed by the preceding paragraph.

17 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating
18 Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose
19 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to
20 sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived the confidentiality designation by failing to
21 file a motion to retain confidentiality as described above, all parties shall continue to afford the
22 material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's
23 designation until the court rules on the challenge.

24 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

25 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed
26 or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this case only for prosecuting,
27 defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only
28

1 to the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the litigation
2 has been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below
3 (FINAL DISPOSITION).

4 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and
5 in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

6 7.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless otherwise
7 ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may
8 disclose any information or item designated “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

9 (a) The Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this action, as well as
10 employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the
11 information for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be
12 Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A;

13 (b) The officers, directors, and employees of the Receiving Party to whom
14 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment
15 and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

16 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is
17 reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and
18 Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

19 (d) The court and its personnel;

20 (e) Court reporters and their staff, professional jury or trial consultants, mock
21 jurors, and Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation
22 and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

23 (f) During their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is
24 reasonably necessary and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound”
25 (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of
26 transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material must be
27 separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted
28 under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

(g) The author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION

If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as "CONFIDENTIAL," that Party must:

(a) Promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

(b) Promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

(c) Cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material – and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

9. A NON-PARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION

(a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in this action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking

1 additional protections.

2 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to
3 produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an
4 agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's confidential information, then the
5 Party shall:

6 (1) Promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party
7 that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-
8 Party;

9 (2) Promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated
10 Protective Order in this litigation, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific
11 description of the information requested; and

12 (3) Make the information requested available for inspection by the
13 Non-Party.

14 (c) If the Non-Party fails to object or seek a protective order from this court
15 within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may
16 produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the
17 Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information
18 in its possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party
19 before a determination by the court.¹ Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall
20 bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

21 10. **UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

22 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected
23 Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective
24 Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the
25 unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the

27 ¹ The purpose of this provision is to alert the interested parties to the existence of confidentiality
28 rights of a Non-Party and to afford the Non-Party an opportunity to protect its confidentiality
interests in this court.

1 Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were
2 made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the
3 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

4 11. **INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED**
5 **MATERIAL**

6 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently
7 produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the
8 Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This
9 provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery
10 order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of
11 Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a
12 communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product
13 protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order
14 submitted to the court.

15 12. **MISCELLANEOUS**

16 12.1 **Right to Further Relief.** Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to
17 seek its modification by the court in the future.

18 12.2 **Right to Assert Other Objections.** By stipulating to the entry of this Protective
19 Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any
20 information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly,
21 no Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material
22 covered by this Protective Order.

23 12.3 **Filing Protected Material.** Without written permission from the Designating Party
24 or a court order secured after appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Party may not file in
25 the public record in this action any Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any
26 Protected Material must comply with the Eastern District of California’s Local Rules.

27 ///

28 ///

1 13. FINAL DISPOSITION

2 Within 60 days after the final disposition of this action, as defined in paragraph 4, each
3 Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such
4 material. As used in this subdivision, “all Protected Material” includes all copies, abstracts,
5 compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected
6 Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must
7 submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the
8 Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all
9 the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has
10 not retained any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or
11 capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to
12 retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts,
13 legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work
14 product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected
15 Material. Any such archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to
16 this Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

17 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

18 Respectfully submitted,

20 Eric P. Oren,
21 LAW OFFICES OF ERIC P OREN
22 Attorney for Plaintiff Christiana Borboa

19 Respectfully submitted,

22 Jason S. Mills
23 Rebecca Licht Jensen
24 MORGAN LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP

25 Maureen McLoughlin
26 DAVIS & GILBERT LLP

27 Attorneys for Defendant Marketstar
28 Corporation

EXHIBIT A

ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

3 I, _____ [print or type full name], of
4 _____ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read
5 in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States
6 District Court for the Eastern District of California on [date] in the case of *Borboa v. Marketstar*
7 *Corporation*, Case No. 1:13-CV-01249 (AWI) (GSA). I agree to comply with and to be bound by
8 all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to
9 so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly
10 promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this
11 Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions
12 of this Order.

13 I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for
14 the Eastern District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated
15 Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action.

16 I hereby appoint _____ [print or type full name] of
17 _____ [print or type full address and telephone
18 number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with this action or any
19 proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

21 Date: _____

22 City and State where sworn and signed: _____

23 Printed name: _____
24 [printed name]

25 Signature: _____
_____ [signature]

25 //

28 //

ORDER

The Court adopts the parties' stipulated protective order as set forth above and filed as Doc. 10 on the Court's docket (signed copy).

6 || IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: October 9, 2013

/s/ Gary S. Austin
UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE