1			
2			
3			
4			
5			
6			
7			
8	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT		
9	FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA		
10			
11	DAKOTA MEDICAL, INC., individually, and on behalf of all others similarly	No. 1:14-cv-02081-DAD-BAM	
12	situated,		
13	Plaintiff,	ORDER GRANTING PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR APPROVAL OF ADDITIONAL CLASS	
14	v.	DISTRIBUTIONS	
15	REHABCARE GROUP, INC., et al.,	(Doc. No. 224)	
16	Defendants.		
17			
18	This matter is before the court on plai	ntiff Dakota Medical, Inc.'s motion for approval of	
19	additional class distributions. (Doc. No. 224.) Defendants RehabCare Group, Inc. and Cannon &	
20	Associates, LLC each filed statements of non	-opposition to the motion. (Doc. Nos. 225, 226.) A	
21	hearing on the motion was held on December	17, 2019. Attorneys Charles Darryl Cordero and	
22	Donald R. Fischbach appeared telephonically	on behalf of plaintiff and the class, and attorneys	
23	David L. Jordan and Oliver W. Wanger appea	ared telephonically on behalf of defendants. Having	
24	considered the motion, the declarations of Kenneth Jue dated November 19, 2019 and December		
25	19, 2019, defendants' non-oppositions, and th	ne argument of counsel, the court will grant	
26	plaintiff's motion for approval of additional class distributions.		
27	On September 21, 2017, the court granted final approval of the class action settlement,		
28	awarded attorneys' fees and incentive payments, and directed distribution of the settlement.		
		1	

1	(Doc. No. 189.) Pursuant to the terms of the settlement agreement, the settlement administrator			
2	KCC distributed settlement checks in the total sum of \$6,739,088.97 to 12,294 class members.			
3	(Doc. No. 215-2 at ¶ 3.) This distribution occurred in two parts: Distribution 1A (\$2,256,563.68)			
4	consisted of 4,823 checks payable to class members that were entitled to receive less than \$600			
5	based on the settlement formula, and to class members that were entitled to receive \$600 or more			
6	and had provided valid taxpayer identification numbers ("TINs"). (Id.) Distribution 1B			
7	(\$4,482,525.29) consisted of 7,471 checks payable to class members that were entitled to receive			
8	\$600 or more but had not provided valid TINs. (Id.) In accordance with the final approval order,			
9	these class members were mailed checks in the amount of \$599.99, as well as a notice informing			
10	them that their payments were limited because KCC did not receive a valid TIN from them. ¹ (<i>Id.</i>)			
11	KCC reserved the balance of funds due to these members for payments in subsequent years. (Id.			
12	at ¶ 6.)			
13	After Distributions 1A and 1B were completed, 1,160 class members provided valid TINs			
14	to KCC. (<i>Id.</i> at \P 4.) Accordingly, on December 29, 2017, KCC issued an additional 1,160			
15	checks totaling \$1,538,800.29 to these class members, representing the balance of their payments.			
16	(Id.) KCC identifies this distribution as Distribution 2A. (Id.)			
17	The settlement agreement afforded class members 120 days from the check date in which			
18	to negotiate their settlement checks. (Doc. No. 171 at ¶ 11.A.) From Distributions 1A, 1B, and			
19	2A, a total of 2,060 checks remained uncashed in the cumulative amount of \$1,004,797.29. (Doc.			
20	No. 221 at \P 4.) Under the settlement agreement:			
21	If any portion of the Members' Payment Amount remains after			
22	initial distribution to Settlement Class Members, including but not limited to amounts represented by Uncashed Checks and checks			
23	returned as undeliverable by the United States Postal Service, the Settlement Administrator shall make a further distribution to			
24	Settlement Class Members that timely negotiated checks in the initial distribution, unless the amounts involved are too small to			
25	make individual distribution economically viable.			
26	¹ Plaintiff previously represented to the court that \$600 is the threshold that triggers certain reporting requirements with the Internal Revenue Service ("IRS"). (Doc. No. 184 at 3.) In its			
27	order granting final approval of the settlement, the court authorized KCC to pay class members who fail to provide valid TIN information annual installments of less than \$600 each. (Doc. No.			
28	189 at 11.)			
	2			

- 1
- (Doc. No. 171 at 14.)

2	On August 3, 2018, plaintiff moved for approval of additional class distributions because
3	a redistribution was economically viable. (Doc. No. 215-1 at 4.) On September 20, 2018, the
4	court approved plaintiff's motion and ordered the settlement administrator to distribute
5	\$3,786,536.89 to 6,311 class members that had failed to provide valid TINs, with the amount per
6	member not exceeding \$599.99, and \$1,004,797.29 to class members that had cashed checks in
7	the initial distribution or in either Distribution 1B or 2A. (Doc. No. 222 at 3–4.) The court also
8	ordered that KCC take additional measures to obtain valid TINs and include a notice and form
9	with each \$599.99 check for members to complete and provide a valid TIN. (Id. at 4.)
10	On May 15, 2019, plaintiff filed a status report regarding the additional (series 3)
11	distributions made pursuant to the court's September 20, 2018 order. (Doc. No. 223.) On
12	October 22, 2018, KCC distributed \$3,875,576.34 to some 11,542 class members in two parts.
13	(Doc. No. 224-1 at 2.) In Distribution 3A, \$423,833.87 in funds from uncashed checks in the
14	series 1 distributions were redistributed to 5,791 class members. (Id.) In Distribution 3B,
15	\$3,451,742.47 were distributed to 5,751 class members that were entitled to receive \$600 or more
16	but that had not provided valid TINs and were, accordingly, issued checks in the amount of
17	\$599.99. (Id. at 2–3.) KCC declared that 15% of all checks issued in Distributions 3A and 3B
18	were not cashed (Doc. No. 223-1 at \P 4), and the value of those uncashed checks totals
19	\$673,232.87 (Doc. No. 230 at \P 5). ² In addition, plaintiff explained that because the number of
20	class members that had not provided valid TINs remained high, plaintiff directed KCC to increase
21	its outreach efforts to members that remain eligible for \$600 or more. (Doc. No. 223 at 2.)
22	Plaintiff advised the court that a formal motion for additional class distributions would be made
23	after the results of that outreach effort became known. (Id.) As a result of KCC's efforts to
24	obtain valid TINs from this group of class members, including a telephone outreach campaign in
25	May and June, KCC has obtained valid TINs from an additional 1,247 members. (Doc. No.
26	224-1 at 3.) According to plaintiff, by the end of 2019, KCC will distribute the balance of funds
27	$\frac{1}{2}$ Class members were provided 120 days from the sheet data in which to percentiate their series 2

 ²⁷ Class members were provided 120 days from the check date in which to negotiate their series 3 distribution checks. (Doc. No. 224-1 at 3.)

1	due these members, totaling $1,181,328.23$. (Doc. No. 230 at $\P 3$.)		
2	KCC now holds \$6,005,199.23 in class funds, which represents the amounts from		
3	uncashed checks, the reserved amounts payable to class members that have not provided valid		
4	TINs, the amounts payable to class members who have provided TINs, and the reserve amount of		
5	\$18,898.70 for administrative expenses. (Doc. No. 230 at \P 6.) Plaintiff now requests that this		
6	court approve three additional distributions: (1) a distribution in December 2019 for class		
7	members that have not provided a TIN, with payments capped at \$599.99; (2) a distribution in		
8	January 2020 for class members that have still failed to provide a TIN, again with payments		
9	capped at \$599.99; and (3) a distribution of the excess funds from uncashed checks for class		
10	members that cashed checks from the series 3 distributions, less the administrator's expenses for		
11	the three distributions. (Doc. Nos. 224-1 at 2, 5; 230 at $\P\P$ 5, 6.)		
12	KCC is prepared to distribute funds in December 2019 to class members that are eligible		
13	to receive \$600 or more but that have not provided valid TINs. (Doc. No. 224-1 at 4.) KCC		
14	projects a total distribution of \$2,031,730.66 to 3,520 class members, with a cost of \$9,872. (Id.)		
15	KCC also projects that this distribution will complete the payouts of reserved funds to some 370		
16	class members. (Id.)		
17	Similarly, KCC is prepared to distribute \$1,141,434.21 in January 2020 to class members		
18	that have not provided valid TINs (3,180 class members). (Id.) KCC projects that this proposed		
19	2020 distribution would complete the payouts of reserved funds to 3,059 members that did not		
20	provide valid TINs, leaving \$850,808.63 remaining to be distributed to 127 members that have		
21	not provided valid TINs. (Id.) KCC anticipates that payouts to the remaining members, with		
22	annual payments capped at \$599.99, would be completed by 2024, with the vast majority		
23	completed in 2022. (Id. at 4-5, n. 2.) Two class members would receive their last payment in		
24	2023, and only one class member would receive a payment in 2024. (Id.) KCC projects this		
25	January 2020 distribution will cost \$9,026.70. (Id.)		
26	Additionally, Plaintiff believes a redistribution of uncashed checks is economically viable		
27	and requests this court approve a redistribution of the funds from uncashed checks (\$673,232.87),		

28 less administrative expenses for the three proposed distributions (\$18,898.70), for a total

1	distribution of \$654,334.17. (Doc. No. 230 at \P 5.) KCC projects that at least 9,808 class		
2	members are eligible to participate in this proposed redistribution because they cashed checks in		
3	the series 3 distributions. (Doc. No. 224-1 at 5.) Specifically, \$342,848.67 would be distributed		
4	to the 6,622 members that provided TINs or for whom TINs are not required, and the balance		
5	would be credited to the accounts of the 3,186 members that have failed to provide TINs and		
6	payable subject to the \$599.99 per annum ceiling. (Id. at 5-6.) KCC projects this redistribution		
7	will cost \$5,844. (<i>Id.</i> at 5.)		
8	Accordingly, it is hereby ordered that:		
9	1.	The settlement administrator shall, no later than December 31, 2019, distribute	
10		\$2,031,730.66 to 3,520 class members that have not provided valid taxpayer	
11		identification numbers to KCC. The amount payable per member shall not exceed	
12		\$599.99. KCC shall include a notice with each check that informs the member	
13		that payment was limited because the member failed to provide a valid taxpayer	
14		identification number, and KCC shall include a form for the member to complete	
15		to provide that number to KCC;	
16	2.	The settlement administrator shall, after January 1, 2020 but no later than January	
17		31, 2020, distribute \$1,141,434.21 to 3,180 class members that have not provided	
18		valid taxpayer identification numbers to KCC. The amount payable per member	
19		shall not exceed \$599.99. KCC shall include a notice with each check that informs	
20		the member that payment was limited because the member failed to provide a valid	
21		taxpayer identification number, and KCC shall include a form for the member to	
22		complete to provide that taxpayer identification number to KCC;	
23	3.	The settlement administrator shall, no later than December 31, 2019, redistribute	
24		\$654,334.17 to all class members that cashed checks in series 3 distributions and	
25		calculate payments to each member in accordance with paragraph 3.B of the	
26		settlement agreement, (Doc. No. 171). For class members that have not provided	
27		taxpayer identification numbers, KCC shall credit that member's account for	
28		subsequent distribution subject to the \$599.99 per annum cap;	
		5	

1	4.	All checks payable to class members in these distributions shall expire 120 days
2		after mailing, and KCC is authorized to close the account on which the checks are
3		drawn or otherwise take expedient measures to stop payment on the checks 125
4		days after mailing;
5	5.	The settlement administrator shall pay itself from the common fund the balance it
6		is owed, not to exceed \$18,898.70, for the costs of administration of the
7		distributions ordered herein; and
8	6.	Plaintiff shall file a report of the status of the settlement account with the court on
9		or before June 15, 2020, detailing the results of the distributions ordered herein
10		and providing an accounting of funds remaining in the class settlement fund at that
11		time.
12	IT IS SO ORDERED.	
13	Dated:	December 26, 2019 Jale A. Dryd
14		UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		6
	1	U