

1 Mark E. Ellis - 127159
2 Anthony P. J. Valenti - 284542
3 ELLIS LAW GROUP LLP
4 740 University Avenue, Suite 100
5 Sacramento, CA 95825
6 Tel: (916) 283-8820
7 Fax: (916) 283-8821
8 mellis@ellislawgrp.com
9 avalenti@ellislawgrp.com

10 Attorneys for Defendant STANISLAUS CREDIT CONTROL SERVICE, INC.

11 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
12 EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

13 JOYCE CHAVEZ,

14 Plaintiff,

15 v.

16 STANISLAUS CREDIT CONTROL SERVICE,
17 INC.,

18 Defendant.

Case No.: 1:17-CV-01515-LJO-SAB

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER

19 1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

20 Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve production of confidential,
21 proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for
22 any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby
23 stipulate to and petition the court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties
24 acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to
25 discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited
26 information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles.
27 The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective
28 Order does not entitle them to file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 141 sets forth

1 the procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks
2 permission from the court to file material under seal.

3 2. DEFINITIONS

4 2.1 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information
5 or items under this Order.

6 2.2 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is
7 generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of
8 Civil Procedure 26(c).

9 2.3 Counsel (without qualifier): Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as
10 their support staff).

11 2.4 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it
12 produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

13 2.5 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of the medium or
14 manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things, testimony,
15 transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery
16 in this matter.

17 2.6 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to the
18 litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a
19 consultant in this action.

20 2.7 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this action. House Counsel
21 does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.

22 2.8 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or other legal
23 entity not named as a Party to this action.

24 2.9 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party to this action
25 but are retained to represent or advise a party to this action and have appeared in this action on behalf
26 of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which has appeared on behalf of that party.

27 2.10 Party: any party to this action, including all of its officers, directors, employees,
28

1 consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their support staffs).

2 2.11 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or Discovery Material
3 in this action.

4 2.12 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support services (e.g.,
5 photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and organizing, storing,
6 or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and subcontractors.

7 2.13 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as
8 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

9 2.14 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a
10 Producing Party.

11 3. SCOPE

12 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material (as
13 defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected Material; (2) all
14 copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony,
15 conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.
16 However, the protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order do not cover the following
17 information: (a) any information that is in the public domain at the time of disclosure to a Receiving
18 Party or becomes part of the public domain after its disclosure to a Receiving Party as a result of
19 publication not involving a violation of this Order, including becoming part of the public record
20 through trial or otherwise; and (b) any information known to the Receiving Party prior to the disclosure
21 or obtained by the Receiving Party after the disclosure from a source who obtained the information
22 lawfully and under no obligation of confidentiality to the Designating Party. Any use of Protected
23 Material at trial shall be governed by a separate agreement or order.

24 4. DURATION

25 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this
26 Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court order
27 otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and
28

1 defenses in this action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion
2 and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this action, including the time
3 limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to applicable law.

4 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

5 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each Party or
6 Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care to limit
7 any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The
8 Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral
9 or written communications that qualify – so that other portions of the material, documents, items, or
10 communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of
11 this Order.

12 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are shown to
13 be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber
14 or retard the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other
15 parties) expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

16 If it comes to a Designating Party’s attention that information or items that it designated for
17 protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other Parties
18 that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

19 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this Order (see,
20 e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or
21 Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so designated before
22 the material is disclosed or produced.

23 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

24 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but
25 excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party
26 affix the legend “CONFIDENTIAL” to each page that contains protected material. If only a portion or
27

1 portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly
2 identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

3 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents or materials available for inspection
4 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which material it
5 would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all of the material
6 made available for inspection shall be deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting Party has
7 identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which
8 documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing the
9 specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the “CONFIDENTIAL” legend to each page that
10 contains Protected Material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for
11 protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making
12 appropriate markings in the margins).

13 (b) for testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial or trial proceedings, that the
14 Designating Party identify on the record, before the close of the deposition, hearing, or other
15 proceeding, all protected testimony.

16 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any other
17 tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container or
18 containers in which the information or item is stored the legend “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion
19 or portions of the information or item warrant protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable,
20 shall identify the protected portion(s).

21 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to
22 designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party’s right
23 to secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the
24 Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with
25 the provisions of this Order.

26 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

27 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of
28

1 confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a Designating Party's confidentiality
2 designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic burdens, or
3 a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a Party does not waive its right to challenge a
4 confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the original designation
5 is disclosed.

6 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution process by
7 providing written notice of each designation it is challenging and describing the basis for each
8 challenge. To avoid ambiguity as to whether a challenge has been made, the written notice must recite
9 that the challenge to confidentiality is being made in accordance with this specific paragraph of the
10 Protective Order. The parties shall attempt to resolve each challenge in good faith and must begin the
11 process by conferring directly (in voice to voice dialogue; other forms of communication are not
12 sufficient) within 14 days of the date of service of notice. In conferring, the Challenging Party must
13 explain the basis for its belief that the confidentiality designation was not proper and must give the
14 Designating Party an opportunity to review the designated material, to reconsider the circumstances,
15 and, if no change in designation is offered, to explain the basis for the chosen designation. A
16 Challenging Party may proceed to the next stage of the challenge process only if it has engaged in this
17 meet and confer process first or establishes that the Designating Party is unwilling to participate in the
18 meet and confer process in a timely manner.

19 6.3 Judicial Intervention. If the Parties cannot resolve a challenge without court
20 intervention, the Designating Party shall file and serve a motion to retain confidentiality under Civil
21 Local Rule 133 (and in compliance with Civil Local Rule 141, if applicable) within 21 days of the
22 initial notice of challenge or within 14 days of the parties agreeing that the meet and confer process
23 will not resolve their dispute, whichever is earlier. Each such motion must be accompanied by a
24 competent declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the meet and confer requirements
25 imposed in the preceding paragraph. Failure by the Designating Party to make such a motion including
26 the required declaration within 21 days (or 14 days, if applicable) shall automatically waive the
27 confidentiality designation for each challenged designation. In addition, the Challenging Party may file
28

1 a motion challenging a confidentiality designation at any time if there is good cause for doing so,
2 including a challenge to the designation of a deposition transcript or any portions thereof. Any motion
3 brought pursuant to this provision must be accompanied by a competent declaration affirming that the
4 movant has complied with the meet and confer requirements imposed by the preceding paragraph.

5 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating Party.
6 Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary
7 expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the
8 Designating Party has waived the confidentiality designation by failing to file a motion to retain
9 confidentiality as described above, all parties shall continue to afford the material in question the level
10 of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the court rules on the
11 challenge.

12 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

13 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or
14 produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this case only for prosecuting,
15 defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to the
16 categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the litigation has been
17 terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL
18 DISPOSITION).

19 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and in a
20 secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

21 7.2 Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered by
22 the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any
23 information or item designated "CONFIDENTIAL" only to:

24 (a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this action, as well as employees of
25 said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this
26 litigation and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached
27 hereto as Exhibit A;

1 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the Receiving
2 Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the
3 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

4 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is
5 reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to
6 Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

7 (d) the court and its personnel;

8 (e) court reporters and their staff, professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and
9 Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have
10 signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

11 (f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is reasonably
12 necessary and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A),
13 unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed
14 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material must be separately bound
15 by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated
16 Protective Order.

17 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or other
18 person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

19 8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER
20 LITIGATION

21 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels
22 disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party
23 must:

24 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a copy
25 of the subpoena or court order;

26 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the
27 other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this
28

1 Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

2 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the
3 Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

4 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena or
5 court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a
6 determination by the court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the
7 Designating Party’s permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking
8 protection in that court of its confidential material – and nothing in these provisions should be
9 construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this action to disobey a lawful directive
10 from another court.

11 9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED IN THIS
12 LITIGATION

13 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in this
14 action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information produced by Non-Parties in
15 connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing
16 in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

17 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Non-
18 Party’s confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with the
19 Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party’s confidential information, then the Party shall:

20 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some or all
21 of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;

22 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order in
23 this litigation, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the
24 information requested; and

25 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party.

26 (c) If the Non-Party fails to object or seek a protective order from this court within 14 days
27 of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the Non-
28

1 Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a
2 protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that
3 is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court.
4 Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking
5 protection in this court of its Protected Material.

6 10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

7 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected
8 Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order,
9 the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized
10 disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c)
11 inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this
12 Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be
13 Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

14 11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED
15 MATERIAL

16 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced
17 material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties
18 are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to
19 modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production
20 without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the
21 parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or information covered by
22 the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in
23 the stipulated protective order submitted to the court.

24 12. MISCELLANEOUS

25 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek
26 its modification by the court in the future.

27 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order no
28

1 Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or
2 item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any
3 right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective
4 Order.

5 12.3 Filing Protected Material. Without written permission from the Designating Party or a
6 court order secured after appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Party may not file in the public
7 record in this action any Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected Material
8 must comply with Civil Local Rule 141. Protected Material may only be filed under seal pursuant to a
9 court order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at issue. Pursuant to Civil Local
10 Rule 141, a sealing order will issue only upon a request establishing that the Protected Material at issue
11 is privileged, protectable as a trade secret, or otherwise entitled to protection under the law. However,
12 if the court denies a Party's Motion to Seal pursuant to Civil Local Rule 141, the Protected Material
13 may be filed on the docket.

14 13. FINAL DISPOSITION

15 Within 60 days after the final disposition of this action, as defined in paragraph 4, each
16 Receiving Party must destroy all Protected Material. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected
17 Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or
18 capturing any of the Protected Material. After the Protected Material is destroyed, the Receiving Party
19 must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the
20 Designating Party) within 14 days of a written request to do so, that (1) identifies (by category, where
21 appropriate) all the Protected Material that was destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has
22 not retained any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or
23 capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to retain
24 an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal
25 memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and
26 consultant and expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such
27 archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as
28

1 set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

2 IT IS SO STIPULATED, BY AND THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

3
4 Dated: February 7, 2018

MARTIN & BONTRAGER, A.P.C.

6
7 By /s/ Nicholas J. Bontrager (as authorized on 02/06/18)
8 Nicholas J. Bontrager
9 Attorney for Plaintiff
JOYCE CHAVEZ

10
11
12
13 Dated: February 7, 2018

ELLIS LAW GROUP LLP

14
15 By /s/ Anthony P. J. Valenti
16 Anthony P. J. Valenti
17 Attorney for Defendant
STANISLAUS CREDIT CONTROL SERVICE, INC.

18
19
20 **ORDER**

21 Pursuant to the stipulation of the parties, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that:

- 22 1. The protective order filed February 7, 2018 is entered;
- 23 2. The parties are advised that pursuant to the Local Rules of the United States
24 District Court, Eastern District of California, any documents which are to be filed
25 under seal will require a written request which complies with Local Rule 141; and
- 26 3. The party making a request to file documents under seal shall be required to show
27 good cause for documents attached to a nondispositive motion or compelling
28

1 reasons for documents attached to a dispositive motion. Pintos v. Pacific Creditors
2 Ass'n, 605 F.3d 665, 677-78 (9th Cir. 2009).
3

4 IT IS SO ORDERED.

5 Dated: February 7, 2018



6 UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE

7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28