

1 DALE L. ALLEN, JR., State Bar No. 145279
dallen@aghlaw.com
2 PATRICK D. MORIARTY, State Bar No. 213185
pmoriarty@aghlaw.com
3 ALLEN, GLAESSNER, HAZELWOOD & WERTH, LLP
180 Montgomery Street, Suite 1200
4 San Francisco, CA 94104
Telephone: (415) 697-2000
5 Facsimile: (415) 813-2045

6 Attorneys for Defendant
CITY OF MADERA

7
8 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
9 EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

11 LISA NOVAK and PATRICK NOVAK,
as the heirs and representative of the
12 decedent, Michael Robert Novak

13 Plaintiff,

14 v.

15 CITY OF MADERA, a municipal entity
of the State of California, KAYLA
16 CLARK, DORIAN LASSO, ROBERT
MAHONEY, and ANTHONY
17 MARTINEZ and DOES 1 through 10
inclusive ,

18 Defendants.
19
20

Case No. 1:20-cv-00301-DAD-SKO

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER

(Doc. 13)

21 1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

22 Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve production of confidential,
23 proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from
24 use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted. Accordingly, the
25 parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to enter the following Stipulated Protective
26 Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all
27 disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and
28 use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment

1 under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section
2 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential
3 information under seal; Civil Local Rule 141.1 sets forth the procedures that must be followed
4 and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file
5 material under seal.

6 2. DEFINITIONS

7 2.1 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information or
8 items under this Order.

9 2.2 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is generated,
10 stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of Civil
11 Procedure 26(c). It encompasses information where public disclosure is likely to result in
12 particularized harm, or where public disclosure would violate privacy interests recognized by law.
13 Examples of confidential information include, but are not limited to, the following:

- 14 a. **personnel file records of any peace officer;**
- 15 b. **plaintiff’s medical records;**
- 16 c. **plaintiff’s military records;**
- 17 d. **documents pertaining to welfare checks and/or California**
18 **Welfare and Institutions Code Section 5150 as to plaintiff;**
- 19 e. **Internal Affairs investigations that would not fall under public**
20 **disclosure per California Penal Code Section 832.7;**
- 21 f. **social security numbers and similar sensitive identifying (unless**
22 **redacted by order or by agreement of all parties);**
- 23 g. **any other documents that that the parties agree should be**
24 **subject to the protections of this protective order; and**
- 25 h. **any and all communications between/by the decedent and his**
26 **family members relating to decedent.**

27 2.3 Counsel (without qualifier): Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as
28 their support staff).

1 2.4 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it
2 produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

3 2.5 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of the medium or
4 manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things, testimony,
5 transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to
6 discovery in this matter.

7 2.6 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to the
8 litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a
9 consultant in this action.

10 2.7 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this action. House Counsel
11 does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.

12 2.8 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or other legal entity
13 not named as a Party to this action.

14 2.9 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party to this action but
15 are retained to represent or advise a party to this action and have appeared in this action on behalf
16 of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which has appeared on behalf of that party.

17 2.10 Party: any party to this action, including all of its officers, directors, employees,
18 consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their support staffs).

19 2.11 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or Discovery Material in
20 this action.

21 2.12 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support services (e.g.,
22 photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and organizing,
23 storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and subcontractors.

24 2.13 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as
25 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

26 2.14 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a Producing
27 Party.

28 3. SCOPE

1 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material (as
2 defined above), but also (1) any information copied from Protected Material; (2) all copies,
3 excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material that reveal the source of the Protected
4 Material or that reveal specific information, i.e., the raw data gleaned from protected documents,
5 entitled to confidentiality under this stipulated order; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or
6 presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material. However, the
7 protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order do not cover the following information: (a)
8 any information that is in the public domain at the time of disclosure to a Receiving Party or
9 becomes part of the public domain after its disclosure to a Receiving Party as a result of
10 publication not involving a violation of this Order, including becoming part of the public record
11 through trial or otherwise; and (b) any information known to the Receiving Party prior to the
12 disclosure or obtained by the Receiving Party after the disclosure from a source who obtained the
13 information lawfully and under no obligation of confidentiality to the Designating Party. Any use
14 of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by a separate agreement or order.

15 4. DURATION

16 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this Order
17 shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court order
18 otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims
19 and defenses in this action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the
20 completion and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this action,
21 including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to
22 applicable law.

23 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

24 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each Party or Non-
25 Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care to limit
26 any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The
27 Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or
28 oral or written communications that qualify – so that other portions of the material, documents,

1 items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within
2 the ambit of this Order.

3 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are shown to be
4 clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily
5 encumber or retard the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses and burdens
6 on other parties) expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

7 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it designated for
8 protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other
9 Parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

10 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this Order (see,
11 e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, Disclosure
12 or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so designated
13 before the material is disclosed or produced.

14 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

15 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but excluding
16 transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party affix the
17 legend "CONFIDENTIAL" to each page that contains protected material. If only a portion or
18 portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly
19 identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

20 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents or materials available for inspection need
21 not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which material it
22 would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all of the
23 material made available for inspection shall be deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting
24 Party has identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must
25 determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then,
26 before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the
27 "CONFIDENTIAL" legend to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or
28 portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly

1 identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

2 (b) for testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial or trial proceedings, that the Designating
3 Party identify on the record, before the close of the deposition, hearing, or other proceeding, all
4 protected testimony.

5 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any other tangible
6 items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container or
7 containers in which the information or item is stored the legend "CONFIDENTIAL." If only a
8 portion or portions of the information or item warrant protection, the Producing Party, to the
9 extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

10 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to designate
11 qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party's right to
12 secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the
13 Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance
14 with the provisions of this Order.

15 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

16 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of
17 confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a Designating Party's confidentiality
18 designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic
19 burdens, or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a Party does not waive its right to
20 challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the
21 original designation is disclosed.

22 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution process by
23 providing written notice of each designation it is challenging and describing the basis for each
24 challenge. To avoid ambiguity as to whether a challenge has been made, the written notice must
25 recite that the challenge to confidentiality is being made in accordance with this specific
26 paragraph of the Protective Order. The parties shall attempt to resolve each challenge in good
27 faith and must begin the process by conferring directly (in voice to voice dialogue; other forms of
28 communication are not sufficient) within 14 days of the date of service of notice. In conferring,

1 the Challenging Party must explain the basis for its belief that the confidentiality designation was
2 not proper and must give the Designating Party an opportunity to review the designated material,
3 to reconsider the circumstances, and, if no change in designation is offered, to explain the basis
4 for the chosen designation. A Challenging Party may proceed to the next stage of the challenge
5 process only if it has engaged in this meet and confer process first or establishes that the
6 Designating Party is unwilling to participate in the meet and confer process in a timely manner.

7 **6.3 Judicial Intervention.** If the Parties cannot resolve a challenge without court intervention,
8 the Designating Party shall file and serve a motion to retain confidentiality (and in compliance
9 with Civil Local Rule 141.1, if applicable) within 21 days of the initial notice of challenge or
10 within 14 days of the parties agreeing that the meet and confer process will not resolve their
11 dispute, whichever is earlier. Each such motion must be accompanied by a competent declaration
12 affirming that the movant has complied with the meet and confer requirements imposed in the
13 preceding paragraph. Failure by the Designating Party to make such a motion including the
14 required declaration within 21 days (or 14 days, if applicable) shall automatically waive the
15 confidentiality designation for each challenged designation. In addition, the Challenging Party
16 may file a motion challenging a confidentiality designation at any time if there is good cause for
17 doing so, including a challenge to the designation of a deposition transcript or any portions
18 thereof. Any motion brought pursuant to this provision must be accompanied by a competent
19 declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the meet and confer requirements
20 imposed by the preceding paragraph.

21 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating Party.
22 Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose
23 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to
24 sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived the confidentiality designation by failing to
25 file a motion to retain confidentiality as described above, all parties shall continue to afford the
26 material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's
27 designation until the court rules on the challenge.

28 **7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

1 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or
2 produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this case only for prosecuting,
3 defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to
4 the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the litigation has
5 been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL
6 DISPOSITION).

7 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and in a
8 secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

9 7.2 Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered by the
10 court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any
11 information or item designated "CONFIDENTIAL" only to:

12 (a) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably
13 necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be
14 Bound" (Exhibit A);

15 (b) the court and its personnel;

16 (c) court reporters and their staff, professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and
17 Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have
18 signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

19 (d) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary
20 and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A), unless
21 otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed
22 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material must be separately
23 bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this
24 Stipulated Protective Order or as agreed by the Designating Party.

25 (e) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or other
26 person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

27 8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER
28 LITIGATION

1 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels
2 disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party
3 must:

4 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a copy of the
5 subpoena or court order;

6 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other
7 litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this
8 Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

9 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the Designating
10 Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

11 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena or
12 court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL”
13 before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has
14 obtained the Designating Party’s permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and
15 expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material – and nothing in these
16 provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this action to
17 disobey a lawful directive from another court.

18 9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED IN THIS
19 LITIGATION

20 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in this action
21 and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information produced by Non-Parties in connection
22 with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these
23 provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

24 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Non-Party’s
25 confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with the Non-
26 Party not to produce the Non-Party’s confidential information, then the Party shall:

27 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some or all of the
28 information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;

1 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order in this
2 litigation, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the
3 information requested; and

4 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party.

5 (c) If the Non-Party fails to object or seek a protective order from this court within 14 days of
6 receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the Non-
7 Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely
8 seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession
9 or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a
10 determination by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the
11 burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

12 10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

13 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected Material
14 to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order, the
15 Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized
16 disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c)
17 inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this
18 Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to
19 Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

20 11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED
21 MATERIAL

22 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced
23 material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving
24 Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not
25 intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides
26 for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and
27 (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or
28 information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the parties may

1 incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted to the court.

2 12. MISCELLANEOUS

3 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its
4 modification by the court in the future.

5 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order no
6 Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any
7 information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no
8 Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered
9 by this Protective Order.

10 12.3 Filing Protected Material. Without written permission from the Designating Party or a
11 court order secured after appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Party may not file in the
12 public record in this action any Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any
13 Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 141. Protected Material may only be filed
14 under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at
15 issue. Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 141, a sealing order will issue only upon a request establishing
16 that the Protected Material at issue is privileged, protectable as a trade secret, or otherwise
17 entitled to protection under the law.

18 13. FINAL DISPOSITION

19 Within 60 days after the final disposition of this action, as defined in paragraph 4, upon written
20 notification served by Producing or Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return all
21 Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this subdivision,
22 “all Protected Material” includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries, and any other
23 format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material is
24 returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing
25 Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that
26 (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or
27 destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts,
28 compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected

1 Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an archival copy of all
2 pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda,
3 correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and
4 consultant and expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such
5 archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective
6 Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

7
8 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

9
10 DATED: September 9, 2020

EMANUEL LAW GROUP

11 By: /s/ Todd P. Emanuel

TODD P. EMANUEL

12 Attorney for Plaintiffs

13 LISA NOVAK and PATRICK NOVAK, as
14 the heirs and representatives of the decedent,
Michael Robert Novak

15 ALLEN, GLAESSNER,
16 HAZELWOOD & WERTH, LLP

17 DATED: September 9, 2020

By: /s/ Patrick Moriarty

18 PATRICK MORIARTY

19 Attorney for Defendants, CITY OF MADERA,
20 KAYLA CLARK, DORIAN LASSO, ROBERT
MAHONEY, and ANTHONY MARTINEZ

21 **ORDER**

22
23 IT IS SO ORDERED.

24 Dated: September 10, 2020

/s/ Sheila K. Oberto

25 UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE

26
27
28

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

EXHIBIT A

ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, _____ [print or type full name], of _____
[print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for the Eastern District of California on _____ in the case of *Lisa Novak and Patrick Novak v. City of Madera, et al.* I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the Eastern District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action.

I hereby appoint _____ [print or type full name] of _____ [print or type full address and telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

Date: _____

City and State where sworn and signed: _____

Printed name: _____

Signature: _____