

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

PAUL EVERT’S RV COUNTRY, INC.,
PAUL EVERT and CHARLES CURTIS,

Plaintiffs,

v.

UNIVERSAL UNDERWRITERS
INSURANCE COMPANY,

Defendant.

Case No. 1:15-cv-00124 WBS SKO

**STIPULATION AND PROTECTIVE ORDER
REGARDING CONFIDENTIAL
INFORMATION**

Local Rule 141.1(b)

Magistrate Judge: Sheila K. Oberto
Judge: William B. Shubb

1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order.

The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rules 140, 141 and 141.1 set forth the procedures that must be followed and the

1 standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material under
2 seal.

3 2. DEFINITIONS

4 2.1 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of
5 information or items under this Order.

6 2.2 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is
7 generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of
8 Civil Procedure 26(c).

9 2.3 Counsel (without qualifier): Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as
10 well as their support staff).

11 2.4 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it
12 produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

13 2.5 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of the
14 medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things,
15 testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or
16 responses to discovery in this matter.

17 2.6 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to
18 the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a
19 consultant in this action.

20 2.7 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this action. House
21 Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.

22 2.8 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or other legal
23 entity not named as a Party to this action on the date this stipulation is filed with the court.

24 2.9 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party to this
25 action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this action and have appeared in this action
26 on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which has appeared on behalf of that party.

27 2.10 Party: any party to this action, including all of its officers, directors, employees,
28 consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their support staffs).

1 2.11 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or Discovery
2 Material in this action.

3 2.12 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support services
4 (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and organizing,
5 storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and subcontractors.

6 2.13 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as
7 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

8 2.14 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a
9 Producing Party.

10 3. SCOPE

11 3.1 Anticipated Categories of Protected Materials and Basis for Judicial Protection:

12 The parties anticipate the disclosure and exchange of a number of categories of confidential
13 and / or privileged information in this action. This information presents a particularized need for
14 protection and warrants protection by the court. Categories of confidential information subject to
15 this order include the following:

16 (a) Information as to which the parties share an attorney-client, work product or other
17 privilege, where that privilege is not held by third parties. This information, which includes the
18 files of counsel Universal provided Evert’s in the underlying matter, presents a particular need for
19 protection due to the important need to preserve and not unintentionally waive these privileges,
20 coupled with the importance of the parties’ ability to freely exchange this information without fear
21 of adverse and unintended consequences outside the context of the litigation. These concerns
22 warrant the court’s involvement in the form of this protective order.

23 (b) Information regarding Defendant’s claims and litigation handling, including but not
24 limited to claims manuals, guidelines, best practices, directives and other publications. This
25 information constitutes a trade secret, the disclosure of which to competitors and others would
26 cause serious and potentially irreparable financial injury. These concerns warrant the court’s
27 involvement in the form of this protective order.

28

1 (c) Information relating to counsel in the underlying action's representation of third
2 parties or other potential conflicts impacting choice of representation in that action. This
3 information presents a particular need for protection due to the important need to preserve and not
4 unintentionally waive the attorney-client and work product privileges as to such representation.
5 These concerns warrant the court's involvement in the form of this protective order.

6 3.2 Scope of Protection:

7 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material
8 (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected Material; (2) all
9 copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony,
10 conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.
11 However, the protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order do not cover the following
12 information: (a) any information that is in the public domain at the time of disclosure to a
13 Receiving Party or becomes part of the public domain after its disclosure to a Receiving Party as a
14 result of publication not involving a violation of this Order, including becoming part of the public
15 record through trial or otherwise; and (b) any information known to the Receiving Party prior to the
16 disclosure or obtained by the Receiving Party after the disclosure from a source who obtained the
17 information lawfully and under no obligation of confidentiality to the Designating Party. Any use
18 of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by a separate agreement or order.

19 4. DURATION

20 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this
21 Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court order
22 otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and
23 defenses in this action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the
24 completion and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this action,
25 including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to
26 applicable law.

27 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

28 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each Party or

1 Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care to
2 limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The
3 Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or
4 oral or written communications that qualify – so that other portions of the material, documents,
5 items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within
6 the ambit of this Order.

7 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are shown
8 to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily
9 encumber or retard the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses and burdens
10 on other parties) expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

11 If it comes to a Designating Party’s attention that information or items that it designated for
12 protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other
13 Parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

14 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this Order
15 (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered,
16 Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so
17 designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

18 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

19 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but
20 excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party
21 affix the legend “CONFIDENTIAL” to each page that contains protected material. If only a portion
22 or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly
23 identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

24 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents or materials available for inspection need not
25 designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which material it would
26 like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all of the material
27 made available for inspection shall be deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting Party has
28 identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which

1 documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing the
2 specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the “CONFIDENTIAL” legend to each page
3 that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for
4 protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making
5 appropriate markings in the margins).

6 (b) for testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial or trial proceedings, that the
7 Designating Party identify on the record, before the close of the deposition, hearing, or other
8 proceeding, all protected testimony.

9 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any other
10 tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container
11 or containers in which the information or item is stored the legend “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a
12 portion or portions of the information or item warrant protection, the Producing Party, to the extent
13 practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

14 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to
15 designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party’s
16 right to secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a
17 designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated
18 in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

19 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

20 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of
21 confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a Designating Party’s confidentiality
22 designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic
23 burdens, or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a Party does not waive its right to
24 challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the
25 original designation is disclosed.

26 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution process
27 by providing written notice of each designation it is challenging and describing the basis for each
28 challenge. To avoid ambiguity as to whether a challenge has been made, the written notice must

1 recite that the challenge to confidentiality is being made in accordance with this specific paragraph
2 of the Protective Order. The parties shall attempt to resolve each challenge in good faith and must
3 begin the process by conferring directly (in voice to voice dialogue; other forms of communication
4 are not sufficient) within 14 days of the date of service of notice. In conferring, the Challenging
5 Party must explain the basis for its belief that the confidentiality designation was not proper and
6 must give the Designating Party an opportunity to review the designated material, to reconsider the
7 circumstances, and, if no change in designation is offered, to explain the basis for the chosen
8 designation. A Challenging Party may proceed to the next stage of the challenge process only if it
9 has engaged in this meet and confer process first or establishes that the Designating Party is
10 unwilling to participate in the meet and confer process in a timely manner.

11 6.3 Judicial Intervention. If the Parties cannot resolve a challenge without court
12 intervention, the Designating Party shall file and serve a motion to retain confidentiality under
13 Civil Local Rule 7 (and in compliance with Civil Local Rules 140, 141 and 141.1, if applicable)
14 within 21 days of the initial notice of challenge or within 14 days of the parties agreeing that the
15 meet and confer process will not resolve their dispute, whichever is earlier. Each such motion must
16 be accompanied by a competent declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the meet
17 and confer requirements imposed in the preceding paragraph. Failure by the Designating Party to
18 make such a motion including the required declaration within 21 days (or 14 days, if applicable)
19 shall automatically waive the confidentiality designation for each challenged designation. In
20 addition, the Challenging Party may file a motion challenging a confidentiality designation at any
21 time if there is good cause for doing so, including a challenge to the designation of a deposition
22 transcript or any portions thereof. Any motion brought pursuant to this provision must be
23 accompanied by a competent declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the meet and
24 confer requirements imposed by the preceding paragraph.

25 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating
26 Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose
27 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions.
28 Unless the Designating Party has waived the confidentiality designation by failing to file a motion

1 to retain confidentiality as described above, all parties shall continue to afford the material in
2 question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party’s designation until
3 the court rules on the challenge.

4 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

5 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or
6 produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this case only for prosecuting,
7 defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to
8 the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the litigation has
9 been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL
10 DISPOSITION).

11 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and in
12 a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

13 7.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered
14 by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any
15 information or item designated “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

16 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this action, as well as
17 employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the
18 information for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be
19 Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A;

20 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the Receiving
21 Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the
22 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

23 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is
24 reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement
25 to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

26 (d) the court and its personnel;

27 (e) court reporters and their staff, professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors,
28 and Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who

1 have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

2 (f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is reasonably
3 necessary and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A),
4 unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed
5 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material must be separately
6 bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this
7 Stipulated Protective Order.

8 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or
9 other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

10 8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER
11 LITIGATION

12 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels
13 disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party
14 must:

15 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a
16 copy of the subpoena or court order;

17 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in
18 the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to
19 this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

20 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the
21 Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

22 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena
23 or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL”
24 before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has
25 obtained the Designating Party’s permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and
26 expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material – and nothing in these
27 provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this action to
28 disobey a lawful directive from another court.

9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED IN THIS

1 LITIGATION

2 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in
3 this action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information produced by Non-Parties in
4 connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order.
5 Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking
6 additional protections.

7 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Non-
8 Party’s confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with the
9 Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party’s confidential information, then the Party shall:

10 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some or
11 all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;

12 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order
13 in this litigation, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the
14 information requested; and

15 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party.

16 (c) If the Non-Party fails to object or seek a protective order from this court within 14
17 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the
18 Non-Party’s confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely
19 seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or
20 control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination
21 by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense
22 of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

23 10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

24 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected
25 Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective
26 Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the
27 unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected
28 Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the

1 terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the “Acknowledgment and
2 Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

3 11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED
4 MATERIAL

5 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently
6 produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the
7 Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision
8 is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that
9 provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence
10 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a
11 communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection,
12 the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted to the
13 court.

14 12. MISCELLANEOUS

15 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to
16 seek its modification by the court in the future.

17 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order
18 no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any
19 information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no
20 Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by
21 this Protective Order.

22 12.3 Filing Protected Material. Without written permission from the Designating Party or
23 a court order secured after appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Party may not file in the
24 public record in this action any Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any
25 Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rules 140, 141 and 141.1. Protected Material
26 may only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific
27 Protected Material at issue. Pursuant to Civil Local Rules 140, 141 and 141.1, a sealing order will
28 issue only upon a request establishing that the Protected Material at issue is privileged, protectable

1 as a trade secret, or otherwise entitled to protection under the law..

2 13. FINAL DISPOSITION

3 Within 60 days after the final disposition of this action, as defined in paragraph 4, each
4 Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material.
5 As used in this subdivision, “all Protected Material” includes all copies, abstracts, compilations,
6 summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether
7 the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written
8 certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party)
9 by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected
10 Material that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained
11 any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any of
12 the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an archival
13 copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda,
14 correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant
15 and expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival
16 copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set
17 forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

18 **IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.**

19 Dated: May 11, 2015

WILKINS, DROLSHAGEN & CZESHINSKI, LLP

20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

By: /s/James H. Wilkins
James H. Wilkins
Attorneys for Plaintiffs
PAUL EVERT’S RV COUNTRY, INC., PAUL
EVERT and CHARLES CURTIS

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Dated: May 11, 2015

MOUND COTTON WOLLAN & GREENGRASS LLP

By: /s/Lawrence Hecimovich
Jonathan Gross
Lawrence Hecimovich
Attorneys for Defendant
UNIVERSAL UNDERWRITERS INSURANCE
CO.

ORDER

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: May 12, 2015

/s/ Sheila K. Oberto
UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE