

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
**EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

ISSAM ELIE KNICKERBOCKER,	)	Case No.: 1:16-cv-01811 - DAD - JLT
	)	
Plaintiff,	)	SCHEDULING ORDER (Fed. R. Civ. P. 16)
	)	
v.	)	Pleading Amendment Deadline: 6/18/2018
	)	
UNITED STATES DEPTARTMEN TOF	)	Discovery Deadlines:
INTERIOR, et al.,	)	Non-Expert: 1/31/2019
	)	Expert: 4/12/2019
Defendants.	)	Mid-Discovery Status Conference:
	)	9/13/2018 at 8:30 a.m.
<hr/>		
	)	Non-Dispositive Motion Deadlines:
	)	Filing: 4/23/2019
	)	Hearing: 5/21/2019
	)	Dispositive Motion Deadlines:
	)	Filing: 6/4/2019
	)	Hearing: 7/16/2019
	)	Settlement Conference:
	)	9/6/2019 at 9:30 a.m.
	)	510 19th Street, Bakersfield, CA
	)	Pre-Trial Conference:
	)	9/23/2019 at 1:30 p.m.
	)	Courtroom 5
	)	Trial: 11/19/2019 at 1:00 p.m.
	)	Courtroom 5
	)	Trial: 7 days

1 **I. Date of Scheduling Conference**

2 March 21, 2018.

3 **II. Appearances of Counsel**

4 Richard Knickerbocker appeared on behalf of Plaintiff.

5 Gregory Broderick appeared on behalf of Defendant.

6 **III. Magistrate Judge Consent:**

7 **Notice of Congested Docket and Court Policy of Trailing**

8 Due to the District Judges' heavy caseload, the newly adopted policy of the Fresno Division of  
9 the Eastern District is to trail all civil cases. The parties are hereby notified that for a trial date set  
10 before a District Judge, the parties will trail indefinitely behind any higher priority criminal or older  
11 civil case set on the same date until a courtroom becomes available. The trial date will not be reset to a  
12 continued date.

13 The Magistrate Judges' availability is far more realistic and accommodating to parties than that  
14 of the U.S. District Judges who carry the heaviest caseloads in the nation and who must prioritize  
15 criminal and older civil cases over more recently filed civil cases. A United States Magistrate Judge  
16 may conduct trials, including entry of final judgment, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 636(c), Federal Rule of  
17 Civil Procedure 73, and Local Rule 305. Any appeal from a judgment entered by a United States  
18 Magistrate Judge is taken directly to the United States Court of Appeal for the Ninth Circuit.

19 The Fresno Division of the Eastern District of California, whenever possible, is utilizing United  
20 States Article III District Court Judges from throughout the nation as Visiting Judges. Pursuant to the  
21 Local Rules, Appendix A, such reassignments will be random, and the parties will receive no advance  
22 notice before their case is reassigned to an Article III District Court Judge from outside of the Eastern  
23 District of California.

24 Therefore, the parties are directed to consider consenting to Magistrate Judge jurisdiction to  
25 conduct all further proceedings, including trial. **Within 10 days** of the date of this order, counsel  
26 **SHALL** file a consent/decline form (provided by the Court at the inception of this case) indicating  
27 whether they will consent to the jurisdiction of the Magistrate Judge.

28 ///

1 **IV. Pleading Amendment Deadline**

2 Any requested pleading amendments are ordered to be filed, either through a stipulation or  
3 motion to amend, no later than **June 18, 2018**. Any motion to amend the pleadings shall be heard by  
4 the Honorable Dale A. Drozd, United States District Court Judge.

5 **V. Discovery Plan and Cut-Off Date**

6 The parties report they have exchanged the initial disclosures required by Fed. R. Civ. P.  
7 26(a)(1). (Doc. 57 at 3)

8 The parties are ordered to complete all discovery pertaining to non-experts on or before  
9 **January 31, 2019**, and all discovery pertaining to experts on or before **April 12, 2019**.

10 The parties are directed to disclose all expert witnesses<sup>1</sup>, in writing, on or before **February 15,**  
11 **2019**, and to disclose all rebuttal experts on or before **March 15, 2019**. The written designation of  
12 retained and non-retained experts shall **be made pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. Rule 26(a)(2), (A), (B),**  
13 **and (C) and shall include all information required thereunder**. Failure to designate experts in  
14 compliance with this order may result in the Court excluding the testimony or other evidence offered  
15 through such experts that are not disclosed pursuant to this order.

16 The provisions of Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(b)(4) and (5) shall apply to all discovery relating to experts  
17 and their opinions. Experts must be fully prepared to be examined on all subjects and opinions  
18 included in the designation. Failure to comply will result in the imposition of sanctions, which may  
19 include striking the expert designation and preclusion of expert testimony.

20 The provisions of Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(e) regarding a party's duty to timely supplement  
21 disclosures and responses to discovery requests will be strictly enforced.

22 A mid-discovery status conference is scheduled for **September 13, 2018**, at 8:30 a.m. before the  
23 Honorable Jennifer L. Thurston, U.S. Magistrate Judge, located at 510 19th Street, Bakersfield,  
24 California. Counsel **SHALL** file a joint mid-discovery status conference report one week before the  
25 conference. Counsel also **SHALL** lodge the status report via e-mail to JLTorders@caed.uscourts.gov.  
26 The joint statement **SHALL** outline the discovery counsel have completed and that which needs to be

27 \_\_\_\_\_  
28 <sup>1</sup> In the event an expert will offer opinions related to an independent medical or mental health evaluation, the  
examination SHALL occur sufficiently in advance of the disclosure deadline so the expert's report fully details the expert's  
opinions in this regard.

1 completed as well as any impediments to completing the discovery within the deadlines set forth in this  
2 order. Counsel may appear via teleconference by dialing (888) 557-8511 and entering Access Code  
3 1652736, provided the Magistrate Judge's Courtroom Deputy Clerk receives a written notice of the  
4 intent to appear telephonically no later than five court days before the noticed hearing date.

5 **VI. Pre-Trial Motion Schedule**

6 All non-dispositive pre-trial motions, including any discovery motions, shall be filed no later  
7 than **April 23, 2019**, and heard on or before **May 21, 2019**. Discovery motions are heard before the  
8 Honorable Jennifer L. Thurston, United States Magistrate Judge at the United States Courthouse in  
9 Bakersfield, California. For these hearings, counsel may appear via teleconference by dialing (888)  
10 557-8511 and entering Access Code 1652736, provided the Magistrate Judge's Courtroom Deputy  
11 Clerk receives a written notice of the intent to appear telephonically no later than five court days before  
12 the noticed hearing date. All other non-dispositive hearings SHALL be set before Judge Drozd.

13 **No motion to amend or stipulation to amend the case schedule will be entertained unless it**  
14 **is filed at least one week before the first deadline the parties wish to extend.** Likewise, no written  
15 discovery motions shall be filed without the prior approval of the assigned Magistrate Judge. A party  
16 with a discovery dispute must first confer with the opposing party in a good faith effort to resolve by  
17 agreement the issues in dispute. If that good faith effort is unsuccessful, the moving party promptly  
18 shall seek a telephonic hearing with all involved parties and the Magistrate Judge. It shall be the  
19 obligation of the moving party to arrange and originate the conference call to the court. To schedule  
20 this telephonic hearing, the parties are ordered to contact the Courtroom Deputy Clerk, Susan Hall, at  
21 (661) 326-6620 or via email at SHall@caed.uscourts.gov. **Counsel must comply with Local Rule 251**  
22 **with respect to discovery disputes or the motion will be denied without prejudice and dropped**  
23 **from the Court's calendar.**

24 All dispositive pre-trial motions shall be filed no later than **June 4, 2019**, and heard no later  
25 than **July 16, 2019**, in Courtroom 5 at 9:30 a.m. before the Honorable Dale A. Drozd, United States  
26 District Court Judge. In scheduling such motions, **counsel shall comply with Fed. R. Civ. P. 56 and**  
27 **Local Rules 230 and 260.**

28 ///

1 **VII. Motions for Summary Judgment or Summary Adjudication**

2 **At least 21 days before** filing a motion for summary judgment or motion for summary  
3 adjudication, the parties are **ORDERED** to meet, in person or by telephone, to confer about the issues  
4 to be raised in the motion.

5 The purpose of the meeting shall be to: 1) avoid filing motions for summary judgment where a  
6 question of fact exists; 2) determine whether the respondent agrees that the motion has merit in whole  
7 or in part; 3) discuss whether issues can be resolved without the necessity of briefing; 4) narrow the  
8 issues for review by the court; 5) explore the possibility of settlement before the parties incur the  
9 expense of briefing a motion; and 6) to develop a joint statement of undisputed facts.

10 The moving party **SHALL** initiate the meeting and **SHALL** provide a complete, proposed  
11 statement of undisputed facts **at least five days before** the conference. The finalized joint statement of  
12 undisputed facts **SHALL** include all facts that the parties agree, for purposes of the motion, may be  
13 deemed true. In addition to the requirements of Local Rule 260, the moving party shall file the joint  
14 statement of undisputed facts.

15 In the notice of motion the moving party **SHALL** certify that the parties have met and conferred  
16 as ordered above, or set forth a statement of good cause for the failure to meet and confer. **Failure to**  
17 **comply may result in the motion being stricken.**

18 **VIII. Pre-Trial Conference Date**

19 **September 23, 2019** at 1:30 p.m. in Courtroom 5 before Judge Drozd.

20 The parties are ordered to file a **Joint Pretrial Statement pursuant to Local Rule 281(a)(2).**  
21 The parties are further directed to submit a digital copy of their pretrial statement in Word format,  
22 directly to Judge Drozd's chambers, by email at DADorders@caed.uscourts.gov.

23 Counsels' attention is directed to **Rules 281 and 282 of the Local Rules** of Practice for the  
24 Eastern District of California, as to the obligations of counsel in preparing for the pre-trial conference.  
25 The Court will insist upon strict compliance with those rules. In addition to the matters set forth in the  
26 Local Rules the Joint Pretrial Statement shall include a Joint Statement of the case to be used by the  
27 Court to explain the nature of the case to the jury during voir dire.

28 ///

1 **IX. Trial Date**

2 **November 19, 2019** at 1:00 p.m. in Courtroom 5 before the Honorable Dale A. Drozd, United  
3 States District Court Judge.

4 A. This is a Court trial for the claims against the Government, and jury for the claims  
5 against the individual defendants.

6 B. Counsels' Estimate of Trial Time: 7 days.

7 C. Counsels' attention is directed to Local Rules of Practice for the Eastern District of  
8 California, Rule 285.

9 **X. Settlement Conference**

10 A Settlement Conference is scheduled for **September 6, 2019**, at 9:30 a.m., located at 510 19<sup>th</sup>  
11 Street, Bakersfield, California. Notwithstanding the requirements of Local Rule 270(b), the settlement  
12 conference will be conducted by Magistrate Judge Thurston. The Court deems the deviation from the  
13 Local Rule to be appropriate and in the interests of the parties and justice and sound case management  
14 based upon the location of the parties. **If any party prefers that the settlement conference be**  
15 **conducted by a judicial officer who is not assigned to this case, that party is directed to notify the**  
16 **Court no later than 60 days in advance of the scheduled settlement conference** to allow sufficient  
17 time for another judicial officer to be assigned to handle the conference.

18 Unless otherwise permitted in advance by the Court, **the attorneys who will try the case**  
19 **shall appear** at the Settlement Conference **with the parties** and the person or persons having **full**  
20 **authority** to negotiate and settle the case **any reasonable terms**<sup>2</sup> discussed at the conference.  
21 Consideration of settlement is a serious matter that requires preparation prior to the settlement  
22 conference. Set forth below are the procedures the Court will employ, absent good cause, in  
23 conducting the conference.

24 **At least 21 days before** the settlement conference, Plaintiff **SHALL** submit to Defendant via  
25  
26

---

27 <sup>2</sup> Insurance carriers, business organizations, and governmental bodies or agencies whose settlement agreements  
28 are subject to approval by legislative bodies, executive committees, boards of directors or the like shall be represented by  
a person or persons who have the authority to recommend settlement of the action (in cases in which a board must  
approve settlement). Nonetheless, to the extent possible, the representative shall have authority, if he or she deems it  
appropriate, to settle the action on terms consistent with the opposing party's most recent demand.

1 fax or e-mail, a written itemization of damages and a meaningful<sup>3</sup> settlement demand which includes  
2 a brief explanation of why such a settlement is appropriate. Thereafter, **no later than 14 days before**  
3 the settlement conference, Defendant **SHALL** respond via fax or e-mail, with an acceptance of the  
4 offer or with a meaningful counteroffer, which includes a brief explanation of why such a settlement  
5 is appropriate.

6 If settlement is not achieved, each party **SHALL** attach copies of their settlement offers to  
7 their Confidential Settlement Conference Statement, as described below. Copies of these documents  
8 shall not be filed on the court docket.

9 **CONFIDENTIAL SETTLEMENT CONFERENCE STATEMENT**

10 **At least five court days before** the settlement conference, the parties shall submit, directly to  
11 Judge Thurston's chambers by e-mail to JLTOrders@caed.uscourts.gov, a Confidential Settlement  
12 Conference Statement. The statement **should not be filed** with the Clerk of the Court **nor served on**  
13 **any other party**, although the parties may file a Notice of Lodging of Settlement Conference  
14 Statement. Each statement shall be clearly marked "confidential" with the date and time of the  
15 Settlement Conference indicated prominently thereon.

16 The Confidential Settlement Conference Statement shall include the following:

- 17 A. A brief statement of the facts of the case.
- 18 B. A brief statement of the claims and defenses, i.e., statutory or other grounds upon  
19 which the claims are founded; a forthright evaluation of the parties' likelihood of  
20 prevailing on the claims and defenses; and a description of the major issues in dispute.
- 21 C. A summary of the proceedings to date.
- 22 D. An estimate of the cost and time to be expended for further discovery, pretrial and  
23 trial.
- 24 E. The relief sought.
- 25 F. The party's position on settlement, including present demands and offers and a history
- 26

27 <sup>3</sup> "Meaningful" means the offer is reasonably calculated to settle the case on terms acceptable to the offering  
28 party. "Meaningful" does not include an offer which the offering party knows will not be acceptable to the other party.  
If, however, the offering party is only willing to offer a settlement which it knows the other party will not accept, this  
should trigger a recognition the case is not in a settlement posture and the parties should confer about continuing or  
vacating the settlement conference via stipulation.

1 of past settlement discussions, offers and demands.

2 **XI. Request for Bifurcation, Appointment of Special Master, or other**  
3 **Techniques to Shorten Trial**

4 Not applicable at this time.

5 **XII. Related Matters Pending**

6 There are no pending related matters.

7 **XIII. Compliance with Federal Procedure**

8 All counsel are expected to familiarize themselves with the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure  
9 and the Local Rules of Practice of the Eastern District of California, and to keep abreast of any  
10 amendments thereto. The Court must insist upon compliance with these Rules if it is to efficiently  
11 handle its increasing case load and sanctions will be imposed for failure to follow both the Federal  
12 Rules of Civil Procedure and the Local Rules of Practice for the Eastern District of California.

13 **XIV. Effect of this Order**

14 The foregoing order represents the best estimate of the court and counsel as to the agenda most  
15 suitable to dispose of this case. The trial date reserved is specifically reserved for this case. If the  
16 parties determine at any time that the schedule outlined in this order cannot be met, counsel are ordered  
17 to notify the court immediately of that fact so that adjustments may be made, either by stipulation or by  
18 subsequent status conference.

19 **The dates set in this Order are considered to be firm and will not be modified absent a**  
20 **showing of good cause even if the request to modify is made by stipulation. Stipulations**  
21 **extending the deadlines contained herein will not be considered unless they are accompanied by**  
22 **affidavits or declarations, and where appropriate attached exhibits, which establish good cause**  
23 **for granting the relief requested.**

24 Failure to comply with this order may result in the imposition of sanctions.

25

26 IT IS SO ORDERED.

27 Dated: March 21, 2018

/s/ Jennifer L. Thurston  
UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE

28