

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

KRISTI LAURIS, Individually and as  
Successor In Interest to the Estate of  
DAINIS LAURIS; KRISTI LAURIS as  
Guardian Ad Litem for L.L.; and TAYLOR  
LAURIS,

Plaintiffs,

v.

NOVARTIS AG, a Global Healthcare  
Company; NOVARTIS  
PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION,  
a Delaware Corporation,

Defendants.

Case No.: 1-16-cv-00393-SEH

**ORDER**

The Court conducted a hearing on November 17, 2017, at the Paul G. Hatfield  
Courthouse, Helena, Montana.

Upon the record made in open court,

**ORDERED**

1. Defendants' Motion to Exclude Testimony of Dr. Klaus Hoffman<sup>1</sup> is DENIED, subject  
to the limitations on opinion testimony as stated on the record.

2. Defendants' Motion to Exclude Testimony of Dr. Sonal Singh<sup>2</sup> is DENIED.

3. Defendants' Motion to Exclude Testimony of Dr. T.K Chen<sup>3</sup> is DENIED. Dr. T.K.  
Chen may not testify as an expert at trial for the reasons stated on the record.

4. Defendants' Motion to Exclude Testimony of Dr. Mark Weiss<sup>4</sup> is DENIED, subject to  
the limitations on opinion testimony as stated on the record.

---

<sup>1</sup> Doc. 142.

<sup>2</sup> Doc. 150.


<sup>3</sup> Doc. 154.

<sup>4</sup> Doc. 163.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

- 5. Defendants' Motion to Exclude Testimony of Dr. Robert Wagneister<sup>5</sup> is DENIED.
- 6. Defendants' Motion to Exclude Testimony of Dr. Cheryl Blume<sup>6</sup> is RESERVED.
- 7. Plaintiffs' Motion to Exclude the Expert Testimony of Drs. Kevin Croce, Javid Moslehi, and Francis Giles Under *Daubert*<sup>7</sup> is DENIED.

DATED this 17<sup>th</sup> day of November, 2017.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
SAM E. HADDON  
United States District Judge

---

<sup>5</sup> Doc. 159.  
<sup>6</sup> Doc. 146.  
<sup>7</sup> Doc. 177.