

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

RANDY BEAVERS,  
  
Plaintiff,  
  
v.  
  
CITY OF TURLOCK, a municipal  
corporation, Turlock Police Department  
Officers GREGORY W. ROTON,  
Individually, DUSTIN M. FERREIRA,  
Individually, GABRIEL GONZALEZ,  
Individually, PAUL INDERBITZEN,  
Individually, and DOES 1 THROUGH 50,  
Jointly and Severally,  
  
Defendants.

Case No.: 1:16-cv-01878-LJO-BAM

**STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER;  
ORDER**

1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment

1 under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section  
2 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential  
3 information under seal; Civil Local Rule 141 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and  
4 the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material  
5 under seal.

6 2. DEFINITIONS

7 2.1 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of  
8 information or items under this Order.

9 2.2 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is  
10 generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule  
11 of Civil Procedure 26(c). It encompasses information where public disclosure is likely to result in  
12 particularized harm, or where public disclosure would violate privacy interests recognized by law.  
13 Examples of confidential information include, but are not limited to, the following:

- 14 a. personnel file records of any peace officer;
- 15 b. medical records;
- 16 c. social security numbers and similar sensitive identifying information

17 (unless redacted by order or by agreement of all parties).

18 2.3 Counsel (without qualifier): Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as  
19 well as their support staff).

20 2.4 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that  
21 it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

22 2.5 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of the  
23 medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things,  
24 testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or  
25 responses to discovery in this matter.

26 2.6 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to  
27 the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a  
28

1 consultant in this action.

2 2.7 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this action. House  
3 Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.

4 2.8 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or other legal  
5 entity not named as a Party to this action.

6 2.9 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party to this  
7 action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this action and have appeared in this action  
8 on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which has appeared on behalf of that party.

9 2.10 Party: any party to this action, including all of its officers, directors, employees,  
10 consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their support staffs).

11 2.11 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or Discovery  
12 Material in this action.

13 2.12 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support services  
14 (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and  
15 organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and  
16 subcontractors.

17 2.13 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as  
18 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

19 2.14 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a  
20 Producing Party.

21 3. SCOPE

22 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material  
23 (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied from Protected Material; (2) all copies,  
24 excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material that reveal the source of the Protected  
25 Material or that reveal specific information, i.e., the raw data gleaned from protected documents,  
26 entitled to confidentiality under this stipulated order; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or  
27 presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material. However, the  
28

1 protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order do not cover the following information: (a)  
2 any information that is in the public domain at the time of disclosure to a Receiving Party or  
3 becomes part of the public domain after its disclosure to a Receiving Party as a result of  
4 publication not involving a violation of this Order, including becoming part of the public record  
5 through trial or otherwise; and (b) any information known to the Receiving Party prior to the  
6 disclosure or obtained by the Receiving Party after the disclosure from a source who obtained the  
7 information lawfully and under no obligation of confidentiality to the Designating Party. Any use  
8 of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by a separate agreement or order.

9 4. DURATION

10 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by  
11 this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court  
12 order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all  
13 claims and defenses in this action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after  
14 the completion and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this action,  
15 including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to  
16 applicable law.

17 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

18 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each Party  
19 or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care  
20 to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards.  
21 The Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents,  
22 items, or oral or written communications that qualify – so that other portions of the material,  
23 documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept  
24 unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

25 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are  
26 shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to  
27 unnecessarily encumber or retard the case development process or to impose unnecessary  
28

1 expenses and burdens on other parties) expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

2 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it designated  
3 for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other  
4 Parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

5 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this Order  
6 (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered,  
7 Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so  
8 designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

9 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

10 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but  
11 excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing  
12 Party affix the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" to each page that contains protected material. If only a  
13 portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also  
14 must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the  
15 margins).

16 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents or materials available for inspection  
17 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which  
18 material it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all  
19 of the material made available for inspection shall be deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the  
20 inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party  
21 must determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order.  
22 Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the  
23 "CONFIDENTIAL" legend to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or  
24 portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly  
25 identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

26 (b) for testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial or trial proceedings, that the  
27 Designating Party identify on the record, before the close of the deposition, hearing, or other  
28

1 proceeding, all protected testimony.

2 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any other  
3 tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container  
4 or containers in which the information or item is stored the legend "CONFIDENTIAL." If only a  
5 portion or portions of the information or item warrant protection, the Producing Party, to the  
6 extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

7 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to  
8 designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party's  
9 right to secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a  
10 designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is  
11 treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

12 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

13 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of  
14 confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a Designating Party's confidentiality  
15 designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic  
16 burdens, or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a Party does not waive its right to  
17 challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the  
18 original designation is disclosed.

19 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution  
20 process by providing written notice of each designation it is challenging and describing the basis  
21 for each challenge. To avoid ambiguity as to whether a challenge has been made, the written  
22 notice must recite that the challenge to confidentiality is being made in accordance with this  
23 specific paragraph of the Protective Order. The parties shall attempt to resolve each challenge in  
24 good faith and must begin the process by conferring directly (in voice to voice dialogue; other  
25 forms of communication are not sufficient) within 14 days of the date of service of notice. In  
26 conferring, the Challenging Party must explain the basis for its belief that the confidentiality  
27 designation was not proper and must give the Designating Party an opportunity to review the  
28

1 designated material, to reconsider the circumstances, and, if no change in designation is offered,  
2 to explain the basis for the chosen designation. A Challenging Party may proceed to the next  
3 stage of the challenge process only if it has engaged in this meet and confer process first or  
4 establishes that the Designating Party is unwilling to participate in the meet and confer process in  
5 a timely manner.

6           6.3    Judicial Intervention. If the Parties cannot resolve a challenge without court  
7 intervention, the Designating Party shall file and serve a motion to retain confidentiality (and in  
8 compliance with Civil Local Rule 141, if applicable) within 21 days of the initial notice of  
9 challenge or within 14 days of the parties agreeing that the meet and confer process will not  
10 resolve their dispute, whichever is earlier. Each such motion must be accompanied by a  
11 competent declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the meet and confer  
12 requirements imposed in the preceding paragraph. Failure by the Designating Party to make such  
13 a motion including the required declaration within 21 days (or 14 days, if applicable) shall  
14 automatically waive the confidentiality designation for each challenged designation. In addition,  
15 the Challenging Party may file a motion challenging a confidentiality designation at any time if  
16 there is good cause for doing so, including a challenge to the designation of a deposition  
17 transcript or any portions thereof. Any motion brought pursuant to this provision must be  
18 accompanied by a competent declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the meet  
19 and confer requirements imposed by the preceding paragraph.

20           The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating  
21 Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose  
22 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to  
23 sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived the confidentiality designation by failing to  
24 file a motion to retain confidentiality as described above, all parties shall continue to afford the  
25 material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's  
26 designation until the court rules on the challenge.

1           7.       ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

2           7.1       Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or  
3 produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this case only for prosecuting,  
4 defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to  
5 the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the litigation has  
6 been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL  
7 DISPOSITION).

8           Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and  
9 in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

10          7.2       Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered  
11 by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any  
12 information or item designated “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

13           (a) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is  
14 reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and  
15 Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

16           (b) the court and its personnel;

17           (c) court reporters and their staff, professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and  
18 Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have  
19 signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

20           (d) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is reasonably  
21 necessary and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A),  
22 unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed  
23 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material must be separately  
24 bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this  
25 Stipulated Protective Order or as agreed by the Designating Party.

26           (e) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or  
27 other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.  
28



1 8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER  
2 LITIGATION

3 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels  
4 disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party  
5 must:

6 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a  
7 copy of the subpoena or court order;

8 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the  
9 other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this  
10 Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

11 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the  
12 Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

13 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the  
14 subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as  
15 “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order  
16 issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s permission. The Designating Party  
17 shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material –  
18 and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving  
19 Party in this action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

20 9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED IN THIS  
21 LITIGATION

22 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in this  
23 action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information produced by Non-Parties in  
24 connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order.  
25 Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking  
26 additional protections.

27 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Non-  
28

1 Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with  
2 the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's confidential information, then the Party shall:

3 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some or all of  
4 the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;

5 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order in this  
6 litigation, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the  
7 information requested; and

8 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party.

9 (c) If the Non-Party fails to object or seek a protective order from this court within 14  
10 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the  
11 Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely  
12 seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession  
13 or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a  
14 determination by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the  
15 burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

16 10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

17 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected  
18 Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective  
19 Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the  
20 unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the  
21 Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were  
22 made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the  
23 "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

24 11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED  
25 MATERIAL

26 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently  
27 produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the  
28

1 Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This  
2 provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery  
3 order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of  
4 Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a  
5 communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product  
6 protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order  
7 submitted to the court.

8 12. MISCELLANEOUS

9 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to  
10 seek its modification by the court in the future.

11 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective  
12 Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any  
13 information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no  
14 Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered  
15 by this Protective Order.

16 12.3 Filing Protected Material. Without written permission from the Designating Party  
17 or a court order secured after appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Party may not file in  
18 the public record in this action any Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any  
19 Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 141. Protected Material may only be filed  
20 under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at  
21 issue. Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 141, a sealing order will issue only upon a request establishing  
22 that the Protected Material at issue is privileged, protectable as a trade secret, or otherwise  
23 entitled to protection under the law.

24 13. FINAL DISPOSITION

25 Within 60 days after the final disposition of this action, as defined in paragraph 4, upon  
26 written notification served by Producing or Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return  
27 all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this subdivision,  
28

1 “all Protected Material” includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries, and any other  
2 format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material is  
3 returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing  
4 Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that  
5 (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or  
6 destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts,  
7 compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected  
8 Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an archival copy of all  
9 pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda,  
10 correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and  
11 consultant and expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such  
12 archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective  
13 Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).  
14

15  
16 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.  
17

18  
19 DATED: 6/9/17

/s/ Sanjay Schmidt

Attorney for Plaintiffs

20  
21  
22  
23 DATED: 6/9/17

/s/ Kevin P. Allen

Attorney for Defendants

24 ///

25 ///

26 ///

27 ///

28

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

EXHIBIT A

ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full name], of \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for the Eastern District of California on \_\_\_\_\_ in the case of \_\_\_\_\_ *Beavers v. City of Turlock, et al.*, Case No. 1:16-cv-01878-LJO-BAM. I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the Northern District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action.

I hereby appoint \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full name] of \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full address and telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

City and State where sworn and signed: \_\_\_\_\_

Printed name: \_\_\_\_\_

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**ORDER**

The parties' stipulated protective order filed on June 9, 2017 (Doc. 14) complies with the requirements of Local Rules 141 and 141.1. Accordingly, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the parties' Stipulated Protective Order is APPROVED in its entirety.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: June 13, 2017

/s/ Barbara A. McAuliffe  
UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE