

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
9 EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
10

11 DONOVAN L. HALEY,

12 Plaintiff,

13 vs.

14 L. COLLUM, et al.,

15 Defendants.
16
17
18

1:14-cv-00233-LJO-GSA-PC

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS
TO DISMISS CASE FOR FAILURE TO
OBEY COURT ORDER
(Doc. 3.)

OBJECTIONS, IF ANY, DUE IN THIRTY
DAYS

19 On February 27, 2014, the Court issued an order requiring Plaintiff to submit an
20 application to proceed in forma pauperis or pay the filing fee for this action, within forty-five
21 days. (Doc. 3.) The forty-five day period has now expired, and Plaintiff has not paid the filing
22 fee, submitted an application, or otherwise responded to the Court's order.

23 In determining whether to dismiss this action for failure to comply with the directives
24 set forth in its order, "the Court must weigh the following factors: (1) the public's interest in
25 expeditious resolution of litigation; (2) the court's need to manage its docket; (3) the risk of
26 prejudice to defendants/respondents; (4) the availability of less drastic alternatives; and (5) the
27 public policy favoring disposition of cases on their merits." Pagtalunan v. Galaza, 291 F.3d
28 639, 642 (9th Cir. 2002) (citing Ferdik v. Bonzelet, 963 F.2d 1258, 1260-61 (9th Cir. 1992)).

1 “The public’s interest in expeditious resolution of litigation always favors dismissal,”
2 id. (quoting Yourish v. California Amplifier, 191 F.3d 983, 990 (9th Cir. 1999)), and here, the
3 action has been pending since February 21, 2014. Plaintiff’s failure to respond to the Court’s
4 order may reflect Plaintiff’s disinterest in prosecuting this case. In such an instance, the Court
5 cannot continue to expend its scarce resources assisting a litigant who will not help himself by
6 resolving the payment of the filing fee for his lawsuit. Thus, both the first and second factors
7 weigh in favor of dismissal.

8 Turning to the risk of prejudice, “pendency of a lawsuit is not sufficiently prejudicial in
9 and of itself to warrant dismissal.” Id. (citing Yourish at 991). However, “delay inherently
10 increases the risk that witnesses’ memories will fade and evidence will become stale,” id., and it
11 is Plaintiff’s failure to pay or otherwise resolve the filing fee for his lawsuit that is causing
12 delay. Therefore, the third factor weighs in favor of dismissal.

13 As for the availability of lesser sanctions, at this stage in the proceedings there is little
14 available to the Court which would constitute a satisfactory lesser sanction while protecting the
15 Court from further unnecessary expenditure of its scarce resources. Plaintiff has not paid the
16 filing fee for this action, indicating that he may be indigent, which would make monetary
17 sanctions of little use, and given the early stage of these proceedings, the preclusion of
18 evidence or witnesses is not available. However, inasmuch as the dismissal being considered in
19 this case is without prejudice, the Court is stopping short of issuing the harshest possible
20 sanction of dismissal with prejudice.

21 Finally, because public policy favors disposition on the merits, this factor will always
22 weigh against dismissal. Id. at 643.

23 Accordingly, the Court **HEREBY RECOMMENDS** that this action be dismissed based
24 on plaintiff’s failure to obey the Court’s order of February 27, 2014. These findings and
25 recommendations are submitted to the United States District Judge assigned to the case,
26 pursuant to the provisions of Title 28 U.S.C. § 636(b)(1). Within thirty days after being served
27 with these findings and recommendations, Plaintiff may file written objections with the court.
28 Such a document should be captioned "Objections to Magistrate Judge's Findings and

1 Recommendations." Plaintiff is advised that failure to file objections within the specified time
2 may waive the right to appeal the District Court's order. Martinez v. Ylst, 951 F.2d 1153 (9th
3 Cir. 1991).

4
5 IT IS SO ORDERED.

6 Dated: May 8, 2014

/s/ Gary S. Austin
7 UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28