-		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8	UNITED STATES	DISTRICT COURT
9	EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA	
10		
11	CHANNEL CENTENO, et al.,	Case No. 1:16-cv-00653-DAD-SAB
12	Plaintiffs,	ORDER FOLLOWING <u>IN CAMERA</u> REVIEW
13	V.	
14	CITY OF FRESNO, et al.,	
15	Defendants.	
16	·	
17	On December 29, 2016, an order issued granting in part and denying in part, Plaintiffs	
18	motion to compel discovery in this action.	In the order, Defendants were to lodge the
19	performance reviews of Defendants Zebulon Price and Felipe Lucero for in camera review. Or	
20	January 10, 2017, Defendants filed a notice of lodging of the documents for <u>in camera</u> review.	
21	The Court has reviewed performance evaluations of Defendant Lucero for the periods o	
22	1/12/15 to 1/11/16; 1/7/14 to 1/12/15; 1/6/13 to 1/13/14; 1/3/12 to 1/6/13; 1/3/11 to 1/3/12	
23	1/1/10 to 12/31/10; and 9/3/09 to 6/11/10. The Court also reviewed performance evaluations o	

1

24 Defendant Price for the periods of 1/12 16 to 1/7/17; 1/12/15 to 1/11/16; 1/7/14 to 1/12/15;
25 1/6/13 to 1/13/14; 1/3/11 to 1/1/12; 1/3/11 to 9/1/11; 1/4/10 to 8/1/10; and 1/4/09 to 1/3/10.

In the motion to compel, Plaintiffs argued that documents were sought to show that the defendants had a history of using excessive force or filing false police reports and there was no discipline or there was ratification of these activities. Plaintiff's also argued that documents

which would indicate poor decision-making, discipline, or other instances of use of force could lead to evidence of their custom and practice of filing to follow policies and procedures. However, the Court finds that only evidence of excessive force incidents or that would go to issues of credibility would be relevant to the claims at issue here and proportional to the needs of the case.

Upon review of the documents, the Court finds that the performance evaluations do not contain evidence relevant to the issues pending in this action. Accordingly, Plaintiff's motion to 

ЪΕ

compel the production of the defendants' performance reviews is HEREBY DENIED.		
IT IS SO ORDERED.	Star & Be	
Dated: January 18, 2017	UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDG	