

1 DALE L. ALLEN, JR., State Bar No. 145279  
dallen@aghwlaw.com  
2 PHILIP J. DOWNS, JR., State Bar No. 302939  
pdowns@aghwlaw.com  
3 ALLEN, GLAESSNER, HAZELWOOD & WERTH, LLP  
180 Montgomery Street, Suite 1200  
4 San Francisco, CA 94104  
Telephone: (415) 697-2000  
5 Facsimile: (415) 813-2045

6 Attorneys for Defendants  
CITY OF CERES; JUSTIN CANATSY and  
7 JESUS SALINAS

8 DARRELL J. YORK, State Bar No.  
[djylaw@gmail.com](mailto:djylaw@gmail.com)  
9 SARAH L. GARVEY, State Bar No.  
[sarahgarvey@yahoo.com](mailto:sarahgarvey@yahoo.com)  
10 YORK & GARVEY  
137 N. Larchmont Boulevard, #506  
11 Los Angeles, CA 90004  
Telephone: (866) 908-2121  
12 Facsimile: (877) 221-3306

13 Attorneys for Plaintiffs  
S.T., a minor by and through his *guardian ad litem*  
14 JESSICA NIBLETT, individually and as successor in  
interest of ALBERT B. THOMPSON, deceased  
15

16 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
17 EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

18 S.T., a minor by and through his *guardian*  
*ad litem* Jessica Niblett, individually and as  
19 successor in interest of Albert B.  
Thompson, deceased,

20 Plaintiff,

21 v.

22 CITY OF CERES; JUSTIN CANATSY;  
23 JESUS SALINAS; and DOES 1-10,  
inclusive,

24 Defendants.  
25

Case No.: 1:16-cv-01713-LJO-BAM

**ORDER ON STIPULATED PROTECTIVE  
ORDER**

26 **1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS**

27 Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve production of  
28 confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public

1 disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted.  
2 Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to enter the following Stipulated  
3 Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on  
4 all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure  
5 and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment  
6 under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section  
7 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential  
8 information under seal; Civil Local Rule 141 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and  
9 the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material  
10 under seal.

11 **2. DEFINITIONS**

12 2.1 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of  
13 information or items under this Order.

14 2.2 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is  
15 generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule  
16 of Civil Procedure 26(c).

17 2.3 Counsel (without qualifier): Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as  
18 well as their support staff).

19 2.4 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it  
20 produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

21 2.5 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of the  
22 medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things,  
23 testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or  
24 responses to discovery in this matter.

25 2.6 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to  
26 the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a  
27 consultant in this action.

28 2.7 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this action. House

1 Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.

2 2.8 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or other legal  
3 entity not named as a Party to this action.

4 2.9 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party to this  
5 action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this action and have appeared in this action  
6 on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which has appeared on behalf of that party.

7 2.10 Party: any party to this action, including all of its officers, directors, employees,  
8 consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their support staffs).

9 2.11 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or Discovery  
10 Material in this action.

11 2.12 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support services  
12 (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and  
13 organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and  
14 subcontractors.

15 2.13 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as  
16 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

17 2.14 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a  
18 Producing Party.

19 **3. SCOPE**

20 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material  
21 (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected Material; (2)  
22 all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony,  
23 conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.  
24 However, the protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order do not cover the following  
25 information: (a) any information that is in the public domain at the time of disclosure to a  
26 Receiving Party or becomes part of the public domain after its disclosure to a Receiving Party as  
27 a result of publication not involving a violation of this Order, including becoming part of the  
28 public record through trial or otherwise; and (b) any information known to the Receiving Party

1 prior to the disclosure or obtained by the Receiving Party after the disclosure from a source who  
2 obtained the information lawfully and under no obligation of confidentiality to the Designating  
3 Party. Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by a separate agreement or order.

4 **4. DURATION**

5 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by  
6 this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court  
7 order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all  
8 claims and defenses in this action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after  
9 the completion and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this action,  
10 including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to  
11 applicable law.

12 **5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL**

13 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each Party  
14 or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care  
15 to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards.  
16 The Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents,  
17 items, or oral or written communications that qualify – so that other portions of the material,  
18 documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept  
19 unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

20 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are  
21 shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to  
22 unnecessarily encumber or retard the case development process or to impose unnecessary  
23 expenses and burdens on other parties) expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

24 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it designated  
25 for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other  
26 Parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

27 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this Order  
28 (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered,

1 Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so  
2 designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

3 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

4 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but  
5 excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing  
6 Party affix the legend “CONFIDENTIAL” to each page that contains protected material. If only a  
7 portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also  
8 must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the  
9 margins).

10 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents or materials available for inspection  
11 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which  
12 material it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all  
13 of the material made available for inspection shall be deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the  
14 inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party  
15 must determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order.  
16 Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the  
17 “CONFIDENTIAL” legend to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or  
18 portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly  
19 identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

20 (b) for testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial or trial proceedings, that the  
21 Designating Party identify on the record, before the close of the deposition, hearing, or other  
22 proceeding, all protected testimony.

23 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any other  
24 tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container  
25 or containers in which the information or item is stored the legend “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a  
26 portion or portions of the information or item warrant protection, the Producing Party, to the  
27 extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

28 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to

1 designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party's  
2 right to secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a  
3 designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is  
4 treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

5 **6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS**

6 6.1. Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of  
7 confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a Designating Party's confidentiality  
8 designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic  
9 burdens, or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a Party does not waive its right to  
10 challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the  
11 original designation is disclosed.

12 6.2. Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution  
13 process by providing written notice of each designation it is challenging and describing the basis  
14 for each challenge. To avoid ambiguity as to whether a challenge has been made, the written  
15 notice must recite that the challenge to confidentiality is being made in accordance with this  
16 specific paragraph of the Protective Order. The parties shall attempt to resolve each challenge in  
17 good faith and must begin the process by conferring directly (in voice to voice dialogue; other  
18 forms of communication are not sufficient) within 14 days of the date of service of notice. In  
19 conferring, the Challenging Party must explain the basis for its belief that the confidentiality  
20 designation was not proper and must give the Designating Party an opportunity to review the  
21 designated material, to reconsider the circumstances, and, if no change in designation is offered,  
22 to explain the basis for the chosen designation. A Challenging Party may proceed to the next  
23 stage of the challenge process only if it has engaged in this meet and confer process first or  
24 establishes that the Designating Party is unwilling to participate in the meet and confer process in  
25 a timely manner.

26 6.3. Judicial Intervention. If the Parties cannot resolve a challenge without court  
27 intervention, the Designating Party shall file and serve a motion to retain confidentiality (and in  
28 compliance with Civil Local Rule 141, if applicable) within 21 days of the initial notice of

1 challenge or within 14 days of the parties agreeing that the meet and confer process will not  
2 resolve their dispute, whichever is earlier. Each such motion must be accompanied by a  
3 competent declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the meet and confer  
4 requirements imposed in the preceding paragraph. Failure by the Designating Party to make such  
5 a motion including the required declaration within 21 days (or 14 days, if applicable) shall  
6 automatically waive the confidentiality designation for each challenged designation. In addition,  
7 the Challenging Party may file a motion challenging a confidentiality designation at any time if  
8 there is good cause for doing so, including a challenge to the designation of a deposition  
9 transcript or any portions thereof. Any motion brought pursuant to this provision must be  
10 accompanied by a competent declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the meet  
11 and confer requirements imposed by the preceding paragraph.

12 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating  
13 Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose  
14 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other 141 parties) may expose the Challenging Party to  
15 sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived the confidentiality designation by failing to  
16 file a motion to retain confidentiality as described above, all parties shall continue to afford the  
17 material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's  
18 designation until the court rules on the challenge.

19 **7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

20 7.1 **Basic Principles.** A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or  
21 produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this case only for prosecuting,  
22 defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to  
23 the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the litigation has  
24 been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL  
25 DISPOSITION).

26 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and  
27 in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

28 7.2 **Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items.** Unless otherwise ordered

1 by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any  
2 information or item designated “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

3 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this action, as well as  
4 employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the  
5 information for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be  
6 Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A;

7 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the Receiving  
8 Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the  
9 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

10 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is  
11 reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and  
12 Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

13 (d) the court and its personnel;

14 (e) court reporters and their staff, professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors,  
15 and Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who  
16 have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

17 (f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is reasonably  
18 necessary and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A),  
19 unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed  
20 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material must be separately  
21 bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this  
22 Stipulated Protective Order.

23 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or  
24 other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

25 **8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN**  
26 **OTHER LITIGATION**

27 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels  
28 disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party

1 must:

2 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a  
3 copy of the subpoena or court order;

4 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in  
5 the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to  
6 this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order;  
7 and

8 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the  
9 Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

10 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the  
11 subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as  
12 “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order  
13 issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s permission. The Designating Party  
14 shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material –  
15 and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving  
16 Party in this action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

17 **9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED IN**  
18 **THIS LITIGATION**

19 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in  
20 this action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information produced by Non-Parties in  
21 connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order.  
22 Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking  
23 additional protections.

24 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a  
25 Non-Party’s confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement  
26 with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party’s confidential information, then the Party shall:

27 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some or all  
28 of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;

1 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order in  
2 this litigation, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the  
3 information requested; and

4 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party.

5 (c) If the Non-Party fails to object or seek a protective order from this court within 14  
6 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the  
7 Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely  
8 seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession  
9 or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a  
10 determination by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the  
11 burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

12 **10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

13 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected  
14 Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective  
15 Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the  
16 unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the  
17 Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were  
18 made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the  
19 "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

20 **11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE**  
21 **PROTECTED MATERIAL**

22 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently  
23 produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the  
24 Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This  
25 provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery  
26 order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of  
27 Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a  
28 communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product

1 protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order  
2 submitted to the court.

3 **12. MISCELLANEOUS**

4 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to  
5 seek its modification by the court in the future.

6 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective  
7 Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any  
8 information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no  
9 Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered  
10 by this Protective Order.

11 12.3 Filing Protected Material. Without written permission from the Designating Party or  
12 a court order secured after appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Party may not file in the  
13 public record in this action any Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any  
14 Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 141. Protected Material may only be filed  
15 under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at  
16 issue. Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 141, a sealing order will issue only upon a request establishing  
17 that the Protected Material at issue is privileged, protectable as a trade secret, or otherwise  
18 entitled to protection under the law. If a Receiving Party's request to file Protected Material  
19 under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in the public  
20 record pursuant to Civil Local Rule 141 unless otherwise instructed by the court.

21 **13. FINAL DISPOSITION**

22 Within 60 days after the final disposition of this action, as defined in paragraph 4, each  
23 Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such  
24 material. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts,  
25 compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected  
26 Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must  
27 submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the  
28 Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all

1 the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has  
2 not retained any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or  
3 capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to  
4 retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts,  
5 legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work  
6 product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected  
7 Material. Any such archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to  
8 this Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

9 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

10 DATED: \_\_\_\_\_ /s/ Sarah L. Garvey  
11 Attorneys for Plaintiff

12 DATED: \_\_\_\_\_ /s/ Dale L. Allen, Jr.  
13 Attorneys for Defendant

14  
15 **ORDER**

16 The parties' stipulated protective order filed on March 1, 2017 (Doc. 18) complies with  
17 the requirements of Local Rules 141 and 141.1. Accordingly, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that  
18 the parties' Stipulated Protective Order is APPROVED in its entirety.

19 IT IS SO ORDERED.

20  
21 Dated: March 2, 2017

/s/ Barbara A. McAuliffe  
22 UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE