

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
**EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

RAUL GONZALES, JR., an individual,	)	Case No.: 1:18-cv-00345-LJO-JLT
	)	
Plaintiff,	)	SCHEDULING ORDER (Fed. R. Civ. P. 16)
	)	
v.	)	Pleading Amendment Deadline: 8/31/2018
	)	
TRANS UNION, LLC, et al.,	)	Discovery Deadlines:
	)	Initial Disclosures: 6/15/2018
Defendants.	)	Non-Expert: 3/1/2019
	)	Expert: 4/26/2019
	)	Mid-Discovery Status Conference:
	)	10/15/2018 at 8:30 a.m.
	)	
	)	Non-Dispositive Motion Deadlines:
	)	Filing: 5/3/2019
	)	Hearing: 5/31/2019
	)	
	)	Dispositive Motion Deadlines:
	)	Filing: 6/11/2019
	)	Hearing: 7/23/2019
	)	
	)	Settlement Conference:
	)	12/18/2018 at 9:00 a.m.
	)	510 19th Street, Bakersfield, CA
	)	
	)	Pre-Trial Conference:
	)	9/17/2019 at 8:30 a.m.
	)	Courtroom 4
	)	
	)	Trial: 11/12/2019 at 8:30 a.m.
	)	Courtroom 4
	)	Jury trial: 4 days

1 **I. Date of Scheduling Conference**

2 June 1, 2018.

3 **II. Appearances of Counsel**

4 Geoff McCarrell appeared on behalf of Plaintiff.

5 Heather Shumaker appeared on behalf of Trans Union, LLC.

6 No appearance on behalf of National Credit Systems, Inc.

7 **III. Magistrate Judge Consent:**

8 **Notice of Congested Docket and Court Policy of Trailing**

9 Due to the District Judges' heavy caseload, the newly adopted policy of the Fresno Division of  
10 the Eastern District is to trail all civil cases. The parties are hereby notified that for a trial date set  
11 before a District Judge, the parties will trail indefinitely behind any higher priority criminal or older  
12 civil case set on the same date until a courtroom becomes available. The trial date will not be reset to a  
13 continued date.

14 The Magistrate Judges' availability is far more realistic and accommodating to parties than that  
15 of the U.S. District Judges who carry the heaviest caseloads in the nation and who must prioritize  
16 criminal and older civil cases over more recently filed civil cases. A United States Magistrate Judge  
17 may conduct trials, including entry of final judgment, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 636(c), Federal Rule of  
18 Civil Procedure 73, and Local Rule 305. Any appeal from a judgment entered by a United States  
19 Magistrate Judge is taken directly to the United States Court of Appeal for the Ninth Circuit.

20 The Fresno Division of the Eastern District of California, whenever possible, is utilizing United  
21 States Article III District Court Judges from throughout the nation as Visiting Judges. Pursuant to the  
22 Local Rules, Appendix A, such reassignments will be random, and the parties will receive no advance  
23 notice before their case is reassigned to an Article III District Court Judge from outside of the Eastern  
24 District of California.

25 Therefore, the parties are directed to consider consenting to Magistrate Judge jurisdiction to  
26 conduct all further proceedings, including trial. **Within 10 days** of the date of this order, counsel  
27 **SHALL** file a consent/decline form (provided by the Court at the inception of this case) indicating  
28 whether they will consent to the jurisdiction of the Magistrate Judge.

1 **IV. Pleading Amendment Deadline**

2 Any requested pleading amendments are ordered to be filed, either through a stipulation or  
3 motion to amend, no later than **August 31, 2018**.

4 **V. Discovery Plan and Cut-Off Date**

5 The parties are ordered to exchange the initial disclosures required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(a)(1)  
6 on or before **June 15, 2018**.

7 The parties are ordered to complete all discovery pertaining to non-experts on or before **March**  
8 **1, 2019** and all discovery pertaining to experts on or before **April 26, 2019**.

9 The parties are shall disclose all expert witnesses<sup>1</sup>, in writing, on or before **March 8, 2019**, and  
10 to disclose all rebuttal experts on or before **April 5, 2019**. The written designation of retained and non-  
11 retained experts shall **be made pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. Rule 26(a)(2), (A), (B), and (C) and shall**  
12 **include all information required thereunder**. Failure to designate experts in compliance with this  
13 order may result in the Court excluding the testimony or other evidence offered through such experts  
14 that are not disclosed pursuant to this order.

15 The provisions of Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(b)(4) and (5) shall apply to all discovery relating to experts  
16 and their opinions. Experts must be fully prepared to be examined on all subjects and opinions  
17 included in the designation. Failure to comply will result in the imposition of sanctions, which may  
18 include striking the expert designation and preclusion of expert testimony.

19 The provisions of Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(e) regarding a party's duty to timely supplement  
20 disclosures and responses to discovery requests will be strictly enforced.

21 A mid-discovery status conference is scheduled for **October 15, 2018** at **8:30** a.m. before the  
22 Honorable Jennifer L. Thurston, U.S. Magistrate Judge, located at 510 19th Street, Bakersfield,  
23 California. Counsel SHALL file a joint mid-discovery status conference report one week before the  
24 conference. Counsel also SHALL lodge the status report via e-mail to JLTorders@caed.uscourts.gov.  
25 The joint statement SHALL outline the discovery counsel have completed and that which needs to be  
26 completed as well as any impediments to completing the discovery within the deadlines set forth in this  
27

28 \_\_\_\_\_  
<sup>1</sup> In the event an expert will offer opinions related to an independent evaluation, the examination SHALL occur sufficiently in advance of the disclosure deadline so the expert's report fully details the expert's opinions in this regard.

1 order. Counsel may appear via teleconference by dialing (888) 557-8511 and entering Access Code  
2 1652736, provided the Magistrate Judge's Courtroom Deputy Clerk receives a written notice of the  
3 intent to appear telephonically no later than five court days before the noticed hearing date.

4 **VI. Pre-Trial Motion Schedule**

5 All non-dispositive pre-trial motions, including any discovery motions, shall be filed no later  
6 than **May 3, 2019** and heard on or before **May 31, 2019**. Non-dispositive motions are heard before the  
7 Honorable Jennifer L. Thurston, United States Magistrate Judge at the United States Courthouse in  
8 Bakersfield, California.

9 **No motion to amend or stipulation to amend the case schedule will be entertained unless it**  
10 **is filed at least one week before the first deadline the parties wish to extend.** Likewise, no written  
11 discovery motions shall be filed without the prior approval of the assigned Magistrate Judge. A party  
12 with a discovery dispute must first confer with the opposing party in a good faith effort to resolve by  
13 agreement the issues in dispute. If that good faith effort is unsuccessful, the moving party promptly  
14 shall seek a telephonic hearing with all involved parties and the Magistrate Judge. It shall be the  
15 obligation of the moving party to arrange and originate the conference call to the court. To schedule  
16 this telephonic hearing, the parties are ordered to contact the Courtroom Deputy Clerk, Susan Hall, at  
17 (661) 326-6620 or via email at SHall@caed.uscourts.gov. **Counsel must comply with Local Rule 251**  
18 **with respect to discovery disputes or the motion will be denied without prejudice and dropped**  
19 **from the Court's calendar.**

20 Counsel may appear and argue non-dispositive motions via teleconference by dialing (888) 557-  
21 8511 and entering Access Code 1652736, provided the Magistrate Judge's Courtroom Deputy Clerk  
22 receives a written notice of the intent to appear telephonically no later than five court days before the  
23 noticed hearing date.

24 All dispositive pre-trial motions shall be filed no later than **June 11, 2019** and heard no later  
25 than **July 23, 2019**, in Courtroom 4 at 8:30 a.m. before the Honorable Lawrence J. O'Neill, United  
26 States District Court Judge. In scheduling such motions, **counsel shall comply with Fed. R. Civ. P. 56**  
27 **and Local Rules 230 and 260.**

28 ///

1 **VII. Motions for Summary Judgment or Summary Adjudication**

2 **At least 21 days before** filing a motion for summary judgment or motion for summary  
3 adjudication, the parties are **ORDERED** to meet, in person or by telephone, to confer about the issues  
4 to be raised in the motion.

5 The purpose of the meeting shall be to: 1) avoid filing motions for summary judgment where a  
6 question of fact exists; 2) determine whether the respondent agrees that the motion has merit in whole  
7 or in part; 3) discuss whether issues can be resolved without the necessity of briefing; 4) narrow the  
8 issues for review by the court; 5) explore the possibility of settlement before the parties incur the  
9 expense of briefing a motion; and 6) to develop a joint statement of undisputed facts.

10 The moving party **SHALL** initiate the meeting and **SHALL** provide a complete, proposed  
11 statement of undisputed facts **at least five days before** the conference. The finalized joint statement of  
12 undisputed facts **SHALL** include all facts that the parties agree, for purposes of the motion, may be  
13 deemed true. In addition to the requirements of Local Rule 260, the moving party shall file the joint  
14 statement of undisputed facts.

15 In the notice of motion the moving party **SHALL** certify that the parties have met and conferred  
16 as ordered above, or set forth a statement of good cause for the failure to meet and confer. **Failure to**  
17 **comply may result in the motion being stricken.**

18 **VIII. Pre-Trial Conference Date**

19 **September 17, 2019** at 8:30 a.m. in Courtroom 4 before Judge O'Neill.

20 The parties are ordered to file a **Joint Pretrial Statement pursuant to Local Rule 281(a)(2).**  
21 The parties are further directed to submit a digital copy of their pretrial statement in Word format,  
22 directly to Judge O'Neill's chambers, by email at LJOorders@caed.uscourts.gov.

23 Counsels' attention is directed to **Rules 281 and 282 of the Local Rules** of Practice for the  
24 Eastern District of California, as to the obligations of counsel in preparing for the pre-trial conference.  
25 The Court will insist upon strict compliance with those rules. In addition to the matters set forth in the  
26 Local Rules the Joint Pretrial Statement shall include a Joint Statement of the case to be used by the  
27 Court to explain the nature of the case to the jury during voir dire.

28 ///

1 **IX. Trial Date**

2 **November 12, 2019<sup>2</sup>** at 8:30 a.m. in Courtroom 4 before the Honorable Lawrence J. O'Neill,  
3 United States District Court Judge.

4 A. This is a jury trial.

5 B. Counsels' Estimate of Trial Time: 4 days.

6 C. Counsels' attention is directed to Local Rules of Practice for the Eastern District of  
7 California, Rule 285.

8 **X. Settlement Conference**

9 A Settlement Conference is scheduled for **December 18, 2018** at 9:00 a.m., located at 510 19<sup>th</sup>  
10 Street, Bakersfield, California. Notwithstanding the requirements of Local Rule 270(b), the settlement  
11 conference will be conducted by Magistrate Judge Thurston. The Court deems the deviation from the  
12 Local Rule to be appropriate and in the interests of the parties and justice and sound case management  
13 based upon the location of the parties. **If any party prefers that the settlement conference be**  
14 **conducted by a judicial officer who is not assigned to this case, that party is directed to notify the**  
15 **Court no later than 60 days in advance of the scheduled settlement conference** to allow sufficient  
16 time for another judicial officer to be assigned to handle the conference.

17 Unless otherwise permitted in advance by the Court, **the attorneys who will try the case**  
18 **shall appear** at the Settlement Conference **with the parties** and the person or persons having **full**  
19 **authority** to negotiate and settle the case **on any reasonable terms**<sup>3</sup> discussed at the conference.  
20 Consideration of settlement is a serious matter that requires preparation prior to the settlement  
21 conference. Set forth below are the procedures the Court will employ, absent good cause, in  
22 conducting the conference.

23 **At least 21 days before** the settlement conference, Plaintiff **SHALL** submit to Defendant via  
24 fax or e-mail, a written itemization of damages and a meaningful<sup>4</sup> settlement demand which includes  
25

---

26 <sup>2</sup> Counsel are advised that Judge O'Neill has announced that he will retire from the Court in January 2020. In the  
27 event that the trial cannot be completed before his retirement, the case will be reassigned but it is unlikely the trial will occur  
until Judge O'Neill's replacement is selected. In recent times, this process has taken up to three years to occur.

<sup>3</sup> Insurance carriers, business organizations, and governmental bodies or agencies whose settlement agreements  
are subject to approval by legislative bodies, executive committees, boards of directors or the like may be represented by  
28 a person whose recommendations about settlement are relied upon by the ultimate decision makers.

<sup>4</sup> "Meaningful" means the offer is reasonably calculated to settle the case on terms acceptable to the offering  
party. "Meaningful" does not include an offer which the offering party knows will not be acceptable to the other party.

1 a brief explanation of why such a settlement is appropriate. Thereafter, **no later than 14 days before**  
2 the settlement conference, Defendant **SHALL** respond via fax or e-mail, with an acceptance of the  
3 offer or with a meaningful counteroffer, which includes a brief explanation of why such a settlement  
4 is appropriate.

5 If settlement is not achieved, each party **SHALL** attach copies of their settlement offers to  
6 their Confidential Settlement Conference Statement, as described below. Copies of these documents  
7 shall not be filed on the court docket.

8 **CONFIDENTIAL SETTLEMENT CONFERENCE STATEMENT**

9 **At least five court days before** the settlement conference, the parties shall submit, directly to  
10 Judge Thurston's chambers by e-mail to JLTOrders@caed.uscourts.gov, a Confidential Settlement  
11 Conference Statement. The statement **should not be filed** with the Clerk of the Court **nor served on**  
12 **any other party**, although the parties may file a Notice of Lodging of Settlement Conference  
13 Statement. Each statement shall be clearly marked "confidential" with the date and time of the  
14 Settlement Conference indicated prominently thereon.

15 The Confidential Settlement Conference Statement shall include the following:

- 16 A. A brief statement of the facts of the case.
- 17 B. A brief statement of the claims and defenses, i.e., statutory or other grounds upon  
18 which the claims are founded; a forthright evaluation of the parties' likelihood of  
19 prevailing on the claims and defenses; and a description of the major issues in dispute.
- 20 C. A summary of the proceedings to date.
- 21 D. An estimate of the cost and time to be expended for further discovery, pretrial and  
22 trial.
- 23 E. The relief sought.
- 24 F. The party's position on settlement, including present demands and offers and a history  
25 of past settlement discussions, offers and demands.

26 ///

27  
28 If, however, the offering party is only willing to offer a settlement which it knows the other party will not accept, this should trigger a recognition the case is not in a settlement posture and the parties should confer about continuing the settlement conference via stipulation.

1 **XI. Request for Bifurcation, Appointment of Special Master, or other**  
2 **Techniques to Shorten Trial**

3 Not applicable at this time.

4 **XII. Related Matters Pending**

5 There are no pending related matters.

6 **XIII. Compliance with Federal Procedure**

7 All counsel are expected to familiarize themselves with the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure  
8 and the Local Rules of Practice of the Eastern District of California, and to keep abreast of any  
9 amendments thereto. The Court must insist upon compliance with these Rules if it is to efficiently  
10 handle its increasing case load and sanctions will be imposed for failure to follow both the Federal  
11 Rules of Civil Procedure and the Local Rules of Practice for the Eastern District of California.

12 **XIV. Effect of this Order**

13 The foregoing order represents the best estimate of the court and counsel as to the agenda most  
14 suitable to dispose of this case. The trial date reserved is specifically reserved for this case. If the  
15 parties determine at any time that the schedule outlined in this order cannot be met, counsel are ordered  
16 to notify the court immediately of that fact so that adjustments may be made, either by stipulation or by  
17 subsequent status conference.

18 **The dates set in this Order are considered to be firm and will not be modified absent a**  
19 **showing of good cause even if the request to modify is made by stipulation. Stipulations**  
20 **extending the deadlines contained herein will not be considered unless they are accompanied by**  
21 **affidavits or declarations, and where appropriate attached exhibits, which establish good cause**  
22 **for granting the relief requested.**

23 Failure to comply with this order may result in the imposition of sanctions.

24  
25 IT IS SO ORDERED.

26 Dated: June 1, 2018

/s/ Jennifer L. Thurston  
UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE